



**ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat**  
Library and Archives Canada  
Standards – IMO  
Ottawa, CANADA  
K1A 0N4

**ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secrétariat**  
Bibliothèque et archives Canada  
Normes – BGI  
Ottawa, CANADA  
K1A 0N4

Telephone - Téléphone  
(819) 994-6939  
Fax : (819) 934-4388  
E-mail - Courriel  
iso.tc46.sc9@lac-bac.gc.ca

<http://www.lac-bac.gc.ca/iso/tc46sc9/index.htm>

**ISO TC 46/SC 9 N 443**  
2006-03-08

To: Members of ISO TC 46/SC 9  
ISO TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1 (ISAN & version identifier)

From: Jane Thacker,  
ISO TC 46/SC 9 Secretary

**Subject: Preliminary report of voting on ISO Draft International Standard 15706-2,  
*International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier***

Dear Colleagues,

Attached are the voting results and comments on ISO Draft International Standard 15706-2 concerning the ISAN version identifier. The voting on DIS 15706-2 ended on March 1, 2006.

DIS 15706-2 was approved by 100% of the 20 ISO member countries that voted. There were 7 abstentions and no negative votes. Comments on DIS 15706-2 were received from the member bodies for Australia, the United Kingdom, the U.S.A. and from the editorial staff at the ISO Central Secretariat.

The comments on DIS 15706-2 are being forwarded to TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1 for discussion and response.

Based on WG 1's responses to comments and the nature of any changes that might involve for the text of DIS 15706-2, the SC9 Chairperson and Secretariat will decide either to advance the modified DIS directly to publication as an ISO International Standard or to issue it for a final two-month vote at the Approval stage as FDIS 15706-2. The responses to comments and subsequent decision of the SC9 Chairperson and Secretariat will be recorded in a final Report of voting which will be sent to you no later than May 31, 2006.

**ACTIONS TO BE TAKEN:**

- **This preliminary Report of voting is for the information of ISO's voting members.**
- **The comments shown in Annex B are to be discussed by TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1.**
- **A final Report of voting will be issued to ISO's member bodies no later than May 31, 2006.**



PRELIMINARY REPORT OF VOTING ON ISO/DIS 15706-2	
Closing date of voting 2006-03-01	ISO/TC 46 /SC 9
Secretariat SCC	

A report shall be returned to ISO/CS no later than 3 months after the closing date of voting on the DIS, whether or not comments have been reviewed and/or a new text has been prepared.

- Preliminary report**  
*(submitted in those cases where comments are still to be considered and/or a decision has not yet been taken, or where it is decided that the nature of comments indicates a need for further consultation and/or reversion to a previous project development stage). To be followed by a 'Final report'.*
- Final report**  
*(submitted either immediately, when all comments have been reviewed and a decision can be taken, or following a 'Preliminary report'. The final report is circulated by ISO/CS to member bodies, and is distributed with any associated DIS or FDIS text)*

<p><b>1 Result of the voting</b></p> <p>The above-mentioned document was circulated to member bodies with a request that the ISO Central Secretariat be informed whether or not member bodies were in favour of registration of the DIS as a Final Draft International Standard or for publication in the case of unanimous approval.</p> <p>The vote closed on the date indicated above. The replies listed in annex A have been received.</p> <p><b>2 Comments received</b> } See annex B, attached.</p> <p><b>3 Observations of the secretariat</b></p> <p><b>4 Decision of the Chairman</b></p> <p><b>Preliminary report</b> (no annexes required)</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> The comments are under review and/or a decision on further procedure has not yet been taken</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The project is to revert to the Preparatory Stage (a new working draft will be developed)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> The project is to revert to the Committee Stage (a new committee draft will be developed)</p> <p><b>Final report</b></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Having received 100% approval from the member bodies voting, the DIS is approved for direct publication without change other than editorial (no FDIS vote) <i>(Option not applicable to projects progressing under the Vienna Agreement)</i></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> A revised text is to be submitted to ISO/CS for the approval procedure (FDIS vote)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> A revised text is to be submitted to ISO/CS for a further enquiry (DIS) vote</p>
---

**Remarks** (e.g. observations on how comments were reviewed, date by which a decision is to be taken, date when a text is expected)

**Comments will be discussed TC46/SC9 WG1. A final Report of voting (including decisions in reponse to comments on DIS 15706-2) will be issued no later than May 31, 2006.**

**Enclosures**

- Annex A: Table of replies received**
- Annex B: Comments on DIS 15706-2**

Signature of the Secretary <i>[Original signed by]</i> <b>Jane Thacker</b> Date 2006-03-08	Signature of the Chairman Date
--	-----------------------------------

**Table of replies from the vote on  
ISO Draft International Standard 15706-2,  
"International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier"**

Approvals: 20 (= 100%)  
Negative votes: 0  
Abstentions: 7

Committee: ISO TC 46/SC 9  
Voting started: 2005-10-01  
Voting ended: 2006-03-01

Country	Member	Status	Vote
Australia	SA	P Member	Approval with comments
Austria	ON	O Member	Abstention
Bulgaria	BDS	P Member	Approval
Canada	SCC	P-member	Approval
China	SAC	P Member	Approval
Colombia	ICONTEC	P Member	Abstention
Croatia	HZN	P Member	Approval
Cuba	NC	O Member	Approval
Czech Republic	CNI	P Member	Approval
Denmark	DS	P Member	Abstention
Finland	SFS	P Member	Abstention
France	AFNOR	P Member	Approval
Germany	DIN	P Member	Abstention
Hungary	MSZT	P Member	
Italy	UNI	P Member	Approval
Japan	JISC	P Member	Approval
Kenya	KEBS	P Member	Approval
Netherlands	NEN	P Member	Approval
Norway	SN	P Member	Approval
Poland	PKN	P Member	Approval
Portugal	IPQ	P Member	Approval
Russian Federation	GOST R	P Member	Approval
South Africa	SABS	P Member	Approval
Spain	AENOR	P Member	Abstention
Sweden	SIS	P Member	Approval
Switzerland	SNV	P Member	Abstention
Ukraine	DSSU	P Member	Approval
United Kingdom	BSI	P Member	Approval with comments
U.S.A.	ANSI	P Member	Approval with comments
ISO Central Secretariat		n/a	Editorial comments
ISO TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat		n/a	Editorial comments

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
ISO Member Body	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the Member Body	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB (U.K.)	1	Paragraphs 2,3 and 4	ge	The phrase “other content related to an audiovisual work” is too loosely worded and it is unclear what might be in scope. The V-ISAN could thus be used to identify anything, including items that already have ISO identifiers. (e.g. the book of the film, soundtrack recording etc.).	The standard should either reword the statement more precisely or clarify the scope by giving examples of what can and cannot be included under “other content”.	
US (U.S.A.)	Annex A		te		Consider making specific mention of “presentations” which are primarily in “web-form” such as Pod-casts. Perhaps in Annex A, section A.2: Other content related to an audiovisual work?	
US (U.S.A.)	general		ge	Consider the establishment of permanent version numbers. Perhaps someone can compile all the various languages, versions (PAL, ...), etc. and assign a number (e.g., English, original version, PAL, etc. and the number would be something like 4565-3678). So regardless of the ISAN (root) assigned, the version number would be the same regardless of the publisher. In other words, there would be a manual of version numbers that would be constantly updated.		

1 MB = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
ISO Member Body	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the Member Body	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

<b>AU</b> Australia	Annex E		ge	<p>The proposed XML encoding of V-ISAN is reasonable, but it seems likely that V-ISANs will almost always be transmitted in the context of some other scheme. What is the purpose of encoding a V-ISAN in XML? What exactly does the phrase “The V-ISAN, when represented in XML documents” mean? Is this only a normative requirement for a V-ISAN authority or does it apply more generally?</p> <p>If the latter, is there an intention to express the ISAN in the form of a URI in other schemes that would resolve to the proposed XML encoding?</p> <p>If so, who would ensure the persistence of such URIs?</p> <p>And in general terms, how does the requirement to encode ISAN and V-ISAN in XML relate to the requirement to encode other standard numbers in XML?</p>	Either make the Annex non-normative or clarify the usage scenarios that would require XML encoding of a V-ISAN or both.	
<b>AU</b> Australia	Annex E.1		ed	“The V-ISAN, when represented in XML documents, should be encoded according to the schema in Section D.2”	“The V-ISAN, when represented in XML documents, should be encoded according to the schema in Section E.2”	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general                      **te** = technical              **ed** = editorial

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
ISO Member Body	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the Member Body	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

** (ISO editor)	Foreword	ISO 15706:2002	ed	The parts list should only include Part 2. In full text after the title of Part 2, explain what will happen to ISO 15706:2002.	For example, <i>"At the next revision of ISO 15706:2002, it will be cancelled and replaced as ISO 15706-1."</i>	
** (ISO editor)	Clause 2	Terms and definitions	ed	<p>Please see ISO 10241:1992 and Annex C [sic]of the ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 2004 for the drafting and layout of terms and definitions.</p> <p>The form of a definition shall be such that it can replace the term in context. Definitions shall be one single phrase and all other information shall be in the form of notes.</p> <p>Please review all of the terms and definitions. Two examples of proposed changes are given.</p>	<p>For example</p> <p><b>3.1</b> <b>ISAN</b> <b>International Standard audiovisual number</b> number allocated for the unique identification of an audiovisual work in accordance with ISO 15706</p> <p>or</p> <p><b>3.2</b> <b>private number</b> V-ISAN reserved and having meaning only in the context of the organization that created it, is not registered with the V-ISAN register and is not normally exchanged between entities since different entities may assign the same private number to different versions of a work</p>	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general                      **te** = technical              **ed** = editorial

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
ISO Member Body	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the Member Body	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

*** (SC9 Sect.)	Bibliography	[2]	ed	The RFC for the URN encoding of ISAN has been published.	The temporary references to the Internet Draft should be replaced with "RFC 4246" before publication of 15706:AMD1 and 15706-2.	The change will be made.
--------------------	--------------	-----	----	--	---	--------------------------

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general                      **te** = technical              **ed** = editorial