



**ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat**  
Library and Archives Canada  
395 Wellington Street  
Ottawa, CANADA  
K1A 0N4

**ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secrétariat**  
Bibliothèque et archives Canada  
395, rue Wellington  
Ottawa, CANADA  
K1A 0N4

Telephone - Téléphone  
(819) 994-6939  
Fax : (819) 934-4388  
E-mail - Courriel  
iso.tc46.sc9@lac-bac.gc.ca

<http://www.lac-bac.gc.ca/iso/tc46sc9/index.htm>

## ISO TC 46/SC 9 N 404 revised

*(includes responses to comments)*

2005-06-20

To: Members of ISO/TC 46/SC 9  
cc: ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1 (ISAN & V-ISAN)

From: ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat

**Subject: Final report of the review and voting on ISO CD 15706-2 and ISO 15706:2002/DAM 1, and ISO DTR 20925**

Dear Colleagues,

Attached is the final report from the Committee review and voting on ISO Committee Draft 15706-2, "*Information and documentation – International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)*" and ISO 15706:2002/Draft Amendment 1, "*Information and documentation – International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – AMENDMENT 1: Alternate encodings and editorial changes*". These documents were accompanied by a proposed Draft Technical Report 20925 on operational guidelines for the version identifier system.

Committee Draft 15706-2 and the Draft Amendment to ISO 15706:2002 were approved by 100% of the 18 ISO national bodies that voted. Comments were received from the ISO members for Canada, Finland, and the U.S.A.. **Responses to those comments are included in this revised version of SC9 document N 404.**

Both CD 15706-2 and ISO 15706:2002 DAM 1 will be registered at the DIS (Enquiry) stage for a five month vote among ISO's member countries.

### **ACTION REQUESTED:**

- **Please retain for future reference during the Enquiry stage vote on DIS 15706-2 and ISO 15706:2002 DAM 1**

With regards,

*[original signed by]*

Jane Thacker  
Secretary, ISO/TC 46/SC 9

*The ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat is provided by Library and Archives Canada on behalf of the Standards Council of Canada, a member of the ISO.*

**TABLE OF REPLIES**  
**from the vote on ISO Committee Draft 15706-2**

**"International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)"**

*Note: CD 15706-2 was accompanied by Draft Technical Report 20925 for review and comment*

Reference numbers: ISO TC46/SC9 N 399 and N 400

<b>MEMBER</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Agree</b> to advancing draft to DIS stage	<b>Do not agree</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Comments on CD 15706-2</b>	<b>Comments on DTR 20925</b>	<b>Did not vote</b>
SAI (Australia)	P						SAI
BDS (Bulgaria)	P	BDS			--	--	
SCC (Canada)	P	SCC			SCC	--	
SAC (China)	P						SAC
ICONTEC (Colombia)	P						ICONTEC
DZNM (Croatia)	P	DZNM			--	--	
CSNI (Czech Rep.)	P	CSNI			--	--	
DS (Denmark)	P	DS			--	--	
SFS (Finland)	P	SFS			SFS	--	
AFNOR (France)	P	AFNOR			--	--	
DIN (Germany)	P			DIN			
MSZT (Hungary)	P	MSZT			--	--	
UNI (Italy)	P	UNI			--	--	
JISC (Japan)	P	JISC			--	--	
KEBS (Kenya)	P						KEBS
NEN (Netherlands)	P	NEN			--	--	
NSF (Norway)	P	NSF			--	--	
PKN (Poland)	P	PKN			--	--	
IPQ (Portugal)	P	IPQ			--	--	
GOST R (Russian Fed.)	P						GOST R
SABS (South Africa)	P						SABS
AENOR (Spain)	P	AENOR			--	--	
SIS (Sweden)	P	SIS			--	--	
SNV (Switzerland)	P			SNV			
BSI (United Kingdom)	P	BSI			--	--	
ANSI/NISO (U.S.A.)	P	ANSI			ANSI	ANSI	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>6</b>

**Comments [and responses] on CD 15706-2, International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)**  
*[issued on 2005-01-03 as ISO/TC46/SC9 document N 399]*

Date: 2005-06-20

Document: ISO/TC46/SC9 N 404 revised

ISO Member Body	Clause number, etc.	Para-graph, etc.	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change) by the Member Body	Proposed change by the Member Body	WG1 response
-----------------	---------------------	------------------	-----------------	---	------------------------------------	--------------

CA	N/A		ge	<p>Canada approves Committee Draft 15706-2 for advancement to the DIS stage.</p> <p>Various sectors of the Canadian audiovisual industry responded to the draft standard with positive comments on the benefits of V-ISAN. The excellent work of the experts who are developing the V-ISAN standard was also noted.</p> <p>We have no comments on the accompanying DTR 20925 at this stage.</p>	Not applicable.	[Response not required.]
CA	1 (Scope)	2 <sup>nd</sup> para.	ge	<p>V-ISAN will also have implications for program tracking and audience measurement. These applications should be kept in mind as the project develops.</p>	<p>Possibly expand the uses for V-ISAN mentioned in the 2<sup>nd</sup> sentence to include program tracking and audience measurement.</p> <p>Alternatively, ensure that these uses are covered in the FAQs and any other promotional materials.</p>	<p>Program tracking and audience measurement applications are included in the FAQs. These applications will be kept in mind as the project develops.</p>

Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

**Comments [and responses] on CD 15706-2, International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)**  
*[issued on 2005-01-03 as ISO/TC46/SC9 document N 399]*

Date: 2005-06-20

Document: ISO/TC46/SC9 N 404 revised

ISO Member Body	Clause number, etc.	Paragraph, etc.	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change) by the Member Body	Proposed change by the Member Body	WG1 response
CA (SCC – Canada)	7.1 General		ge	<p>One respondent expressed concerns about the criteria that will be used for identification of a work's artistic content components and requested clarification of this issue before the project progresses to further stages.</p> <p>Are universal criteria in development for identification of artistic content components? For instance, will the same criteria be applied by all agencies of the ISAN/V-ISAN network to determine which are the "principal cast members" (i.e. lead actors) of a work? Will universal guidelines for the way in which names are recorded in the ISAN and V-ISAN registers be established?</p> <p>We recognize that artistic content components are more directly related to ISAN but this issue has a bearing on V-ISAN in terms of knowing that the version segment is being attached to the correct ISAN. It also concerns the integrity of data capture and management throughout the ISAN / V-ISAN system.</p>	<p>The criteria to be used in identifying a work's artistic content components should be specified as part of the organizational relationship between ISAN and V-ISAN.</p> <p>Will such criteria be established by the Registration Authority, or by individual registries?</p>	<p>The Registration Authority will establish internal system rules for data, including the form of names in the register. This gives the system the flexibility to accommodate industry developments and new user requirements without having to undertake a revision of the ISO standard.</p> <p>The RA will work with other databases in the audiovisual industry to enhance the usefulness of the ISAN and version register.</p>
CA (SCC – Canada)	7.2.1	Foot-note 2	ge	<p>Canada approves the nomination of the ISAN International Agency as the Registration Authority for the V-ISAN standard. We view this as a very positive development.</p> <p>Linking ISAN and V-ISAN as two parts of the same International Standard with the same Registration Authority is essential for the effective implementation and widespread adoption of both ISAN and V-ISAN.</p>	[Not applicable]	[Response not required.]

**Type of comment:** ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

**Comments [and responses] on CD 15706-2, International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)**  
*[issued on 2005-01-03 as ISO/TC46/SC9 document N 399]*

Date: 2005-06-20

Document: ISO/TC46/SC9 N 404 revised

ISO Member Body	Clause number, etc.	Paragraph, etc.	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change) by the Member Body	Proposed change by the Member Body	WG1 response
CA (SCC – Canada)	7.4 (Resolution service providers)		ge	Please refer to our comments on Draft Amendment 1 to ISO 15706:2002 which suggest that an equivalent concept for linking to third-party databases of enriched information could be introduced into the ISAN standard as well.		See response to comment on DAM 1.
CA (SCC – Canada)	Annex B (V-ISAN registration records)		te	One of our reviewers (from the Canadian national committee involved with ISO/IEC JTC1/SC32 "Data management and interchange") suggests that a more IT-enabled approach should be taken with the data elements in Annex B by assigning each of them their own globally unique identifier, which would allow one to prepare tables of the names and definitions of each of these data elements in any language. An example of this approach can be seen in Annex A of ISO/IEC 5218 which has two such tables with multilingual equivalencies including their mapping into XML. ISO/IEC 5218 is available via <a href="http://www.jtc1.org">www.jtc1.org</a> (under "freely available documents").		The RA will establish specifications for the internal structure of the database and the labels used for data elements in the register.  For clarification, the 3 <sup>rd</sup> sentence of B.2 has been revised to: "The V-ISAN Authority will define the <u>interface specifications</u> and...."
US (ANSI – U.S.A.)	7.3.3 7.4.2 App B	m (1) Table B-1	te		Should "administrative data" be "administrative <u>metadata</u> "?	The change has been made.
FI (SFS – Finland)	Annex A paragraph A.1.1		te	Adding an example would clarify		The wording of the 1 <sup>st</sup> item was changed to: "a specific language track or <u>combination</u> of language tracks". Other examples do not need clarification.

Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

**Comments [and responses] on CD 15706-2, International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)**  
*[issued on 2005-01-03 as ISO/TC46/SC9 document N 399]*

Date: **2005-06-20**

Document: **ISO/TC46/SC9 N 404 revised**

ISO Member Body	Clause number, etc.	Paragraph, etc.	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change) by the Member Body	Proposed change by the Member Body	WG1 response
Other changes agreed by TC46/SC9 WG1	Title		ge	<p>"(V-ISAN)" was removed from the title. Feedback from producers and other potential users indicates that they see version identification as a component of the ISAN system and are not using the separate term "V-ISAN". To facilitate marketing and implementation efforts, the term V-ISAN was suppressed in the title of the standard although, for practical reasons, it will remain in the text so that the standard is not further delayed.</p> <p>Related editorial changes were made to the Introduction and in the first paragraph of the Scope clause.</p>		
Other changes agreed by TC46/SC9 WG1	1	5	ge	<p>The last sentence of the scope clause (referring to a separate Technical Report) was deleted. WG1 is recommending that DTR 20925 should be replaced by operational guidelines established by the ISAN International Agency (which will be the Registration Authority for both parts of ISO 15706). Until ISO 15706-2 is approved, however, DTR 20925 will remain available as a TC46/SC9 document to illustrate how various V-ISAN processes could work.</p>		
Other changes agreed by TC46/SC9 WG1	Bibliography	[1]	te	<p>The reference to DTR 20925 was deleted from the Bibliography (see above explanation). A reference was added for the forthcoming IETF RFC standard on the ISAN URN definition.</p>		

**Type of comment:** ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

**RESPONSES TO COMMENTS ON DRAFT TECHNICAL REPORT 20925  
 V-ISAN OPERATIONAL GUIDELINES**

ISO Member Body	Clause number, etc.	Para-graph, etc.	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change) by the Member Body	Proposed change by the Member Body	WG1 response
US (ANSI – U.S.A.)	D.3		te		Should or would there be a list of variants sent back to the user?	Annex F describes the process for listing all registered versions associated with a specific ISAN.
US (ANSI – U.S.A.)	F.1	2 <sup>nd</sup> paragraph, last sentence	ed		Delete the “a” after offer and before “this.”	The correction has been made.

**IMPORTANT NOTE:** ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1 recommends that further development and publication of ISO TR 20925 is no longer necessary. The ISAN International Agency has agreed to act as Registration Authority for V-ISAN and will assume responsibility for developing and maintaining operational guidelines of the V-ISAN registration system.

DTR 20925 will remain available as a TC46/SC9 document until ISO 15706-2 is approved in order to illustrate how some V-ISAN registration processes and queries might function.

**TABLE OF REPLIES**  
**from the vote on ISO 15706:2002 Draft Amendment 1**  
**"International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – AMENDMENT 1:**  
**Alternate encodings and editorial changes"**

Reference number: ISO TC46/SC9 N 401

<b>MEMBER</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Agree</b> to advancing draft to Enquiry (DIS) stage	<b>Do not</b> <b>agree</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Comments on</b> <b>DAM 1</b>	<b>Did not vote</b>
SAI (Australia)	P					SAI
BDS (Bulgaria)	P	BDS			--	
SCC (Canada)	P	SCC			SCC	
SAC (China)	P					SAC
ICONTEC (Colombia)	P					ICONTEC
DZNM (Croatia)	P	DZNM			--	
CSNI (Czech Rep.)	P	CSNI			--	
DS (Denmark)	P	DS			--	
SFS (Finland)	P	SFS			--	
AFNOR (France)	P	AFNOR			--	
DIN (Germany)	P			DIN		
MSZT (Hungary)	P	MSZT			--	
UNI (Italy)	P	UNI			--	
JISC (Japan)	P	JISC			--	
KEBS (Kenya)	P					KEBS
NEN (Netherlands)	P	NEN			--	
NSF (Norway)	P	NSF			--	
PKN (Poland)	P	PKN			--	
IPQ (Portugal)	P	IPQ			--	
GOST R (Russian Fed.)	P					GOST R
SABS (South Africa)	P					SABS
AENOR (Spain)	P	AENOR			--	
SIS (Sweden)	P	SIS			--	
SNV (Switzerland)	P			SNV		
BSI (United Kingdom)	P	BSI			--	
ANSI/NISO (U.S.A.)	P	ANSI			--	
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>6</b>

**Comments [and responses] on ISO 15706:2002 DRAFT AMENDMENT 1, International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)**  
*[issued on 2005-01-03 as ISO/TC46/SC9 document N 401]*

Date: 2005-06-20

Document: ISO/TC46/SC9 N 404 revised

ISO Member Body	Clause number, etc.	Paragraph, etc.	Type of comment	Comment (justification for change) by the Member Body	Proposed change by the Member Body	WG1 response
CA (SCC – Canada)	Annex C	C.4 (new)	ge	<p>The draft Part 2 of ISO 15706 builds a mechanism into the structure of the V-ISAN for linking to entities ("Resolution Service Providers") that can provide additional information about the registered versions of works in the V-ISAN system. This provision recognizes the enormous potential of ISAN and V-ISAN for improving the international administration of audiovisual works across different sectors of the audiovisual industry, to the benefit of all participants.</p> <p>The idea of providing a mechanism for linking the V-ISAN to enriched third-party databases of information is a creative and elegant solution to concerns about the availability of data. The introduction of this concept in the V-ISAN standard, however, raises the question: will a similar mechanism be incorporated into the ISAN standard as well? After all, much of the additional information that will be handled through V-ISAN Resolution Service Providers will be data that actually applies to the original work and all its versions.</p> <p>We also note that a single entity may act as both an ISAN and V-ISAN registration agency. If that becomes a common arrangement, such agencies will have all the protocols in place for linkages with V-ISAN Resolution Service Providers, which could be readily applied to the equivalent ISAN linkages.</p>	<p>Incorporate the concept of Resolution Service Providers into the ISAN standard.</p> <p>If that is not possible in the timeframe of this Amendment, we request that this proposal be submitted to the Registration Authority for consideration as a possible Amendment 2 at the appropriate time.</p>	<p>It would be premature to introduce the concept of Resolution Service Providers into the ISAN standard at this particular stage of ISAN implementation. However, the suggestion has been brought to the attention of the Registration Authority for future consideration.</p>
Other changes	3.4 & 3.5 (Notes only ); 4.1; E.1; F.1; F.2		ge	<p>Editorial changes were made to clarify that the specifications refer to ISAN for audiovisual works and should not be assumed to also include versions of audiovisual works (e.g. "An ISAN" was changed to "An ISAN for an audiovisual work").</p>		

**Type of comment:** ge = general te = technical ed = editorial