



## ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1

for ISO Project 15706: International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN)  
and ISO Project 20925: Version identifier for audiovisual works (V-ISAN)

**Web page:** <http://www.lac-bac.gc.ca/iso/tc46sc9/wg1.htm>

## ISO TC 46/SC 9/WG 1 N 247

*Updated as of 2004-11-04*

### **Subject: WG 1 responses to comments on ISO Committee Draft 20925-1, Part 1 of the V-ISAN standard**

The voting results and comments on CD 20925-1, *Identifier for versions of audiovisual works and related content (V-ISAN) – Part 1: Structure and use* were distributed in February 2004 as SC 9 document N 374. CD 20925-1 was approved for advancement as a Draft International Standard (DIS) by 17 of the ISO member bodies that voted. There were 2 negative votes (Denmark and the Russian Federation) and no abstentions.

This document records the responses by ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Working Group 1 to comments received from ISO's member bodies during the voting on Committee Draft 20925-1, as discussed at the WG1 meeting on March 1-2, 2004 in Santa Monica. Responses to most of the comments on CD 20925-1 were prepared at that meeting. The one outstanding item is a final response to the Danish comment on XML and the check character.

At its September 2004 meeting, WG 1 agreed that the normative sections of the V-ISAN standard should be merged into a single document and that the lengthy informative annexes in the existing Working Draft for Part 2 should become the subject of a separate Technical Report. WG 1 also concluded that implementation of both ISAN and V-ISAN would be helped by closer integration of the two standards so it proposes to reconfigure the V-ISAN standard as a new Part 2 of ISO 15706. This will also require some editorial amendments to ISO 15706:2002 in order to clarify distinctions between the two parts.

The new V-ISAN documents will be distributed for voting by December 2004, as follows:

- Committee Draft 15706-2, consisting of the normative specifications for the V-ISAN version identifier under the tentative title: *Information and documentation – International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Part 2: Version identifier (V-ISAN)*
- Draft Technical Report 20925, consisting of informative guidelines for operations of the V-ISAN system under the tentative title: *Information and documentation – International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – Version identifier (V-ISAN) operational guidelines*
- Draft Amendment 1 to ISO 15706:2002, under the title: *Information and documentation – International Standard Audiovisual Number (ISAN) – AMENDMENT 1: Alternate encodings and editorial changes*

TABLE OF REPLIES: ISO Committee Draft 20925-1, V-ISAN structure and use

<i>P-Members of ISO/TC46/SC9</i>	<i>Agree to register as DIS</i>	<i>Disagree</i>	<i>Abstain</i>	<i>Did not reply</i>	<i>Comments submitted</i>
<b>Australia (SAI)</b>				SAI	
<b>Bulgaria (BDS)</b>	X				
<b>Canada (SCC)</b>	X				SCC
<b>China, P.R. (CSBTS)</b>				CSBTS	
<b>Colombia (ICONTEC)</b>				ICONTEC	
<b>Croatia (DZNM)</b>	X				
<b>Czech Republic (CSNI)</b>	X				CSNI
<b>Denmark (DS)</b>		DS			DS
<b>Finland (SFS)</b>	X				
<b>France (AFNOR)</b>	X				
<b>Germany (DIN)</b>	X				
<b>Hungary (MSZT)</b>				MSZT	
<b>Ireland (NSAI)</b>				NSAI	
<b>Italy (UNI)</b>	X				
<b>Japan (JISC)</b>	X				
<b>Kenya (KEBS)</b>				KEBS	
<b>Netherlands (NEN)</b>	X				
<b>Norway (NSF)</b>				NSF	
<b>Poland (PKN)</b>				PKN	
<b>Portugal (IPQ)</b>				IPQ	
<b>Russian Fed. (GOST R)</b>		GOST-R			GOST-R
<b>South Africa (SABS)</b>	X				
<b>Spain (AENOR)</b>	X				
<b>Sweden (SIS)</b>	X				
<b>Switzerland (SNV)</b>				SNV	
<b>U.K. (BSI)</b>	X				
<b>U.S.A. (ANSI)</b>	X				
<b>TOTAL (of 27)</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>

## COMMENTS ON ISO COMMITTEE DRAFT 20925-1

### General comments

#### SCC (Canada)

We recognize that Part 1 of this future V-ISAN standard deals with the structure, syntax and display of the V-ISAN identifier from a technical perspective and, as such, Canada approves Committee Draft 20925-1.

Nevertheless, future approval of ISO 20925 as a whole will depend largely on the content of Part 2 which we anticipate will address the application and administration of the V-ISAN. The specifications in Part 2 will determine whether or not the proposed V-ISAN system is viable and meets the requirements of its intended users.

Canadian reviewers have already expressed interest in the metadata to be associated with each V-ISAN registration, particularly as it relates to components involving artistic content.

The administrative, business and functional relationships between the V-ISAN system and the ISAN agencies will also be of great interest. The V-ISAN could have a very positive effect on ISAN implementation. Any applications of V-ISAN will potentially broaden and strengthen the use and business model for ISAN, particularly in terms of the broadcasting community. We trust that this symbiotic relationship between the two identifiers will be taken into account in the development of Part 2 of this standard.

Depending on how those relationships between ISAN and V-ISAN evolve during the development of Part 2, it would also be worth considering whether the V-ISAN project should be integrated into a multi-part ISO 15706 standard.

**DRAFT WG 1 RESPONSE (as discussed at March 2004 meeting):**

– Acknowledge these points. They will be taken into consideration as the project develops. Also see response to GOST R comments below.

#### GOST R (Russian Fed.)

1. This International Standard will be closely related to ISO 15706. Is not it better to nominate it as an additional part (parts) of ISO 15706 (-2, -3, ... )?

**DRAFT WG 1 RESPONSE (as discussed at March 2004 meeting):**

– The ISAN and V-ISAN will remain as a separate standards for now because the organizational relationship(s) between V-ISAN and ISAN are not yet known. This decision can be reconsidered when the V-ISAN project is further developed and the ISAN system is on a secure operational footing.

2. The term “content” is very ambiguous. It is better to avoid such jargonisms. So the title of this standard might be “Identifier for versions of audiovisual works and derived materials”. And such alternations are to be performed all over the text. The word “related” in this context is too wide. All the examples of “related content” listed in the section A.2 are *derivations* from the original work.

**DRAFT WG 1 RESPONSE (as discussed at March 2004 meeting):**

- In television broadcasting it is possible to broadcast programs that have no moving image component. The version standard has broadened its scope so that such programs can also be registered.
- The first paragraph of Annex A.2 will be copied into Clause 1 (Scope), i.e. "V-ISAN may also be assigned to other content that is derived from or directly related to an audiovisual work if such content is intended for broadcast or other mass distribution and if it is necessary to manage such content in the broader context of an existing ISAN or V-ISAN application."

**Comments on clause 3 (Definitions)****GOST R (Russian Fed.)**

Definitions of the terms "derived material" (or "related content") and "work" will be necessary in the section 3 Terms and definitions.

**DRAFT WG 1 RESPONSE (as discussed at March 2004 meeting):**

- There is no need to define "derived material" or "related content". These are not technical terms. Also see previous response.
- "Audiovisual work" is defined; there is no need to define "work" separately.

**Comments on clause 5 (Affixing and displaying the V-ISAN)****SCC (Canada)**

Revise clause 5.1 to cover all instances of versions and content entities, including any for which there is no place to embed or affix the V-ISAN, add the phrase "or associated with" and reword the first sentence to read:

*5.1 The V-ISAN for a version or content entity related to an audiovisual work shall be permanently incorporated in, affixed to or associated with all occurrences of that specific version or content entity to the extent that it is technically feasible to do so.*

This is also closer to the wording used in the ISAN standard, ISO 15706:2002.

**WG 1 RESPONSE (as decided at March 2004 meeting):**

- Agreed. The phrase "or associated with" will be added at clause 5.1.

**Comments on Annex A (Criteria for assigning V-ISAN)****SCC (Canada)**

Annex A should be labelled as "normative", not "informative". We note that the equivalent Annex in ISO 15706 ("General principles for the issuance and use of ISAN") is normative.

**WG 1 RESPONSE (as decided at March 2004 meeting):**

– Agreed. Annex A will be changed to normative

**Comments on Annex B (Check character for the V-ISAN)****CSNI (Czech Republic)**

Annex B.4: The exact explanation for computation of the check character is missing.

**DRAFT WG 1 RESPONSE (as discussed at March 2004 meeting):**

– Add at Annex B.4 immediately before Figure 2:

“The check character X is calculated over the 16 characters of the ISAN (1 through 16 of Figure 2). The check character Y is calculated over the 24 characters of the V-ISAN (1 through 16 and 18 through 25 in Figure 2).”

**DS (Denmark)**

1. Because XML is also used to present the ISAN in human-readable form we prefer the check digit contained in the XML encoding, so the transformation of XML to displays do not need to calculate the check digit.

**WG 1 RESPONSE NEEDS FURTHER DISCUSSION.**

[Editor's note: There was a short discussion of this comment on the first day of the March 2004 meeting. Participants decided to handle this issue in relation to comments on ISO 15706 Draft Amendment 1. It was noted that the response to this comment should match the response to the equivalent Danish comment on Draft Amendment 1 to ISO 15706 (the ISAN standard). Revisions to Annex F might also be needed.]

2. And in general, it should be checked that V-ISAN is given without space between V and - ISAN, as in 4.4, second time.

**WG 1 RESPONSE (as decided at March 2004 meeting):**

– Agreed and corrected. The space has been closed.

**Other changes agreed by WG 1:**

The reference to ISO 15706 in clause 2 should be an undated reference.