



ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat
Library and Archives of Canada
395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, CANADA
K1A 0N4

ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secrétariat
Bibliothèque et archives du Canada
395, rue Wellington
Ottawa, CANADA
K1A 0N4

Telephone - Téléphone
(819) 994-6939
Fax : (819) 953-0291
E-mail - Courriel
iso.tc46.sc9@lac-bac.gc.ca

<http://www.lac-bac.gc.ca/iso/tc46sc9/index.htm>

ISO TC 46/SC 9 N 384
2004-10-04

To: ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Member Bodies
cc. ISO/TC 46 Secretariat
ISO Central Secretariat
ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 4 (ISBN revision)
From: ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat

Subject: Report of voting on ISO Draft International Standard 2108, "International Standard Book Number (ISBN)"

Dear Colleagues,

Attached is the final Report of voting on ISO DIS 2108 for the vote ending July 19, 2004. An earlier summary of voting results was distributed in SC9 document N 381.

DIS 2108 was approved by 100% of the 23 P-member countries that voted. There were no negative votes and 4 abstentions. (Abstentions are not counted in the vote.)

These voting results meet ISO's criteria for approval of DIS 2108 at the Enquiry stage and for immediate advancement to publication, in accordance with clause 2.6.4 of the *ISO Directives, Part 1*.

The comments on DIS 2108 were discussed by SC9 Working Group 4 and their responses are shown in Annex B of this Report of voting. The SC9 Secretary and Chairperson have reviewed WG4's responses and are of the opinion that the agreed revisions to DIS 2108 are editorial in nature and should not affect the 100% approval for DIS 2108.

ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN:

- **This Report of voting is for the information of ISO's voting members.**
- **The SC9 Secretariat will forward DIS 2108, as shown in the attached document, to the ISO Central Secretariat for publication as the 4th edition of ISO 2108.**

With regards,

[original signed by]

Jane Thacker
Secretary, ISO/TC 46/SC 9

The ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat is provided by Library and Archives Canada on behalf of the Standards Council of Canada, a member of the ISO.



REPORT OF VOTING ON ISO/DIS 2108	
Closing date of voting 2004-07-19	ISO/TC 46 /SC 9
Secretariat SCC	

A report shall be returned to ISO/CS no later than 3 months after the closing date of voting on the DIS, whether or not comments have been reviewed and/or a new text has been prepared.

- Preliminary report**
(submitted in those cases where comments are still to be considered and/or a decision has not yet been taken, or where it is decided that the nature of comments indicates a need for further consultation and/or reversion to a previous project development stage). To be followed by a 'Final report'. Any preliminary report is for ISO/CS for information, and is not circulated to member bodies)
- Final report**
(submitted either immediately, when all comments have been reviewed and a decision can be taken, or following a 'Preliminary report'. The final report is circulated by ISO/CS to member bodies, and is distributed with any associated DIS or FDIS text)

<p>1 Result of the voting</p> <p>The above-mentioned document was circulated to member bodies with a request that the ISO Central Secretariat be informed whether or not member bodies were in favour of registration of the DIS as a Final Draft International Standard or for publication in the case of unanimous approval.</p> <p>The vote closed on the date indicated above. The replies listed in annex A have been received.</p> <p>2 Comments received</p> <p>3 Observations of the secretariat</p> <p>4 Decision of the Chairman</p> <p>Preliminary report (no annexes required)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The comments are under review and/or a decision on further procedure has not yet been taken</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The project is to revert to the Preparatory Stage (a new working draft will be developed)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The project is to revert to the Committee Stage (a new committee draft will be developed)</p> <p>Final report</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Having received 100% approval from the member bodies voting, the DIS is approved for direct publication without change other than editorial (no FDIS vote) <i>(Option not applicable to projects progressing under the Vienna Agreement)</i></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> A revised text is to be submitted to ISO/CS for the approval procedure (FDIS vote)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> A revised text is to be submitted to ISO/CS for a further enquiry (DIS) vote</p>	<p>} See annex B</p>
--	----------------------

Remarks (e.g. observations on how comments were reviewed, date by which a decision is to be taken, date when a text is expected)

See Annex B for SC9/Working Group 4's decisions in response to comments on DIS 2108.

Enclosures

- Annex A: Table of replies received**
- Annex B: Disposition of comments on DIS 2108**
- A revised copy of DIS 2108 is attached to the full Report of voting which is available through ISO member bodies only. The revised DIS has been submitted to AFNOR for final verification of the French edition.**

Signature of the Secretary <i>[Original signed by]</i> Jane Thacker Date 2004-10-04	Signature of the Chairman <i>[Original approved by]</i> Brian Green Date 2004-10-04
--	--

**Table of replies from the vote on ISO Draft International Standard 2108,
International Standard Book Number (ISBN)**

Approvals = 28 (100%)

Negative votes = 0

Abstentions = 4

Country	Member	Status	Vote
Australia	SAI	P Member	Approval with comments
Austria	ON	O Member	Abstention
Bulgaria	BDS	P Member	Approval
Canada	SCC	Secretariat	Approval with comments
China	SAC	P Member	Approval
Colombia	ICONTEC	P Member	Approval with comments
Croatia	DZNM	P Member	Abstention
Cuba	NC	O Member	Approval
Czech Republic	CSNI	P Member	Approval
Denmark	DS	P Member	Approval
Egypt	EOS		Approval
Finland	SFS	P Member	Approval with comments
France	AFNOR	P Member	Approval with comments
Germany	DIN	P Member	Approval with comments
Hungary	MSZT	P Member	Approval with comments
Iran, Islamic Republic of	ISIRI	O Member	Approval
Italy	UNI	P Member	Abstention
Jamaica	JBS		Approval
Japan	JISC	P Member	Approval
Kenya	KEBS	P Member	Approval
Netherlands	NEN	P Member	Approval
Norway	SN	P Member	Approval with comments
Poland	PKN	P Member	Approval
Portugal	IPQ	P Member	Abstention
Russian Federation	GOST R	P Member	Approval
South Africa	SABS	P Member	Approval
Spain	AENOR	P Member	Approval
Sweden	SIS	P Member	Approval with comments
Switzerland	SNV	P Member	Approval
Thailand	TISI	O Member	Approval
United Kingdom	BSI	P Member	Approval
U.S.A.	ANSI	P Member	Approval with comments

Sweden	N/A	N/A	ge	The Swedish centre for ISBN is organised within Kungliga biblioteket (Royal Swedish library) in Stockholm as part of its department for collection development and documentation. KB representatives have discussed the DIS with the Swedish representative in the working group and have the following comments: As a whole, the text is now clear and pedagogical; it is easy to read and follow and we do congratulate the working group to a task well accomplished. We have but few comments, but we do find them important.	<i>[See specific comments, below]</i>	See responses to specific comments, below.
Norway			ge	We have realized that some E-booksellers (Knoval, Netlibrary) assign ISBNs (not publishers). Can they? And should this be described in the standard?		No change. The text stresses that publishers are responsible for assigning ISBNs.
Italy			ge	Abstention due to lack of technical expertise	--	--
France	1.	Page 1	ed	[Comment on both the English and French texts]	2. Référence normatives: Add the publication dates of the latest editions after the references.	No change. Omitting a date reference indicates that the edition prevailing at the time is intended rather than a specific edition (which may be revised at any point).
France	1.	Page 1	ed	[Comments on the French text only]	1. Domaine: Replace; « ce1 1. Domaine d'application Replace » with Replace "cette" « la présente » and read « pour la présente Norme internationale ». Page 19, Annex E - tab	Agreed. These corrections will be included in the French text.
Germany	3 Terms and definitions		ge	We noted that the definitions are orientated towards ISBD definitions. In 3.5 and 3.7 (see below) we suggest to eliminate deviations to ISBD(CR).	<i>[See below]</i>	See below.

Sweden	3.3 and 3.5		te	The text in 3.3 and 3.5 should be adjusted to the definitions of integrating and continuing resources of ISBD (CR). A reference to ISBD (CR) should be added in Bibliography (see comment no 8). Text from ISBD (CR), 2002. 0.2 Definitions: [see next column]	<p>3.3 Continuing resource A bibliographic resource that is issued over time with no predetermined conclusion. Continuing resources include serials and ongoing integrating resources.</p> <p>3.5 Integrating resource A bibliographic resource that is added to or changed by means of updates that do not remain discrete and are integrated into the whole. Integrating resources can be finite or continuing. Examples of integrating resources include updating loos-leafs and updating Web sites.</p>	<p>Concerning clause 3.3: no change. The current wording is clearer and is likely to be easier to translate into other languages. It was also noted that ISBD (CR) is currently being revised and so further changes may be made to existing wording, which the ISBN revision would not be in a position to implement within the revised standard.</p> <p>Concerning clause 3.5: the wording has been changed to: <i>"Integrating resource A publication that is added to or changed by means of updates that do not remain discrete and are integrated into the whole. Integrating resources can be finite or with no predetermined conclusion. NOTE - Examples of integrating resources include updating loos-leafs and updating Web sites."</i></p>
U.S.A.	3.3	line 2	ed		Add a slash mark (/) between and or.	Agreed. The change has been included in the text.
Sweden	3.4		te	The definition of edition should be expanded.	All copies of a publication embodying essentially	No change. The term

				<p><i>Rationale:</i> the crucial condition for classifying something as a new edition is that it is derived from essentially the same, new registration, not that the content is essentially the same (it necessarily is). It would be impossible for those who handle the ISBN assignment to give guidance as to when the content is sufficiently similar and when not. On the other hand, a publisher or producer is always well aware of when a new registration has been made, or substantial changes to an existing master have been done.</p> <p>The phrasing in 3.4 is not compatible with the guidelines in chapter 5 (5.4-5.6) or in annex A (A.1.5-A.1.7). The guidelines in these paragraphs are basically good, and will be easy to follow.</p> <p>A phrasing like the one we propose above would be compatible (although not identical in phrasing) with the definition of edition in ISO 5127 <i>Documentation and Information – Vocabulary</i>, 1. ed. 1983, 2. ed. 2002.</p>	the same content, <i>derived from essentially the same act of registration</i> , and issued by the same entity.	“registration” does not give greater clarity in this context.
Germany	3 Terms and definitions	3.5	ge	The wording “that do not remain discrete” as given in ISBD(CR) should not be omitted. It illustrates an important condition, making clear, e.g., that supplements or multiparts do not fit into this definition.	A publication that is added to or changed by means of updates that <u>do not remain discrete and</u> are integrated into the whole.	See response to comment from Sweden above concerning this clause.
Germany	3 Terms and definitions	3.5	ge	In the second sentence, we suggest to give “finite” and “continuing” as antagonistic pair of terms as in ISBD(CR). “No predetermined conclusion” already explains 3.3 continuing resource.	Integrating resources can be finite or <u>continuing</u>	See response to comment from Sweden above concerning this clause.
Germany	3 Terms and definitions	3.7	ge	We wonder whether the conception of publisher/author(s) should be given as a prominent part of a definition and suggest to use the ISBD terminology instead.	A publication <u>that is complete in one part, or intended to be completed within a finite number of parts.</u>	No change to clause 3.7. However, it was agreed to incorporate the wording “and made available to the public in any product form” to clauses 3.3 and 3.5.
Sweden	3.8		te	Print on demand publication	We offer the following, slightly amended,	Agreed. The change

					phrasing: "A publication that is printed at the time a customer orders a copy of it rather than that copy being supplied from existing stocks held by the distributor or publisher."	has been made.
U.S.A.	4.1		te	Question: The standard does not require the use of the colon when displaying the human readable ISBN, but many publishers use the colon. As publishers will be displaying both the 10-digit and 13-digit ISBN during the transition period it might be useful to suggest that the colon be used to avoid confusion. For example: ISBN-10: ISBN-13:		No change to the DIS. WG4 will consider this issue in the context of the Implementation Guidelines.
U.S.A.	4.2		te	Rationale: The word "ensuing" means "following." It is not true that 13 digits follow the prefix.	Change: "It indicates that the ensuing 13 digit product number originates with and is part of the ISBN system." To: "This prefix included in the 13-digit product number indicates that this product number originates with and is part of the ISBN system."	Agreed.
Canada	4.4 (Registrant element)	5th sentence of 1 st paragraph	te	The 5 th sentence should refer directly to the registrant element which is the focus of clause 4.4. In its current form it emphasizes the assignment of ISBN (clause 5) rather than the construction of the registrant element (clause 4.4). "May" is a statement of permission which should apply to all ISBN agencies so the word "Some" at the start of the 5th sentence should be deleted.	Rephrase the last sentence of the first paragraph of 4.4 as follows: <i>"ISBN registration agencies may reserve a common block of registrant elements for the purpose of assigning individual ISBN to single title publishers."</i>	Agreed. The changes has been made.
Canada	4.5 (Publication element)	2 nd and 3 rd sentences 1 st paragraph	te	To retain the focus on the publication element in this clause it would be better to revise the last two sentences of the first paragraph of 4.5. At present they refer only to the registrant block and therefore duplicate the preceding clause.	Rephrase the 2 nd and 3 rd sentences of the first paragraph as follows: <i>"The publication element shall be allocated in accordance with the specifications of Annex A. It is usually allocated by the publisher of the monographic publication although in some cases ISBN registration agencies may choose to assign an individual ISBNs to single title publishers by allocating single publication elements from within a common registrant element block reserved for that purpose."</i>	Agreed. The changes have been made.

U.S.A.	5.5		te	Rationale: Ebooks are a volatile and evolving product form and it is too early to require this level of identification. Further, the examples should conform to the Implementation Manual.	Change: "Each different format of an electronic publication (e.g. ".doc", ".pdf", ".html") that is published and made separately available shall be given a separate ISBN." To: "Each different format of a downloadable electronic publication (e.g. .lit, .pdf, .pdb, .prc) that is published and made separately available should be given a separate ISBN."	It was agreed to amend the examples of publication formats to be: .lit, .pdf, .html, .pdb. The change from "shall" to "should" was not agreed. The issue of "separately available" will be considered for further explanation and expansion in the User Manual.
U.S.A.	5.6		te	"A separate ISBN shall be assigned if there have been significant changes to any part of parts of a publication or to its title." Comment: What signifies a significant change to a title? Is there a way to define 'significant'? It is suggested that this be explained more fully in the Implementation Manual.		This sentence will now be split into two in order to make its meaning and emphasis clearer, as follows: <i>"A separate ISBN shall be assigned if there have been significant changes to any part of parts of a publication. A separate ISBN shall be assigned if there has been a change to the title of a publication."</i>
U.S.A.	6.2.2		te	Rationale: The original text does not reflect current publishing practices.	Change: "The ISBN shall also be printed at the foot of the outside back cover, if practicable, and at the foot of the back of the jacket." To: "The ISBN shall also be printed at the foot of the outside back cover, if practicable, and/or at the foot of the back of the jacket."	Agreed. The change has been made.

Disposition of comments on ISO/DIS 2108, International Standard Book Number (ISBN)

Date: 2004-10-04

Document: ISO/TC46/SC9 N 384, Annex B

U.S.A.	6.3.2		te	Add text to indicate that the ISBN should appear in a help screen, introductory page, etc. for objects that do not have a title page and for which the title and the ISBN could get lost when a removable wrapper is discarded.		Clause 6.3.2 will be amended to include the phrase “any <i>permanent packaging</i> ”.
Canada	Clause 8 (Administration of the ISBN system)		te	Provide the name and contact information for the Registration Authority for ISO 2108 (i.e. the International ISBN Agency).	Information needs to be provided.	This will be included once this information is available.
Canada	Clause 8 (Administration of the ISBN system)		ge	In our previous comments on CD 2108, we requested information about the intended administration and governance arrangements for the ISBN system. Such information has not yet been made available. These arrangements can have significant cost and/or operational impacts on ISBN agencies at the national level. Although we approve DIS 2108 on the basis of its technical content, we are concerned to know more about potential changes affecting the international and national administration of the ISBN system and, if so, what those changes might be. See also the comment on B.2.12.	Information needs to be provided. The Registration Authority for this standard (i.e. the International ISBN Agency) needs a formal governance structure that includes a role for ISBN national agencies in the policy and decision-making process for the ISBN system. The requirement for such a structure should be specified in the contract between ISO and the Registration Authority.	This information is not part of the standard itself but will be provided in other supporting governance documents.
Hungary	Annex A.1.9.		ge	Please insert “maps” among the examples. Maps are mentioned only in the draft of the ISBN Users’ Manual.	Some examples of types of monographic publications to which an ISBN may be assigned are: - printed books and pamphlets (and their various product forms); - Braille publications; - maps; etc.	No change. Not all agencies assign ISBN to maps. The earlier decision to cover maps solely in the User Manual was reconfirmed.
Norway	A.1.9		te	We miss a guideline on how we should treat mixed media publications where one of the elements is ongoing, for example text-books sold together with a CD with software to access a website which is continually updated.		No change. It is more appropriate to deal with these exceptional cases in the more expansive User Manual.

Australia	Annex A, A.1.10		te		Add " <i>packaging material and other point of sale material even if used solely for presentation of publications</i> " to the list of material to which an ISBN should not be assigned.	No change. It is prudent for the standard to remain silent on this issue.
Sweden	A.1.10	first bullet	te	<p>After the definition in 3.3, it might be regarded as unnecessary to exemplify the kinds of publications covered by the term "continuing resources", but it makes no real harm. However, the difference to monographic publications should be emphasised in two ways:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • By adding after the parenthesis the words <i>when regarded in their entirety as one unit of publishing</i> • By adding a note before the next bullet sentence: <i>Separate issues of a continuing resource may qualify for an ISBN, esp. when they are monographic in character.</i> 	<p>- continuing resources (e.g. serials, series without predetermined conclusion and ongoing integrating resources) <i>when regarded in their entirety as one unit of publishing;</i></p> <p><i>Note: Separate issues of a continuing resource may qualify for an ISBN, esp. when they are monographic in character.</i></p>	No change. This matter is dealt with in more detail in the User Manual.
Colombia	A.1.10		te	To go deeply into the terms: Printed music and music sound recording.	Clarification of the meaning and differences between: songbook and score. As well as music sound recording and songs orchestra, bands, etc.	No change. It is more appropriate to add extra detail on these matters in the User Manuals for ISBN and ISMN.
Canada	A.3 (Publications issued as part of a series)	Whole paragraph	TE	<p>This clause is confusing and could be interpreted in different ways. In one sense it seems virtually indistinguishable from the situation that is already covered in clause A.2. The other possible interpretation is that ISBN could be assigned to monographic series, which is wrong since series are handled by the ISSN. On looking back through earlier drafts of this clause A.3, we note that this possible misinterpretation may be the reason that the wording "part of a series that will be completed within a finite number of parts" was introduced into the text after the CD voting. In our opinion, however, this only worsened the confusion over: a) what is actually being specified in this clause; and, b) what makes this clause distinct from A.2.</p> <p>We propose rewording A.3 to restore its original intent as expressed in the first Working Draft</p>	<p>Use similar wording to that of the first Working Draft in SC9 N 326), with a minor difference as indicated by underlined text:</p> <p><i>"A.3 Publications issued as part of a series A publication that is issued <u>both individually and as part of a series shall be treated as two separate editions, each of which shall be assigned its own ISBN.</u>"</i></p> <p>However, if that original wording is deemed unsuitable, then we propose the following alternative:</p> <p><i>"A.3 Publications issued as part of a series When a publication is issued both individually and as part of a series that situation shall be treated as two separate editions, each of which shall be assigned its own ISBN."</i></p>	See note below to comment from Norway.

				<p>(ISO/TC46/SC9 N 326, issued 2001-11-01): "A publication that is issued on its own and as part of a series shall be treated as two separate editions, each of which shall be assigned an ISBN."</p> <p>We are not sure why that wording was abandoned; perhaps it was changed in order to avoid using the term "edition" – although that term does not seem problematic since it is used in the same sense as the definition of "edition" in clause 3.4.</p> <p>We also suggest that this specification should be a requirement ("shall") as it was in the Committee Draft. The equivalent specification in DIS 2108 for clause A.2 is a "shall" and it makes sense that the specification in clause A.3 should be at the same level.</p>	<p>If neither of the above two options are satisfactory then we suggest that A.3 should be deleted altogether rather than remain in its current form.</p>	
Sweden	A.3		te	<p>Publications issued as part of a series</p> <p>This clause deals with the case that the main difference between two product forms of a publication is that one of them is self-sufficient and independent, while the other one is issued as part of a larger bibliographic entity. The specific case mentioned for the latter category is the series, meaning a multi-volume publication issued over a sequence of years. However, there are other and more frequent cases, such as the one where one of the forms carries the title of a monographic serial and a number within that, while the other form shows no evidence of such a relation.</p> <p>It could be argued that all these cases are already covered by the general rule that each product form shall have its own ISBN. However, for clarity and guidance, it is useful to mention this category explicitly, since the other definitions of product forms (3.9, 5.5, A.1.7) go mainly for physical attributes such as binding or for technical properties such as medium or format.</p>	<p>We suggest a short addition to the text as given in A.3, making the whole clause as follows:</p> <p>"When a publication is made available to the public both individually and/or as part of one or more larger bibliographical entities, such as an ongoing publication or a series that will be completed within a finite number of parts, it should be regarded as separate publications, each of which should be assigned a separate ISBN."</p>	<p>See note below to comment from Norway.</p>

Norway	A.3	1	ed	We suppose that a publication shall be assigned to different ISBNs if it is published both separate and as a part of a series – regardless of the series is published periodically or as a finite series. Therefore we propose to delete some of the text in this paragraph.	"When a publication is made available to the public both individually and as a part of a series, it should be regarded as two separate publications, each of which should be assigned a separate ISBN."	The proposed text will be incorporated into the standard and User Manual, except that in the case of the standard the word "should" in the two occurrences where it appears will be replaced by "shall".
Australia	Annex A	A.4 A.5.1	ed	This provision allows more than one ISBN to be applied to a single publication when it is published by co-publishers. This is inconsistent with the purpose of the ISBN to provide a single unique number for a publication. Also, the use of 'may' is inconsistent with it being in a normative annex.	Remove the provision.	No change. The current wording reflects common industry practice and requirements, whilst not making the assignment of ISBN by each co-publisher mandatory.
U.S.A.	A.5.1	line 1	ed	Rationale: Maintains the parallel with A.5.2.	Change to: " <i>A separate ISBN may be assigned if the same publication is issued published. . . .</i> "	Clauses A.5.1. and A.5.2. will be amended to "published" and "republished". This is easier to translate than "issued" and "re-issued".
Australia	Annex A	A.6	te	The second paragraph has some terms that are not well defined, i.e. "specifically customised", "a user" and "limited availability". Including this in a normative annex has the potential of introducing inconsistency in the issuing of ISBNs. We note that SCC (Canada) expressed a similar concern in their previous response, and we share their concern.	Add explanatory material.	No change to the draft. Further explanation of these terms can be provided in the User Manual.
Sweden	B.2.1 and B.2.12		te	If the activity described in B.2.12 can be characterised as a service parallel to those described in B.2.2 to B.2.11, the last word in B.2.1 shall be <i>B.2.12</i> . If not, the syntactic structure of B.2.12 must be changed so that it gets its own main clause.	Change the last word of clause B 2.1 to <i>B 2.12</i>	Agreed.

Disposition of comments on ISO/DIS 2108, International Standard Book Number (ISBN)

Date: 2004-10-04

Document: ISO/TC46/SC9 N 384, Annex B

U.S.A.	B.2.1		te		Change the last word to: B.2.12.	See above response.
Canada	Annex B (Administration of the ISBN system)	B.2.12	te	B.2.12 makes reference to financial contributions from ISBN registration agencies. We would like to see an equivalent written commitment on the part of the Registration Authority to give ISBN agencies a voice in the decision-making process. See also the comment on clause 8.	Include this requirement in the Registration Authority's contract with ISO and/or add this requirement as a new subclause in the list of the Registration Authority's responsibilities at B.2.	No change. These matters will be covered in separate documentation on governance.
U.S.A.	B.3.1		te	Delete B.3.2 from the range of numbers given in B.3.1. The services are described in B.3.3 to B.3.10. The comment on the continuous nature of service provided by the ISBN registration agencies applies equally to all of the services listed; this comment could become the last bullet in this paragraph.		Agreed. The current B.3.2. will become the final clause. This section will be renumbered as appropriate.
U.S.A.	B.3.8	line 2	ed	Rationale: Restates the direction in a positive manner.	Change to: "International ISBN Agency no less frequently than annually or more frequently. "	Agreed.
Canada	Annex C (Check digit for the 13 digit ISBN)	C.4	te	<p>Section 4.5 of the draft ISBN Users' Manual provides a clearer explanation of the check digit algorithm whereas the current text in Annex C.4 presents the mathematical formula with little or no explanation. We would like to see the explanation in section 4.5 of the Users' Manual copied into Annex C.4 of DIS 2108 in addition to, or in place of, the existing mathematical formula.</p> <p>If the present text is retained in C.4, we have the following additional comments. In the table, the "Total" column (currently second from the left) should be on the extreme right because that is how people add.</p> <p>The mathematical formula directly beneath the table is not comprehensible to those who are not familiar with this form of expressing equations. Could it be written out in another way that would make the individual steps more obvious? For example:</p> $\text{check digit} = \text{mod } 10(10 - \text{mod } 10(\text{Product total}))$ $\text{check digit} = \text{mod } 10(10 - \text{mod } 10(81))$ $\text{check digit} = 9$ <p>The logic of the formula also needs explanation. Is a division sign (i.e. "/") missing somewhere, where</p>	Copy the check digit explanation given in section 4.5 of the draft ISBN Users' Manual into Annex C of DIS 2108 in addition to or in place of the existing mathematical formula (see document ISO/TC46/SC9/WG4 N40, page 9).	Agreed. A simpler, more tabular explanation of the calculation has been agreed which will be common to the standard and the Users' Manual. See changes in Annex C of revised DIS 218 (appended to this Report of voting).

				10 gets to be divided into the Product total plus the addition of the unknown factor x?		
U.S.A.	C.4		te		Change: "When an ISBN is displayed in human readable form, hyphens should be used to enhance readability and. . . ." To: "When an ISBN is displayed in human readable form, it shall be preceded by the letters ISBN. Hyphens should be used to enhance readability and to provide..."	Agreed. See changes in Annex C of revised DIS 218 (appended to this Report of voting).
U.S.A.	C.4	Example, line 1	ed	Rationale: This wording is used in F.2 and F.3 examples.	Insert: "showing the": <i>Showing the Modulus 10 algorithm. . . .</i>	See changes in Annex C of revised DIS 218 (appended to this Report of voting).
U.S.A.	C.4		ed	Include a descriptive example explaining how to calculate the check digit.	For example: Calculating check digit for a 13 digit ISBN 978-0-393-04002-? 1. Take the first 12 digits of the ISBN (the check digit is the thirteenth and last digit) : 9, 7, 8, 0, 3, 9, 3, 0, 4, 0, 0, 2 2. Take the weighting factors associated with each digit : 1, 3, 1, 3, 1, 3, 1, 3, 1, 3, 1, 3, 3. Multiply each digit in turn by its weighting factor : 9, 21, 8, 0, 3, 27, 3, 0, 4, 0, 0, 6 4. Add these numbers together : 9+21+8+0+3+27+3+0+4+0+0+6=81 5. Divide this sum by the modulus 10 : 81 / 10 = 8 remainder 1 6. Subtract the remainder from 10 : 10 - 1 = 9 7. Add the remainder, which is the check digit, to the extreme right (low order) position of the base number of the ISBN : 978-0-393-04002-9	See changes in Annex C of revised DIS 218 (appended to this Report of voting).
Canada	Annex D (Ranges of ISBN)	D.2, last 2 sentences of 2 nd paragraph	te	The specification should apply any future prefix group, not just to the 979 prefix.	Change the last 2 sentences of the 2 nd paragraph of D.2 into a Note and revise the wording as follows: <i>"NOTE – The number of digits specified and assigned for registrant groups and registrants within prefix element 978 cannot be relied upon to predict those which are specified and assigned</i>	Agreed. The change has been made at D.2.

					<i>within future prefix elements (e.g. prefix element 979). Registration groups and registrant allocations for future prefixes will reflect assignment history and assignment projections for the entire prefix element system viewed collectively."</i>	
U.S.A.	E.1.1		te	Rationale: This change is consistent with the directions in the Implementation Manual.	Change: "In order to provide enough information to differentiate one entity bearing an ISBN from another, ISBN registrants should supply the ISBN registration agency with a specified amount of metadata (descriptive information) about the publication to which the ISBN is assigned. The core metadata associated with each ISBN assignment should be maintained by the ISBN registration agency or by its designated bibliographic agency." To: "In order to provide enough information to differentiate one entity bearing an ISBN from another, ISBN registrants shall supply the ISBN registration agency with a specified amount of metadata (descriptive information) about the publication to which the ISBN is assigned. The core metadata associated with each ISBN assignment shall be maintained by the ISBN registration agency or by its designated bibliographic agency."	No change. "Should" is the appropriate weight for this clause. Mandatory compliance may not be possible for all agencies.
U.S.A.	E.1.1 and E.2.2.		te	Are "core" and "minimum" metadata the same? If so, use the term "core" in Section E.2.2.		The word "core" will be deleted from E.1.1
Norway	E.2		ge	It is not clear enough what is meant by the term "imprint"		No change. This term can be explained further in the Users' Manual.
France	Annex E – Clause E.2	Page 19	ed	[Comment on the French text only]	In the last box on the last line of the table: Replace "ceci" with "cela"	Agreed. The changes will be made in the French text.
Australia	Annex E	E.2.1 E.2.2	ge	We would prefer that the text given at Annex 2.2 be given first under the E.2 heading <i>Elements of ISBN metadata</i> to give the elements themselves primacy, rather than the scheme from which they are	Change the order of E.2.1 and E.2.2. Replace 'should' with 'may' in the reference to ONIX to ensure that it is clear this is informative and not normative	No change. The current order – indicating the scheme and then the elements

				<p>derived.</p> <p>Given that ONIX is not yet an ISO standard, the reference to it could be interpreted as endorsement of that standard by ISO without due process.</p> <p>Should a reference to the existing ISO Metadata standard (ISO 15836) Dublin Core be added as an informative reference?</p>	<p>and not normative.</p> <p>Consider adding reference to Dublin Core.</p>	<p>of that scheme is more logical.</p>
Australia	Annex E	E.2.2 Table. Product Form.	ed	<p>'Product form' is separately defined in 3.9, and it would be better not to give a definition at this point.</p>	<p>Change comments to "Coding which indicates the product form" or "Coding which indicates the form of the publication".</p>	<p>No change. The existing version is clearer than the proposed amendment.</p>
Australia	Annex E	E.2.2 Table. Publisher and Imprint		<p>The registrant may or may not be the publisher. Is there a need to record the registrant separately?</p> <p>In addition, there may be a publisher only, and no imprint. Should 'when applicable' be added to the comments under Imprint?</p>	<p>Consider recording registrant as a separate element.</p> <p>Add 'when applicable' to the comments under Imprint?</p>	<p>No change. Publishers are responsible for ISBN assignment and metadata registration. The inclusion of "when applicable" has been previously considered and rejected.</p>

U.S.A.	E.2.2		te	Comment: It would be helpful to supply the ONIX equivalents in the Implementation Manual.	<p>The suggested text follows:</p> <p>ISBN <b004> <ISBN></p> <p>Product Form <b012></p> <p> <ProductForm></p> <p>Title <b028> <DistinctiveTitle></p> <p>Series title <b018> <TitleOfSeries></p> <p>Series number <b019></p> <p> <NumberWithinSeries></p> <p>Contributor Name(s) <b036></p> <p> <PersonName></p> <p>Contributor Role Code(s) <b035></p> <p> <ContributorRole></p> <p>Edition Number <b057></p> <p> <EditionNumber></p> <p>Edition Type <b056></p> <p> <EditionTypeCode></p> <p>Edition Statement <b058></p> <p> <EditionStatement></p> <p>Language(s) of text <b059></p> <p> <LanguageOfText></p> <p>Imprint <b079> <ImprintName></p> <p>Publisher <b081></p> <p> <PublisherName></p> <p>Country of Publication <b083></p> <p> <CountryOfPublication></p> <p>ISBN of parent publication <????> This is to come</p>	No change to the draft. The scheme will be included in the Users' Manual.
Finland	ANNEX E	E 2.2	ed	Because of choosing the "real" name of series is often difficult and the names are written in different ways, ISSN of the series identifies the series better than the name	"Series title and enumeration" could be " <i>Series title, ISSN, and enumeration</i> "	The element will be renamed "Series" and the comment will be amended to: "Series title and enumeration when applicable".

Australia	Annex E	E.3	ge	The use of 'should' in this provision is inconsistent with the usage of normative within standards as something that is required for compliance.	Replace 'should' with 'shall'.	No change. Not all agencies may be able to comply if this becomes mandatory.
Canada	Annex F (ISBN in the 10-digit format prior to implementation)	F.2	te	F.2: Same comments as those for Annex C, see above.	Copy the check digit explanation given in section 4.5 of the draft ISBN Users' Manual into Annex C of DIS 2108 in addition to or in place of the current version for mathematicians (see document ISO/TC46/SC9/WG4 N40, page 9).	See changes in Annex C of revised DIS 218 (appended to this Report of voting).
Canada	Annex F (ISBN in the 10-digit format prior to implementation)	F.4.1	ed	Subclause F.4.1 does not contain any specifications. If it is there in order to explain the contents of clause F.4, then a preferable solution would be to change the title of F.4 so that its content is obvious from the heading.	Delete clause F.4.1.	Agreed. Clause will be deleted and subsequent clauses renumbered as appropriate.
Canada	Annex F (ISBN in the 10-digit format prior to implementation)	F.4.3	ed	The second and third sentences of F.4.3 do not relate to the first sentence. They should become a separately numbered subclause.	Remove the 2 nd and 3 rd sentences from F.4.3 and transfer them into a new subclause F.4.4.	Agreed.
EN/France			ge	The commission would like to draw attention on the need to add an annex in this DIS containing the list of existing identifiers and comprising the description of their relationships with ISBN. Such relationships might be illustrated with modeling schemes. Annex E (informative) of ISTC/CD circulated first in June 2002, and a second time with number SC9 N377 D, might fruitfully be used. A Working Group could work along these lines to set up a structure which might be adopted for any draft standard		No change. This information will be provided in the Users' Manual.

Sweden	Bibliography		te	We think a reference to ISBD (CR) should be added (see comment on 3.3 note).	[13] ISBD (CR): International standard description for serials and other continuing resources. 2002 Revision. International Federation of Library Association and Institutions, 2002. ISBN 3-598-11599-7. Available at: http://www.ifla.org/VII/s13/pubs/isbdcr-final.pdf	No change. See earlier response to comment from Sweden concerning clause 3.3.
France	Bibliography	Page 22	ed	For consistency reasons, it is suggested to add the publication dates of the latest editions in force.		Agreed.