Representation and Power

'The Eastern Door'

Mary Smith

Department of Anthropology

McGill University, Montreal
August 2002

**A Thesis submitted to
The Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research in
partial fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of
Master of Arts**

National Library
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services

Acquisisitons et
services bibliographiques

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Canadä

Contents

Acknowledgements

I would not have come to Canada without the generous financial and practical assistance of a Commonwealth Scholarship so I wish to thank the International Council for Canadian Studies (ICCS). My thanks also go to the Department of Anthropology of McGill University for granting me teaching assistantships, as well as the Centre for Society, Technology and Development (STANDD) at McGill University for its financial assistance and working environment. I am indebted to Kenneth Deer, the editor of The Eastern Door, for his generosity as well as the inspiration he provides to many. My feelings during my first few weeks at McGill were those of confusion and disorientation, which were resolved somewhat by my contact with Carmen Lambert, my supervisor. I wish to thank Carmen for her strength, sustenance and inspiration, and I must mention her unassailable good humour in facing the shifting winds of my imagination and my English accent. I also want to thank Toby Morantz, who was influential to the course of my studies, and always provided warmth and encouragement. I am grateful to those who have helped to facilitate my studies, for the academic support of John Galaty and Jérôme Rousseau and the practical support of Cynthia Romanyk and Diane Mann. I would particularly like to thank Rose-Marie Stano for her advice and understanding, as well as my peers who gave assistance, Daniel Casey and Janalyn Prest. This is also for those who provided friendship in Montreal, all of whom have great ways to smile and who have made it impossible for me to forget them: Ari Gandsman, Tahirih Walsh, Chloe Frommer, Gillian Chilibeck and Allan Dawson. My last thank you must be saved for my family. We seldom realise how lucky we are: for their patience, love and for finding many different ways to laugh.

Résumé

Cette thèse s'attache aux questions de représentation de soi dans les médias autochtones et aux processus qui y sont liés d'articulation des relations de pouvoir entre les communautés autochtones et l'Etat. L'analyse du journal hebdomadaire, *The Eastern Door*, de la communauté Mohawk de Kahnawake au Québec (Canada) permet de voir comment un tel medium peut devenir un véhicule important de construction d'identité et de conceptualisation de Nation autochtone dans le contexte contemporain. *The Eastern Door* joue ce rôle consciemment par son exploration des avenues et directions d'autonomie politique, par les thèmes choisis, par les préoccupations exprimées et par le langage utilisé. Un élément de son engagement en faveur de l'autodétermination de la communauté et de la Nation Mohawk est l'emphase mise sur le comportement collectif et individuel et sur la façon d'être à la fois comme expression d'identité et comme base d'action dans les relations avec l'Etat. Si cette thèse souligne l'influence dans ces démarches des interactions avec l'Etat et du pouvoir de l'Etat, elle démontre aussi l'influence des représentations culturelles qui dans ce cas çi permettent aux Mohawks de développer des stratégies politiques vis-à-vis l'Etat et même d'imposer les agendas politiques et les questions qui doivent être débattues par les gouvernements.

Abstract

This thesis explores processes of self-representation in Indigenous media by analyzing the work of a weekly newspaper, *The Eastern Door*, of the Mohawk community of Kahnawake, Quebec (Canada). The thesis examines articulations of power in relations between State and Aboriginal communities, demonstrating the importance of such a medium for the conceptualization of Aboriginal Nation and construction of identity in the contemporary context. *The Eastern Door* is an important vehicle fro communicating Mohawk identity and nationhood, a role it consciously plays, as part of its commitment to political autonomy. Its commitment is shown by its discursive explorations: of avenues, themes chosen, concerns expressed and language used. An element of this commitment is an emphasis on collective and individual behaviour, and on "being" as an expression of Mohawk identity, both of which provide powerful bases of action for the community and in relations with the State. If this thesis underlines that State interest and power are an influence on these processes, it also demonstrates that the Mohawk engagement with cultural politics is influential itself, allowing the Mohawks to develop political strategies vis-à-vis the State, and even to impose political agendas that have to be engaged with by the government.

Introduction

The Eastern Door

In Aboriginal philosophy, the 'Eastern Door' is the site of spring: of regeneration, growth and development. It is a place which heralds the horizon: "The east is, through its association with sunrise, a place of beginnings and enlightenment, and a place where new knowledge can be created or conceived to bring about harmony or right relations" (Calliou 1995:67). Among the Iroquois, the Mohawks are the 'Keepers of the Eastern Door'; the gateway to Aboriginal culture, and it is the Mohawks who take responsibility for guiding people through it. As such, it is fitting that the Mohawk community of Kahnawake in Quebec should host a community newspaper named The Eastern Door. For outsiders, The Eastern Door greets us; it bids us welcome, but on its community's terms. For a wider Aboriginal community, The Eastern Door reaches out and reminds them of their brotherhood. For the Mohawks of Kahnawake, The Eastern Door situates their culture and heritage, helping them perceive what they share and how they should share it.

This thesis arises from a concern with processes of interaction and how they are mediated through agencies of power, resistance and re-definition. It seeks to discover how various agencies play roles in creating and sustaining governance relating to Aboriginal communities, and will examine the work of The Eastern Door in order to highlight how these processes may be challenged, questioned or reinforced. In this case, this thesis will attempt to explain how The Eastern Door understands, explains and represents both

opaque and transparent social processes, by investigating some of its key themes and how they are discussed.

The Eastern Door's productions can be seen to form an important part of a discourse on Aboriginal politics, representation and politics of position. Globally, many Aboriginal groups have become engaged in the politics of representation (Rushing 1999:75) because they wish to contest the ways in which they have been codified and assessed by governments and states (Atleo 1991:91). These representations form part of a power relationship, which has played an important role in categorizing and controlling Aboriginal groups (Cohen 1993:202). We may define the politics of representation those contests over knowledge about 'culture', character and identity, which form part of 'identity politics'. Some argue that identity politics as strategy are redundant because they elicit only small differentials in the structural socio-economic realities of Aboriginal groups (Rouse 1995:361) and are part of a 'logic of identity' that renders people unaware of their 'true' place in class structure (Rouse 1995:357). But however redundant some may find them, the discourse of 'identity politics' exists on several different levels and is continually utilized by those Aboriginal groups as part of their challenge to state legitimacy and as a facet of their right to nationhood.

I will explore the dynamics of representation by examining the ways in which The Eastern Door presents mandates of governance, representation and responsibility, which should illuminate some of the processes by which Aboriginal groups create and sustain ideals and objectives regarding their governance. I will investigate the concerns of The

Eastern Door and how it attempts to write for its community while addressing different audiences and maintaining the philosophical tendencies that dominate its rhetoric. As a result of which I may be able to explore The Eastern Door's embodiment of politics: the tension between reality and idealism (Bay 1981:52). This will contribute to an understanding of the ways in which movements reinforce certain features of their political concerns in order to make appeals to certain values or to re-present realities in ways which enhance their concerns, as well as demonstrating how they are influenced by wider social processes.

Kahnawake and The Eastern Door

Kahnawake is an urban community of 8,000 Mohawk peoples 12 km outside Montreal. It has one of the highest incomes per family of any Aboriginal community in Canada, and one of the highest levels of education (Alfred 1995:2). People from Kahnawake work in various industries inside and outside the community, such as ironworkers, a migrant population who work around North America and particularly in New York. The community also has a significant number of Mohawk-run businesses, which provide a substantial source of income.

The infrastructure of Kahnawake is well developed and it has its own hospital, school, radio station, library/cultural centre and newspaper (The Eastern Door). Kahnawake's traditional political system runs on the basis of factionalism, with three Longhouses that maintain different versions of traditional Iroquois practices. It also has an elected Band Council, the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake (MCK), with its various offices and

jurisdictions (Alfred 1995:3). Kahnawake is the first Aboriginal community in Canada to maintain its own police force, the Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers (Leonardy 1998:243). The community makes every effort to keep the culture alive, particularly the language. The Kahnawake Survival School is a community operated multi-lingual centre for learning the Mohawk language and practices, which is different from the government-operated schools.

Strong and effective political stances of independence and nationhood, means that Kahnawake is a well-known Aboriginal community, not just to other Aboriginal communities, but also to the provincial and federal governments, who due to its political positioning, have had to establish governmental precedents with Kahnawake (such as the Mohawk police force). All authorities continually debate over jurisdiction and autonomy. Mohawks are also known internationally, Kahnawake's scholars and leaders are well-respected Indigenous[1] rights advocates, engaging in international politics. Although many leave, most retain ties: a common goal shared by Mohawks is their commitment to, and ties with the community, as well as their desire for political autonomy.

A striking factor of Kahnawake is its high political mobilization and degree of political competency. Mohawks are known for their militancy; for example, the Mohawks made headlines when they protested the intended development of a Kanehsatake Mohawk burial site by the town of Oka (40km outside Montreal), by helping the Kanehsatake

---

[1] My distinction between 'Aboriginal' and 'Indigenous' is a reflection of a semantic shift in the application of these two terms. At the time of writing, it is preferable to use 'Aboriginal' to signify original occupants of land, while 'Indigenous' has class- and ethnicity- based connotations as well. However, much literature, including The Eastern Door, uses 'Indigenous', especially when speaking of global movements, while it uses Aboriginal to refer to North America's First Peoples

Mohawks in the struggle with the government over land issues, which led them to block the Mercier Bridge, a major access road from the South Shore of the St. Lawrence River to the Island of Montreal. The Oka Crisis was arguably the most important standoff in Canadian history between Aboriginal populations and the state, and symbolises the long-standing problems Aboriginal groups face in Canada in terms of ownership of land and dependency[2]. The Mohawk stance caused varying reactions, including a gun battle between the Mohawks and the SQ; racist riots at the blockades by local Quebecois citizens; the stoning of women, children and elders as they tried to leave via Whiskey Trench, and a frenzied mass media reaction, some of which depicted the Mohawks as criminal, violent and untenable in their protests.

A noticeable problem to affect the community has been the issue of land. For example, in the 1950's, despite protests from the Mohawks, the government took 1,200 acres of Kahnawake land on the South Shore of the St. Lawrence River to transform it into a navigable shipping channel. The Mohawks lost their access to the river, which had an impact that should not be underestimated: a feature of Kahnawake's community identity is its connection to the river, 'Kahnawake' meaning 'by the river' in the Mohawk language. The community is also crossed by haphazard developments (such as the exit ramps for the Mercier Bridge) and toxic landfills. It has a large and growing population, and a lack of housing. However, as a result of growing political engagement, the community is now able to defend this land and its base, both physically and rhetorically.

---

[2] This event raised questions of the Canadian state for its mismanagement and poor treatment of the Mohawks, and is cited as a major reason for its changes in attitude and policy towards Aboriginal groups in Canada, such as the institution of the Royal Commission of Aboriginal Peoples in 1991 (Brant Castellano 2000: 263), the subsequent 'healing fund', as well as a reason for Canada's fall in the international human rights rating in 2001.

The Eastern Door is the Kahnawake community newspaper, serving Mohawks in the community and around it. Kenneth Deer, a Kahnawake Mohawk and a well-known Indigenous rights activist (Wearne 1996:20), established The Eastern Door in 1992. He perceived mainstream media and outside institutions to be manipulating representations of the community before and during the Oka Crisis. These were the main sources of information available to Mohawks and he believed they needed alternatives, as the inaccurate and distorted picture disseminated by these outside bodies was contributing to apathy and lack of community spirit[3]. The Eastern Door was designed to redress this problem, and therefore its mandate is:

> The Eastern Door is a community based newspaper serving the Mohawk of Kahnawake regardless of birth, sex, age, language, politics or religion. The paper strives to be a factual balanced, authoritative source of information with access to all segments of the community. (The Eastern Door)[4]

At this time (as well as before and afterwards), the community faced issues of control, self-determination, governance, as well as feeling a sense of indignation and ignominy at the behaviour of the government. The irresponsibility and lack of sensitivity of government authorities were particularly strong issues, however the need to disavow any type of dependent relationship with the state was more pervasive (Alfred 1995).

The origins of the newspaper support these issues: The Eastern Door was conceived to present alternative and more sensitive news and knowledge to Mohawks within the community, and it is a deliberate attempt to bypass mainstream press representations, as

---

[3] Interview with Kenneth Deer, February 22nd 2002.
[4] This mandate is included on the first page of every edition of The Eastern Door.

well as a contestation of those representations. This trend may be traced through its

ideological fields of presentation: The Eastern Door acknowledges that knowledge and

information (as well as ways of using them) are sources of power. As such it attempts to

interpret news through certain formats. In an interview with Kenneth Deer in February

2002, he spoke of the need to remind people of the long-running issues affecting the

Kahnawake community, such as the events of the Oka Crisis. As part of this effort, he

attempts to advise Mohawks about how their behaviour affects the community and its

consequences[5].

I will later illustrate that The Eastern Door is concerned with behaviour (all types) and

responsibility, which is an influence on the ways relationships are conceptualized within

and outside the community. It substantiates a significant charter for how people should

behave, as well as believing that the tenets of Iroquois philosophy are a source of power

to those who can employ them in every day life, negotiating between the tensions that

arise between modernity and understanding it as a primary source of conflict, while

attempting to find meaning that stems from traditional practice.

Methodology

The Eastern Door has a small staff; it has been in existence for about 10 years and its

founder Kenneth Deer, remains its editor. Its mandate also remains the same. Therefore

---

[5] *"...we communicate long-standing issues – I agree with you that we represent behaviour and say how to behave, because its important to remind people of the issues, long standing ones, what will be important for the future – is unity and awareness. Also there are youth who were not around in the Oka Crisis and don't know – there are a decreasing amount of people who have experienced these struggles – we don't want people to forget what went on and how it has affected us – youth in particular – don't see how their behaviour affects the community –their issues, and their recent behaviour, have been a terrible time for this community. That's why it should be important for them to learn about the consequences of such actions and why it is important to have respect"* (Kenneth Deer: Interview February 2002).

when reading its text and when attempting to analyse its narratives I relied less on its individual staff writers (almost all of whom are Mohawk) and more on its editorial practices, which I understood as imposing a general policy on rhetoric. By and large, those of The Eastern Door maintain similar concerns, and their editor is responsible for maintaining cohesion.

I read every complete edition of The Eastern Door from June 2000 to May 2002. I then identified some main themes, and whether they directly addressed events or presented descriptions of them. Certain themes seem to surface continuously, and appear to be more important than others. They also inform the directions that The Eastern Door takes and a discussion of them will illuminate its philosophy on certain issues. I chose to concentrate on these themes. I then carried out random sampling of complete editions from 1995-2000. I did this because I wanted to find out if the themes had been present all along, or if they were developed according to certain events and circumstances. I also wanted to find out how The Eastern Door's rhetoric had changed over the years, and what factors influenced change.

Once this was done, I carried out a qualitative analysis of narratives because, as will be explained in Chapter Two, The Eastern Door discusses issues in more than one way, but only for a percentage of the time directly. Data thus cannot be kept consistent and in that context quantitative assessments based on titles or events described would not have reflected the meaning or significance of The Eastern Door's rhetoric. In practice quantitative assessments are hard to operationalise when analysing themes, because much

rests on abstract or symbolic referents that depend on interpretation, and cannot be easily reduced to quantitative assessment.

Because I wanted to address semantic issues, a qualitative assessment was very important; this includes looking at themes, words, and language use, types of rhetoric, and main concerns, including commentaries and editorials, and then tracing the same themes through other articles.

It may be possible to garner much information on the Mohawk conceptualization of social dynamics from The Eastern Door; however, it is important to emphasize the distance between a medium of communication and its motivation, and community discourses. Thus, this thesis is concerned with how The Eastern Door represents culture and not how it is an unproblematic representation of culture. For the majority of the time, I have then used The Eastern Door's information as a primary source, rather than attempting to contradict it, and only used alternative information in an attempt to understand The Eastern Door's motivations. News should be seen as a power resource and whether news is true or false is less important than to examine how it enters into power relations, and legitimises or undermines them (Ericson 1991:12).

I have also worked with the view that much media is concerned with the question of 'how does what happened fit with an order of things' (Ericson 1991:109) and this trait should not appear as an abnormality or unique to The Eastern Door. Media is also said to maintain a concern with aggression, crime and deviance (Shoemaker 1996:43-44).

Recognition of this trait enhanced a conceptual understanding of the Eastern Door's concerns with certain themes, and led to insights on when themes were explicit or where they were hidden (implicit) and in what contexts this occurred.

I am interested in transparent and opaque structural conditions, and the ways in which they are masked or engaged with by different groups, especially the strategies that can be employed to contest state hegemonic practices of representation. In this case, The Eastern Door's strategies influence its choices of representation, informed by its philosophy of group practices and behaviour. My concentration on The Eastern Door has meant my research has been limited to non-verbal discourse; my intention is not and has not been to judge how discourses are received by actors outside of their contexts, although this would be a fruitful avenue for future research.

In my understanding and analysis of The Eastern Door, I have brought together theories on representation and narrative that concerns Indigenous and Aboriginal people, and because of the newspaper's concern with behaviour, I have tried to understand the impacts that perceptions of behaviour can have on rhetoric. To that end I have utilised theories on deviance and emotion to help me understand how and why people conceptualise events in certain ways. The Eastern Door is concerned with deviance and social control, but as this interest is generally recognised to be one of the most defining characteristics of "newsworthiness" (Ericson 1991:239), I wanted to understand how The Eastern Door understood it.

As many critics of western scholars pursuing Aboriginal studies note, scholars take from their own cultural setting and project analyses based upon their understanding of society onto Aboriginal peoples (Lattas 1992:61-62). However, in pursuing an analysis of literature, I hope to demonstrate that a newspaper like The Eastern Door, whose purpose is to contradict mainstream society and provide alternatives to it, is already concerned with levels of discourse that rest both on westernized concepts of power and control, and its own.

I met with Kenneth Deer (the editor) on February 22nd 2002 (with Professor Toby Morantz), and we spoke of my findings concerning the newspaper. We then discussed his opinions on The Eastern Door, its mandate, issues affecting the community and its future, as well as Canadian mass media and their treatment of Kahnawake. After this interview I was able to communicate with him later for additional information. Much secondary media also informed me: films, mass media, articles, books, documentaries, personal conversations and impressions that have been taken as secondary sources or enhanced my understanding of the subject area, prevalent attitudes and ways of thinking.

In Chapter One I will briefly address the issues of Indigenous media and Indigenous narrative construction. Although there is much literature in this area, I have only addressed narrative analysis as it relates to Aboriginal peoples and have concentrated on the Canadian context. In Chapter Two I will present the different levels and directions of discourse that influence the way in which events are discussed in The Eastern Door. In Chapter Three, I will illustrate some of the main themes arising from The Eastern Door,

as a process by which events are slotted into significances and allotted meaning. These themes contribute to an understanding of behaviour, so in Chapter Four, I will look at representations of the Mohawk Kahnawake Peacekeepers and assess their symbolic importance for The Eastern Door. In Chapter Five I will attempt to explain the sources of the concerns The Eastern Door maintains, and provide explanation for their narrative construction. The conclusion will discuss the Mohawks' political abilities and the results of politics of representation.

Chapter 1

Indigenous Media, Representation and Narratives: Politics of Identity

"The space outside representation is an ellipsis, 'silence'." (Richards 1994:258)

In many cases, Indigenous self-representation has been stimulated in reaction to situations of colonial representation, where as part of the construction of powerful social control mechanisms, governments and colonial authorities utilised notions about cultural and ethnic identity to further programs of assimilation, repression and cultural annihilation (Wearne 1996:10). Agendas have been advanced through education, media and 'facts' about personality and character, which have impacted policy and practice (Wearne 1996:139). These circumstances relate to many generalized conditions of colonial rule, and are often perceived to remain prevalent in 'post-colonial situations'. All have nuances and have had different applications, although generally social control mechanisms based on the characteristics of certain people can achieve a powerful influence over cultural mindsets and provide an equally powerful basis for resisting them.

Representations of ethnic minorities and Indigenous peoples have followed the changing protocol of academics, travellers, government agents and authorities (Trigger 1986). Shifts in acceptable discourses of humanity, psychology, human rights, evolutionism and difference have impacted these peoples, influencing how they are thought about and understood. In contrast, 'Indigenous representation' contests the previous basis of knowledge about Indigenous peoples and articulates identity in ways that address the inequalities behind this knowledge production (as it is seen to have been created in unequal situations and to be part of a Euro-American discourse of superiority):

> Which story? Told by whom? To what audience and under what circumstances? One of the defining characteristics of Aboriginal American art since the 1960's has been the investigation of stories, narratives, and histories – both verbal and visual.... There are no signs that this impulse to analyse how knowledge is formed and transmitted – that is to say, how power is constructed and maintained – is diminishing...In post modern parlance, such work constitutes a 'discourse on representation': whose ideas, memories, or values are represented, in what form, and toward what end? (Rushing 1999:75)

'Resistance' to colonial rule has taken different forms, whether overt or covert, as a process of challenge or reinforcement, 'everyday forms of resistance' (Wearne 1996:190) have proven to be an anathema to the Canadian Nation State and its authorities. Since the 1960's social movements involving Aboriginal people have shown they can be powerful in challenging the authority of this agency. It is important to remember however, that Aboriginal peoples have never been entirely under the whim of government authorities or passively accepted their positions. Political consciousness raising in the 1960's did elicit new gains for these groups, but John Gledhill (1996:70) suggests that it is inaccurate for us to think of states and bureaucracies as holding an 'iron-clad' grip over their colonial populations until this point. As he states, "Local histories did not stop either during or after the period of direct colonial rule" and later continues, "An emphasis on Western domination and global processes of transformation can obscure Indigenous resistances to domination" (Gledhill 1996:70). This is particularly true of the relationships between French and English colonial bodies and Canada's Aboriginal population, whom, Bruce Trigger (1986:156) argues, had their own perceptions and interpretations of outsiders and were active agents in determining the actions and agencies of these 'newcomers'.

Indigenous Media

The ideas and strategies behind the 'politics of representation' are linked to activism and political social movements. For example, in the late 1960's the American Indian Movement (AIM) took up the question of naming, asking "What Is An Indian?" (Wearne 1996:169), wanting to define whom American Indians were for themselves. As a result of activism begun in the 1960's, an understanding of the value of consciousness-raising in heightening cultural awareness has led to the notion that practical issues of alienation, dispossession and mistreatment are interlinked with cultural demands (Wearne 1996:175) and a revival of spirituality, which again impacts political strategy and motivation.

Much 'Indigenous media' takes up this confrontation as a direct acknowledgement that "to survive the onslaught from the mass media, Indigenous peoples should try to wrest some kind of control over the transmission of information from the agencies that normally dominate it" (Ruby 2000:233). Indigenous media consists of re-representing reality through Indigenous voices and understandings and engenders certain specific problems. Early conceptualisations of 'Media for the Indigenous' were mainly co-authored experiments with interested western observers. Notable examples include Terence Turner, who worked with the Kayapo of Brazil to achieve a co-authored video project, publicizing their fight against a Multi-National Corporation. Eric Michaels[6] is also well known in this field, as is Fay Ginsburg[7]. Unfortunately however, these co-authorships engender problems of their own, Ginsburg (2000:42) terming the interested western do-gooders "media missionaries" and others seeing the co-authorship as an

---

[6] Eric Michaels is probably one of the best-known people to have worked in Indigenous media. His first projects began with Aboriginal groups in Australia, giving them video cameras to use.
[7] Fay Ginsburg is a supporter and a critic of Indigenous media.

assignment of legitimacy to the academic "representor" by Indigenous peoples (Simpson 1996:155), which does not address the problems inherent to representation. Jay Ruby (2000:233) argues that these productions are easily misrepresentative; socially concerned filmmakers have wrongly assumed that films that produce political *reactions* compel people to a desired political *action*. Other Indigenous people work with mainstream mass media to present their own programs, although Ruby (2000: 233) also dismisses this trend: "diversity through mass media is mainstreamed and gives the appearance of minority representation without challenging anything".

What is 'Indigenous media'? Media produced by Indigenous peoples engenders the process of self and communal representation of their communities, carried out by themselves and for themselves. Ruby (2000:213) explains motivations thus: "they wish to represent themselves, and they wish to have themselves, their communities, and their stories presented in ways that differ from the ways in which the mass media have represented them." As Ginsburg (1995:257) further elaborates, "the term Indigenous media respects the understandings of those Aboriginal producers who identify themselves as members of "First Nations" or "Fourth World Peoples", categories that index the sense of common political struggle shared by Indigenous people around the globe". Indigenous media is therefore a title for material generated by a global network of producers, which also seeks to make political and social statements.

Work produced by Indigenous groups also attempts to mediate several types of knowledge, to work across boundaries of space, time and cultural systems, to create

understandable and coherent Indigenous compositions. This challenge involves reproducing culture in a way that is an accurate representation of Indigenous knowledge and its structures, as Marie Battiste (2000:xvii) argues, "there is more than one perspective required to view a box holistically".

Re-presentations aim to redefine Indigenous thought and re-present it for several reasons. Aboriginal peoples seek to readdress categories of knowledge, which are seen to have been implanted by non-Aboriginal scholars and restore traditional values. Indigenous media also works to bring some coherency to cultures that have been displaced via colonial or outside activity, and is concerned with re-articulating knowledge in restorative ways. Systems of colonial domination, whatever the agency involved or to what extent, have had tremendous effects on disarticulating systems of Indigenous knowledge and its communication (Diaz-Polanco 1993:8). Many decisions that those producing Indigenous media make are because of a concern with the transfer of cultural knowledge: "People speak their languages and relate their stories not just to tell of subsistence or sovereignty but also to tell of all that is meaningful for understanding ourselves, individually and collectively, as human beings" (Battiste 2000:xxviii).

As such, the attempts at re-representation and presentation speak to more than resistance or re-definition and are more than cultural statements produced for political reasons. As she further argues, diverse struggles cannot simply be reduced to singular, one-dimensional solutions. However, identity narratives are important vehicles for "discovering the cures that will heal and cure our heritage and knowledge (which) is an

urgent agenda occupying the daily and intellectual lives of Indigenous peoples" (Battiste 2000:xxi). Thus, Indigenous media is directed at self-conscious transformations of culture (Ginsburg 2000:29), raises important questions about the circulation of knowledge and access to it and is a medium for education and healing. It is a conscious attempt to regain cultural integrity after western-based precedents of 'cultural warfare', and also to articulate power and agency in ways that conflict with 'diffusionist'[8] strategies and understandings of the global system (Henderson 2000: 60).

However, for some reading Indigenous media as a 'truthful' reading of an entire culture is as much of an 'essentialist fallacy' as taking traditionally produced ethnographies as "objective recall of their cultural reality" (Ruby 2000:214). As Ginsburg asks, is there a total crisis in representation (Ginsburg 1995: 261)? Claire Smith (2000:11) also questions the abilities of groups to present the 'multivalent' characteristics of Indigenous systems of knowledge in a way that is not canonical and does not reflect current western constructions of dialogue and discourse, but is instead part of living practice. Indigenous media does represent certain 'non-western' types of knowledge through a medium that is seen as a western construction, as James Brown (1999:53) argues, "discourse and representational discourse alike are inoperable from the status quo of power relations between Native people(s) and the dominating society".

For Davis Richards (1994:294), re-presentation is impossible, because "colonial intervention, migration, dislocation, cultural representations have wrought a perpetuating

---

[8]"Diffusionism": a concept that 'genuine culture' is seen to emanate centrally from Europe (Henderson 2000:61).

sense of fracture, a tragic cycle from which no sense of recuperation is possible and which renders the subject silent, invisible, unformed, since representation consists of the replicated divisions of colonial authorities". Donald Taylor (1997:60), similarly argues that due to the inconsistent exposure of Aboriginal people to culture, they are lost in a meaningless vacuum of information in which they may best rely on an idealized reconstruction of the past, valueless colonialism and identity overload. This has the effect, in Richard's opinion, of a conflict of integrity and security, "No-one quite believes their own words; no one quite believes their own fictions: self-consciousness is a priority; self-consciousness is a problem"(Richards 1994:237).

Indigenous Narratives: Constructions and Representations

"The space outside representation is an ellipsis, 'silence'." (Richards 1994:258)
Is self-representation possible? Regardless of the critiques of Indigenous media, and the extent or agency of Indigenous cultural producers, it may be that 'non-representation' is not a worthwhile policy either. Any kind of challenge to colonial and state authority is vital to highlight the anomalies between experience and rhetoric and to contest the authority of states, such as Canada, that rhetorically embrace multiculturalism, consideration of human rights, and the heritage of Aboriginal peoples, while those same people regard themselves as victims of situations similar to apartheid (E.D.[9] Sept 7th 2001:2). If Aboriginal peoples do not engage in representation, they do not challenge these situations (Webster 1995:382). As Michael Ames (1992:140) states, "Since those

---

[9] The Eastern Door will be referred to as E.D. in references.

who control history are the ones who benefit from it, people should have the rights to the facts of their own lives".

Narratives of identity and integrity render this incongruity tangible. Systems of Indigenous representation have depended in many cases on establishing a type of identity alternative to the mainstream, one that gives cohesion to a version of the past that supports the present priorities and concerns of Aboriginal peoples. For Claire Smith (2000:3), the issue here is control of the continued future of Indigenous societies. As such, intellectual and cultural property rights can play large roles in exacerbating misunderstanding between different societies, as do problems of rights, material culture, governance and economic determination and social systems.

However there are inconsistencies embodied in many claims regarding identity, ownership and authenticity of Indigenous knowledge, particularly because it is expected that those fighting will maintain non-permeable cultural boundaries. This can impact representation, as in order to maintain Indigenous identity; groups may be forced to provide an essentialised version of past and of culture. This is also a problem in representation, because many Indigenous groups are forced or expected to select a spokesperson to represent 'ethnicity', using a concept of cultural property that reproduces western concepts of individualism and ownership. However, there is no 'single' view encompassing 'Indigeneity' and it is a misunderstanding of these narratives to equate them with a "monolithic viewpoint" (Fine-Dare 1994:36). Establishing authenticity and 'producing culture' also involves power differentials concerning the producers. Who

narrates the story, and for whom, can be just as significant as the narratives themselves so challenging the authority of an outside body to represent a 'culture' also encompasses questioning the right of the Indigenous person to do so. Narratives should not be read purely as reflections of an alternative reality but the processes of their construction considered too (Ginsburg 1995:257).

Because identity narratives often involve political or cultural demands, they can confirm dialectical differences between 'whitestream' society and Aboriginal societies: "the dominant narratives typically saw Indians as what Whites were not (for example, bloodthirsty, amoral, pagan, ignorant, out of control). The counter narratives also tend to see Indians as what Whites are not (for example, at one with nature, communitarian, egalitarian, spiritual)" (Cornell 2000b:117). Paul Ricoeur (1965:277) explains this problem when he states that, "the fight against colonial powers and the struggles for liberation were…only carried through by laying claim to a separate personality; for these struggles were not incited by economic exploitation but more fundamentally by the substitution of personality that the colonial era had given rise to".

For Cornell (2000: 45), the reasons behind narratives can explain their discursive construction. For example, narratives of identity and difference are often built as "groups try to make sense of new problems or opportunities" and as such may respond to dominant ideas rather than originating separate ones: "Like outsiders' narratives of Indian identity, Indian counter narratives select their events carefully and link and interpret them

in particular ways, making particular kinds of Indians in the process. They, too, generalize" (Cornell 2000: 117).

As mentioned, many critique the nature of Indigenous narrative for its expedience and for the use of events or identity in ways that some find disturbing or somehow false (Hobsbawm 1993:40). Emphasising the separate and distinct elements of Aboriginal existence provides a basis on which to oppose western-held ideas about nationhood, personhood and sovereignty. Cornell (2000b:48) argues that particular interpretations of events may undergird moral or legal claims to power, such as 'telling' dispossession in a way that adds moral force to claims. As Audra Simpson (2000:127) argues, for Mohawks, "'behaving as other nations do' requires that those of Kahnawake maintain a strong sense of themselves as a distinct people with rights and obligations that flow from their distinctiveness". Establishing narratives of difference in representation is a conscious strategy to renew a sense of worth and status in nationhood.

These narratives of difference do, as Cornell notes, tend to reproduce dichotomies. However, this can be explained if we consider Thomas Hall's (1988:31) observation that American Indian efforts have been expanded politically, but are usually 'played out' on Euro-American turf, and "to fight has generally meant the acceptance of some of the premises of that turf", including the discursive measures and representational scenarios of Euro-American formats, such as 'authority' or 'discourse'. As Kimberley Blaeser (1993:57) has argued of Aboriginal literature, with early strategies of re-presentation, a frequently employed mode for re-articulating "native constructions of the category of

knowledge" had to be oppositional, emphasising the tradition of an individual vs.

communal paradigm. This type of construction was necessary to underscore the

differences between 'native' and 'mainstream' society. However, she explains that

although these categories do contribute to an understanding of Aboriginal literature, they

reaffirm an understanding of the Native American through a Euro-American

interpretation, "constructing their own identity as they do by its relationship to that

master template" (Blaeser 1993:57).

This appears to be a dilemma for Indigenous peoples who challenge and produce

knowledge about themselves and others. Ginsburg (2000:30) terms these people "cultural

activists" engaged in "strategic conservatism", because in many cases they employ a

strategy of "cultural refrigeration" (Ginsburg 1995: 265). As Stuart Hall (1992:285)

notes: "identities are the names we give to the different ways we are positioned by, and

position ourselves in, the narratives of the past". However, emphasising present realities

by rooting them in the past can engender problems when others contradict these claims

for their perceived fallacies: such as mass media accusations that Mohawk claims of

moral behaviour are contradicted by cigarette smuggling. People expect Aboriginal

peoples to live the discourses they propagate, and when they find they do not, they

believe they have refuted them. This is a problem of narratives of difference (when

similarities are found), but it also leads us to a valid question: how do people inhabit or

become the discourse they choose (Richards 1994:2000)?

On a practical level this type of positioning involves a process of 'narrativisation':
selecting different types of events and making them coherent, *plotting* these events by
linking them to each other in an associational way, and interpreting what they *signify*.
This refers to the making of claims about what the narrative may indicate and its
relevance to the group (Cornell 2000:43).

Identity narratives are not merely politically or culturally expedient, but are also a way of
interpreting events and understanding them, as well as renewing a type of knowledge that
has been denigrated and subdued. This can be linked to Indigenous groups in particular as
the need to create certain types of narratives is for Cornell (2000:45) a typical process of
those who have suffered disruption in their lives. He argues that individuals turn to
narratives as a means of making sense of situations of breakdown or deviation. Through
narratives "they create order, a sense that things make sense after all, and they do so
through the imposed order of narrative". Because of the systematic denigration of
Aboriginal culture and knowledge, identity narratives are important tools for preserving
and renewing a sense of pride in culture, as well as providing sources of resistance.

Aboriginal peoples can make representations in ways that are geared not towards others,
but towards interpreting and transmitting culture, embodying their systems of
understanding in writing. For example, the use of the "Trickster" character in much
literature:

> Many Indigenous writers maintain Trickster survives incredibly challenging
> experiences only to live and begin again. Just as the traditional Trickster culture
> hero/fixer-upper survived great odds, contemporary Indigenous writers are writing

their cultures *back into stability* and thereby assuring survival (Acoose 1993:39 [my italics]).

They also do so in ways that do not depend on the reproduction of Euro-American

dichotomies, and instead utilize traditional characterizations in an interpretation of

events. As Janice Acoose (1993:38-39) further explains:

> … unlike the Trickster's Christian counterpart, her/his/its motivation is neither solely altruistic or virtuous: Trickster manifestations function just as easily doing unkindly, suspicious, and sometimes cruel deeds as she/he/it does doing kind and virtuous deeds. Perhaps the most important aspect of contemporary Indigenous people's writing that distinguishes our writing from non-Indigenous peoples is the Trickster who endures all: the survivor.

Much of Aboriginal writing is also concerned with space and embodies spirituality.

Acoose (1993:33) quotes from Lee Maracle's (1988:172) "I Am Woman" thus:

> You actually represent an infinite number of people, and the only physical manifestation is yourself. Also, you own your own "house" and that's all you own. It's this "house" that I live in. The "I" that lives in here is the thinking "I", the being "I," the "I" that understands creation, understands that there are consequences for every future action.

However there is a fear of marginalisation by virtue of possessing an Aboriginal status, as

The Eastern Door (Sept 11th 1999:2) states:

> Dances with wolves and North of 60 are not sufficient to change the stereotypical image that the media have made of us. We need more of those kinds of shows, and better ones at that. My concern is: if we have our own cable channel, will there be less energy in the mainstream media to produce movies or a television series about us? Are the producers and media moguls going to decide that a good script about Native people should be sent to the Aboriginal Network where "they" can do their own thing?

Kateri Damm (1993:15) also tells us that Aboriginal producers are always judged by their

Aboriginal identity; this is a difficult experience:

> In Canada, First Nations writers are often expected to write about certain issues, to share certain values, to use certain symbols and icons, to speak in certain ways. We are expected to know everything about our cultures and histories from land claims to spiritual practices to traditional dress. More than that, we are expected

to know this for all 52 First Nations in Canada and, where applicable in the United States.

Identities often have interpretations attached to them that are based on 'insider' and 'outsider' relationships and analyses (Cornell 2000:47). Although Aboriginal peoples in Canada have never been without agency and the ability to interpret the world in their own ways, the type of access they have had to representational vehicles and media has been limited for many years. As a result, the balance is heavily skewed in favour of 'outsiders'. As Greg Young-Ing (1993:185) tells us, "In the 1990's, all books by Aboriginal peoples have been published through small and independent presses. Not one Aboriginal author has been published by a large Canadian publishing house; while over a hundred books about Aboriginal peoples have been published by large Canadian houses already in the 1990's". It appears that redressing the balance is difficult, especially fraught with inconsistencies and contradictions. It is however, an important and urgent task, because Aboriginal peoples suffer from social problems related to these inequalities in power and representation. Such "marginalized groups may lack the inclination to engage in certain ways of thinking and writing because we learn early on that such work may not be recognised or valued" (hooks 1992:129). These are powerful influences: problems with identity can be linked to 'demotivation', which "characterises a lack of purpose, direction and commitment", which Donald Taylor (1997:6) views as a typical process affecting many youth in Aboriginal communities today.

For Richard Wagamese (1996:36) representation of oneself is urgent and necessary because of the overt racism of mainstream society and the ways in which 'relevant' news

items are constructed. He believes that the misunderstanding of Aboriginal identity narratives is rife: "These days, the majority of non-Indians see the relationship of Indian people to the land as being an overtly political one...the news media presents a political view, and thus we are political". He also questions misrepresentation in the Canadian mainstream media: "part of the problem lies in a disturbing lack of information regarding the authentic representation of Indians circa 1990. The media in general somehow sees fit to investigate Indians only when they are dead, dying or complaining"(Wagamese 1996:60). He terms this a 'brown revival' (Wagamese 1996:34) and establishes that Aboriginal peoples in Canada have always maintained their cultures and their actions have always been misunderstood. But as part of a process of education and readjustment, it is necessary to take the message to the outsiders: "Canadians are ignorant. They're ignorant because the information machinery of the government has always been unwilling to allow them access to the realities that Canada's Indian people must live under"(Wagamese 1996:70). The only solution then is that: "The logical launching point lies with the Indians themselves. Through using the tools of modern culture, i.e. the media, native people can reach their fellow Canadians quickly and easily"(Wagamese 1996:80). The Eastern Door supports this view; "We must use modern technology to secure our own survival, not the survival of the dominant society" (E.D. Jan 5th 2001:2).

A constituent part of The Eastern Door's understanding of 'culture' depends on the concern it maintains with dispersing knowledge about culture. I will explore The Eastern Door's understanding of it by utilizing Phillip Wearne's (1996:11) discussion:

> Knowing what we mean by culture is one thing; defining it is another. A common set of values, beliefs and practices that bind a group of people together in a

common perception or understanding of life might be one theoretical definition. A lifestyle or common way of life might be a more practical definition. Culture as a means of making sense of life, giving it meaning, might be a more spiritual interpretation".

I believe The Eastern Door thinks about culture in all of these ways, and it accentuates the last interpretation as an ideal, culture as spirituality. Its understanding also has links to Rayna Green's (1984:7) discussion of identity:

> 'Identity' is never simply a matter of genetic makeup or natural birthright. Perhaps once, long ago, it was both. But not now. For people out on the edge, out on the road, identity is a matter of will, a matter of choice, a face to be shaped in a ceremonial act.

So how do Aboriginal cultural producers endeavour to redress problems engendered in representation? How do they represent and for what reasons are their choices made? How do they negotiate the tension between idealism and reality and what constraints do they encounter in their attempts? I will now explore some of the concerns raised above, by looking at the work of the Eastern Door, and ascertaining its main considerations in its re-presentation and presentation of the Mohawk community of Kahnawake.

Chapter 2

The Eastern Door: Levels and Directions of Discourse

The Eastern Door divides subjects into certain themes. It also works to clarify Mohawk principles and provide a complex interpretation of events by using different levels and directions of discourse, which endow them with different forms of significance. Before a discussion of the main subject areas and concerns of The Eastern Door, we will focus on how The Eastern Door 'writes community' in its structuring of discourse.

The Eastern Door is divided into sections on politics, news, and community events as well as wider Aboriginal issues. The newspaper also discusses items within the context of certain themes: community, representation, responsibility, and tradition are the most prevalent. Ideological preferences filter through the discussion of these themes, and endow stories with greater political relevancy due to the interlinking of reality and ideology. Preferences involve implicit and explicit dialogues on politics and three directions of discourse: that directed to the community, that directed to a global Aboriginal community, and that directed to a wider domestic society, the Canadian institutions and public; as well as a discussion of cultural knowledge and its importance for the future of Kahnawake.

News is often related to governance or constitution, thus a community institution that is consistently featured in The Eastern Door is the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake

(MCK)[10] and its subsidiaries. Kahnawake's police force, the Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers (KMP), is also continuously represented in the newspaper in different ways, as part of news items on actions, jurisdiction, politics, and behaviour. Community entrepreneurs are prominent, as are community events and services, particularly those that mediate community health, both physically and mentally. The newspaper reinforces its mandates by presenting these themes in certain ways, separating positive and negative news, and by consistently re-examining news items and their significances. A concern with outside society and its practices is manifold and discussed openly in terms of politics, as well as forming part of an implicit placement of Kahnawake as a political entity.

The ways in which The Eastern Door chooses to discuss these different subjects maintain discursive similarities in interpretation. We can loosely divide these concerns into two different levels of discourse, implicit and explicit, and three different directions that discourse takes. As an illustration of these two levels of discourse, while The Eastern Door is a community newspaper, it is very political. It can be explicit about its political position, which is one level I will term 'explicit level', or it can be subtle and make implicit allusions to politics when it does not wish to declare a position, which is the other level of discourse, 'implicit level'. The subjects that it chooses to discuss in these ways maintain consistency, for example, a discussion of Canadian policing will maintain a political position, while a discussion of Kahnawake's police force will not.

---

[10] The Mohawk Council of Kahnawake is otherwise known as the Band Council. It has legitimacy stemming from the Indian Act. Although it maintains jurisdiction and its members are voted in to place, it still has problems of legitimacy because it is not coherently linked with a traditional Iroquois governance system.

The Eastern Door attempts to serve three purposes in its discourse and this affects its

interpretation of events. These three purposes I will term directions: the editor, Kenneth

Deer, states that he wishes The Eastern Door to be a window, a door, and a mirror. The

Eastern Door is a window for outside society to look through to view Kahnawake; it is a

door to promote wider Aboriginal access to Kahnawake and it is a mirror for those of

Kahnawake to view themselves[11]. This priority affects its discourse, as it is compelled to

make the effort to be relevant to all.

The Eastern Door's attempts to represent the range of beliefs within the community limits

the political views it may exercise:

> The Role of the Newspaper
> The philosophy of The Eastern Door, and the reason for its creation, is to be a platform of
> information which the community can rely on. This newspaper is not a political body or a faction in
> the community. It is solely a vehicle to distribute news, information and opinions in a fair, and
> unbiased manner.
> There are times when a contentious issue in the community pressures the newspaper to take a
> position one way or another. In this case, those who support the ten agreements with Quebec are
> hoping that The Eastern Door would make a blanket statement or editorial endorsing the
> agreements. Those opposed to the ten agreements are hoping that The Eastern Door would take a
> strong stand against them.
> While there is a temptation as individual staff members to take one position or the other, the
> newspaper must remain as accessible as possible to all sides of the argument. If the paper takes
> one side, it may alienate the other, and that would not be in the best interest of the newspaper or
> the community.
> Other communities have examples, where newspapers have taken strong stands on divisive issues
> that have only added to the deeper divisions in the community. In some instances, multiple
> newspapers are tied to political factions in the community. The newspapers then have political
> goals rather than the obligation of fair and unbiased newsgathering.
> The Eastern Door is striving to remain true to its original objective as being a platform of
> information with access to everyone. It will continue to give both sides of contentious issues and
> give constructive criticism when necessary. (E.D. Sept 3rd 1999:2)

I will now further discuss and explain the two levels of discourse The Eastern Door

maintains, and go on to do the same for the three directions of discourse. I will then

---

[11] Kenneth Deer, Interview February 2002.

illustrate The Eastern Door's philosophy on responsibility, which brings all levels

together.

Levels of Discourse: Explicit and Implicit Discussions

Explicit

When The Eastern Door makes direct reference to events as part of a political schema,

and when it gives opinions and direct assertions of political motivations, the Eastern Door

is being explicit about its political position and its understanding of politics. 'Explicit'

level politics will thus refer to the direct assertion of 'political' events or agendas that are

usually part of a discussion of politics. Usually explicit politics will be found in

editorials, or commentary, for example:

> Unity seems to be a popular word these days. Especially among people who would like to see a reconciliation between the three Longhouses in Kahnawake. In order for the Mohawk Nation and eventually the entire Confederacy to be unified again the process must start at the community level. In each community, not just ours.
> The childish bickering which has been running rampant within each group that would like to take power in Kahnawake must stop. How can we expect to be taken seriously by the federal and provincial governments if we cannot take each other seriously? After all, you cannot sow the seeds of peace using hatred....
> The return to traditional government not only means the complete and total removal of the Indian Act systems from Kahnawake, it also means that we would be embracing the very thing that made the Mohawk Nation and the Iroquois Confederacy something great. It is up to everyone to embrace the process that would lead us back to the path of greatness. Remember, we are Kanien'keh:ka, we do not want to become the descendants of the Mohawk people. (E.D. March 23rd 2001:2)

For the majority of the time, explicit discourse is employed during a discussion of outside

society, and community interactions with it, as well as a discussion of The Eastern Door's

philosophy of behaviour, which explains the interactions. The Eastern Door is

particularly concerned with labelling techniques utilised by government for purposes of

social control, to which it explicitly refers. However, when it talks about how behaviour

within the community can be misinterpreted, it uses similar terms of analysis but only

makes implicit mention to its recommendations for action.

Implicit

Implicit level politics engender a somewhat 'opaque' discussion of the themes utilised

within explicit political or ideological dialogues such as responsibility or accountability

of all governmental authorities. The Eastern Door does not directly engage with these

themes (such as politics), but it does make allusions to certain trends that have been

explicitly mentioned and appear to be interpreted in a similar way, as well as using the

same language and 'trigger words'. Implicit politics are a way of communicating the

seemingly 'hidden agenda' prevalent within the discourse of The Eastern Door. Although

imbued with the same concerns, these implicit links rest more on the audience's ability to

recognise and interpret the significance of events in a political way. This type of

symbolic use reinforces almost 'subconscious' messages and provides forums for and

ways of thinking about community politics. There are links between this level of

discourse and topics such as community events, for example, which feature often. It is

possible to illustrate this trend when discussions of the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake

(MCK) may briefly mention administrative transparency and accountability, but appears

to lack opinion of the event.

Choices of implicit politics may be illustrated as much by The Eastern Door's opinions

on certain matters, as by its relative silence on others. An example that follows discusses

the shooting of a Kanehsatake community member by the Kanehsatake Mohawk Police

under suspicious circumstances. Policing is a highly debated subject, but the article does

not include any kind of comment on the circumstances, instead choosing the Peacekeeper

to narrate the story, which may be an implicit type of support for the Peacekeepers:

> The Kanehsatake Mohawk Police were involved in a tense ten-hour standoff with community member Joe David. The stand-off eventually ended with David being seriously shot and injured by a Kanehsatake Mohawk Police officer.
> David, 42, known as Stonecarver during the 1990 Oka Crisis, was one of the last Warriors to leave the Treatment Center back on September 26, 1990.
> On Saturday, June 5, around 6 p.m. the Kanehsatake Mohawk Police went to David's residence to investigate, they were met by him. He fired shots in their direction with a semi-automatic rifle.
> "The two officers were forced to flee the scene on foot. A ten-hour standoff ensued and attempts to negotiate with the suspect failed; at one point the suspect was standing on Route 344 goading police into a shootout," the statement continues. 'The situation came to an end at approximately 5 a.m. June 6, when several KMP officers entered the property to force the suspect out of his residence. Once again, attempts to negotiate with the suspect failed. "The suspect exited his house and fired several rounds in the direction of the officer, who took cover behind some trees. The suspect pursued the officers and once again, fired several times at the officer. The Kanehsatake Mohawk Police returned fire. The suspect was shot and transported immediately to St. Eustache Hospital. The investigation has been transferred to the Sureté du Québec..."[12]
> When The Eastern Door contacted Terry Isaac, the Chief of the Kanehsatake Mohawk Police, and asked why the SQ was investigating the shooting, he answered, "In a situation where someone gets shot, most police forces get an outside agency to investigate. This is to have a neutral party investigate and to let the public really know what happened and what led to the shooting."
> But the SQ, can they really be neutral investigating the shooting of a Warrior who was involved right to the end of the Oka Crisis?
> "I'm going to talk to the commander at Parthenais about that," answered Isaac.
> Was there any thought of having the Kahnawake Peacekeepers do the investigation?
> "I spoke to Warren (Lahache) for assistance during the standoff, and if that option comes up I will speak to Warren about that."
> About the actual incident, Isaac said, "We didn't go in there shooting. A community member saw him lying on a couch and we went in there to check on him to see if he was all right.
> 'We made a plan to jump him and arrest him when he came out of his house,' stated Isaac. At this point David exited his house shooting. 'The officers took cover behind a tree. He (David) picked up one of the officer's AR-15'.
> The KMP officers then fired shots and David was hit between his shoulder and spinal cord.
> 'We went there to investigate without anyone getting hurt,' said Isaac.
> Dennis Nicholas and his wife Kathy were on their way to Kahnawake on Saturday, to come to the Zero Tolerance Social when they heard what had happened..."The police chief was inquiring what was going on with my being there, which was of no significance," continued Nicholas. "We had to de-escalate the situation into nothing. One of our guys (from the Longhouse) was in there and tried to arrange a peaceful settlement". (E.D. June 11th 1999)

---

[12] The Suréte du Québec is Quebec's security force. Some critics say that they are increasingly removed from the Quebec government's jurisdiction, a problem during the Oka Crisis. For the community however, relationships with the SQ have always been tense, especially because in 1979 members of the SQ shot a resident, David Cross for waving a pool cue at them. Since then they have been banned from the Kahnawake community, unless invited to collaborate with the Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers.

This discussion is narrated as a news story without apparent opinion or judgement of the shooting situation, providing the Peacekeepers' statement of the event, and the newspaper does not question their activities. There is no explicit political positioning on this event, although we are led to believe that this event is connected with politics, especially with mention of the Warrior Longhouse. The main ramification of this event is again, an explicit one because of the Sureté du Québec's involvement, but the circumstances of the implicit politics are not made clear.

Implicit levels of politics surface mainly in the *structuring* of the newspaper and the linking of certain themes. For instance, while The Eastern Door can be quite explicit about its opinions regarding the MCK, often it is not, remaining 'objective' or not expressing an opinion. However, sometimes, in these cases, an article will often be included in the same edition of the newspaper that discusses themes of accountability, as well as an article dealing with spiritual health and responsibilities, for example. When all three articles are presented together they maintain a substantial dialogue on actions and communal behaviour that encourage people to think in certain ways about authority. The Eastern Door then can maintain an appearance of objectivity and politics in a discussion of the MCK while substantiating a different level of discourse based on characterizations of Mohawk people. This type of interlinking occurs often, in different discussions.

Directions of Discourse: Window, Door, and Mirror

As a production, the three main concerns The Eastern Door maintains are reproduced

through its interpretation of events. I will now examine each, as it is possible to trace

these concerns through presentation strategies and symbolic references.

The Window

In being aware of 'the outside society' in its writings, The Eastern Door directs some

elements of its discourse towards that society, as well as being concerned with the events

that occur outside the community. In doing so The Eastern Door opposes previous and

current portrayals of Kahnawake (and other Mohawks) by the Canadian mass media,

which it does explicitly because the editor believes they are distorted and untruthful, and

so presents ways in which they are wrong or biased. One of the ways The Eastern Door

does so is to take behavioural criticisms of Kahnawake that come from mainstream

society, and turn them back at the federal and provincial governments, making parallel

claims by using their own accusations against them, analysing their behaviour using their

analyses of Mohawk behaviour. For example, The Eastern Door defends accusations of

Mohawk immorality during Kahnawake's cigarette smuggling[13] by claiming that in fact,

it was Quebec-based cigarette companies who were selling cigarettes to Mohawks to

smuggle at reduced prices (Kenneth Deer: Interview February 2002).

This can also be shown in the debate between the Quebec government and the Mohawks

concerning the community's plans to establish a casino on reserve land. When the

---

[13] "Cigarette smuggling" is a continuous issue between the Mohawks and the provincial and federal
governments. The Mohawks illegally bring onto the reserve cigarettes which are sold tax-free, not only to
residents but also to non-Aboriginals, who come onto the reserve for this purpose.

Quebec government took over Video Lottery Terminals (VLTS) (Gambling machines that had been installed in the community without a permit), The Eastern Door situated that argument by suggesting that the Quebec government was merely motivated by fiscal gain and not a concern for people:

> When Quebec was seizing illegal video lottery terminals (VLT's) from bars, they weren't doing it because they had concern for citizens losing their welfare checks. They were simply clearing the way for their own VLT's. They didn't want to stop or prevent people from gambling, they just wanted to monopolize the gambling industry in Quebec. (E.D. June 26th 1998:15)[14]

Not only did The Eastern Door render government intent to be purely fiscal but it also made judgements on government behaviour, "governments have a responsibility to their people and should provide the necessary education and treatment for problem gamblers. This is especially true when governments advocate and contribute to the problem" (E.D. June 26th 1998:15). This is a regular tactic for The Eastern Door, as it contradicts outside allegations of Kahnawake's illegality and immorality by positioning the government's own position as opaque and thus immoral. At this time, The Eastern Door did not believe that the Quebec bureaucracy had a legitimate reason to contest the community's casino, especially as it maintained its own casino (E.D. June 26th 1998:5).

In contrast, The Eastern Door presented Kahnawake as a responsible community, which would care for the negative effects of gambling (in contrast to the Quebec government, which did not effectively enough). The Eastern Door wrote of the strategies within the community to resolve problem gambling, and continued further to link problems with addiction to westernized influences, which caused alienation and loss of Mohawk identity. This gave gambling as a problem a mainstream source, not an Aboriginal one.

---

[14] Although gambling is seen to be a problem for the community, many of the gamblers were non-Mohawks. The Quebec government also operates a casino near Kahnawake

This demonstrates that part of The Eastern Door's focus on being a window to the community is because of a concern with mainstream media's representations, which it reverses. It goes further to establish a moral pretext on which to contest governmental actions that affect the community, thus setting another agenda.

A constituent part of The Eastern Door's method of interpretation is a moral judgement based on its opinions about ethics, behaviour and accountability. I will discuss and examine these opinions later, because they are prevalent sources of analysis. This interpretation works in opposition, and is a table of actions against which moral dialogues are compared, scrutinized and established. For example, The Eastern Door's examination of governmental actions towards citizens is an important part of its generalized discourse about society.

The Eastern Door also shows how images of the community are untruthful or misunderstood. For example, the newspaper believes that the Canadian society often labels Mohawks as badly behaved, usually as criminal or deviant. The Eastern Door challenges the mass media's generalized concern with violence and criminality among the Mohawks as it presents a peaceful, law-abiding and cohesive community, respectful of, and responsible toward, others. For example, delinquency is presented as an abnormality in contrast to the views of outsiders and often blamed on western sources, or less directly, drug dealing for example which is presented as a behavioural trait of those who lack a sufficient sense of Mohawk identity.

The Eastern Door's concerns with presenting the community in a favourable way establish a dialogue on how the government behaves (in particular towards the community), actively contest its actions, and also refute mass media and outside society's opinions of the Mohawks.

The Door

The second direction of rhetoric relates to The Eastern Door's concern with disseminating information to wider Aboriginal societies. This means that it positions its presentation of events and embodies them with significance according to their relevance to Aboriginal politics.

While The Eastern Door's attempts to refute or debate government action rest on the utilisation of explicit themes of analysis, its concern with Aboriginality is based more on an appeal to difference (to the Canadian mainstream) and emphasises the 'essential nature of' Aboriginality, pan-Indigenous rights rhetoric, and an exploration of Aboriginal values, worldviews and influences. While in the first direction (the window) The Eastern Door directly contests the legitimacy of governments, in this trend (the door) it establishes a world of significance removed from governmental authority: the Indigenous world (or 'fourth world'). It does so by appealing to essential components of 'Indigeneity' - respect, tradition and law - and reiterates these themes by positioning itself within a global Indigenous 'fight for survival'. This is an explicitly political move, but it is also based on implicit appeals to a different type of mentality, an 'Indigenous worldview' or 'mindset'.

The Eastern Door confirms the community's importance as part of a wider schema of Aboriginality. It reaffirms the significance and value of possessing to this pan-Indigenous status. It justifies the constant struggle of all Aboriginal groups for survival and reminds people of their worth.

As a result, The Eastern Door explicitly encourages its population to think outside the limits that living within the Canadian nation state imposes on them. It removes the community from these limits of governance by positing Kahnawake as a distinct society. As a result The Eastern Door renders governmental concerns obsolete by making them irrelevant to Kahnawake.

For example, The Eastern Door defends government assertions of Mohawk criminality by positioning Kahnawake as a society that is not controlled by the same laws. It does so by seeing behaviour as a right of the Mohawk nation. For example, in responding to allegations of illegal behaviour during cigarette smuggling, The Eastern Door regards the problem as a political issue of sovereignty regarding law enforcement: "Because the governments consider the trade as illegal, there is a cross-over between the issue of law enforcement and the expression of an Aboriginal right. The conflict between ourselves and the government then becomes a political matter and not a criminal one"(E.D. July 30th 1999:2). It contests expressions of illegal Mohawk actions by refuting them, and then concurs with their illegality while positioning it as a 'western' illegality and thus irrelevant to Aboriginal society.

The Mirror

The third direction of discourse that The Eastern Door utilises is based on implicit

politics because it is intended as a reflection of the community back at itself (and is

conscientiously community-based rather than politically oriented). As a mirror for the

community, The Eastern Door emphasises positions that do not appear to be based on the

political application of difference that it takes up in the other two directions. It renders

government and outside concerns irrelevant by *appearing* to ignore them. Instead it

presents Kahnawake as a community, discussing community events and its people,

unique culture and practice. This is a fundamental part of its appeal to the community, the

affirmation of community values and cultural knowledge. As part of this rhetoric, what is

important to The Eastern Door is community information, which will enhance the need

for cultural knowledge. Behaviour is influenced by culture, and thus, education based on

Mohawk culture is extremely important to The Eastern Door, as it is a primary source of

regeneration and power for the Mohawks. Power and strength appear to come from the

knowledge of Mohawk/ Iroquois 'culture', with which Mohawks can gain the correct

values and act in appropriate ways to enhance the strength of the community. As a result

The Eastern Door maintains an emphasis on Iroquois 'high culture', the elements of

Iroquois tradition that it believes are powerful sources of cultural capital for the

community. This type of analysis sees the prevalence of strategic implicit politics (which

are actually based on positioning of difference). By exhorting people to behave in certain

ways that are consistent with their inherited culture, the community as a whole can gain

strength, that which it needs to be an independent entity and become self-governing.

Connected to this type of discourse is the role that The Eastern Door perceives itself to play within the community. It constructs its role in rhetoric as one of the vital mechanisms for the dispersal of alternative information relating to community and outside events, and cultural knowledge and ways of attaining access to it. As a provider of information the newspaper encourages cohesion within the community and also appears to see itself as a facilitator of that cohesion, or at least a mediator. The interpretation of news in a positive and community-referenced way encourages people to see commonalities in what is shared in their culture rather than assessing the differences (such as those inspired by different readings of culture and religion, i.e. factions which have divided the community in their disagreements over the constitution of 'tradition' and 'law'). There is an implicit emphasis on that which is shared by the Mohawk peoples and other Aboriginal groups, and the parallel differences with outside society, which despite its claimed multi-culturalism, exists as a completely different entity. This often results in prescriptions for how to behave as a Mohawk person: "We represent behaviour and say how to behave, because it's important to remind people of the issues, long-standing ones. What will be important for the future is unity and awareness" (Kenneth Deer: Interview Feb 2002).

In summary of these three types of analysis, the Eastern Door exhorts members of Kahnawake to behave in certain ways, in particular to possess and use certain knowledge that benefits the community. It uses the same ethical discourses whether speaking of individuals or larger collectivities such as nations, judging all people, no matter position or ethnicity, via its consideration of morality and appropriate behaviour. Its primary

focus, however, is to subject those with power (whether inside or outside the community) to audits of their authority, through its belief that dissenters who disseminate alternative forms of information and means of interpreting that information can potentially limit the power of authorities.

News items are directed back to the community as part of the three different levels of discursive interpretation, referencing the significance of an event for Kahnawake or for Mohawks in general. Formats of interpretation incorporate the discussion of news into a political filter, with news and information on all levels being primarily reinterpreted in light of their significance to the Mohawk population. As such The Eastern Door attempts to present news and events in ways that will draw out their long-term significance, and it can do so by explicit reference, or by using symbolism, which confers meaning upon them. The Eastern Door is also concerned with external media representations of the community, and attempting to challenge them. All of these efforts exercise a primary influence on its narrative concerns with accountability, responsibility, behaviour and culture.

A Philosophy on Behaviour and Labelling: Terrorism

The Eastern Door's tendency to analyse events based on community significance and then to direct levels of discourse at interpretation can be highlighted when we look how The Eastern Door discussed the incidents of the September 11th 2001 terrorist attacks in the United States (US). On September 11th 2001 (9/11), terrorist forces targeted four American sites, destroying the World Trade Centre towers in New York and damaging

the Pentagon in Washington DC. This event has had global ramifications; with the US government beginning a 'War on Terror' and conceptualising an 'Axis of Evil', composed of any country or person who supports 'terrorism'. The Eastern Door presented the events through the stories of Kahnawake ironworkers in New York from whom it had eyewitness accounts and information concerning the attacks[15]. It presented their stories, then made commentary on how these types of events could be averted if people behaved in a more appropriate manner.

The Eastern Door was compassionate about the tragedy, but its main concern was with behaviour and especially the ramifications of '9/11' for state labelling processes. It did this in three ways. Firstly, the US's 'discourse of terror' was clearly linked to the unlawful labelling of dissenting people as 'terrorists'. This is part of the newspaper's belief that states falsely identify certain people as bad and as contravening social norms in order to impose measures of social control upon them, for example, the Canadian federal and Quebec governments' view in 1994 that the Mohawks were 'armed to the teeth' legitimized a planned invasion using nearly 20,000 military and police personnel against them (E.D. July 16th 1999:2). This may have led The Eastern Door to question whether anyone labelled a terrorist at that time would now form part of the 'Axis of Evil'.

Secondly, The Eastern Door worried that with the 'War on Terror' people would be so concerned with state unity that they would forget about the plight of Aboriginal peoples. This became especially relevant as the 'Commonwealth Meeting of Indigenous Peoples'

---

[15] Ironworkers from Kahnawake assisted in the construction of the World Trade Centre, the buildings destroyed in the terrorist attacks.

planned for 2002 was cancelled because of those terrorist attacks in the US. As a result

The Eastern Door argues that: "the Commonwealth lost its opportunity to show the world it is a

separate entity from the US" (E.D. Oct 19th 2001:3). The Eastern Door not only blamed the

US for its capacity to influence global agendas but also blamed terrorists – its title "Can't

Let Terrorists Dictate *Our* Agenda" signifying the differential 'nature' of Aboriginal peoples

the world over. In distancing itself from the global agendas of terrorists and states, The

Eastern Door referred to a quite different global conglomeration of peoples who should

be independent of national governance: Aboriginal peoples.

Thirdly, The Eastern Door questioned the US's right to label others as terrorists, when the

newspaper considered the US's behaviour to be comparable to terrorism itself[16]. The

newspaper maintained that "The True Motivation Behind America's New War" was fiscal warfare,

arguing the US intended to support a policy of aggressive economic expansion by

perpetuating its discourse on terror. At this point, The Eastern Door also linked all global

economic policies (whether globally, or in North America, or Canada) to terrorism. For

example, The Eastern Door accused Robert Nault, the Canadian Minister of Indian

Affairs, of an act of 'terrorism' in his 50% 'slash' of the First Nations budget. This was

qualified as a patent act of terrorism, comparable to the US's demand that nations join it

in its 'War on Terror', or face the consequences (become part of the Axis of Evil).

According to The Eastern Door, the Mohawks have themselves been labelled as terrorists

by governments and mass media, especially during the Oka Crisis and the blockade of the

---

[16] In doing so, it joined many other dissenting groups; the primary difference between their analyses and the
Eastern Door's is its concern with Aboriginal peoples.

Mercier Bridge. This was continually referenced in The Eastern Door during the Fall of 2001 as it used its own example of labelling (and its untruthfulness) to raise an important question: "At What Cost Will Terrorism Be Stopped?" (E.D. Oct 26th 2001:2). The Eastern Door drew continuities between images of terrorist behaviour and images of Mohawks to prove that the government has a great ability to create labels and to make them stick in its characterizations of dissenting groups.

As a result of the Mohawks having been labelled as terrorists, themes of terrorism are not new to The Eastern Door, and the newspaper has its own well developed and pre-existing dialogue on what behaviour constitutes 'terrorism'. Generally, The Eastern Door's own definition cites uncontrolled and irresponsible action, motivated by self-interest rather than communal responsibility. For example, to The Eastern Door, the US is self-interested because it wishes to expand its economic networks and hegemonic status and does not act on morally meaningful and responsible motivations.

The Eastern Door's discussion of 'terrorism' is strongly linked to its general approach to understanding the interactions between Mohawks and government authorities. Government bodies generally appear to act self-servingly, without altruism or 'care' for their populations. This illustrates that The Eastern Door does not only believe that the Mohawks are labelled as part of a deterministic process, but it also labels the government itself according to its understanding of governmental actions.

Another way to illustrate The Eastern Door's understanding of 'labelling' is its discussion

of its own population in a similar way. A few weeks after The Eastern Door's evaluation

of the terrorism on September 11th (2001) it called four Mohawk youths 'terrorists' for an

assault on a non-Native boy from a neighbouring municipality. To The Eastern Door the

"attack" was appalling for its violence but the main message was political, because The

Eastern Door pointed out that if the situation had been reversed, and a Mohawk attacked

by white youths, the Mohawks would *"cry racism"*. In this case, how was 'white society'

supposed to respond? The Mohawks had a bad reputation anyway, so this event would

not only confirm institutionally informed views of Mohawk behaviour but it had the

potential to reinforce them, thus providing more evidence for the negative labels (E.D.

Oct 26th 2001:19).

This event was not just significant as an example of negative behaviour that confirmed

the stereotype. It became especially cogent in light of The Eastern Door's view that the

Canadian State and states in general purposefully misinterpret information or behaviour

and label it to provide excuses for tighter control mechanisms. This event was alarming

because the Mohawks were continually confronting negative views about themselves

held by outside society, such as the 'terrorist' label. They could contest these images by

presenting good behaviour. However, when Mohawk behaviour did 'terrorise' other

citizens, as in this attack, there was no context to debate the actions of the government.

This was one example of how behaviour within the community could threaten it and as

such it was an action of terrorism as The Eastern Door defines it, an act of behaviour

which had no meaningful impulse and was an example of self-interest: not just towards

the outside society or the child who was beaten, but it was also an act of terrorism towards the Kahnawake community, by those in the community.

This way of discussing the event refers us back to the concept of responsibility. This article that discussed youth action in a way that related it back to terrorism and communal responsibility is not without precedent. Earlier in August 2001 (before the terrorist attacks) some Kahnawake youths had taken drugs and alcohol and 'gone on a rampage', driving recreational vehicles at other children as well as firing machine guns at them. This situation was the subject of an editorial titled "Terrorism in Our Midst". The Eastern Door saw these teenagers as 'out of control' but also as entirely purposeful because it interpreted their inebriation as a conscious action: "...when you drink or take drugs you make that decision..." (E.D. August 17th 2001:2). The Eastern Door equated these young people with terrorists for this behaviour.

Noticeably, in the same edition of the newspaper in another (non-related) article, The Eastern Door praised other Kahnawake youth for their third film festival: "...it was good to see youth involved not in destruction but creation." It also ran an article (also non-related), which attempted to explain why children might turn to alcohol or drugs. These latter two articles directly focus on the negative behaviour of the children as described in the article about the machine gun incident yet for the reader they appear to be *implicitly* related to it. This is because they offered alternative examples of youth behaviour that was positive, and also suggested why children might behave badly. This is a similar strategy to its other

presentations of behaviour and other thematic choices, and is a good example of its implicit politics, as it made subtle links between action, tradition and responsibility.

As a logical result of this position we can interpret the message of these three articles being together thus. Behaving in a good way equals an acknowledgement of Mohawk values and community responsibility while behaving in a bad way equals an ignorance of Mohawk values and responsibility and is a problem of the community (so is not a structural [Mohawk] cultural problem). However because behaving in a bad way is probably a result of western-based alienation, identity loss and ignorance, it is a structurally imposed problem of colonial relations. Therefore the 'bad behaviour' of youth is the fault of outside society and 'bad behaviour' is only an example of westernized behaviour.

The common thread of these dialogues is that positive behaviour comes about through a commitment to, and knowledge of, Mohawk tradition. As long as action concurs with the needs of the community's interests and of Mohawks in general, then it is acceptable and logical. Whether the message is implicit or explicit, to The Eastern Door, it is acceptable to practice behaviour that is consistent with tradition and its interpretation, regardless of how it may be labelled by others. However, the negative labelling practices of others mean it is vital to be consistent within a certain framework, the main impetus of which appears to be that thoughtful and consistent action based on cultural values should be paramount as a basis for action. Any person or group that does not behave in a way which

is consistent with cultural values, yet has agency, is then irresponsible and a 'terrorist', because they terrorise values.

Conclusion

The constant interpretation of events via the levels of discourse and directions of discourse mean that in rhetorical style, The Eastern Door makes varied commentaries on community and social life. Sometimes these frames of narrative and their modes may appear to be contradictory, as some of the directions appear to be capable of countering each other, a facet of which a concern with behaviour, for example, illuminates. In colloquial terms, The Eastern Door simultaneously says, "no we're not" and "we are and so what - it's none of your business if we are".

These levels and directions of presentation may become clearer, however, with a discussion of ways in which subjects are also interpreted in terms of dominant 'themes' or tropes, which can give general news items extra significance because of their part in these themes. I will now examine some of the most prevalent in the next chapter.

Chapter 3

Main Themes and Subjects of the Eastern Door

The Eastern Door concentrates on some community events and concerns more than it does on others. I have discussed how its agenda impacts its directions and levels of discourse and now I will examine its choices of language and main themes. I do so because Stephen Cornell (2000:43) argues that examining systems of language use highlights processes of understanding and interpretation of social structures.

The Eastern Door's communication utilises certain idioms that can be grouped into themes, with which images and allegories are expanded upon and narratives given meaning. I have chosen to concentrate on particular themes because together they form part of a supra narrative on morality and a proposal for the future that is extremely significant. These themes are accountability and authority, siege and invasion, respect and tradition, health and knowledge, and behaviour. The use of words such as spirit, flame, fire, recovery and roles is woven into these themes. Although The Eastern Door does not often fully explain these concepts they are used explicitly and implicitly.

As a result of these concerns, certain subject areas appear more than others and the same event can be spoken about in different ways. For example, The Eastern Door is concerned with politics (as both a subject area and a theme) and it may analyse politics based on themes of behaviour, accountability and authority. It may also analyse addiction, for example, based on themes of behaviour, and health and tradition. This demonstrates that subjects and themes are separable but also depend on other themes and an understanding

of them. As such, similar subjects can have different implications, just as different subjects can be endowed with similar significances: all are embodied with a strategic meaning influenced by The Eastern Door's political directions. I will now examine these themes and give examples of how they influence subject areas.

Accountability and Authority

The Eastern Door conceptualises authority without seeing it as based on discretion, rather it interprets it as a facet of legislate power relations. However, it accepts the legitimate 'authority' of power figures and of other agencies within the community only in as much as they remain accountable to the people (Mohawks of Kahanwake) they serve:

> ...That it would have been an inconvenience to the individual business owner is a given. Yet, it still would have been better for the board to have waited until after the election. By not doing so, the board has gone against its own word to honour the community's wishes.
> More than this, it has damaged its own credibility and left itself open to charges of preferential treatment of certain individuals. True or not, it leaves room open for the charge. At best this might not be fair to the individual and at worst it offends the trust of the community which expected the ABC Board to live up to its word. (E.D. March 8th 2002:2)[17]

The Eastern Door submits authority figures to regulations of their power based on its conceptualisations of accountability. In particular, accountability is constructed as responsibility – The Eastern Door is concerned with the responsibility of governmental figures or authorities for their populations. Concepts of personhood are inter-related here, as The Eastern Door emphasizes communal responsibility.

---

[17] This editorial discusses the actions of the Kahnawake ABC Board, the Alcoholic Beverage Control Board. Apparently during a moratorium on the provision of alcohol permits, which was issued because of concerns over community consumption of alcohol (and youth problems with alcohol abuse), one local business was granted a permit by the Board. (E.D. March 8th 2002:7).

As I have noted, individuals are seen to encompass the community in their actions, thus they may affect everybody. This line of thought is similar to stages of responsibility, for which at every point all stages are impacted through actions. The individual is part of a stage, as is the community, and so forth, in a type of 'ripple' effect. Therefore it is important that people remain accountable to that which they affect through individual action: the world to which they belong. However, in this understanding, just as the individual's behaviour can have repercussions for the community, the community is responsible for the individual. Thus problems are not just those of individuals but the community is accountable for mediating and resolving them.

The Eastern Door explores this theme based on the extent of responsibility by using it to examine the behaviour of people within the community, in particular those who behave in ways that appear to negate the validity of this linked aspect of human life. Outside institutions are examined in the same way. The Eastern Door challenges the opaque and unaccountable nature of governmental rhetoric by presenting ways in which the Canadian federal and provincial governments' rhetoric of responsibility or care have been shown in practice to be false and represent words rather than actions.

As well as directing its attention to outside governance, The Eastern Door subjects Kahnawake community members to the same levels of analysis. One community institution that repeatedly fails to be accountable is the MCK:

> Kahnawake residents are claiming they were not consulted by Council or any other organisation for the recent construction of a cellular phone tower near Kahnawake Survival School (KSS).
> Add the uncertain health risks of electromagnetic fields (EMFs) to this lack of public consultation and the result is an increasingly vocal community opposition directed at leadership in the last few weeks.

...(Selma) Deslisle said, 'who will protect the children if we don't? People have questions in their mind, ...there's a battery plant out there, and a planned ADM grain storage plant. They're all unknown factors. I would not like to see KSS go down the drain due more or less to people looking at money instead of health'...

Leborgne [an MCK Council Chief] said it was KSS land, that's what they wanted, and the Combined Schools Committee has some responsibility because they were involved in the decision. (E.D. August 8th 1997:1)

Although The Eastern Door does not generally contest the MCK's role or status in many explicit ways, it does illustrate how it fails to be accountable to community wishes by clarifying what those are and comparing them with governance priorities. As such the MCK has a rather negative image within The Eastern Door, its perceived unwillingness to act for the community rather than its acolytes, a problem (Alfred 1990:29). While the existence of the MCK is rarely questioned, its legitimacy and support for its actions is seen to be limited as a result of previous interactions and power struggles between the MCK and others (such as community members). Its authority to represent the community in a cohesive and responsive way is questionable, but preferable to outside forces.

The Eastern Door presents varied accounts of the MCK's performance. In doing so The Eastern Door attempts to regulate (via rhetoric) the legislative authority that the MCK maintains. This mediation of power is an attempt to restrict what appears to be the MCK's increasing control over community institutions. Because the MCK is a legislated authority, whose members are elected by the community every two years, The Eastern Door does not have much recourse to question its legitimacy, however it can suggest ways in which MCK members are not accountable or do not behave by their own rules. It can do this explicitly but often is more implicit about its criticisms or mediations of power.

We can demonstrate The Eastern Door's approach to understanding accountability and holding authority figures to be responsible according to certain values when we look at how The Eastern Door reported on a recent encounter between the MCK and the Peacekeeper Accountability Board (PAB). The Peacekeeper Accountability Board existed until recently as an independent body in Kahnawake, set up to provide accountability to the population regarding Peacekeeping (actions and jurisdiction). This body was designed to be independent from the machinations of politics and governance. However, the MCK suspended and later dissolved the Peacekeeper Accountability Board in a controversial manoeuvre, which had seemingly opaque motivations.

The Eastern Door provided differing and unclear explanations for the decision. Although it cited Grand Chief Joe Norton as saying, "regardless of what body exists between government and policing, don't cut the link", The Eastern Door did not appear to be supportive of the MCK's reassertion of its own power regarding Peacekeeping (E.D. August 24th 2001:2).

Instead, The Eastern Door presented the issue as one of accountability. In suspending the PAB, the members of the MCK were seen to be contravening their own protocol and laws (E.D. August 24th 2001:5). Thus their actions were interpreted by The Eastern Door to be unaccountable. In its coverage of this issue, The Eastern Door did not explicitly complain about the MCK (except in a generalized editorial about politics and policing), however, its implicit support for the PAB was more positive and noticeable than any support for the MCK. The Eastern Door quoted Mohawk Chiefs and personnel from the PAB who

were contesting the issue and relayed their accusations without comment (ED September 21st 2001:12), whereas it remained fairly silent on the issue of MCK motivations.

How did The Eastern Door finally understand the situation? The Eastern Door presented the PAB positively in contrast to the MCK (at least in its implicit support and lack of criticism). Interpretations of the MCK's actions had revolved around its perceived irresponsibility. In suspending the PAB and contravening its own laws, the MCK overrode the very basis of accountability it had formulated with the original establishment of an Accountability Board (E.D. August 24th 2001:1). In the Board's mandate to be representative of the community's wishes, independent of politics, The Eastern Door saw an institution that was outwardly more responsible and accountable. It had more authority to be able to claim this accountability than the MCK, whose members emerged in the coverage as those who were irresponsible and overly concerned with politicking. This debate was connected to problems of power and control, as issues of accountability and authority are in The Eastern Door. I will further expand on this event and its later ramifications in Chapter Four, in a discussion of the Kahnawake Peacekeepers, and authority.

Siege and Invasion

A particular concern for The Eastern Door is 'invasion' – the forced entry of outside bodies onto Kahnawake territory – and this is referred to physically and also mentally. As a result, The Eastern Door conceptualises many interactions with outside societies on warlike levels, using metaphors that evoke images of siege and control. These images are

explicitly connected to concerns about the ability to control and mediate force. In

particular they are linked to Mohawk ability to defend land. In interpreting news via a

concern with invasion, the newspaper reiterates some discourses of the Oka Crisis[18].

When Sureté du Québec (SQ) incursions on to territory occur for example, they are

described as deliberate military manoeuvres rather than as police manoeuvres, procedures

that are assigned to civil society and governance. In an article reporting on government

informants (Aboriginal peoples who collaborate with all levels of government), the role

of informants is also interpreted militarily: "...all of these people pose a threat to the security and

well-being of our communities, who must fight the oppression and racism of dominant society around us"

(E.D. July 30th 1999:2).

As well as explicitly construing events as invasive, The Eastern Door engages in an

implicit reproduction of a type of 'siege mentality', in which Kahnawake is perceived to

be under siege against outside society and its influences. As a result, actions of those

members in the community should be strategic. As with Chapter Two's discussion of

youth behaviour in Kahnawake, the actions of all parties become imbued with political

meaning as the independence of Kahnawake is emphasised.

Efforts to exhort the Kahnawake populace to behave in ways that support the 'siege'

draw on references to the tradition of siege this community has already had to establish.

There are several different types of invasion to be alerted against: with the physical

defence of Kahnawake on several occasions, referrals are made to the Oka Crisis, the

Sureté du Québec (SQ), and the RCMP. In particular, the SQ has recently entered into

---

[18] See Maclaine &Baxendale 1991; G. Alfred 1990; Ciaccia 2000; Goodleaf 1995.

Kahnawake illegally. This is a physical invasion and needs to be stopped or protected against. Government control of the community is another type of invasion, both physical in its ability to influence the development of the community (such as construction of the St. Lawrence Seaway against the community's wishes in the 1950's) or to define identity and property/governance issues, as Kahnawake does not have total independence from either provincial or federal government. Both levels of government are perceived to have an interest in planned or attempted incursions onto the territory and in Mohawk private community affairs. Thus any discussion of CSIS[19] after Oka for example, tends to reiterate the government's attempts to attain access to the Kahnawake community. This is added to by pressures from outside forces and influences such as gambling or substance use, which create problems such as diabetes or addiction. As well, these influences contribute non-Mohawk ways of thinking and non-Mohawk values, such as lacking respect, which can influence engagement in criminal activity for example.

Thus we see that siege and invasion are spoken of in ways that engender concepts of lifestyles and life practices, as well as physical circumstances. This involves the discussion of the community as a 'body', or as a holistic entity, which can fall prey to certain types of invasion that are potentially physically related (such as sieges), health related or related to identity. Health – related examples of siege emerge in discussions about physically and mentally alienating influences, such as drug addiction or alcohol use. For example in an article on "Addiction Awareness Month" images of health problems with causes outside the community provoke exhortations to people to remember their

---

[19] CSIS were involved in providing information to the federal and provincial governments during the Oka Crisis and during the period of cigarette smuggling in 1994.

families and their communities in their struggles. By "Rekindling Our Fire" it is hoped that

addicts (of all kinds) will be able to conquer their problems:

> The campaign during the month of November strives to inform people of the effects of addictions in order to spark a fire and rekindle the flame of hope inside each individual. The individual is at the axis of every family circle. In order for a family or community to be healthy the individuals within the circles need to take responsibility for their healing and at the same time support others (E.D. Nov 5th 1999:17).

As a result much communal responsibility rests on the individual to recover their 'spirit'

but the problem is also one of community responsibility, with images of 'fire', 'flame',

'spirit', 'burning', and 'renewal', evoking facets of The Eastern Door's notion of

Mohawk personhood. The loss of such attributes that are related to 'healthy identity' is

likened to a form of alienation, which is the result of a certain type of invasion; "Due to the

many traumatic experiences that Kahnawake has had to endure over the years it is amazing that our

community hasn't totally fallen apart"(E.D. Nov 5th 1999:17). This relates to invasion, however it

is swiftly replaced by the measures the community takes to protect against it, "This is due to

the great resiliency of our people. However, these traumatic experiences coupled with the alcoholism and

drug use has taken a toll on the health of individuals and their families"(E.D. Nov 5th 1999:17). This

is an explicit linkage of addiction to issues outside the community. For example, as in

Chapter Two's earlier discussion of gambling, The Eastern Door sees the causes of

addiction to be westernized (gambling in itself as a western cultural trait) but also as a

result of colonial relationships and lack of identity. These are two ways in which the

'body' of the community has been invaded.

Addiction comes about through a weakness in defence mechanisms (or a break in the

siege) and has to be healed via sources of aggressive 'cultural' healing. People are not

personally blamed for their problems but they may be susceptible to addiction and other

such problems as a result of an alienation from knowledge. Thus the effects of such

destructive influences are a form of invasion; the reinforcement of community spirit with

prescriptions for behaviour is an implementation of siege against outside influences:

"Are we so lucky that the flow of drugs into our community has miraculously stopped? Or do the people in charge like things nice and quiet, the way they have been in the past few years?
Are they waiting for a public outcry, to take a strong stand against the problems of drugs the way they did before? Or are they waiting for some kid to die from an overdose?" (E.D. June 22nd 1997:2)

Respect and Tradition

Notions about implementing 'siege' are primarily connected to ideas about respect and

tradition, the proper utilization and understanding of concepts that The Eastern Door sees

as necessary to restore power to the community. As discussed, power comes from culture

and cultural knowledge, and when people or the community are 'weak', they are ignorant

or unaware of their cultural identity, such as tradition for example. Through not

practising tradition, they are unaware of the principles of respect, an axis of relationships.

This is a trend of analysis that surfaces constantly in The Eastern Door's discussion of

crime as a type of behaviour that can be as a result of these circumstances of ignorance.

There are some types of crime that initially appear to be random, purposeless and which

are often connected with youth (delinquency). In this case, the focus is on the

consequences rather than the victim.

An example of this view is found in an article about vandalism. The article quotes the

victim: "when I was a kid, houses on the reserve were never locked and there was never a problem with

breaking and entering, stealing, or vandalism. If it ever did happen, the guy who did it would be shunned..."

The duty rests, however, on mediating delinquency with recommendations for future

action: "the onus should be placed equally on parents, social workers, storeowners, Peacekeepers and psychologists..."(E.D. Dec 11th 1998:13). There is a great obligation on the community to feel responsible for amending these problems, by addressing behaviour. For example, in another article discussing delinquency The Eastern Door cites a prevention officer: "There is a lot of family dysfunction in our community. There are way too many unhealthy families out there and it shows in our children" (E.D. November 26th 1999:15). The article concludes with a plea that appears to connect dysfunction to identity: "I think we have to sit back and say, do we know who we are what are our values and beliefs, where do they come from? What does it mean to be Onkwe:homwe[20] and when did we lose respect for our elders?"

These dialogues urge parents and elders to instil respect in their children, so that they gain appropriate values and knowledge about their identities. With this knowledge they will behave in ways that are appropriate to their tradition: with respect for others. Infusing a discussion of 'everyday' activities with this type of dialogue evokes a sense of cultural continuity, which has been tampered with by outside influences, but is nonetheless strong enough to withstand them. Respect for others enhances community spirit and enables the community to behave cohesively and with unity.

Health and Knowledge

Knowledge based on 'culture' is seen as a fundamental means for gaining power, because it provides a basis upon which to act. As mentioned, being aware of the tenets of Mohawk or Iroquois identity and utilizing them enhances the general health of the community and thus its strength. This results in an encouragement of Mohawk education

---

[20] Mohawk peoples.

systems, especially the support for the Mohawk Kahnawake Survival School, which is a

way to transmit values to children, as well as substantiating a primary means through

which worldviews are created and Mohawk socialization takes place.

The inter-relatedness of discourses of knowledge and health point to an awareness that

identity is gained through an appeal to a 'different' kind of knowledge than that found in

mainstream society, and that 'health' is not merely a physically tangible issue but exists

on other levels and can be influenced by them. For example, the conservatism inherent in

this philosophy dictates the structure of an article discussing Kahnawake's growing

population that worries about the levels of abortion in the community and links them to

cultural knowledge:

> Young Natives opt for full-term pregnancy over abortion: Return to traditional values?
> As one drives through the streets of Kahnawake on a bright sunny day, one can't help notice a
> bevy of young mothers wheeling their baby carriages along the side of the road. In a great number
> of cases, these appear from a distance to be teenage girls in the 15-18 age bracket. Perhaps many
> of them are single mothers, but nobody knows for sure. Such statistics are unavailable, it seems.
> All of which leads one to wonder what role abortion plays in Kahnawake. Abortions are not
> performed at Kateri Memorial Hospital, but some Native girls have been known to have their
> pregnancies terminated at off-reserve hospitals...to name but a few.
> This eventuality threatens to jeopardize the widely-held contention that Kahnawake girls are more
> apt to bring their babies to full term out of pride in their culture and a wish to contribute to the
> Native population stream...
> KSCS communications officer Connie Meloche and Kateri Hospital director of professional services
> Dr. Suzanne Jones were not as cautious, however.
> "Off the top of my head I'd say a lot of our (Kahnawake) youngsters go full term," Meloche
> surmised. "It has a lot to do with family values and freedoms. Here in Kahnawake pregnant
> teenagers get a lot of support from their families. It's a return to traditional values"...

The article concludes with:

> "It all depends on the individual and on the situation," one young Kahnawake mother told The
> Eastern Door. "I know a local girl with a child who has already had three abortions. But she
> happens to come from a dysfunctional family.
> "As for myself, I could never bring myself to have an abortion. For me, it would be like taking a
> life." (E.D. Sept 4th 1999:4)

The choices women make in keeping pregnancies is seen as influenced by a pride in and awareness of tradition. The fact that the article ends with the quote from the 'young Kahnawake mother' leaves us with no real problem in assessing The Eastern Door's politics on the matter. 'Good health', is in this case determined by politics.

The Eastern Door believes that healing is an important characteristic of renewal and tradition, and it actively encourages the practice of traditional knowledge in its attempts to heal the alienation the community suffers. However, the boundaries of traditional practice are consistently debated within the community (Alfred 1995:76) and so The Eastern Door's recommendations rest on its unique understanding of Mohawk culture. This reiterates the encouragement of particular attributes as desirable, particularly a militant stance connected to historical cultural practice:

> Our children are not clocks that we might easily drop off at a repair shop and say, 'Fix it'. The first step in dealing with any problem is first admitting there is a problem, followed by a fearless examination. Such an examination is required here, because the 'problem' is not simply 'the youth'. The youth in this community have not grown up, and are not growing up in a vacuum. It follows that the problem cannot be remedied by KSCS or the MCK or any other single group alone. It is not an organisational problem. It is a people problem which can only be effectively remedied by people. In the case of our community, that means as many as possible. It means parents, elders, youth: all are needed...(E.D. August 31st 2001:2).

Behaviour – Appropriate and Inappropriate

These themes relate in diverse ways to 'behaviour'. The Eastern Door does not generally differentiate clearly between different types of behaviour such as 'social' or 'personal', and provides more generalized discussion that attempts to subtly remind people of their responsibilities. This may be related to its view that all levels of behaviour are inter-linked. While it does not examine personal relationships, it may question events and

wonder whether the actions of those people involved have been influenced by factors such as a loss of identity or alienation. However, it does make explicit references to poor behaviour and while it explicitly attempts to stop people behaving in such a way, it makes indirect references to the causes and impacts:

> Is it any wonder that, historically, women who were 'captured' by Native people often chose not to return to their own people? In Mohawk culture there are examples of this happening. Why? Perhaps it was because, in our culture, women were respected as leaders and the choosers of leader. Women were the acknowledged holders of the land, which we referred to as our 'Mother'. Is it fair to ask how true this still is? When we think about our grandmothers, mothers, aunts and sisters, do we still hold them in the highest regard, as our forefathers did? Do we still recall how our mothers nurtured us and our culture? Its something we should reflect upon. (E.D. March 8th 2002:9)

Behaviour for The Eastern Door is based on the possession of knowledge as 'capital', as it is the use of 'cultural capital' that influences the actions of all social entities. This view of behaviour and its sources depends on an understanding of 'culture' that relates to concepts of 'habitus' (Bourdieu 1977:vii). The Eastern Door argues that Mohawk peoples possess Mohawk 'habitus'; while they may become alienated from their possession of culture it is still received knowledge and resides within them. Thus, behaviour that harms the community can be addressed, or behavioural problems healed.

As behaviour is based on this received capital, The Eastern Door's assessment of 'other behaviour' becomes fairly 'determinist' as it applies these types of analyses to all members of society as noted in Chapter Two. People are caught within the *labels* The Eastern Door imposes upon them, based on interpretations of their 'cultural logic', which is the newspaper's understanding of their previous action and rationale. This can be demonstrated with the example of the September 11th terrorist attacks in the US from the previous chapter.

In The Eastern Door discussions, the newspaper encourages appropriate behaviour based on 'cultural knowledge', but also draws attention to inappropriate behaviour within the community in a way that is similar to discussions of deviance. The Eastern Door provides reasons for this behaviour and discusses it in different ways. It is analysed as part of The Eastern Door's theory of alienation from identity. A concern with deviance is also related to government and outside media conceptualisations of the behaviour and character of the Mohawks so The Eastern Door's concern with 'deviancy' can also be seen as an explicitly political concern:

> In an editorial on Wednesday April 17, the Gazette, while attacking the Extreme Fighting spectacle, again went into its usual tirade questioning sales of cigarettes, alcohol and gasoline in Kahnawake. It even suggested illegal casino gambling was taking place here. If the Gazette knows of an illegal casino in Kahnawake, then it should inform us to where it is so we can deal with it one way or another. As far as the rest of us are concerned, there is no illegal casino in Kahnawake but the thousands of readers of the Gazette will now believe that there is. This is just another example of the continuing criminalization of the Mohawk people. Gossip, rumour and misinformation repeated over and over again, is accepted as truth..." (E.D. April 19th 1996:2)

The Eastern Door's engagement with 'deviance' also transcends cultural understandings of criminality on occasion and can be related to Durkheim's discussion of 'anomie' as well as forms of alienation that are similar to Marxist theory.

To The Eastern Door, in practice, 'deviance' is defined by those who behave in ways that are inconsistent with Mohawk values. For The Eastern Door, Mohawk values include respect for others and the imperative that individuals act as part of a whole – the community. Emphasising that Mohawk values do not encompass 'deviance' as understood by either the Mohawks or the outside world is a strategic presentation of behaviour, in which acts that will be viewed as 'deviant' appear as cultural abnormalities to the Mohawks. As a conscious justification strategy, The Eastern Door emphasises that

types of western deviance are not structural to Mohawk identity yet can still be corrected by the Mohawk capacity to 'socially heal'. This strategy explains the incongruity between The Eastern Door's promotion of Mohawks as peaceful and actual acts of criminality or disrespect. The acts are seen as anomalies, thus The Eastern Door can continue to view Mohawks as well behaved and appropriate.

'Bad behaviour' also impacts 'non-criminal' understandings of behaviour; to The Eastern Door for example, the actions of the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake in dissolving the Peacekeeper Accountability Board were not consistent with their own laws or stated values. Thus to all intents and purposes they behaved negatively. This is an understanding of deviancy which is not based on a finite or legislative categorisation of behaviour, but instead is based on political discretion and which I will explain later in this thesis, in Chapter Five.

The Moral Charter: Embodying Themes

Because all of the above themes are related to notions of behaviour and actions they form part of a supra narrative on morality. For example a concern with deviance, which is categorised by The Eastern Door as 'bad' (un-Mohawk-like) behaviour, comes from a failure to understand responsibility: that behaving in a certain positive way has benefits for all of the community, and behaving in a negative way can impact the community and its success. The supra narrative on behaviour involves creating and maintaining guidelines for behaviour that I will term a 'moral charter', an implicit and symbolic template setting out ways to behave. The Eastern Door encourages people to make their

own reading of tradition, and to be conscious of the impacts of behaviour that does not follow those guidelines.

This rhetoric is repetitious and generalized, which may be because it is linked to political positioning and thus has motivations that are not made explicit or clear in The Eastern Door. Although The Eastern Door clearly calls attention to the impacts of negative behaviour in the community when it discusses delinquent actions, for example, "...not all kids are bad in our community, but those few bad ones seem to attach a scarlet letter on every teenager who lives here. Many good kids get the blame for the stupid few and it's absolutely wrong" (E.D. Nov 26th 1999:9), it also tends to encourage 'good' behaviour to benefit the community in its struggles to be independent from the Canadian state. This is based on its belief that only a concentration on what it is to be Mohawk can help the community to gain meaningful independence from the paternalism of federal and provincial governments: "...instead of treating the issue as it was, which was a legitimate concern over the expansion of the Oka golf course, the politicians treated it like they were punishing bad children" (E.D. July 13th 2001:1). This reinforces the community's abilities to set agendas if they do so coherently, following a moral code, and without prescription from an outside body.

Conclusion

I have identified behaviour to be a primary concern for The Eastern Door because of its impacts on the Kahnawake community's health, stability, and political status. The Eastern Door addresses this concern by propagating a type of moral template for behaviour, which as based on a contentious view of tradition, turns instead into a moral charter, a

potential strategy to enhance the actions of the community. I will discuss probable reasons for The Eastern Door's concern with behaviour in Chapter Five.

Certain community institutions embody the positive themes that The Eastern Door emphasises, and one in particular is the Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers (KMP), members of which in their peacekeeping roles fulfil some of The Eastern Door's mandates and appear to successfully negotiate the problems The Eastern Door sees as inherent in modern existence as an Aboriginal person. This is noticeable because there is a substantial continuity in representation between the ideals of the moral charter The Eastern Door propagates, and the philosophy it sees the Peacekeepers as possessing (as demonstrated through behaviour). I will now present a case study of this representation and then analyse the KMP's importance to The Eastern Door and to the community. This case study should also illuminate some of the themes discussed in this chapter, and I will attempt to explain why they are prevalent issues.

Chapter 4

Representations and the Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers

The Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers (KMP/Peacekeepers) have an important role to play in The Eastern Door's conceptualisation of Kahnawake. This is because they contribute on many levels to its ideas about governance and independence, as well as maintaining symbolic links to its conceptualisation of force and control and its strategic levels of discourse. They are important because they embody The Eastern Door's charter for positive Mohawk behaviour and provide examples of accountable authority.

I will trace representations of the Peacekeepers in The Eastern Door since 1996, just after the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake (MCK) signed an agreement with the Federal government to give them legitimate jurisdiction. I will then examine the ways in which the Peacekeepers are important as symbols of commitment to the community, as well as analysing how they embody certain mandates in their practice.

The Kahnawake Mohawk Peacekeepers

The Kahnawake Peacekeepers are an independent Mohawk policing body that gained formal governmental recognition in 1995 as a result of a Federal First Nation Policing Policy (FNPP)[21] introduced in 1991. They are now semi-independent from outside governmental authorities, although outside police forces can be invited into the territory if needed and can enter in times of emergency (Simpson 2000:272) Although the

---

[21]The First Nations Policing Policy was designed by the Federal government to allow Aboriginal groups to police their own communities.

Peacekeepers secured outside legal legitimacy in 1995, their origins lie in the 1970's

when the community banned outside police officers from Kahnawake after a bungled

Sureté du Québec (SQ) arrest attempt left a Mohawk, David Cross, dead (Simpson

2000:272). As a result, community volunteers formed the Kahnawake Mohawk

Peacekeepers, preferring their own policing to outside policing as it had problematic

connotations of control, power and force within Kahnawake regardless of the incident.

The contentious foundation of policing means that it has remained part of an axis of a

fractious relationship with outside authorities. The federal and provincial governments

opposed the institution of the Kahnawake peacekeepers, calling them vigilantes, but were

forced to negotiate with the Mohawks when it became clear that the community had no

intention of removing the Peacekeepers from their duties[22].

Kahnawake residents, who worried that the influence of the Peacekeepers was limited by

the government's retention of outside jurisdiction, protested the 1995 signing of an

agreement with the government because although the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake

(MCK) had signed the agreement to give the Peacekeepers official and independent

capabilities, the community saw it as an affront to self-government and a concession to

---

[22] There was already a precedent for Native American policing, Quebec's provincial Amerindian Police having previously policed the community (Alfred 1995:137). Alfred quotes from an MCK Chief from that time thus:
"We were trying to kick out the SQ – the RCMP were here but they weren't doing it and neglecting their responsibility. And that's how it happened, these guys started volunteering and we lobbied for it. One of the biggest instances was when RK and I were called into the RCMP Headquarters building over here. They had all the brass dressed in uniform and ribbons, with the RCMP on one side and the SQ on the other. We walked in and they told us that we had to get rid of these men because it was illegal, they were 'vigilantes'. But we had done our homework by contacting several judges on the Superior Court and got them on our side. They were looking for a solution to the problems here too, and we told the police brass that we would stop it on the condition that we work toward establishing an Indian police force in Kahnawake. And they said, 'all right'. So we called a big meeting with all the people…and then the government had to agree to establish the Indian Police here. That was a big change." (Alfred 1995:112)

the values of self-determination[23]. The agreement was surprisingly renewed in 1997 but

is now generally accepted. In 2001 and 2002 The Eastern Door portrayed the

Peacekeepers as one of the community institutions with the most positive image in

Kahnawake.

Overview of Peacekeeper Representations

After the protests[24] surrounding the initial 1995 agreement with the government and the

debatable level of their jurisdiction, the Peacekeepers appeared to suffer public relations

problems. In 1996, articles discussing the re-signing of the policing agreement expressed

surprise because Grand Chief Joe Norton had previously suggested that the policing

agreement was dead, and in serious trouble (E.D. 14th June 1996:1). The newspaper goes

on to consider the protocol of the agreement as well as comparing inside jurisdiction held

to outside governmental jurisdiction and politics.

However, The Eastern Door reported that despite these doubts and internal disputes, the

agreement would go ahead:

> Norton expressed his apprehension on renewing the Agreement and concerns of the community about whether the government of Quebec can be trusted when it panics over a minor sporting event and allows itself to be manipulated by the media and which reacts irrationally to opposition criticism in the National Assembly. (E.D. June 14th 1996:5)

The article concludes that the MCK was also internally divided about this agreement:

---

[23] It was seen as an affront to self-determination because it was an agreement with the outside government which some argued was not needed as the Peacekeepers were originally instituted without outsider control(E.D. October 27th 1995:2) and the agreement is also seen by some to contain problematic wording, especially because of the definition of 'emergency' (Simpson 2000:272).

[24] Two days of sometimes violent protests followed the signing. They were also called 'riots', although their status as 'riots' is debatable.

> Chief David Rice said he and two others have reservations on whether it should be renewed. 'I was against the signing in September and I'm against its extension. The Peacekeepers have come a long way without an agreement; we could keep on going without one. I do not feel that 'all applicable laws' is clear enough to protect our jurisdiction' said Rice. (E.D. June 14th 1996:5)

This article presents the positive nature of the agreement and adds a further discussion of possible dissatisfaction, related not to Peacekeepers but their powers.

Following the signing, it is obvious that the Peacekeepers suffer not just from issues related to jurisdiction but also from public image problems. In an interview with The Eastern Door, the Chief Peacekeeper, Warren Lahache, states that; "The best interests of the community will be the first concern of the Peacekeepers". He continues; "All our operations are geared to the community, and I want to adopt more of an open door policy where people can feel comfortable and talk with the Peacekeepers" (E.D. Jul 12th 1996:8). The Eastern Door writes that the Peacekeepers are continually 'active in the community' and intend to provide greater visibility of services and make themselves more familiar to the community, in order to improve relations. The intention of Peacekeeper accountability reported in this article is quite significant, considering the discourses of accountability and references to opaque institutions provided throughout the newspaper. In this article, The Eastern Door takes on public relations responsibilities and declares the Peacekeepers to be a community liable institution, geared around the community and answerable to it.

An article discussing Warren Lahache's 'swearing in' ceremony later in the summer continues this theme. The force takes an oath to show that it exists to serve the community, and "ultimately is accountable to the people of Kahnawake"(E.D. Aug 16th 1996:1). The discussion of the Peacekeepers emphasises their integration within the community,

as the men and women serving on the force come from Kahnawake, and maintains that

potential issues concerning the Peacekeepers in the future will come from outside

challenges rather than inter-community politics. The Peacekeepers see this as a new

direction for Kahnawake, as the Peacekeepers are referenced constantly as an apolitical

force, which will "keep politics with politics and policing with policing" (E.D. Aug 16th 1996:1).

Discussions of the Peacekeepers are filled with positive references to the future,

symbolizing an awareness of the problematic nature of policing in the past but

maintaining a new direction; "The feeling within the department...is a positive one. It's been a

long-time coming...now everyone can hear we are pledging allegiance to the community" (E.D.

Aug 16th 1996:1).

In 1999 The Eastern Door gives a voice to what appears to be the *community's* somewhat

negative impressions of the Peacekeepers. In an interview, Chief Peacekeeper Warren

Lahache is "astonished to learn that some Kahnawake residents actually believe his staff comes up short

when it comes to public relations, image and community involvement". The Eastern Door quotes his

reaction thus: "'I was under the impression we do a whole lot' said the somewhat startled Lahache when

the perception was conveyed to him" (E.D. Nov 5th 1999:11). In this article, Lahache is given

an opportunity to respond to accusations and he lists the actions of the Peacekeepers who

are not limited to policing criminality but also intend to achieve a full relationship with

the community as trust figures. Lahache views negative images to be an issue all police

forces have to face, rather than an especial contextual problem of the Peacekeepers. Since

he is aware of the problem of negative press, he counters with: "Most PKs take the job to heart

and stand up for what they have to respond to by putting an individual responsibility to the community above

all else. Sure we're human too and we sometimes make mistakes, but here we're accountable for our

actions"(E.D. Nov 5th 1999:11). In publicizing the role of the Peacekeepers, attention is drawn to the weak foundations of the community's critique, which appears to render it unwarranted. In contrast, The Eastern Door presents the Peacekeepers as a sturdy and worthy community institution.

An awareness of public image is prevalent in discussion of the Peacekeepers, as other examples[25] also cite the Peacekeepers' awareness of a negative image and declared intentions: "The situation of new vehicles acquired by fraudulent means has been in the media, providing a reason to go public now; to show the Peacekeepers are committed to the investigation with the cooperation of outside agencies" (E.D. April 18th 1997:5) In 1997 and in 1998 this awareness of public image continues: "This shutdown of an operation gives some satisfaction for Lahache and the Peacekeepers because during Lahache's tenure as Chief there have been grumblings within the community of police inaction about the drug problem" (E.D. Apr 3rd 1998:7).

Later in 1999 an article stating how badly paid the Peacekeepers are details their activities and how busy they are kept as well as describing their political positioning regarding outside society: "We've had our share of inter-governmental politics involving international extreme fighting and gaming (casinos). Last year the SQ wanted us to raid certain places for outstanding taxes but we referred it to the liaison committee" (E.D. May 14th 1999:7/10). This kind of rhetoric identifies the Peacekeeper's primary concern: a growing responsibility to the community, illustrated by conflict with the SQ over the implementation of certain codes regarding community behaviour. Conflicts arose with the SQ because the Peacekeepers would not

---

[25] Taken from random sampling of the Eastern Door over the years 1996-1999.

turn against their own community, regardless of how people within Kahnawake were behaving. The article continues:

> Although his staff is paid decidedly inferior wages, Lahache says they're still having fun 'even though our job is more dangerous than elsewhere because of the severity of some of the crimes we deal with. Our officers encounter more in one year than most MUC[26] cops see in 10 years. It's more than just a job to our employees because we live here and grew up here. We feel proud to be offering this service to the community '". (E.D. May 14th1999:10)

Trends of Representation: Symbols of Commitment

A trend within The Eastern Door then is to emphasise the basis of the Peacekeepers' commitment to community; the community comes before '*policing*' but inherently the needs of the community should be inseparable from those of 'Peacekeeping'. The emphasis on the different qualities of Peacekeepers as compared to police links Peacekeepers with motivation and community roles. The Peacekeepers do more than police because they also protect and mediate, while policing is linked with control and criminality. Thus, The Eastern Door promotes the view that the Peacekeepers would protect the community before they sacrificed it as part of their role as police.

The Peacekeepers then appear as an extremely accountable organisation, with an organic community impetus. This depiction of their character contradicts conceptualisations of the Peacekeepers as a concession to Quebec (due to their limited jurisdiction) or at least renders these worries redundant. This occurs especially when their dedication to the community results in a political stance against the SQ. In those instances, The Eastern Door regards the Peacekeepers as an implicitly political institution for the community because they are willing to defend Kahnawake members against outside society. This is

---

[26] Communaute d'Urbaine de Montréal.

shown by one of their annual end-of-year synopses, in which The Eastern Door states:

"The Peacekeepers look back at 1999 as a successful year especially since they were able to

handle all of their cases without having to call in the SQ or RCMP for assistance" (E.D. January

21st 2000:7). The Eastern Door continually reinforces the message that the Peacekeepers

are community-motivated, by moving from active promotion of the Peacekeepers to

contradict community worries, to being able to support the Peacekeepers' role without

having to defend them. As a result their position in The Eastern Door's rhetoric is

naturalized as part of a Kahnawake 'order of things' when it ceases having to defend

them, and it now represents the Peacekeepers (in 2002) as symbols of leadership.

The Peacekeepers play an inherently political role for Kahnawake, although to a large

extent their actions are depoliticised. As one of the only independent First Nations inside-

community policing organisation in Canada, the Peacekeepers constitute a significant

part of Kahnawake's ability to maintain a degree of independence. This is shown in The

Eastern Door's discussion of Kanehsatake:

> The violence and intimidation taking place at Kanehsatake by a small group of thugs is
> criminalizing all Mohawks in the eyes of non-Natives. It's long past time that a Native
> Peacekeeping force be established there to ease the tensions and bring a little stability. That some
> frightened residents are asking for the SQ to come in and patrol the area is a real sign of
> desperation.
> Kanehsatake should follow our example in putting in place a Native policing group. The SQ will
> never be trusted by us to deal fairly with Native people; not with their seemingly built-in prejudices,
> if not out-right racism. (E.D. September 1st 1995:3)

This is highlighted by a case in which in Summer 2001 the SQ made several illegal

incursions into the territory.

The Eastern Door reported that community residents greeted the presence of the SQ with alarm, as their presence in the territory was threatening, since they had been banned from Kahnawake since 1979. The SQ was chasing a non-native into the area for an outside violation, but displeasure with the SQ's actions towards the *community* was voiced, and its irresponsibility emphasised: "Diabo[27] is upset that these incidents continue to happen. He said not only did the two officers put themselves at risk by entering Kahnawake, but they also put community members at risk by doing so" (E.D. Jul 20th 2001:1/4). The dialogue on this event emphasises the fractious quality of relationships between outside police and the community, the *illegal* activity of the SQ, which is supposed to be a law enforcement body, and their overall irresponsibility.

In comparison, the Peacekeepers (as community personalities) are presented as carrying out their duties in a professional manner: "Peacekeepers Warren White, Dwayne Zacharie, Wally Montour and Clint Jacob arrived on the scene, where two SQ officers remained inside their cruiser. The Peacekeepers asked the SQ why they had pursued a vehicle..." (E.D. Jul 20th 2001 1/4) and display protective force. As guardians of Kahnawake, they act responsibly in comparison to the SQ. This is vital, as The Eastern Door argues: "Actions like this could lead to another incident where a community member could be shot, much like that of the shooting death of David Cross in the late 1979" (E.D. Jul 20th 2001:1/4)[28].

---

[27] The new Chief Peacekeeper from 1999, Chief John K. Diabo.
[28] When David Cross was shot by the SQ, he was waving a pool cue at them. They shot him through the window of their cruiser. These similarities are not accidental. The references made to the SQ officers remaining within the cruiser while being approached by the KMP conjure visions of cowardice and remind readers of the circumstances and ramifications of their actions.

Contrasts between the representations of the Peacekeepers and the SQ are striking. The Peacekeepers are presented as the only legitimately behaved organisation and allusions are made to the SQ as behaving illegally and with cowardice, demonstrated by the reference to the officers remaining within their cruiser. There are implicit similarities and comparisons here with how the Mohawks are portrayed by outside media and how governmental authorities behave, the behaviour construed symbolically by The Eastern Door.

However, the irresponsible behaviour of the SQ is also interpreted in an *explicitly* political way. In his editorial Kenneth Deer argues the actions of the SQ were purposeful and not coincidental. He points out that this is the highest level of outside police presence in and around the community since the 1990's and terms this an SQ 'game' over protocol, believing that the SQ is trying to provoke the community into action (E.D. July 20th 2001:2). Construing these incursions in terms of calculated provocation renders the actions of the SQ as irresponsible, in comparison to the Peacekeepers who carried out their duties responsibly.

In presenting them in this way, The Eastern Door maintains its position that the Peacekeepers are a product of the community and exist to serve it rather than the needs of the state, especially by emphasising their community –responsive behaviour and contrasting it with other authorities, such as the MCK's opaque decision making procedures or the irresponsible SQ. Thus the 'visibility' of Peacekeeper motivations is accentuated via affirmative interpretations of their actions.

Because of the 'apolitical' stance of the Peacekeepers, they play a symbolic and implicit role for The Eastern Door and are also a vital pretext for debates about community and force. While jurisdiction and control enter political realms, their actions are constrained by politics rather than developed by them. The philosophical themes of The Eastern Door, surrounding key issues of implicit politics, respect, tradition, communication and responsibilities, are mandated by the presence of the Peacekeepers while they are important for its outside political focus.

Peacekeepers and their Symbolic Status: An Analysis

The Peacekeepers symbolize the ability of Kahnawake to be independent. Contention over their existence relates to their jurisdiction and ability to control, rather than the roles they employ as they keep peace within the community.[29] Policing or Peacekeeping then appears to be an important premise within Kahnawake as a political basis for independence. There are three ways in which this is primarily conceptualised: as jurisdiction, independence and control, and identity and behaviour. I will attempt to explain the importance of the Peacekeepers for The Eastern Door and its mandates of behaviour.

Jurisdiction and Force

Control and force comprise a fundamental feature of colonial relationships regardless of how they are carried out or with what rhetoric intentions are obscured (Wearne 1996:16). The ability to control oneself is a distinction of sovereignty, and is one of the most

---

[29] Kenneth Deer, Personal communication.

important debates surrounding Aboriginal groups in their declarations of independence. As force and control have played such vital parts in the execution of many governmental decisions and policies, the implementation of such measures is contested on diverse levels. The Peacekeepers represent one of the first legible alternatives to outside government force or control. As a legitimate institution for the mediation of society, Mohawks are able to define and apprehend their own notions of deviancy and the use of physical force. The legitimacy of the Peacekeepers defines a challenge to the state and its ability to have power over certain actions.

Incursions onto the land by outside bodies are legislated as illegal, except on invitation and these incursions and invasions define a crucial element of the relationship between the state and the community. In the past it appears as if physical incursions onto territory by outsiders have been imagined as assault. The invasion of the seaway engineers in the 1950's, the notion that non-Mohawks leave the community in the 1970's, the killing of David Cross in 1979 and the Oka Crisis have been influential events. When discussed in The Eastern Door, these actions are implicitly seen as an assault on a body – that of the community. This may be related to the interdependency of land and identity deemed so prevalent in much literature discussing Mohawks (Wagamese 1996:37), for example Matthieu Sossoyan (1999:1) has argued that land is a powerful symbol of collective definition for Kahnawake Mohawks. Stephanie Phillips (2000:ii-iii) has also suggested that land as a concept (and especially the Seaway), is a metaphorical base on which to contest the intrusiveness of the government and highlight the necessity of resisting encroachment from outside bodies into Kahnawake's autonomy.

The Peacekeepers are important because they present a challenge to the legitimacy of outside bodies to enter onto the Mohawk territory, and they are an outstanding example of a legitimate defence mechanism against outside intruders, as we can see with the illegal incursions into the area by the SQ. Control and authority is defined by this ability (to challenge outside authorities), and this may be why the continuity between images of Peacekeepers and warriors is striking in The Eastern Door's discursive illustrations.

Independence and Control Mechanisms

The Peacekeepers have an ability to provide community cohesion that is distanced from politics through legitimate control mechanisms. Their very history (as a defence force against the SQ in the 1970's) gives them a legitimacy and continuity of purpose that cannot be matched by any other institution in Kahnawake. This is extremely relevant, as the definition of certain groups as problematic can legitimate *governmental* control mechanisms, as Philip Smith (1996:95) states, narratives of disinterested, selfless, and 'legitimate' violence (for self-defence or as altruistic) are acceptable only with a precondition, that this violence be carried out by an 'evil other'. Smith argues that the precondition of certain characters is part of the movement of protocol of nations away from military actions, which cannot be morally defended within civil society. I would suggest that the Mohawks exist to a certain extent as the state's 'evil other', and that this identity role-playing is a condition of the state's struggle to contain them within its borders (however it occurs), exemplified by The Eastern Door's discussion of protests at Gustafen Lake:

> The first thing that comes to mind about the recent developments at Gustafen Lake in British Columbia is the attempt by the RCMP to demonize the Secwepemc (Shuswap) people occupying the forest. The campaign to discredit the occupiers begins with quoting local chiefs who have disowned the group, displaying of weapons seized from other Shuswap individuals, and then branding them all radicals and terrorists. Special note was made of the Chinese made AK47, the supposed favourite weapon of anti-government, communist supported groups. (Isn't the cold war over?) The RCMP have managed to make a political statement into a criminal one and in order to maintain 'law and order', a forceful removal of the Secwepemc is justified. (E.D. Sept 1st 1995:2)

In contrast, the Mohawks' 'criminality' is contested by The Eastern Door by encouraging positive visions of the Peacekeepers who present both a determined force for peace or are 'pro-good', and also have the power to implement alternative rules and laws based on Mohawk values and concepts of behaviour. In this they symbolize the ability to be self-governing and distinct.

Self-identification and Behaviour

The Peacekeepers symbolize one intrinsically important feature of any social movement or group; they embody the positive characteristics of The Eastern Door's moral charter. The legitimacy of the Peacekeepers rests on their ability to carry out some of the most positive attributes of Mohawk identity and behaviour: to be responsible towards the community; to care for its members and represent them; as well as be fully accountable to them. They must enforce certain regulations whilst maintaining a degree of informality or discretion that asserts their loyalty to the community. Narratives that assert traditional values to be embedded within the Peacekeeper institution reinforce this view.

The Eastern Door presents the Peacekeepers as a body of people who possess a certain organic character. People who carry out the roles of peacekeepers are presented as stoic, heroic, and selfless, giving much to the community, in short, fulfilling the 'essential'

characteristics of Mohawk behaviour by behaving well. They are comparable to warriors in their protection of the community and promotion of peace (Pertusali 1997:41),[30] although they have a level of authority and legitimacy the Warrior Society is incapable of achieving, through its past action (for instance, during the Oka Crisis). They also appear as natural leaders, because of their accountability, particularly in contrast to the MCK, whose past actions have also negated its trustworthiness.

This conceptualisation is linked to The Eastern Door's philosophy in which individuals have a responsibility for the community, and the community a responsibility for the individual. Conceptually, the Peacekeepers are modern representatives of the community, embodying the act of communal responsibility. They mediate life practices, in their ethos encapsulating the philosophy of communal care and socialization.

Thus it is essential that the community support them. This appears to be the case; further, the legitimacy (of the Peacekeepers) can be connected to the fact that traditionalist ideology was one of the guiding principles of institutional reform within the community (Alfred 1996:134), as such the Peacekeepers are an institution whose values affirm positive Mohawk behaviour and a directed movement for future action. The Peacekeeper commitment to the community rather than politics fulfils The Eastern Door's desire to provide community cohesion, and to exhort community members to remember that the real foe of the community is outsiders. This can be illustrated by a recent example of politics and policing explicitly entering the Mohawk public arena: the joint raid of an illegal alcohol still in Kahnawake by the Peacekeepers, the SQ, the RCMP and the MUC.

---

[30] Linda Pertusali states that 'warrior' means 'carrier of peace' (Pertusali 1997:41-42).

The Peacekeepers vs. The Mohawk Council of Kahnawake: Debates of Accountability

As mentioned in Chapter Three, in December 2001 the MCK disbanded the Peacekeeper Accountability Board (PAB) and later passed a law transferring the jurisdiction over the Peacekeepers to MCK accountability, meaning that the MCK was responsible for the actions of the Peacekeepers. However, on March 25th 2002 the Peacekeepers, the RCMP, the SQ and the MUC carried out a joint raid on an illegal alcohol still in Kahnawake. Apparently both Mohawks and non-Mohawks were operating the still. When the event first happened, many were angry at the Peacekeepers for inviting the SQ onto the territory because the SQ had been banned since 1979. However, a few weeks later a Peacekeeper wrote an anonymous letter insinuating that MCK Chiefs were involved with a cover-up and had warned some of the Mohawks participating in the raid. The Peacekeeper eventually admitted to his authorship of the anonymous letter but stated that he was scared for his rights, because the MCK had jurisdiction over the Peacekeepers, and there was no independent body to consider them. This controversial event has provided many contentious issues with a context for debate, especially the jurisdiction and control of the Peacekeepers as an institution.

A main query raised in this debate was the joint investigation of the policing bodies, and the question of who exactly knew about it. The concern was whether the issue was one of health and safety, or one of jurisdiction? In other words, was the protection of the community's health more important than the independence of Kahnawake in making its own decisions? Peacekeepers argued that they were protecting people in raiding several locations in Kahnawake: "This wasn't an issue of jurisdiction...It was an issue of public safety"

(ED Pg 19 March 29ᵗʰ 2002), and as such needed the expertise of the SQ, (who had also been investigating the subjects of the raid for a while previously), to dismantle the still safely. Community members, however, appeared to be worried that it was the SQ that had issued warrants for search and arrests rather than the Peacekeepers, and reminded each other of the fact that Peacekeepers were unable to issue those warrants (E.D. March 29ᵗʰ 2002:5).

The Eastern Door reported that a pressing concern for several community members was that the Suréte du Québec's presence in the community was a symbolic reminder of its influence, who questioned the MCK thus: "weren't you told last Friday to cease allowing the SQ coming into Kahnawake?" (E.D. March 29ᵗʰ 2002:18). To those members, the Peacekeepers were present merely as "goons" - fodder to protect outside forces in carrying out the raid. This is a familiar problem – the MCK had endangered people's rights by negotiating with an outside government (E.D. March 29ᵗʰ 2002:18).

Debates over levels of SQ activity and differing reports about what had occurred that night led to an issue of clarity. Some community members perceived the ambiguous language of the Peacekeeper protocol (regarding issues of jurisdiction) to be a problem, and a change was suggested: "No SQ, RCMP, nor any foreign organisation shall at any time, for any reason, be permitted within the sovereign territory of the Mohawk Nation at Kahnawake..." (E.D. April 12ᵗʰ 2002:20).

A key concern was that the Peacekeepers had failed in their stated intent to protect the community; instead of protecting Kahnawake from outside forces, they had invited these forces in, and to persecute certain members of the community. This would seem to negate the view that the Peacekeepers are seen as symbolic leaders and protectors of the community against outside forces. This action appeared to demonstrate that they were more concerned with policing than community because they had betrayed community interests of autonomy.

However, the problem had more complex links to issues of accountability and intentions. Due to the recent dissolution of the PAB, the MCK had taken over complete jurisdiction and accountability for the Peacekeepers. The problem immediately became the MCK's responsibility, particularly whether they should have warned people about the raid or not when they became aware of it. As such, the liability was removed from the Peacekeepers very quickly. Subsequent debates then revolved around the accountability of the Mohawk Council of Kahnawake and its responsibility to the community. Questions were raised as to the MCK's intentions and practices and it also had to answer questions relating to the Peacekeepers and the raid, while the Peacekeepers were relatively distanced from accusations after the first week.

Some weeks after the raid, documents related to it began to circulate in Kahnawake, suggesting that the Peacekeepers had known about the still for five months and done nothing about it, so they could not be that concerned about community health. Accusations were made that an MCK chief had actually contacted Mohawks involved in

the illegal operation, and had warned them that a raid was to be carried out, as well as being actively involved in covering up evidence that would implicate Mohawks.

The Eastern Door, however, maintained that this was an issue of corruption – the MCK members were suspending norms of Peacekeeper procedures and involving them with politics: "it is very clear that in the end the MCK will always have, and maintain, ultimate control over the PKs" (E.D. April 19th 2002:3). This narrative implies that the Peacekeepers have no agency since the PAB agreement was reneged on, and thus are victims, once again, of the whim of the MCK:

> There will always be room for speculation or suspicion that it is political interference and obstruction which drive certain Chiefs of the MCK in their relationship with the PKs. One has to wonder if all the roadblocks and resistance the PAB encountered from the MCK were designed to eliminate the PAB because the latter would have prevented political interference. (E.D. April 19th 2002:3)

The Eastern Door's editorials explicitly supported this view:

> The purpose of the Peacekeepers is to maintain peace and security in our community. And to do this they should be free of political interference. In the past, community members were very concerned the Peacekeepers would not be able to arrest or charge members of our community who had political connections or were closely related to members of the MCK. (E.D. April 5th 2002:2)

The Eastern Door was quite explicit about why the Peacekeepers should be regulated by an independent authority: accusations of personal and political interests. The allusions to personal interests, and accountability and regulation, also contain implicit references to the factionalism and people within the community (such as certain MCK members) who seem to be impeding cohesion.

The presentation of the Peacekeepers by The Eastern Door does not question their

particular accountability or willingness to do their job. It reintroduces an alternative

problem: the illegal and dangerous still itself, and the criminal activity surrounding it:

> Kahnawakehro:non react to moonshine bust.
> Word spread throughout the community quickly that the Kahnawake Peacekeepers were raiding several establishments in the community to bust up an illegal moonshine operation. The raid was conducted using Kahnawake Peacekeepers, Kanesatake Mohawk Police, Akwesasne Mohawk Police, Kahnawake Conservation Department and experts from the RCMP, Sûreté du Quebec, Montreal police and chemists from the Societe des Alcools du Quebec (SAQ).
> Many people believed that this operation was an SQ and RCMP operation conducted with the assistance of the Peacekeepers. Other people were glad that such an operation was uncovered and stopped.
> 'It was not an SQ operation,' Chief Peacekeeper John K. Diabo said. Diabo said the only reason the SQ and RCMP were in the community on the night of the raid was for their expertise in this area. 'If we dismantled this on our own,' Diabo continued, 'there was a strong possibility that there would have been an explosion and people could have been killed.'
> Diabo also said that during the past two years there were a number of teens who have been sick after drinking a similar product. He said their sicknesses included being in comas for several days and another young girl had to have her stomach pumped for two days.
> 'My first priority is the health and safety of our people, of our children, their children and their grandchildren,' Diabo said. 'My first concern is the community. We can't let the outside come here to run their businesses tax-free for their own gain. I'm not going to tolerate that'. (E.D. March 29th 2002:19)

To The Eastern Door, it is more important that the *Peacekeepers* were attempting to

protect people's health (by guarding them from the potentially lethal contents of the still)

than the processes of their protection. The Eastern Door argues: "If bars and stores insist on

selling moonshine to our people or anyone else, then the Peacekeepers should be able to rid these

establishments of these illegal and potentially harmful alcoholic beverages" (E.D. March 29th

2002:2). And if *MCK* members were leaking information to people so they could escape

prosecution, this was a more serious issue; "there is a growing perception that some members of

the MCK have leaked information or have tried to influence or hinder the activities of the Peacekeepers in

order to protect certain individuals" (E.D. April 26th 2002:2). As a logical consequence of this

implicit discourse, The Eastern Door implies that the MCK put a population at risk to

protect a few individuals who were guilty of criminal activity. It provides both explicit critique of the MCK, but also refers to the results in a symbolic way, providing allusions and images that may inspire readers to critique the MCK independently of The Eastern Door. In comparison, the Peacekeepers were seen to act responsibly, especially as they state they were also mindful of the effects that the presence of the SQ would have on the community: "Chief John K. Diabo has stated that the SQ had wanted to come into the community in greater force but that he flatly refused, knowing this would be [as] unacceptable to the community as it was to himself" (E.D. April 5th 2002:9). Thus the Peacekeepers are seen as protectors of the community, and the processes of their institution corrupted by the MCK.

This narrative continues and gains strength as the author of an anonymous email questioning the MCK and implicating certain MCK people as guilty of fraudulent behaviour admits that he is a Peacekeeper. The Peacekeeper writes a letter to The Eastern Door, contending: "They jeopardised the case by ignoring evidence pertaining to local suspects. They lied about this on the televised news conference" (E.D. April 26th 2002:3). He argues that had he behaved within the institutional boundaries of his Peacekeeper oath, the facts would have been concealed:

> I felt that if I came forward on my own, the evidence would have been suppressed and I would become an easy target within the council structure. Because the PAB Board was recently disbanded, there is no organisation, independent from the council that would protect my rights to pursue a complaint against the Peacekeeper Chief and Grand Chief of the Mohawk Council. (E.D. April 26th 2002:3)

The Peacekeeper utilises a concept of accepted communal rights and responsibilities to protect him from an allegedly corrupt system based on individual responsibilities and legislation.

At the same time, The Eastern Door publishes a letter written by thirteen Peacekeepers who are complaining about "organised intimidation" and attempting to secure their continued ability to carry out their tasks without being political: "we have done our duty to the community in a respectful and professional manner and will continue to act upon any activity that is in contravention of our Peacekeeper mandate and oath, irrespective of their political affiliation, race, creed or colour" (E.D. April 26th 2002:3). These Peacekeepers reinforce the idea that the activities of Peacekeepers should be separate from politics, and rather than accusing any institution in particular attempt to distance themselves from these types of considerations. In comparison, the single Peacekeeper utilises the same type of community - responsive discourse prevalent in The Eastern Door when he says: "Though unorthodox, the facts and evidence were brought to light to the people we are ultimately accountable to, the community of Kahnawake" (E.D. April 26th 2002:3).

The similarity of The Eastern Door and Peacekeeper statements of purpose affirm that the mandates of the two institutions correspond; the exception is that The Eastern Door has no institutional jurisdiction to restrain it. However, there are broad similarities in their roles: to serve the community, to act in its best interests and to keep it informed about situations that affect it. Discourses of protection and stances of protection and accountability surround both the workings of The Eastern Door and the Peacekeepers. In representing this controversy (which is still being contested months later) sometimes explicitly, and sometimes with no comment, The Eastern Door is also trying to distance itself from politics. This controversy was highly problematic and plays into very political issues. As a result of The Eastern Door's mandate, it attempts to avoid explicit condemnation of other people. It criticized the interlinked jurisdiction of the MCK and

the Peacekeepers only when the problem was obvious, and for the majority of the time

suggested how future action should be carried out. It also left statements unfinished, in

the sense that it led people to conclusions but did not make them. Whether or not this is

accidental, it is a very strong message and method of discourse.

Conclusion

The Peacekeepers appear very positively in The Eastern Door in drastic contrast to

images of the MCK. Specific values embodied by the Peacekeepers are those of trust,

responsibility and accountability to the community, which are vital themes within the

newspaper and its vision of community. Philosophical themes of respect and tradition are

fulfilled in the newspaper as the Peacekeepers maintain a professional and yet distinctly

Mohawk sense of duty; their stoic and strong natures combine a commitment to duty with

a commitment to community, as well as a sense of right and wrong.

This portrayal of the Peacekeepers legitimises their presence and abilities. It also

depoliticises their roles within the community, by making it acceptable for the

Peacekeepers to be working in Kahnawake as agents of law, as police. By emphasising

their commitment to the community, and in extreme cases, their apparent willingness to

suspend protocol for the community, we are shown where the loyalties of the

Peacekeepers lie: with their own people. In presenting them this way, The Eastern Door

depoliticises the very political character of policing and deviancy in this community too.

In validating the community-oriented responsibilities of the Peacekeepers, and

confirming their identity as Mohawk, The Eastern Door distances them from the

problematic nature of policing, and the fact that they have the jurisdiction of police. This

appears surprising, given the prevalence of discourses surrounding force and control in

this community, but may not be considering the prevalence of those relating to behaviour,

which I will now discuss.

Chapter 5

A Concern With Behaviour

The principal characteristic I have traced through The Eastern Door is its concern with behaviour. I have done so by exploring its rhetorical style, and by examining its representations of a Kahnawake institution, the Peacekeepers (KMP), which embodies its positive examples of behaviour. In this chapter, I will go on to suggest how and why themes of behaviour and conduct are so prevalent within The Eastern Door's discourse.

I will do this by examining some influences on The Eastern Door's presentation strategies, such as stereotypes and preconceptions of Mohawk behaviour. Although I have noted these influences and themes in other chapters, I will now attempt to explain them using theory to provide insight. Thus I will look at The Eastern Door's implicit and explicit concerns with behaviour, examine why the promotion of ideas about positive and negative behaviour occur, and suggest that a concept of appropriate conduct influences conceptualisations of problems with behaviour. I will problematise the existence of such constructions and link them to a wider societal context.

Stereotypes and Behaviour: Media

As I have noted, a component of The Eastern Door's representational style (particularly as it applies to behaviour) is a concern with outside mass media and its depictions of Kahnawake and Mohawks in general. The Eastern Door is extremely conscious of the force and influence of outside media depictions and their results, and has on several

occasions made formal complaints about the levels of distortion these media can achieve in their coverage of the community[31].

What are the impacts of this type of representation? Scholars such as Andrew Ford and Rick Ponting have also commented on media coverage of Kahnawake and link it with the reinforcement of mainstream hegemonic practices. In this case, the Canadian mass media has shown a marked concern with the governance and control of Kahnawake. Mohawks have been portrayed as lawless in the extreme[32], influential and threatening to others (i.e. Canadian 'white stream'[33]). Noticeable examples include discussions of the Warrior Society as bullying and uncontrollable (Ford 1996:86), Mohawks as violent; "In fact, the Montreal region was sitting on a powder keg all through the first half of 1994: Mohawks armed to the teeth had announced they would retaliate with force to any aggression by police or army" (Journal de Montreal)[34]; deviant for their cigarette smuggling and concerned more with money than with care for others (Ford 1996:87) and self-interested during the Seaway protests: "…this is a chronicle of men fighting for self- interest against nations fighting for national interests…" (Hauptman 1986:136 quotes L. Chevrier: The St Lawrence Seaway).[35]

---

[31] For example, in reporting on the cigarette smuggling in 1994, Le Devoir ran a headline "SMOKA", attempting to draw links between the Oka Crisis and generalized Mohawk behaviour. This was seen as particularly insulting and offensive (Kenneth Deer: Interview February 2002).

[32] Steadily negative media coverage climaxed between 1990 and 1995 according to Ford (1996), as a result of the Oka Crisis in 1990, cigarette smuggling in 1995 and problems with the Warrior Society.

[33] This is a phrase used mainly by Aboriginal critics to describe mainstream Canadian society and its values/norms.

[34] Reported in The Eastern Door, trans I. Schulte-Tchenkoff ref. (ED July 16 story 1)

[35] Lionel Chevrier was a cabinet minister and later president of the St Lawrence Seaway Authority and believed the Mohawks were protesting against the development of the Seaway merely to thwart his plans.

This type of mass media and governmental depiction has constructed an image of uncontrollable, emotional, irrational and belligerent people. As they are shown to behave in ways that are outside the boundaries of mainstream norms, the Mohawks appear as pathological personalities, who terrorize other Canadian citizens. Racism against them appears to be prevalent: "Mention the word racism today and certain images come quickly to mind: angry mobs burning Indians in effigy during the Oka Crisis of 1990 and the equally appalling images of other non-Natives throwing rocks and stones at Mohawk women, children, and elders fleeing Kahnawake across the Mercier Bridge during that same crisis" (Ponting 1997:163). Ponting terms this type of attitude 'systemic racism'. It is a form of discrimination that is embedded in cultural systems; it takes on qualities that are removed from original meanings. It is pervasive and regardless of its origins, it can be re-expanded upon and reformulated. Systemic racism is not seen as purposeful; it is instead a product of certain relations of power and circumstances, which appear to be based on the understandings and perceptions that people form in interaction.

Part of this process develops via a pre-existing entrenchment of ideas about characters, which Philip Smith (1997:95) explains as parts of cultural vocabularies of understanding that "...plot key actors in social dramas as 'characters', as symbols to which they attribute specific roles and motivations". Events feed into a meta-narrative of action, which can dictate their interpretation. It may be possible therefore that mainstream depictions of media do not rest on a purposeful manipulation of reality as a simple implementation of hegemonic power, but are based on formerly persistent ideas about Mohawks, which have many different origins (Trigger 1986).

Narratives need continual *confirmation* that is provided by the method of interpretation itself (Smith 1997:95) and its self-fulfilling tendencies. The government also reinforces these narratives: Rick Ponting[36] (1990:99) reports that in a 1990 meeting with European delegates, police, government and Mohawks, the Federal Indian Affairs Minister at that time, Tom Siddon, is quoted as saying; "I can see how you'd draw those parallels, having visited Mohawks. Elsewhere round the country, especially the North, there is a strong sense of discipline and respect, and respect for the law". Ponting (1990:101) states that the government attempts to undermine the Mohawks by claiming they are criminal, deviant and need to be policed while proclaiming its own values to be those of restraint, lawfulness, generosity and liberality. Both the federal and provincial government depict themselves as extremely patient with the Mohawks and as selfless benefactors or negotiators (Ponting 1990:100), an attitude that is supported by the media. Christian Bay (1981:96) identifies this tendency towards justification to be a primary trait of governments: a semantic self-defence system, which involves slanting the uses of key terms so that positive words are associated with the established social order, while negative words are associated with anti-establishment activities. However, Ellen Bobet (1988:25) notes that this type of narrative from outsiders may be a result of federal/ provincial wrangling over responsibilities as does Claude Denis[37] (1997:26) but it is nonetheless pervasive when it is utilised to speak about the Mohawks.

---

[36] Ponting was present at this 1990 meeting as an independent / 'neutral' observer.
[37] Denis argues that the Mohawks are victims of a power struggle between the provincial/federal government, their claims only privileged by the federal government at the expense of Quebec's provincial government.

Whether stereotypes are purposeful or systemic, they have certain benefits for the state and civil society because of their entrenchment in laws, customs, values and norms (Ponting 1997:167). The adoption and operation of western cultural values, laws and customs have negative consequences for Aboriginal groups, who suffer problems of control. The enforcement of a law supposedly created for multi-cultural purposes yet engendering Anglo-European standards (Miller 1991:411) is a part of a dramatic exercise of symbolic power and western legal habitus (Bourdieu 1991) and its implementation has been problematic for many groups, who seek to question its validity for their people. It has had negative impacts on agency regarding strategy and action. Characterizations of groups in legislation and policy (as well as within outside media representations) exercise an influence on how groups are thought about, how these groups think about themselves and how they react to these depictions, or how they can debate them (Bourdieu 1991:109).

Marilyn Dumont (1993:48) cites stereotypes and their constructions to have causal responsibility for many of the problems that Aboriginal peoples suffer. Kateri Damm (1993:11) likens the continuity of negative images to a type of cultural violence and argues that the resulting confusion, uncertainty, low self-esteem and need to assert control over identity are just some of the effects of these stereotypes. The impacts are hard to assess, but the negative characterizations of Mohawks as uncontrollable, acting on the margins of social life, are part of a powerful discourse on ethnicity, class and social control. As bell hooks (1992:5) argues: "...images play crucial roles in defining and controlling the political and social power to which both individuals and marginalized

groups have access. The deeply ideological nature of imagery determines not only how other people think about us, but how we think about ourselves". People are constrained by images and ideas about character. For example, Ponting (1997:176) states that generally, regardless of orientation, politicians are concerned with and rarely act against public opinion– but who has the power to influence public opinion?

In Bourdieu's (1991:164) theory of practice, he suggested that habitus was inculcated in systems of language. Thus, these systems were not merely based on meaning, but access to power and legitimacy – the authority to use language (Bourdieu 1991:109). Because they were based in social structures of power and authority, discourses were limited according to what was thinkable to the social structure (1991:172). This was the exercise of symbolic power (1991:164), which was rarely recognised as such because it was embodied in language.

In the political field for example, actors were limited by having to appeal to the tools of perception available at any one time. Those who could utilise the tools available, which they could gain through their possession of habitus, would garner greater legitimacy (1991:172). This might suggest that due to their social position, the Mohawks do not possess sufficient authority to be able to change the way that people think about them and their proposals for nationhood. As a ruling elite, the state embodies and inculcates meaning, as Bourdieu (1991:170) further argues:

> What creates the power of words and slogans, a power capable of maintaining or subverting the social order, is the belief in the legitimacy of words and of those who utter them. And words alone cannot create this belief.

States, media and Aboriginal groups are in the middle of a battle over representation and 'truth-saying'. Images and opinion are intrinsic to their success, which may be shown by looking at the Oka Crisis and its confusing ramifications. Many Canadians initially supported the Mohawk cause (although not their actions) and they received support and sympathy from international observers, including the European media, which caused embarrassment for the Canadian state because of their mistreatment of the Mohawks. However, the mass media in Canada (and especially in Quebec) presented the affair as a criminal and outrageous 'crisis', with the Mohawks as savages, behaving illegally by contesting controversial government actions. This may be connected with Ponting's (1997:165) opinion that: "...dissemination, backed and defended by the considerable financial muscle of the corporate media giants, operates subtly and cumulatively over time to undermine respect for diversity in Canadian society". However, it is also linked to the actions of the Warrior Society and the problems that the three major Mohawk communities in Canada faced in governance at the time;[38] what it leads us towards is a demonstration of media tendencies, showing that the press may take a multi-faceted and complex issue and reduce it to a more simplistic dialogue between 'good' and 'bad'.[39]

These negative images of Mohawks feed into and are fed by part of the 'emotional savage' narrative. They work to deplete Mohawk legitimacy, and their ability to make coherent protests by making them appear to be problematic and deviant citizens of the

---

[38] Alfred (1990:28) argues that the Warriors ruined Kahnawake's 'golden opportunity' and 'created defeat' through their mismanagement and 'political myopia'.
[39] This is part of a typical media and government response - only the most extreme circumstances and scenarios become focal points (Wagamese 1996:81).

mainstream,[40] rather than as those who suffer legitimate problems related to sovereignty. As a result, Mohawk expressions of dissatisfaction are depoliticised, because they are interpreted either as militancy or deviancy. This diminishes the basis upon which they can make claims, and they are instead reduced to a simplistic subordinate status.

This outside narrative of values and judgments concerning Mohawk behaviour has an unequivocal impact on how The Eastern Door assesses its own peoples, and how it strategically and politically opposes and provides alternatives to mainstream depiction. This may be an important explanation for The Eastern Door's concern with behaviour and morality, as these negative images have long-reaching impacts on self-image and ways of constructing identity, especially the image of Mohawks as irreparably amoral. However, Gillian Cowlishaw (1988:92) argues that these narratives can be exploited, as she feels that the moral outrage of White populations regarding Aboriginal behaviour and failure to conform is a source of power for Aboriginal peoples. She suggests that Aboriginal Peoples can take on and utilize these feelings and as a result, set agendas of behaviour. Yet these agendas are weak, as they are based on an inequality of power and the pervasive force of stereotypes, and, as Vincent Sacco (1992:26) has noted, processes involved with deviance include 'escalation'. This is a situation whereby interventions by legal authorities or over-reactions from authorities result in the commission of offences that probably would not have occurred otherwise. Behaviour can be provoked, as he further argues: "those who are labelled deviant frequently respond to those who label them with a sense of injustice and anger which results in further acts of primary deviance" (Sacco 1992:24). However, The Eastern Door recognizes 'deviance' as the

---

[40] Regarding media and government interpretations.

Canadian state frames it, to be a weak source of power. Instead of developing the idea of negative behaviour, The Eastern Door does not embrace the negative images of Mohawk behaviour as 'negative': it tries to explain them, that the behaviour takes place as a *sui generis* right, and as a fallacy or misunderstanding of that right.

This is why government accusations of criminal behaviour are countered in two ways, which can appear contradictory. As I have mentioned in Chapter Two, the deviancy concerned with illegal cigarette smuggling (for example) is defended as a right of Mohawk peoples to do so as part of their independent nationhood as Haudenosee[41] peoples. In other words, the rules of the Canadian state do not hold significance for the Mohawks as they do for others. Secondly, The Eastern Door attacks the view that the Mohawks are deviant within the community by presenting ways in which they are not and ways in which they heed notions of legitimate behaviour. Their values are held up as an incontrovertible 'essence' of national Mohawk identity and contrasted with the Canadian mainstream's seeming lack of values.

Emotions and Behaviour: Appropriate Expressions

Why are the Mohawks seen as particularly deviant? For their behaviour – their failure to 'control' themselves, or for their 'militancy? The view of the Mohawks as deviant is connected to understandings of their characters or behaviour, which are in turn negotiated by The Eastern Door. For all actors, a concern with the control of this community is present, which has certain impacts. Part of the Mohawks' image may be explained by Catherine Lutz's (1990) discussion of emotion and control. Lutz (1990:69) argues that

---

[41] Haudenosee people means 'People of the Longhouse' in Kanienke:haka.

'control' as a concept is extremely prevalent in western society, which posits the inability

to control oneself as chaotic, irrational and anti-social. The very existence of this

behaviour legitimates a need for control, justifies terms of authority and is viewed as

'emotion', thus irrelevant. Emotional roles are further linked to hierarchies, which can be

based on gendered, racial or class-based lines (Lutz 1990:77). When social subordinates

express 'emotion', they push and threaten social boundaries. They are portrayed as weak

for this expression but due to their inability to observe appropriate western boundaries

they are also depicted as periodically threatening, especially for the tendency to riot or to

hysterical behaviour (Lutz 1990:78).

There are striking comparisons between Lutz's discussion of emotional management and

construction, and the ways in which Mohawk behaviour and expressions of

dissatisfaction have been depicted in mainstream media, in particular their perceived lack

of control and intolerance for Canadian laws and values. Discourse about emotion "draws

links between subordination, rebellion and power" (Lutz 1990:69), as does discourse

about Mohawk behaviour. The Mohawks are seen as lacking reserve, as being irrational,

violent and threatening. They take strong stances of determined behaviour that is

interpreted as belligerent and appears to influence other groups to act in irrational ways.[42]

Geoffrey White (1990) may elucidate this point as he argues that the types of activities

and relations in which they are enacted constitute emotions. For White (1990:64)

emotions are defined by understandings and perceptions about actions and identities. The

---

[42] For example, the rioting of Chateauguay citizens during the Mohawk blockading of the Mercier Bridge in 1990, or the collusion of citizens with Mohawks in 1994 when the Mohawks were smuggling cigarettes to sell to Canadians.

potential for misunderstanding is high and rests on a web of conceptualised encounters. Furthermore, so much rests on the *appropriate* expression of emotion, and particularly, on appropriate behavioural management, that chances are high that these complex frameworks will be misinterpreted (White 1990:51). White is arguing that there are culturally appropriate times to express opinions or sentiments. When they differ there is a high potential for them to be misunderstood.

Geoffrey White implicitly discusses the power relations of systemic interpretations (for our purposes, racism), while Catherine Lutz draws direct links between power and the categorisation of emotional and irrational behaviour, an anathema to the traditional western state and civil society.[43] Lutz follows a Foucauldian (Foucault 1975: 205) concern with power as her theory sees a fluid relationship between dominant authorities and emotional bodies when policing expressions of authority. In using the work of Michelle Rosaldo (1984/ Renato Rosaldo 1977) who stated that there are benefits to an emotional person who can claim they are aware of the need to have self-control, Lutz writes that the perceived need to manage oneself sustains social boundaries of emotional control (Lutz 1990:70).

It may be possible to see this type of development occurring in the interpretation of Mohawk dissatisfaction, opinions, or actions as emotional rather than 'rational' or 'reasonable'. As 'emotions' or their presence form part of a social hierarchy of understanding, and 'invalidate' the person who expresses them (because of their

---

[43] Verne Dusenberry has also noted this type of development within the Canadian state, in his discussion of Sikhs and interpretations of their behaviour. In particular, he draws attention to the Sikh failure to divide between religion and the political state as a major cause for their unpopularity (Dusenberry 1997:751).

irrationality and basis in feeling rather than fact), outside narratives of Mohawks as expressing emotion rather than logical dissatisfaction may invalidate their opinions. Dissatisfaction interpreted as emotion gives it an irrational and chaotic quality and may justify certain types of control over it.

As The Eastern Door is conscious of constructions of Mohawks in the media and by the state as emotional, deviant and as terrorizing concepts of norms and appropriate behaviour, its awareness of a negative image may stimulate its own expressions of control, and not just defence, of Mohawk behaviour. The newspaper defends Mohawks by presenting ways in which outside views are incorrect, such as stating that the Mohawks do not have to abide by Canadian social norms. However, in countering assertions about Mohawks, The Eastern Door presents ways in which they can be controlled and well behaved – its concern with morals. In doing so it is implicitly judging the Mohawk population with the same schema that the state uses.

This may be an added reason why The Eastern Door maintains such a prevalent concern with Peacekeepers and why it problematises visibly emergent forms of crime as non-Mohawk identity traits, such as drug pushing or running illegal stills for example. Because Mohawk behaviour is routinely depicted as criminal, occurring at the expense of other people, the disregard for Canadian society and its ethos gives Mohawks an extremely deviant public image. The Eastern Door's concern with control, as part of an acknowledged need for it, is part of an alternative representation of more acceptable and

valued cultural traits, such as Aboriginal concepts of community, respect, tradition, and noble morality (Wearne 1996:176).

Problems With Behaviour

Luana Ross (1998:3) argues that speaking of Aboriginal groups in a way that posits them as problematic citizens of a nation state results from needs of state social control mechanisms. In her opinion, as a result of these needs, cultural 'difference' has become factual; the culture of the oppressor is seen as 'ideal', and any kind of aberrance from the norm has become deviant. She terms this 'convoluted racism' (Ross 1998:5), which is a reflection of the complexity of having to contain different social groups within one state. This view can be supported by Jacques Donzelot's (1979:55) suggestion that institutions of governance have been historically normalized by an adherence to tradition and norms as 'philanthropy'. A concern with social mores helped to establish 'indigence' and to depoliticise the institutionalization of control in sensitive areas. James Ferguson (1994:256) supports this view as he argues: "The 'instrument effect', then is two-fold: alongside the institutional effect of expanding bureaucratic state power is the conceptual or ideological effect of depoliticising both poverty and state".

Ross (1998:267) argues that ideas about cultural difference and behaviour warrant the removal of many Native Americans to corrective institutions, because 'everyday' behaviour is categorized as irresponsible and deviant, and that the stereotype of Aboriginal peoples as ignorant, backward and savage is carefully developed for this very reason. Donald Purich (1991:422) also supports this view, arguing that the outlawing of

Aboriginal cultural practices in Canada was part of a concerted effort to assimilate Aboriginals into the mainstream.

Ross (1998:14) states that in general Aboriginal peoples have traditionally adhered to a system of discretionary justice based on 'restoration'. In her view, North America's Aboriginal peoples have always exercised laws but they are based on mediating and healing behaviour. No one thing is wrong, or right, but an event is assessed on how it impacts different people. She argues that because of their legislative tendencies Euro-Americans have never understood the principles behind the exercise of discretion and as such have not been able to see it as an exercise of justice at all (Ross 1998:16).

The legislative tendencies of Euro-Americans combined with the stereotype of Aboriginal peoples in Canada as lawless (Ford 1996:25) or childlike, emotional and uncontrollable, has resulted in strict social controls such as those found in residential schools. However, changes in attitude and policy, as well as attempts at understanding cultural differences, have encouraged a system of independent governance and policing. Many First Nations communities now maintain a certain measure of control over themselves (via agreement with the federal government to do so). However, they do so as long as they mediate their social systems in a legible way for outside government, in short, if they mediate their own actions rather than having them mediated. The Peacekeepers in Kahnawake are part of this process, as they exist as a hybrid of government and Mohawk values. This hybrid rests not on government *law* and the practice of Mohawk *discretion* but rather on the *institutionalization* of a certain type of

morality deemed to be an organic feature of the Iroquois peoples. This institutionalization of social norms may be a strict one, influenced by preconceptions of irresponsible and lawless behaviour.

The Eastern Door is concerned with Peacekeepers and their roles, and interprets their behaviour, in a way that appears to be based on the implementation of discretion, however. The application of its standards is part of a subjective political understanding of an event and its status, in which deviancy is not absolute, but is negotiable and considered for its value and ramifications, as is the existence and actions of the Peacekeepers. This may be part of the Mohawk tendency towards political expediency, a deliberate configuration of nation as 'difference' (Simpson 2000:119) in which The Eastern Door's bias creates 'loopholes' in its moral charter that sometimes offer unconditional support for the Peacekeepers because of their political status/meaning. This may have an impact on the moral charter for behaviour that The Eastern Door creates and supports and may create 'ambiguity' as to its understanding. It may also have problematic ramifications for those of its population who do not behave in appropriate ways or express themselves in a politically appropriate manner (i.e. behaviour which adds value).

This may mean that those who The Eastern Door sees as unsupportive of the 'cause' because of their actions can be held personally responsible. In their behaviour they are not acting in ways that 'add value' (while they are also reinforcing outsiders' notions of the need to control the community). Thus deviance can be defined as that which 'detracts value' and The Eastern Door can define it as behaviour that is an abnormality in the

Mohawk community in direct comparison to state and mass media concepts of
Kahnawake.

Whereas the media portrays Kahnawake as a corrupted and uncontrollable community,
The Eastern Door emphasizes its peaceful and co-operative nature, its outstanding law
enforcement officers, and presents others such as drug dealers as cultural abnormalities,
acting without the consent of the community. This is not far removed from popular
definitions of deviance: "…it is most useful to think about such activities as violative of
social rules or norms. Thus, it is argued, the deviant is someone who cannot or will not
respect widespread, culturally supported expectations as to what constitutes appropriate
conduct" (Sacco 1992:6).

These 'cultural abnormalities' of Mohawk behaviour can be related to The Eastern
Door's own conceptions of westernized influences of alienation (loss of spirit, fire, flame
and renewal concepts) and as stated in my discussion of emotions, also respond to the
government's concepts of deviance. In responding to the Canadian state, The Eastern
Door has to take on and utilize state-held concepts of deviancy. As a consequence, social
processes of definition are those that stem from state and community interactions as well
as pre-existing ideas. This is another influence on The Eastern Door's formulation and
assertion of a 'moral charter', an extremely prevalent force within its rhetoric on
behaviour. As Vincent Sacco (1992:22) argues; "…deviant behaviour does not so much
reflect the state of mind of disreputable individuals as it does the push and pull, give and
take, negotiation and coercion inherent in the relationships that join such people to those

who monitor, police and treat them". In the absence of an overarching agreement on what constitutes deviancy or appropriate behaviour, as a result of the implementation of hybrid forms of policing, contestations of state version of legalities (i.e. cigarette smuggling), and dubious authorities, The Eastern Door provides an alternative form of behaviour based on discretion: its charter for how to behave as a responsible Mohawk entity and its ideal institution to embody these values: the Peacekeepers.

Universalism and Behaviour: Utilizing Indigenous Rights Rhetoric

When groups have been subjects or objects of repression by more dominant bodies and have resisted, 'culture' has been used as a form of control (Wearne 1996:10). Through various processes, governments and colonial agents have defined Indigenous behaviour as deviant or criminal, or the culture a relic or frustration to centralizing tendencies (Wearne 1996:175). Aboriginal groups have also used these ideas about their 'cultural difference' to contest state authority. As part of its discourse, The Eastern Door attempts to emphasize separation from the state, and does so in order to appeal to its own community and to its inherent 'difference' from Canadian culture. In doing so, The Eastern Door appeals to a concept of Aboriginality that defines its difference from the mainstream. This is a well-defined tactic, as Ponting (1990:93) noted that in a meeting in 1990 to discuss the Oka Crisis; "A striking feature of the Indian discourse was its redundancy. That is, certain 'frames' or themes ran like a refrain through the presentations made to the European delegation by the numerous Indian groups". There are similarities here with the repetitive and generalized nature of The Eastern Door's formulaic constructions of events and their significance. This discursive strategy may be

a result of attempts to use some concepts of Indigenous rights rhetoric and trying to promote cohesion; as such it may reiterate these discourses regardless of the subject.

Bourdieu (1991:55), wrote that in situations where identity was lived through cultural capital (just as it appears to be for The Eastern Door in order to contest the government), much rested on the justification of speech via cultural knowledge, and elevating it to a primordial status, which is a facet of The Eastern Door's utilization of general 'Indigenous rights rhetoric'. He also cautioned that because these expressions of justification were constantly reiterated and had a tendency to be univeralistic, they could become rather false[44] (Bourdieu 1991:41). Because different events were constantly interpreted in the same way, they lacked relevance and became insignificant, the distance between them becoming small and inconsequential.

This means that the competence of The Eastern Door in utilizing a wider trend of common rights rhetoric may appear to enhance its struggle, yet the commonality or universalism of its appeal may mean that its local (and individual) struggle loses significance. The constant reiteration of themes and ideas taken from other peoples, and the use of arguments involving luminous yet intangible concepts of sovereignty, ownership and 'being' may, in Bourdieu's (1991:41) schema, result in a meaningless vocabulary[45] of words rather than actions. Because The Eastern Door rhetorically slots events into wider agendas, and thus endows them all with the same importance, its

---

[44] just as Ponting argues that in 1990 the meeting between Mohawks, government officials and international observers emphasized certain trends that were redundant (Ponting 1990:93)
[45] Bourdieu referred to this process as 'freewheeling'.

capacity to make an impact on the people of Kahnawake may be lost or reduced, in other words, if the struggle is constant, it may become normalized.

The 'univeralistic' element of The Eastern Door's presentation of the Mohawk alternatives to mainstream culture is problematic for another reason, its lack of substance. Assertions of Mohawk identity rest on what the Mohawks are not (in comparison to wider society), or what Mohawks are (utilizing a very general discourse of Aboriginal concepts of tradition and ethics). This feature of Mohawk nationalism is one on which both Taiaiake Alfred and Audra Simpson have concurred, which is for Alfred (1991:25), formed within a vacuum of political ideas and a sense of distinctness: "what does exist among the Kahnawake Mohawks is a vague though persistent sense of the difference between being a 'Mohawk' as opposed to being a non-Indian". Simpson (2000:118) confirms this statement when she writes that Mohawk nationalism is "replete with colonial ironies" which draw from Iroquois teaching, ancestral and immediate past, and from the "neo-colonial project". As a hybrid entity, the 'nation' in Mohawk is configured as a deliberate and expedient symbol of difference, and she argues that it should neither be argued to exist independently of or because of the Canadian state (Simpson 2000:119).

Conclusion
The Eastern Door utilizes a generalized concept of sovereignty and Aboriginal behaviour common to many groups; on some levels it reinforces what it should be by discussing what it is not, and it enacts quiet but strict sanctions against those people who do not conform to these values. It purposefully contradicts state and outside representations of the Mohawks, and it does so in different ways, some of which appear incongruous. This

may be because it tries to resolve the tensions between pre-conceptions of Mohawk behaviour in making positive changes in light of modern realities.

This chapter has discussed some of the possible effects of the interactions between Mohawks and outside society, and how The Eastern Door deals with and is influenced by these processes, assessing the impacts of stereotyping and the characterization of the Mohawks. In particular I have addressed the links between characterizations and control mechanisms. This has been presented as a probable reason for The Eastern Door's concern with behaviour and its presentation of a moral template in contradiction to legislated ideas about deviance, which may reproduce some of those control mechanisms. Finally, I have discussed how The Eastern Door, while being influenced by these ideas about Mohawk behaviour and legitimacy, appeals to a separate state of nationhood, Aboriginal identity, and how this impacts its rhetoric, making it generalized political discourse.

Chapter 6

In Conclusion

In this thesis I have not presented a complete analysis of this newspaper. I identified themes, many of which were conceptual and abstract (and so if there are any inaccuracies, I apologise). These themes are good indicators of what is important to The Eastern Door as a forum that provides information to the Kahnawake community. The use of Aboriginal tools of communication, and the language and directions contained within them embody cultural paradigms (Wearne 1996:9). However, these paradigms are not always explicit or obvious. A study of written or spoken discourse may thus be enhanced by a study of how that discourse is received. I cannot judge how The Eastern Door's discourse is received in Kahnawake or how The Eastern Door is regarded there. The Eastern Door's popularity may be self-evident, with a large distribution that averages just over one edition per household in Kahnawake. Nevertheless, I have no substantiated idea about how The Eastern Door's message is interpreted at this local level, or how 'outsiders' read it.

In the last few decades, Canada's Aboriginal Peoples have become influential in their voicing of ideas about self-government and self-determination. Ideally, many wish to cut the ties they have to the Canadian state and its perceived paternalism and thereby attain political autonomy (Denis 1997:22). Many groups have already gained a level of political integrity in the past few decades as a result of these beliefs and actions that is hitherto unseen in the Americas. However, political autonomy is based on an assertion of 'difference', Aboriginal nationhood, which may, if successful, engender the existence of

nations within nations. This would further mean that Aboriginal peoples would not be integrated into the mainstream.

Ideas on how to establish (and then maintain) political autonomy have been based on revivals: of culture, language, religion and life practices (Wearne 1996:21). One way in which Aboriginal groups can assert their nationhood is as part of the 'politics of recognition'. This involves restoring pride in culture and heritage to Aboriginal peoples, a process that engenders self re-presentation of Aboriginal culture. Movements have promoted cultural values of Aboriginality, such as trust, respect, cohesion, and holism, as well as those based around material culture, such as repatriation claims (the return of Aboriginal human and material remains), and literature and art (Wearne 1996:2).

Another factor that appears to be vital to Aboriginal groups in making a coherent case for self-governance is the presentation of cohesive communities. Communities that can show they are distinct, stable and consensus based, acting with accordance of cultural values, can create respect for their abilities to govern themselves (Cardinal 1991:364) and garner far greater support than if they are internally divided.

This thesis has shown how Kahnawake Mohawks, producing The Eastern Door, attempt to promote Kahnawake's independence as part of the above processes. The Eastern Door sustains certain 'intrinsic' Aboriginal ideals and presents a community that values its unique culture as well as providing support for the people within it. It does so by emphasizing general ways in which to behave or to be, in order to live a meaningful

'Mohawk' existence, that are general enough for consensus and are influenced by outsider norms, Mohawk social norms, and Aboriginal cultural norms. Taken together they form a powerful basis for independence.

The Eastern Door shows us that it is a fallacy to suggest that the basis of Mohawk nationalism and concerns stems from a purely oppositional relationship with 'outside' bodies. For many Aboriginal groups, central concerns lie with their communities and their general health and circumstances. Thus an important influence on The Eastern Door's rhetoric is its engagement with community politics and events.

The Eastern Door also successfully negotiates the tensions that may arise between tradition and modernity. Problems involved in producing a culture based on tradition have led to certain dichotomies that are inapplicable to the situations Aboriginal peoples face in contemporary life. The Eastern Door's presentations allow Mohawks to sustain the idealism that supports the basis of a continuous fight against the Canadian state, as well as negotiating the realities of everyday existence. Its presentations promote a concept of identity that depends on asserting certain kinds of values. This is a conceptual understanding of nationhood that allows for some disagreement in implementation. As such, The Eastern Door provides an example of the processes of community dynamics. For example, the newspaper rarely explicitly mentions factionalism. Kahnawake's political system is factional, but even in a discussion of factions, The Eastern Door rarely identifies them. That The Eastern Door does this shows that it is trying to represent the whole community and is identifying the 'whole' to be more important than the individual.

Encouraging these basic principles can also reinforce unity, which The Eastern Door does by reproducing a type of 'siege mentality'.[46] Many of the newspaper's assertions (especially those concerning control) are based on Mohawk discretion of defence. By elevating ordinary events to a continuous fight against the state, The Eastern Door encourages vigilance and reinforces a sense of shared experience for the community. The renewal of the need to be 'watchful' under threat may be a conscious strategy to promote unity (Pertusali 1997:132). Taiaiake Alfred (1990:25) argues that during the Oka Crisis, the differences and tensions within the community dissipated when it was faced with external pressure, or at least were seen as temporarily less important. Richard Salisbury (1977) has also noted of factionalism that its levels of political disagreement are lower upon threat from an outside body.

It is important to recognise that we cannot look at the content of Aboriginal productions without analysing the way in which they represent the community and their position within the community. It is the media's ability to define a situation that gives them their power (Shoemaker 1998:224-225). If this is true of mass media productions then it also relates on another level to the productions of The Eastern Door. The ability to define and label people provides a substantial base of power. I argue that The Eastern Door is a powerful source of Mohawk identity; it may also be a crucial mechanism of legitimacy within the community.

---

[46] This is similar to prevalent discourses during the Oka Crisis: see Maclaine /Baxendale 1990 & Ciaccia 2000.

A study of The Eastern Door is also a reflection of state and community relations (and politics). The presentation strategies The Eastern Door employs are indicators of the current political climate, including views about establishing nationhood, the perception of the Mohawks in mainstream society and the processes of governance between the state and minority groups. The implicit presentation of the Mohawks as part of a disaffected minority group that is part of the mainstream may not appear deliberate, but regardless of its motivations, it impinges on the capabilities of the Mohawks to contest state action. This illustrates the realities of symbolic power, and consequently the limits to agency experienced by minority groups. Although the politics of representation appear peripheral to state vs. Aboriginal action, they are actually central.

This may be further understood with a consideration of Antonio Gramsci's (1988: 190-192) discussion of hegemony. He suggested that hegemony was not a received status, but was constantly contested by dominators and the dominated, especially in the cultural domain. In this case, all actors contributed to and could redefine hegemonic processes, so all were endowed with agency. To Gramsci, hegemony was the product of an 'art of domination', as he identified a fluid relationship between those with power and those without. As part of his schema, power could be contested and was never absolute. Abilities to maintain it depended upon the maintenance of certain demands and differentials, and he further argued that the state had to comply on occasion with some of the expectations of its dominated classes (Gramsci 1988:206) to maintain its legitimacy.

The state has made concessions towards the Mohawks, principally because they challenge its legitimacy. One of the ways they do so is by highlighting the circumstances of Aboriginal peoples today, not just by raising consciousness within communities, but also by educating those in the mainstream who are either ignorant of the conditions or believe the simplistic profiles presented by the mainstream media. This demonstrates that the work of newspapers and Aboriginal cultural producers can be very influential sources of power for Aboriginal social movements. The Eastern Door is a primary force towards articulating Mohawk nationhood, a vehicle for the reconstruction of identity, as well as being a source of definition for new relations with the state, not only cultural but also in terms of structural patterns.

The Eastern Door's challenge to depictions of Mohawk behaviour by mass media and government forms a unique attempt to resist or contest certain types of authorities. This process may be understood using Gramsci's (1988:333) view that a critical understanding of self comes about through a struggle of conflicting political hegemonies. There are many factors that influence The Eastern Door: its position within Kahnawake; the politics there, such as factionalism and debates involving authorities; its historical circumstances; the work its editor Kenneth Deer carries out for the Geneva human rights convention; provincial and federal politics; global Indigenous politics and global politics. Gramsci (1988:334) argued that this process ends with the individual arriving at a conception of 'one's own reality'. The Eastern Door's stance on representation may be viewed in this

way and as such its presentations may be understood as its 'philosophy of praxis'[47]

(Gramsci 1988:176). As Taiaiake Alfred (Jan 21st 200:2) states in a guest editorial for

The Eastern Door:

> We must be aggressive in another way, by attacking the oppressor's ideas, beliefs and attitudes and exposing the lies and hypocrisy that pass for law and policy in this country. Canada promises justice but it practices deception and pain. This is a hard lesson learned by Indians very early on in life, yet it is a truth denied by the average white person. White people need to be brought to the truth: that theirs is a country whose foundation and conduct is wrong by any moral standard. The smug satisfaction most Canadians feel toward the rightness of their country is the most real and biggest obstacle we face in our struggle for justice.

The Mohawks' contestations of state activities can have powerful ramifications, for

example, the Oka Crisis had embarrassing international outcomes for the Canadian state.

This is an example of what Gramsci (1988:218) termed a 'crisis of authority', a stage at

which the state's actions appear to be untenable. However, Gramsci also cautioned that

these were "theatrical" manifestations of state crisis that did not really elicit any real

gains for dominated groups (Gramsci 1988:261). This may be substantiated by Claude

Denis' (1997:21) claims that the assertions of nationhood by Aboriginal peoples are

untenable because of their social and economic realities.

Bourdieu similarly argues that the real value of symbolic power lies in its misrecognition

as 'meaning'. Because words take on 'meaning' as part of their inculcation into a social

system they can only be properly exercised by people who have the authority to use them,

as I discussed in Chapter Five. This is relevant to the situations of Aboriginal peoples in

Canada today. But what about groups who introduce new symbolic frames of meaning?

---

[47] 'Philosophy of praxis' may be understood as a terrain on which social groups become conscious of their social being, strength and tasks. Praxis is usually an expression of subordinate groups who want to educate themselves in the 'art of government'.

How is the mainstream basis of symbolic power impacted by the arrival of these frames of meaning, which are derived from a different kind of social system?

Audra Simpson (2000:127) relates the process of conceptualising Mohawk identity to 'cultural praxis'. She has stated that in order to maintain a sense of shared nationhood distinguishable from other peoples, the Mohawks expand on discourse to implement a shared sense of experience, both historical and contemporary. Key tropes arising from this process include 'being Indian' and having 'rights'. This serves the purposes of identity maintenance, and enables Mohawks to think of themselves as "behaving as other nations do". This discursive practice impacts cultural practice thus: "(this is) a process that not only signals to individuals the social ideal, but suffuses everyday life with a sense of nationhood" (Simpson 2000:127). This implementation of shared experience as a process would appear to be similar to Gramsci's conceptualisation of selfhood coming from praxis, and echoes Bourdieu's discussion of political fields and habitus. Simpson's discussion of nationalism confirms that there are considered to be key ways of behaving as a Mohawk, just as The Eastern Door propagates in its discourses of everyday life.

Linda Pertusali (1997:18) believes that Mohawk nationalism provides a 'lens' through which their actions and identity can be understood. She argues that social movements have the power to change language, and to frame and reframe events through discourse, consciousness raising and political symbols (1997:15). They do so by "articulating a language frame with an implicit political agenda and strategy that stressed the maintenance of territorial boundaries and regaining pre-existing civil, social and

economic rights" (Pertusali 1997:122). This movement may be understood as creating a certain type of political field that stimulates a cultural worldview advantageous to understanding Mohawk identity.

Thus the Mohawks are able to negotiate different conceptual levels of nationhood. They preserve their community by embracing their connection to their land and their shared past. Basic principles of tradition and historicity are re-interpreted according to their contemporary significance. Although certain principles may be strategically acknowledged before others, the Mohawk philosophy has an organic quality, which with its links to continuity and to spirituality endows a great power in providing community cohesion, regardless of arguments over its implementation.

Furthermore, as a community, Kahnawake has proved that its members are able to operate in two political semantic fields of meaning, a Mohawk one and a mainstream one. In the Mohawk field, they are able to practice and preserve Mohawk 'culture' and tradition, as well as act as an autonomous community with goals oriented towards furthering their independence. In the mainstream field, they are also able to navigate Indigenous rights rhetoric and play the political game of the nation state. This level of competency gives them a type of bilingual ability, as savvy political negotiators their competency is influential, and they are able to sway symbolic meaning, and perhaps, symbolic power.

It is the link with mainstream society that has produced this type of competency in national and international affairs, which establishes the Mohawks as an unusual Aboriginal community in Canada, preserving integrity of nationhood, while taking advantage of their abilities in mainstream society to set agendas, thereby furthering their goals of political autonomy. As a result of strategic political and militant manoeuvres, as well as those inspired by defence of land, the Mohawks have been able to establish precedents, such as the establishment of their own police force. Although some of these developments have occurred because of tragic causes (such as the death of David Cross, or the loss of land), the community has been able to respond to and institute developments based on its own ideals of future existence.

How are the Mohawks able to set agendas with the government? They do not own the mass media in Canada or institutions of dissemination. They do not possess the land base or resources, economic or social, to make this other than "a poorly matched war of nations" (Denis 1997:21). Their lack of economic resources means that they are still somewhat dependent on the government. Their lack of social resources mean that they have been characterized as deviant members of the mainstream, as the Canadian government seems theoretically unwilling to define them as outside the realm of multi-cultural status.

However, the Mohawks do possess political capital. Their competence in political strategizing provides a powerful base on which to contest and resist governmental actions, as well as define them. Semantic and conceptual posturing becomes central: the

Mohawks operationalise a level of politics that depend on 'position', interpreting events in ways that endow them with political significance. This tactic has been successful, for example, regardless of the Canadian government's attitude towards cigarette smuggling, it still occurs. The government has been unable to stop it, because the basis of the Mohawk claims to do so rests on their assertion of national right. This means that the 'Aboriginal problem' threatens to overwhelm the authority of both provincial and federal governments. It suggests that it might provide a crisis of legitimacy, and that in their attempts to discredit the Mohawks, the governments are well aware of this problem

The Mohawks have been able to change mainstream ways of thinking about sovereignty and nationhood (or at least significantly assail them). They have been able to do this by utilising ideas that come from their own political fields and possession of Mohawk cultural capital, as well as their competence in a mainstream field of national politics, to influence, and define, the mainstream cultural script. The fact that they have unarguably had a defining impact on the state's strategies, particularly by setting agendas, represents a significant accomplishment for Aboriginal peoples. As such they contribute to and join a large number of Aboriginal communities that have already made, and continue to make, important achievements.

The Mohawks have made their struggle international, as a result of which Canada's status is under question – the 'humanitarians' have a problem in their own back yard. The 'Aboriginal question' is the most important issue for the Canadian state to resolve, one in

which its agency in defining becomes increasingly restricted due to the actions of Aboriginal groups.

For all actors then, choices are made based on reasonable actions: this is the exercise of a pragmatism that does not undermine cultural integrity. The Mohawks are realistic; they have a strong sense of identity, and their rights. However, as Ramsbottom (1996:19) states, rights are not guaranteed, they are claimed. So Mohawks are also aware that any gains are made as a result of contesting or establishing agendas and then negotiating those agendas, not as individual actors, but as national actors. This is why they also continue to work with provincial and federal authorities.

What part does 'representation' play? Productions such as The Eastern Door provide powerful and motivational bases of identity, as well as reminding people of their shared connections to their land base and nation. This rests on conceptual positioning; thus The Eastern Door is a source of communication and information, which provides a strong foundation of position for the Mohawk population. This also supplies a base on which to contest governmental authority, to influence and set new ways of thinking.

I hope that this analysis will be a useful contribution to understanding relations and articulations of power, especially between the state and Aboriginal communities in Canada. I believe that I have highlighted some intrinsic and important processes by which groups establish bases of position. Politics of representation do not only engage with an objectification of the past, but the transmission of culture. Media can be used as a tool to

125

challenge authority or to define it, and it is not merely a receptor or transmitter of active

ideas, but also a way of engaging with an active cultural practice.

The Eastern Door establishes difference (to the mainstream) and it recognises similarities.

The members of the Kahnawake community are able to make the choice to communicate

and operate in the two realms of mainstream society and Aboriginal society. The Eastern

Door encourages this practice for its members, to remind them that if they retain this

competence, they embody the ability of Kahnawake to maintain its control over, and

connection to, land, and thus, to the Mohawk nation:

> They thought it would never happen. The colonizers that is. They thought that we would fade away,
> assimilate or just die out before the end of the last century. But we fooled them. We're still here, as
> feisty as ever ...
> (E.D. Jan 6th 2001:2)

Primary Sources: The Eastern Door

August 11th 1995	Vol. 4 No. 27
August 18th 1995	Vol. 4 No. 28
September 1st 1995	Vol. 4 No. 30
October 27th 1995	Vol. 4 No. 38
April 19th 1996	Vol. 5 No. 12
June 14th 1996	Vol. 5 No. 20
July 12th 1996	Vol. 5 No. 24
August 16th 1996	Vol. 5 No. 28
October 4th 1996	Vol. 5 No. 35
April 18th 1997	Vol. 6 No. 12
April 25th 1997	Vol. 6 No. 13
June 25th 1997	Vol. 6 No. 22
August 8th 1997	Vol. 6 No. 27
November 7th 1997	Vol. 6 No. 40
December 19th 1997	Vol. 6 No. 46
January 30th 1998	Vol. 7 No. 1
March 27th 1998	Vol. 7 No. 9
April 3rd 1998	Vol. 7 No. 10
April 10th 1998	Vol. 7 No. 11
May15th 1998	Vol. 7 No. 16
June 26th 1998	Vol. 7 No. 22
December 11th 1998	Vol. 7 No. 45
May 14th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 16
June 11th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 20
July 9th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 24
July16th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 25
July 23rd 1999	Vol. 8 No. 26
August 28th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 31
September 4th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 32
September 11th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 33
September 17th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 34
October 2nd 1999	Vol. 8 No. 36
October 9th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 37
October 29th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 39
November 5th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 40
November 12th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 41
November 26th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 43
December 10th 1999	Vol. 8 No. 45
January 21st 2000	Vol. 8 No. 50

July 7th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 24
July 14th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 25
July 21st 2000	Vol. 9	No. 26
August 4th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 27
August 11th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 28
August 18th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 29
September 1st 2000	Vol. 9	No. 31
September 8th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 32
September 15th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 33
October 13th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 37
October 20th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 38
October 27th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 39
November 3rd 2000	Vol. 9	No. 40
November 17th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 42
November 24th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 43
December 1st 2000	Vol. 9	No. 44
December 15th 2000	Vol. 9	No. 46
January 5th 2001	Vol. 9	No. 48
January 12th 2001	Vol. 9	No. 49
January 19th 2001	Vol. 9	No. 50
February 16th 2001	Vol.10	No. 4
February 23rd 2001	Vol. 10	No. 5
March 2nd 2001	Vol. 10	No. 6
March 9th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 7
March 16th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 8
March 23rd 2001	Vol. 10	No. 9
April 13th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 12
April 20th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 13
May 4th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 15
May11th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 16
May 18th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 17
May 25th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 18
June 1st 2001	Vol. 10	No. 19
July 13th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 25
July 20th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 26
August 3rd 2001	Vol. 10	No. 27
August 10th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 28
August 17th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 29
August 24th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 30
August 31st 2001	Vol. 10	No. 31
September 7th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 32
September 14th 2001	Vol. 10	No. 33
September 21st 2001	Vol. 10	No. 34

September 28th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 35
October 5th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 36
October 12th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 37
October 19th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 38
October 26th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 39
November 2nd 2001   Vol. 10 No. 40
November 9th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 41
November 16th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 42
November 23rd 2001   Vol. 10 No. 43
November 30th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 44
December 7th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 45
December 14th 2001   Vol. 10 No. 46
December 21st 2001   Vol. 10 No. 47
January 4th 2002   Vol. 10 No. 48
January 11th 2002   Vol. 10 No. 49

February 1st 2002   Vol. 11 No. 2
February 8th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 3
February 15th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 4
February 22nd 2002   Vol. 11 No. 5
March 1st 2002   Vol. 11 No. 6
March 8th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 7
March 15th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 8
March 22nd 2002   Vol. 11 No. 9
March 29th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 10
April 5th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 11
April 12th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 12
April 19th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 13
April 26th 2002   Vol. 11 No. 14
May 3rd 2002   Vol. 11 No. 15

References

Acoose, J
    1993   'Post Half-breed: Indigenous Writers as Authors of Their Own Realities'
            in J. Armstrong (ed.), <u>Looking at the Words of our People: First Nations
            Analysis of Literature</u>, Penticton, British Columbia: Theytus Books, Pp:
            27-44.

Alfred, G
    1991   'From Bad to Worse: Internal Politics in the 1990 Crisis at Kahnawake',
            <u>Northeast Indian Quarterly</u>, Spring: 23-31

Alfred, T
    1988   <u>Heeding the Voice of Our Ancestors: Kahnawake Mohawk Politics and
            The Rise of Native Nationalism</u>, Don Mills, Ontario: Oxford University
            Press.

Ames, M
    1992   <u>Cannibal Tours and Glass Boxes: The Anthropology of Museums</u>,
            Vancouver. UBC Press.

Atleo, E.R,
    1991   Policy Development for Museums: A First Nations Perspective' in D.
            Jensen & C. Brooks (eds.), <u>In Celebration of Our Survival</u>, Vancouver:
            UBC Press, Pp: 104-124.

Battiste, M
    2000   'Introduction: Unfolding the Lessons of Colonization' in M. Battiste (ed.),
            <u>Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision</u>, Vancouver: UBC Press,
            Pp: xvi-xxx.

Bay, C
    1981   <u>Strategies of Political Emancipation</u>, Notre Dame: University of Notre
            Dame Press.

Blaser, K
    1993   'Native Literature: Seeking a Critical Center' in J. Armstrong (ed.),
            <u>Looking At the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature</u>,
            British Columbia: Theytus Books Ltd, Pp: 51-62.

Bobet, E
    1990   <u>Indian Self-Government and Community Control in Canada: A Case
            Study of Kahnawake</u>, PhD Thesis, Ottawa: National Library of Canada.

Bourdieu, P
    1977   <u>Outline of a Theory of Practice</u>, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, P
    1991   <u>Language and Symbolic Power</u>, J. Thompson (ed.), Cambridge, UK:
            Polity Press.

Brant Castellano, M
    2000   'Education and Renewal in Aboriginal Nations: Highlights of the Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples' in J. Steckley (ed.) <u>Full Circle: Canada's First Nations</u>, Toronto: Prentice Hall, Pp: 261-281.

Brown, J
    1999   'Of Cupboards and Shelves: Imperialism, Objectification, and the Fixing of Parameters on Native North Americans in Popular Culture' in J. Brown & P. Sant (eds.), <u>Indigeneity: Construction and Representation</u>, Commack, New York: Nova Science Publishers, Pp: 35-58.

Burroughs, W J & Spickard, P
    2000   'Ethnicity, Multiplicity and Narratives: Problems and Possibilities' in W. J. Burroughs & P. Spickard (ed.), <u>We Are a People: Narrative and Multiplicity in Constructing Ethnic Identity</u>, Philadelphia: Temple University Press, Pp: 244-254.

Calliou, S
    1995   'Peacekeeping Actions at Home: A Medicine Wheel for a Peacekeeping Pedagogy' in M. Battiste & J. Barman (eds.), <u>First Nations Education in Canada: the Circle Unfolds</u>, Vancouver: UBC Press, Pp: 47-72.

Cardinal, H
    1991   'Hat in Hand: The Long Fight to Organise' in J. R. Miller (ed.), <u>Sweet Promises: A Reader on Indian-White Relations in Canada</u>, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, Pp: 393-404.

Ciaccia, J
    1999   <u>The Oka Crisis: A Mirror of the Soul</u>, Dorval, Quebec: Maren Publications.

Cohen, A.P.
    1993   'Culture As Identity', <u>New Literary History</u>, Vol. 24 (1): 195-210.

Cornell, S
    2000   'Discovered Identities and American Indian Supra-Tribalism' in W.J. Burroughs & P. Spickard (eds.), <u>We Are A People: Narrative and Multiplicity in Constructing Ethnic Identity</u>, Philadelphia: Temple University Press, Pp: 98-119.

Cornell, S
    2000b   'That's the Story of Our Life' in W. J. Burroughs & P. Spickard (eds.), <u>We Are A People: Narrative and Multiplicity in Constructing Ethnic Identity</u>, Philadelphia: Temple University Press, Pp: 41-53.

Cowlishaw, G
    1988   <u>Black, White or Brindle: Race in Rural Australia</u>, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Damm, K
    1993   'Says Who: Colonialism, Identity and Defining Indigenous Literature' in J. Armstrong (ed.), <u>Looking At the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature</u>, British Columbia: Theytus Books Ltd, Pp: 9-26.

Denis, C

1997 We Are Not You: First Nations and Canadian Modernity, Ontario: Broadview Press.

Diaz-Polanco, H
 1990 'Indian Communities and the Quincentenary', Latin American Perspectives, 19 (3): 6-24.

Donzelot, J
 1979 The Policing of Families, New York: Pantheon.

Dumont, M
 1993 'Popular Images of Nativeness' in J. Armstrong (ed.), Looking At the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature, British Columbia: Theytus Books Ltd, Pp: 45-50.

Dusenbery, V
 1997 'Poetics and Politics of Recognition: Diasporan Sikhs in Pluralist Polities', American Ethnologist, 24 (4): 738-762.

Ericson, R
 1991 Representing Order: Crime, Law and Justice in the News Media, Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Ferguson, J
 1992 The Anti-politics Machine: "Development", Depoliticization and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Fine-Dare, K
 1997 'Disciplinary Renewal Out of National Disgrace: NAGPRA Compliance In the Academy', Radical History Review, No.68, Spring: 25-53.

Ford, D
 1996 Sustaining Colonialism: Canadian Print Media and the Representation of the Mohawk Nation, PhD Thesis, Carleton University.

Foucault, M
 1975 Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison, New York: Vintage Books.

Franklin, B & Murphy, D, (eds.)
 1990 Making the Local News: Local Journalism in Context, London & New York: Cambridge University Press.

Ginsburg, F
 1995 'Mediating Culture: Indigenous Media, Ethnographic Film, and the Production of Identity' in L. Devereaux & R. Hillman (eds.), Fields of Vision: Essays in Film Studies, Visual Anthropology and Photography, Berkeley: University of California Press, Pp: 256-291.

Ginsburg, F
 2000 'Resources of Hope: Learning From the Local in a Transnational Era' in C. Smith & G. Ward (eds.), Indigenous Cultures in an Interconnected World, Vancouver: UBC Press, Pp: 27-47.

Gledhill, J
 1996 Power and its Disguises: Anthropological Perspectives on Politics, London: Pluto Press.

Goodleaf, D

1995   Entering The War Zone: A Mohawk Perspective on Resisting Invasion, Penticton, B.C: Theytus Books Ltd.

Gramsci, A
1988   A Gramsci Reader: Selected Writings 1916-1937, D. Forgacs (ed.), London: Lawrence and Wishart.

Green, R
1984   That's What She Said: Contemporary Poetry and Fiction by Native American Women, Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Hall, S
1991   'Cultural Studies and Its Theoretical Legacies' in L. Grossberg, C. Nelson & P. Treichler (eds.), Cultural Studies, New York: Routledge, Pp: 277-294

Hall, T
1988   'Civilizational Incorporation in Indigenes: Towards a Comparative Perspective', Comparative Civilizations Review, 39 (Fall): 10-37.

Hauptman, L
1984   The Iroquois Struggle For Survival: World War II to Red Power, Syracuse, N.Y: Syracuse University Press.

Henderson, J. Y
2000   'Postcolonial Ghost Dancing: Diagnosing European Colonialism' in M. Battiste (ed.), Reclaiming Indigenous Voice and Vision, Vancouver: UBC Press, Pp: 57-76.

Hobsbawm, E
1996   'Identity Politics and the Left', New Left Review, Vol. 217: 38-47.

hooks, b
1989   Yearning: Race, Gender and Cultural Politics, Boston, MA: South End Press.

hooks, b
1992   Black Looks: Race and Representation, Toronto: Between the Lines.

Jackson Rushing III, W
1997   'Introduction, Part II' in W. Jackson Rushing III (ed.), Native American Art in the Twentieth Century: Makers, Meanings, Histories, London & New York: Routledge Press, Pp: 75-76.

Lattas, A
1992   'Wiping the Blood off Aboriginality: The Politics of Aboriginal Embodiment in Contemporary Intellectual Debate', Oceania, 63 (2): 160-164.

Leonardy, M
1998   First Nations Criminal Jurisdiction in Canada: The Aboriginal Right to Peacemaking Under Public International and Canadian Constitutional Law, Houghton: Boston.

Loring, S & Ashimi, D
2000   'Past and Future Pathways' in C. Smith & G. Ward (eds.), Indigenous Cultures in an Interconnected World, Vancouver: UBC Press, Pp: 167-189.

Lutz, C

1990   'Engendered Emotion: Gender, Power, and the Rhetoric of Emotional Control in American Discourse' in C. Lutz & L. Abu-Lughod (eds.), Language and the Politics of Emotion, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, Pp: 69-91.

Maclaine, C & Baxendale, M
1990   This Land is Our Land: The Mohawk Revolt at Oka, Montreal, Quebec: Optimum.

Mahon, M
2000   'The Visible Evidence of Cultural Producers', Annual Review of Anthropology, 29: 467-92.

Maracle, L
1988   I Am Woman: A Native Perspective on Sociology and Feminism, British Columbia: Theytus Books.

Miller, J.R
1991   'Aboriginal Rights, Land Claims, and the Struggle to Survive' in J. Miller (ed.), Sweet Promises: A Reader on Indian-White Relations in Canada, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, Pp: 405-420.

Pertusati, L
1997   In Defense of Mohawk Land: Ethnopolitical Conflict in Native North America, Albany: State University of New York Press.

Phillips, S
2000   The Kahnawake Mohawks and the St. Lawrence Seaway, MA Thesis, Montreal: Department of Anthropology, McGill University.

Ponting, R
1990   'Internationalization: Perspectives on an Emerging Direction in Aboriginal Affairs', Canadian Ethnic Studies, Vol. 22 (3): 85-109.

Ponting, R
1997   'Historical Overview and Background: Part II 1970-96' in J. R. Ponting (ed.), First Nations in Canada: Perspectives and Opportunity, Empowerment and Self-Determination, Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, Pp: 35-67.

Ponting, R & Kiely, J
1997   Disempowerment: "Justice", Racism, and Public Opinion' in J. R. Ponting (ed.), First Nations in Canada: Perspectives and Opportunity, Empowerment and Self-Determination, Toronto: McGraw- Hill Ryerson, Pp: 152-192.

Purich, D
1991   'The Future of Native Rights' in J. Miller, Sweet Promises: A Reader on Native-White Relations in Canada, Toronto: University of Toronto Press, Pp: 421-437.

Ramsbottom, O
1996   Humanitarian Intervention in Contemporary Politics, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Richards, D
1994   Masks of Difference: Cultural Representations in Literature, Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press.

Ricoeur, P
  1965 History and Truth, USA: Northwestern Press.

Rosaldo, M
  1984 'Toward an Anthropology of Self and Feeling' in R. Shweder & R. LeVine (eds.), Culture Theory: Essays on Mind, Self, and Emotion, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Pp: 137-157.

Rosaldo, R
  1977 'The Rhetoric of Control: Ilongots Viewed as Natural Bandits and Wild Indians' in B. Babcock (ed.), The Reversible World: Symbolic Inversion in Art and Society, Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, Pp: 240-257

Ross, L
  1998 Inventing the Savage: The Social Construction of Native American Criminality, Austin: University of Texas Press.

Rouse, R
  1995 'Questions of Identity: Personhood and Collectivity in Transnational Migration to the United States', Critique of Anthropology, 15 (4): 351-380.

Ruby, J
  2000 Picturing Culture: Explorations of Film & Anthropology, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Sacco, V
  1992 Deviance: Conformity and Control in Canadian Society, Scarborough, Ontario: Prentice-Hall.

Salisbury, R & Silverman, F
  1977 A House Divided?: Anthropological Studies of Factionalism, Institute of Social and Economic Research, Memorial University of Newfoundland, No.9

Shoemaker, P & Reese, S
  1996 Mediating the Message: Theories of Influence on Mass Media Content, USA: Longman Publishers Ltd.

Simpson, A
  2000 'Paths Toward A Mohawk Nation: Narratives of Citizenship and Nationhood in Kahnawake' in D. Ivison, P. Patton & W. Saunders (eds.), Political Theory and the Rights Of Indigenous Peoples, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Pp: 113-136.

Simpson, M
  1996 Making Representations: Museums in the Post-Colonial Era, London: Routledge.

Sossoyan, M
  1999 The Kahnawake Iroquois and the Lower Canadian Rebellions, 1837-1838, Master's Thesis, Montreal: Department of Anthropology, McGill University.

Smith, C, Burke, H & Ward, G
  2000 'Globalization and Indigenous Peoples: Threat or Empowerment?' in C. Smith & G. Ward (ed.), Indigenous Cultures in an Interconnected World, Vancouver: UBC Press, Pp: 1-26.

Smith, P

1997 'Civil Society and Violence: Narrative Forms and the Regulation of Social Conflict' in J. Turpin & L. Kurtz (eds.), The Web of Violence: From Interpersonal to Global, Urbana: University of Illinois Press, Pp: 91-116.

Steckley, J
2001 Full Circle: Canada's First Nations, Toronto: Prentice Hall.

Taylor, D
1997 The Quest For Identity: The Plight of Aboriginal People, Ethnic Minorities, and Generation X, Montreal, Quebec: P.S. Presse.

Trigger, B
1985 Native and Newcomers: Canada's 'Heroic' Age Reconsidered, Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Wagamese, R
1997 The Terrible Summer, Toronto: Warwick Publishing.

Wearne, P
1996 Return of the Indian: Conquest and Revival in the Americas, Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Webster, S
1995 'Escaping Post-Cultural Tribes', Critique of Anthropology, Vol. 15 (4): 381-414.

White, G
1992 'Moral Discourse and the Rhetoric of Emotions' in C. Lutz & L. Abu-Lughod (eds.), Language and the Politics of Emotion, Cambridge & New York: Cambridge University Press, Pp: 46-68.

Young-Ing, G
1993 'Aboriginal Peoples' Estrangement: Marginalization in the Publishing Industry' in J. Armstrong (ed.), Looking At the Words of Our People: First Nations Analysis of Literature, British Columbia: Theytus Books Ltd, Pp: 177-188.

Appendix

This project was conducted as part or in the context of Professor Carmen Lambert's research project, which received approval from the Ethics Committee.

McGill

Research Ethics Board Office
McGill University

Research Ethics Board I
Certificate of Ethical Acceptability of Research Involving Humans

Project Title: A Community for the Future

Applicant's Name: Dr. Carmen Lambert   Department: Anthropology

Undergraduate Student ( )   Master's Student ( )   Ph.D. student ( )

Supervisor's Name: N/A

This project was approved on _June 13, 2001_

Expedited Review __✓__   Full Review_____

Departmental Level Review : For research projects that are carried out by undergraduate or graduate students as part of their course work – course number:

_____
(Signature of departmental designate/   date)

_____13 June 2001_____
Signature/Date

George W. Wenzel, Ph.D.
Chair, REB I

This approval is valid for a period of one year.