



National Library  
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale  
du Canada

Canadian Theses Service

Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada  
K1A 0N4

## NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

## AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

Images and Reality of Fatherhood  
A Case Study of Montreal's Protestant Middle Class,  
1870-1914.

A Thesis submitted  
to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Department of History  
McGill University, Montreal

by  
Cynthia S. Fish  
June 1991

(c) Cynthia Fish, June 1991



National Library  
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale  
du Canada

Canadian Theses Service    Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada  
K1A 0N4

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-72159-6

Canada

## Contents

Abstract-Résumé	iii
Acknowledgements	v
Introduction	1
I- City Between the Hills	21
II- "Wise" Authority: Images of Manliness and Fatherhood in Reform Literature	61
III- Authority vs. Nurture: The Judicial Interpretation of Paternal Authority	119
IV- "Putting His Oar In": Fathers in Children's Literature	162
V- The Anatomy of Tyranny: The Image of the Father in Adult Literature	210
VI- The Sum of Its Parts, Fatherhood in Montreal, 1870-1914	253
Conclusion	317
Appendices	
A Advice Literature for Young Women	328
B Fathers in The Bible	334
C Custody Decisions, Quebec Courts, 1866-1929	341
D Selection of Literature	343
E List of Titles: Children's Books	350
F List of Titles: Adult Books	353
Bibliography	
Primary	356
Secondary	375

## Abstract

This dissertation examines the images and reality of fatherhood, between 1870 and 1914, using a case study of Montreal's middle class, and specifically the English speaking, Protestant community. An examination of reform literature, custody decisions, and fiction suggest that providing for his family's material needs was a father's first duty. Fatherhood was also invested with authority and power. Yet, the sentimental family ideal entrusted the mother with the emotional elements of child-rearing. Many fathers appear to have created nurturing relationships with their children, despite the emotionally restrictive social images, and society's emphasis on the importance of motherhood.

## Résumé

Cette thèse examine les images et la réalité des pères, entre 1870 et 1914, par la voie d'une analyse de la communauté bourgeoise, anglophone et protestante de la ville de Montréal. L'étude des images du père trouvées dans les textes du mouvement réformiste, les jugements sur la garde des enfants et la littérature victorienne démontre, qu'avant tout, le père était responsable de l'entretien de sa famille. L'image du père était, en plus, investie d'une grande autorité. D'autre part, la mère était considérée comme la plus capable d'élever les enfants. Cependant, l'étude montre que malgré les modèles contradictoires, les pères de Montréal eux-mêmes ont créé des bonnes relations avec leurs enfants.

## Acknowledgements

Several years ago, when I was still in first bloom of comprehensive exam success, I remarked to a friend that writing was easy. I was wrong. Writing was hard, and without the support of several institutions and many people, this study would never have been completed. My first thanks must go to the History Department of McGill University who gave me several years of teaching assistantships, which financed the first part of this study. Bishop's University allowed me to teach a course on family and gender in Canadian history, which gave me opportunity to expand and reflect on the subject. I would like to thank the students of History 207 for their attention and enthusiasm.

Pamela Miller at the McCord Museum, Richard Virr at the Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, and Robert Michel

at the McGill University Archives were helpful and generous with their time, and thoughtful in their comments.

Louise Dechêne and Carman Miller gave each draft careful attention. Any remaining confusion or errors must be attributed to my own short-sightedness. Their encouragement and support was invaluable.

The energy and support from family, and friends deserves my special thanks. Manon Lamontagne and Scott Proudfoot offered streams of advice, some of which I took. Colin Irving read endless drafts and never failed to point out the difference between what I wanted to say and what was down on paper. No one is more encouraging than those who still have the memory of "last draft" desperation fresh in their mind: for their encouragement and help, I thank Micheal Childs, Tom Wein, and especially Louis-George Harvey.

Julia Morch watched over my words one wet winter. Kate and Mark Schultz generously suffered the computer at the dinner table, and Richard Schultz never allowed me to give up.

My brother tried to teach me about simple sentences.

This study is dedicated to my mother, who had the idea in the first place, and to my father, who was the original inspiration.

## Introduction

The late nineteenth and early twentieth century Canadian father was caught between a rock and a hard place. His traditional role as manager of the family economy, policeman of its morals and the figure recognized by society as the pivot between the public and the private realms had been usurped by the teachers and the community workers, and undermined by his wife. The reform impulse which dominated much of the period challenged the father's position as sole Head of the Household. His role as family provider increasingly alienated him from his family, and owing to the rapid urban growth lengthening the physical and emotional distance between him and his family: his home and work place were becoming separate spheres. His morally superior spouse, protected in the purified 'streetcar suburbs' was perceived as the more appropriate parent for the innocent and

vulnerable children. There is little if any systematic research into either the roles society proposed for these men within their home, or their experiences of the reality of parenthood. This study attempts to address these omissions, using a case study of Montreal English-speaking middle class fathers, in the hope that our understanding of the Canadian family from 1870 to 1914 will be, by the addition of this heretofore silent member, more complete.

The space, group, and temporal limits of this study require definition. Rather than examine 'English-Canada', this analysis has confined itself to a geographic 'island', the city of Montreal, and specifically, to the English community. Montreal was chosen as the setting because of its cultural, intellectual and economic importance in Canada between 1870 and 1914.<sup>1</sup> English Montrealers saw themselves as cosmopolitan, and at the confluence of transatlantic culture. Theirs was a self-conscious city at the national cultural forefront.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>- R. Rumilly, Histoire de Montréal, vol. 4 (Montréal, 1972); P.-A. Linteau, R. Durocher, and J.-C. Robert, Quebec: A History, 1867-1929, trans. by R. Chandos, (Toronto, 1983); K. Jenkins, Montreal, Island City of the St. Lawrence (New York, 1966); J. Cooper, Montreal, The Story of Three Hundred Years (Montreal, 1942).

<sup>2</sup>- M. Westley, Remembrances of Grandeur: Montreal's Anglo Protestant Elite, 1900-1950 (Montreal, 1990); D. MacKay, The Square Mile: Merchant Princes of Montreal (Vancouver, 1987).

The middle class was chosen as the object of this study because of its efforts to assume a position of social leadership. Such efforts led it to participate in a self-conscious and literate articulation of its values. For the purposes of this study, the middle class is defined as broadly as possible, by shared cultural experiences and values, including the importance of education, and the weight of respectability.<sup>3</sup> The members of this group sent their children to schools, public or private, and encouraged them, whenever possible to further their education at the university level. They lived in quiet neighbourhoods, in well regulated municipalities.<sup>4</sup>

Two considerations dictated such a broad definition. The first was the perception of fatherhood as a cultural experience, defined and patterned by values. Economic considerations played an important part in determining the

---

<sup>3</sup>- In this regard, our definition coincides with first level of definition used by P. Ward in Courtship, Love and Marriage in Nineteenth Century English Canada (Montreal, 1990) and E. Rotundo, Manhood in America: The Northern Middle Class, 1770-1920, unpublished PhD. Brandeis, (1982). See also F.L.M. Thompson, The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain, 1830-1900 (London, 1989); M. Ryan, Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County, New York, 1790-1865 (Cambridge, New York, 1981); J. Luckas, "The Bourgeois Interior", American Scholar, 39 (1970), pp. 616-630; and R. Wiebe, The Search for Order, 1877-1920 (New York, 1967).

<sup>4</sup>- Such a broad definition is not intended to suggest that there did not exist a stratification within the middle class. However, as this study does not deal with social relations, but rather with socially created value systems, distinctions based on occupations, rents or income might obscure more than they clarify for this topic.

parameters available for the individual father, but these parameters were also a cultural construction. In this sense then, the working class could be expected to have different models of fatherhood than those created for men with more leisure. The second consideration dictating this broad definition was the desire to encompass the totality of the middle class experience, which may have included the ambition to join (or at least imitate) the elite of the community, the banking, railway and shipping magnates of the city's obvious and dominant Square Mile.

The period 1870 and 1914 is generally recognized as framing a period of important and rapid socio-economic change.<sup>5</sup> Family historians recognize this period as one of change: new perceptions of childhood and the intrusion of the State into private affairs signal so many points of transition in the emergence of the modern family.<sup>6</sup> Gender historians view this period as one of consolidation, in which the impact of early urbanization and industrialization

---

<sup>5</sup>- Particularly in the cities. See M. Girouard, Cities and People: A Social and Architectural History (New Haven, 1985); S. B. Warner, Streetcar Suburbs: The Process of Growth in Boston, 1870-1900, 2nd. ed., (Cambridge, Mass., 1978); G. Wright, Moralism and the Model Home: Domestic Architecture and Cultural Conflict in Chicago, 1873-1913 (Chicago, 1980); and Linteau, et al., op.cit.. See also S. Hynes, A War Imagined: The First World War and English Culture (London, 1990); and P. Fussell, The Great War and Modern Memory (New York, 1975) who examine the Great War as a moment of cultural cleavage.

<sup>6</sup>- N. Sutherland, Children in English Canadian Society: Framing the Twentieth Century Consensus (Toronto, 1976).

had already caused the significant reorganization of gender identification and relations.<sup>7</sup>

Traditionally the family had been a unit of economic production and social reproduction. The father's role was paramount, as manager of the family economy, and as its moral steward.<sup>8</sup> The emergence of a distinct middle class and middle class mentality around the end of the eighteenth century and early decades of the nineteenth century created important changes in household structure, power relations within the home, relations between the home and the work-

---

<sup>7</sup>- According to P. Stearns, Be a Man! Males in Modern Society (New York, 1979), the First World War was a significant moment in the evolution of manliness in the United States. Considering the Canadian contribution to that war, it is not unlikely that a similar disjunction occurred in the Canadian ideal as well. The feminine ideal, which persisted until even in the 1950's, is generally acknowledged to have been formed and fixed sometime between 1800 and 1860. See Ryan, op.cit.; B. Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood, 1820-1860", American Quarterly, 18 (1966), pp. 151-174; and C. Smith-Rosenberg, Disorderly Conduct: Visions of Gender in Victorian America (New York, 1985).

<sup>8</sup>- See S. Mintz and S. Kellogg, Domestic Revolutions: A Social History of American Family Life (New York, London, 1988); Ryan, op.cit.; L. Stone, The Family, Sex and Marriage in England, 1500-1800 (New York, 1977); L. Davidoff and C. Hall, Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class, 1780-1850 (London, 1984); P. Laslett, The World We Have Lost, 2nd. ed., (New York, 1973); R. Chartier, éd., Histoire de la vie privée: De la Renaissance aux Lumières, sous la direction de P. Ariès et G. Duby, vol. III, (Paris, 1986); S. Ozment, When Fathers Ruled: Family Life in Reformation Europe (Cambridge, Mass., 1983).

place, as well as perceptions of gender and childhood.<sup>9</sup> Throughout the nineteenth century the private world, the home and intimate relations became more isolated from the public world, as well as a focus of public concern.<sup>10</sup>

Arguably, the key to these shifts was the changing perceptions of childhood.<sup>11</sup> As society came to see childhood as a state of innocence, rather than one of innate evil, the middle class family's emotional epicenter shifted towards and around the nursery, and the glorification of the

---

<sup>9</sup>- J.-L. Flandrin, Familles, parenté, maison, sexualité dans l'ancienne société (Paris, 1976); Laslett, op.cit.; J. Luckas, "The Bourgeois Interior"; P. Ariès, L'Enfant et la vie familiale sous l'Ancien Régime <1959>, Nouvelle édition, (Paris, 1973); L. Pollock, Forgotten Children: Parent-child Relations, 1500-1900 (Cambridge, New York, 1983); B. Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood"; A. Douglas, The Feminization of American Culture (New York, 1988).

<sup>10</sup>- Thompson, op.cit.; Wiebe, op.cit.; E. Shorter, The Making of The Modern Family (New York, 1975); Wright, op.cit.; Sutherland, op.cit.; J. Snell, "'The White Life for Two': The Defense of Marriage and Sexual Morality in Canada, 1890-1914," Histoire sociale/Social History, XVI, 31 (mai/May, 1983), pp. 111-128.

<sup>11</sup>- Ariès, op.cit.; Sutherland, op.cit.; Pollack, op.cit.; M. Perrot, éd., Histoire de la vie privée: De la Révolution à la Grande Guerre, sous la direction de P. Ariès et G. Duby, vol. IV, (Paris, 1987); V.A.R. Zeliner, Pricing the Priceless Child: The Changing Social Value of Children (New York, 1985); B. Wishy, The Child and The Republic: The Dawn of American Child Nurture (Philadelphia, 1968); J. Demos, A Little Commonwealth: Family Life in Plymouth Colony (New York, 1970); E. Erickson, Childhood and Society (New York, 1963); N. Semple, "'The Nurture and Admonition of the Lord': Nineteenth Century Canadian Methodism's Response to Childhood," Histoire sociale/Social History, XIV, 27 (mai/May, 1981), pp. 460-475.

maternal, and the domestic.<sup>12</sup> Impelled by the search for social order and in the name of the best interests of the child, the State became an important actor in private relations, particularly child protection, and increasingly usurped the traditionally absolute authority of the father, in terms of schooling, work, court intervention, and delinquency.<sup>13</sup>

Within this "Nursery" oriented family, and child centered society, fathers and fatherhood are relatively unknown quantities. Historians have focussed their attention on the mother and child, these new and increasingly powerful private actors, their public spokespeople, and the ideals which motivated the changes, thereby passing over with only a brief nod of acknowledgement, the problems and issues revolving around the paternal figure. According to this

---

<sup>12</sup>- Many historians have argued that one of the signs of the "Modern" family was the intensification of intimate and personal relations, such as between married people, (the companionate ideal) and mother and child. See Shorter, op.cit.; and L. de Mause ed., The History of Childhood (New York, 1976).

<sup>13</sup>- C. Bacchi, "Race Regeneration and Social Purity. A Study of the Social Attitudes of Canada's English-Speaking Suffragists", Histoire sociale/Social History, XI, 22 (novembre/November, 1978), pp. 460-474; N. Sutherland, "'To Create a Strong and Healthy Race ': School Children in the Public Health Movement, 1880-1914", History of Education Quarterly, 12, 3 (1972), pp. 304-333; J. Bullen, Child Labour in Early Industrial Canada: Working Conditions and Family Responsibilities, unpublished Ph.D., Ottawa University, (1990); A. Jones and L. Rutman, In The Children's Aid: J.J. Kelso and Child Welfare in Ontario (Toronto, 1981); M. Grossberg, Governing the Hearth: Law and the Family in Nineteenth-Century America (Chapel Hill, 1985).

'nursery' centered vision of family life, fathers were either distant, or authoritarian. Between these extremes, the late Victorian and early Edwardian father is a figure shrouded in silence.

Studies pertaining to the private lives of men, ideals of masculinity, and fatherhood suggest that the late nineteenth century was an important period of transition in the middle class manly ideal.<sup>14</sup> The process of professionalization created university structured apprenticeships, and challenged the father's role as

---

<sup>14</sup>- Since the publication of Peter Filene's Him/Her/Self: Sex Roles in Modern America in 1975, studies in history, literary criticism, and sociology about men as private figures have become more available. Some recent historical studies include Norman Vance's study of Christian Manliness, Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought (Cambridge, New York, 1985); an analysis of the masculine ideologies taught in the British Public School by J. Chandos, Boys Together: English Public Schools, 1800-1864 (London, 1984); and P. Dunae's study of the ideal of imperialism in juvenile literature, "Boy's Literature and The Idea of Empire, 1870-1914", Victorian Studies, 24, 1, (1980), pp. 105-121. See also J. Mangan and J. Walvin, eds., Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America, 1800-1914 (Manchester, 1987); P. Filene, "Between a Rock and a Soft Place", South Atlantic Quarterly, 84 (Autumn, 1985), pp. 336-355; Rotundo, op.cit.; J. Dubbert, A Man's Place: Masculinity in Transition (New Jersey, 1979). Histoire des pères et de la paternité, edited by Jean Delumeau and Daniel Roche (Paris, 1991), was released too late to be consulted for this thesis.

counsellor and 'master' to his sons.<sup>15</sup> Urbanization, which created distinct geographic areas for work and home, altered the family's participation in the family economy, creating islands of separate existence for men and women during the day time.<sup>16</sup> These structural changes created a living trench between the father and his family.

Further, the historiographical overview suggests three important avenues of investigation: the variations of manliness, the importance of play, and finally the significance of religion in defining the father's role. The authors included in Mangan and Walvin's collection of articles edited under the title Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America 1800-1940 (1987), examine component parts of the ideology of masculinity: for example, Boy Scouts, the ideals of physical fitness and the imperial ideology. One of the general conclusions of the Mangan and Walvin collection is that

---

<sup>15</sup>- See J. Bernier, La Médecine au Québec. Naissance d'une profession (Québec, 1989); R. Millard, The Master Spirit of the Age: Canadian Engineers and the Politics of Professionalism (Toronto, 1988); H. Perkin, The Rise of the Professional Society in England Since 1888 (London, New York, 1989).

<sup>16</sup>- Wright, op.cit.; D. Handlin, The American Home: Architecture and Society, 1815-1915 (Boston, 1979); D. Hanna and S. Olson, "'Métiers, loyers et bouts de rue': l'armature de la société montréalaise, 1881 à 1901", Cahiers de géographie du Québec, 27, 71 (1983), pp. 225-276; J.-P. Collin, "La Cité sur mesure: Spécialisation sociale de l'espace et autonomie municipale dans la banlieue montréalaise, 1875-1920", Urban History Review/ Revue Histoire Urbaine, XIII, 1 (June/juin 1984), pp. 19-34.

society defined and controlled masculine behavior as thoroughly as it controlled feminine behavior. The more important conclusion would be that there were multiple varieties of masculinity, depending on class, time and place. Furthermore, while the boundaries of masculinity were in a sense broader than for femininity, men were as socialized into their role as women.<sup>17</sup> As Peter Filene has argued there is nothing haphazard about how societies construct gender.<sup>18</sup> Moreover, there were multiple varieties of masculinity, depending on class, and time and space. Assuming that society defined fatherhood in a similar manner as motherhood, as an element of gender, then it will be important to suggest some important elements of masculinity as it was developed in Canada, and particularly in Montreal, throughout these years.

---

<sup>17</sup>- American studies of manliness have generally focussed on the socially promoted images and ideals. The essential feature of late nineteenth century American manhood was its public visage. (Implied, but not coherently stated in these studies is the assumption that men defined themselves as social beings exclusively outside the walls of their homes, as the ideals told them to.) These historians have characterized the manly ideal promoted in the last half of the nineteenth century and the first two decades of the twentieth century as 'the bull moose mentality', the promotion of 'the strenuous life', or 'the masculine primitive'. All these titles suggest the importance late nineteenth century American society placed on the male physique and endurance, but also they also imply a lack of inner emotion, vulnerability or sensitivity.

<sup>18</sup>- P. Filene, Him/Her/Self: Sex Roles in Modern America, 2nd. ed., (Baltimore, 1986).

The question of play was initially suggested by the comparison of two concluding paragraphs from Davidoff and Hall's study of early nineteenth century men and women in England.

Fathers in the local records most certainly desired to become the progenitors of a family, to beget and rear children and to form them according to ideas of a good life. These goals were not necessarily aimed at forming a family dynasty in the gentry mould. Rather fatherhood was a responsibility and an enjoyment, both part of a moral destiny. ...

In Maria Marsh's words, motherhood was, indeed, a 'world of business to those who are in a small measure desirous of doing their duty.'<sup>19</sup>

What this juxtaposition indicates is an apparent difference between motherhood and fatherhood: fathers are described as 'enjoying' their children, while motherhood would appear to be more of a job, a 'business'.

The idea of enjoying children and playing with them, is very rarely discussed in studies of motherhood.<sup>20</sup> Historians who study childhood have also neglected the

---

<sup>19</sup>- Davidoff and Hall, op.cit., p. 335 and p. 343.

<sup>20</sup>- The importance of play for a child's development has recently been reexamined by Bruno Bettelheim, "The Importance of Play", Atlantic Magazine, 249 (1987), pp. 35-46. The key to his argument is that children learn to socialize with the outside world through the elements of games. If fathers are the gate-keeper to the outside world (as suggested by Leonard Benson in Fatherhood (New York, 1968)), then this function of playing games with children would be an important manner for fathers to teach their children about how the outside world functioned. This theory was obviously more appropriate in households when it was only the father who functioned outside the home.

question of shared play between parents and children, despite the focus on toys, and evolution of sport.<sup>21</sup> In fact, the enjoyment of children's company has always been considered as a very modern phenomenon.<sup>22</sup> In the studies of fatherhood, however, the question of play is critical. In his study of the British mid-Victorian paterfamilias, Roberts has found more references to play with fathers than to mothers.<sup>23</sup> E. Rotundo, in his study of variants of masculinity in New England between 1750 and 1920, demonstrates that after 1880, some fathers attempted to re-enter the family's emotional circle of woman and child. Rotundo suggests that these fathers attempted this re-entry through playing with their children.<sup>24</sup> The biographies and autobiographies surveyed for this study also refer to the father as the parent who played with the children. Perhaps one of the consequences of the rise of the Cult of Motherhood was that, in abdicating the central place of moral responsibility, fathers become free to enjoy their children, without feeling ultimately responsible for their behavior.

---

<sup>21</sup>- Ariès, op.cit.; L. Pollock, ed., A Lasting Relationship: Parents and Children over Three Centuries (Hanover, N.H., 1987); Sutherland, op.cit..

<sup>22</sup>- Shorter, op.cit.; de Mause, op.cit..

<sup>23</sup>- D. Roberts, "The Paterfamilias of the Victorian Governing Classes", in A. Wohl, ed., The Victorian Family: Structure and Stresses (London, 1977), pp. 35-51. See also Dubbert, op.cit.; Rotundo, op.cit..

<sup>24</sup>- Rotundo, op.cit..

Considering the Judeo-Christian tradition of a male ministry, it is not surprising that of all elements of fatherhood, the one most understood is the religious aspect. Fathers were 'ministers of the home'.<sup>25</sup> This element of fatherhood was crucial to many communities, such as the colonial Puritans. Edward Morgan, John Demos and Philip Greven have examined men in their role of father, husband and head of household in Puritan New England.<sup>26</sup> Although studies of seventeenth century New England family life include information about the father, they are primarily focussed on his role as mediator between the community and the family, rather than on an examination of the father's role in and of itself. This emphasis on the functions of the men in studies of the Puritan family appears to have been dictated by the politico-religious structure of the community, which placed the father at the head of the 'family commonwealth'. This ideology forced the father to take a very participatory role in the lives of his children,

---

<sup>25</sup>- According to John Demos, it was a function held by the paterfamilias until the mid nineteenth century in America, when the 'Cult of True Womanhood' placed women at the center of the pure, morally rejuvenating home. "The Changing Faces of Fatherhood", in J. Demos, ed., Past, Present and Personal: The Family and The Life Course in American History (New York, 1986), pp. 41-67.

<sup>26</sup>- E. Morgan, The Puritan Family: Religion and Domestic Relations in Seventeenth-Century New England, rev. ed., (New York, 1966); Demos, A Little Commonwealth; P. Greven, The Protestant Temperament: Patterns of Child-Rearing, Religious Experience, and The Self in Early America (New York, 1977).

as both God and the community held him responsible for his children's morals and behavior. One might describe these studies as illuminations of the public father figure, the legislator and judiciary of the little commonwealth. The emphasis on the public discussion about fathers has obscured our eyes to the real father living behind the shutters, and away from the pulpit.

Roberts' comparative study of the paterfamilias of the landed gentry and the urban middle class in England during the Victorian period also suggests the crucial role played by religion. Many of the fathers in his sample of the urban middle class were evangelicals, as compared to the High Church Anglican gentry. Roberts attributes to the former religion the firm and authoritarian nature of this father figure, particularly in comparison with the more lenient Anglicans: "For the urban and devout father the family became a work of art, and a duty to God, for the rural and conventionally Anglican father, it was an ancient and tried institution."<sup>27</sup>

The works of Morgan, Greven, Demos and Roberts suggest an important consideration for the study of fathers, particularly in patriarchal communities. The notion that God

---

<sup>27</sup>- Roberts op.cit., p. 69. In Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and The Cult of The Virgin Mary (London, 1976) Marina Warner has argued that the Roman Catholic hierarchy used and transformed the image of the Virgin mother in order to strengthen their power over women in the Catholic Church. While Joseph has never received the same publicity as his wife, the Churches had prescribed roles for fathers as well.

holds the father directly responsible for the upbringing of his children would have an important effect on how the father disciplined and participated in his children's lives. As Ann Douglas, Mary Ryan and others have demonstrated, however, the nineteenth century was a period of religious re-orientation, and women played an increasingly large role in the determination of theology and religious practices. The traditional cornerstone of the father's authority, his role as moral overseer of his family, was consistently being eroded by the "Feminization" of religious culture. At the same time, the reform impulse had spawned a plethora of groups and associations, organized along peer group lines, whose legitimated leaders also challenged the father's traditionally absolute moral leadership over the members of his family. These two points of erosion combined with the economic re-orientation of the middle class family are important elements in evaluating the changing function of the father.

The inferences to be drawn from this survey of the historiography concerning the role of the father in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century family are two-fold. In the first instance, the father's role was a product of both his public responsibilities, and the demands placed on him by his wife and children in the privacy of their home. In the second instance, the parameters of fatherhood can be said to be as socially determined as the parameters around

motherhood. In essence then, the father functioned within and between the distinct spheres. The two challenges to the late Victorian, early Edwardian father were, first, the reconciliation of the demands made upon him by the public world and those of his private world; and second, the power and multiplication of alternative figures of authority. We might characterize the first challenge as a personal one: within certain socially set parameters, the middle class father could choose to spend more or less time with his children. The second challenge becomes a public one, as particular social agencies justify their intervention in what had heretofore been considered private, and the family becomes a focus of intervention for the public good. While this institutional and State intervention may have most directly affected the working class father, middle class families could not be exempted: their role as social leader demanded a most righteous and correct standard of behavior. The breach between public and private, once forced, could not be halted. The middle class father's authority would, by the end of nineteenth century, be imperilled by exactly those institutions his forefathers had created for social betterment, class control and the maintenance of middle class patriarchy. In a sense then, the father of the turn of the century, facing what some historians have identified as the democratization of the family, found themselves having to create a new type of fatherhood, distinct from an earlier

generation.<sup>28</sup> This new fatherhood would have implications for all members of the family.

This study will present the images suggested by society to fathers through a variety of sources: reform literature, custody cases, children's literature, adult literature, and private papers. Assuming that during a period of flux gender and family roles contain both traditional and new ideals, this study considers several different kinds of sources in order to avoid focussing on any single perspective of the father's role. This approach was suggested by Nina Auerbach's thesis of the image of women in Victorian art and literature, The Women and the Demon (1982). While it is true that much of the Victorian imagery surrounding women was indeed caught up in the dichotomy of Madonna and Magdalene, there was a sub-current of alternate images, which broadened and challenged the dominant imaginative landscape. Nina Auerbach points out that to limit the analytical framework used to study the Victorian woman means flattening the living reality behind it. A second reason for examining the father's role through a variety of perspectives is that any repetition of an image or model will suggest its social power and pervasiveness as a social parameter. If both an

---

<sup>28</sup>- C. Lasch, The Culture of Narcissism: American Life in an Age of Diminishing Expectations (New York, 1978); C. Lasch, Haven in a Heartless World, The Family Besieged (New York, 1977); Grossberg, op.cit.; Rotundo, op.cit.; Shorter, op.cit..

author of a children's story and a judge on the Queen's Bench promoted the same image of the father, then one might reasonably conclude that such an image was deeply rooted in society. Two important purposes are thereby achieved: consensus will be noted and varieties perceived.

This study begins by describing the city of Montreal, with particular emphasis on the life-style of the English speaking middle class. The function of this chapter is to set the study group, the English middle class of Montreal, within a descriptive framework available for reference throughout the rest of the study. This chapter will describe the cultural and geographic reference points available to the anglophone middle class of the city of Montreal from 1870 to 1914.

The next two chapters analyze two institutions fundamental to the creation and maintenance of gender and familial roles, the Church and the Law. Both these institutions can be seen as reflections of conservative ideologies, and as reflecting the middle class value structure. A discussion of church records focuses on the place of the father in the Social Gospel movement, as well as an examination of a Montreal benevolent institution for young boys, the Boy's Home. The legal ideal of fatherhood is explored through a study of child custody cases, and the invocations of Article 243 of the Civil Code defining

Paternal Authority. Although both the gospellers and the Bench recognized the continued need for hierarchy and stability within the family, increasingly more emphasis was placed on the mother as moral arbiter of the Home, despite the continued rhetoric of patriarchal authority.

After examining the institutional responses to the conditions of the urban father, we will view the father figure as he appeared in the imaginative landscape, through a study of children's and adult fiction, written between 1870 and 1914. The power of fiction throughout this period was constantly increasing. As a reflection of social standards, and perhaps even as a promoter of social values, Victorian fiction exerted an important influence. Literature of this period generated various images of the father. Literature written for girls suggested the crucial importance of fathers for the heroines, as well as suggesting that fatherhood benefited the man as well. Literature written for adults, however, raised important philosophical questions about regeneration. In this literature, fathers generally represented the static past, while the children, the promise of the future.

The final chapter of this study examines the reality of Montreal's middle class fathers through an analysis of the private papers of several Montreal families. This final chapter serves to gauge the impact of the images produced by social institutions and ideals, to determine if they had any

resonance in the reality of middle class fathers of Montreal.

This study suggests that fathers were an important participating member of their families. Although their authority over their children was challenged by the moral purity of their wives, and alternative social structures and leaders, fathers served an important function, both in the contemporary discourse concerning the family and in the reality of individual families. In its search for order, late Victorian early Edwardian Canadian society manipulated the traditional image and ideal of the absolute authority of the pater-familias. In this way, paternal authority becomes a figurehead, while the moral mother becomes the focus of society's injunctions. On the other hand, perhaps liberated from society's strictures, individual fathers created their own place in their homes, depending on their own individual needs. Lacking firm social guidance or explicit standards, Montreal's middle class fathers demonstrated a wide spectrum of behavior. The years between 1870 and 1914 were in fact years of flux for the ideals of fatherhood, similar in nature perhaps to the years 1800 to 1850 for motherhood. The purpose of this study is therefore an examination of the variations, and the ensuing conflicts presented to the late Victorian man in his role as father.

## Chapter I City Between the Hills

Northern Jewel in the Crown, between 1870 and 1914, Montreal was the Grand City of the Northern Nation. The hyperbole is apt: not only was the city the nation's most populous, but it was also headquarters to its transcontinental railway and most influential bank, the largest port, the site of Canada's industrial accomplishments, and home to some of the great fortunes of the country. No other Canadian city compared favorably to the texture of Montreal, a richness of life largely attributable to the fortunated families of the city, who were determined to create alongside their institutions of power, a haven of culture on the island in the middle of the great river. Montreal's middle class, and particularly the English speakers, shared in those endeavors, and perhaps aspired to the opulent lifestyle of the Square Mile. This chapter will

describe Montreal's urban space to give the reader a picture of the city of Montreal as experienced especially by its English middle class. Like a falcon circling down upon its prey, this portrait will begin from the highest vantage point, examining the population, the available cultural and leisure activities, and the communications' infrastructure which linked the various elements of the city together. Circling lower, we will view the home in this city.

## I

The tourist may have noticed that between 1870 and 1914, Montreal was in the grip of significant change. In 1870, the tourist might have stayed at the St. Lawrence Hall, at the corner of St. James and St. Francois Xavier Streets, "in the most salubrious and fashionable part of the city." After 1876, however, the wealthy tourists might have frequented the Windsor Hotel on Dominion Square, and after 1912, the Ritz Carleton at the corner of Sherbrooke and Mountain Street. The upmarket neighborhood of Montreal had moved north and west of the original city center.

Agnes Machar's children's story Marjorie's Canadian Winter <1892> was set in Montreal in the winter preceding

Riel's Rebellion in 1885.<sup>1</sup> Her description of the city establishes certain important reference points: the Reservoir, Dominion Square, (site of the Ice Palace during Carnival), the Old Town, (including Bonsecours Market, the new Town Hall, and the Sailor's Church) and St. Helene's Island. In 1885, the Mountain was a rough park, with bridle paths.<sup>2</sup> Middle class Marjorie's visit to the city was clearly confined: from Guy to St. Denis Streets, and from the Port to Sherbrooke Street. Guide books written after 1900 reflected very little change: Montrealers still boasted 'old Montreal', with its old world, feudal charm, and charmingly costumed, pipe smoking "habitants", McGill University, with its imposing greystone buildings, and gracious Sherbrooke Street. Significant change had in fact come to the city, and one simple addition to these guide books indicates the breadth of change: the horses and carriages were fast disappearing after 1892, and rather than admire the 'dash and splendor of the best sleighs outside of

---

<sup>1</sup>- A. Machar, Marjorie's Canadian Winter <1892> (Toronto, 1896).

<sup>2</sup>- Montrealers took enormous pride in their mountain. In 1882, Oscar Wilde called Montreal's mountain a hill. One Toronto columnist remarked that: "Oscar Wilde nearly drove the people of that interesting city into hysterics by speaking of their mountain as a hill. You can say nearly anything you like of Montreal and the people will not bother their heads about it - except when you belittle their mountain. It is high treason to speak ill of that, or to attempt to lessen its size or grandeur by as much as a spade-ful." K. O'Brien, Oscar Wilde in Canada : An Apostle for the Arts (Toronto, 1982), p. 62.

St. Petersburg,' the tourist was encouraged to take the electric tram and view the city from the now protected public park: the Mountain.<sup>3</sup>

From the falcon's vantage point in time and space, the changes which affected the city of Montreal between 1870 and 1914 appear revolutionary. The city's population grew from 115,000 in 1871 to 470,480 in 1911. The city grew from 3,299 sq. miles in 1881 to 5,458 sq. miles in 1911. By 1914 the streets were congested with automobiles, bicycles, and an electric tram system, replacing the horse and pedestrian traffic of the earlier period. The city's growth was attributable to its economic position as a regional and national center of communication, industry, and commerce.<sup>4</sup>

Fire, pestilence, flood, and the building of a fixed link to the mainland, pushed the city's residential population away from the old center, and drew it into new

---

<sup>3</sup>- American Library Association, twenty second Annual conference, McGill University, Montreal. June sixth to twelfth, nineteen hundred. Programme and guide issued by the local committee (Montreal, 1900).

<sup>4</sup>- See B. Young and J. Dickinson, A Short History of Quebec: A Socio-Economic Perspective (Toronto, 1988); R. Rumilly, Histoire de Montréal, vol. 4 (Montréal, 1972); P.-A. Linteau, Maisonnette, ou comment les promoteurs fabriquent une ville (Montréal, 1981); P.-A. Linteau, R. Durocher, and J.-C. Robert, Quebec: A History 1867-1929, trans. R. Chodos (Toronto, 1983).

avenues of commercial and residential growth.<sup>5</sup> Throughout this period, these residential areas flowed northward, westward, and eastward from the old core around the port.<sup>6</sup> The movement away from the center accelerated significantly after the establishment of the tramway system in 1892. New municipalities were incorporated at Montreal's borders: Westmount in 1901, Outremont in 1910. Other municipalities were annexed: Hochelaga in 1883 and Maisonneuve in 1918.

Evolving rapidly, at any given moment between 1870 and 1914, the city presented a disparate face to the casual visitor. Home to the wealthiest Canadians, by 1900 the Square Mile was built up with mansions, many surrounded by their own landscaped parks. In 1890, well over one-third and perhaps as much as two-thirds of the nation's economic power was controlled by roughly one hundred Montrealers.<sup>7</sup> In contrast, the working class wards near the railway and

---

<sup>5</sup>- David Hanna sees one indicator of this movement as being the building of churches around present-day Guy and Sherbrooke. D. Hanna, The New Town of Montreal: Creation of an Upper Middle Class Suburb on the Slope of Mount Royal, Unpublished M.A. Thesis, University of Toronto (Toronto, 1977). The most famous of these residential areas is the Square Mile. See D. MacKay, The Square Mile: Merchant Princes of Montreal (Vancouver, 1987).

<sup>6</sup>- Some of these residential movements were of short duration. St. Catherine's Street, for example, was residential for less than thirty years. D. Hanna, "Creation of an Early Victorian Suburb in Montreal", Urban History Review/Revue d'histoire urbaine, IX, 2 (October/octobre, 1980), pp. 38-64.

<sup>7</sup>- M. Westley, Remembrance of Grandeur: Montreal's Anglo-Protestant Elite, 1900-1950 (Montreal, 1990), Introduction.

Lachine canal were the sites of some of the worst slums in the country, with the highest infant mortality rate, and the greatest number of deaths attributed to tuberculosis in the nation.<sup>8</sup> Wedged between these two visible extremes, aspiring to one, fearful of the other, Montreal's middle class shared in the city's prestige, and benefitted from her institutions.

Middle class unity which might have come from the combination of growth, residential segregation and differentiation was undermined in Montreal by the ethnic and religious cleavages which split the city in two: the west end being predominantly anglophone and Protestant, the east end predominantly francophone and Catholic.<sup>9</sup> These linguistic and religious cleavages were reinforced by the State, which promoted the division of social agencies, including schools, by religion, treating the Protestants as a single unit, regardless of denomination. Socially and culturally, these two middle class worlds lived apart, each

---

<sup>8</sup>- H. Ames, The City Below The Hill <1887>, introduction P. Rutherford (Toronto, 1972); T. Copp, Anatomy of Poverty: The Condition of the Working Class in Montreal, 1897-1929 (Toronto, 1974).

<sup>9</sup>- The oral evidence collected by Margaret Westley and Edward Collard states that some turn of the century English Montrealers never heard French spoken around their homes and schools. Such evidence must be treated carefully, but it does suggest that at the very least, total linguistic isolation was a possibility for some Montrealers. M. Westley, op.cit.; E. Collard, Call Back Yesterdays (Don Mills, 1965).

with their own clubs, theatres, sporting associations, churches, and charitable organizations.

The conflicts arising from the efforts of French Canadian merchants to participate in the Winter Carnival in 1885 illustrate the extent of the cleavage. Begun in 1880 by city promoters to attract the tourist in the winter season, by 1884 the Winter Carnival was a distinctly west-end affair: the Ice Castle on Dominion Square, the Ball held in the Windsor Hotel, the torchlight snowshoe parades, the toboggan slides on Cote des Neiges. In 1884, realizing the potential of the tourist dollar, and aware of the bias of the early organizers, efforts were made by some French Canadians to organize other events within the Carnival's program in the east-end. Several English snowshoe clubs declined an invitation to participate in a parade on the Tuesday night, citing their prior commitments to the traditional parade, (in the west-end only) held on Wednesday night. As Sylvie Dufresne comments, such an excuse was surprising, considering the usual length of tramps undertaken by these clubs. The debate became so acrimonious, that at least one French club may not have participated in the storming of the Ice Castle that year.<sup>10</sup>

In some instances, tensions between the French and English went beyond passive hostility. The riots following

---

<sup>10</sup>- S. Dufresne, "Le Carnaval d'hiver de Montréal, 1803-1889", Urban History Review/Revue d'histoire urbaine, XI, 3 (February/ fevrier, 1983), pp. 25-46.

the hanging of Louis Riel, and during the South African war, the skirmish between the McGill students and their counterparts at the Montreal campus of Laval University suggest that the strain between the two linguistic/religious groups was ever-present. For the most part, however, the two linguistic groups lived separate lives on the Island, the middle class particularly self-conscious in promoting at least the appearance of good relations. Reflecting this accommodating attitude was the relatively consistent election of alternating French and English speaking mayors of the city.<sup>11</sup>

A smaller group of Canadian intellectuals went further in 'race' relations, and tried to promote an understanding and spirit of tolerance between the two groups. In Agnes Machar's Marjorie's Canadian Winter <1892>, and Rev. Hugh Pedley's Looking Forward: A Novel for the Times, <1913> two Canadian novels preaching ecumenicalism and religious tolerance, the city of Montreal plays a significant role, as

---

<sup>11</sup>- Another effort was the continued inclusion of French lessons in the curriculum of the schools of Montreal. It appears that there was a self-conscious effort to maintain a minimum level of bilingualism, if only because achievement in languages was a sign of a cultured society. Such efforts must, of course, be put into perspective. In Marjorie's Canadian Winter, for example, Agnes Machar commented upon the opportunity English Montrealers had for learning French. "In German, she (Marjorie, a native New Yorker) found herself rather before her companions, though the Montreal girls had naturally the advantage in French, having plenty of opportunity for practicing speaking it, if they were so disposed. Even Ada could do a little shopping in it, when necessary." (p. 242).

the proximity of English and French communities made it the choice area of the country to begin the work of understanding and rapprochement. Here, the city represented a field for dealing with the national issue of the place for the 'two founding peoples'.

Another genre of fiction, the historical romance, was pressed into the same service. William Kirby's The Golden Dog <1877/1896>, William Lighthall's The Young Seigneur <1888> and Gilbert Parker's The Seats of The Mighty <1896> are three of many works of fiction written by English Protestants about the Conquest, and the fall of the city of Quebec. In the retelling of the Conquest, these novelists attempted to find some common ground for harmonious relations, beyond mere elite accommodation. According to these novelists, the loss of New France was a function of the decadence of the French aristocracy. The habitants were, for the most part, a hard working, deferential group of people. These qualities were perfectly adapted to Canadian society, according to the Tory vision of the authors, whose subtext was the difference between Canada and the rowdy republicanism of the United States. In this vision, the French Canadian habitant was a sign of Canada's uniqueness with social qualities to be reinforced so as not to be swallowed up by the democratic experiment.<sup>12</sup> The extent to

---

<sup>12</sup>- See C. Berger, The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1870-1914 (Toronto, 1970), pp. 134-147.

which these novels helped create bridges between the two groups of the city is perhaps less important than the fact of their existence, and the centrality of the 'race' question to the inhabitants of Montreal.<sup>13</sup>

One might say that English Montrealers were of three minds concerning their French Canadian neighbors. On one hand, when dealing with outsiders, they boosted their feudal roots and vaunted the decorative habitants. A second group, a small collectivity of intellectuals, expanded on this tourist attraction, and in their attempts to differentiate Canada from the United States, used the deferential qualities of the French Canadians as a base for more than simple accommodation. Finally, the day-to-day lives of French and English Montrealers, lived in neighborhood isolation, reinforced by municipal by-laws, suggests a polite but separate existence.

Between 1870 and 1914, Montreal's English Protestant population was losing ground. Its percentage of the city's population dropped from 45% in 1871 to 28% in 1911.<sup>14</sup>

---

<sup>13</sup>- The political and social importance of the two founding peoples for Montrealers distinguished the middle class inhabitants of that city from other Canadian centers, such as Vancouver or Winnipeg, whose concerns centered around the immigrant problem, particularly as it related to 'visible' minorities. Stephen Leacock makes almost no reference to the 'visible' minorities in Arcadian Adventures of the Idle Rich <1914>. Ralph Connor's The Foreigner <1909> is illustrative of the western perspective.

<sup>14</sup>- According to the Canadian Census, 1871 and 1911.

Despite their declining numerical importance, a weakness worsened by the inter-denominational divisions, Montreal Protestants were a strong and influential group, well served by schools, hospitals, churches, and other religiously based institutions. Separated from its linguistic counterpart by geography, religion, language and tradition, Montreal's Protestant, English middle class lived a relatively privileged and well serviced existence. And this despite the fact that the Protestant community was itself divided between several denominations. Two factors, however, led the Montreal Protestants towards amalgamating their charitable organizations, despite the denominational differences.<sup>15</sup> The Quebec government promoted the division of social agencies by religion and treated the Protestants of any denomination as a single unit. The second factor was the difficulty of a single congregation to finance or maintain interest in any serious missionary endeavour. There were several inner-city missions organized by a single congregation, but by 1914, with a few exceptions, such as St. Columba House in the working class community in St. Henry, these had a tendency to integrate with others,<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup>- The Social Gospel encouraged an ecumenical movement which stressed Brotherhood in Jesus over dogmatic denominational differences.

<sup>16</sup>- In 1914, the St. Antoine Mission of the Church of St. James the Apostle was amalgamated with St. Jude's Church. Rev. A. Pearson, The Year of the Jubilee, Church of St. James the Apostle (Montreal, 1915).

despite the relatively late espousal of ecumenicalism by the religious elite of the community.<sup>17</sup>

The city was an important Protestant administrative, educational and religious center. There were three Protestant theological colleges in the city. Presbyterian College, (est. 1873- affiliated with McGill, 1873), Montreal Diocesan College (est. 1873- affiliated with McGill, 1880), and Wesleyan Theological College, Montreal (est. 1873- affiliated with McGill, 1878). The Presbyterian College was the largest and best endowed. There were also efforts to rationalize the religious structures at the provincial level and bring those institutions which had heretofore been relatively spread around the province into the city of

---

<sup>17</sup>- This kind of ecumenicalism can be seen on a individual level as well, from an analysis of subscription lists, often appended to the annual reports of the charitable organizations. A significant number of names continue to reappear, regardless of the denomination of the organization, or faith of the individual donor.

According to D. C. Masters the professors of Montreal's theological schools espoused ecumenicalism only in the last years of the nineteenth century. Protestant Church Colleges in Canada: A History (Toronto, 1966), p. 152. This apparent contradiction between the attitude of the professional and the behavior of the average subscriber suggests that the charities were filling important social needs.

Montreal.<sup>18</sup> Through such institutions, the city's influence radiated over the region and the nation.<sup>19</sup>

The combination of theological colleges and administrations meant that the city had a large and active religious community.<sup>20</sup> Several important educational and religious leaders of Canada were at one time or another active members of Montreal's community. The presence of Sir William Dawson in Montreal as Principal of McGill University from 1850 to 1893 assured the city of a privileged awareness

---

<sup>18</sup>- For example, in 1870, Bishop Ashton Oxendon justified the establishment of a college in Montreal by saying that because of the distance between Montreal and Lennoxville, he could not personally supervise the training of the clergy. Ibid., p. 122-23.

<sup>19</sup>- According to Masters, twenty percent of the Methodist ministers in Canada were graduates of the Wesleyan Theological College of Montreal. Ibid., p. 128.

<sup>20</sup>- It also contributed to a certain feeling in the rest of the country that Montreal was a difficult city to serve in. Difficult not only because of the high theological standards, but also because of the competing forms of entertainment. The Presbyterian Record (Jan. 1882, no.1, vol. vii, p.13) complains that during an Anniversary meeting at Erskine Church, out of a total Presbyterian population of some four thousand communicants, only four hundred individuals attended the meetings. "Our hope is that intelligence and culture will discover that once in awhile, at least, it may find as pleasant and profitable entertainment at the missionary meeting as at the theatre and other fashionable places of resort." In Salem Bland's biography of James Henderson, Bland suggests that the cosmopolitan and educated nature of the congregations made even Henderson nervous that he might not come up to the high standard demanded by Montrealers. Salem Bland, The Life of James Henderson D.D., introduction by S. D. Chown, (Toronto, 1926), p. 71.

of the argument against evolution.<sup>21</sup> Andrew MacPhail, editor of the prestigious University Magazine, contributed to the crucial debates of the hour, particularly the re-evaluation of Christianity within a new and complex modern society.<sup>22</sup> James Henderson, one of the important Methodist social gospellers of Canada, was the minister of St. James Church from 1888 to 1891, and again from 1918 to 1920. Father Edmund Wood (1858-1909), rector and founder of the Anglican Church of St. John the Evangelist, introduced many elements of the Anglo-Catholic revival to Montreal and Canada. The spiritual leadership of this community was infinitely varied, and representative of many points of view, thereby providing Protestant Montrealers with an important variety of perspectives.

## II

City of spires, Montreal was also the cultural center of Canada. The English-speaking middle class, dominated by

---

<sup>21</sup>- For example, it may have been on his instigation that the University organized a series of lectures on the question of higher science, and the need for religion, entitled Questions of the Day (Montreal, 1885), delivered only two years after the death of Darwin.

<sup>22</sup>- Andrew MacPhail was the editor of the Magazine from 1907 to 1919.

the Scottish Presbyterians in style if not in numbers,<sup>23</sup> was a cultural crossbreed of traditional Imperial ties and ever-expanding continental links. While many English speaking Montrealers looked fondly to Britain as their cultural home, their economic links with American capital and business, as well as the city's geographic proximity to American centers of culture such as Boston and New York, created a unique cultural landscape, cross-fertilized by both influences. Summer vacations spent at Bar Harbour or Virginia Beach, bookstores and libraries catering to the literary fashion regardless of national origin, theatre troupes proclaiming their New York and London successes, and architectural styles from both Britain and America, all suggest that Montreal was, in this cultural sphere at least, a true participant in the North American triangle.<sup>24</sup>

---

<sup>23</sup>- One indication of the wealth and domination of the Presbyterians throughout this period was the constant building of churches on the prestigious Dorchester Blvd. By the 1880's, St. Andrew's Ball had become well established as the height of the Montreal season, and belles from as far away as Kingston, Toronto, and Hamilton came to be presented. E. Collard, Montreal's Yesterdays (Don Mills, 1963), p. 217-218.

<sup>24</sup>- A list of some of the more famous visitors to the city, from 1850 to 1910, including Charles Dickens, Harriet Beecher Stowe, Samuel Butler, Matthew Arnold, Oscar Wilde, Mark Twain, Rudyard Kipling, Winston Churchill, suggests that like Mohammed, the Montrealers moved the Imperial and American Mountain. Such illustrious names and visitors were, in part, accountable to the credit of some of Montreal's most eminent residents; for example, Sir William Hingston, one-time mayor of Montreal, arranged Oscar Wilde's visit of 1882.

The variety of available institutions contributed to this particular cultural standard. Much of Montreal's cultural activity was directed and financed by the great magnates of the city. The Art Association of Montreal for example (inaugurated in 1858, permanent hall built in 1879, on Philips Square, relocated in 1912 to the corner of Sherbrooke St. and De Musée Ave.) was really a showcase for those works of art the private citizens of Montreal were willing to loan out.<sup>25</sup> The Saturday teas held in the hall were a popular pastime for those Montrealers with artistic pretensions.<sup>26</sup> According to one contemporary art critic, Sir Martin Conway, Slade Professor of Fine Arts at Cambridge: "The lover of art who finds himself in Montreal and proceeds to investigate the art treasures possessed by the energetic inhabitants of that prosperous city, will be astonished at the result of his search. He will discover not one or two, but some dozen or more collections of importance."<sup>27</sup> Other observers were less enthusiastic.

---

<sup>25</sup>- Linteau, et al., op.cit., chap. 17. See also Discerning Tastes the catalogue from the exhibition "Discerning Tastes", Montreal Museum of Fine Arts (Montreal, 1989). In 1910, admission to the gallery was 25 cents, the same price as a ticket to the hockey games.

<sup>26</sup>- Collard, Call back Yesterdays, p. 224. According to Edward Collard, Sir William Van Horne would not donate any part of his vast art or geological collection to a museum which was closed on Sundays. As a youth, Van Horne, had suffered from having this pastime closed to him, on the only day of the week he was not working. Collard, Montreal's Yesterdays, p. 251.

<sup>27</sup>- Collard, Montreal's Yesterdays, p. 249.

Oscar Wilde's comment about the state of the arts in Montreal was summed up in one sentence. Upon being asked his impressions of the art in the city, he said: "Well, yes (with a shrug): I was in the Art Gallery, I saw one good picture, one very fine picture."<sup>28</sup>

The domination of Montreal's high culture by the wealthy merchants disgusted many visitors and residents alike. Kathleen Jenkins reports an anecdote concerning Samuel Butler's visit to Montreal in 1874:

For some reason, Butler peered into a storeroom (of the museum of the Natural History Society) not ordinarily open to the public. There, among a miscellany of plants and snakes and insects not yet ready for the display cases, he spied two plaster casts of ancient Greek statues, one of them being a reproduction of the discus thrower, the Discobolus. Their banishment led him to question an old man working nearby. Stopping to talk of this and other matters, the oldster replied simply, "You see, they are rather vulgar". With these words, Butler had the text for his poem, "A Psalm of Montreal," first published in the Spectator in 1878:

Stowed away in a Montreal lumber room  
The Discobolus standeth and turneth his face to  
the walls;  
Dusty, cobweb-covered, maimed and set at naught,  
Beauty crieth in an attic and no man regardeth:  
O God! O Montreal!

And I turned to the man of skins and said unto  
him, "O thou man of skins,  
Wherefore hast thou done thus to shame the beauty  
of the Discobolus?"  
But the Lord had hardened the heart of the man of  
skins

---

<sup>28</sup>- O'Brien, op.cit., p. 63. Oscar Wilde was, however, particularly impressed with Montreal's scenic attractions, the mountain and the river.

And he answered, "My brother-in-law is haberdasher  
to Mr. Spurgeon."  
O God! O Montreal!

"The Discobolus is put here because he is vulgar-  
He has neither vest nor pants with which to cover  
his limbs;  
I, Sir, am a person of most respectable  
connections-  
My brother-in-law is haberdasher to Mr. Spurgeon."  
O God! O Montreal!<sup>29</sup>

In Butler's poem, respectability and aesthetic appreciation are not necessarily compatible, and for the respectable of Montreal, the haberdasher to Mr. Spurgeon, the naked Discobolus was too outré. Stephen Leacock's Arcadian Adventures of the Idle Rich <1914> is another example of the criticism levelled at the 'idle rich' and their cultural pretensions. Wealth was no substitute for good taste, and Leacock lampooned the conservative ostentatiousness of Montreal's preeminent families, whose motto was 'I know what I like', and who could afford to buy it. The crime, according to Leacock, was not that this elite was wasting its money, but rather that this group commanded the taste of other Montrealers.

---

<sup>29</sup>- K. Jenkins, Montreal, Island City of the St. Lawrence (New York, 1966), p. 395. The full text of the poem is reprinted in Collard, Call Back Yesterdays, p. 173-174. Museums of Natural History before 1900 in Montreal and in Canada were a very popular form of diversion. See R. Duchesne et P. Carle, "L'Ordre des choses: Cabinets et musées d'histoire naturelle au Québec (1824-1900)", Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique Française, 44, 1 (été, 1990), pp. 3-30.

In 1870, Montreal had only one true theatre, and at least one theatre critic lamented "the mighty dullness or dead silence of the Cote St. boards."<sup>30</sup> Other cultural activities took place in hotel halls and dining rooms. By 1914, there were six permanent theatres, and the overflow was still directed to the hotels.<sup>31</sup> Theatres catered to every taste, and "la comedie francaise" and Gilbert and Sullivan were particular favorites. Sarah Bernhardt and Lillie Langtry appeared on Montreal stages, as did Albani, the Chambly born opera prima donna. The great British actor/producer, Sir Henry Irving, opened his American tours in Montreal.<sup>32</sup> Circuses also came to town: in 1864 P.T. Barnum's Tom Thumb came to the city, and Buffalo Bill entertained thousands in 1885 and again in 1897.

Libraries were an important source for the dissemination of culture. The Fraser-Hickson Library, Montreal's first free public library, opened its doors in 1885. Westmount opened its municipal library, (free to

---

<sup>30</sup>- The Montreal Gazette, May 31, 1870.

<sup>31</sup>- Another indication of the radiation of Montreal's taste over the national hinterland was the purchase of theatres in other Canadian cities by owners of Montreal's theatres. In 1900, for example, Mr. J. B. Sparrow, who controlled the Theatre Royal and the Academy in Montreal, leased the Grand Opera House in Ottawa. The Montreal Gazette, January 1, 1900.

<sup>32</sup>- J. Cooper, Montreal, The Story of Three Hundred Years (Montreal, 1942), p. 97. See also Collard Call Back Yesterdays, p. 231. Edward Greenshields often took his son Moray to the theatre. (Greenshields Family, McCord Museum, Montreal, Edward Greenshields diary).

residents, a membership fee for those living outside the city limits) in 1899. According to the souvenir booklet for the American Library Association's annual meeting held in Montreal in 1900, the four free public libraries held some 63,500 volumes. As for University libraries, McGill alone housed 80,000 volumes.<sup>33</sup> Bookstores advertised recently received titles in Montreal's newspapers, and once a week, The Gazette published a short literary review article, sponsored by the booksellers of the city.

Spectator sport was another element in the island's cultural landscape.<sup>34</sup> The Montreal Amateur Athletics Association held outdoor events on the field in Lower Westmount, (corner Clarke Ave. and Dorchester). The indoor events, for members only, ran the gamut from swimming to

---

<sup>33</sup>- American Library Association.

<sup>34</sup>- A. Metcalfe, "The Evolution of Organized Physical Recreation in Montreal, 1840-1895", Histoire sociale/Social History, XI, 21 (mai/May, 1987), pp. 144-166. Metcalfe makes the distinction between competitive sport and recreational sport. Sailing, snowshoeing, and bicycling are examples of predominantly recreational sports, while hockey and lacrosse are competitive sports. It is therefore possible to suggest that fathers and their children could enjoy recreational sports together, and be spectators for the competitive sports. The wealthy merchant E.B. Greenshields recorded in his diary that he and his son Moray attended a hockey match together, (28 January 1911) and even that the father attended a ping-pong championship his son was involved in at the Y.M.C.A. (12 April, 1902) Greenshields Family, McCord Museum, Montreal. Edward Greenshields diary.

ping-pong. Junior members had restricted club privileges.<sup>35</sup> Horse races were held on a field near Cote St. Catherine road in the 1880's and 1890's. American baseball had, by 1900, overtaken and supplanted the traditional sports such as lacrosse and cricket in popularity for both participants and spectators. Football and hockey leagues were established in the first decade of the century, after two decades of local pick-up games.<sup>36</sup> Leagues were organized on a neighborhood, school, and even business level, and the competitions were keenly followed in the press. Finally, photographs of the period suggest that croquet and badminton were popular family games, playable in any small greenspace.<sup>37</sup>

---

<sup>35</sup>- The Montreal Amateur Athletic Association, according to its historian, had metropolitan, regional, and national pretensions. Individuals and teams were financed by the Association to compete with teams even as far away as England. D. Morrow, A Sporting Evolution: The Montreal Amateur Athletic Association, 1881-1981 (Montreal, 1985). However, the Association was extremely selective, and exclusive. Furthermore, the emphasis being on the winning of prestigious awards and competitions, (the Association's hockey team for example was one-time winner of the Stanley Cup), less energy was devoted to the junior members, or those who were merely interested in fraternal game playing. Other amateur athletic associations sprung up, without the large membership fees or the well-appointed clubhouse. The Westmount Amateur Athletic Association, the Point St. Charles Amateur Athletic Association fielded baseball teams in 1914 catering to this category of play.

<sup>36</sup>- See Cooper, op.cit.; and Morrow, op.cit.. See also Collard, Call Back Yesterdays, p. 214-220.

<sup>37</sup>- For example, see photograph album, Lighthall Family, Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, McGill University.

At the outbreak of the Great War, with a population only as large as Brandon, Manitoba, the English speaking middle class community of Montreal was extraordinarily well serviced, in social agencies, learning institutions, and cultural and sporting activities. One of the reasons for such a rich, textured field was certainly the presence of some of the wealthiest individuals of the country, the geographic position of the city, at the crossroads of British and American influence, and finally the city's own dynamism, as the self-styled cultural capital of the country. For the father looking for activities to share with his children, Montreal presented a plethora of prospects.

### III

Within the sea of French-Canadian Catholics, the Anglophones lived their day-to-day lives in well delimited neighborhoods, which over time moved across the urban landscape, as inner-city transport and financial capability permitted. According to the urban geographers, the English middle class of Montreal moved their residences away from the old core in three waves. Two conditions made the residential movement possible and guided its timing and placement: the development of the inner-city transport system, and the speculation by developers. The first outward

wave of residential housing, begun by speculative subdivision of the properties on the Hill in 1849, and accelerated after the great fire of 1852, lasted until the late 1870's. This movement was led by the upper-middle class, and upper class, who moved into the New Town, the great Montreal terraces, and the Square Mile mansions. The second wave, from roughly 1870 to the late 1890's built up the old Sulpician property, (Guy to Atwater, below Lincoln), St. Catherines St. and the spaces between St. Denis and Union Ave. below Pine. The housing which characterized this period lacked the architectural homogeneity of the first. The straight Georgian lines of the terraces were abandoned in favor of peaked roofs and turned woodwork.<sup>38</sup> Finally, in the third wave, begun in the late 1890's, the middle class

---

<sup>38</sup>- This discussion of housing and architecture focusses on the houses built by developers, rather than those built by individuals. The creations of profit minded developers can be seen as more reflective of the prevalent tendencies in domestic space, compared with those individuals who with an architect or engineer constructed their own space to suit their own particular needs.

moved into the suburbs of Outremont and Westmount, and after 1906, into Notre Dame de Grace.<sup>39</sup>

One element remained constant throughout this period: the higher the elevation, the wealthier the inhabitants. The escarpment (running north south between Dorchester and St-Antoine) played an important role in maintaining the distinctions, a function reinforced when the CPR laid its tracks on the embankment. Montreal was throughout this period a distinctly checkered city, divided both east west, and again, north south, each section almost self-contained.

Even though these three waves are perceptible, the great watershed appears in 1892 with the electric tram. Until 1892, Montrealers who could not afford their own transportation, a carriage and horse, could either walk to

---

<sup>39</sup>- Although the terrace was abandoned after 1870, later developments in Montreal, Westmount, Notre Dame de Grace and Outremont retained a certain external architectural homogeneity. D. Hanna, "Creation of an Early Victorian Suburb...". Some of these streets still essentially exist today. See for example Montrose Ave. between Argyle and Aberdeen, North side, built in 1910. See also Chesterfield St.. Some streets are surprisingly eclectic: for example Mount St. Stephen in Westmount. D. Hanna and F. Remiggi, "New Neighborhoods in Nineteenth Century Montreal", in D. Frost, ed., Montreal Geographical Papers, Occasional Papers in Geography, No.1 (Montreal, 1981), pp. 91-117. According to J.-P. Collin, "La Cité sur mesure: Spécialisation sociale de l'espace et autonomie municipale dans la banlieue montréalaise, 1875-1920", Urban History review/Revue d'histoire urbaine, XIII, 1 (June/juin, 1984), pp. 19-34, much of the homogeneity can be attributed to legislation. For example, both Outremont and Westmount had bylaws which prohibited the long outside staircases so common in other areas of the city. (See Jeanne Mance between Pine and Melville, east side.) Other by-laws legislated the space between the home and the street.

their destination,<sup>40</sup> or use the slow moving, unregulated horse drawn carriages.<sup>41</sup> The unreliability of the horse drawn carriages made this method of inner-city transport difficult to use for commuters. Furthermore, Montreal's horse carriages suffered from the problems posed by the steep escarpment. In winter, despite the addition of extra horses, gentlemen were asked to leave the sleighs, and walk beside them on particularly snowy days. The electric tram, however, rigidly regulated with a timetable, as well as with extended service beyond the horses' power, permitted an important and major residential population movement away from the center of the city, the financial and commercial districts, into the new suburbs. The horse cars and the trams both had their central terminus at the Post Office, suggesting the continued importance of St. James, St. Antoine and Craig St. as the commercial and financial center. By 1890, the horse cars' most westerly terminus was Greene Ave. and St. Catherines St. By 1914, the trams had

---

<sup>40</sup>- In Agnes Machar's description of the Ramsay family, Doctor Ramsay had a horse and cutter, necessary for his profession. His wife walked to do her shopping, and his sons had to borrow a bicycle. The whole family, however, had snowshoes.

<sup>41</sup>- P.-A. Linteau, "Montréal, 1850-1914", Urban History Review/Revue d'histoire urbaine, 75, 1 (June/juin, 1975), p. 33. The enormous impact of the electric streetcar on the urban environment has been described for the city of Boston by S. Warner, Streetcar Suburbs: The Process of Growth in Boston, 1870-1900 (Cambridge, Mass., 1969).

extended their lines past Victoria Ave, all the way to Snowdon.

The 1870 map of Montreal by Plunkett and Brady showed that the residential housing ceased at Guy,<sup>42</sup> and although there were scattered pockets of residential housing, for example, along St. Lawrence Blvd., and around the Church at Notre Dames de Grace, the massive density of housing was below Ontario between St. Denis, and Peel. By 1901, according to Olson's and Hanna's map in the Historical Atlas, the continuous residential area extended slightly past Victoria Ave.<sup>43</sup> Though some of the city's middle class had begun to move earlier, the massive depopulation of the core, and the development of streetcar suburbs began only after 1892.<sup>44</sup>

The social consequences of this urban population movement were felt by men and women differently. The outward population movement, associated with the development of the

---

<sup>42</sup>- By 1825, only 20% of the population of the city still lived within the Old Town. P. Frost, "Vieux montréal-Old Montreal", in D. Frost, ed., Montreal Geographical Essays Occasional Papers in Geography, Concordia University, Montreal, No.1, (Montreal, 1981), p. 71.

<sup>43</sup>- Historical Atlas of Canada: Addressing the Twentieth Century, vol. 111 (Toronto, 1990), plate 30.

<sup>44</sup>- Both the French and English speaking groups moved out of the center at about the same time, the English speaking towards the west, the French towards the north and the east. Any effects on families would be therefore roughly the same, and dependent less on ethnic variations than on the time the family leaves the center to move towards the suburbs.

predominantly residential neighborhoods, presented certain problems, unique to the turn-of-the-century city family and father and in some cases particular to the middle classes. The earlier period of urban family life, which could be called 'integrated domesticity', was characterized by the dual nature of the home.<sup>45</sup> The public and private elements of the family co-existed; the mother and children were aware of the father's business activities, and the father was conscious of the domestic arrangements. Even if residential space and business space were not shared, the distance between the two was very slight. Several forces contributed to the disintegration of this early type of domesticity. These included industrialization, which attracted many immigrants, who swelled the city's population, and the important rise of the white-collar service sector, a middle

---

<sup>45</sup>- Integrated domesticity was not a phenomenon unique to the urban environment: family-managed farms are another example of the same domestic relationship. See M. Ryan, Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County, New York, 1790-1865 (Cambridge, New York, 1981); and S. Mintz and S. Kellogg, Domestic Revolutions A Social History of American Family Life (New York, London, 1988). To a certain extent, this period of 'integrated domesticity' continued for a longer period in Europe, where the move to the purely residential suburbs began fairly late. Even when some cities developed the residential neighborhoods, few streets were denuded completely of stores or businesses. (M. Girouard, Cities and People: A Social and Architectural History (New Haven, London 1985)). See, for example, the XVIth arrondissement in Paris, or Kensington in London.

class labor force which increasingly worked in large 'office' buildings.<sup>46</sup>

Integrated domesticity's intellectual death blow was delivered by the new perception of the Home as moral and sentimental center: the "moral refuge". Because of the Home's invaluable role as guardian of moral purity, and the agency considered most responsible for the rearing of children, it had to be physically protected from what was increasingly perceived as the undesirable influences of urban squalor. Until 1892, however, such separation was only attainable for the few, but its appeal explains the enormous movement after the electric tram system was established. Such separation was very much occupation dependent: lawyers and doctors, for example, could continue to live and work in the same space, whereas managers could not.<sup>47</sup>

The establishment of the outer rings of middle class, residential suburbs signalled a new concept of domesticity,

---

<sup>46</sup>- The first building in Montreal to be built above five stories was opened in 1887. Until the invention of the elevator in 1850, buildings were built no higher than people would climb. These large, and for the time, towering structures emerged at the same time as businesses were feeling the pressure to expand their offices. Big business could no longer be managed, as Simon McTavish had done, in a small office, with a single clerk, above the warehouse.

<sup>47</sup>- See J. Tunbridge's analysis of the separation of home and work for Kingstonian doctors and lawyers. "Separation of Residence from Workplace: A Kingston Example", Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, 78, 3 (February/fevrier 1979), pp. 23-33. In The Montreal Gazette, as late as 1900, some real estate advertisements were still directed at those who wished to live and work in the same space. Such advertisements had disappeared by 1914.

which intensified as the distance between the home and the work place increased.<sup>48</sup> Wives, mothers and female domestics, were 'in charge' from 8 a.m. to 6 p.m., and husbands and fathers became 'men of the night'. Women were no longer geographically attached to their husbands' place of business,<sup>49</sup> and lived their day-to-day lives in predominantly residential neighborhoods, in small communities which, during the day, were predominantly female. Further, the self-containment of these smaller neighborhoods was reinforced by certain municipal bylaws. For example, in 1896, Westmount forbade non-residents from

---

<sup>48</sup>- In both Outremont and Westmount, the development of these activity distinct areas was entrenched in the zoning laws. See J.-P. Collin, "La Cité sur mesure".

<sup>49</sup>- Mary Ryan has argued that this distance tended to reinforce the mother's role as moral center of the home, and at the same time, diminish the father's role as manager of a economic unit based on his family, thereby diminishing one of his basis for authority.

availing themselves of the playgrounds in the city's parks.<sup>50</sup>

The significant consequence for men was obviously the new distance between their home and their place of business.<sup>51</sup> Although the telephone was fairly current by 1914, and could be used to summon the men home in case of an emergency, men could no longer return for the noontime meal.<sup>52</sup> In general, there were fewer and fewer links between the husbands' daytime activities, and their home life.

---

<sup>50</sup>- One of the consequences of this outward push into Montreal's suburbia may have been the development and reinforcement of smaller geographic units, characterized by ethnic or religious homogeneity. Much has been made by urban historians of the development throughout the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries of the emergence of such culturally, ethnically and financially homogenous communities, (such as a block, or even a street) within the larger metropolitan area. See S. Olson, "Occupations as Cues to Social Structure in Nineteenth Century Montreal/ Les Professions indices de la structure sociale de Montréal, 1861-1891", Shared Spaces, 4 (1986).

Again, the effect of these culturally homogeneous would be felt more particularly by women, having less opportunity to leave their small neighborhoods, than for men, who travelled on the new electric tram system and worked within the larger metropolitan area. J.-P. Collin "La Cité sur mesure", p. 25.

<sup>51</sup>- This distance was particularly important for the middle class. This class could best afford the costs of transportation from home to work site. The working class, particularly those who were employed in the new, skill-less sectors were still bound to live as near as possible to their work site. S. Cross, "The Neglected Majority: The Changing Role of Women in 19th Century Montreal", Histoire sociale/Social History, VI, 12 (novembre-November, 1973), pp. 202-223.

<sup>52</sup>- According to John Cooper, by 1910, there were 30,000 subscribers.

One indicator of the separation between home and place of business was the establishment of male clubs, like the St. James Club (est. 1857, moved to new buildings in 1864, on the north-west corner of Dorchester and University). Other similar male only luncheon spots included the M.A.A.A., where women visitors and members were required to eat in a separate room. Until 1910, the bar and dining room of St. Lawrence Hall was still considered the ante-room of St. James Street. The Canadian Club luncheons, established in Montreal in 1911, were in their first year, male only. In the second year, a few women were invited to address the assembly, and women were permitted in the gallery to hear the speakers. They were not invited to sit at the tables. These male only clubs, some formal and others casual, served an important and new need of Montreal's middle and upper class: a congenial eating place for men only.<sup>53</sup> The geographic distance served to reinforce the division between home and work place, and the gender relations identified within.

These residential suburbs were perceived in a relatively ambivalent manner. On the one hand, it was undeniable that the environment was healthier away from the center. There were fewer people per square foot, and therefore, more surrounding greenspaces. The houses were

---

<sup>53</sup>- E. Collard, The Saint James Club: the Story of the Beginnings of the Saint James Club (Montreal, 1957). See also Cooper, op.cit., especially Chapter XXIII.

constructed of newer and safer materials, a particular concern considering the frequency of great urban fires throughout this period, as well as the attention being paid to preventative health care.<sup>54</sup> On the other hand, a rift was being created between home life and work place, which effectively removed women and children from the centers of business, thereby reinforcing gender differentiation, and changing the nature of domesticity.<sup>55</sup>

---

<sup>54</sup>- A. Adams "Architecture in the Family Way, 1870-1914", delivered at the McGill Center for the Study of Women, Fall 1990. Enormous energies were being spent cleaning up the city, and while much of this energy was directed at working class slums, the middle class did not neglect their own homes. Plumbing in particular was important: good drains were considered vital to good family health.

<sup>55</sup>- Like other aspects of urban life, the suburbs were seen as having both a negative and positive aspect. On the positive side, the new houses, and the greater amount of green spaces were seen as beneficial, especially to those who harkened back to the pastoral mythology. James Peabody, an important American reformer of the early twentieth century, saw the commuting as "a social movement which, beyond doubt, makes for the cleansing of social life, and the establishment of domestic unity. A suburban home is not a guarantee of domestic happiness, but it certainly makes a center of mutual attachment, thrift, and simplicity." Implied in this analysis was the idea that by isolating the home from the work place, the individuals would invest a greater amount of sentiment in the domestic sphere. Walter Rauschenbusch, another major American social reformer, saw the suburbs as a negative aspect of urban life. Particular to his criticism was the effect on the father, who not only has to work long hours, but has to spend precious time travelling from home to the work place, thereby depriving his family of his presence: "the element of fatherhood is missing". F. G. Peabody, Jesus Christ and the Social Question. An Examination of the teaching of Jesus in its relation to some of the problems of modern life (New York, 1907); W. Rauschenbusch, Christianity and the Social Crisis <1907> (New York, 1919.)

The home itself, its relationship to the street, and the determination of rooms and activities within the walls evolved throughout the period as well. Architecturally, from 1870 to 1892, Montreal's middle class homes were in a period of transition. The older ones, built after 1800 but before 1870, combined the open floor plan for the public spaces, and the bourgeois (closed) plan for the private spaces. The public rooms opened on to each other, with few corridors, (like the Parisian apartments), while the private spaces, the bedrooms, were small and quite separate from the public areas. Between 1870 and 1892, Montrealers began to abandon the open floor plan, even for the public spaces. Dining rooms and drawing rooms became separate from each other, and furthermore, with the addition of a corridor, separate from the rest of the house as well. As English Montrealers moved further west, the two story cottage style became popular.<sup>56</sup> Using the staircase as a filter, this style permitted a true separation between public spaces and private spaces. Bedrooms and bathrooms were on the top floor, while dining rooms and drawing rooms were on the ground floor. For the upper strata of the middle class, those who could afford the Terraces, however, the open floor plan for the public, (ground floor) was maintained throughout this period. New homes built for the Montreal middle class, particularly

---

<sup>56</sup>- Contemporary photographs of Ste. Catherines St. illustrate this architectural style.

after 1890, were set slightly off the street,<sup>57</sup> and such separation was continued within the homes, with outside staircases, vestibules, and hallways, all architectural devices designed to maintain the homes' integrity.<sup>58</sup>

In their analysis of housing in Montreal in 1901, Olson and Hanna distinguished seven types of housing, essentially based on rents.<sup>59</sup> According to their illustrations, only in the two highest rent groups were there three stories, and usable basement space, suggesting that a spacious lifestyle was not accessible to the greatest number of middle class families.<sup>60</sup> For the purposes of this discussion, Olson and

---

<sup>57</sup>- Contemporary photographs and the city's map of 1890 clearly show the place of the home in relation to the street. On predominantly middle class streets, Bleury or Peel, for example, there is a considerable distance between the house and the street.

<sup>58</sup>- This is not a phenomenon unique to Montreal, but has been observed in London, and in most American cities. See G. Wright, Moralism and the Model Home: Domestic Architecture and Cultural Conflict in Chicago, 1873-1913 (Chicago, 1980); D. Handlin, The American Home: Architecture and Society, 1815-1915 (Boston, 1979); and J. Burnett, A Social History of Housing, 1815-1970 (Newton Abbott, North Pomfret, 1978).

<sup>59</sup>- See also D. Hanna and S. Olson, "'Métiers, loyers et bouts de rue: l'armature de la société montréalaise, 1881 à 1901", Cahiers de géographie du Québec, 27, 71 (1983); J.-C. Marsan, Montreal in Evolution (Montreal, 1981).

<sup>60</sup>- The Square Mile mansions were most often built to individual specifications, each one a monument to its owner. The photographs of the interiors of these homes suggest a rich opulence. The vast space available permitted real segregation, both between the servants and the family, as well as between the family members themselves: billiard rooms, studies, and morning rooms were all gender and age specific.

Hanna's class four, five and six, with a median annual rent between 121 and 540 dollars are of particular interest. Only the very wealthiest of this group could afford housing, which permitted an opulent lifestyle. Those who could afford class 5 had two stories of a four story dwelling, while those in class 4 lived in one level of a three story flat.

Ignoring for a moment the wealthiest inhabitants of the city, one might argue that the English middle class of Montreal could be divided into two distinct sub-groups, based on their housing. The first group, equivalent to Olson and Hanna's group six, could afford to live in what might be termed miniature mansions, and conduct their domestic activities accordingly. Such housing enabled the inhabitants to segregate their household by age and gender, in a manner similar to those who inhabited the opulent Mansions, but on a smaller scale. The kitchen and servants' quarters occupied the basement, while the children could be essentially isolated on the third floor. The segregation of the family and the servants was considered so important that in 1888, when the 'old' Sherbrooke Apts. were built (corner Sherbrooke and Crescent) the servants' quarters, as well the kitchen facilities for each unit, were distinct from the

apartment itself.<sup>61</sup> Such domestic arrangements were not continued in the extension of the building, built in 1909, but whether it was because of the strategic difficulties inherent in such distances, or simply because the price of land was such as to make it unattractive, the records do not explain. In the New Sherbrooke, a small bedroom was attached to a small kitchen.

The second grouping of the middle class, equivalent to Olson and Hanna's groups four and five, numerically larger, lived in domestic spaces which did not permit such gender/age segregation. Neither the kitchen (and the servants) nor the children could be isolated to any significant extent. Even in the well heeled suburb of Westmount, developers built these relatively modest homes. Although some of the homes did have a back staircase, there was often only enough space for a single servant. The kitchen was most often placed in the back of the main floor, leaving the front for the living and dining areas. Few of

---

<sup>61</sup>- The appeal of segregation was so strong, in fact, that some houses were built on very thin lots, but with three stories, and a serviceable basement. That these homes were only 1 room wide, and perhaps at best, 3 rooms deep, (often with poor acoustics,) did not obviously detract from their desirability, since it permitted an (uncomfortable) recreation of the mansion domesticity.

The manner by which servants were segregated from the family varied depending on the city. In Paris, for example, the "grands appartements" were designed with each apartment's maid's rooms on the top floor. There was no direct access from the apartments to the maid's rooms.

these homes had bathrooms downstairs.<sup>62</sup> Upstairs, the bedrooms (usually four) were small, and only two faced the street. There was rarely a room which could be designated as a study, and no space for an office, or 'surgery'. The homes retained one important feature from the Terraces, the alleyways, permitting a certain discretion for more plebeian activities, and the maintenance of the respectable facade.<sup>63</sup>

The houses inhabited by the majority of Montreal's middle class suggest a small household. There was not enough room for boarders, or extra servants. Nor was there enough space for much separation between parents and children, although one could assume that children of a very young age could be somewhat contained at the back of the house, the kitchen, back staircase and smaller, back bedrooms.<sup>64</sup> Finally, there was no designated, or separate space for the

---

<sup>62</sup>- Montreal's water system was surprisingly well established already by 1850. According to David Hanna, this condition permitted the initial movement away from the old core, onto the terraces. D. Hanna, "Creation of an Early victorian Suburb...".

<sup>63</sup>- Ibid.

<sup>64</sup>- One must, however, be careful about assuming that segregation in these homes was possible. According to Claudette Lacelle, servants were a precious commodity. After the 1880's, manuals appeared for both servant and mistress, detailing exact duties and demands. While Claudette Lacelle does not address the problem of child care, one could question whether or not the care of small children was pro-forma, or personality dependent. C. Lacelle, "Les Domestiques dans les villes canadiennes au XIXe siècle: effectifs et conditions de vie", Histoire sociale/Social History, XV, 29 (mai-May 1982), pp. 181-208.

adults, and particularly the father, in which to isolate themselves. While the three storied terraces did have such a space, and those who built their own homes on large lots often included such a space, the bulk of middle class housing did not have an adult, or male only space.<sup>65</sup>

Compared to the working class houses built in the same period, this floor space appears as relative largess. In comparison, however, with the larger three story homes of the earlier period, these more modest homes suggest the growing presence of a real 'middle' class whose life styles differed enormously from their social betters, most notably in the ability to divide their homes by age or gender. The physical distance and separation between the home and the workplace made the traditional integrated domesticity impossible to maintain. On the other hand, multiple use of the inner space, indicates a new domesticity, one more intimate, if only by necessity.

---

<sup>65</sup>- Sir William Dawson had a study in his house, a room the children entered only for a particular reason (Manuscript reminiscences of George Dawson, written after his father's death, George Mercer Dawson Papers, Rare Book Department, McLennan Library, McGill University). William Lighthall's home, Chateaucclair, built after the birth of his second child, included a study. (Lighthall Family, Rare Book Department, McLennan Library, McGill University).

\*\*\*\*

Montreal was not London, New York or Paris. It had neither the Ancien Régime charm of Quebec City, nor the close cohabitation of mud and ostentation of Winnipeg. Montreal was throughout the period the premiere city of Canada: home of the national industrial, commercial and financial magnates. It was also the site of the worst national slums.

Members of Montreal's middle class lived in the midst, and often between, such excess. Their homes were scattered over the escarpment, squeezed between the mansions on the hill, and the slums on the other side of the tracks. They benefited from the cultural pursuits of the most advantaged, and worried about the dangerous epidemics which rose with the vapors from below the hill. The English Protestants, a numeric minority on the island, were vibrant members of the greatest Empire since Alexander's. Their religious community was served by some of the most distinguished ministers of the day, which in turn contributed towards making their University one of the most prestigious of the country.

Montreal's urban geography underwent tremendous change between 1870 and 1914. Public buildings became taller, the urban sprawl extended the living boundaries of the city beyond the Mountain, thanks especially to an expanded

network of inner-city communications, most notably the electric tram system, and the telephone.

These conditions contributed to the breakdown of the traditional form of integrated domesticity: a domesticity which while it divided the household by gender, was nevertheless characterized by the close proximity of work and home spaces, as well as a family economy directed by a single manager, the father. In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, this form of domesticity was challenged by the extension of the urban space, and with it the ghettoization of women and children into exclusively residential neighborhoods.

On the eve of the Great War, Montreal's English Protestant fathers were distanced from their families throughout their days, and lived with them in intimate spaces in the evenings. These visible changes were reinforced and challenged by various social and cultural institutions which advanced new ideals of fatherhood to meet these new conditions. The following chapter will examine how religious institutions and their leaders, in this case, Protestant churches, responded to and attempted to alter the new middle class father.

Chapter II  
'Wise Authority'  
The Image of the Father in Reform Literature

Throughout the latter half of the nineteenth and the first decade of the twentieth centuries, Christian churches in Canada, Great Britain, and the United States grappled with the changing social and economic conditions, caused by industrialization and urbanization, as well as the intellectual challenges brought on by Charles Darwin's The Origin of the Species, and the work of the German school of Higher Criticism. Visible poverty, more particularly, urban squalor, and the difficulties of incorporating the assumptions and assertions of the new science into traditional theology fundamentally challenged the churches' theological and social relevance. The churches' response was to move the pulpit closer to the people, taking a more

active role in finding solutions for these social ills.<sup>1</sup> In this search for social relevance, the role of the family, and the relationship between its members, were also redefined. This chapter will examine how the reform tradition and social gospel in Montreal contributed to the redefinition of the role of the father from 1870 to 1914.

The traditional role of the father changed during this period, becoming in many respects a shared, public responsibility. The whole thrust of the social gospel and the reform movement was to extend the claims of the community over private, individual interests.<sup>2</sup> The father's traditional functions as mediator between the family and the community, and as high priest of the household, were subverted as alternative forms of religious participation became available for other family members, and as his own

---

<sup>1</sup>- See A. B. McKillop, Disciplined Intelligence: Critical Inquiry and Canadian Thought in the Victorian Era (Montreal, 1979); C. Berger, The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1867-1914 (Toronto, 1970); C. Berger, Science, God and Nature in Victorian Canada (Toronto, 1983).

<sup>2</sup>- R. Allen, The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-1928 (Toronto, 1971); R. Cook, The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada (Toronto, 1985); R. Wiebe, The Search For Order, 1877-1920 (New York, 1967); W. H. Magney, "The Methodist Church and the National Gospel, 1884-1914", The Bulletin (1969), pp. 3-95.

role of provider (actor in the public world) stripped him of the requisite rectitude.<sup>3</sup>

The first part of this analysis of the changing role of the middle class father will examine two keystone ideas of late nineteenth century reform: the changing conception of childhood and muscular Christianity. Although the subject of this study is neither children, nor men per se, it will be important to understand a few of the key perceptions of childhood as well as some of the more socially accepted elements of masculinity. The second part will examine the specific advice addressed to young men, fathers and heads of households in religiously inspired advice manuals. The analysis of this prescriptive literature will indicate some

---

<sup>3</sup>- In an examination of private papers of English families from 1800 to 1850, Roberts has suggested that there were important differences in styles of fatherhood between those of wealthy Anglican landowners, (whose households were often extended) and the emerging urban evangelical middle classes. "For the urban and devout father the family became a work of art and a duty to God; for the rural and conventionally Anglican father it was an ancient and tried institution." (p. 69) Another consideration, however, and one which has nothing to do with religion is the father's time and place and profession. Roberts' 'Anglican landowners' were also the great explorers, military men, or politicians whose lives were devoted to the growth and maintenance of the Empire, while his 'evangelical, urban fathers' were most often barristers, or early industrialists, whose occupation permitted them a close relationship between the home and the work place. D. Roberts, "The Paterfamilias of the Victorian Governing Classes", in A. Wohl ed., The Victorian Family: Structure and Stresses (London, 1978), pp. 35-51. While certain religions and denominations may have definite precepts about the family and child-raising, the father, as provider, also had to respond to the needs of his business, in order to keep his family fed and cared for.

of society's behavioral and intellectual axioms for men entering adulthood, or already a parent.

The reform movement was motivated by an ideal, translated into reality by benevolent organizations, nourished in turn by a large literature. The remaining sections of this chapter will examine two different applications of this reform spirit. The third section is an analysis of the image of the father in the illustrative stories found in temperance literature. Because of the heat of the temperance debate, these writers were quick to take advantage of a vulnerable institution -the family- to make their point. The dramatic consequences of alcohol on members of the family indicate where these reformers felt the family was most in danger of collapsing. The final section will examine how the reform ideology animated a specific Montreal social agency, The Boy's Home, established in 1870. An analysis of the Boy's Home Annual Reports will indicate how Montrealers organized these charitable services, and the kinds of masculine and paternal qualities considered desirable by their middle class Montreal administrators.

The sources used for this analysis include advice literature, assorted published sermons, annual reports of several Montreal agencies, articles in religious periodicals, and the novels written by Ralph Connor. Faced with what they perceived to be a declining civilization, beset by alcohol, crime, and disease, these religiously

inspired authors wrote to rouse their readers to create the Kingdom of God: a Kingdom available here on earth, if each did his or her share. This literature was prescriptive rather than descriptive in nature. The authors urged, and implored, better conduct. They rarely described contemporary situations, except as examples of where things had gone sadly wrong.<sup>4</sup>

The sample of advice literature and temperance tracts used was wholly selected from the Canadian Information of Historical Material index (CHIM).<sup>5</sup> An effort has been made to select those books written by clergymen, or lay people inspired by religious sentiment, and whenever possible special stress has been placed on those writers published or living in Montreal. These books are not merely reflections of the author's individual point of view but represent the

---

<sup>4</sup>- As Linda Pollock as argued, the distinction between prescriptive and descriptive advice books is an important one to make. See Forgotten Children: Parent-Child Relations, 1500-1900 (Cambridge, New York, 1983), pp. 43-47.

<sup>5</sup>- The CHIM index is the most thorough tool available at the present time for Canadian material published before 1900. According to the introduction issued with the index of CHIM, the selection was dependent on the Canadian nature of the publication, either in content, place of publication, or author. Its use assures that only literature of Canadian relevance will be selected for analysis.

The reform movement, and the social gospel, as much as any other cultural or intellectual expression in Canada at this time, drew on ideas and even organizations coming from the United States and Great Britain. Since this study's focus is the city of Montreal, efforts have been made to highlight the expressions of reform emanating from that city, although many ideas, institutions, books and tracts were imported.

general view of childhood and fatherhood, held by the larger Protestant community. As such, they are a barometer of the Protestant perception of parents and children.<sup>6</sup>

The failure to examine other, more obvious sources of information requires some explanation. This study had originally intended to use sermons preached in Montreal during the years under study, for reasons which appear self-evident. Regular churchgoing was a mark of genteel respectability, and the sermon, a subject of discussion over Sunday lunch or dinner. As such, it might have served as the basis for both individual and communal religious debate. There are, however, very few complete published sermons either from Montreal ministers, or by visitors, and those that were published concern themselves with public or civic issues, or special events, such as the conflict between science and religion.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup>- The late nineteenth century was not the first time in history that advice books were written for parents, and the books examined for this study conform to the general trend of parental advice books analyzed by Linda Pollock, op.cit.. These books are generally of two types, prescriptive and descriptive, and were written with the aim of encouraging the reader to take greater control of their children's lives, a characteristic of parental advice books found as early as the seventeenth century. The nature of these Canadian books therefore conforms to the traditional pattern of advice books. It is the content of these books which is unique to the period.

<sup>7</sup>- Questions of the Day (Montreal, 1885).

A second source examined was religious periodicals.<sup>8</sup> These were found to be surprisingly silent on the subject of the family, and especially of fathers. The majority of articles discussed missions, home and abroad, and other reform movements, especially the temperance movement. A few articles discussed literature, public health, and the Sabbath School movement.

Why are these two sources, which might be expected to have been so rich in information about the religious image of the family and the role of the father, so poor? Did the family have such an important place in theology that it remained beyond debate? Alternatively, does the time frame of this study hide the religious debate on the family? According to several American and British studies,<sup>9</sup> by 1870, a consensus had formed. Theologians had already debated the nature of childhood and original sin, and the relationship between the Church and children, so that throughout the period under study, other issues, such as the

---

<sup>8</sup>- The Presbyterian Record (Montreal); The Methodist Monthly and Review (Toronto); The Canada Presbyterian (Toronto); The Witness (Montreal); University Magazine (Montreal); The Canadian Methodist Magazine (Toronto, Montreal, Halifax).

<sup>9</sup>- Some American historians would put the date as early as 1848, the year Bushnell's On Christian Nurture was published. M. Ryan, Cradle of the Middle Class: the Family in Oneida County, New York, 1790-1865 (Cambridge, New York, 1981), p. 100. See also L. Davidoff and C. Hall, Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class, 1780-1850 (London, 1984); and A. Douglas, The Feminization of American Culture (New York, 1988).

need for the community's salvation were more important. If the Canadian context is similar to the American and British, then by 1870 the family was apparently taken for granted as being essential to the reform process, and no longer a focus of debate. The only remaining debate was the relationship between the individual and society as a whole.

# I

"Spare the rod, and spoil the child."

"Suffer the little children to come unto me."

These two quotations represent the two extremes of Protestant attitudes towards children during the nineteenth century. The sentiments inherent in the first quotation dominated the early part of the century, whereas in the later decades of the century, the emphasis was placed on Jesus' invitation to the children to approach him. Social historians have considered the perception of the nature of childhood as one of the more important indicators of the development of the 'modern' middle class family.<sup>10</sup> The consequences of this theological development went beyond the

---

<sup>10</sup>- P. Ariès, L'Enfant et la vie familiale sous l'Ancien Régime, Nouvelle édition, (Paris, 1973); J.-L. Flandrin, Familles, parenté, maison, sexualité dans l'ancienne société (Paris, 1976); Ryan, op.cit.; Douglas, op.cit.; N. Sutherland, Childhood in English Canadian Society: Framing the Twentieth-Century Consensus (Toronto, 1976).

child and included ideas about parenthood, and in the final analysis, about society.

Exactly when the perception of childhood changed from being considered a state of inherent evil to the personification of good is a debatable point. Some have argued that the nature of childhood as being malevolent was fundamentally challenged by the publication of Rousseau's Emile.<sup>11</sup> Others have argued that in the United States, it was the publication in 1848 of Horace Bushnell's On Christian Nurture.<sup>12</sup> Still others have traced the origin of childhood as a state of innocence to the poetry of the Romantics, especially Wordsworth, and other 'Lakers'.<sup>13</sup> By the 1850's it seems that there was, amongst the North American Protestant community, a general acceptance that childhood was not a state reminiscent of Original Sin, but

---

<sup>11</sup>- As Linda Pollock has argued, however, if one examines parent-child relationships through family papers, even as far back as the early Puritans, one finds very little to support the hypothesis that parents were 'monsters of authority,' beating the devil out of their children, and warping their will. Despite the harsh words of the ministers from their pulpits, Linda Pollock found that parents were permissive, rather than strict disciplinarians.

<sup>12</sup>- Ryan, op.cit., p. 100.

<sup>13</sup>- W. Johnson, Sons and Fathers: The Generation Link in Literature, 1780-1980 (New York, 1985). One common thread between all these points of origin is the identification of the perception of childhood as being a state of nature; when nature is no longer perceived as malevolent, neither is childhood.

rather of Eden.<sup>14</sup> Implicit, but not yet fully developed, in this new vision of childhood, was the idea that corruption came from without, and that it no longer stemmed inevitably from man's nature.

One example of this new vision of innocent childhood is drawn from the sermons appended to James Henderson's biography and provides a case in point. In a sermon entitled "The Coronation of Childhood", he equates the quality of grace needed to be with Christ as being similar to the state of childhood: loving, kind, innocent of all adult doubt and self-consciousness.<sup>15</sup> According to Henderson, it was the adult world, full of confusion, skepticism, difficulties and troubles, which separated men from God. Children loved God naturally, and had a 'natural' aptitude for understanding things of the higher realm. Consequently, adults should look towards the child and emulate their innocence.

The ramifications of such a vision are far reaching. On one level, this theology suggests that the 'adult' world is

---

<sup>14</sup>- This evolution was not absolutely consistent amongst all the Protestant denominations. The Salvation Army (established in Montreal in 1884) still held to the idea that children needed very firm, but not harsh guidance and discipline. See for example, General Booth, The Training of Children (London, 1884). One of the earliest Canadian expressions of innocent childhood was made in 1875, published in 1882 by Henry Fletcher Bland, Universal Childhood Drawn to Christ (Toronto, 1882).

<sup>15</sup>- "Except ye become as a little child, ye shall not enter the Kingdom of Heaven". "The Coronation of Childhood" (no date), in S. Bland, The Life of James Henderson D.D. (Toronto, 1926), in appendix.

flawed and corrupting, and that it is the 'natural' state of childhood which is blessed. Implied in this theology is a call for a reexamination of the role of discipline; harsh discipline would harm the fragile, innocent soul, and indeed, it would be unnecessary since misbehavior was no longer seen as the expression of inherent evil. One anonymous contributor to the Canadian Methodist Magazine expressed this faith in gentleness in the following manner:

The force of love is greater than that of sternness.... Need I add that the same principle applies to parents in the training of their children in the nurture and admonition of the Lord. You say you have tried everything with your sons and daughters; let me ask you if you have tried gentleness, and let me beseech you to make the experiment of that.<sup>16</sup>

Furthermore, such a theory implies that sin was not an inherent quality in man, but a function of his environment. Reformers of the late nineteenth century were certainly in agreement with this idea as articulated by Henderson, and many groups were organized to eradicate those qualities in the environment most likely to contribute to man's unhappiness and evil.

One of the more important consequences of this theology was the growth of various religious based reform oriented

---

<sup>16</sup>- In The Canadian Methodist Magazine, 17, 2 (August, 1883), p. 179. See N. Semple, "'The Nurture and Admonition of the Lord': Nineteenth Century Canadian Methodism's Response to 'Childhood'", Histoire Sociale/Social History, XIV,, 27 (mai/May, 1981), pp. 460-475, for a more detailed examination of the evolution of this idea in Methodist thought.

organizations. These groups were organized along gender or peer group lines, and were quite distinct from the family unit the Churches had traditionally used to mobilize their members.<sup>17</sup> The purpose of these groups was two-fold: to encourage religious study, or, to function within the larger charity network of the city. The Annual Reports of the Church of St. Paul's contain a listing of groups, the analysis of which gives an indication of their number and nature.<sup>18</sup> Amongst others were the Dorcas League, the Ladies' Association, and the Young Men's Literary Society. It boasted a large Sunday School, with an attendance of over 100 children, and over 25 teachers. St Paul's also ran a mission on St. Antoine Street. Finally, there was a Bible Study class, led by the minister, which met on Sunday afternoons, "to encourage the youth of the congregation in

---

<sup>17</sup>- This 'corporate' approach is examined in Mary Ryan's study of Utica, New York. She suggests that the revivals of the 1810's, 1820's and 1830's are a key to understanding the development of the renewed emphasis on the individual after 1850. A recent analysis of one Montreal based group, organized by women in the late nineteenth century is J. Wolfe and G. Strachan, "Practical Idealism: Women in Urban Reform, Julia Drummond and the Montreal Parks and Playgrounds Association", in C. Andrew and B. M. Milroy, eds., Life Spaces: Gender, Household, Employment (Vancouver, 1988), pp. 65-80.

<sup>18</sup>- Other denominations were even more 'group' oriented. The Methodists added to these types of group the famous Epworth League for young boys and girls. Magney, op.cit..

the systematic study of the Holy Scriptures."<sup>19</sup> If one added to these church led groups the neighborhood organizations, such as the Y.M.C.A., the M.A.A.A., numerous school activities, such as the Cadets, and, after 1911, the Boy Scouts, there were indeed a plethora of socially conscious peer groups to choose from.<sup>20</sup>

The consequences to family life of these reform peer groups was a splitting up of the unit. Just as the monopoly of the minister as community leader was being challenged by the scientists and the social workers, so too was the father's monopoly on moral authority over his family. The father was no longer the undisputed mentor of his children. He was assisted, even usurped, by Sunday School teachers, Boy Scout leaders, perhaps even by swimming instructors. Children no longer needed to enter the religious and social community through their fathers; religious and secular groups accepted them independently.

The challenge these groups posed to the moral authority of the parents, but particularly to that of the father, was evident even in 1880. The evolution of Sunday School from a family oriented Bible Study class held on Sunday afternoon

---

<sup>19</sup>- Presbyterian church, on the corner of Dorchester and Monique. Church of St. Paul's, Montreal, Annual Report, 1879.

<sup>20</sup>- Throughout this entire period, childhood was being redefined, in both religious and secular terms. Sociologists and pre-Freudian psychologists were examining childhood's different stages: as a result kindergartens and age specific grades in the school systems were established.

for the whole family to a forum of religious education designed exclusively for children was decried by some as a means for parents to abdicate their moral responsibility. In one letter to the editor of The Canada Presbyterian:

That by this undue attention to Sabbath School work, the parents have been crippled in their preparation and fitness for imparting home instructions....The sad consequence is that the parent as such has been unfitted for his own proper work, and thus between crippled and wronged parents and incompetent Sabbath School teachers the condition of our children must necessarily be deplorable, and ten years hence the children will be anything but desirable citizens or strong, useful members of churches. The causes of this parental neglect we believe lie deeper than the Sabbath School system- viz. in the over eager anxiety of fathers to make riches, the luxurious sloth that comes of the fashion of this world, and in not a few instances from a style of pulpit ministration whose tendency with the hearers is away from the unexplored riches of the world of God.<sup>21</sup>

John McEwan's letter suggests the presence of a minority viewpoint within the community, one which did not find the slow encroachment of public power into the private world an acceptable solution to social decay. McEwan's letter suggests that solutions to the problems should come from within the family, rather than through the imposition of some external agency. Finally, this letter underlines the problems some men felt were being caused by the ever increasing demands of providing for their families. To a certain extent, the family no longer functioned as the

---

<sup>21</sup>- Signed John McEwan. The Canada Presbyterian, 1, 16 (February 15, 1878), p. 242, and Ibid., 1, 10 (January 4, 1878).

center of religious instruction or devotion.<sup>22</sup> There were available, legitimate and alternative forms of religious activity which could function just as effectively. The reality of the father as high priest of his household was sorely challenged by the authority of the Sunday School teacher.

A second and more serious challenge to the father's authority came from within his own home, as the feminine became equated with, probity, piousness, and purity.<sup>23</sup> The 'women on a pedestal' quickly incorporated an almighty motherhood, as the following quotation from the editorial column in The Canada Presbyterian makes clear:

Of all auxiliaries of the Sunday School- and there are many- the mother is the most important and influential there is. And this follows necessarily from what a mother is! She is the heart of the Home. Her spirit broods upon it, and is the grand formative force that falls upon every child. The destinies of the children are in her hands. She sows the seed of future harvests. She implants the principles of future actions. She gives direction to the currents of life. Being in league with the central power of the child's life she can make it or mar it. If there is one fact, one grand and prominent fact that the lives of all men teach us, from the beginning of the world, until now, it is this,

---

<sup>22</sup>- The extent to which parents appear to have lost their 'natural' ability to instruct their children in moral realm is suggested by an editorial in Ibid., 16, 20 (May 11, 1887), p. 313, in which the proper manner for parents to conduct religious instruction is explained in great detail.

<sup>23</sup>- See Appendix A for a brief examination of the expression of the 'women on a pedestal' ideal expounded in advice books for young women.

that the influence of the mother is paramount, superior to all others.<sup>24</sup>

Caught between this glorification of the feminine and the alternative agencies with their respective leaders, the father's absolute authority within his own home was slowly eroding.<sup>25</sup>

The theory of evolution, and especially social Darwinism, compounded this reevaluation of childhood, in several ways.<sup>26</sup> The most important consequence was the idea that society was evolving in the same way that animal life had evolved. This possibility of a new society suggested to

---

<sup>24</sup>- Ibid., 1, 1, (November 2, 1877).

<sup>25</sup>- The invention of the "mother instinct" is an interesting indication of the admixture of social Darwinism, and the new appreciation of childhood, and could be considered the ultimate expression of the 'Cult of Motherhood'. The 2nd. Annual Report, of the Montreal Directory of Women, (Montreal, 1915) an agency established in 1914 to train unmarried mothers for domestic service is revealing. The three objectives of this establishment were to keep the mother and child together, to bring the father to a realization of his paternal responsibilities, (this would keep the dissolute from completely falling, and would redeem him by making him save his money) and finally, to train the unmarried mother so that she may fulfill her parental obligations usefully and happily. "The strongest instinct in the world- mother love- cannot be repressed and deliberately deadened without a corresponding lowering of the whole moral character. Common experience shows that mother love can strengthen and purify a women's nature." (p. 9).

<sup>26</sup>- Despite some ferocious hostility towards the theory of evolution, some elements and assumptions readily became part of almost every aspect of life. The General of the Salvation Army incorporated the idea of inherited characteristics to show that goodly and Godly parents had more chances of bearing a God fearing child. General Booth, op.cit., p. 5.

many that children were vitally important to the coming of the New Jerusalem. In a sense, this vision of a renewable society put a premium on the flexibility of youth, as compared to the wisdom of age, as the cutting edge of societal change. And, by emphasizing the importance of the next generation, and therefore the need to nurture it, rather than break its will, the emphasis in child rearing shifted from punitive (strict) to nurturing (lenient), from father to mother.

## II

A second consequence of the theory of evolution was a renewed emphasis on physical fitness. Particularly in the cities, and amongst the working classes, children suffered from malnutrition and the effects of childhood diseases were permanently crippling.<sup>27</sup> This generation which was to show such power and had within it such potential, was sickly, and therefore useless. One of the primary functions of inner city missions, after Bible story reading, was physical fitness. A healthy body began to be seen as an important

---

<sup>27</sup>- This perception accounts for the establishment of the Fresh Air Funds. Montreal's Fresh Air fund was initiated by Mr. Hugh Graham, the editor of the Star, in 1887.

precondition to a healthy and Godfearing soul.<sup>28</sup> Youth groups began to be organized for mental and physical development,<sup>29</sup> and lobbies were created for school

---

<sup>28</sup>- Frederick Farrar, Archdeacon of Westminster, wrote: It has been felt that Christianity has a duty here and now on earth, in this life, to men's bodies as well as their soul. It has even been felt that, if we disregard the hunger and misery of their bodies, we cannot effectually touch or reach their souls. Social and Present Day Questions, 2nd. ed. (London, 1902), p. 18.

<sup>29</sup>- The Boy's Home, Montreal, Annual Report (1901) reports the introduction of a Drill, under the supervision of a sergeant, formerly of the Highlanders. High Schools of the Protestant School Board organized Cadet classes after school. The Church of St. James the Apostle (established in 1864, corner of Bishop's and Ste. Catherines Street) had a Church Lads Brigade which met Thursday evenings for drill. The leader of the Brigade was also a Boy Scout member, and all members of the Brigade had to attend Church and Bible Class. Pearson, op.cit.. The agencies which served both sexes included special child care classes for women and girls, emphasizing hygiene and nutrition. See Sutherland, op.cit.; N. Sutherland, "To Create a Strong and Healthy Race": School Children in the Public Health Movement, 1880-1914" History of Education Quarterly 12, 3 (1972), pp. 304-333; C. Bacchi, "Race Regeneration and Social Purity. A Study of the Social Attitudes of Canada's English-Speaking Suffragists" Histoire sociale-Social History XI, 22 (novembre/November, 1978), pp. 460-474.

gymnasiums.<sup>30</sup> Even the churches themselves altered their architecture to include halls large enough for games.<sup>31</sup>

Amongst the middle class, the importance of the physical health of their children was evident. There may have been less concern about nutrition, but there was a constant solicitude about physical education in school, and during holidays.<sup>32</sup> The playground movement can be understood within this perspective as well.<sup>33</sup> Even within

---

<sup>30</sup>- "The gist of Dr. Mackensie's address was that modern conditions had done away with the time when hard outdoor work for the young laid a foundation of physical strength which would last through a maturity of less healthful conditions. And unless some means were found to combat such a position, he argued that there would ultimately come a reduction in the national physique which would react upon the progress of the people." R. Tait Mackensie, "Canada's Opportunity in Physical Education", Addresses Delivered Before the Canadian Club of Montreal, 1911-1912, p. 175.

<sup>31</sup>- St. Mathias, (Anglican) and Urskine Church (Unitarian). Such indoor spaces corresponded to the development of playgrounds, made necessary by the inclement weather of the city.

<sup>32</sup>- Letters written to parents or friends from holidays always mentions how active and strong the children look playing in the sand or walking in the woods. Private schools built in Montreal during this period for the Anglophone-Protestant community include some physical education on the curriculum, even for girls. M. Westley, Remembrance of Grandeur: Montreal's Anglo-Protestant Elite, 1900-1950 (Montreal, 1990), Chapter 3.

<sup>33</sup>- It was not just the creation of space for children to play in which concerned these reformers. They were also lobbying for organization, and supervision of these playgrounds. Miss J. Schoenfield, Field Secretary of the Playgrounds Association of America, "Recreational Survey of Montreal" Addresses Before the Canadian Club of Montreal, 1912-1913 Season, and J. A. Riis, "Our Grip on the Morrow", Methodist Monthly and Review (June, 1904).

the universities, bastions of the middle class, the appeal was made to integrate forms of physical exercise into the curriculum.<sup>34</sup>

Much the same momentum for the physical education of youth was developing in Great Britain and the United States. In Canada, however, this momentum had a unique cast to it, as the country was blessed with the all-important bracing northerly climate. According to social Darwinism, societies were seen to evolve just as species did, and much stress was placed on the invigorating nature of the northern climate in the refinement of Canadian society. Canadians felt themselves graced, not only because of their British institutions, (developed by a Northern race) but also because of their fortifying climate.<sup>35</sup> Canadians had a long association with winter sports, and during the last quarter of the nineteenth century, these were cloaked with a nationalistic flavour. Montrealers celebrated winter with the famous Winter Carnival, the symbol of which was the huge Ice Castle built in Dominion Square. Sir William Hingston, a mayor of Montreal, (1875-1877) wrote a book concerning the effect of climate on the human body, proving beyond "a

---

<sup>34</sup>- Tait Mackenzie, op.cit..

<sup>35</sup>- See Berger, op.cit., pp. 128-134. The Canada Firsters, and then many writers of fiction, had picked up the myth of the Great North, and developed it both as a distinguishing characteristic, as well as a rallying cry. Canada, being a country on the cutting edge of the twentieth century, could ill afford not to take advantage of the new ideas of social regeneration.

shadow of a doubt," that the Canadian climate conditioned its inhabitants to be the eventual leaders of Men.<sup>36</sup>

The mixture of nationalism and environmental determinism combined in Canada to create a particular form of manliness, a regional variant of Muscular Christianity.<sup>37</sup> On the one hand, Canada was part of the morally superior British Empire, inheritor of British

---

<sup>36</sup>- Dr. W. H. Hingston, The Climate of Canada and Its Relations to Life and Health (Montreal, 1884). See Frank Watt, "Nationalism in Canadian Literature", Carl Berger, "The True North Strong and Free", and Cole Harris, "The Myth of the Land in Canadian Nationalism", in P. Russell ed., Nationalism in Canada (Toronto, 1966).

<sup>37</sup>- See N. Vance, The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought (Cambridge, 1985), for a complete analysis of the causes and forms of Muscular Christianity as it was developed in Great Britain.

Essentially, Muscular Christianity was a response, on the part of certain theologians and writers, to the fear that men were finding themselves alienated from religion. The force alienating men from traditional theology was the perceived irrelevance of some earlier theology in this new, especially urban and industrial, world. Men, finding themselves in a fast-paced, economically fragile world, were perceived to be finding it difficult to reconcile the teachings of the Sunday sermon with the realities of the Monday morning business world. (It also seems as if some ministers were concerned that it was the men, rather than the women of their congregations, who were more affected by the higher criticisms provoked by Darwin's theory. For example, books and public addresses concerning the defense of Christianity appear to be more directed towards men. See the opening lecture in the series Questions of the Day (Montreal, 1885). Muscular Christianity was a response to several different causes, the ultimate effect of which was an alienation of men from the Church. The churches therefore tried to respond by making religion more manly, infusing theology with a particular force and vigour which found as its prime example Jesus Christ. General characteristics of Muscular Christianity include honor, strength of purpose, love of God, and a strong body, ready to perform christian acts at any time.

traditions, the evidence of God's grace being the extent of its territory. On the other hand, the country was ideally situated to create a strong and healthy race. The image of the true north, strong and free, was very much linked with the image of the fighting Christian man. What better environment to produce such a sterling character?

Except that the new character was not emerging. Playgrounds and drills were only one part of the solution. Novelists, like Ralph Connor, and writers of advice literature bent themselves to the task of enthusing this all important new generation of young Canadian men.<sup>38</sup> This population of youths, not yet encumbered with adult paraphernalia (wives and children), were a particular target for advice literature. The number of books suggest the new attention paid to 'youth' as a distinct developmental stage, one with particular problems and attitudes.<sup>39</sup> The anonymity

---

<sup>38</sup>- The authors of these books do not explicitly state the age of their intended reader, however, their numerous references to 'starting out' suggests that they were writing for young men, older than school age, but not yet firmly established in the adult world. For example, the strength of character shown by Ralph Connor's heroes is often demonstrated in the plot by the protagonists leaving their aging parents in the East (The Prospector, <1904>, Black Rock <1899>). One of the most prolific and creative fictional framers of the Canadian variant of muscular Christianity, Ralph Connor was also extremely popular. While the focus of the stories is not the development of the parent-child relationship, it is significant that the hero's adventure involves the distancing of the hero from his familiar and familial ties.

<sup>39</sup>- J. F. Kett, Rites of Passage: Adolescence in America 1790 to the Present (New York, 1977).

of life in ever expanding cities, the extended period of 'apprenticeship' for middle class youth, and the increasing social emphasis on materialism were perceived as threatening to this vulnerable stage of character development. The future of the nation depended on this group's strength and valor, the future of civilization depended on its moral rectitude.

The most striking aspect of the literature written for young men is the assumption that the audience was sadly in need of faith. The annual pastoral letters of James Barclay of St. Paul's Church, Montreal, almost always alluded to the necessity for the young men of the congregation to participate more fully in the activities of the Church.<sup>40</sup> Men of all ages were perceived as needing to be drawn back into the religious fold, which explains the quantity of theological and lay literature inspired by muscular Christianity. For the Rev. Jackson, as for others, young men felt alienated from the Church. They were indifferent, rather than hostile to the Christian message because, "...they have never realized that the ideal Christian life and the ideal manly life are one and the same thing."<sup>41</sup>

Now, if there is one thing that a young fellow hates more than another it is to be thought weak and

---

<sup>40</sup>- See for example the pastoral letters introducing the St. Paul's Church Annual Report of 1872, and 1887.

<sup>41</sup>- Rev. G. Jackson, First Things First: Addresses to Young Men (London, 1894), p. 84.

"womanish". He will go a long way sometimes towards making a fool of himself, but he will never, if he knows it, do aught that will lead his companions to think him 'soft'.<sup>42</sup>

Reverend Jackson went on to describe Jesus and his disciples as manly, 'plucky' men with moral courage, steadfastness of purpose, refinement of feeling, and perfection of sympathy. They were the epitome of men of character. Jackson makes an interesting connection between the manliness of Jesus as he threw down the tables of the money changers, and General Gordon during the siege of Khartoum.<sup>43</sup> To be Christian was not to be 'soft', or 'womanish'.

According to Ralph Connor, the most prolific of the creators of the fictionalized ideal of Canadian manliness, the danger to the Canadian male was in becoming morally lost in the challenges of modern day living, whether it be urban (Corporal Cameron <1912>, The Prospector <1904>) or rural

---

<sup>42</sup>- Ibid., p. 85.

<sup>43</sup>- An interesting chronological point is how these Empire saviors change over time. In 1860, the manliness writers use Havelock at Cawnpore, (Rev. Ebenezer Ross, The Manliness of Piety (Halifax, 1860), p. 14). In 1894, the example given is Gordon of Khartoum. British and Canadian writers often use these Empire soldiers to make their point, while the Americans seem to shy away from such overtly military examples, at least until the taking of San Juan Hill.

A comparative reading of similar literature for young women does not include sterling examples of individuals lives, such as Florence Nightingale, Dorethea Dix or Clara Barton (all of whom remained unmarried). Young women are urged to look to Miriam, mother of Moses, or the sainted mother of the Wesley's. To be great oneself was significantly less important than raising great men.

(Black Rock <1898>).<sup>44</sup> The climate virtually guaranteed a race of physical giants, but it was up to the men and youths to keep their sights on the higher things of life. The missionaries in these stories are not always themselves particularly strong men. In The Sky Pilot <1899> one of them actually dies a very young man, but they are not 'sissies' either.<sup>45</sup> Shock, the protagonist of The Prospector, was a rugby hero before he heard the call to mission out West. Regardless of their physical strength, or lack of it, Shock and the Sky Pilot succeed because of the power of their faith.

Almost without exception the authors of the advice books for young men begin their advice with injunctions to

---

<sup>44</sup>- Each environment poses its own problems. The city tends to make men lose sight of the common bonds of shared humanity. Shock's first lesson in the West was understanding that the social lines dividing men in the East were fabricated and untrue to a real community of men. (The Prospector). The urban environment is particularly detrimental to young men of the middle class, who in their ease forget the less fortunate. The Superintendent writes to Shock: "The upholstered seat of the Park Church pulpit does not induce the liveliest sympathy with the Western conditions." The Prospector (Toronto, 1904), p. 279.

Despite the clean air and the absence of artificial class barriers, the most damaging element of the West is the alcohol, which flows freely, even in Prohibition areas. It destroys good men and bad. Connor often uses the educated doctor to demonstrate how neither education, nor good breeding is any protection against alcohol. (The Doctor, <1906>).

<sup>45</sup>- The fear that religion sissified young men of the Victorian era is examined in many of the articles contained in J. Mangan and J. Walvin, eds., Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America (Manchester, 1987).

be good and God-fearing men. The usefulness of good character is often put in business terms. The sneak, the thief, the shifty-eyed will never 'get on' like the upright youth, because somehow, sometime their sins will find them out and their good name will be irretrievably lost. Fortunes can be re-couped, but a good character once lost can never be regained.<sup>46</sup> Reasons to maintain a good character include

---

<sup>46</sup>- Rev. F. E. Clarke, Our Business Boys (What 83 business men say) (Boston, 1884), chapter 1.

the importance of its legacy to one's children,<sup>47</sup> and the

---

<sup>47</sup>- It is a touching illustration of its values, that there is no legacy of more real moment to a child than the reputation of a parent. To have been the son of one whose memory lingers like light in the air is not only a delightful recollection, and a powerful stimulus, but a great material aid in life. No household can be called poor with such an inheritance, nor any parent really lost whose nobler life still survives in the breast of his children, and, while animating them to follow his example, predisposes others to befriend them.

C. Gelke, Entering on Life, A Book for Young Men, 10th ed., (London, 1882), p. 34. Parental influence, even beyond the grave, was a popular theme, and suggests the pervasiveness of the 'death cult' of the late-Victorian ethos. In one illustrative story, a man stands between two gravestones, his mother and father. "So influence lives. The instruction of these parents long since given, live again in that strong man to-day; to be reproduced and perpetuated in his children, and circulated over the enlarged circle into which the calling of the bowed in prayer shall defuse them. O, who can tell the influence of the righteous dead, while year after year, as sea waves, rolls away into eternity." Canada Presbyterian, 1, 2 (November 9 1877), p. 18. This story also suggests the power of moral suasion that some still felt was held by men, as parents. Over the years, this will disappear.

pride it affords one's parents.<sup>48</sup>

There is very little difference between the ideals of manliness as expressed by the authors of advice literature, and those dramatized by the novelists like Connor. Nor is there any significant difference in the presentation of the reader's present or future home life. Connor's stories are about young men on the Canadian frontier, where parental guidance, if any, is supplied by the manly minister. In the advice literature, there is little mention of a boy's present or future home.<sup>49</sup> Authors urge their readers to be good by referring themselves back to their home and asking

---

<sup>48</sup>- In his two published speeches, the Nova Scotia politician Joseph Howe, in 1859 (St. John Early Closing Association) and again in 1872 (YMCA, Ottawa)) urged his listeners to be responsible, thrifty and good, "...that the parents who dearly love you may be honoured by your behavior, and that the rising generations who come after you may be inspired by your example." J. Howe, Address to the YMCA of Ottawa February 27, 1872 (Ottawa, 1872), p. 2. His reference to parents is even more theatrical in his earlier speech:

Dumas novels, billiards, and bowling saloons are all very attractive, but we cannot live by these, and our first range of study should include those things by which we are to live. Aye! and perhaps by which others are to live. We may have a Father, broken by the storms and struggling with the cares of life- now lifted on a momentary wave of prosperity, now fainting in the though of the sea. How jolly we will feel when we can stretch out a helping hand and bear him into port. Lecture delivered before the St. John Early Closing Association at the Hall of the Mechanic's Institute (St. John, 1859), p. 6.

<sup>49</sup>- One interesting exception of this rule is in Ralph Connor's, The Patrol of the Sun Dance Trail <1914>, when at the end of the story, the hero's beautiful eyed infant son is brought down from the nursery to be admired. It is, however, significant that the hero never actually holds his own child.

"What will they think?" and "How can I do this great wickedness and yet win her love?"<sup>50</sup> These questions suggest that independent young men should look to their homes, past or future, to guide them in good behavior. As an ideal, Home functioned in this advice literature as a moral touchstone.

Boys were encouraged to honor their mother, as she was the emotional center of the home: "...for to raise the mother is to raise the race".<sup>51</sup> Long lists of great men who owed everything to their wonderful, self-sacrificing mothers is a common feature of these books. Examples include Napoleon, Moses, and the Wesley brothers.

Numerically, fathers are almost non-existent in the advice literature. There are few suggestions that fathers may be responsible for the family's moral welfare, or that the father may be a role model for his sons. The few references found in this literature indicate that fathers concerned themselves with the business world, and that their participation in a boy's life was to prepare him for the business world.<sup>52</sup> At the end of his life, Joseph Howe, in his introduction to a speech given in Ottawa at the Y.M.C.A. in 1872 reflected on the parental partnership:

---

<sup>50</sup>- Jackson, op.cit., p. 109.

<sup>51</sup>- Gelke, op.cit., p. 148.

<sup>52</sup>- Business success in the Connor books is not crucial at all to the hero's achievements.

To me the battle of life has been no boy's play, and I address you with a vivid impression of the work that lies before you, and of the dangers which beset the paths you are to tread, however they may be fenced in by a mother's thoughtful prayers or a father's forethought.<sup>53</sup>

Parents, according to Joseph Howe, act as their children's guardians and protectors. Mothers appear to be responsible for the spiritual aspects, while fathers concern themselves with concrete concerns. There are, however, few references to the role of the father in the young reader's life. He is not a spiritual guide, he is not even a business guide. At least in this literary genre, the image of the omnipotent Victorian paterfamilias is difficult to justify.

While these advice books and speeches directed at young men rarely discuss the reader's family, in the final analysis, and sometimes only implicitly, these authors encourage their readers to use the home as their moral yardstick. There is a conscious attempt by many of the authors to make the young men realize the larger social, familial and generational picture, which their new found independence might have made them forget. Their role in the home, past or future, is very rarely spelled out clearly.

---

<sup>53</sup>- Howe, Address to the Y.M.C.A...., p. 1. Such references to fathers in advice literature to young men, however slight, appear to diminish over time. This disappearance may be a result of the emphasis on the frontier as a new land, for young men, or it may be that as society rapidly underwent changes, technical, and intellectual, during the Laurier boom in Canada, the generational link between fathers and sons was even further diminished.

These advice books and novels were all written for young men, establishing their lives away from their familial home, and the clear emphasis is on the development of qualities needed to succeed in the public world, the world of business. In a way, this success in the business world, based on good character and manly bearing, is the young man's contribution to the maintenance of the private family. He keeps the family pure by providing for it and by maintaining his good public character. There is a marked silence concerning the young man's future role as father.<sup>54</sup>

The intense public interest in the creation of the new world placed the children at the cutting edge of the new morality, and mothers appear to have been considered the more capable parent to shape their formation. It would appear to be premature, based on negative evidence, to conclude that fathers had no place in the social regeneration. We shall therefore examine what was being said directly to fathers and heads of households in books written explicitly for them.

---

<sup>54</sup>- Needless to add that in the same type of literature written for young women at the same stage of life, the goal is to develop good nurturing skills which will be of use when the reader becomes the moral heart of her own home. See Appendix A for a brief analysis of the advice literature written for young women.

## III

This silent, absent father is at odds with the image and ideals proposed by those rare authors writing for the head of the home. In the CHIM index, two books only were written explicitly for fathers between 1870 and 1900. Those written for mothers, however, number over thirty. Either the fathers were so secure in their social and familial position or, by 1870, their role in their family was so marginal that no one even thought to address them. These two books, therefore, because of their rarity, take on a special importance.

In them fathers move from a silent, marginal character, to front and center of home life, responsible not only for the financial security of his spouse and children, but also for the moral tone of the household:

All government originated in patriarchal or parental authority, and families contain the rudiments of empires; and as the happiness of a nation may be promoted by the wisdom and justice of the legislature, so the welfare of a family depends most essentially on its government.<sup>55</sup>

This quotation introduces us to a key theme: the necessary reinforcement of parental, and particularly paternal authority, an authority necessary not only for the

---

<sup>55</sup>- J. E. Lancelly, The Domestic Sanctuary or the Importance of Family Religion (Hamilton, 1878), p. 52.

good of the family, but also for the good of the State. "The home is the foundation of all moral stability, and we touch the root of the social tree when we touch family life."<sup>56</sup>

The nature of this authority is derived from the father's role as "head of the house, as king and priest of the whole, and to him only, is deputed the authority of law and order. It is his right to rule. The outer world cares to know no one but him."<sup>57</sup> The father's absolute authority stems from both a religious and a secular base.

Although paternal authority was rooted in both the divine and the secular realms, its nature was unambiguously benevolent. The favorite biblical image was found in the story of the prodigal son. Patience and understanding are paternal virtues, exceeded only by the patience of the mother, and ultimately that of Jesus Christ himself.<sup>58</sup> While a well ordered family life "requires proper authority and rule" it was not to be "arbitrary authority or by the reign of brute force". It had to be a 'wise' authority.<sup>59</sup> Neither of the authors counseled striking the child, although the consequences of 'overfondness' were inevitably

---

<sup>56</sup>- Rev. J. Thompson, Lambs in the Fold; or the Relation of Children to the Church and their Proper Christian Nurture (Montreal, 1893), p. 183-4.

<sup>57</sup>- Ibid., p. 13.

<sup>58</sup>- Ibid., p. 121.

<sup>59</sup>- Ibid., p. 157.

'desolation of poverty, or the walls of prison'.<sup>60</sup> Contrary to expectations, few models of biblical fathers were used as examples of such benevolent behavior.<sup>61</sup> There was no mention of David's forgiveness of Absalom, or of Abraham's readiness to sacrifice his only son, and very little about Joseph of Nazareth, except in his role as support for Mary, who was given all the credit for raising Jesus.<sup>62</sup>

Considering the number and stature of biblical father figures, and that benevolence was considered a positive element in fatherhood, the omission of such examples is striking. A rare reference to biblical fathers was to the story of Ahab and Jezebel, which cautions heads of households against giving too much power to their wives, thereby causing familial and social chaos.<sup>63</sup> The wife had the conceded right to guide the house.<sup>64</sup> Her judgement was therefore very important; however, Lanceley was concerned that the father had conceded too much power to his wife. In the final analysis, the father must bear the ultimate

---

<sup>60</sup>- Lanceley, op.cit., p. 124.

<sup>61</sup>- See Appendix B for an analysis of some of the more prominent biblical fathers.

<sup>62</sup>- Thompson, op.cit., p. 203.

<sup>63</sup>- Lanceley, op.cit., Chapter III.

<sup>64</sup>- Ibid., p. 15.

responsibility; both because he is the priest, and also because he is, by nature, wiser.<sup>65</sup>

The image of the father bearing final responsibility for his children disappeared in the fifteen years which separated Lancelly's work from Thompson's.<sup>66</sup> In 1893 the Rev. John Thompson, of Sarnia, Ontario, portrayed the father as having lost almost all moral power to his wife. The Christian Home was governed by the mother, whom he called the 'head professor'.<sup>67</sup> Although Rev. Thompson makes an interesting case, based on Old Testament scripture,<sup>68</sup> for the father leading the family into religion, his illustrative stories of family life are based on the mother's power of moral suasion. The child learns of God at the mother's knee, and understands the love of Christ 'through the love of its own mother.'<sup>69</sup> By 1893 children's

---

<sup>65</sup>- "'Oh says the mother, it's only play, he will know better soon; he does not mean any harm; I cannot chide him." No, and if the father, wiser than herself, does, she cries, and, perhaps in the hearing of her child, reproves him for his cruelty." Ibid., p. 125.

<sup>66</sup>- This process began, according to the historians of the American "Cult of Motherhood", in the 1840's. (The exact date is a debatable point. See Ryan, op.cit..) By the 1870's the idea of the morally superior women had taken a firm hold, and by 1914, there is only lip service paid to the father as ultimate authority figure within the household.

<sup>67</sup>- Thompson, op.cit., p. 30.

<sup>68</sup>- For example, it is because Noah is so good that God saves his children as well. God saves the righteous and the seeds of the righteous. Ibid., p. 13, 52.

<sup>69</sup>- Ibid., p. 72.

natural love will be first to their mother, not their father.<sup>70</sup>

Rev. Thompson attributes this change in the father image to the overwhelming demands made by the business or professional world.<sup>71</sup> "In too many instances the father turns all spiritual responsibility over to the mother, and everything is left to her as being the most with the children. He attends to the worldly concerns and she to the

---

<sup>70</sup>- In comparison with books written before 1850, the change is even more striking. In a book by William Cobbett published in 1833, the father, as head of the house is to supervise the entire household, from the moral education of the children, to the hiring of the servants. He is the central figure in the home. "All in a wife, beyond her own natural disposition and education, is nine times out of ten, the work of the husband." W. Cobbett, Advice to Young Men and (Incidentally) to Young Women in the middle and higher ranks of life in a series of letters addressed to a youth, a bachelor, a lover, a husband, a citizen or a subject (New York, 1833), p. 122. Notice that in the title, the author addresses the father, an aspect which will disappear in the forthcoming books. Henceforth, he will be addressed as head of the home, a slightly less intimate and more limited title. A father's first duty was to instill in his children an ardent love for their mother. Ibid., p. 173. This suggests that the love for a mother was not considered 'natural'. In just fifty years the change is obvious: from the apex to an adjunct.

<sup>71</sup>- A point raised by Cobbett in 1833. Ibid., pp. 188-217. Cobbett argues that to care for children is not effeminate, and to care for wealth, or rank more than one's children's happiness is criminal. Fathers should spend as much time with their children as possible.

religious."<sup>72</sup> Fathers were too busy providing for their families to oversee the religious instruction of their children.

Admittedly, fathers had to supply the material needs of their wives and children, but this particular advice author appears to be concerned that the function of providing has been overemphasized, at the expense of the important emotional relationship between father and child. The consequences of such an overemphasis is personal loss, as well as irreparable damage to the family and the social structure. One might read the references to Jezebel as an admission that in 1878 society had gone too far in granting women all the power in the home. Lanceley's book then, became a lament, a confession that men had lost their 'traditional' authority. Fifteen years later, Rev. Thompson continues to lament, calling for a resumption of paternal authority within the home. His illustrative stories, however, subvert the absolute paternal position; and by the turn of the century, the mother appears to hold the moral scepter.

---

<sup>72</sup>- Thompson, op.cit., p. 164. Joseph Howe also described a division of parental duties, but he saw this as positive, rather than negative. See footnote # 51. One significant anecdote involves a wealthy merchant who says: "If I had my life to live over again, my relations to my sons would be very different from what they have been. Probably I would have made less money, but they and I would not be such strangers to each other." Ibid., p. 74. See also Cobbett, op.cit., p. 217.

The two authors of the advice books addressed to the pater-familias advocated a strong father figure, and endowed him with a great deal of authority.<sup>73</sup> An examination of the vignettes which accompanied such arguments, however, suggests that even these advocates of paternal authority placed the mother at the moral heart of the Home. This contradiction suggests the existence of a complex and multifaceted role for the father, which, compared to the rather one-dimensional 'Angel in the Home' maternal image, had not yet had time to fix itself firmly in the late Victorian mind. If by the 1870's the role of Victorian women had stabilized within the Angel in the Home mould, this analysis suggests that, by comparison, at this time the image of the father was still struggling between an older patriarchal model, based on strong moral authority,<sup>74</sup> and a more modern image based on sentiment.

---

<sup>73</sup>- The emphasis on the relationship between the health of the State and the government of the family is unique to those authors writing for the head of the family, especially in comparison with the emphasis on the heavenly Kingdom found in the literature for women and girls.

<sup>74</sup>- An authority based on one hand on a moral power issuing from the position as priest of the household, but also, as Mary Ryan points out, based on the position of manager of the household as an economic producer.

## IV

The reforming spirit did not limit itself to extolling positive social virtues. After 1890, the tone of reform literature takes on a particularly strident tone and begins to use more manipulative tactics, emphasizing the consequences of the social ills, rather than merely presenting the rewards of good behavior. The literature of the temperance movement is a case in point. Examined for the most part as a political phenomenon,<sup>75</sup> the nineteenth century temperance movement in North America had a complete social policy, one in which the family had an important role to play.

The temperance movement was governed by the belief that alcohol was at the heart of most social ills.<sup>76</sup> From its inception in the 1820's through the 1880's, the movement depended on education and persuasion to influence the public

---

<sup>75</sup>- It has for example, been analyzed as the forerunner to the women's movement, and as an example of the 'sentimentalization' in American culture. C. Bacchi, Liberation Deferred: The Ideas of the English-Canadian Suffragists (Toronto, 1983); W. Mitchison, "The WCTU: 'For God, Home and Native Land': A Study in Nineteenth-Century Feminism", in L. Kealey, ed., A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880's-1920's (Toronto, 1979), pp. 151-167; and Douglas, op.cit..

<sup>76</sup>- Mitchison, op.cit.; E. R. Forbes, "Prohibition and the Social Gospel in Nova Scotia", Acadiensis, 1, 1 (Autumn/Autome, 1971), pp. 12-36.

to take the pledge. After 1883, with the establishment of the Women's Christian Temperance Union, the movement became oriented towards legislation. An examination of this pervasive literature reveals another facet of the father's role.

The illustrative stories are particularly indicative of some of the more widely held views and tenets of Victorian ideology. While it is true that the temperance movement was, on one level, an attempt on the part of the middle class to assume the dominant position in the creation of social order and to remake the working class in its own respectable image, the movement did not ignore the effects of alcohol on the 'better' classes.<sup>77</sup> The internal stories are so interesting precisely because the literature was directed

---

<sup>77</sup>- See N. Clark, Deliver Us from Evil, An Interpretation of American Prohibition (New York, 1976); and J. Lukacs, "The Bourgeois Interior", American Scholar, 39 (1970), pp. 616-630. Both these scholars demonstrate that the temperance and prohibition movement was not as Richard Hofstadter argued a "pinched, parochial substitute for reform, carried about America by the rural-evangelical virus". (Cited in Clark, op.cit., p. 10). On the contrary, the temperance movement was an expression of the "developing consciousness of individual, rather than communal, dignity, the turning inward for new sources of direction, destiny, and discipline, what John Lukacs has called the "bourgeois interior" that was coming to dominate American and European life during the nineteenth-century." Ibid., p. 12.

towards all classes.<sup>78</sup> Characters included barristers, clerks, and doctors as well as railwaymen and skilled laborers.<sup>79</sup>

Over eighty percent of the stories used to illustrate the temperance message concerned an alcoholic male in a nuclear family. It appears as if the men were in a position of special vulnerability, as a consequence of being forced to spend a great deal of time away from the home, and therefore in contact with the wily saloon keeper. The remaining stories concerned women; for example, a young girl

---

<sup>78</sup>- Furthermore, the authors appealed to the middle class for their support. Rev. Rogers, in The Gatling With Ammunition for the Temperance Warfare (Toronto, Montreal, Halifax, 1894), tells the story of a wealthy merchant who, asked to join a temperance society, replies, "Gentleman, it is not my business." A few days later, his wife and two daughters are involved in a massive train accident in which they all die. The cause of this accident is a railway employee who drank a quart of whisky on the job. Temperance should be everyone's fight, because no one is immune to the consequences, not even a wealthy man.

<sup>79</sup>- One of the reasons these authors chose skilled workers rather than unskilled workers was the emphasis on responsibility. Alcoholic workers in responsible positions could do far more damage to their employers or places of employment than an unskilled worker. Professionals, men in responsible social positions, who succumbed were a menace to the social fabric, and their fall from grace was perhaps even more significant. Without these natural leaders, social decay was even more imminent. Furthermore, the effect of an alcoholic father was to force his wife and children out onto the streets to look for work, any way they could. Such female labor was considered undesirable for working class families, but untenable for middle class families.

who begins her life of alcoholism because of a doctor's prescription.<sup>80</sup>

Crime, poverty and diseases were the major social costs of alcoholism.<sup>81</sup> The ultimate cost of drunkenness would be paid by the State, although the initial cost would be borne by the family. In The Gin Mill Primer, under an illustration of a ragged man beating his wife while his ill-clad children looked on in fear, the author wrote:

What is this? It is a Home. The State is built on the Home, and if we would have a good, free, pure State, we must have Homes of the same kind. From what I have said as to Drink up to this point, it must be clear that it

---

<sup>80</sup>- Very few temperance stories deal with alcoholic mothers. One example is Homes Made and Marred, a book for working men and their wives (London, 1870). One child dies as a result of the mother's neglect, and the father abandons the home when he understands that he, by silently allowing her to continue to drink, is also responsible. Finally, when the mother dies, the father providentially returns to save the remaining children from the poor house, thereby atoning for his failure. Another example is the more common one of a young woman falling down on her return home from the tavern, killing her infant. No matter what the character's gender, class or age, the important point is that the alcoholic has innocent dependents.

<sup>81</sup>- Particularly after 1880, authors of these tracts usually included a list of the effects of alcohol on the body. Diseases, such as liver failure, poor eyesight, epilepsy, were commonly attributed to drink. See Rev. L.-P. Paquin, Lecture on the Hurtful Qualities of Spirituous Liquors Delivered in Quebec City (Quebec, 1880). The inclusion of the medical aspect to this debate after 1880 suggests a reflection of the general appreciation of medicine in the late Victorian world-view. It may also suggest that the appeal was going beyond the working class, and towards the middle class which might have some elementary knowledge about hygiene, and health. The lists of painful illnesses contracted by drink never wholly eclipse the emphasis on the public and familial consequences.

has all to do with the Home, and that Drink must be the one great foe of the State.<sup>82</sup>

In one sentimental domestic drama, Bill and Polly, the author concluded his moral tale by showing the protagonist, a reformed drinker, as a productive member of society, "not only ministering to the happiness and respectability of his own household, but helping you to make your country rich and prosperous."<sup>83</sup> The appeal to the maintenance and strengthening of the State passed through the family, and particularly the father.

One of the most striking elements of the temperance tracts was their exaggeration of certain familial characteristics. The notion that the father is a figure of authority was exaggerated to include beating his wife and

---

<sup>82</sup>- J. Bengough, The Gin Mill Primer: A Book of Easy Reading lessons for children of all ages especially for boys who have votes (Toronto, Montreal, Halifax, 1898), p. 14-15.

<sup>83</sup>- D. Lucas, Bill and Polly (Toronto, Montreal, Halifax, 1893), p. 21. Again, the health of the State is dependent upon the health of the family. Most the stories written between 1870 and 1914 were variations on the most powerful temperance story, written in response to the Maine Law of 1851, by Timothy Shay Arthur, Ten Nights in a Barroom, and What I Saw There, <1854>, D. A. Koch, ed. (Harvard, 1964). In Ten Nights, the hero's daughter is inadvertently killed fetching her father from the saloon. The barkeeper's son kills him in a drunken fury. One indication of this publication's success, was, like Harriet Beecher Stowe's Uncle Tom's Cabin, that this story was quickly taken to the stage. According to Norman Clark: "Men and women in the 1850s, and for several decades thereafter, took Ten Nights seriously precisely because of its Victorian sentiment, its breathtaking portrayal of Victorian paternal tyranny, martyred innocence, and family disaster." Clark, op.cit., p. 42.

children, sometimes until death. In one typical story, in a once happy home, where the father and mother read from the Book of Books, the reader was invited to watch "the children at noon or at night as they hear the father's footsteps upon the threshold, how they run in childish glee to greet him." The next scene was the same family in a hovel, the children cringing as they hear their father's staggering footsteps. He comes in, a specter of his former self, strikes his wife, and kills her.<sup>84</sup> Prior to his downfall, the father was shown to be gainfully employed. He and his family were God-fearing. His wife and children revolved around him, the home was happy and carefree. Once inebriated, he becomes a brute: "nothing but alcohol can blot out every humane feeling and prompt him to act more like a fiend than a man."<sup>85</sup>

The frightening aspect of the abusive father implied in this image was not merely the loss of control, and the ensuing physical violence against inherently fragile dependents, but more importantly, that the abuse was an exaggerated extension of the father's natural authority as

---

<sup>84</sup>- H. Adams, A True Picture of the Effects of Intemperance (Yarmouth N.S., 1888), p. 2-3. One temperance song reads:

Licensed to make a strong man weak,  
 Licenced to lay the strong man low  
 Licenced the fond wife's heart to break  
 And make the children's tears to flow.

Rev. Rogers, Shot and Shell for the Temperance Conflict (Toronto, Montreal, Halifax, 1884), p. 99.

<sup>85</sup>- G. Platt, The Temperance Primer: An Elementary lesson book on the nature and effects of alcohol for use in Canadian schools. (Toronto, Winnipeg, 1883), p. 43.

Head of the Home. The reformers were driven by a desire to control the excesses of this paternal position, but without effecting its positive social values.

A second leitmotif found in the temperance tracts was the incapable drunken father. This father might not be abusive, but his drinking inhibited him from providing for his family. An anecdote of this type is found in Mrs. Mason's Faces That Follow: a barrister refused to sign the pledge, "with his toes out of his boots, his wife at work to support her family." Eventually he would sign and would support them "in comfort."<sup>86</sup> Henry Adams tells a little story about a man "bearing an air of gentility" despite his ragged clothes, entering a pawn shop with the shoes of his recently dead daughter: he needs a drink. "Fathers, what a picture, your only child sleeping softly in the arms of Jesus, your broken hearted companion watching beside the lifeless form of her loved one, and you in a pawn shop pledging the little shoes for that which will separate you and your child forever."<sup>87</sup> In Bill and Polly, the drunken father often did not return for several days, during which time he was squandering the family savings, forcing his wife

---

<sup>86</sup>- Mrs. Mason, Faces that Follow (Toronto, Montreal, Halifax, 1898), p. 185.

<sup>87</sup>- A more exaggerated image can be found in Rev. Rogers, Shot and Shell for Temperance when he is arguing that a woman never laughs at the temperance movement, as "... she sees the blue, cold, shoeless feet of little children, and the daughter by destitution turned into a life of infamy,...". p. 28.

out of the home to find work to support her family.<sup>88</sup> Mrs Mason's barrister, and Adams' man bearing an air of gentility, suggest that the father's drunkenness causes serious social dislocation: prostitution, female wage labor, and finally, death.<sup>89</sup>

These fictional accounts of home abandonment again allow us to reflect on the centrality of the father as provider in the Victorian ideal of fatherhood. The economic climate was difficult enough for the average business man during this period, but that the difficulties should be compounded by drunkenness was anathema to these reformers. They believed that if only the alcohol trade could be stopped there would be no more familial ills, such as abuse, or abandonment.

---

<sup>88</sup>- Lucas, op.cit., p. 10.

<sup>89</sup>- Widowed hearts and homes deserted  
Helpless children, orphans made;  
What a picture, God of mercy  
Let the cruel tide be swayed.  
Rogers, Shot and Shell..., p. 111.

The final keystone to these temperance stories was the centrality of the Home as a formative influence.<sup>90</sup> Despite all that was said about the authority and indispensibility of fathers, in the temperance stories the real moral center of the home was, again, the mother. Mothers were urged to teach their children about the dangers of alcohol:

Mothers on you mainly depends your children's happiness; no father can command the same respect and esteem from the children, as the mother does. From their birth, they are under the watchful and tender care of their mother, 'tis you that ministers to their wants; 'tis you that shares their joys and griefs....<sup>91</sup>

Such power demands that women take the temperance issue seriously, as the guardians of the new generation. Young women were urged to say no to young men who say yes to alcoholic beverages. "To you young ladies we especially appeal. A potent influence is yours. You are the true regents of society. To you is committed a fairy wand of

---

<sup>90</sup>- Young men were urged to think about their parents' grief should they break their 'pledge'. Again, the family was used as a moral touchstone for these newly independent youths.

One temperance song, sung to the tune of Auld Lang Syne and quoted in Rogers, The Gatling..., p. 103:  
Can we forget the gray haired sires,

Who sink by anguish riven,  
To see their sons, by liquid fires,  
To endless ruin driven?  
The sires, the sires, the grey haired sires,  
No more shall be riven,  
Nor see their sons, by liquid fires  
To endless ruin driven.

<sup>91</sup>- Adams, op.cit., p. 10.

magic influence whereby you may bless or ban mankind and affect for weal or woe their eternal destiny."<sup>92</sup> There is the repeated suggestion here of the value of family as a moral touchstone, and of the moral power wielded by young women and mothers. Again, the father is a rather shadowy figure.

In conclusion, the message of these temperance reformers was conservative in its social analysis and ambiguous in its representation of the father as head of the home. There is no question here of changing familial or social structures, which, in their exaggerated form, gave way to misery and distress. The father's function was again unspecified. His role as provider was one fraught with difficulties. As the family member most likely to leave the sanctified home, he was most vulnerable to the lure of the saloon. As the family's provider, any shortcomings were laden with social significance. Furthermore, he seems to have limited influence over his children; mothers and young women are the 'regents of society'.

---

<sup>92</sup>- Rogers, The Gatling..., p. 31. It is obviously from this perspective that the Canadian suffragists fought for the vote. See Bacchi, Liberation Deferred.... ; and L. Kealey, ed., A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880's-1920's (Toronto, 1979), Introduction.

## V

The image of the father, and his role within his family so far suggested by an analysis of reform and religious literature is characterized by a certain ambiguity. A two level discourse concerning his role and function appears to have been in the making. On one level, the authors maintained the traditional ideal of the father as absolute moral arbiter. On the other hand, in real family politik, his position as religious leader appeared undermined by his pure and unsullied wife. This kind of ambiguity would make the translation of this ideal into reality rather difficult. In an effort therefore, to understand exactly which elements were finally selected to be emphasized in concrete terms, the goals and methods of a social agency for boys will be examined. An analysis of the Annual Reports of the Boy's Home will demonstrate which elements of the national reform spirit were in fact promoted and realized in this institution by the Montreal middle class which directed it.

The example of the Boy's Home (which would become Weredale) is representative of many similar institutions.<sup>93</sup>

---

<sup>93</sup>- D. MacLeod, "A Live Vaccine: The Y.M.C.A. and Male Adolescence in the United States and Canada, 1870-1920", Histoire Sociale/Social History XI, 21 (May/mai, 1978), pp. 5-25; Magney, op.cit.. See also the papers presented to the National Conference of Charities and Corrections History of Child Saving in the United States, Chicago, June 1893 (Reprint, Montclair New Jersey, 1971).

It was financed on a volunteer basis, and run by a board of governors composed of some of the most influential Montrealers, among them Herbert Ames, John Redpath Dougall, and Alexander Galt. A list of subscribers appended to the Annual Report, as well as an examination of the names of the speakers at the annual dinner, illustrates the inter-denominational, but Protestant, nature of this kind of social agency in Montreal.

The Boy's Home developed and evolved throughout the period, emerging at the outbreak of World War One as one of the most successful Montreal Protestant charities.<sup>94</sup> For a study of fathers and fatherhood, it seemed obvious to examine an agency which catered to men or boys, as opposed to women or girls (which were legion).<sup>95</sup> Finally, the Boy's Home was created by Montrealers to suit the needs of their particular community, and as such may be considered a reliable reflection of the ideals of manliness and the place

---

<sup>94</sup>- One measure of its success can be seen in the enormous construction successfully undertaken to provide space for the increasing number of needy cases. One reason for its success was the establishment of Shawbridge Farm in 1907, located in the Laurentians. This isolated Home was designed especially for the more difficult boys who could not be contained in the city. Shawbridge Farm helped its parent institution by weeding out the delinquents from the more malleable boys, thereby giving the Home a solid reputation, based on success.

<sup>95</sup>- The second reason for choosing an institution catering to boys was the assumption that men would play an important role in the establishment and formation of the institution, more so than in the case of an institution run for women.

of fatherhood within that ideal as expounded by its middle class directors.

Established in 1870, out of the Zion Congregational Church,<sup>96</sup> it was initially intended for newsboys, those 'ragged urchins of the city streets'. Eventually, however, the Home took in any youth who was gainfully employed, its goal being to take these working youths and "through God's blessing (help them to) become good citizens and useful members of society".<sup>97</sup> The annual reports indicate the many lines along which this agency was organized. The most important one was the creation of a Home for working boys, a place more conducive to the development of a good soul and healthy body than an anonymous boarding house.<sup>98</sup> The frontpiece of the reports explains the reason for the Boy's Home, and its goal:

Special opportunities for assisting individual boys frequently occur, such as the maintenance and education of one maimed or wholly friendless. There are those here now, whose father was well to do not too long ago, when together with his family was happy in the comfortable home, "when mother was there".

---

<sup>96</sup>- According to the census of 1871, the Congregationalists of Montreal numbered only 871 members. Such a small number of members suggests that while this charitable organization was initially organized by a single denomination, such denominational exclusiveness could not be maintained for any length of time.

<sup>97</sup>- Boy's Home, Montreal, Annual Report (1910), p. 5.

<sup>98</sup>- The idea that a Home, and not an institution, was felt to be the best place for children by the reformers is examined more fully in Sutherland, Framing the Twentieth Century Consensus....

But trials and reverses came through drink and other causes. But now, father is dead or gone, and mother dead or worse.

What parent can say, "My boy will never be in a Home, and dependent on other fatherly or motherly care?" There are sad stories written within the space of one year.

If you will take a destitute boy into your special care, by becoming responsible for his maintenance and education in the Boy's Home, the desire will be from Him who promised to be the Father of the Fatherless, and thou shalt be His partner in the loving service and thine will be a special joy.<sup>99</sup>

Within the structure of the institution itself, the idea was to recreate a home. The boarders did not sleep in one large room as in many institutions during that era, but were at most, fifteen to a room,<sup>100</sup> with the older boys sleeping two to a room. For over twenty-five years, the Boy's Home was run by Mister and Mrs. Richard Dick. In almost every annual report consulted during the Dick's tenure, Mrs. Dick is praised in no uncertain terms for her

---

<sup>99</sup>- Frontpiece Boy's Home, Montreal, Annual Report (1910). It is an interesting reflection on the sanctity of motherhood that fathers can be dead or gone, but mother can be worse than dead. It is suggestive of the real importance the late Victorian placed on the influence of a mother.

<sup>100</sup>- By the standards of the day, fifteen to a room was relative opulence. In photographs of the Brace Memorial Boy's Lodging House and Industrial School in New York City, one can count three rows of bunk-beds, seven deep. If all the beds were full, forty-two boys would be sleeping in a single room. Report of the Committee on the History of Child-Saving Work op.cit., p. 11.

contributions.<sup>101</sup> Her husband, Superintendent Dick, was responsible for the organization of the night classes, the liaison with the Board, and admissions. The division of labor between the Superintendent and the Matron conform with the traditional division of labor apparent in many middle class homes, and coupled with the separate sleeping quarters suggests that the Boy's Home made an effort to resemble a real home as nearly as possible.

Fundamental to the purpose of the institution was the emphasis on constructive leisure for these boys. The larger cities were felt to be particularly detrimental for young people; girls could be lured away into the white slave trade, and boys could become adepts at crime and debauchery. The goal of the Boy's Home was therefore to give their charges something constructive to do in their off-hours other than wandering aimlessly around the streets where temptations lurked. Activities included the evening prayer meeting, the Night School, Drill, Manual Training Classes, and swimming. The object of these classes, beyond merely controlling the boy's free time, was to help them develop the skills necessary for occupational advancement, and to develop their physical capabilities.

---

<sup>101</sup>- Mrs. Dick was responsible for the housekeeping. She was the leader of the morning prayers, and the evening meeting for testimony and prayer, to which one young man credited the spiritual awakening that culminated in a career in the ministry. (These prayers were not obligatory.) Boy's Home, Montreal, Annual Report (1910), p. 22.

The annual reports are divided into two main sections, one dealing with the actual running of the Home, including financial statements, and the other, selections from some of the speakers at the annual dinner. Superintendent Dick, in his annual reports, lays great weight on the physical and educational aspects of the Home's work. He describes the enthusiasm of the boys for the facilities, and the efforts they have made to improve their skills. Most of the annual dinner speakers stress the singular opportunity the boys have in living in such morally uplifting conditions, and the necessity for each boy to live up to the good examples given them in the Home. The tone of these speakers is particularly striking since the lodgers in this Home were not criminals, or even depraved; they were in fact employed youths who were expected to contribute in proportion to their income.<sup>102</sup>

As the institution was established for working class and clerically employed youths, and not criminals or deviants, the expressions of manhood found in Annual Reports should be fairly close to the ideals of manliness formulated for the middle class. The emphasis placed on physical

---

<sup>102</sup>- The organization of the Home essentially assured it of controlling for the better able youth. The boys had to be gainfully employed, (work would be found for them, if they were currently unemployed), and dismissal was without appeal for the breaking of House Rules. In 1907, Shawbridge Farm was established as an direct extension of the Boy's Home for those delinquent youths who needed more supervised attention. Shawbridge Farm was also part of the Fresh Air Fund, some of the grounds being given over every summer to the Fund. Nazareth Street Club, 1st. Annual Report, 1910. In 1913, this organization became the Griffintown Boy's Club).

development and moral strength of character as component parts of good citizenship, strongly resembles those expressed in the books by Ralph Connor. Good citizenship, according to the speakers of the Annual dinners, involved contributing to society and not being a criminal, or a pariah. There is also, as expected, little direct mention of fatherhood.

There is an interesting exception to this silence concerning fatherhood. Sometimes an Old Boy present at the Annual Dinner was referred to as being accompanied by his wife and family. The reference suggests that the creation of a family was the ultimate in respectability, and a standing example to the youths who wished to make good. Domestic respectability, however, was not a stated goal of the institution: public usefulness was. Like all reform inspired literature examined above, the Boy's Home appeared to formulate the ideal of the public spirited man, leaving aside those elements of personality which might have helped create the private man, the father. Comparing this emphasis by the speakers on the importance of success in the public realm with the ideals expressed by such authors as Ralph Connor suggests that the speakers were not reflecting their own inherent prejudice towards these working class youths, as much as the general, classless ideal of the relative importance placed on good citizenship as compared with a fulfilling private life.

\*\*\*\*

This analysis of various reform literature has introduced certain familial models and images of the paternal figure prevalent in late Victorian-early Edwardian reform ideology. While these images may be conservative, the centrality of religion to the Victorian ethos suggests that these were important ideals and potentially powerful models. The place of the family in this ideology cannot be overstated. The importance of its continued maintenance as a cornerstone of the State compelled many reformers to advocate temperance and other changes in behaviour and legislation to protect it.

This chapter has also examined elements of the relationship between the ideal of Canadian manliness and the function and ideal of fatherhood. Canadian manliness, based on Christian principles married to physical development, emphasized the application of public virtue, rather than private sentiment. Connor's ministers and protagonists leave widowed mothers and aging fathers to fulfill their patriotic/religious duty out West. The Boy's Home Reports suggest that the first function of youth was to develop into good citizens, public men, omitting references to the skills necessary to be fathers, private men.

The image of the father described by religiously inspired authors suggests an internal contradiction between

the father as a figure of authority, and the public provider of material goods. There was some consensus that fathers were the moral authority figure within the home, but the extent of that authority was unclear, and in the end, subverted by the available and legitimate alternative leaders, and by the image of the mother as the family's moral guardian. According to these authors the demands of the role as provider had become overemphasized, and the role of the household priest, proportionately devalued in favor of the mother. Yet even those who argue for a re-evaluation of the moral role illustrate their tales with images of the mother as the moral head of the family.

The illustrative stories selected from the temperance tracts reinforce the ideal of the father as provider. His family's dependency upon him makes alcoholism all the more tragic. The innocent suffer. These stories also make clear the father's vulnerability on two different levels. On the first level, he is physically more vulnerable to the wiles of the saloon keeper, simply because of all members of the family, the father has the most contact with the streets. On the second level, the father's vulnerability stems from the innate weakness of men, a weakness made all the more apparent by the moral strength of the women, the 'true regents of society.'

There is in this chapter the initial indication of a double conflict facing middle class fathers of the late

nineteenth and early twentieth century. The first is between the ideal of manliness (public) and the need for sentiment and ability to nurture (private). This public-private conflict appears compounded by a second conflict, this one within the private sphere, between the role of provider and the role of priest, the latter being in some ways undermined by the demands of providing, and in other ways, usurped by the emerging and strengthening role of motherhood. The father remains a figurehead, but one beset on both sides and virtually devoid of power. The following chapter will examine how another social institution, the Quebec legal system, dealt with these issues, as the judges struggled to decide custody of minor children.

Chapter III  
Authority vs. Nurture  
The Judicial Interpretation of Paternal Authority

In 1876, Henry Hull took his brother-in-law to the Quebec Superior Court to gain custody of Hull's 14 year old daughter. She was living with her uncle and her mother who had left Hull several years previously. The father's attorney argued that "...until the child had attained the age of majority she can have no will, no opinion, no judgement except mine, and as she is being detained against my will, she must therefore be considered as detained against her will."<sup>1</sup> The judge refused this argument and allowed the girl to choose her place of residence. This decision was upheld a year later in the Court of Appeal.

In 1912, in a custody battle with his former wife, Frank Woolven argued "that the child being unable to express his desires on account of his tender years, the father is

---

<sup>1</sup>- Quoted in Lorenz vs. Lorenz 28 R.J.Q., 1905, p. 333.

entitled to speak for him and ask that he be given custody."<sup>2</sup> Judge Beaudoin took into consideration that Frank Woolven lived several miles away from his place of employment, and was unable therefore to care personally for the child. In his decision he stated: "... I cannot come to the conclusion that the care of a nurse, however good she may be, is equal to the care that a good mother will give to her child,...".<sup>3</sup> Consequently, Frank Woolven lost his case. The judge ruled that for the moment, he saw no reason for removing the child from its mother, "...the child being only two years and four months, [and] he requires the care and attendance of his mother".

Why did both these judges, despite Article 243 of the Civil Code, grant custody of the child to the mother? Article 243 was very clear. It stated: "That the child remains subject to the authority of his father and mother until his majority or emancipation, but the father alone exercises the authority during marriage." Paternal authority in the Quebec Civil Code was those four articles (No. 243-248) which prescribed the boundaries, rights and duties of parents and their children. Essentially, these articles confirmed the right of the father over the person of his children, a right granted to the mother only in her husband's absence or incapacity, and which could only be

---

<sup>2</sup>- 14 R.P., 1912, p. 171.

<sup>3</sup>- Ibid., p. 167.

revoked by the court for serious offence. The apparent inconsistency between these two and other judgments and the letter of the Code raises the question of the judicial system's perception of the family, and how it promoted relationships among family members.

This chapter will focus on the role of the father as proposed and promoted by the judicial system, as seen through child custody cases, both between parents, and between parents and a third party, between the years 1866 and 1928.<sup>4</sup> Its focus is twofold: first, to examine the evolution of the courts' perception of where the best interests' of the child might lie, and second, to examine the courts' interpretation of the paternal role, specifically, how the legal ideal of the paternal role was affected by changing social visions.<sup>5</sup> In essence this chapter will argue that the Quebec Courts consistently reinforced the family unit, preferring the natural parents to the foster parents, and that from this perspective, the father's

---

<sup>4</sup>- These are the dates, respectively, of the introduction of the Civil Code, and the final important custody case of Kivenko vs. Yagood, (1928) confirming the inviolateness of paternal authority. See appendix C for a complete list of cases examined. For a short history of the Codification of the Quebec Civil Code, see J. Brierly, "Quebec's Civil Law Codification: Viewed and Reviewed", McGill Law Journal, 14 (1968), p. 522-589.

<sup>5</sup>- See introduction of study for a more complete examination of the changing social image of the late Victorian women. See Barbara Welter "The Cult of True Womanhood 1820-1860" American Quarterly XVIII, 2 (Summer, 1966), pp. 151-174.

authority functioned as a representative symbol of the family. Within the family, however, the father was perceived to be increasingly less important to the child's welfare than the mother. By 1912, the onus was on the father to prove the mother an unfit parent, otherwise, the courts would consider her the child's 'natural' custodian, regardless of Article 243. As in the reform literature examined in the previous chapter, the power of the ideal of motherhood has insinuated itself firmly in the landscape of the late Victorian family.

A brief historiographical examination focused our discussion of custody cases in Quebec on three hypotheses and raised a question of methodology. The first hypothesis is suggested by Neil Sutherland's study of attitudes towards juvenile delinquency.<sup>6</sup> Canadian historians have often considered the State's interaction and intervention in the private sphere, from birth control,<sup>7</sup> child-rearing practices,<sup>8</sup> and more specifically its direct efforts to

---

<sup>6</sup>- N. Sutherland, Children in English Canada: Framing the Twentieth Century Consensus (Toronto, 1976), Chapters 5 and 6.

<sup>7</sup>- A. McLaren and A. McLaren, The Bedroom and The State: The Changing Practices and Politics of Contraception and Abortion in Canada 1880-1980 (Toronto, 1986).

<sup>8</sup>- Sutherland, op.cit.

protect children.<sup>9</sup> Much of this work has emphasized the increasing public concern for the needs of children. The goal of many of these movements was often to strengthen the family unit, perceived to be threatened by socio-economic forces. One of the most important questions facing these reformers was whether the family was in fact the best place for some of these children. Neil Sutherland has argued that in trying to prevent juvenile delinquency, child reformers in this period were convinced that a proper, structured home setting was more beneficial to these delinquents than jail, or returning them to their own, often incomplete, families. Although the focus of this study is not juvenile delinquency the Quebec Courts also had to consider the idea that the biological family may not always be the best place for a child. The nature and resolution of this debate will be one of issues discussed in the first part of this chapter.

Other studies dealing with the law and the family have been concerned with marriage law<sup>10</sup> and inheritance laws.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup>- A. Jones, and L. Rutman, In the Children's Aid: J.J. Kelso and Child Welfare in Ontario (Toronto, 1980); J. Bullen, "Hidden Workers: Child Labour and the Family Economy in Late Nineteenth-Century Urban Ontario", Labour/Le Travail 18 (Fall 1986), pp. 163-187.

<sup>10</sup>- L. Holcombe, Wives and Property: Reform of the Married Woman's Property Law in 19th Century England (Toronto, 1983). Also, Le Collectif Clio, L'Histoire des femmes au Québec depuis quatre siècles (Montréal, 1982), p. 149-152.

In Quebec especially, studies of inheritance, have been the object of important debates concerning the relations between family structure and the transmission of property. Andre Morel's analysis of the freedom of testament is one of several studies which examine the family and its relationship to society through inheritance.<sup>12</sup> Morel argues that despite the apparent absolute liberty in matters of testament, prior to 1940, the court judgments are consistently in favor of the legal family, rather than the concubine. Morel perceives this as an indication of the courts' desire to shore up the traditional family unit against competing forms of cohabitation. The second purpose of this chapter is to examine this hypothesis using custody cases.

Constance Backhouse's analysis of nineteenth century custody cases in English Canada suggests a general pattern in custody decisions, a pattern which will be examined in

---

<sup>11</sup>- See for example, L. Gérin, Le type économique et social des Canadiens (Montréal, 1948); G. Bouchard, "L'étude des structures familiale pré-industrielles: pour un renversement des perspectives", Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine, 28 (1981), pp. 545-571.

<sup>12</sup>- A. Morel, Limites de la liberté testamentaire dans le droit civil de la Province de Québec (Paris, 1960).

light of the Quebec evidence.<sup>13</sup> Backhouse argues that, in the early years of the nineteenth century, the tendency in English Canadian law favored granting custody to the father, in accordance with the British tradition.<sup>14</sup> However, from 1855 to 1887, politicians and judges were affected by the reexamination of the child's needs, and the environment most favorable to those needs, and by the end of the century, the legislation began to reflect this new focus on the child.<sup>15</sup> Mothers were increasingly viewed by the Bench and the legislators as the more appropriate, and capable parent. Backhouse attributes the changes in custodial law to the focus on the child, rather than by any direct recognition of the mother's rights. In the introduction of the article,

---

<sup>13</sup>- C. Backhouse, "Shifting Patterns in Nineteenth-Century Canadian Custody Law", in D. Flaherty, ed., Essays in the History of Canadian Law, vol. 1, (Toronto, 1981), pp. 212-248. For other countries, see M. Grossberg, Governing the Hearth: Law and the Family in Nineteenth-Century America (Chapel Hill, 1985); N. V. Lowe, "The Legal Status of Fathers: Past and Present", in L. McKee and M. O'Brien, eds., The Father Figure (London, New York, 1982), pp. 26-42; R. Griswold, Family and Divorce in California, 1850-1890: Victorian Illusions and Everyday Realities (Albany, 1982); W. O'Neill, Divorce in the Progressive Era (New Haven, 1969); and D. Bonnekamp, "The Best Interest Principle and the Adjudication of Custody", in T. Knijn and A.-C. Mulder, eds., Unravelling Fatherhood (Dordrecht, Providence, 1987), pp. 62-74.

<sup>14</sup>- A tradition entrenched in Blackstone's famous line, a mother is entitled to 'no power but only reverence and respect.'

<sup>15</sup>- "It (the new focus) reflected a change in attitude from a sense of children as representing a form of property to an explicit examination of the duties and responsibilities of parents." Backhouse, "Shifting Patterns...", p. 233.

Backhouse raises the question of custody in the Quebec Civil Law. She interprets Article 214 (custody to be awarded to the wronged party, unless the court finds it in the best interests of the child to be placed elsewhere) as a piece of progressive legislation for the time. Our study of Quebec decisions will examine the actual interpretation of Article 214, which on the surface, would appear to be progressive. If Quebec decisions follow a similar pattern as those in Ontario, was it for the same reasons?<sup>16</sup>

Finally, little has been written about Quebec's legal profession's perception of the relationship between parent and child. It is the legal profession which, especially in preparation for the enormous reevaluation of the Civil Code in the 1960's and 70's, have contributed the most towards our understanding of the law and the family.<sup>17</sup> These jurists, however, are by the nature of their interests, more concerned with the contentious than the norm, and in persuading legislators to reform the Code. This study will focus exclusively on legitimate children, as children born

---

<sup>16</sup>- Obviously, the first important distinction between English Canada and Quebec is that the actual law in Quebec did not change during this period, while in Ontario for example, there were, according to Backhouse, three important pieces of legislation, each one moving towards favoring the mother in custody cases.

<sup>17</sup>- See for example, E. Deleury, M. Rivet, and J.-M. Nault, "De la Puissance paternelle à l'autorité parentale: Une institution en voie de trouver sa vraie finalité", Cahier de Droit, 15 (1974), pp. 778-870. Also L. Beaudoin, "Puissance paternelle", Revue du Barreau, 14 (1954), pp. 478-486.

out of wedlock are under the exclusive authority of the mother.<sup>18</sup> In order to overcome the legal bias which concentrates on the contentious rather than the norm, the judgments will be examined as texts, rather than legal decisions.<sup>19</sup> To provide a context for this text, the commentators of the Code, and their analysis of the articles in question, will also be examined. The object of this exercise is to discover the ideal of the father in law, which includes the important issue of the father's rights as opposed to those of the child. In this way, some light will be shed on the complexity and changes of the legal view of the father-child relationship, as well as the fundamental principles upon which these views were founded.

One last point before entering the subject. The question of class in the court system is an important one to address. Several cases within this sample were brought

---

<sup>18</sup>- Deleury, et al., "De la puissance paternelle...".

<sup>19</sup>- Such a distinction is an important one to make. The format of the edited and published cases emphasize the judge's decision, to the detriment of the process of making that decision. These compiled journals of cases, do however, contain some references to the actual arguments made. The extent of those references depended a great deal on the editor of the journal, and the perceived importance of the case. Legal historians have often depended on the brief notes heading the cases, rather than the limited, but available arguments made. Our purpose in this chapter being a description of the law, rather than a prescription for the law, (as is for example Deleury, et al., "De la puissance paternelle...") we will examine the arguments as well as the final outcome of the cases. A similar approach to reading judgments as texts, rather than as a progression of linear judgments was adopted by Griswold, op.cit..

forward by working class individuals: for example, Grace Ham (1883) was a servant, as was Mrs. Stevenson (1923) and Kennedy (1887) was a day laborer. This suggests that not only were lawyers available to take on cases for the working classes, but that the servants, and day laborers availed themselves of that privilege. While the judiciary was dominated and led by the middle class, it was obviously not completely divorced from the larger society.

# I

The first important custody case between a parent and a third party to come before the Courts of Quebec was that of Kennedy vs. Barlow (1869). This case basically upheld the father's authority over the person of his minor children as inviolable. While this authoritarian vision of the family was not the only legal vision acceptable at the time, it was the one which was subsequently predominant in the Quebec Courts. This case, which was heard on appeal in two Quebec Courts,<sup>20</sup> draws attention to several important social questions. By examining each question and how it developed over time, we will see how the Courts evolved towards the articulation of the family as by nature authoritarian, in

---

<sup>20</sup>- The Court of Appeal and the Court of Queen's Bench.

which the father maintained a great deal of control over the persons of his minor children.

Briefly, the facts of the case are thus: a father finding himself after the death of his wife, unable to care for his two year old daughter, placed her in the care of William Barlow, a merchant, who, with his wife, agreed to raise the child. She was to "...be instructed and educated, clothed and fed and cared for as if she were Barlow's child till the age of majority...."<sup>21</sup> Four years later, after Kennedy remarried, he wanted the child to live with him and his new wife. During the four years of separation, Kennedy had visited his daughter, and had even taken her away from the Barlow's home to visit some friends of his, returning her to the Barlow's in the evening.

The first question raised by the Barlow-Kennedy case is the nature of the contract entered into by the two men concerning the girl. Judge Short, the first judge to hear the case, ruled that an oral contract had been entered into and that Kennedy was still bound by it. This contract was justified by the fact that Kennedy was incapable of caring for the child, and under these circumstances, it was suitable that he give the child over to Barlow, "...to procure benefits for his child from another which he cannot provide for himself....".<sup>22</sup> This contract was not illegal,

---

<sup>21</sup>- Barlow vs. Kennedy, 13 L.C.J., 1869, p. 157.

<sup>22</sup>- Ibid., p. 58.

since a parent's duty was to see to their child's  
"...support and comfort and education."<sup>23</sup>

The judges of the Court of Appeal ruled that on the contrary, any contract divesting a father of his paternal rights was not only illegal but immoral, no matter what the intentions of the contract were. Except for cases of gross misconduct or insanity, a father's rights over his minor children were judged inviolable and could not be subject to transfer. Counsel for the petitioner (Mr. Kennedy) at the Court of Appeal, argued against Judge Short's decision by invoking the moral aspect of the father child relationship. "The parent can by no act of his own and by no judgment of any tribunal be divested of his paternal rights or liberated from his obligation towards his child; nor can he transfer to strangers to his blood the honour, respect and obedience of the child." Judge Badgley stated in his decision: "...even a contract by him (the father) to part with his child is so unnatural, that the law does not recognize a man's right to violate his most sacred duty, least of all to bind himself by a contract to do that which is inherently immoral and ab initio illegal."<sup>24</sup>

The idea that the father's rights are inviolate was one of the most significant judgments handed down in this case. The significance for subsequent child custody cases was that

---

<sup>23</sup>- Ibid., p. 58.

<sup>24</sup>- Kennedy Vs. Barlow, 17 L.C.J., 1871.

the foster family had to prove that the parent demanding custody was unfit, and thereby could be divested of their authority. Reasons for divestment included notorious prostitution (Sigouin vs. Denis, 1904), and abandonment (Nelson vs. Riley, 1888). The legal assumption became that, without just cause, parents could not transfer this authority to another person. Furthermore, the parents could reclaim their child at any subsequent moment in time.

In *Ex Parte Ham* (1883), Judge Ramsay gave the mother two adjournments in order that she might collect affidavits attesting to her ability to care for the child. Grace Ham was a servant in the house of Mrs. Barnett, who had to come before the Bench in order to testify that there would be place for the child in her house. Although the twelve year old girl had lived with her foster family for over four years, and expressed her desire to remain with them, the judge ruled in favor of the mother. Despite Grace Ham's low socio-economic status, (especially in comparison with that of the foster family) it seems clear that by granting two adjournments, Judge Ramsay was predisposed to grant her custody.

The second issue raised in the *Kennedy vs. Barlow* case is that of the weight which should be given to the voice of the child. Judge Short talked with the girl, and found she preferred to stay with the Barlows. He gave this some weight in his decision. Judge Short also felt that the child would

be uncomfortable with the new wife, and should therefore remain where she was comfortable and things were familiar to her.<sup>25</sup> In neither of the appeal courts, did the child's wishes appear to have been brought into evidence nor were they requested by the judges.

The decision to hear a child during one of these cases, and respect its preferences was fairly arbitrary. For example, Judge Charland used the testimony of two siblings, aged 11 and 8, to grant custody to their maternal grandfather rather than their father (Riley vs. Grenier, 1888). The next year, he ordered a young girl of 18 to return to her father's house, despite her wishes to remain in the Protestant hostel (La Mission de la Grande Ligne vs.

---

<sup>25</sup>- "...considering that it would be more conducive to the comfort, happiness and welfare of the said Mary-Ann Margueret Kennedy to suffer her to remain under the care of said respondent, [Mr. Barlow] who and his wife have become much attached to her, and to whom she has also become attached, than to consign her to the guardianship of said petitioner, [Mr. Kennedy] a poor day laborer, and a stepmother to whom she is an entire stranger." 17 L.C.J., 1871, p. 256.

Morrisette, 1889).<sup>26</sup> In *Ex Parte Ham* (1883), Judge Ramsay ruled that "...the opinions of a girl of twelve are not sufficiently formed to justify a judge in interfering with the natural order in the matter of guardianship."<sup>27</sup> The weight given the children's stated wishes in judgments was inconsistent. Without exception, the children wanted to stay with their foster families. Despite the children's wishes, only if the parent was deemed unfit, however, could the children remain where they were.<sup>28</sup>

The final issue raised by the Barlow-Kennedy case is that of the use of *Habeas Corpus* as a permissible procedure for the ascertainment of the child's proper residence.

---

<sup>26</sup>- The question of religion was extremely important to the Quebec Bench. In both *Barlow vs. Kennedy*, and *La Mission de la Grande Ligne vs. Morrisette*, one key factor in returning the child to her natural parent, was that the foster family was of the Protestant faith, while the child had been baptized a Roman Catholic. In *Kennedy vs. Barlow* Judge Short ruled that the Courts had no reason to consider the religion the child was being raised in, and that the responsibility of the Bench under the *Habeas Corpus* procedure was simply to determine if the child was being detained against his or her will.

In overruling Judge Short, the judges of the Court of Review saw the maintenance of the father's religion as crucial to their judgment. A father could never stand by and see his child raised in a heretical faith. The child's moral upbringing was essential to proper fathering, and by this judgment, the maintenance of the father's faith was established as a crucial component to the awarding of custody in future cases.

<sup>27</sup>- *Ex Parte Grace Ham vs. Phelan*, 27 L.C.J., 1883, p. 127-128.

<sup>28</sup>- This is in contrast to similar cases in the United States, where, according to Grossberg, the wishes of the child carried a great deal of weight with the American courts. M. Grossberg, op.cit. (1985), Chapter 8.

*Habeas Corpus* is the procedure by which an individual can be granted a court hearing in order to ascertain whether his detainment is legitimate. The use of this procedure, ordinarily associated with criminal justice, was introduced in England for child custody in 1816.<sup>29</sup> This procedure could be used either by a parent against another parent, or by a parent against a third party. There were two possible interpretations of the function of the procedure in custody cases. A narrow interpretation of the procedure was as an enquiry as to whether the child was actually being detained against his or her will. This interpretation of the procedure of *Habeas Corpus* emphasized the liberty of the child, rather than the rights of the parent demanding custody, as the judge limited his consideration to the simple question of freedom. A broader interpretation of the procedure, was that it was to establish who was best fit, between the litigants, to care for the child. In this way, the procedure becomes less a means to ascertain detention, and more a means to redress custody.

The fundamental issue raised by the procedure was one of liberty versus rights, and the resolution of that question came finally in 1923 with the Privy Council's decision in the case *Stevenson vs. Florent*. The *Barlow-Kennedy* case represented, in 1869, one of two different

---

<sup>29</sup>- In Quebec, this procedure was introduced in 1812, and reaffirmed in the Code of Procedure of 1867.

visions of the parent-child relationship.<sup>30</sup> Until 1885, there was another competing ideal, equally as strong as that articulated in *Barlow vs. Kennedy*. This second interpretation was eventually defeated in the courts, as the notion of the inviolability of the parent-child relationship became more acceptable. This second vision can be seen in such cases as *Cooper vs. Tanner* (1864), *Stoppelbom vs. Hull* (1876), and *Ex Parte Meikerljohn* (1882).<sup>31</sup> The primary difference between these two visions, was the emphasis placed on the child's will as opposed to that of the parent. Henry Hull argued that, until the girl's majority, his will should be hers, and since she was being detained against his will, she should be considered as being detained against hers. The Court found however that the girl was not being detained, and could have left her uncle's house whenever she wished. Furthermore, she was not being mistreated. The Court, therefore, refused to order her to return to her father. In essence, then, the court found in favor of the right of the child, rather than the father. In other words, this legal vision of the family rested on a sense of balance

---

<sup>30</sup>- Other cases which were found in favor of the parent include *Ex Parte Ham* (1883), *La Mission de la Grande Ligne vs. Morrisette* (1889).

<sup>31</sup>- It may be argued that this last case *Ex Parte Meikelrjohn*, the judge could afford to allow the girl to choose between the litigants, as neither were her natural parents. The court and both parties agreed however, that Louisa Brooks, manager of the Knowlton Distributing home, stands in loco parentis', and as such, was entitled to the same considerations as a natural parent.

between the rights of the parent and the child, and it respected the child's personal liberty, over and above the rights of the father.

The reasons for the abandonment of this vision are both legal and social. First, while the Civil Code was fairly authoritarian, emphasizing the rights of the father over the person of his children, the judges on the Bench were, until about 1885, still fairly dependent on British traditions, and precedents.<sup>32</sup> This tradition was more favorable to the notion of individual liberty than the Civil tradition.<sup>33</sup> Second, in Quebec, it was not until Mignault's commentaries were published in the 1890's that the Courts had a comprehensive overview of the Code. Until that publication, there was no real synthesis of the relationships between different chapters of the Code.<sup>34</sup> Third, precedents cited in judgments prior to 1890 are overwhelmingly British in

---

<sup>32</sup>- In the cases surveyed for this study, there was not a single reference to cases from other Canadian provinces.

<sup>33</sup>- See L. Beaudoin, Le Droit civil de la Province de Québec: Modèle vivant de droit comparé (Montréal, 1953); and D. Howes, "The Transformation of Quebec Law: From Polyjurality to Monojurality" McGill Law Journal, 32 (1987), pp. 524-558.

<sup>34</sup>- This is an important problem, as the Civilists see the Code as a totality, one item illuminating another. The Common law tradition is less interdependent, and does not have to refer to the all relevant (or irrelevant) bills to render a decision. See Howes for a more complete analysis of the importance of Judge Mignault on the development of Quebec legal thought, "From Polyjurality to Monojurality...".

origin.<sup>35</sup> After the Meikelrjohn case, precedents are increasingly taken from earlier Quebec Courts. Finally, it is possible to hypothesize that the Judges sitting in the Quebec Courts for at least several years after the introduction of the Code, were still steeped in the earlier British based tradition. This dependency on British common law tradition would explain why the authoritarian nature of the Code did not immediately supplant the older tradition, but existed side by side for a number of years.<sup>36</sup>

Quebec society in the later years of the nineteenth century was still undergoing serious social and economic upheaval caused by the new industrialization and immigration. The strengthening of the family unit, by all means possible, was a common response to industrialization, and this response has been documented in Quebec.<sup>37</sup> One way of strengthening the family was to reaffirm the authority of the father. By 1890, Quebec Courts no longer looked with an unbiased eye at cases which essentially pitted the child's will against the rights of the father. Children as old as 18 were returned to their parent's home (*La Grande Ligne vs.*

---

<sup>35</sup>- Judge Brookes, in reviewing the precedents in the *Ex Parte Meikelrjohn* case, depended on many cases coming from the Common Law tradition. The cases cited are overwhelming from Britain.

<sup>36</sup>- Howes, "From Polyjurality to Monojurality...".

<sup>37</sup>- See *Le Collectif Clio*, op.cit.,; and M. Danylewcz Taking the Veil: An Alternative to Marriage, Motherhood and Spinsterhood in Quebec, 1840-1920 (Toronto, 1987).

Morrisette). In this way, the Courts responded to society's concern for the disintegration of society. The Quebec Bench gave to the head of the family, perceived as the corner stone of society, more power and moral authority. This authority was given at the expense of the liberty of the child.

The change from the vision emphasizing liberty and that which emphasized authority is an interesting one, as it demonstrates to what extent the Courts put their faith in the natural parenting abilities of the biological parent. The American jurist Hurd had written in 1830, that the best interests of the child should be the guiding light in those cases of custody brought forth under *Habeas Corpus*. This authority was cited in almost all of the cases studied. Hurd wrote that the wishes of the child should be consulted, "...not because he has a legal right to demand it, but because it is material for the court to understand them, that it might be better to exercise discretion wisely."<sup>38</sup> The Quebec Courts began to equate the best wishes of the child with the natural home, and the care only a blood parent could give. In the case of *Proulx vs. Proulx* (1908), Judge Rinfret ruled that despite the lowly occupation of the father, in comparison with the occupation of the foster father, the child would be better off with his or her

---

<sup>38</sup>- Quoted in *Rilley vs. Grenier*, 33 L.C.J., 1888, p. 6.

natural father. "Dans une semblable matière, la Cour paraît posséder un souverain pouvoir discrétionnaire, et s'il est vrai que le seul intérêt de l'enfant doit être mon unique guide, je ne puis hésiter entre son intérêt purement matériel et son intérêt moral. Ce dernier doit prévaloir."<sup>39</sup> In 1923 this equation between the child's best interests and the natural parent was confirmed during the landmark case of *Stevenson vs. Florent*.

L'intérêt de l'enfant, qu'il faut prendre en considération, son bien être, ne résident pas surtout dans le confort matériel, mais dans les soins et l'affection paternels, dans les avantages de l'éducation familiale et religieuse. Le chagrin passager que l'enfant va, sans doute, ressentir en laissant ceux avec qui il a vécu, et qui furent bons pour lui, et en changeant d'entourage, ne saurait se comparer à la satisfaction permanente, et au bonheur solide qu'il ne tardera pas à éprouver en réalisant qu'il est désormais chez lui, dans sa demeure, par droit de naissance et non plus en vertu de la bienfaisance d'un étranger qui n'a envers lui d'obligation légale; en grandissant dans l'honneur et le respect pour ses parents, à l'ombre de leur autorité. C'est là l'intérêt de bien compris de l'enfant d'accord avec celui de la famille et de l'état.<sup>40</sup>

It should be noted that the people who were the foster parents of this little girl were her paternal grandparents, and she was certainly not dependent on the kindness of

---

<sup>39</sup>- *Proulx vs. Proulx*, 33 C.S., 1908, p. 132.

<sup>40</sup>- *Stevenson vs. Florent*, S.C.R., 1925, p. 548.

strangers.<sup>41</sup> Keeping the nuclear family together was by 1923, the duty of the Courts.<sup>42</sup>

In 1928, in the case of Kivenko vs. Yagood, the only appropriate way to protect the child's best interests was to return her to her father. Judge Rivard stated:

Le fait qu'on a recours à l'habeas corpus n'affecte donc pas le droit qu'on recherche à faire valoir par ce moyen. ...l'appelant attire notre attention à l'opinion de Hurd sur habeas corpus (2e. éd., p.532): "the welfare of the infant is the polar star by which the discretion of the Court is to be guided: but the legal rights of the parent or guardian have to be respected." Dans notre droit, l'ordre de ces deux propositions doit être renversé; c'est la puissance paternelle qu'il doit sauvegarder d'abord; en principe, il ne devait jamais être permis de l'enlever aux parents; elle est de droit naturel, et, essentiellement à l'ordre public.<sup>43</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup>- By the time this case reaches the Privy Council, the grandmother has died, and one of the reasons given for the child to returned to her mother is the age and fragility of the grandfather.

<sup>42</sup>- It is interesting to note that in several of these custody cases, the child has been fostered out to other members of the family, and not to perfect strangers. In *Steven vs. Florent* (1923), the girl lived with her grandparents. In *Nelson vs. Riley* (1888), the children lived with their grandfather. In *Truax vs. Ingals* (1898), the litigants were the stepfather, and the child's maternal grandparents. *Kivenko vs. Yagood* (1928), the children were living with an uncle. Approximately half my sample consists of parents demanding custody from members of their, or their spouse's, extended family. Despite the judges' rhetoric, then, about the nature of the blood relationship, (which can be said to exist between an uncle and his niece,) there was indeed a conscious effort to keep the nuclear family together, even if this meant, (as it did in all the cases under study) taking the child from a home with both a foster mother and father, (usually relatives) and placing them in a home with only one parent.

<sup>43</sup>- *Kivenko vs. Rivard*, 44 R.J.Q., 1928, p. 334-335.

The reinterpretation of Hurd, and the 'polar star' image signified a reevaluation of the family in Quebec's legal society. Paternal authority was perceived as a man-made creation, reflecting the natural order. This authority was also at the base of a strong state. E.-A. Côté argued passionately in 1926 that without the affirmation of paternal authority, the family unit will disintegrate, and with it society as a whole:

Il y a urgence, (de remédier la famille) car si on ne veut pas voir l'Etat s'étioler, s'anémier et mourrir, il faut que la famille, qui est a la base de l'Etat, soit bien constituée; il faut qu'elle soit respectée, et que les liens qui unissent cette trilogie du père, de la mère et de l'enfant soient inviolables, forts et considérés.... Pour que toute société vive, se developpe et progresse, il faut l'unité de commandement, sans quoi l'anarchie est à redouter.<sup>44</sup>

By 1928, *Habeas Corpus* has become a method not of enquiry, but of determining the appropriate guardian. The appropriate guardian was, by nature, the natural parent. Furthermore, by inverting Hurd's propositions, paternal authority becomes the primary "polar star", rather than the liberty of the child. By defending the rights inherent in the paternal authority, the Courts affirmed an authoritarian ideal of the family, one in which the liberty of the child had no place.

From about 1900, the judges' decisions suggest a general concern with the political importance of the family.

---

<sup>44</sup>- E.-A. Côté, L'Autorité paternelle (Rimouski, 1926), p. 7.

With the bias already established in favor of the 'trilogy', it is difficult to contend that each case could be judged fairly, on the basis of its merits, and with an open mind to exactly where the best interests of the child might actually lie.

The case of Marshall vs. Fournelle (1926) might be considered an interesting exception to the model of legal development proposed above. In this case the right of a fourteen year old girl to remain with her foster family was upheld by the Supreme Court of Canada. However the dissenting remarks of Judge Hall of the King's Bench indicate some testimony given during the trial which may have had some influence on the other two judges. Judge Hall argued first of all, that he was not convinced that the mother was an unfit person: it was alleged that she lived in sin with a young man, and that once she tried to physically remove the girl from the foster family's house, causing the child some distress and physical pain. Second, Judge Hall did not think it to be proper precedent to allow the girl's preference to overrule the authority of the mother, who has not legally been declared unfit. These two remarks suggest that the other two judges, while not remarking on the mother's conduct in their decision, probably took these allegations seriously, and felt the mother to be less than

acceptable.<sup>45</sup> The majority ruling by Judge Tessier, while couched in terms of liberty, was probably a result of their negative perception of the mother's conduct. In this way, while the case appears to uphold the liberty of the child over the authority of the parent, it might also have been a case of the judges being influenced by allegations about the parent's fitness.

The Barlow-Kennedy case was a significant step in child custody cases, between a third party and a parent. It established the major principles upon which the authoritarian vision of the family would be built. The inviolability of paternal authority, the rejection of the child's testimony, and the new interpretation of the *Habeas Corpus* procedure as one of redress, rather than enquiry, all became cornerstones of this vision of the family, a vision which emphasized the authority of the parent over the persons of his minor children.

The *Ex Parte Meikeljohn* decision reflected the opposing vision of the father-child relationship. In affirming the right of the child to choose, these judgments reflected the interpretation of the *Habeas Corpus* procedure

---

<sup>45</sup>- Judge Hall's dissenting remarks also alerts us to the problem of interpreting edited judgments. The edited judgment is often a synopsis of the judge's decision, (and the excerpts are not indicated.) Furthermore, Judge Hall mentions potentially significant testimony which is not mentioned in the majority decision, and which may have played a part in the judges' personal thought about the fitness of the individuals involved.

in its most traditional fashion. Furthermore, the implications of these decisions were more in harmony with the British and American ideal of individual liberty, rather than the ideal of strong family authority as perceived in the Code. This vision of the family as a group composed of individuals whose liberties were protected by law, was found inappropriate for Quebec society. As Andre Morel argued in his work on testamentary liberty, Quebec judges found themselves defending a very traditional, authoritarian family ideal. By the end of the nineteenth century, there was no question that to allow a child's wish to predominate over the will of the father was courting social disaster.

## II

While the courts were affirming the authority of the parent over the person of the child, thereby affirming the primacy of family unit over the liberty of the individual, judges also had the difficult task of deciding which parent best upheld their vision of the family in child custody cases between parents. Having established the relationship between the family, and the State, the courts were also asked to choose between the mother and the father; a choice which raised the issue of the relative importance of

authority, as represented by the father, and nurture, as represented by the mother.

Although divorce was unrecognized in the Quebec Courts until 1968, there existed a method for the dissolution of the couple called *separation de corps*. This procedure effectively dissolved the marriage contract, the couple was no longer bound to live together, nor were the individuals responsible for each other's debts.<sup>46</sup> Although one could not remarry, the Code explicitly stating that the only absolute termination of marriage was the death of one of the partners, it was the only socially acceptable legal procedure for breaking the marriage contract. Causes acceptable to the Bench for granting a separation included bad treatment, adultery, and lack of respect, (a woman's to her husband and not vice versa.)

No research has been undertaken for this period to suggest how many couples chose to legalize their separation, rather than merely abandoning the home. J. Snell suggests that since court proceedings were expensive, and in fact useful only if property were involved, many poorer individuals simply abandoned their home and families, "the poor man's divorce."<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>46</sup>- See Code civil du Bas-Canada, Rapports des Codificateurs (Quebec, 1865), p. 191-205.

<sup>47</sup>- J. Snell, "'The White Life for Two': The Defence of Marriage and Sexual Morality in Canada 1890-1914", Histoire sociale/Social History, XVI, 31 (mai/May, 1983), pp. 111-128.

The question of separation was an important one for the Codifiers. Having dismissed the Napoleonic model for divorce, they set out the rules and procedures for separation, (articles 186-215). Only two Articles in the Code are explicitly about children, and these allow the judges a great deal of discretion. The other articles deal with the reasons justifying their granting of a separation, and the appropriate division of property. The tentative directives given in the Code to judges ruling on separation, and especially custody between parents, suggests that the Codifiers were concerned about this sensitive issue, and preferred to err on the side of the conservative, allowing judges to rule on each case's merits. This judiciary discretion means that the judgments are a good barometer of the changing social values, as judges interpret the facts of the case in the light of current social fashions.

The most significant changing social fashion for custody cases was the new vision of women and motherhood. The argument put forward by suffragists for example, suggested that women, the guardians of the home and morality, should have an extended franchise in order to more properly protect, through legislation, the home and morality. Within this movement was a reexamination of the value of children, and their importance for the future. This idea of women as the defenders of the hearth was, to a

certain extent, in conflict with the paternal authority established in the Quebec Code.

A second problem was that many men claiming custody would not be physically capable of providing the kind of personal care their children were now perceived as needing. Urban, middle class fathers were particularly vulnerable, as one consequence of urbanization was the significant distance between the home and the work place. This distance meant that children either would be cared for by someone else, or would have to be put in some institution, such as a convent. The father might be the legally acceptable guardian of the child, but by the turn of the century, Quebec Courts, through their recognition of the new needs of the child, were recognizing the moral rights of the mother.

Custody battles prior to World War One, presented certain difficulties to Quebec judges. According to Article 214, the injured party, the spouse suing for separation, should be granted custody, unless the judge deemed it in the best interest of the child to award custody elsewhere. The Code did not explicitly state to whom custody should be granted, and some judges awarded custody to other family members, or institutions.<sup>48</sup> Similar to the divorces granted by the Senate during this period, it was much easier for a

---

<sup>48</sup>- See P.-B. Mignault, Le Droit civil canadien, Tome II, (Montréal, 1895-1916), p. 141. See also Bytheway vs. Lille, (1919).

husband to be granted a separation than a wife.<sup>49</sup> This contributed to the bias of the cases, at least until *Malloch vs. Graham* (1917), since it was easier for the husband to present himself as the injured party, thereby assuring him of custody. While in accord with the principles of paternal authority as a fundamental social construction, judges were torn between the father's authority and the need of the child for the care 'only a mother could give'.<sup>50</sup>

To lose custody did not mean, however, losing all the rights of paternal authority. In the case of *Valade vs. Corbeil* (1889) before the Superior Court (in review), the father did not lose the right of paternal authority, even

---

<sup>49</sup>- Snell, "The White Life For Two...".

<sup>50</sup>- This preference for the mother was relatively consistent, despite the minority viewpoint, held by some jurists, even as late as 1926, which favored the father as the more capable parent.

S'il existe égalité de sentiments et d'amour des parents pour leurs enfants, qu'elle est la raison de cette préférence en faveur du père? ... C'est que le père est le plus apte tant au point de vue physique que moral. Il a, plus que la mère, l'habitude des affaires; par son expérience personnelle, il a appris à mieux connaître les personnes et les choses et cette expérience lui sera d'un grand secours pour guider efficacement son enfant et le préparer pour la grande lutte de l'existence. Au point de vue moral, le père a plus souvent pour guide la raison; tandis que la mère écoute plus souvent son coeur, se laisse plus facilement attendrir. Si la loi confie au père le commandement au sein de la famille parce qu'il est peut-être plus apte à procurer à ses enfants une éducation virile, elle sait d'avance que la mère ne leur refusera pas son affection et son coeur pour que, plus tard, ils deviennent de respectables citoyens.

Côté, op.cit., p.91-2.

though his wife had won custody during the separation. (Francois Corbeil had allegedly given his wife syphilis, and instead of providing for his family, "s'est livré à la passion du jeu, et à ses habitudes dissipées,...".<sup>51</sup>) In review, the judges confirmed the right of the father to supervise his children's education, and further, his right to appear before the court at a later date if he had grounds to suspect that his wife was making immoderate use of the power invested in her. While the father lost his right to custody, his basic authority over his children was not challenged.<sup>52</sup> Despite the syphilis, and the gambling, Francois Corbeil was not considered unfit enough to be divested of his paternal authority. Women, on the other hand, could be prohibited by the Courts from having custody of their children if they were prostitutes. This discrepancy suggests that, at least until the Malloch-Graham case (1917), the courts accepted not only the social importance

---

<sup>51</sup>- Valade vs. Corbeil, 33 L.C.J., 1889, p. 208.

<sup>52</sup>- In accord with the principle laid down in Barlow vs. Kennedy.

of paternal authority, but also that a father's dissipation was of less significance for the child than a mother's.<sup>53</sup>

Early decisions of custody between parents suggest that there was a conscientious effort to follow the letter of the law, and grant custody to the injured spouse (Pillet vs. Delisle, 1884, Valade vs. Corbeil, 1889, and Moore vs. Guillard, 1893). In the case of Valade vs. Corbeil (1889), the records show a most acrimonious court battle, with both parties accusing the other of foul and abusive behavior and language, forcing the innocent party to abandon the marital home, and finally, there were mutual accusations of contracting syphilis. The judgment published is quite

---

<sup>53</sup>- Snell explains in his article on divorce in Canada prior to World War 1, that in order for the wife to be granted a divorce, the husband had to have his concubine share the matrimonial home, whereas, the wife had only to be presumed to be conducting herself in an untoward fashion to be divorced. As in the Quebec custody cases, the onus was on the women to conduct herself in an unimpeachable manner. The conclusion one can draw from these official records appears to be that because of her position as guardian of the home, children, and morality, a women had to be extra pure, as any dissipation on her part would have far more effect on the home than her husband's, which could be conducted in a quiet manner outside the home. It is only when he transgresses the household threshold with the concubine, thereby defiling the home, that he can be divorced. The ideal of the sanctity of the home and hearth, examined by A. Douglas, The Feminization of American Culture (New York, 1988); and F. Thompson, The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain, 1830-1900 (London, 1989), can be seen to be operating in Canada as well.

explicit about the nature and reliability of the witnesses, and the mother was finally awarded custody.<sup>54</sup>

One of the first cases which challenged the right of the injured spouse to automatic custody was O'Dell vs. Gregory (1893). Although the father was granted custody of two young boys, the mother's right to visit was also maintained, despite her adulterous behavior. Judge Routhier explained in his decision: "Si le père est le roi de la famille, la mère en est la reine; d'ou ce dualisme harmonieux de force et de douceur, de justice et d'amour, qui représente si bien, pour l'enfant, l'autorité paternelle."<sup>55</sup> In maintaining the mother's right to visit, Judge Routhier's argument was based on an interpretation of paternal authority in which the mother played a part.

Although the Code explicitly gave the father exclusive power over his children, Mignault suggested that very young

---

<sup>54</sup>- The case of Courteau vs. Skelly (1901) stands as an example of how conscientious the judges were in these cases. In this 1901 case, the judge ruled that Dame Courteau, even in seeking separation and custody, had to respond to her husband's allegations that it was her own conduct which drove him to his unfaithful conduct, injury, insult and refusal to provide.' She demurred on the ground that her conduct would bear no relation on the case of separation. The judge responded that while her conduct might not have an effect on the case for separation, it might have a bearing on the question of custody, and the case was dismissed. This case suggests that the Bench was very conscious of its social role, especially when it considered the fitness of the parent in awarding custody.

<sup>55</sup>- O'Dell vs. Gregory, 5 R.J.Q., 1894, p. 348.

children should remain with their mothers.<sup>56</sup> This is an interesting point, as Mignault was a great defender of the conservative vision of Quebec society. Between 1895 and 1906, Pierre-Basile Mignault published his *Commentaires* on the Quebec Civil Code. This was the first comprehensive examination of the Code and the related jurisprudence, and its importance in influencing the subsequent evolution of Quebec law cannot be underestimated. Mignault's general comments on paternal authority as it functioned within society confirmed the family as hierarchial, and the father as ultimate authority figure. "La puissance paternelle est, en effet, l'élément primitif et nécessaire de toute société." Mignault continues to affirm the necessity for unchallenged authority, by suggesting that a mother's responsibility is to defer to her husband, as "son intervention serait pleine de conflit; la paix du ménage en serait troublée et le bonheur des enfants compromis."<sup>57</sup> Without such delegated and absolute authority within the family, society would crumble.

Even the State's right to intervene was based, according to Mignault, on the demands of public order. The State serves as social regulator, and should intervene only in the interests of society or when public order is

---

<sup>56</sup>- P.-B. Mignault, op.cit., T. II, p. 38.

<sup>57</sup>- Ibid., p. 143.

compromised.<sup>58</sup> Mignault affirmed the family as central to the good ordering of society, and within this context, the father stands as ultimate protector of this vision. His authority cannot be compromised, or social chaos would ensue. And yet, Mignault suggested that very young children, (age unspecified) required a mother's care. To a certain extent, Mignault's own remarks forced a breach in the impervious wall of paternal authority, at least as it applied to real children and real mothers and fathers. This brief analysis of Mignault's analysis of the Code again suggests that there was a serious problem in reconciling the ideals of the family, and the real needs of its individual members.

The idea of motherhood as necessary for a child's well being was essentially confirmed in the case of *Poitras vs. Lafrance* (1900). In this case, the mother, accused of adultery, is granted temporary custody of the youngest child, aged one year, but not the eldest, aged four, who had been placed in a convent school by her father. It could be argued that this was only a temporary custody hearing, and that the subsequent trial would examine more closely the allegations; however, the idea that a mother was the appropriate parent for a young child, and that despite the allegation of adultery, should be allowed to keep the child with her, if only temporarily, is an indication of how the

---

<sup>58</sup>- Ibid., p. 144.

Quebec Bench was beginning to assume that mothers, despite some untoward behavior, were more important to their children than fathers.

Increasingly, the Quebec Courts, confirmed the rights of the mother. In *Nault vs. Nault* (1911), the Bench granted the wife temporary custody, despite her abandonment of the conjugal home. An important consideration in this case was that the father's employment was some distance from his home, thereby obliging him to place the child in the care of a nurse. Judge Globensky, took into consideration the father's place of employment, and therefore his inability to care personally for the child. Judge Globensky, in ruling in favor of the mother, introduced one of the major inconsistencies between the ideals of paternal authority and the reality of early twentieth century urban life for the late Victorian man: the conflict between the private and the public lives. With this precedent, it became increasingly difficult for men to claim their children in custody battles, as it became obvious that they would be incapable of adequately caring for the child.<sup>59</sup> On the other hand, the mother, perhaps unable to find permanent employment

---

<sup>59</sup>- As early as 1869, an Ontario mother attempted to fight for custody, on the grounds that her husband was a busy man, and could not adequately care for their young daughter. (*In re Allen* (1869), cited in Backhouse, "Shifting Patterns...", p. 221).

anyway, became the child's most obvious parent.<sup>60</sup> The emphasis in custody battles becomes reversed. Whereas in earlier cases the father was the Courts' preferred parent, by 1911, the mother has become the Courts' first choice.

The significance of this decision was many fold. It signifies a new appreciation of the child and its needs, thereby signalling a new family organization. Before the Nault case, children were assumed to be better off with their father, an obvious choice, as he had the financial resources to care for them. As the Nault case suggests, this idea of the child was being challenged. Children were being seen as needing more than financial aid. They also were perceived as needing constant emotional care. For the urban father, providing constant emotional care was difficult, as more and more men worked outside their homes, and as children were trained in their occupations by other men or institutions. As the image of the child changed, so did the division of responsibility between the parents. The late Victorian man became less capable of fulfilling the new emotional needs of his children.

The extent of the revolution in the Court's reevaluation of the importance of the mother can seen in an examination of two cases, Truax vs. Ingalls (1898) and

---

<sup>60</sup>- Constance Backhouse notes that women awarded custody in English Canada had to be living with a male kin. Ibid., p. 219. There is no evidence in the reported Quebec cases that such a condition was necessary for a mother to claim custody.

Stevenson vs. Florent (1926). In the first case, the maternal grandparents of a nine year old girl kidnapped the child from her home with her stepfather, her legal guardian. (The child's natural parents were both dead.) The stepfather sued the grandparents for the return of his ward under *Habeas Corpus*. In this case, although the judge understood that the girl should feel more affection for her own family, the child was returned to the stepfather, because the grandparents had kidnapped her. The grandparents forfeited their right to the child by not proceeding along established rules. In Stevenson vs. Florent however, the judges accepted that the mother should try and kidnap her daughter from the home of her paternal grandparents, it being only natural that motherhood expresses itself. The judgments in these two cases suggest that the Quebec Courts were becoming increasingly influenced by society's new ideals of the family, and within these new ideals the mothers were considered more significant to their children's well being than the fathers.

While the cases which came before the Courts were still judged in favor of paternal authority, the case of Malloch vs. Graham (1917) suggests that the ideal of motherhood had insinuated itself firmly into the legal community. This was an important case, as it was the first to recognize that despite her promiscuous behavior, a woman did not necessarily lose her rights in terms of the 'communauté de

biens'. Furthermore, the judgment of the lower court "not to interfere with the children born of her with the plaintiff" was overturned in appeal, asserting that a mother had the right to visit her children, and to look after their welfare, despite her marital behavior. However ad hoc these rights may have been, they were beginning to be taken into consideration. By the 1920's, it was not only the husband who could appeal on the basis of the formal text of paternal authority, but the mother had some recourse under the 'Ideals of Motherhood.' Considering the Bench's aversion to allowing the will of the child to enter into conflict with the father's rights, the acceptance of the importance of the mother's voice was a significant one, as it suggested a reformulation of the legal perception of the internal hierarchy within the family. While the mother's rights remained on a casual level,<sup>61</sup> this new hierarchy suggests a newly recognized balance between authority and nurture.

\*\*\*\*

This study of custody cases suggests that overall, the legal community reinforced the traditional family structure. The importance placed on the hierarchy inherent in paternal

---

<sup>61</sup>- And therefore dependent on the judge's individual judgement of what was a proper parent.

authority can be understood as a foundation for such a structure. A similar foundation would be the de facto absence of testamentary liberty, drawn to our attention by Andre Morel. This ideal was defended by the Courts as they awarded custody to the natural parent, no matter what the child wanted, or, for that matter, which litigant was in a better position to care for the child. To a certain extent, the decisions in custody cases between a natural parent and a foster family can be seen as a discouragement of competing forms of family structures. As such, the Quebec Courts defended this image until well into the 1950's. The Courts, like the spirited reformers, perceived the family as being under siege, and expended great effort at reinforcing the structure against any and every threat. Unlike the reformers, however, the Bench did not look to the moral purity of the mother to protect the threshold, but to the older, authority laden pater-familias image.

The unstated ideal of the father in law was a rational, powerful autocrat, his power over his children affirmed over both the child's will, or the will of any other individual. This ideal was, furthermore, confirmed by the absence of successful challenges, which might have altered the judicial vision of the father. Such an ideal had certain political overtones to it, as the 1926 study of the question by Cote attests. The only successful challenge to the judicial vision of the father as the apex of the family hierarchy,

was that introduced by the Cult of Motherhood. The new perceptions of the child dictated that mothers, the 'natural' nurturer, were more significant and important to their child's development than mere material providing, the traditional function of the father. In essence then, like in Ontario, the shift in judicial vision had relatively less to do with the Court's perception of the Victorian man, and more to do with a changing image of the child.

What is particularly unique in the case of the Quebec Bench, is the interplay between the discourse on the family, and the reality of the custody decisions between the parents. The legal community, in defending the biological family placed the father as its representative, its symbolic head. The father functioned in this discourse as the totem pole of tradition, of social stability. While the traditional and hierarchial vision of the family was never fully challenged by the slow incorporation of the moral rights of motherhood, when faced with two parents demanding custody, the Bench and the jurists increasingly saw the father as the parent less suitable for child rearing, in comparison with his more capable wife. The reality of children's needs and the discourse on the family never truly combined as it did in certain American states, which on hearing the mother's voice, the courts and legislatures eventually modified the laws and permitted and promoted the development of the 'democratic family.' In Quebec, the Bench

managed to keep the two levels separate: the mother's voice would not supplant the father's authority, at least on the ideological level. In reality, however, the Bench was increasingly willing to give some weight to the claims of motherhood.

The discrepancies between the image of the father presented in Protestant reform literature, and that argued from the Quebec Bench can be accounted for in several ways. The increasing feeling of national alienation felt by French Canadians, due in part to the hanging of Riel, the Manitoba Schools Question, the South African War effort and the Naval Bill debate, created a mentality of cultural and social retrenchment. All elements of society were drafted into the war against acculturation and assimilation. The family and particularly the father were part of this protectionist policy. Strong authority, exact hierarchy and clear chains of command were important social goals in French Canadian society. The child's will was a threat to this established pattern of authority, although an important, but incidental space was given to the mother's voice. Thus, the continued attachment to the traditional authority figuration of the pater-familias in the Quebec Bench can be explained by the important social and cultural protectionist efforts. The Protestant reformers, part of the National and Empire building spirit, animated by a belief in the perfectibility of man and society, appeared to be more willing to challenge

some of the traditional roles of the father, as protector of the family, as high priest of the household, by encouraging alternative leaders, or the ideal of mother-love.

And yet, to emphasize the differences between the Quebec Bench and the reformers is to ignore some very important similarities between these two agencies of social control. Both believed that the family was at the base of a strong State, and that the family was severely threatened by the consequences of industrialization and urbanization. Although to different degrees, both maintained the ideal of the father as an important authority figure, and moral arbiter of the family. Finally, and most importantly, both agencies, in acknowledging the new needs of the child, and the mother's 'natural' nurturing qualities, drove a wedge into the traditional image of the family, the leading edge of which was the new 'sentimentalized' family, where emotional intimacy and nurturing played a significant role. In this new climate, whatever the political or rhetorical ideal of the father was, his place as 'head of the household' was undermined.

Chapter IV  
"Putting his Oar In"  
Images of the Father in Children's Literature

The first three chapters of this study have described the late nineteenth early twentieth century father through the public looking-glass of current fashions in household

patterns, judicial and theological developments.<sup>1</sup> Emphasizing social trends and fashions, however, still leaves the father a quasi public and perhaps overly rigid figure. The following two chapters are based on fiction written roughly between 1870 and 1914. The first chapter is based on fiction written for children, the second is based on fiction for adults. Fiction, like church literature or legal judgments also creates parameters, more fluid and more

---

<sup>1</sup>- To a certain extent, the study of the legal and theological vision of the father can be considered as prescriptive. And in that way, as Charles Rosenberg argues, it can be understood as a parameter within which the individual creates his own experience.

To delineate role prescriptions is, of course, not to describe behavior; no particular individual need have lived his or her life in accordance with these projected values. On the other hand, one never escapes them entirely; every member of a particular generation has somehow to find an individual accommodation with respect to these ideal prescriptions. Even those who reject a life entirely consistent with such ideals cannot elude them completely-for they constitute a parameter which helps define the nature and content of their deviance. In the series of choices which can be said to describe growth, options rejected as well as those accepted form a part of one's self-image, become an element in the configuration of emotional resonance which ultimately defines individuality.

C. Rosenberg, "Sexuality, Class and Role in 19th Century America", in E. Pleck and J. Pleck, eds., The American Man (Englewood Cliffs, 1980), p. 221.

individual than law or theology, but none the less powerful.<sup>2</sup>

This chapter will examine the image of parents in children's literature written between 1870 and 1914; more specifically, the roles of fathers and mothers, and their interplay with their children. A second theme is the authors' vision of what was important concerning the expectations the readers should have about their future "private" life. Children's literature provides a unique point of entry into aspects of any historical period. Written for children, it often offers a simplification of significant images and themes, thereby indicating what the adults (as represented by the author, the editors, and the adult choosing the book) wanted the children to know about their society.

---

<sup>2</sup>- The use of literature in historical studies is rare. More often it is the literary specialists who have suggested models from literature to illuminate certain social and cultural aspects of an earlier period. Nina Auerbach's suggestive study of the variations of womanhood presented in Victorian novels has taken women's studies beyond the older historiographical vision of the Victorian women as either Madonna or Magdalene. N. Auerbach, Women and the Demon (Cambridge, 1982). See also J. Townsend, Written for Children (Harmondsworth, 1974); and G. Avery, Childhood's Patterns A Study of Heroes and Heroines of Children's Fiction (London, 1975).

Although J. Flemming cautions historians about the use of literature, he concludes that if examined carefully, literature can be as illuminating as any of the other sources Clio has appropriated. J. Flemming, "Historians and the Evidence of Literature", Journal of Interdisciplinary History, IV, I (Summer, 1973), pp. 95-105.

Prior to 1850, literature written expressly for children was unusual. The market was limited by the low rate of literacy. Until that time, children tended to read toned down editions of adult literature, and what was written for them was very didactic,<sup>3</sup> characters and plots were two-dimensional. The characters were usually moral paragons who withstood every temptation in a virtuous fashion, and were rewarded in a suitable manner: when they died, usually at a tender age, they went to heaven. This type of child character has been identified by some historians as reflecting the primary concern of parents and society about children: the assurance of their moral and spiritual well being.<sup>4</sup>

By 1850, however, a subtle shift of focus began in the tone and content of these books.<sup>5</sup> Without completely losing the instructive focus, morality is treated with a lighter touch as the characters become identifiable children. The books written for children become more numerous, and more

---

<sup>3</sup>- J. Townsend, Written for Children: An Outline of English Language Children's Literature (Harmondsworth, 1974), Chapter 1.

<sup>4</sup>- L. Pollock, Forgotten Children: Parent-child Relations, 1500-1900 (Cambridge, New York 1983); N. Semple, "'Nuture and Admonition of The Lord': Nineteenth-Century Canadian Methodism's Response to 'Childhood'", Histoire sociale/Social History, XIV, 27 (mai/May, 1981), pp. 460-475.

<sup>5</sup>- Townsend, op.cit., p. 55. Historians of children's literature consider the rise in the literacy rate as the spark to this development which created a large and lucrative market, thereby attracting some very good authors.

concerned to prepare the readers for a useful role in secular society.<sup>6</sup>

Children's literature seeks to maintain the status quo, both in style, and content, with regard to its intended reader. It also responds to the perception of the nature of the child by society. As such it is an accurate barometer of values, and attitudes of a society, and a useful tool for the historian, in understanding adults' expectations of children, their present behavior, their future expectations, and their environment.<sup>7</sup>

The selection of books used in this study requires some explanation.<sup>8</sup> Sixty two English language children's books, written for children between the ages of seven and fourteen, published 1850 and 1914 were selected and analyzed. The

---

<sup>6</sup>- L. Pollock, op. cit.. See also G. Avery, Childhood's Patterns A Study of Heroes and Heroines of Children's Fiction (London, 1975), p. 122. This shift in tone in children's literature reflects the general change in nineteenth century society's perception of childhood. There is a new awareness of, and increased interest in, childhood as a state somewhat distinct from adulthood. Throughout the early nineteenth century, childhood had become identified as a state of spiritual grace, rather than the personification of malevolence.

<sup>7</sup>- Adult literature has been used successfully by several researchers to illuminate certain aspects of the relationship between men and women in the Victorian period. See for example J. Miller, Women Writing About Men (New York, 1986); and Auerbach, op.cit..

<sup>8</sup>- See Appendix D for a complete explanation of the selection of the sample used in this study, and Appendix E for a list of titles used.

assumption was that at this age children were reading more or less alone,<sup>9</sup> and that while the books might have come out of a library, or been given as a gift by a fond aunt or grandparent,<sup>10</sup> reading was virtually an autonomous activity.<sup>11</sup> This too, was the age group entering the world of adulthood,<sup>12</sup> and the models created for it were designed

---

<sup>9</sup>- The participation at the Sunday night reading aloud of a favorite author such as Charles Dickens probably continued however, until the child moved away from home, as long as there were younger children around the house. (See L. Alcott Little Men <1857>. (Boston, 1969), p. 44-45, and a letter from Bernard Harrington to his wife Anna Dawson-Harrington, September 23, 1894. Dawson-Harrington Family. University Archives, McGill University, Montreal.)

<sup>10</sup>- Witness the large number of inscriptions in the first editions of these books.

<sup>11</sup>- This process of adult intervention is documented in Rudyard Kipling's Just So Stories <1902>. If you read it aloud, which is what the author intended, you will notice that the author is drawing your attention to certain key plot details, that the child you are reading it to should be alerted to. Reading aloud to younger children often involves stopping the story to explain words, or going over a plot development. Since this is such a personal and intimate aspect of young reader's experience, the historian has probably lost this total reading experience forever.

<sup>12</sup>- J. Walvin, A Child's World: A Social History of English Childhood 1880-1914 (Hardmonsworth, 1982); and N. Sutherland, Children in English Canadian Society: Framing the Twentieth-Century Consensus (Toronto, 1976).

to explain the reader's place within the societal structure.<sup>13</sup>

Two sources provided a list of about two hundred titles, from which to sample. The first were library lists. The second were the private papers of Osla Clouston, and Sheldon Stephens, who in letters and diaries, noted what they read.<sup>14</sup> Although both these children were ill much of their lives (which might mean that they read more than other children) their diaries were very useful in establishing the important fact that books available on a library shelf were indeed read. Osla Clouston's papers contained an address book of some 100 titles, of books probably on her own or her sister's shelves at home. From this initial list of two hundred titles fifty of the most popular titles were chosen, based on the criterion explained above.

While it remains impossible to say exactly which child read which kind of book, these books were available both through the library and in children's homes. One significant

---

<sup>13</sup>- Fairy tales, and fables were excluded on the grounds that many of the plots issued out of an earlier generation, and this study's focus was in what the Victorians were writing about for their own children, rather than the manner in which they altered past stories to suit contemporary conditions. R. Darnton, "Peasants Tell Tales: The Meaning of Mother Goose", in The Great Cat Massacre And Other Episodes in French Cultural History (New York, 1983), pp. 9-74; J. Zipes, Fairy Tales and the Art of Subversion: The Classical Genre for children and the Process of Civilization (New York, 1983).

<sup>14</sup>- See chapter 6 infra, for a full discussion of these two children and their families.

question is whether books written for one gender were read by the other gender.<sup>15</sup> Although not conclusive, the letters and diaries of Osla Clouston and Sheldon Stephens suggest that while Osla had a great number of adventure titles in her address book, Sheldon was not reading domestic stories, such as Louisa Alcott's Little Women. It may be that the stories written for girl's were indeed only read by them, but that the "adventure" story was enjoyed by all. Without more study of the reading habits of the Victorian child, it is impossible to know how rigidly gender determined reading material. The only conclusion we can be sure of is that the books were available and that the children did read them.

## I

The girls' books of the late nineteenth century, British, Canadian and American, emphasize the notion of family creation. There is no significant difference between the British and American models. The plots of the books follow young girls in their attempts to create an environment suitable to the fulfillment of their needs as a

---

<sup>15</sup>- Women wrote books for girls, and men wrote books for boys. Animal stories were written, and probably read, by both genders.

child.<sup>16</sup> The fulfillment of these needs are the adult's responsibility; and it is the successful integration of the child's needs and the adult's responsibility which gives these stories their emotional content. The "domestic bliss"<sup>17</sup> as the plot resolution is an indication of what Victorian society desired as goals for its girls. There are no surprises here. Girls are homemakers and from the very first, their stories reinforce the "Angel in the House" motif. After a brief discussion of some of the most common elements found in these stories, this chapter will focus on the caretakers in these stories, and how they interact with the children.

The literary device most used by the authors of girls' children's stories is the orphan heroine motif. Of the twenty three stories chosen for this study, the most striking point of similarity amongst the authors was the use of the orphan heroine. Only three protagonists come from an intact family: two are heroines in school books by Angela

---

<sup>16</sup>- In this selection of girls' books, some stories were included in which the protagonist was a young boy. Timothy's Quest <1890>, Hans Brinker and the Silver Skates <1865>, and Little Lord Fauntelroy <1886>. However, these stories were all written by women, and all the plots conform to the domestic type, rather than the exotic adventure story. Furthermore, the protagonists' personalities conform more closely to the female type, rather than the male type as examined through the analysis of the boy's adventure story. These stories should be considered as images of what the late nineteenth century woman thought men should be.

<sup>17</sup>- Townsend, op. cit., p. 55.

Brazil. School books focus on relationships with peers, and parents are present only by implication, and are not important for either plot, or character development. In the other novel with an intact family, Poor Little Rich Girl <1912>, the heroine's parents ignore her, leaving her in the care of nurses and nannies. All the other heroines, have lost one or both parents, either temporarily or permanently. Furthermore, twelve protagonists have no siblings. Finally, all the protagonists are very young children, between five and fourteen years old: with two exceptions, Meg March (Little Women) who is sixteen and the heroine of Daddy-Long Legs <1912> who is seventeen. These are young girls, alone in the world, who must devise some sort of nurturing relationship with the adults around them to replace the parents they have lost. Their youth prevents them from surviving outside some form of institution, be it an orphanage, a school, or a family.

Their youth and their dependency is also reinforced by the geographic setting of the story. The heroines do not live in, or even travel to, isolated areas of the world. Their spheres are the little towns, or big cities, which in a sense underlines the girl's dependency on agents outside of herself. The majority of the stories are 'suburban' or rural in their setting, and what is important is not the geographic, or climatic elements, but the people who live there.

The issue of class is rarely raised in these books. The heroines are all from the gentlefolk, and even Sarah Crewe, reduced to a scullery maid after her father dies, tries to act 'appropriately' to her station. On one of her hungriest days, she gives five of six buns to another child who looks even hungrier than she (A Little Princess <1888>). Gerty, of unknown parentage until the end of the story, learns to act with grace and poise, suggesting that good middle class manners can be learned by anyone, if only they take the trouble. More important, once learned they ought not, under even the most adverse conditions, be lost (The Lamplighter <1854>). Little Lord Fauntelroy, the republican boy who inherits an English estate, is an example of the standard of 'good manners' which learned very young, stands the hero in good stead, as he wins over his grandfather with his manly bearing, and calm courage. Even Kate Wiggin's little Timothy, an orphan reared in the most degrading of big city environments, is polite, careful about cleanliness, and although his speech is often imperfect, he is the ultimate little gentleman, devoted to finding a mother for his 'adopted' sister, Gay. In a sense, by restricting themselves to stories about middle or upper class children (or children who aspire to this class,) the authors reinforce the notion of dependency. The middle class Victorian women could not exist without some form of family or other caretaking

institution, without losing her status,<sup>18</sup> and these stories all help to strengthen that dependent image.

These authors consistently refuse to follow their protagonists through the dull and dreary world of domestic service,<sup>19</sup> artfully saving them with the 'long lost uncle' if need be. The point is made: children need a home. This is a strong consideration for Marilla when deciding to keep Anne after their visit with Mrs. Blewett (Anne of Green Gables <1908>). The authors insist that these girls will build a home for themselves, in much the same way the Victorian woman was expected to build a home for her family. Without it, the options are unattractive.

These young protagonists, finding themselves because of abandonment or adoption in an initially sometimes hostile environment, are obliged to fall back on the adults around them. Their needs as children must be met in order to survive and it is the responsibility of both mothers and fathers or their surrogates to provide for these needs,

---

<sup>18</sup>- B. Welter, "The Cult of True Womanhood, 1820-1860", American Quarterly, XVIII, 2 (Summer, 1966); P. Branca, The Silent Sisterhood: Middle Class Woman in the Victorian Home (Pittsburgh, 1975); M. Danylewycz, Taking the Veil: An Alternative to Marriage, Motherhood and Spinsterhood in Quebec, 1840-1920 (Toronto, 1987).

<sup>19</sup>- An option statistically more probable according to J. Parr, Labouring Children: British Immigrant Apprentices to Canada, 1869-1924 (Montreal, London, 1980) who has argued that children without their parents were often sent into service, or else put into institutions. See also Sutherland, op.cit.; and P. Rooke and R. Schnell, "Childhood and Charity in Nineteenth-Century British North America", Histoire sociale/Social History, XV, 29 (mai/May, 1982), pp. 157-179.

which for the purposes of analysis are grouped into four main headings: nurturance, material welfare, discipline, and protection.

These books assume that children need to be nurtured. There is no female Kim, able to attach themselves at age 6 to anybody who happens along, and take the rough with the smooth. Affection and care are essential for a child to grow. Jimmy Bean explains to Pollyanna "I'd like a home--jest a common one, ye know, with a mother in it, instead of a matron. If ye has a home, ye has folks: and I hain't had folks since dad died. ... They (at the orphanage) ain't like folks, ye know. They don't care."<sup>20</sup> Another of Kate Wiggin's heroes reflects upon the difference between the comforts of a Home with a capital H, compared with the comforts of a cosy one with the little "h":

Not that he had any ill treatment to remember in the excellent institution of which he was for several years an inmate. The matron was an amiable and hard-working woman, who wished to do her duty to all the children under her care; but it would be an inspired human being indeed who could give a hundred and fifty motherless or fatherless children all the education and care and training they needed, to say nothing of the love they missed and craved. What wonder, then, that an occasional hungry little soul, starved for want of something not provided by the management; say, a morning cuddle in father's bed or a ride on father's knee,--in short, the sweet daily jumble of lap-trotting, gentle caressing, endearing words, twilight stories, motherly tucks-in-bed, good-night kisses,--all the dear,

---

<sup>20</sup>— E. H. Porter, Pollyanna The Glad Book <1912> (Boston, 1946), p. 66, 71.

simple, everyday accompaniments of the home with the little "h".<sup>21</sup>

This anti-institutionalism is repeated in many of the other books.<sup>22</sup> Parents, or even individuals, care for the children the way institutions cannot. Although none of the stories actually dramatize what might happen if a child is left in an uncaring environment, the despair that Elsie (Elsie Dinsmore <1867>) feels when her father is harsh with her suggests that authors are concerned with the idea that children need affection and nurturing. In The Lamplighter, Gerty is explicitly threatened with death due to the maltreatment she received at the hands of Nan Grant, a boarding house keeper in whose care Gerty was entrusted when her mother died.

What is surprising is that the men who succor these children are just as responsible as the women for their nurturance, and quite often more capable than the women. It

---

<sup>21</sup>- K. Wiggin, Timothy's Quest (Boston, 1891) p. 28. Timothy is only eleven years old himself, but his quest was for a mother for the little 'adopted' sister, Gay, who was only about 3 years old. It is significant that while the 'home' described in the passage includes a father, the home Timothy eventually finds has only two spinsters.

<sup>22</sup>- L. Montgomery, Anne of Green Gables (Toronto, 1968), p. 14, 51. Alcott's Little Men is a story about the boys at Penfield, which is an institution run by Jo March, and her husband, Prof. Bhaer, based on the principle that children's "institutions" should resemble as closely as possible a "home" with a mother and a father. In the sequel Jo's Boys <1886> the "family" of orphans comes together one last time, and all the boys are grateful for the start they got at Penfield, under the careful, guiding hands of the Bhaers.

is Matthew who "cottons on" to Anne first, long before Marilla (Anne of Green Gables), and Ben, the lamplighter, who saves Gerty from Nan Grant, nursing her back to health during her long fever (The Lamplighter). This need for emotional intimacy is a very strong in children, and one often shown to strike a more responsive cord in the men than in the women.

The second need of these fictional children is their material welfare. Without any examples of intact families, it is hard to judge how the authors perceived the distribution of this responsibility, between two parents. When women raise the children alone, they often lack the means to give them everything they need and the heroines are obliged to find surrogates to provide for their material needs. In Little Women, the old neighbor, Mr. Lawrence, encourages Beth and Jo to play the piano at his house, since their piano was ruined and the funds unavailable to repair it.<sup>23</sup> Mary Craven's uncle remembers her enough to send her nice books up from London (The Secret Garden).<sup>24</sup> The most extreme example of providing is shown in The Five Peppers and How They Grew, when the mother has to give up her eldest daughter temporarily to the care of Mr. King so that the

---

<sup>23</sup>- L. Alcott, Little Women <1868> (Boston, 1968), p. 56.

<sup>24</sup>- F. Burnett, The Secret Garden <1911> (London, 1911), p. 215-6.

daughter can have better music instruction.<sup>25</sup> Natural and surrogate parents are expected to provide the child with its basic physical needs, even if this means, as in the case with Mrs. Pepper, giving up the child, at least temporarily.

In these stories, not only are providing and nurturing both important, but both parents are responsible for fulfilling these needs (Poor Little Rich Girl). This is especially true for some of the fathers in the stories. Mr. Dinsmore provides financially for his daughter, but he does not love her, does not accept her, and eventually, he will cause a serious accident because of his inability to love his daughter (Elsie Dinsmore). Mr. Craven, who lost his wife in child birth, shuns the child. "He had supplied doctors and nurses and luxuries, but he had shrunk away from the mere thought of the boy and had buried himself in his own misery....He had forgotten and deserted his home and duties."<sup>26</sup>

There are a few cases of serious material neglect. In A Little Princess, it is Mrs. Mitchims' cruelty to Sarah after her father's death, which in the end provokes Mr. Carrisford

---

<sup>25</sup>- M. Sidney, Five Little Peppers and How They Grew, <1880> (New York, 1976), p. 259. A similar situation is portrayed by K. Wiggin in Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm, <1903> where the mother selects one of her children, Rebecca, as being the child with the most to gain by living with her aunts, who will provide a "proper education".

<sup>26</sup>- Burnett, The Secret Garden, p. 64.

to take an interest in the child, and thereby discover her true identity, and restore her fortune. Nan Grant in The Lamplighter also neglects and mistreats Gerty, left in her care after the death of her mother. If Ben had not happened to be walking by the house at that time, Gerty would probably have died of exposure. These cases of actual neglect underline the danger to a young girl if left unprotected by a family. It is significant that in both cases, it is a man who saves the child.

The third need of the child is discipline. The nature of the fictional discipline is very mild. There are no cases of striking or whipping a child. Adults in these stories all attempt to reason with the child first, to influence her with good role models, or in very severe cases, temporarily depriving her of her liberty.<sup>27</sup> It might be argued that because these heroines are more high-spirited than outrightly rebellious or evil-minded, the images of stern authoritarianism are unnecessary. The concern the parents show over proper behavior and that mis-behavior is immediately disciplined, seems to indicate that discipline is an issue, and that the parents see disciplinary measures as a means of keeping the child on the "right way".

---

<sup>27</sup>- Mrs. March tells a story about being tied to a bed post by her mother, after having forgotten to come home for dinner one night, and Anne of Green Gables is almost deprived of a Sunday School picnic, and ice cream, for having taken Marilla's Sunday brooch and inadvertently losing it.

The few exceptions confirm the rule: Mr. Dinsmore (Elsie Dinsmore) treats his daughter's religious convictions with contempt, and forces her to sit at the piano for an extended period of time because she refuses to play on the Sabbath. This punishment provokes a severe accident, threatening the child's life, and in the end, plays a significant role in the development of the father's character, as he reflects how important the child is to him, once he realizes he might lose her. Relative to other great tyrants of Victorian literature, however, the few exceptions of paternal tyranny in children's literature are very mild.<sup>28</sup>

According to these authors, the responsibility for discipline belongs to the primary caretaker, rather than the father. The image of the stern, authoritarian father devoted to the adage "spare the rod and spoil the child", is not borne out in these books.<sup>29</sup> Matthew is quite content not to "put his oar in", when it is believed that Anne has taken Marilla's broach.<sup>30</sup> In the "Katy Did" books, Aunt Izzy disciplines the children, because the father, a rural doctor, is rarely home (What Katy Did <1872>). In these

---

<sup>28</sup>- Mr. Graham (The Lamplighter), Mr. King (Five Little Peppers) and Mr. Dinsmore (Elsie Dinsmore).

<sup>29</sup>- See Linda Pollock's discussion about disciplining children. Her conclusions are an interesting addition to those drawn here. op.cit..

<sup>30</sup>- Montgomery, op.cit., p. 104.

stories, fathers may be more guilty than mothers for only being providers, but mothers are often shown as being too indulgent. Meg March is incapable of disciplining her son, who becomes uncontrollable. In The Lamplighter, there are two examples of children, spoilt by their mothers, who eventually come to very bad ends. According to these books, children need a balance between the two extremes to grow strong and healthy. The exception to this rule is Louisa Alcott, who is the only author who suggests that fathers are especially important in disciplining their sons. Mrs. March says very clearly that John Brooke (Meg's husband) has a place in the nursery, and that without his guidance the children would go astray, especially little John, who has already understood that he can take advantage of his mother's inexperience.<sup>31</sup> None of the other authors suggest this distinction between the adults. Marilla even went so far as to say that Matthew should not interfere with her treatment of Anne, for if an old spinster knows little about raising a child, an old bachelor knows less (Anne of Green Gables).

Finally children need to be protected. They need to be protected from injustice, from the orphanage, from the world of service, from the streets. Children are vulnerable and fragile, as the few examples of neglected children demonstrate, and it is the parent's duty in the short run to

---

<sup>31</sup>- Alcott, Little Women, p. 354-355.

intercede physically for them, as Marilla does with Diana's mother when Anne inadvertently gets Diana drunk on cordial wine,<sup>32</sup> and in the long run, by teaching them proper morals, and skills which will allow them one day to enter the adult world.<sup>33</sup>

These four needs, nurturing, providing, discipline, and protection, become the responsibilities of all adults who raise children. It is in finding a home, and creating a relationship which most closely fills these needs that give the girls books their plots, and their emotional content. Although parenting can be done by adults of both sexes, and indeed there is no division of labor between men and women in fulfilling these needs, there are some fine distinctions between men and women in how they relate to the child in their care, and how the child relates to them. It is appropriate then to turn our attention to how fathers and then mothers fulfill these needs, and how they are portrayed in the books.

There are three characteristics of men and fathers, which repeatedly surface in these books. They are the need a man feels to be a father, the need the child feels to have a father, and the effect of the child on the father. These

---

<sup>32</sup>- Montgomery, op.cit., p. 104.

<sup>33</sup>- In L. Alcott's Little Women, Mrs. March takes pain to instruct her girls to be good Christians. Orphan girls are often taught an occupation, like teaching. Gerty (The Lamplighter) and Anne (Anne of Green Gables) both enter this profession prior to getting married.

books strongly suggest that men desire a family. Fatherhood appears to be an important aspect of a man's life, without which he might feel unfulfilled as a person. John Pendelton actively tries to adopt Pollyanna because, as he says to her, "It takes a woman's hand and heart, or a child's presence, to make a home..."<sup>34</sup> Professor Bhaer, sitting in his rooming house alone, "did his best and did it manfully; but I don't think he found a pair of rampant boys, a pipe, or even the divine Plato were satisfactory substitutes for a wife and child and home."<sup>35</sup> Only one father, Mr. Dinsmore, actively dislikes his daughter and successively avoids her for eight years (Elsie Dinsmore). Even men who have children thrust upon them, like Ben, who has to take Gerty in because she is sick and will probably die out on the streets, accept the child very quickly, and easily (The Lamplighter). Matthew Cuthbert, the shyest man on the island, wants Anne to stay, because she's a "funny little thing", and he enjoys her company. It may be that children are desired by these men for what they represent, a home, stability, rather than for what they really are, but as soon as the real life child enters their lives, they are always happy to be in their company.

---

<sup>34</sup>- Porter, op.cit., p. 116.

<sup>35</sup>- Alcott, Little Women, p. 325.

A reciprocal desire is expressed by the heroines who are, for one reason or another, deprived of their father. Although Jo March wants to take her father's place, it is towards Mr. Lawrence that the girls turn in moments of need. He is the one who makes Mrs. March's trip to Washington possible, to nurse her husband, and the one who gives Beth a piano (Little Women). While her father is ill, the "Little Colonel" seeks out another father figure; ironically she finds her grandfather, estranged from his daughter and her husband since their marriage (The Little Colonel <1896>). Although the use of the mysterious benefactor (Mr. Carrisford in A Little Princess for example, appears in the plot initially as an old man silently providing for the little servant girl in the attic), might appear to some critics as abused,<sup>36</sup> it does seem to indicate that these Victorian middle class authors perceived the father as necessary for the child's growth and development.

The relationship between the child and the adult male in her life, be it her natural, or adoptive father, is one of growth for both parties. This is the single most important difference between the boys' and the girls' books: that the relationship between adult and child is a growing one, one where both child and parent develop as individuals as the relationship deepens. One of the advantages in using

---

<sup>36</sup>- M. Cadogan and P. Craig, You're a Brick Angela: A New Look at Girls Fiction from 1839 to 1975 (London, 1976), p. 60-64.

the orphan motif, is that the author can examine the parent-child relationship without some of the assumptions that intact families may hold.<sup>37</sup> Because this is not a blood relationship from birth, the author can more clearly set forward examples of the creation and consequences of such bonds as they develop over time.

Matthew Cuthbert's transformation is the most startling. Before Anne arrives, the shyest man on the Island had such a dread fear of ladies that he can only shop at one of the town stores, because the other has a female clerk. By the end of the story, however, Matthew is not only conversing with female clerks, but actively involved in choosing Anne's wardrobe (Anne of Green Gables). Matthew states, when Marilla asks him what good would Anne be for them: "We might be some good to her."<sup>38</sup> But while he is contemplating Anne's leaving for Queens he thinks: "She's been a blessing to us, and there never was a luckier mistake than what Mrs. Spencer made- if it was a mistake. I don't believe it was any such thing. It was Providence, because the Almighty saw we needed her, I reckon."<sup>39</sup> Matthew started out with the idea of giving to the child, but comes to realize that she gave just as much back.

---

<sup>37</sup>- In Pollyanna for example, Aunt Polly sees her duty to raise this orphan child, whereas Polly sees her aunt as a loving benefactress.

<sup>38</sup>- Montgomery, op.cit., p. 37.

<sup>39</sup>- Ibid., p. 294.

There are other examples of such men becoming better individuals because of the love of the child. Mr. Craven, alienated from his son by the grief at losing his wife, becomes reintegrated into his home due to Mary's arrival, and intervention (The Secret Garden). Children are capable of softening even the hardest hearts: Mr. King (Five Little Peppers...) and Mr. Dinsmore are both eventually drawn out of themselves through a reciprocal relationship with a child. In developing a warm relationship with the child, the man develops his own personality and becomes a more constructive member of society and his family.

There are very few 'perfect' fathers in these books. Dr. Carr, the father of Katy Carr in the "What Katy Did" series might be considered a model father, except that he is so very rarely present. His rural practice keeps him away from his family for extended periods, and his influence on his children is less direct than that of his sister, Aunt Izzy, or Cousin Helen. While the children adore their father, their primary caretaker is really Aunt Izzy. Although she cannot replace either their mother, or their father, it is with her that the children develop the parent-child relationship which forms the backbone of the story. In all of the other books, however, the fathers participate and benefit and evolve through their interactions with children. Children are not only sources of hope to these men, but of amusement and pleasure.

The women in these stories are not quite so homogeneous in character. There is more variety in their personalities. The authors create more varied types, or models of mothers. The men basically all go through a metamorphosis during their relationship with the child, their starting characteristic being alienated or selfish, and becoming over time, more generous and loving. On the other hand, the women fall into four groups. There are the dead mothers, the step-mothers, the model mothers, and the learning mothers.

The dead mothers are used by the authors in an interesting manner. They have usually died at birth, and as such, have no real personality for their daughters. As residents of heaven, they are used as a tool in disciplining a recalcitrant child, or inspiring her to higher values. In A Little Princess, Sarah manages to calm Lottie, a child of four, during a temper tantrum, by evoking the image of a mother's face peering down from heaven and being saddened by such a display of poor manners. Gerty, the heroine of The Lamplighter, is taught her first Christian lesson, as she gazes up to the stars, and learns that if she is good, she will one day reside there with her mother.

The second type of mother is the step-mother. There are not too many 'wicked Step-mothers' in these stories. Even those who are wicked, are motivated by jealousy at the child's place in her father's heart;<sup>40</sup> and even they do not

---

<sup>40</sup>- Mrs. Graham in The Lamplighter.

actively turn on the child. They merely ignore her or make her life more difficult. Other examples of step mothers are usually kinder to their step-children. They try not to fill the place of the mother, but rather to establish some kind of supportive relationship. These step-mothers can even be other children. Sarah Crewe becomes Lottie's adoptive mother (A Little Princess), and helps her to keep her temper, and learn her lessons.

There are also the model mothers. These are women who have internalized the lessons the books were trying to instill in the reader; women who have successfully incorporated the required skills and attitudes to raise a child or create a home. Mrs. March, in Little Women, is perhaps the best known of this type of mother: she is kind, considerate, resourceful, a Good Christian, and disciplined in her own life, who can raise her children without resorting to force. These women are all natural, or biological mothers as well. There is in these women an understanding of the balance between rules and spontaneity needed to bring up a child. Dickon's mother, in The Secret Garden, lets Dickon roam the countryside, knowing that her son has judgement enough to return without any harm befalling him. Like the dead mother, or the step-mother, the model mother does not evolve during the story. These three types stand out by their rigidity. The heroine revolves around these figures, learning from them, but she does not

influence these women, as she influences the men, or the last type of mothers, the learning mothers.

The learning mothers are the spinsters, who, for whatever the reason, have accepted the responsibility of raising a child. These women are all portrayed as being bound up in the notion of duty, to the detriment of the potential of their relationship with the child. The place of and emphasis on duty within the Victorian ethos cannot be overestimated, but these women demonstrate that the over development of this notion can interrupt the fluid development of the mother-child relationship. For this type of woman, bringing up children does not automatically include affection and pleasure. Child-rearing is first and foremost, a duty. Marilla sees Anne as more of a burden than a source of pleasure,<sup>41</sup> and Aunt Polly does not think that "nice" is the word she would use for Pollyanna's presence, but being a good woman, she knows her duty.<sup>42</sup> Eventually, however, these women too, "warm" to the child, and develop both the nurturing capacity, and the sense of "family". In a way, these women represent a warning to the readers, both of the state into which a woman can fall without a child, a home, and a family. Marilla is described as being bony, hard looking and unsmiling, at the beginning of Anne of Green

---

<sup>41</sup>- Montgomery, op.cit., p. 52.

<sup>42</sup>- Porter, op.cit., p. 2.

Gables. The learning mother in Timothy's Quest is described in the following manner:

Poor Miss Avilda! Fifty years old, and in twenty summers and winters scarcely one lovely thought had blossomed into lovelier deed and shed its sweetness over her arid and colorless life. And now, under the magic spell of tender little hands and innocent lips, of luminous eyes that looked wistfully into hers for a welcome, and the touch of a groping helplessness that fastened upon her strength, the woman in her woke into life, and the beauty and fragrance of long-ago summers came back again as in a dream.<sup>43</sup>

Once again, the notion is reinforced that a relationship with a child is a positive one, where both sides can develop.

The skills and resources that the heroines used to create this caring environment are as varied and as nuanced as the girls themselves. There are a few characteristics which recur in most of the heroines: a sense of humor, a generous nature, and a pliant personality. These are not borderline delinquents. Their need to belong is much stronger than their need to rebel. In comparison with the model mothers, the heroines exhibit many successful nurturing qualities. In the same way the model mothers create a home for their natural children, the orphan girls create a "home" for themselves and their surrogate parents.

In the final analysis, all these books emphasize the idea of creating a home. The orphans must find a home, and

---

<sup>43</sup>- Wiggin, Timothy's Quest, p. 183.

then interact with the surrogates to make it appropriate. The children from intact families must also adapt to the absence of a parent, and find alternative relationships. This then is the girl's "adventure": the creation of a "home". The pattern of relationships for these heroines is the same as for the ideal Victorian woman. These books underline the importance of the Victorian ideal of homemaking for women: and that a girl's first objective is to learn how to make a home, and only then, can the girl branch out and develop other facets of her personality.<sup>44</sup> These books seem to indicate that parenthood is a joyful experience for both sexes, and that all members of the family can develop their personalities within the relationship.

Men are crucial to the process. Those children who are bereft of a father, temporarily or permanently, seek one out. Fathers do more than provide the material things of life; they discipline the children (especially the sons) they appreciate the children, encourage them in their pursuits, and they protect the children from harm. They are a vital part of the child's home, and life. These images are as constant and continuous over time as they are

---

<sup>44</sup>- Anne of Green Gables can go to college, and Jo March can go to New York.

international.<sup>45</sup> Compared as we will see with the boys' books, these models for girls are incredibly rigid, suggesting that the Victorian ideal for women is more static than their notions of manhood, and manliness. In what way then are the boys' books different in their representation of the family, parents and children?

## II

The two most striking differences between the heroes and heroines are their ages, and their family states. While the heroines of the girls' books are all under the age of sixteen, and usually much younger, the heroes of the boys' adventure stories are all over the age of eighteen. (The exceptions are the school books, written in the mold of Tom Brown's Schooldays <1857>, where the hero starts very young, about eight years old, into a world where women are at best the headmaster's wife and at worst, unmentioned.) Even at this early age, the time has come for the hero, not to create a family, but to leave one.

---

<sup>45</sup>- See for example Heidi by J. Speyri, written in the late 19th century in German, and untranslated until the 1920's into English.

They also have a family to leave. There are only six orphans in the thirty five books read. Unlike the female protagonists, these characters have already got a firm base from which to depart. They do not have to create a family, they already have one. The boys are obviously starting out on their adventure with a different set of needs than the girls, needs which affect that adventure.<sup>46</sup>

If the girls' books emphasize the creation of a home, the boys' books emphasize individual personality development. In leaving a home, their adventure is to forge the personality through conflicts, usually against nature, but sometimes against the "heathens". Parents, even adults, do not take an active part in the adventure. The adult's role is limited to being the agent, the catalyst which provokes the adventure. Once the adventure is started, however, adults recede to the background. In examining the boys' books this study will first look at the extent of parental influence as it is represented in the different types of adventure stories, the kinds of relationships developed during the "adventure", and what these relationships might signify in terms of fatherhood, and finally the differences between the British Empire and American adventure story.

---

<sup>46</sup>- In the boys' adventure stories, the female characters have at least one parent or grandparent living. There are no female orphans in this genre.

Written in 1716, Robinson Crusoe is the model for many subsequent adventure stories. When the story begins, Crusoe's father counsels his son to enter business, but Crusoe defies him and runs off to sea. Crusoe comes to believe that being marooned is his punishment for that defiance, and while he might have discovered many laudable aspects of his personality during his conflict with nature, in the end, the adventure was not worth the grief he caused his father. These two themes, defiance and personality development are repeated by many authors.

The parental influence can be defied in several ways. Many of the fictional boys see their parents as being too restrictive, and feel justified in disobeying them, if only to pursue their adventure. The variations of defiance are many. Crusoe leaves a father he sees as being unsympathetic, but Davey McAdam remains within his father's house, spending most of the time baiting his father (Bob, Son of Battle <1898>). Davey Balfour's conflict is not with his father, but with an uncle, who apparently stole the family fortune (Kidnapped <1886>). John escapes from his aunt's house, defies her injunctions and establishes a relationship with the smuggler Elzevir (Moonfleet <1894>). Eric defies his parents' wishes by becoming a bad influence at Roslyn school (Eric or Little by Little <1858>).

Inheritance is rarely discussed explicitly in these stories; neither is it an issue of conflict between fathers

and sons. Boys' books are not preparing sons to follow their fathers' footsteps. It is surprising to find so little mention of what must have been the lot of many of the readers, at least the middle class readers. Only Crusoe rebels against his father's plans for his future. None of the other books even mention it as an issue for the hero, and it is not given as a reason for defiance. Only two exceptions were found: Mr. Cheyne, father of the hero of Captains Courageous <1897>, assumed his son would follow in his business footsteps, but it is not a factor in the boy's adventure. In Henty's With Wolfe in Canada <1886>, the young hero does not really wish to follow in his dead father's medical footsteps, but in honor of his mother, he will resign himself to that fate.

Defiance is not the only manner in which parents can trigger the adventure: some parents actively help the son "start" in the world, at least in the school books, where it is the parents who decide to send their son away for his education (Tom Brown's Schooldays, and Stalky and Co. <1899>).<sup>47</sup> Other heroes' parents die, such as Davey Balfour's father, allowing the son the liberty of moving away, and seeking his fortune. Davey goes to see his uncle, and unlike the girls' books, does not immediately try to

---

<sup>47</sup>- The parents of the hero in The Coral Island <1858> actually send their boy to sea, and in Henty's With Clive in India <1883>, and Jack Archer <1883>, the authority figures planned to send the boys into the service of the Company, or into the army.

placate him, but instead enters into conflict with him. Even after just having lost his father, Davey Balfour does not need to recreate his nurturing environment; he needs to make his way in the world (Kidnapped).

Parents are not portrayed as being harsh disciplinarians or unyielding, even those whose sons defy them. With two exceptions, McAdam's father who is bitter against all humanity, including his son, and Balfour's uncle, who is merely rapacious, these parents or authority figures, all express concern for their sons' futures. They want their sons to be safe, and never thwart them in approved pursuits. They do not want their sons to mix with sailors, lose their religion, or participate in dangerous activities. In a way, these parents are similar to the dead mothers in the girls' books: their memory is occasionally conjured up during the adventure as guides to good behavior; otherwise their direct influence is negligible. The four needs we saw as being important for the girls are not important in these boys' books. The heroes do not need to be protected, or cared for by their parents.

If the adventure is important to the son's development, as a rite of passage from childhood to adulthood, it can sometimes have tragic results for the parents. The child grows with the adventure, something is learned, even if it is the hard way. Crusoe discovers religion, Davey Balfour recovers his fortune, and John learns caution and humility

(Moonfleet). The consequences for the parent, however, can be very different, and this is especially true when the adventure starts by defiance, and the defiance has a moral overtone to it. These so-called moral adventures, examples of which include Robinson Crusoe, and Eric or Little by Little, end in the death of the parents, due exclusively to the transgressions of the sons. Over time these "moral" adventures become less and less popular,<sup>48</sup> as authors change their focus from the moral development to the development of secular skills. We will return to this change of focus, from the moral to the secular, after an examination of the kinds of relationships the heroes develop.

While relationships between parents and children are not a central focus of these stories, there is an important emphasis on relationships between equals. The hero sets off on his "adventure" and often meets up with other young men of about the same age. In The Coral Island, the hero is marooned with two other young boys, and the three of them form a unit, stronger than the sum of the parts, and by the end of the story, the team becomes capable of saving a young

---

<sup>48</sup>- An example is the scorn Stalky and his friends heap on Eric in 1899. Eric's style of defiance is no longer popular with the following generation, reflecting perhaps new ideals of manhood circulating in the English language world. See E. Rotundo, "Learning about Manhood: Gender Ideals and The Middle Class Family in Nineteenth Century America", in J. Mangan and J. Walvin, eds., Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America (Manchester, 1987), pp. 35-51.

girl from almost certain death. They form a team, which Townsend suggests, is an effort to show the importance of a rounded personality. The characters compensate for each other's faults and weaknesses, and learn from each other.<sup>49</sup> By the end of the tale, the hero is a better, more rounded character.

Women are strikingly absent; contact is almost always with other boys, or young men. Tom Sawyer is the only hero who has an adventure with a girl. He gets lost in the caves with Becky Thatcher. Some of Henty's characters save a young girl, incidentally to saving the Empire (With Clive in India <1883>, Jack Archer <1883>). The models proposed are between men, or boys, and no story examines male-female relationships in any detail. There is not a single story similar to Alcott's Little Women.

Nor is the obvious ending of the adventure a wife and a home. In Bob Son of Battle, the marriage between the rivals' children is obvious from the start, although once established early in the book, the story focuses on the hero's struggles with his father, rather than the development of any nurturing skills he might need once he actually marries his neighbor's daughter. Henty traditionally ends his stories with a short concluding paragraph confirming that the hero has earned enough merit protecting society to be granted the hand of the girl he has

---

<sup>49</sup>- Townsend, op.cit., p. 62.

loved since childhood (With Wolfe in Canada) or saved from an enraged Rajah.<sup>50</sup> Henty goes one step further, and confirms the hero's merit, and society's good fortune, by briefly indicating that he has been graced with many offspring, all of whom are interested in hearing about their father's brave deeds. The most extreme case of a male only world is presented in Stalky and Co., where the young men come together one last time to talk about their past, after having been separated for several years. Not one character suggests he even has a family; their reminiscences concern Stalky's deeds of heroism in India.

These stories give only passing attention that once the adventure is over, a man is expected to get married, and have children. Henty, Alger, and Ollivant are all harkening back to the Crusoe tradition of the adventure story, where marriage, and progeny are the confirmation of the hero's success in his adventure. Kipling, Connor, and Tarkington represent a more modern tradition, where even this passing reference to marriage and parenthood is absent. This new silence may be an important element in the masculine ideal, as it changed through the late nineteenth early twentieth century. Unlike the girls' books, there is no suggestion, however, that parenthood is any different from slaying

---

<sup>50</sup>- The boy's Empire adventure takes place far away from civilization, and the passing to and fro of the shores of England and the environment of adventure may well be symbolic of the future father's daily threshold crossing.

lions, or scaling the cliffs of Quebec. These novels give boys no developed images of family life or models for their future role as father.<sup>51</sup>

Most of the stories concern the development of relationships between male equals, however, some of the stories include an authority figure, usually an older man, who has some knowledge of life to impart to the hero in his quest to become a man. The smuggler Elzevir in Moonfleet had a son the same age as John, the hero of the story, and Elzevir protects, nurses and eventually dies saving John's life. He nurses him as well, and as tenderly as any woman, and yet on some occasions, they are equals. This is the only real example of such an ambivalent relationship between an older man and a younger one.

Kipling's Captains Courageous also has an older authority figure, the skipper who saves Harvey. During his relationship with this man, Harvey learns something about himself. If Harvey wants to eat, he must work; none of the values of his early life apply any more. Harvey has to start all over. Unlike Elzevir and John, the relationship between the skipper and Harvey is not ambiguous at all. If any of the other stories have an adult character, he is on the same footing as the young hero: in Kidnapped, Alan Beck is hardly

---

<sup>51</sup>- L. Alcott's Little Men could be considered an exception to this rule, except that the book is so obviously written for girls.

an authority figure, although he is significantly older than Davey.

Captains Courageous is unique in other respects as well. This story starts with an accident, the boy falls overboard on his way to an English school, and is picked up by a fishing boat on the Grand Banks. There is no defiance against the parents. Harvey learns the value of work and self-control on this boat before the season is over, and he is re-united with his parents, who believed him dead. Furthermore, this story follows the son and his family after the adventure, as they establish a new relationship based on their insights, and the consequences of the adventure. In other words, as in the girls' books, both Harvey and his father change because of what happened. Harvey's father was a busy man and until the accident, Mrs. Cheyne had been the sole caretaker of their son. One of the men on the liner sized up the situation: "Old man's piling up the rocks. Don't want to be disturbed, I guess. He'll find out his error a few years from now. Pity, because there's a heap of good in the boy if yer could get at it."<sup>52</sup> The father himself, after being reunited, wonders if "perhaps he might have been neglectful as a father."<sup>53</sup> In his final admission

---

<sup>52</sup>- R. Kipling, Captains Courageous (London, 1937), p. 2.

<sup>53</sup>- Ibid., p. 231.

of failure as a father, Mr. Cheyne admits to the skipper "I never rightly understood I had a son before this."<sup>54</sup>

Once the family is reunited, the son more mature and the father more aware of the boy, the family reorganizes itself along new lines. Both father and son develop a new respect for each other, and their relationship is richer for the accident. The loser is the mother who "was a little jealous. Her son, who rode roughshod over her, was gone, and in his stead reigned a keen-faced youth, abnormally silent, who addressed most of his conversation to his father."<sup>55</sup> If the adventure is a rite of passage for a young man, as it appears to be in the Victorian mind, the cost of such a passage was very high for the mother, who has to watch her son go into a world she cannot hope to enter, and when he returns, she no longer understands him. Although this story deviates in several ways from the standard "adventure story", it conforms in certain features: the boy becomes a man without his parents playing any direct role in the transformation, and without any indication of personality traits which might be helpful for the hero's own future role as father and husband.

Rotundo has suggested that a strain of manliness developing in America in the latter part of the nineteenth

---

<sup>54</sup>- Ibid., p. 251.

<sup>55</sup>- Ibid., p. 261.

century included a greater participation in the family.<sup>56</sup> While fathers have always been concerned about work habits and the value of achievement, by the late 1880's Rotundo suggests that some fathers increasingly encouraged play and the enjoyment of life.<sup>57</sup> These men took a very active role in the family, trying to develop "a new fatherhood, one that would bring a man back into the main emotional currents of the family."<sup>58</sup> While it is certain that the evidence put forward by Rotundo is very suggestive of this conclusion, the same ethos is not represented in the boys' books. According to the girls' books, there are certain skills necessary to raise children in the Victorian world. The awareness of these skills is completely lacking in any of the boys' books. Where the men Rotundo uses for his conclusions learnt this new sense of family, he does not say, but they certainly did not learn it reading the adventure books, British or American, written for the Victorian boy.

Many of the above mentioned characteristics can be found in both the British and American "adventure" stories. But with the development of the Western, the American standard begins to deviate from the British Empire books.

---

<sup>56</sup>- E. Rotundo, Manhood in America The Northern Middle-Class 1770-1920, Unpublished PhD., Brandeis (1982), chapter 8.

<sup>57</sup>- Ibid., p. 340.

<sup>58</sup>- Ibid., p. 344.

The Western plains are inhospitable, 'no place for a lady'. There was no place for a lady on Crusoe's Island either, or in Kipling's Grand Banks fishing boat. But in these stories the boys eventually return to England.<sup>59</sup> The cowboy remains on the prairies. He does not return to the east, a better man, ready to face civilization and implicitly marriage and a family. By the early twentieth century, the American adventure is no longer a rite of passage, it has become a way of life.<sup>60</sup>

In the British stories, there was no question about the boy's return. As long as he was alive, he and society expected him to come back to England. This meant that there was no need for women to come with their schools, and their 'manners' to change the environment of adventure. In the British stories, the environment remains unsullied by womanly hands. Not so for the cowboy, who lives within a very paradoxical situation. Choosing to remain forever on the plains, because "the romance of the American adventure had drawn them all alike to this great playground of young

---

<sup>59</sup>- See P. Dunae, "Boy's Literature and the Idea of Empire 1870-1914", Victorian Studies, 24, 1 (Autumn, 1980), pp. 105-121.

<sup>60</sup>- No other genre of children's literature allows the child to remain within the world of adventure. Even fantasies like Peter Pan <1911> or Alice in Wonderland <1865> expect that the child will grow up and "out" of the adventure. The cowboy is the first fictional creation who physically remains forever within the adventure.

men",<sup>61</sup> the cowboy must reproduce himself, and that means women, children and wire fences changing the great playground so that "this country would not long be a country for men."<sup>62</sup> The result is ambiguity for those who choose to settle down and raise a family, torn as they are between the demands of the "great playground" and their wives and children.

Fatherhood does not come easily to the cowboys: once after the Virginian (a sort of super cowboy) and a friend swap babies during a party "Most of them (the fathers) being as yet more their wives lovers than their children's parents, began to see the mirthful side of the adventure....Not so the women. They cried for vengeance but they cried in vain."<sup>63</sup> Compare this with John Brooke (Little Women) who "...rescued his babies and marched them up and down with one on each arm, as if already initiated into the mysteries of baby tending..."<sup>64</sup> The necessary sentiments of child raising are in direct contrast to cowboy living, and it takes time for the individual to synthesize these roles.

---

<sup>61</sup>- O. Wister, The Virginian <1902> (New York, 1970), p. 105.

<sup>62</sup>- Ibid., p. 80-81.

<sup>63</sup>- Ibid., p. 146.

<sup>64</sup>- Alcott, Little Women, p. 259.

Within this conflict, between babies and fighting Indians, is the problem not only of losing the "romance" but also of becoming too soft. Jack London's White Fang <1910> contains a chapter devoted to the demonstration that the wilds are no place for a lady. Indeed she is dangerous, as two men and a woman set out on a cross country trek, and perish, along with the dogs, due to the woman's misplaced sentiments. The glorification of the "rugged individual", "the law of the Club and the Fang" and the conflicting image of the danger of sentiment, indicates a real tension in the American stories about the balance between the ability to nurture, and the strength needed to succeed in the harsh world outside the home.

Setting the story in suburban America does not resolve the issue. Penrod by Booth Tarkington, written in 1914, is also about the permanence of the life of adventure. In this case, the hero, Penrod, has to deal with dancing lessons, rather than Indians, but there is still no indication that the child will ever leave the "adventurous" mentality. The girls' books all showed the girls advancing through childhood towards independence, but Penrod would be quite happy in childhood forever, as long as his mother did not make him go to dancing class. There is nothing for him to grow up towards, no image to emulate. His father is a nebulous character (the reader is never even told his occupation) and he is impotent compared to his wife and

elder daughter.<sup>65</sup> Penrod, like the cowboy, never develops towards anything else; he remains within the adventure forever, with no impetus to change.

The boys' books, American or British, give few positive images of parent-child relationships. The emphasis is on the development of the personality, and the creation of relationships between equals, rather than the fulfillment of childish needs. The adventure rarely affects the parents in their own development, except in some cases to destroy them. The explicit message of these books appears to be that of St. Paul: "When I was a child, I spake as a child, I understood as a child, I thought as a child; but when I became a man, I put away childish things." According to these Victorian authors, boys must not only put them away, but actively reject them in order to become a man.

\*\*\*\*

How the Victorian child perceived the world and their place in it was largely determined by their gender. Boys and girls were dressed differently, they had different toys and they read different books. These books were important in how

---

<sup>65</sup>- There is a certain amount of Shaw's Professor Higgins' misogyny in Booth Tarkington's Penrod.

they perceived their environment. How many men going off to the Great War had Kipling's notion of the Empire, or G.A. Henty's ideals of honor and adventure? These books reflected and contributed to the dominant ideologies and biases of the day. Girls had female virtues to emulate, and boys had male standards to live up to. Perhaps only in advice books are the distinctions so clearly set out between the genders as we have seen them in these books.

The model given to girls is one of home creation; a model remarkable for its stability in time, and across national borders. Even as a child, the girl was expected to participate in the creation of family feelings. This idea is underlined most clearly by the number of orphans, who for survival, create a nurturing environment. This environment is not only beneficial to the child, but also to the parents, who through parenthood, develop their own personalities. The girls' books emphasize interaction and intimacy between individuals, in controlled environments. A girl's participation in the world is, according to these stories, through her influence and her contributions to the individuals around her. Like the image of women found in reform literature, girls in these stories are private actors, and like a stone thrown in a pond, the significance is in the ripples, rather than the splash. The heroines' effect on the social fabric is through the domestic sphere.

The boys' books are less concerned with home creation, or emotional intimacy than with individual development. Relationships are between equals. Parents can be dramatically affected by their son's adventure, but they do not actively, or directly participate in it. When marriage and parenthood are the denouement of these stories, they are only briefly dwelt upon, usually in a single paragraph. That even this brief reference appears to disappear at the turn of the century, suggests that this literature is reflecting important changes in masculine values, changes which may be excluding marriage and parenthood. The protagonists in the boys' literature act on the world, directly, usually through feats of martial musculature. The contribution to the social fabric is immediate, and direct. Adventures are not solitary affairs, the relationship between the 'chums' is very important in terms of individual development. What is lacking, however, are developed relationships between girls and boys, and between the boys and their parents, or other figures of parental authority.

How children, in becoming adults, resolved the images and the reality cannot properly be evaluated here. The boys especially must have been torn between this very male, very individualistic approach to life, and the demands made on

them by their wives and children. If Rotundo and others are correct, by the later Victorian period, a new sensitivity was developing amongst fathers, there is no evidence that they learnt this behavior from books. How these men learned their parental skills is still largely unknown. Society reinforced at every turn the woman as mother, as wife, as homemaker. But the men as fathers, as husbands were on their own.

Chapter V  
The Anatomy of Tyranny  
The image of the father in late Victorian fiction

The preceding chapter on the role of the paternal figure in children's literature demonstrates the multiplicity of models of imaginary fathers, and their function within the plot development. One might say that it acts as a paternal topology: fathers in the girls books are part of a larger theme about the creation of the home, representatives of the 'masculine' that the heroines have to learn how to deal with in order to become successful women, and by extension, mothers. The 'adventure' stories, on the other hand, are set in strange and wonderful landscapes, and the characters have few, if any, adults to relate to. Success is to return home, complete and capable men. Fathers, like all adults in these adventure books, are noticeable by their absence.

Whereas children's literature lends itself well to an analysis focussed on patterns, literature written for adults is much more complex, in plot and in theme. The authors are not intending to simplify the world for their readers, but on the contrary, to give it brilliance and texture. This literature is, by definition, more intricate than that written for children. There are more layers of plot and character development, and the symbolism is more elaborate. Generalizations are accordingly more difficult to make.

Wendell Johnson's Sons and Fathers,<sup>1</sup> an interpretation of the father-child relationship in Victorian literature, is the starting point for this study. Johnson suggests that the literary father-son relationship is dictated by time. To the child, fathers represent the public world, the world of change, while mothers represent the idea of continuity and fluidity in the face of change. Further, Johnson contends that the writers of the Victorian period find within the filial relationship a contradiction they cannot escape. It is through their relationship with their father, that the sons find the balance between inherited values, and those of their own age.

On one level, this model contradicts the model developed in the previous chapter on children's literature, which showed that the adventure stories for boys were

---

<sup>1</sup>- W. Johnson, Sons and Fathers The Generation Link in Literature, 1780-1980 (New York, 1985).

directed at developing the individual, without the interference of parents, or even adults. Remembering one's father, or one's family roots is not a concern for those authors writing adventure stories for the young Victorian boys. Based on these two types of literary evidence, one could posit that there was, for young men, a double journey to be performed; the first step was the development of one's individuality, independent of the parental sphere, followed by the second step, a period of readaptation, and in some cases, reconciliation to the parents' world. In writing for children, the authors emphasized the independent development, while in writing for adults, the emphasis was placed on reconciliation.<sup>2</sup>

The son's journey from dependency through independence and finally, perhaps, to a moment of reconciliation, is not altogether the focus of our study, except as it teaches the young man nurturing skills, (necessary for his own role as father) or as it might affect his father. To search for liberty and independence implies authority, and in Victorian fiction, the symbol of that authority is the father. From

---

<sup>2</sup>- This double journey is obviously gender dependent; young Victorian women could not be permitted to establish their personalities within the 'adventure' pattern, but rather within the function of their domestic responsibilities. Within this sphere some fictional fathers attempt to control their daughters, however, as we will see, there was a 'female' sphere, identified in these novels as the boudoir, which even the most tyrannical of fathers could not enter, and upon which they could not exercise any control.

the paternal perspective, the question is pertinence: personal and public. When the times change, the father can only see his power to control diminish, and his son supercede him.<sup>3</sup> As the sons gain power, the father loses it. While Johnson's study focusses particularly on the son's journey, this discussion will examine the effect of that journey on the father, and how the fictional father was portrayed as dealing with this 'natural' challenge to his authority.

Considering the importance of this thematic question of regeneration, and its consequences on the father, as well as the popularity of the stereotype of fictional fathers as tyrants, this study will focus on the nature of authority and its extreme tyranny as portrayed by Victorian novelists: particularly, how fictionalized tyranny is exercised, and upon what grounds it is maintained. After a general overview of the significance of the family in Victorian fiction, the specific analysis of paternal tyranny will be developed from themes found in a reading of Edmund Gosse's Father and Son <1907>, and Samuel Butler's The Way of All Flesh <1903>. Philip Gosse and Theobald Pontiflex are two of the best known paternal tyrants in Victorian fiction. From these

---

<sup>3</sup>- This explains the incredible importance of knowledge, and education found in Victorian fiction, and middle class society. See F. Thompson, The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain, 1830-1900 (London, 1988); and A. McKillop, A Disciplined Intelligence: Critical Inquiry and Canadian Thought in the Victorian Era (Montreal, 1979).

perspectives we will examine the paternal tyrant as he is used by authors in other novels, the child's efforts to escape the tyranny, and the consequences of that escape on the father. To a certain extent, this analysis could be termed an examination of the rhythm of paternal authority, how it ebbed and flowed throughout the father's lifetime.

The selection of works studied for this chapter resembles the criterion used for the selection of children's literature: library holdings, references in private papers, reading club lists of the city of Montreal, visits by notable authors to the city,<sup>4</sup> and usage made by literary critics.<sup>5</sup> Careful attention was paid to Canadian authors, especially those who had personal ties with the city of Montreal, like William Lighthall, regardless of whether those authors were particularly popular. The strong dependency on Charles Dickens in this study is justified not only by his famous and well remembered visit to the city in 1852, but also by the numerous references to his works in both the private papers, and library lists. While the selection used for this study is only a small fraction of the available literature, both Canadian and international, efforts were made to be as inclusive as possible.

---

<sup>4</sup>- Authors such as Charles Dickens, Samuel Butler and Oscar Wilde. This list was compiled using secondary sources: specifically anecdotal histories of Montreal, such as K. Jenkins, Montreal: Island City (New York, 1966).

<sup>5</sup>- See Appendix D. for a more complete presentation of selection process and Appendix F. for a list of titles used.

## I

The father-child relationship in Victorian fiction is often an important center of plot development. Whether it is the story of a child becoming autonomous, against or with the wishes of the parent, or whether it is the story of the sins of the fathers visited upon the sons, the father is often a crucial aspect of both plot and character development. Fathers are active characters in approximately fifty percent of all the novels read for this study. In another forty percent, they are referred to, as the source of the protagonist's problem. In only ten percent of the novels, are the protagonists obvious orphans, or the father is absent.<sup>6</sup> The numeric weight of the father in these novels, the very fact that fathers are almost constant characters in plot development, indicates that for these authors, the father-child relationship held an important place.

Authority or tyranny are not always exercised overtly or directly. One of the component parts of family life, developed to some extent in every book, is family ties.

---

<sup>6</sup>- If the father is absent, however, there is often another character who stands in *locos parentis* to the protagonist.

Novelists seem to agree that membership in a family causes its own problems, either by the sins of the father visiting the son, or on the other hand, by being excluded by some twist of fate from one's real family, thereby being excluded from the generative aspects of family life. The idea of family life itself is a form of tyranny.

Dickens and many other authors are passionately interested in what one might call the 'tyranny of blood', by the sins of the fathers visiting the heads of the sons. Bleak House <1853>, Great Expectations <1861>, A Tale of Two Cities <1859>, and Barnaby Rudge <1841>, are famous examples of novels in which children have to deal with problems created by past generations.<sup>7</sup> One could even argue that Tess, the heroine of Tess of the D'Urbervilles <1891> was doomed the moment her father heard the story of his supposed ancestry. Other novelists used the same idea: Gilbert Parker's The Weavers <1907>, for example. In Curwood's The Danger Trail <1910>, the plot is entirely premised on a case of mistaken identity caused by a familiar name attached to a familiar face.

This literary device, plot directly motivated by events in the past, serves to underline two important concepts about family life and individuality. The first of these concepts is the incredible and inescapable power of the

---

<sup>7</sup>- The Hound of The Baskervilles by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle is based on the premise of a curse dating back some 300 years, revisiting the family.

family, which transcends time and space. Through the links of blood one could be raised up, or brought very low. "The Importance of Being Earnest" <1895> is premised on a young man trying to change his origins: "a somewhat large, black leather hand-bag, with handles to it." (Act 1.) Lady Bracknell assures Jack that "To be born, or at any rate bred, in a hand-bag, whether it had handles or not, seems to me to display a contempt for the ordinary decencies of family life that reminds one of the worst excesses of the French Revolution." (Act 1.) Oscar Wilde dramatizes and ridicules the importance of family, but other authors take it more seriously: there are many examples of children who are victims of their father's past.<sup>8</sup> Dickens uses a whole system of doubles and twins in A Tale of Two Cities to underline the hero's essential inability of escape conviction for the crimes of his father.

---

<sup>8</sup>- In over ninety percent of the stories, the family 'blood' involved is paternal, not maternal. The sins of the past are the sins of the fathers. This overwhelming numerical domination of the importance of the paternal side as being the motor of the plot, cannot be easily dismissed by arguing that this merely reflects the patriarchal structure of late nineteenth century society. We have seen throughout this study how important the maternal influence was perceived to be in this society, and yet the negative impact of this influence is a relatively uncharted territory in the fiction. With the exception of a few maternal tyrants created by Charles Dickens, the negative impact of the inherent power of maternalism is a relatively uncharted territory in the fictional landscape. Even the mother's past is no excuse for a plot. The most striking example of the maternal link to the past being the plot motor is Charles Dickens' Bleak House.

The power of the family and the ensuing consequences on the child, tragic or not, is one side of the plot equation. The second side is the child's fight for individuality. The resolution of the problem provoked by the older generation is the rite of passage through which the child must pass in order to affirm his or her own identity.<sup>9</sup> To a certain extent, the child's 'adventure' in adult literature is to become an 'adult' through the resolution of the problem posed directly by the parents. One can compare this model with the model found through the analysis of fiction for children, where the adventure for girls was to find a home, and for boys to leave their homes, and become men. The continuing emphasis in adult literature on family, and on parent-child relationships suggests that the authors saw this relationship as a fundamental construction of individuality, and one which the majority of authors recognized as being an important defining relationship, even after children had ostensibly 'grown up'.

---

<sup>9</sup>- This plot structure recalls Shakespeare's Romeo and Juliet. One important difference between that play and much of Victorian fiction is that the Victorian authors apparently refuse to portray the children of such generational conflict as its tragic victims. In the overwhelming number of novels plotted in this fashion, the new generation, representing the future, is victorious over their family's past. One can interpret this thematic pattern in one of two ways. Either as a general approval of democracy, (particularly in Britain where class structure was so apparent) or perhaps more specifically, an indication of the relative optimism of the authors concerning the ability of their epoch to overcome past deficiencies, and problems, towards the new age.

In his discussion of Charles Dickens novels, Johnson suggests that Dickens was particularly concerned with the problems of the children (who in some cases are adults) finding their parent, and learning to relate to that parent.<sup>10</sup> The best example of this model is Pip's relation to the convict Magwitch, (Great Expectations). Having spent several years believing that Miss Havisham, crazed but still respectable, was his benefactress, Pip is shocked to find that it was, in fact, the convict for whom he had stolen bread. Magwitch may be significantly more sane than Miss Havisham, but he is an escaped convict, with a price on his head, and therefore hardly respectable. The final third of the novel deals with how Pip learns to readjust his 'expectations' as well as his values, which were as fragile and ultimately as volatile as Miss Havisham's wedding dress.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup>- Johnson's model closely resembles the model found in our analysis of fiction written for girls. Johnson, op.cit., p. 77-110.

<sup>11</sup>- Throughout this argument, Johnson apparently does not notice that only sons go on this kind of search. Dickens' daughters are either, as Little Dorrit, already aware of her father's incapacities, (as was Florence in Dombey and Son <1848>) or like Esther (Bleak House), finally too afraid, and fortunately too late, to find her parentage. The only one of Dickens' sons who has this innate moral worth is Oliver Twist, who without models of decency or kindness, (and despite Fagin or Bumble) still has his moral standards intact. Otherwise, Dickens' sons are all in the process of recognizing their fathers, and by implication their filiation and their station in the spectrum of time and place, and through this process, becoming better men.

Pip is one of many of Dickens' orphans who went searching for their fathers, (or what their fathers represented.) Arthur Clennam (the hero in Little Dorrit), Nicholas Nickleby, Esther (Bleak House) and Martin Chuzzlewit are all examples of characters in the process of searching for their heritage, either material or figurative. Like the orphaned heroines in fiction for girls, these 'adult' orphans must also come to terms with their family's past. The significant difference between these two genres is, however, an important one. The young girl orphans must find a family and then participate in the creation of a home. In other words, the plot functions as a mirror of a woman's role in the real world. On the contrary, the 'adult' orphans, already participants in the adult world, must go back in time, and find out about the mystery of their ancestry. Without this solid grounding in the past, the characters cannot proceed into their future. Arthur Clennam must learn the secret of his father's folly, to free himself and move on to marrying Little Dorrit. In Barnaby Rudge, the great mystery of the story is the parentage of both Barnaby and Hugh, parentage which will eventually account for the motivations of these characters throughout the story.<sup>12</sup> In Bleak House, Esther also moves slowly but surely in search of her family's past, only to be thwarted at the end by the

---

<sup>12</sup>— This is similar to Ebenezer Scrooge and his father.

premature death of her mother. The repetition of this theme in the works of Charles Dickens, and in other novels, (The Mill of the Floss <1860>, and Tess of the D'Urbervilles) reaffirms the importance of the ideal of family in the late Victorian era. The family itself exercises on its members a strong and authoritative effect, becoming in some cases almost abstract in its power to coerce the protagonists. In this way, the plot is motivated by the very real notion of the 'sins of the father on the head of the sons'. The obsession with ancestry, roots, and blood lines, is indicative of the authors' view of the family, a view which emphasizes continuity over time.

In this way, the family symbolizes the perceived need for a measure of conservatism felt by many late Victorians, struggling as they were between the fear of radical change, and the lure of the new technology. In fiction, the recurrence of the 'adult' orphan motif stands as metaphor for the need for political, as well as spiritual conservatism. In this interpretation, the past holds answers to some of the vexing contemporary problems. The father stands for the pastoral past, and the sons for the confusing

present.<sup>13</sup> Only by returning to the past, can one move forward.

The abstract nature of this driving power of authority inherent in the concept of the family, implies within it, the concept of the paternal tyrant, who exerts direct and absolute control over his children in the name of that authority. Because of the importance of the stereotypical fictional paternal tyrant, we will examine the two most infamous examples of this paternal figure, and in a second part, how this figure appears in the historical novel.

## II

The most striking aspect of the two greatest fictional tyrants of Victorian literature is their verisimilitude. This is not surprising, for they were drawn from the author's real life. Samuel Butler's The Way of All Flesh was completed nearly twenty years before its posthumus

---

<sup>13</sup>- Such an interpretation is supported by other elements of late-Victorian culture, for example, folklore, and genealogy, both of which help to ground individuals and communities in a tangible past. The search for permanence which dominated the Victorian frame of mind contained both a drive to understand the past, as well as projecting onto the future, not to be forgotten. The erection of great monuments, for example, suggests not only the honoring of the dead, but also their continued remembrance.

publication, because Butler did not wish to face the ire of his family. Edmund Gosse's Father and Son was published anonymously, and reprinted for several years without the author's name. That both these docu-novels were first published as fiction, and were read as such for several years, allows us to examine them as fiction, rather than pseudo-biography.

The basis for the father's tyranny, whether it be Pontiflex or Philip Gosse, is his belief that God ordained his authority, that his children were to be his greatest religious works of his lifetime. Pontiflex was an Anglican Clergyman, and Gosse was a leader of the Brethren. They were both father and minister to their sons. The concept of the father acting as minister to his family is not an unfamiliar one.<sup>14</sup> But in these novels, the extreme to which both these 'inspired' fathers went, was compounded by their father's egomania.<sup>15</sup> Nothing existed for either father beyond their provincial horizons: the metropolis was a source of evil and corruption. Their sons were to follow in their secular, and

---

<sup>14</sup>- S. Ozmet, When Father Ruled: Family Life in Reformation Europe (Cambridge, Mass. 1983); J.-L. Flandrin, Familles, parenté, maison, sexualité dans l'ancienne société (Paris, 1976).

<sup>15</sup>- A similar pattern can be found in The Ordeal of Richard Feverel, <1869> by George Meredith, in which the son becomes a vessel for the father's ideals; rather than a mere duplicate of the father, Richard will be formed by him to a state of perfection. In this way, the father will live on, not merely as he was in reality, but attuned to a perfect state. The father's desire for continuity and immortality will find itself by 're-living' in his son.

religious footsteps: no deviant individuality was to be tolerated.<sup>16</sup> Within the general model of male development, which involved a double journey, these two fathers attempted to arrest the first stage of their sons' development, that which emphasized the autonomously developed personality. In the name of generational continuity, the sons' identity must be sacrificed. For both these fathers, their sons represent a measure of immortality, a way to cheat time. By creating in their sons direct copies of themselves, these fathers are breaking the code of time, they are seeking their own immortality. In literary terms, it is this guiding concept which stands as the father's tragic flaw. Like King Lear, they have attempted to overturn the 'natural' course of

---

<sup>16</sup>- Ernest Pontiflex will be a minister because his father was a minister. It is impossible to gauge the importance of gender in this paternal recreation. Edmund Gosse was an only child. The protagonist in The Way of All Flesh had two siblings, but neither of these characters are developed in any way at all in the novel. Theobald Pontiflex's sister, Althea, appears to have escaped her father's control. The question remains however, did the father try to control her, or did her sex preclude the full weight of the tyranny from bearing down upon her.

time: to possess their sons completely assures them of immortality.<sup>17</sup>

Escape for both sons requires physical distance, and in the case of Pontiflex Jr. the help of his father's oldest friend. The escape includes almost complete repudiation of what the father stood for, and in the final analysis, this repudiation includes publicizing the relationship, by publishing the novels. Both Ernest Pontiflex, and Edmund Gosse escape their fathers' power, in the first part by physically distancing themselves, and in a second part by psychologically distancing themselves.<sup>18</sup> By creating an island of existence away from the paternal home, these young men can, and do, establish their individuality, despite

---

<sup>17</sup>- An opposing paternal response, one which was intended to protect the father's place, was Mr. Tulliver's decision to send his son Tom to a good school.

"if I made him a miller an' farmer, he'd be expecting to take to the mill an' the land, an' a-hinting at me as it was time for me to lay by an' think o' my latter day. Nay, nay, I've seen enough o' that wi' sons. I'll never take my coat off before I go to bed. I shall give Tom an eddication an' put him to a business, as he may make a nest for himself, an' not want to push me out o' mine. Pretty well if he gets it when I'm dead an' gone. I shan't be put off wi' spoon meat afore I've lost my teeth." (George Eliot, The Mill on the Floss (Boston, 1961), Chapter III.

See also Emile Zola, La Terre <1887>.

<sup>18</sup>- This ability of young men to actually distance themselves physically from their family is a key to understanding some of the differences between the paternal tyrants' efforts to control their sons, as compared to their daughters. The facility of young men, in the late nineteenth century, to exist independently, was much greater than for young women. Young women, especially middle class women, had narrower means of escape, and less options for 'respectable' existence outside their protective environment.

their fathers' power. On the second level, the psychological level, writing about the tyrant, describing his methods, acts as a form of psychic release. In publishing these acts, the sons can formally distance themselves from their fathers.<sup>19</sup> While these authors/sons may be older than Harvey Cheyne, the hero of Kipling's Captain Courageous <1887>, their journey towards independence is still to be achieved.

The success of the paternal tyrant can, therefore, be measured by the loss of the child's individuality; in other words, by the ability of the parent to control, and finally to break down the child's personal will. While it is true that many authors developed, to a greater or lesser degree, this character of the paternal tyrant, the success rate of the paternal tyrants is minimal.

---

<sup>19</sup>- The Feminist school of literary criticism has contributed a great deal to the issues involved in literary empowerment. To write is, as Gilbert and Gubar have argued, to create, to form and to control. To a certain extent, one can group these 'authoring' sons in the same category as lady authors- both are trying to come to terms with societal experiences which essentially deny them power through the articulation of their struggles. S. Gilbert and S. Gubar, The Madwomen in the Attic (New Haven, 1979).

Such an interpretation of the significance of writing about one's experiences in order to control is not gender specific. The same interpretive model holds true as well for fictional characters, created by men. David Copperfield <1850> and Great Expectations were both written in the first person narrative, and in both these examples the act of writing becomes a means by which the characters come to terms with themselves, and with the forces, and personalities which created them.

The paternal tyrant without power,<sup>20</sup> becomes impotent or at best, a bully. Paternal tyrants, whether drawn from real life, or created in the author's imagination, almost become figures of ridicule. By creating their oasis of individuality, the sons come to recognize the final powerlessness of their father.<sup>21</sup> On one level then, both of these novels can be understood within the proposed model based on the patterns found in the Victorian boys' adventure stories. Although already 'adult', these sons must have their 'adventure' away from their father's influence. In this sense, the tyrannical fathers represent more than a member of a private family, with a desire to find immortality. To a certain extent, for many of these authors, the paternal tyrant represents all that is small-minded, arbitrary, and mean in their society.<sup>22</sup> In allegorical

---

<sup>20</sup>- Power denied, either through the sons' physical removal, or from self-realization of the cost to the child.

<sup>21</sup>- The final impotence of these fathers is their inability to respond to their sons works of literature- neither father wrote a rebuttal.

<sup>22</sup>- These men are not however, evil. They cannot be equated with characters such as Uriah Heep (David Copperfield) or Quilp (The Old Curiosity Shop <1841>). The paternal tyrants do not wish to destroy their sons for the pleasure of destruction, but rather to subsume their progeny in an effort towards immortality.

form, these fathers represent those forces in society which held back progress and development.<sup>23</sup>

To create an entire explanation of fictional paternal tyranny based on two novels, pseudo-biographical ones at that, would be strongly misleading. The analysis of these two novels, however, suggests some keys to the understanding of the methods and powers of the fictional paternal tyrant, specifically the philosophical, psychological or political basis for the tyranny, the technique of tyranny, and finally the success of the tyrant. Pontiflex and Gosse focus our attention on a number of political and familial issues.

Despite the personal nature of both these stories, there is an important subtext concerning political power:

---

<sup>23</sup>- This interpretation of the paternal tyrant as allegorical figure for the conservative forces within Victorian society is not suggested in order to mask over the power of the father within the private sphere, but rather to suggest that within Victorian literature, there exists a multitude of levels of interpretation, within which to comprehend the characters, and their functions within the novel.

tyranny functions best when hidden from view,<sup>24</sup> and exercised in the name of something larger, and other than the personal love of power.<sup>25</sup> This political subtext will be examined in the following section on the historical novel.

On the familial level, an important theme is the problem of the gender of the child who is being tyrannized. Daughters and sons can not be controlled in the same manner. Their place within the home and society compels them to develop in a different fashion, and the exercise of paternal tyranny reflects that difference. Finally, the development of the idea of reconciliation must also be taken into account, as it suggests that the resolution of the filial

---

<sup>24</sup>- The Sherlock Holmes novellas, especially "The Sign of Four" and "The Valley of Fear" suggest that one of the real political fears of the late Victorians was secrecy. Of the four great Holmes cases, three are based on secret societies. (The Hound of the Baskervilles is based on a case of inheritance, the sins of the father visiting the sons.) The fear of secret societies undermining the fragile political structure was both a British and American phenomenon. The riots, revolutions, and civil war of recent memory placed a premium on the ideal of political stability. The ever extending reign of Queen Victoria soon became a potent symbol of stability. In the English Canadian context, the Imperial link was a source not only of pride, but of strength, and durability. (C. Berger, The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1867-1914 (Toronto, 1970); R. Moyles and D. O'ram, Imperial Dreams and Colonial Realities; British Views of Canada, 1880-1914 (Toronto, 1988); W. Morton, ed., The Shield of Achilles: Aspects of Canada in the Victorian Age (Toronto, 1968).

<sup>25</sup>- Family life as symbolic mirror of political life is not unique to this period's fiction: it is one of the oldest symbols and models of the relationship between the family and the State.

paradox implies a balance between the values held by an earlier generation, and those demanded by the new age.

### III

The fundamental question raised by authors in the historical novel centers around generational time, and politicized power. The father symbolizes the past, and the son represents the future.<sup>26</sup> The tyranny emerges as the fathers' attempt to control their sons' lives, to insure that the fathers' regime will continue.<sup>27</sup> The use of a real historical time, allows the author to make the relationship between the chaos of the times, and the familial disorder.<sup>28</sup> The paternal tyrant located in the historical novels functions on two distinct but mutually supportive

---

<sup>26</sup>- In Waverley <1814>, Scott uses a three generational model. The son's 'adventure' will allow him to synthesize the values of his rational, Georgian father, and his idealistic, Stuart grandfather.

<sup>27</sup>- Daughter-father conflict is extremely rare in these historical novels. The overwhelming number of plots center on the father-son relationship, and female characters are merely the tangible (and sexual) symbols of the sons' political desires.

<sup>28</sup>- In Lorna Doone <1869>, this father-son conflict is resolved early in the novel, as the protagonist's father is killed by the Doone's. However, the revenge of the father's death is an important motor for the plot.

levels: the personal and the political. The personal paternal tyranny in this genre stems from the father's refusal to acknowledge the son's independence, an independence made all the more critical as the son confronts new political realities. The political tyranny is established by the father's refusal to acknowledge the new regime. In Scott's Ivanhoe <1819>, for example, Cedric the Saxon refuses to recognize the essential political domination of the Normans.<sup>29</sup> Cedric's refusal is so profound, that he drags his son Ivanhoe into his political machinations.<sup>30</sup> Rowena, Ivanhoe's lady love, will be pledged to Athelstane, (enabling the two oldest Saxon blood lines to merge) and Ivanhoe himself will be disinherited for going on the Crusades, (a Norman activity). Where Cedric sees only subservience, Ivanhoe recognizes the need for political compromise, and eventually will be symbolic of the new Saxon order.

This double edged father-son relationship is repeated by Charles Dickens in Barnaby Rudge. In this novel, both young male protagonists are victims of their respective fathers' tyranny. The fathers are particularly authoritarian

---

<sup>29</sup>- Scott was, according to Carl Berger op.cit., p. 94-5 particularly influential in the development of the Canadian romantic historical novelists.

<sup>30</sup>- "The Saxon had been under very intense and agonizing apprehensions concerning his son, for nature had asserted her rights, in spite of the patriotic stoicism which laboured to disown her." W. Scott, Ivanhoe (Harmondsworth, 1986), Chapter XVIII.

when it comes to their sons asserting their individuality, for example, in the matter of future wives. Both fathers, in their own manner, also contribute to the general societal chaos. Willet refuses to recognize any reason for change,<sup>31</sup> and Chester contributes to the Gordon riots, by encouraging Hugh and Gashford, Gordon's secretary. Fed up with the unreasonableness of their fathers' demands, both sons run away. Like *Ivanhoe*, Joe Willet and Edward Chester establish their independence in a world beyond their father's powers. Unlike the pattern found in the boys' adventure novels, however, these young men will return to their fathers' world, and contribute to the proper reordering of the community. Their fathers' tyranny is to a certain extent a personal representation of the causes of the societal chaos.

The standard father-son relationship in Victorian historical novel sets the tyrannical father as symbol of the past regime, the static, conservative vision of the world. The son stands for modernity, for the future. A few novels invert this standard pattern, and create in the father the universal and in the son, the deviant. For example, in

---

<sup>31</sup>- In the flyer he had made up after Joe finally runs way, the father describes his son as "a young boy; and furthermore as being from eighteen inches to a couple of feet shorter than he was; two circumstances which perhaps accounted, in some degree, for its never having been productive of any other effect than the transmission to Chigwell at various times and at a vast expense, of some runaways varying from six years old to twelve." Charles Dickens, Barnaby Rudge (Harmondsworth, 1987), Chapter 33.

William Lighthall's The False Chevalier <1898>, the son, in abandoning the father's world, (physically, by moving across the ocean, psychologically, by abandoning his father's sound values), contributes to the end of the pastoral if corrupt, New French regime. In this novel, the tyrant is not the father, but the ephemeral vision of riches followed by the son. While not representative of the numerical majority of historical novels, Lighthall's The False Chevalier is representative of a second perspective of the father-son relationship: a perspective which appears to be more concerned with the problem of sons abandoning their fathers' worlds, and thereby launching the community into chaos.

In William Kirby's The Golden Dog <1877-1896>, two young men, and one father stand on these polarities. The beloved and honored bourgeois Philibert, father to the honorable Pierre, stands as symbol for all the potential of New France. Le Gardeur, brother of Pierre's lady love Amelie, kills the honorable bourgeois in a drunken haze, ascerbated by the beautiful but soulless Angelique.<sup>32</sup> This triangle of male characters represents those elements of New

---

<sup>32</sup>- Coming just after a brief, but bloodless tussle in the street, "That look, that word, would have made Le Gardeur slaughter his father at that moment. Astonished by the sight of Angelique, and maddened by her words as much as by the blow he had received, Le Gardeur swore he would have revenge upon the spot." W. Kirby, The Golden Dog (Toronto, n.d.), Chapter 50. It is significant that in order to express Le Gardeur's strength of the passion, Kirby writes that he would slaughter his father, suggesting that striking one's father would be the height of insanity.

France society which were instrumental in Kirby's vision of its downfall. Le bourgeois represents the power of the French "habitant", treacherously slain by a drunken noblemen who once had character, but now is a pawn in the hands of the French seigneurs who are systematically raping New France for their own profit. Like Lighthall, Kirby portrays the past on both a political and personal level. The father's time has been corrupted by a son, who has basically sacrificed his traditional values, in favor of other immediate, but less wholesome ones.

Time, in the historical novel, functions as a major theme, and serves a double purpose. On one hand, the use of a real past time (always a period of conflict, crisis, or transition) allows for an examination of the recreation of political regimes.<sup>33</sup> On the other hand, the author can also use the question of regeneration, implicit in political crisis, or transitions, as a mirror in an examination of the paternal-filial relationship.

---

<sup>33</sup>- This aspect of the novel is especially important for Canadians, who, throughout this period, were searching in their past for answers to their current political questions. William Kirby's The Golden Dog, William Lighthall's The Young Seigneur <1888>, and The False Chevalier, Gilbert Parker's The Right of Way <1900>, and The Seat of the Mighty <1898> are examples of the nationalistic use made of the past, attempting to examine and explain the French fact to those outside Quebec. A second response to the nascent nationalism in Canada are authors such as Ralph Connor, or H. A. Cody, who saw the promise of the nation in the West, and North.

This double purpose reflects the tension of the Victorian masculine experience, as men deal with the conflicts between the private and the public spheres. As men they are expected to have certain qualities. For example Cedric is a good man, strong, honest, stalwart, and true to his beliefs (Ivanhoe). As a father, however, Cedric is blinded by his political vision, so much so, that he nearly loses his son. Scott uses the character to call for a balance, on both the political and personal level. One of the consequences of political or public immoderation is familial disorder.

#### IV

In Victorian fiction, paternal tyranny is not limited to times past. Nor is it exclusively paternal. The father characters created by Charles Dickens run the gamut between the genial but inefficient Mr. Micawber (David Copperfield) to the tyrannical Dombey (Dombey and Son). Dickens' great paternal tyrants, Gradgrind, (Hard Times <1854>) and Dombey (Dombey and Son) possess many of the same characteristics as Pontiflex, and Gosse. Philip Dombey, of the firm Dombey and Son, seeks above all to confirm his own immortality by

having a son, who will follow the father's footsteps into the family firm, as Dombey himself did. His tyranny is based on the confusion he creates between the firm, the public, and his family, the private. (Dombey and Son) In Hard Times, Mr. Gradgrind, sacrifices his children's individuality on the alter of his god, Utility.<sup>34</sup> In both cases, the basis upon which the authority of the father rests, providing and instruction, has been warped out of all shape, leaving in its wake a twisted, and self-serving paternal tyrant.

On the personal level, the paternal tyrants are all made of the same cloth: the father who stands as minister, not only to society, but also to his family, a traditional role within patriarchal societies, but a role which when taken to extremes, becomes tyranny. The characters are created with this one tragic flaw: they are egomaniacs, and their exercise of the paternal responsibilities is clouded by their inherent flaw.

In all of Dickens' novels there are only three cases of a father being successful in tyrannizing his children. The first example is Ebenezer Scrooge's father in "A Christmas Carol" <1843>. In the first scene, the Ghost of Christmas Past, the young and still emotionally fragile Ebenezer comes home from school to visit his father and sister. In a dialogue between the siblings, the reader learns that the

---

<sup>34</sup>- In The Ordeal of Richard Feverel, the father's tyranny is exercised in the name of education.

father is in some way displeased with the young boy, and the girl is planning to intercede for him. Unfortunately, the girl dies before she can reconcile father to son. In the scene following the cemetery, the Ghost shows Ebenezer the result of such an unreconciled father-son relationship. Ebenezer loses the girl he loves, to a god he loves better, Mammon. The hostile father-son relationship is the only clue to the reasons Scrooge has become the way he is, and as such, it has much weight in the story line.<sup>35</sup>

In Dickens' final two novels the arm of paternal tyranny is extended beyond the fathers' grave. In Our Mutual Friend <1865>, the novel opens with the supposed death of the protagonist, who according to his father's will, was either to marry a certain young woman, or lose the fortune to the dustman. In the unfinished novel The Mystery of Edwin Drood <1870>, the turning point of the plot is the written desires of two dead men that their children, on reaching a certain age, should marry. If the wills had not been written, then Edwin Drood would never have had to be killed by his uncle, who had fallen in love with the young girl. In both these books, it is the hand of the father's authority,

---

<sup>35</sup>- The weight of the first scene between Ebenezer and his sister is underscored by one of the scenes shown by the ghost of Christmas' yet to come, at the Cratchit home, after Tiny Tim is dead. The strong relationship between Bob Cratchit and his son is one of the reasons the boy is still alive, and Scrooge's increasing demands on Bob will eventually be one of the reasons why Tiny Tim will not survive. Without his father's strength, the child will die.

reaching beyond their graves, which precipitates the stories.<sup>36</sup> In both these cases, the natural wishes of the fathers to secure for their children the best match possible, becomes tyrannical by the misplacement in time. Dickens' concern with the boundaries between the father's authority, and the child's will is shown in these stories to have been twice overstepped. In the first place, by trying to force a match, and in the second, from doing it from the grave.

What is most striking about the paternal tyrants created by Charles Dickens is their lack of success compared to the maternal tyrants. Miss Havisham, (Great Expectations) Edith's mother in Dombey and Son, Steerforth's mother in David Copperfield, Arthur Clennam's mother in Little Dorrit, are all more successful at corrupting their children, and subsuming the child's will. To a certain extent, the maternal power comes from the women's ability to warp the basis for Motherhood itself: these mothers all over-emphasize their sacrifice for their children, they all over-emphasize their own ill-treatment at the hands of the world, and almost all of them seek to punish the world through their children. Miss Havisham physically controls the

---

<sup>36</sup>- This use of wills repeats the problems found in the novels based on the sins of the father motif, in that the children must sort out the problems caused by the earlier generation before they can begin their own lives.

beautiful Estella by keeping her prisoner in the time-frozen house, and a psychological prisoner of her wounding words.

Mrs. Clennam (Little Dorrit) feels that her husband ill-treated her, and punishes her son for the sins of the father. Moreover, she refuses to explain to Arthur the roots of the conflict. Arthur's ignorance concerning the roots of the conflict, and the permutations of guilt and doubt, essentially render him impotent, unable to act on his own accord with any strength. It is only when Mrs. Clennam speaks her secret about the past to Dorrit, that he is free from the shackles of both his mother, and the past, and can begin to live his life, on his own terms.<sup>37</sup> Maternal tyrants are relatively more successful than paternal tyrants in controlling their sons, and absolutely more successful at controlling their daughters.<sup>38</sup>

To all intents and purposes Miss Havisham can ruin Estella, making her incapable of having any kind of relationship with either men or women. Having been jilted at the alter, Miss Havisham seeks to create in her adopted daughter, Estella, a perfect weapon of revenge: beautiful

---

<sup>37</sup>- This relationship between Mrs. Hallum and Arthur reinforces the argument of the filial paradox.

<sup>38</sup>- Steerforth's mother is an interesting exception to the rules governing the maternal tyrants, in that it was less her strength which corrupted her son, than her inability to control him at all. In Jane Eyre <1847>, by Charlotte Bronte, Jane's cousin, the household bully, is permitted to behave in such as fashion because his mother refuses to check his behavior.

and attractive Estella will hate men, and by her refusals, break the hearts of many men in revenge for Miss Havisham's. Edith's mother is also capable of ruining any fountain of affection in her daughter. These women share certain characteristics which make them members of the parthenon of great tyrants. Like Gosse and Pontiflex, these mothers will sacrifice individuality for a higher goal. Unlike the fictional male tyrants, however, these mothers perceive their children as weapons against the world, as tools of revenge, rather than as means of immortality.<sup>39</sup> Estella will break men's hearts as a man broke Miss Havisham's, Mrs. Clennam will make her son pay for the folly of his father.

These tyrannical mothers are especially powerful when compared to Dickens' creation of the tyrannical father. In Dombey and Son, Edith (the second Mrs. Dombey) has been successfully warped by her mother's tyranny, in a way in which Mr. Dombey, for all his love of power and desire for authority, cannot come near to emulating. Mr. Dombey cannot control Florence to the point of killing off all her sensitivity, in the way Edith's mother did. He can and does ignore her, devalue her, and finally strike her, but he cannot kill her ability to care.

---

<sup>39</sup>- Truly evil characters, whose authority comes from their ability to impose their will through chaos, like the Count in Wilke Collins' The Women in White <1860>, and the evil-doers whose nemesis is Sherlock Holmes, are overwhelmingly men. Evil female characters (except for witches) are striking by their absence.

Why are the Dickens' women more successful as tyrants? One of the reasons is that women tyrannize their daughters, and men their sons. But sons could run away, and the daughters could not. David Copperfield, Nicholas Nickelby, and Martin Chuzzlewit: the list is endless of heroes able to run away from unreasonable paternal demands. Daughters are not so fortunate, and must remain within the home, vulnerable to a strong personality.

Tyrants, maternal or paternal, rarely thrive in these novels. Miss Havisham burns to death, Edith's mother is reduced by a stroke to the vision of a painted doll, Mr. Dombey loses his business in which he had invested so much pride. In Barnaby Rudge, John Willet, the Maypole innkeeper, who rebuked his son in the opening of chapter of the book for speaking out of turn,<sup>40</sup> is himself struck dumb in the final chapter. The two most consistent consequences of tyranny are redemption and impotence.<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup>- "Silence sir!" returned his father 'what do you mean by talking out when you see people that are more than two or three times your age, sitting still and not dreaming of saying a word."

"Why, that's the proper time for me to talk, isn't it?" said Joe rebelliously.

"The proper time, sir!" retorted his father 'the proper time's no time." Charles Dickens, Barnaby Rudge (Harmondsworth, 1987), Chapter 3.

<sup>41</sup>- Only rarely are the children liberated from the tyrant through his death. The child, however, often dies: Dombey Jr. and Richard Feverel for example.

According to the pattern found in Butler's and Gosse's works, the first death blow to the power of the tyrant is the physical distance of the son from the father. In fiction, the child's escape from this tyranny is gender dependent. The sons must be physically distanced from their fathers, whereas the daughters must actually confront their fathers. In Hard Times, after the bank robbery, Tom Gradgrind is spirited away with the help of the despised circus troop. Only after he has been exiled, will he become reconciled with his father. On the other hand, Louisa Gradgrind confronts her father, directly and verbally, with his paternal failure. After this confrontation, which essentially opens the father's eyes to his failures, Louisa returns to her father's house, and along with Sissy Jupe, assumes responsibility for her father's transformation.<sup>42</sup>

The son's escape must be more physical and immediate—he must leave the paternal home. To a certain extent, the daughter's escape depends on her ability to confront her

---

<sup>42</sup>— Florence Dombey runs away from her father's house, so like the sons she physically distances herself. She takes this action only after her father has struck her, and after her father's business collapses, she will be reunited with him.

To a certain extent, this pattern is a repetition of the pattern found in the girls' books. Florence and Louisa are reunited with their fathers, and like Anne of Green Gables and Matthew Cuthbert, these daughters become instrumental in helping their fathers become more rounded and complete individuals. The key difference, however, between L.M. Montgomery and Dickens is that Dickens chooses to place the emphasis on the efforts to destroy the daughters, whereas Montgomery chose to examine the efforts needed to form the positive bonds.

father directly with his failings. In Dickens' world daughters become personally implicated in the tyrants' rehabilitation. Daughters can help fathers, but sons cannot. One of the consequences of this gender dependency in terms of the child's escape, is that the fathers of daughters are allowed to redeem themselves, whereas the fathers of sons have few such opportunities.

If redemption is not possible, then the plight of the tyrant is to be rendered impotent. One could argue that the final outcome of paternal tyranny is to end up like Mr. Bennett, arguably the first sustained impotent fictional father (Pride and Prejudice <1813>). A witty, gentle man, with a dithering, and confusing wife, Mr. Bennett has retired to his library, supervising his five daughters from afar. Faced, however, with the disgrace of Lydia's elopement with Mr. Wickham, Mr. Bennett can only look on from the sidelines as Mr. D'arcy and Mr. Gardiner (the girls' uncle) arrange to legitimize the disgraceful situation. Mr. Bennett has neither the knowledge of London, nor the financial means to coerce Wickham, nor in the end, the stature of authority strong enough to have prevented Lydia from running away in the first place.

Powerless fictional fathers are not only a consequence of tyranny. Some fathers are portrayed as consistently powerless particularly in 'drawing-room' dramas, the realm of the 'lady' author. The powerless father is also found

particularly in matchmaking stories- stories about young women in those years in which they must choose their husbands.<sup>43</sup> The issue of paternal impotence raises the question of the balance of parental power: if the father has no power, does his wife exercise it? Powerlessness also raises the question of the nature and place of patriarchal authority: if a father is portrayed as powerless within his home, is he also powerless outside of it?

The first issue, the hierarchy of power within the family, is almost never shown to be an area of conflict. In other words, the plot structures of these 'drawing-room' novels do not include a demonstration of a power struggle. In cases where the father begins the novel as powerless, some other member of the family exercises authority in his name. In Pride and Prejudice, the power and authority in the home might arguably be in the hands of one of daughters, Elizabeth, and not in the hands of Mrs. Bennett, who is successful in marrying her daughters despite her best intentions. Charlotte Yonge, one of the most popular British authors of the period, in The Clever Women of the Family <1865>, shows a triangle of authority: the mother, the dead father, and the daughter. The mother of the protagonist

---

<sup>43</sup>- See P. Ward, Courtship, Love and Marriage in Nineteenth Century English Canada (Montreal, 1990) who has suggested that in match-making, it was the women, mothers and daughters who organized and supervised the process, and the paterfamilias was essentially excluded from the procedure. See also J. Miller, Women Writing About Men (New York, 1986).

constantly appeals to the memory of her dead husband, and as her husband's widow, rather than by any 'natural' ability, in her attempts to control her daughter. The protagonist, on the other hand, appeals to the ideal of a rational System to break the traditional authority of her dead father.

In those rare stories where the authority over the family is a question of conflict between members of that family, the authors tend to shy away from direct and overt descriptions of conflict. Mrs. Humphrey Ward's C.P.R. inspired novel Canadian Born <1910>, shows a young man attempting to co-opt the position as head of the house to decide his sister's marriage partner, and yet, throughout the novel, it is the mother and the sister who made the real decisions. Both mother and daughter allow this co-opting, since the young man is dying apparently from some 'wasting' disease.<sup>44</sup>

The authors of such 'drawing-room' novels do not wish to challenge the notion of the male's 'natural' position of authority, and rarely describe overt scenes of conflict. In those cases where the person of authority is powerless, the functions of authority are assumed by some other member of the family, without conflict, and lip service is still paid

---

<sup>44</sup>- Women co-opting power are not however, always shown to be successful. In Charlotte Yonge's The Clever Woman of The Family, the fatherless heroine, a woman of good intentions, but little common sense, attempts to control all around her in the name of a System she reads of in books. This presumed knowledge eventually causes the death of a young girl, placed in her care.

to the ideal. Stories which have as a subtext the question of a power struggle, nearly always end in favor of the traditional patriarchal construction (The Clever Woman of the Family).

The second question raised by the idea of paternal powerlessness is the extent to which the father has lost power: whether this personal impotence extends to his public image as well. Rosanna Leprehon disguises her creation of an impotent father behind a certain amount of filibuster, which makes the seigneur sound impressive and powerful, yet his daughter, Antoinette marries twice, and neither of her husbands were her father's first choice (Antoinette de Mirecourt or secret marrying and secret sorrowing <1864>). While there are no direct scenes of the seigneur exercising public power, by other character's descriptions of him, he is a figure of some reputation. Despite the power invested in him, both by his position in society as a leader of men, as well as by the personal, familial power invested in him by the governess of his daughter, and his daughter herself, he could not prevent the first marriage, and finally had to capitulate to the second.

Because these fathers are found most often in the realm of 'drawing-room' drama, written by women, one could argue from a feminist perspective, that these authors are essentially describing a powerful female dominated sub-culture, representative of a subversive image of female

power. This image shows women doing what they will, despite the desires of their fathers, or other male authority figures, as well as showing the essential ineffectiveness of trying to control women.

The first condition, that only women created these characters of powerless fathers is not true. Nell's gambling grandfather cannot protect her, cannot even shelter her (The Old Curiosity Shop). While it is true that few men wrote 'drawing-room' dramas, it is not true that the problem of powerless fathers is not treated in those books written by men. In certain cases, the impotence is caused by an overextension of discipline, and control. In The Ordeal of Richard Feverel for example, Sir Austin, in attempting to control every thought and action of his son, ends up losing any influence whatsoever, and Richard marries against Sir Austin's wishes. The same consequences of the same action are visited on Pontiflex, whose son transfers his intimacy from his father to the narrator (The Way of All Flesh). The difference between how the female and male authors dealt with the powerless father is essentially based on how each author perceives the manner in which the impotence was created. The female authors create a smaller 'female' community in which men are seemingly powerless to operate, (although they are powerful to save, Pride and Prejudice), while the male author sees the impotence as a consequence of the overexertion of paternal power.

In many of these 'drawing room' novels, domestic authority is firmly in the hands of the women. There is a striking insularity here, between the gender spheres which was not apparent in the girls' books examined in the previous chapter. In this genre of fiction, fathers seem to play only a very small role in their daughter's lives. Even when they wish to exercise some measure of control, their authority appears to be limited, like the authority of the paternal tyrant, by the threshold of the boudoir.

\*\*\*\*

Using the father-son relationship as a foil, these authors create imaginative, personalized tensions personifying larger social stresses. This analysis underlines specific issues which concerned late Victorian early Edwardian society. Hidden behind big words like tradition, are specific issues such as education, science, and political liberalism and their effect on the social fabric. The Ordeal of Richard Feverel and Hard Times are novels about the suasive power of education. Ivanhoe, Waverley and The Golden Dog, are examinations of the problems in periods of transitions of political regimes.

The father figure in turn of the century literature is complex and multi-dimensional. In children's literature, the image of the father presented is relatively uni-dimensional,

and dependent on the gender of the intended reader. In adult literature, the image of the father is intricate, and as a reflection of the author's perception of society, has been found to refract particular social, political and regenerative issues. That, overall, the father figure plays an important part in this period's literature may suggest that while he may have been overshadowed by his wife in texts generated by specific social agencies, his role was none the less important. To reduce this figure to a caricature of tyranny or impotence, is to flatten the variations and levels of symbolism the authors used, and thereby pass over the father's importance in the mental landscape of the period.

If there are any national differences in the fictional father created by English Canadians as compared with those created by either the British or Americans, it may be that the Canadian authors tended to create more admirable fathers. These father figures representing the older regimes, destroyed by their sons, suggest that the Canadian authors were more conservative than the British authors of the same genre. At the service of political nation-building, as Carl Berger has demonstrated, this fiction was promoting positive attitudes towards the nation's past. Within that perspective, the admirable father becomes an important totem of change, a cause for perhaps lament, as well as a

personalized image of the tradition the authors were concerned about losing.

There are several important issues of direct application to the father to underline from this discussion. The first point is the reaffirmation of the constant problem of the reconciliation of the private and the public spheres. Only one type of source, children's literature, showed an easy integration between these two spheres. As in custody decisions, or church literature, adult literature confirms the problems faced by fathers: the integration of their public aspirations, with their family life. The paternal tyrants were all tyrannical because they sacrificed their children's well-being to their own desires for immortality, an immortality which they perceived as emerging from public recognition. In their misguided efforts to recapture their 'time', the fathers are willing to sacrifice their sons.

The second is the lack of effective and sustained paternal power in this fiction. Sons escape into the world, and daughters retreat to the boudoir. In this world there are places that the pater-familias cannot follow, spaces that he cannot enter. Some tyranny is broken through the redemptive power of their children, as their actions redeem the father, while other tyranny is broken by the child's own articulation.

Finally, this chapter has pointed to the question of time and the problems inherent in regeneration. The cost of

the son's liberty is the father's loss of control. Whatever the means of direct deliverance, there is within the tyranny the seeds of its own destruction: poetic justice itself decried that, like King Lear, to exceed one's time, doomed one to inarticulate ravings in the storm. Time has to be respected. For these authors, Canadian, British, American, the focus of these stories is the search for a balance between the future and the past, and the reconciliation between father and child, which is the inevitable denouement, reaffirms that balance.

Even without the excess of tyranny, from the perspective of progress, of growth, issues which appeal to the liberal or the reformer, the son's victory compels attention. In this Brave New World, however, the tradition, the 'way it was', personified in the figure of the father, is made somewhat obsolete. This built-in obsolescence concerns these authors. The desire for immortality, raised to new heights in the Victorian mind, was itself a defensive response to the enormous changes experienced by these people. Within this defensive response, the extraordinary attention they paid to the past, and those who represent the past is understandable.

This analysis of the father figure in literature has drawn our attention to the multiple levels on which the pater-familias played in the turn of the century imaginative landscape. As a political actor, he represents the static,

the past regime clawing for continued respectability and legitimacy. As a public actor, he represents the innate drive for success, exaggerated to become an obsession for which all else is sacrificed. These fictional fathers, in confusing their political or public lives with their private lives, contribute to the social chaos, and the familial crisis. In an inverted way, these authors re-create the tensions between the social and the familial, in the same manner as the authors of the temperance tales. Both genres stress the place of the father as mediator between the family and society. When he fails to keep a balance, both society and the family fall apart.

The following chapter will examine the father as he really acted, and no longer as he was told to act, or as symbol for larger social problems. Through a study of several collections of private papers from middle class late Victorian early Edwardian Montrealers, we will attempt to find the echoes of this imaginative and prescriptive ideal, as it was realized by particular fathers, as they and their children lived their lives.

Chapter VI  
The Sum of Its Parts  
Fatherhood in Montreal, 1870-1914

One of the most marked silences in the texts so far examined has been the change of fathering patterns throughout the child's and father's life-time. The reform literature assumed a generic fatherhood, which appeared constant and relatively independent of the child's development. In the custody decisions, the judges focussed on what precise age a child no longer needed a mother's care, rather than the particular moments when a father's care might be most appropriate. Similarly, literature posited a static father-child relationship, children's literature centered on the dependant child, while adult literature focussed on the problems of the child seeking his independence. No single genre, however, generated a coherent dynamic vision of fatherhood from birth till death. Yet, viewed as a whole, these texts suggest that there was a

general recognition that fatherhood was not be a static state. Exactly how the middle class Anglophone Montreal men integrated the various models and images presented to them may, therefore, best be clarified by an analysis which focusses on this perspective of change.

This chapter will explore the father-child relationships of six Victorian Montreal middle class families, through the prism of their private papers. It will examine whether the models and roles found in earlier chapters were echoed in the reality of Montreal's middle class, as well as examine the attitudes and behavior of this selected group of fathers. The purpose of this chapter is to understand how the individual father integrated the variety of social images presented to him, and how the fathering process evolved during the period, as well as throughout the father's lifetime.

The families examined for this study were eminent members of the English, Protestant upper middle class of Montreal. The Greenshields, Stephens and Cloustons were wealthy Montreal families. The Stephens lived off the family estate, Edward Clouston was general manager of the Bank of Montreal in 1890, and its first vice president in 1906. Edward Greenshield and James Morgan were important Montreal merchants. Other individuals were distinguished, rather than wealthy: Sir. William Dawson was the principal of McGill

University, from 1855 to 1893, his son-in-law Bernard Harrington was a chemistry professor at McGill and William Lighthall was a prominent lawyer, author and local politician, (Mayor of Westmount, 1900-1902). All men played important leadership roles in the Protestant community of the city.<sup>1</sup>

All families had more than one child: the Harringtons had ten, while the Greenshields had two.<sup>2</sup> George Dawson was a cripple, and Sheldon Stephens and Eric Harrington suffered long illnesses which eventually led to their deaths.<sup>3</sup> Only Cybel Lighthall lost a child in childbirth. There were no single parent families within this group, no households headed by a widow or widower, nor were there any extended or multiple households. All of the families organized their households in the nuclear manner. Almost all the children attended local schools, the exceptions being Lawrence Sheldon, and Douglas, Cleveland and temporarily Harold Morgan who were sent to school in England. Only one daughter

---

<sup>1</sup>- The institutions supported by these men included hospitals, libraries and schools. Bernard Harrington was a member of the Protestant School Board, William Lighthall Jr. was a governor of the Congregational College of Montreal, James Morgan was a governor of the Protestant Hospital for the Insane, Edward Greenshields was a trustee of Trafalgar School, and Edward Clouston was a governor of the Fraser Institute.

<sup>2</sup>- None of the families had multiple births: no twins, or triplets.

<sup>3</sup>- Sheldon suffered from diabetes, and Eric had consumption. Sir William Dawson and his wife Margaret lost a child in infancy.

was sent away to school: Kylie Lighthall attended Havergal in Toronto. All the boys attended universities, except Harold Morgan, sometimes outside of Canada,<sup>4</sup> and most became professionals, or entered their father's business.<sup>5</sup>

For the most part these families lived in relative opulence.<sup>6</sup> Several families had country houses, either on or off the Island.<sup>7</sup> Except for the Harringtons, all of the families travelled to Europe, either on business or for pleasure.<sup>8</sup> The houses these families occupied were in the respectable St. Antoine Ward of the city, which included the Square Mile. While the women occasionally complained about the lack of qualified help, there appears to have been at least one servant, if not two in every house. There was, however, a striking absence of live-in nannies. This lack

---

<sup>4</sup>- Douglas Morgan, George Dawson studied in England. William Dawson studied for a short while in France, and the Rhodes brothers attended American Universities.

<sup>5</sup>- Engineering was the occupation of choice for most of the sons. All four of the Rhodes brothers, and George and William Dawson were engineers. Douglas Morgan became a doctor, and Cleveland Morgan ran the family business.

<sup>6</sup>- These families lived in houses and neighborhoods which correspond to Sherry Olson and David Hanna's category 5, 6 or 7. "Métiers, loyers et bouts de rue: L'Armature de la société montréalaise, 1881 à 1901", Cahiers de géographie du Québec, 27, 71 (1983), pp. 225-276.

<sup>7</sup>- The Morgan family has a country home in Senneville, on the western tip of the Island of Montreal, and the Dawson's summer house was at Metis.

<sup>8</sup>- During Sheldon Stephens' illness, the entire family resided in Europe for three years. Lawrence Stephens would continue his education at McGill.

may reflect the women's choice to spend a great deal of time with their young children, or it may be an indication of the lack of nannies in the city, or it may be that these men just starting their families and their careers could only afford a limited number of servants, and a maid and a cook were the priority.

Beyond the geographic and time considerations, the most important criterion for selection of the collections examined for this study was the extended length of correspondence between members of the family, and particularly between father and child. Extended correspondences were better prisms through which to examine the fundamental questions posed by this study, although smaller collections were examined, and in some cases, fragments are included in the analysis. A second reason for retaining only very large collections was to establish the balance between mothers and fathers. Which parent was

responsible for what aspects of child care?' The final reason for examining particularly long collections is to avoid being misled by fragmentary evidence. Without a family

---

<sup>9</sup>- John Demos in his article on the changing ideals of fatherhood in America, has proposed a model of the historical changes of fatherhood. "The Changing Faces of Fatherhood", in J. Demos, ed., Past, Present and Personal: The Family and the Life Course in American History (New York, 1986). Demos argues that mothers and fathers are each held socially responsible for certain aspects of child rearing; aspects which over time, have oscillated between the parents, depending on what constitutes masculinity and femininity in any given historical period. For example, he notices that the Puritan father was much more involved than the Victorian father in the child's spiritual development. In Puritan New England, women were not considered spiritually mature enough to be entrusted with the spiritual education of the children. By the 1850's however, through the 'Cult of True Womanhood', men were considered too secular to be responsible for their children's spiritual education, while women, preserved in the home from the destructive aspects of industrial life, were now the perfect educators. From 1700 to 1900, American children were always perceived as needing spiritual guidance and education; what altered was which parent should be responsible for it.

Two important reservations about this model must be stated. The first reservation is that Demos apparently sees fathering as a catch all for whatever mothers can not or will not do. Fathers are not, according to this model, active creators of their role, but rather a reactor to what mothering was. The second reservation is that Demos does not take into account the important evolutions over the lifetime of the child, as his/her new needs are met by the more socially decreed capable parent.

context, fragments often distort a relationship. Taken out of context, the fragment might be misunderstood.<sup>10</sup>

The drawback of depending on extended and two sided correspondences is the very modest number of existing

---

<sup>10</sup>- If historians wish to find authoritarian, or intimate fathers, a judicious and anecdotal selection of the material can be manipulated to support their argument. Linda Pollock, in her study of American and British diaries, Forgotten Children: Parent-Child Relationships 1500-1900 (Cambridge, 1983), p. 66-67, draws our attention to a case in which a Puritan father, Samuel Sewell 'whipped' his son Joseph 'pretty smartly'. This incident has been used by several historians, (most recently by S. Mintz and S. Kellogg, Domestic Revolutions: A Social History of American Family Life (New York, 1988), p. 2) as an example of the typically severe discipline of the Puritan father. And yet, if one examines the diary more closely, it appears as if Joseph had not only been playing with a kitten during prayers, but had thrown a lump of brass at his sister, causing a nasty gash on her forehead. Joseph had been misbehaving all day, and finally Sewell lost his temper, and whipped the boy. Not only was this the only time Sewell ever struck one of his children, but he spend the rest of the evening in prayer, sick at heart about his own lack of control.

A recent case of such a distortion is Donald MacKay's interpretation of Edward Greenshields' relationship with his son Moray, in A Square Mile: Merchant Princes of Montreal (Vancouver, 1987), pp. 171-172. MacKay tells us that Greenshields had a very good relationship with his son, "in an age when fathers were remote figures and children were brought up in the nursery...". MacKay goes on to recount the bicycle trips, the snowshoeing expeditions over the Mountain, and the trips to Europe, all of which can indeed be found in the day book. Greenshields also had a daughter, Muriel, who was very rarely mentioned in the day book. MacKay makes no mention of Muriel at all, nor does he comment on the fathering ability of the other men in his study. Greenshields thereby becomes the exception proving the rule, and his more distant relationship with his older daughter is completely ignored. This analysis proposes to document these subtle variations and alternative attitudes exhibited by these Montreal middle class men.

collections from which to draw conclusions.<sup>11</sup> Such a small sample also makes it difficult to gauge precisely changes in fatherhood over time: only a few examples can be drawn from any single generation.<sup>12</sup> While subsequent studies based on more families may add subtlety to the conclusions drawn here, the purpose of this analysis, to delimitate the lifetime evolution of the father-child relationship, is best served by this methodology, however limited in numbers.

The major focus of the following analysis based on private papers will be the evolution of the intensity of the father-child relationship, and the rhythm of intimacy established as the child passes from infancy to adulthood. In order to establish most accurately the evolving pattern of fathering, this chapter will examine the father-child

---

<sup>11</sup>- Six families (24 father-child relationships) is a small number to be considered a representative sample of Montreal's middle class. Another problem is the number of women represented in the sample. The collections were valued because of the sons or fathers involved, rather than the mothers or daughters. There is, therefore, significantly less information about the daughter-father relationship.

Correspondences themselves are not an absolute source. Some letters may have been lost, others destroyed. Even in the pre-telephonic era, letters may not have been complete expressions of the writers' emotions.

<sup>12</sup>- This sample contains examples from roughly three generations of fathers, spread over six decades: William Lighthall Sr. and Sir. William Dawson were both establishing their families in the 1850's and 60's, while Bernard Harrington, Edward Greenshield, James Morgan and Edward Clouston were fathers in the 1870's and 1880's. William Lighthall Jr., the Rhodes brothers were fathers of the 1890's, while William, and Rankine Dawson and Cleveland Morgan were establishing their families in the 1900's, and 1910's.

relationship in a chronological manner, based on the developmental stages of the child, and the corresponding pattern of fatherhood. Four periods will receive attention: expecting, infancy, childhood, and youth. The first stage of fathering is the expecting stage: during courtship, and the pregnancy of the spouse. Projections of the future role expressed by these expecting fathers have important significance. The second stage to be examined is infancy. The standard pictorial or literary image of the late Victorian father is one slightly set off from his family.<sup>13</sup> Only in rare cases are fathers portrayed physically touching a child, and usually it was an elder child. Infants are usually in their mothers' arms. The function of this section will be to examine the father-infant relationship with an eye to this stereotypical image of distance.

The third stage examined is childhood, the period from infancy to 16. Until children reached the age of about 16, parental and especially paternal attention focussed on the development of the child's skills and abilities. This analysis will focus on two aspects of the father's role: as disciplinarian, and as companion and playmate. The final period examined will be youth, defined here as from 16 to

---

<sup>13</sup>- An interesting series of collected portraits and photographs can be found in M. Perrot, éd., Histoire De La Vie Privée, vol. IV, sous la direction de P. Ariès et G. Duby (Paris, 1989). For a Canadian collection see J. R. Harper, and S. Riggs, eds., Portrait of a Period: a Collection of Notman Photographs, 1856-1915 (Montreal, 1967).

about 25, or until economic independence was achieved. According to the imaginative literature, this period was especially important for the father-son relationship, as the father, arbiter between the home and the outside world, helped his sons to establish their independence.<sup>14</sup> According to the literature, it was also this period of the relationship which saw the greatest amount of conflict, as fathers attempted extraordinary measures of control over their sons.

## I

How did the father of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century visualize his prospective role of father as he entered into marriage? What were men's expectations of fatherhood? One way to understand men's paternal aspirations is to examine the sentiments expressed during courtship and the pregnancy of their spouses. The sentiments expressed during these moments of anticipation focus our attention on what the men themselves thought to be important as they

---

<sup>14</sup>- The relationship between the father and his daughter probably went through a similar development, however, this period of the father-daughter relationship is more difficult to capture through the letter writing, since young unmarried middle class women rarely spent extended periods apart from their families at this point in their lives.

articulated their own expectations of children, family and home.

A man's first step towards family formation was the decision to get married.<sup>15</sup> This study provides two samples of courtship correspondence, between William and Margaret Dawson, and between Cybel and William Lighthall. Separated for extended periods of time prior to their marriage, both couples' letters were very explicit about their mutual feelings, and their dreams about their life together. What is significantly absent in these letters is any mention of future children. Their vision of married bliss consisted of quiet poetry readings in front of a fire, and a home for entertaining friends. As William Lighthall expressed his idea of marriage to Cybel Wilkes: "...You will be mine, we shall make one dear home, the light of love will lighten it, the warmth & affectionate sympathy will make it rosy and warm...."<sup>16</sup> Even when discussing the purchase of a house,

---

<sup>15</sup>- The stages and manners of courtship are beginning to be studied in Canadian history. P. Ward, Courtship, Love and Marriage in Nineteenth-Century English Canada (Montreal, 1990). See also B. Bailey, From Front Porch to Back Seat: Courtship in Twentieth Century America (Baltimore, 1988).

<sup>16</sup>- William Lighthall to Cybel Wilkes, July 25 1889. Lighthall Family Collection, Rare Book Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. (R.B.D.). A similar childless vision of marriage was expressed by bridegrooms writing to their family. William Dawson writing to his father, J. W. Dawson, described his future home life with his new bride, saying: "... to occupy them [the evenings] with music or reading or other forms of recreation when we are not out." William Dawson to his father, Sept. 28 1883. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. University Archives, McGill University. (U.A.).

the need for extra space for a child was not referred to.<sup>17</sup>  
 Future children were simply never mentioned.<sup>18</sup>

To suggest from this silence that the Victorian bride and groom did not think about their future children would be to ignore other factors. Prudery may have constrained the correspondents or shyness of confiding such intimate thoughts to paper. Or perhaps children were so much a part of the Victorian ideal of marriage, that they did not need to be discussed; children were simply assumed.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup>- Cybel Wilkes to William Lighthall during the summer of 1890. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

<sup>18</sup>- A similar silence surrounds the wife's pregnancy.

<sup>19</sup>- This last interpretation is suggested by the legal and religious significance of marriage. In both the Civil Code, and marriage vows, the maintenance of children is a foregone conclusion of the state of matrimony.

A letter from Dr. Drummond to his wife May in 1896, suggests that some women might have worried a great deal about not being able to have a baby.

...Look here May you deserve a good spanking to talk as you do- you are in good health feeling well- what should you fear? Nothing whatever- that's the way I feel about it and I can trust my instincts in the matter. I agree with you about the "instability" of life or rather the "immutability of human events" but on the other hand both of us stand as good a chance as the average number of the human family & there is no use in throwing up the sponge...

Mrs. Drummond was obviously depressed about her inability to conceive, suggesting that in her mind, at least, a baby was a natural and normal part of marriage. She did eventually have a baby. Dr. Drummond to his wife May, March 12 1896. Drummond Collection, Osler Library, McGill University. (O.L.).

A second significant silence concerns the presence of the father during childbirth.<sup>20</sup> Although all births were at home, few fathers mentioned their whereabouts during delivery. The announcements to friends and family members are almost exclusively written by the fathers, suggesting that none of them was absent from the city. Bernard Harrington did not go to the office, but remained at home all day "...in case of accidents."<sup>21</sup> The most significant announcement in these letters was the health of the mother. For the fathers writing these letters this was even more important than the health of the child. While the rate of mortality was steadily decreasing during the last half of the nineteenth century, childbirth remained a moment of fear.<sup>22</sup> Among these families, there was only one case of an infant dying hours after birth. William Lighthall's letter

---

<sup>20</sup>- Jill Suitor, in her analysis of American fathers participation in childbirth from 1800 to 1850, has suggested that many men in the early nineteenth century were present and active participants during the birth of their children. J. Suitor, "Husband's Participation in Childbirth: A Nineteenth Century Phenomenon", Journal of Family History, 6, 3 (Fall 1981), pp. 278-293.

<sup>21</sup>- Anna was attended by both a doctor and a midwife: Dr. Howard and Mrs. Gordon, "...a wretched woman who was not to be found at the address which she had given three days before". Bernard appears to stayed with his wife throughout the day and even during the delivery. Bernard Harrington to Margaret Dawson, Aug. 7th 1880. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>22</sup>- J.-C. Robert, "The City of Wealth and Death: Urban Mortality in Montreal, 1821-1871", in W. Mitchison and J. McGinnis, eds., Essays in the History of Canadian Medicine (Toronto, 1988), pp. 18-38.

to his mother suggests that when complications arose, there was a potential for family tragedy.

Little girl died a few minutes after birth.... Cybel herself is weak, but on the whole bearing up as bravely as possible, & I am thankful that she escaped herself. By good nursing now she ought to get around in time all right....Do not trouble about myself, as I am keeping perfectly calm & right. Sometime in September, I look forward to getting away....<sup>23</sup>

Lighthall spent less time in this letter expressing grief over the dead child, than reassuring his mother that both he and Cybel would recover from the blow. This letter suggests that the health of the mother was the major consideration, and that while the loss of the child was a tragedy, it was a lesser tragedy than losing his wife.<sup>24</sup>

Bernard Harrington, father of eight, writing to his brother in law, (and new father,) draws our attention to a third silence concerning the father's feelings in these letters of announcement.

...We are both delighted to hear that mother and daughter are both progressing so favorably. Nobody says anything about how you are progressing, and so I am constrained to hope that you are doing well. Considerable experience has caused me to conclude that when babies are born into the world the suffering of the papa is not much less that of the mama, though perhaps different in kind, and yet we hear that "mother

---

<sup>23</sup>- William Lighthall to his mother Margaret Lighthall, Aug. 17th 1897. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

<sup>24</sup>- Cybel however, did not recover, and had to go to the Adirondacks for the fall as she was too weak, mentally and physically to remain in Montreal and take care of her other children.

& child are doing beautifully" and no one says a word as to how the poor father is recovering from the shock. You have my sympathy and prayers for a speedy recovery. ...<sup>25</sup>

Bernard's humorous reference to the 'suffering of the papa' is notable for its singularity. Furthermore, this letter suggests that underneath the silence, the 'shock' of becoming a father, whether for the first time, or the eighth, was significant. The general silence in these letters of announcements about the father's feelings suggests that the father's state of mind was considered far less important than the mothers' health.<sup>26</sup>

Until the child actually arrived safely within the home, men were not very articulate about what the child

---

<sup>25</sup>- Bernard Harrington to Hope Atkin, July 7th 1891. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>26</sup>- For a contemporary examination of this silence see S. Osherson, Finding Our Fathers: The Unfinished Business of Manhood (New York, London, 1986). Motherhood, on the other hand, appeared to be a more immediately assumed status, if Anna Morgan is to be believed. "...Sixteen years ago tonight they laid your dear brown head covered with soft silky 'fuzz' on my arm, and said "Now little mother, look at your big boy." So I looked and thought you were the dearest sweetest baby in the world. For many days I lay there, ...always thinking and planning, first what I would do for my boy, and then as he grew up honest and pure and good what good he would do for other people." Anna Morgan to her eldest son Douglas on the occasion of his sixteenth birthday, June 28 1896. Morgan Collection. (R.B.D.).

might mean to them, as fathers.<sup>27</sup> This silence does not immediately lead to the conclusion that men did not care about their future role of father, but rather suggests that for the late Victorian middle class Montrealers, fatherhood in the abstract had little meaning. During this anticipatory stage of fatherhood, the father appeared to be, as Owen Wister put it "more his wife's lover than his child's father."<sup>28</sup> It appears then, that it took more than a mere birth experience to make men into fathers.

## II

If there are meaningful silences surrounding the father's participation and expectations about unborn children, very shortly the father-child relationship occupies a central place in the correspondences. Although

---

<sup>27</sup>- Older men may, however, have understood the significance of being a father. William Dawson took the opportunity of the birth of Rankine's first child, to counsel his son Rankine. William Dawson wrote that Rankine must now be on his best behavior, give up his travelling habits, and think seriously of the future. The new born daughter placed Rankine in a new situation, one where he must take responsibility and make plans. William Dawson to Rankine Dawson, Oct. 10 1898. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>28</sup>- O. Wister, The Virginian <1902>. The term "the little stranger" can be found in numerous letters. See John MacKay to Auguste MacKay, January 20 1890, MacKay Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

few fathers were the children's primary caretaker, the fathers in this study are far from indifferent to the health and well being of the child. This is particularly striking when examining the father's relationship with very young children.<sup>29</sup> According to the social standards set by both Church and State, fathers had a negligible role to play in the nursery.<sup>30</sup> In the correspondences, however, fathers demonstrate that they are capable and attentive parents and are extremely concerned about the infant's health. They enjoy their presence, and worry about being away and missing some part of their child's development.

---

<sup>29</sup>- The period a father considered a child an infant depended on many variables. Infancy might last until the child started to establish his or her self outside the family, for example going to school; or it could begin when a new sibling arrived, the baby taking much of the mother's attention, leaving the father to establish a new relationship with the older child, or somewhere in between, learning to walk or talk. Essentially, however, it was a period dominated by the child's complete dependency on the parents for his or her existence, as well as characterized by the fragility of the child's health. Once a measure of independence had been achieved however, such as the ability to speak, the infant becomes a child, and the relationship with the father changed.

<sup>30</sup>- Architectural historians, geographers, and urban historians have demonstrated that there was not enough space in most middle class homes for the parents to be able to dissociate themselves from their children. With the exception of the particularly wealthy, there is no evidence to suggest that the parents could completely isolate themselves from their children. Indeed, the evidence from the letters suggests the opposite, that children lived closely associated with their parents, particularly when they were ill. Cybel Lighthall nurses her children through illnesses in her own bedroom.

Fathering the infant was characterized by two concerns: the first was a general appreciation for this period of rapid personality growth and change, the second being an overwhelming concern with the child's health. Most of the fathers in this sample enjoyed playing with their young children. James Dawson amused himself and one year old Anna, (while Margaret and George were away in Edinburgh) by drawing pictures of puppies, geese and sparrows and reading stories.<sup>31</sup> The lack of self-consciousness, (or even self-praise) suggests that William Dawson had actively participated in child care even while his wife was present. Cybel Lighthall's brother, Herbert Wilkes, gives the impression that when he was home, he spent a great deal of time with his baby girl:

...some people say she is rather small but of course we think she is just right. I am sure you think me an awful goose if you could see me with her, I have her in my arms most of the time when I am in the house. She is getting so cute now and has a lot of funny little tricks and altogether her mama and papa are rather proud of her.<sup>32</sup>

Herbert's letter suggests the kind of activities he participates in with his daughter, and the attention he lavishes upon her when he is home. The tone of the letter suggests that Herbert had actual first hand knowledge of the

---

<sup>31</sup>- William Dawson to Margaret Dawson, Jan. 4th 1853. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>32</sup>- Herbert Wilkes to his sister Cybel Lighthall, May 30 1903. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

'cute little tricks', and that he was very attentive to his daughter. A similar letter from Bernard to Anna also indicates the amount of time a father might spend with his very young children.<sup>33</sup>

One of the most interesting aspects of these two letters is how often the fathers spoke of carrying their children in their arms. The image of the middle class Victorian father with a child in his arms is rarely represented in literature, and even less in pictorial representations.<sup>34</sup> In reality however, fathers might have had more physical contact with their children than these representations suggest.

Despite the advances in medical science throughout the late nineteenth century, a sick child was a cause for great concern, a concern shared by both parents. Infants were very

---

<sup>33</sup>- "...At any rate, his old father misses him, & would not in the least object to walking the floor with him for an hour on a stretch if only he had the chance...." Bernard Harrington to Anna Harrington, July 15th 1877. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.). See also Hugh McLennan to Francis McLennan, December 3 1870. McLennan Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

<sup>34</sup>- There are a few representations, such as Vincent Van Gogh's The First Steps (Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York,) and some of Millet's drawings, but these depict working class fathers. Portraits of the middle class Victorian family usually show the established family, children over the age of ten, (E.-H.-G. De Gas's The Bellelli Family in the Musée Quai d'Orsay, Paris) and often the father is represented by himself, away from the children and mother. If there are infants, they are in their mother's arms.

vulnerable to many childhood diseases and Bernard Harrington expresses the fears parents face with a very sick baby.

... Kemps' [the doctor] statement with regard to baby [who is having convulsions and the chicken pox] are certainly not reassuring but evidently he knows little about such cases beyond the fact of their great gravity. This indeed is what we have to face and I only wish I could face it with my old hopefulness, but that is gone....<sup>35</sup>

Herbert Wilkes echoes Prof. Harrington's fears: "... I think God has been very kind to us to give us a dear little girl and I pray that she will teach us to train her so that she will be of some great use in the world if He leaves her with us which I hope and pray he may do....[emphasis mine]"<sup>36</sup>

The fear of losing a child, because of the infants fragile health is strongly expressed in these letters.

---

<sup>35</sup>- Bernard Harrington to Anna Harrington, June 30 1896. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.). They have already lost two children.

<sup>36</sup>- Herbert Wilkes to Cybel Lighthall, May 30 1903. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.) This letter is significant on another level. Herbert wrote that 'she will teach us to train her', suggesting that, in his mind, the child's own personality and temperament were crucial formative factors in the raising of children. According to many historians of childhood and the family, this sentiment is one indication of the "nursery" centered family. See Pollock, op.cit.; E. Shorter, The Making of the Modern Family (London, 1976).

Not all children were threatened with serious illnesses,<sup>37</sup> but the fragility of the infant, even a healthy one, is underlined by teething. Every child cut his or her teeth, and if traumatic, every household member had to suffer the consequences. Some fathers took this interruption philosophically, while others appear to have been more affected. With the exception of home remedies, a gin soaked cloth for example, there was not a great deal to be done for the pain. One of the problems of teething was that, because of the lack of medical knowledge, parents had no way of distinguishing between serious and temporary illnesses. Any fever could get out of control, and become threatening. The awareness of this inability to discriminate may have caused some parents "excessive anxiety."<sup>38</sup> The

---

<sup>37</sup>- Children away from home often sought to reassure their fathers when they fell ill away from home. During an outbreak of measles in school, Lawrence Stephens writes to his father: "...I am so sorry for you dear pap that I have got the plague as I am sure you cannot but feel anxious and I don't want you to as I am up and working and well only-unclean- something like lepers of old..." Lawrence Stephens to his father, June 21 96. Stephens Family Collection. McCord Museum, McGill University. (Mc.M.).

<sup>38</sup>- A similar anxiety existed prior to the advent of modern medicine. The Diary of Ralph Josellin, 1661-1683, A. MacFarlane, ed., (London, 1976) and the letters of Joseph Papineau in "Lettres de Joseph Papineau à sa femme", Rapports de l'Archiviste de la province de Québec, F. Ouellet, éd., 34-35 (1953-55), 36-37 (1955-57), both indicate this concern over the least lesion, fever, or bowel obstruction. There was simply no way of knowing what would become serious, therefore, they worried about everything.

health of the infant was a responsibility and a concern that both parents shared.<sup>39</sup>

Some fathers, like Bernard Harrington, placed themselves in the child's place "...I was greatly grieved to hear of the dear little baby's illness, but sincerely hope that ere this he will be himself again. He is such a charming little chap that one cannot bear to have him suffer..."<sup>40</sup> William Lighthall, on the other hand, appears to have been more disturbed by his child's nightly disturbances. Cybel Lighthall was, on several occasions, very apologetic about the nightly disruptions caused by teething "...Baby is very fussy about her stomach teeth they are taking a long time to come through but she is not really

---

<sup>39</sup>- "...Some of the little Hamiltons have the whooping cough at present and I am glad that Eric is not here as he would likely catch it from them. The poor little dear is too young to be racked with that abominable cough...." Bernard Harrington to Anna Harrington, July 14, n.d.. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>40</sup>- Bernard Harrington to Anna Harrington, May 26 1894. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.). William Dawson, expressed his concern about the health of the mother who might be tired after such sleepless nights. "...I received your welcome letter of wednesday evening today. I trust that George's troubles with his teeth will be but temporary. It must cause fatigue and want of rest to you. I trust that you will as you say take courage and spare yourself both in respect to over much labour and excessive anxiety...." William Dawson to Margaret Dawson, July 13th 1851. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

sick only restless at night, another reason you should not come home for awhile...."<sup>41</sup>

The physical fragility of the infant, the mortality rate of children under the age of one,<sup>42</sup> are possibly important factors in explaining some men's difficulties in establishing an early relationship with their children. The fear of investing emotional energy on something quite so fragile may have been difficult for some men.<sup>43</sup> With few role models upon which to base their relationship with the 'little stranger', it is not surprising that some fathers, like William Lighthall should be unable to cope with the nightly, and other household disruptions caused by infants.<sup>44</sup> It is this emotional distance which historians may have overemphasized which might account for the traditional image of the distant father.

Furthermore, both the occupation of the father, and his public position probably had some effect on his perceptions of and abilities to father. This is particularly true in

---

<sup>41</sup>- Cybel Lighthall to William Lighthall, April 13th 1894. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.). And again "...she (baby) gave me a pretty bad night last night so I was thankful you were not here to be disturbed...." Ibid. n.d.

<sup>42</sup>- Robert, op.cit..

<sup>43</sup>- Probably some women as well. Post partum depression is not a modern phenomenon.

<sup>44</sup>- Amongst the household disruptions which might have caused some men to feel distant from their infants was their wives disinclination to have sexual relations.

considering those fathers in this sample who appeared to have had a certain difficulty establishing an early relationship with their children. In explaining the apparent differences between fathers such as Bernard Harrington and William Lighthall some attention must be paid to their individual inclinations and available time.<sup>45</sup> The conflict Bernard faced between the demands of his 'public' or professional life, and his family, or 'private' life, was probably not an uncommon one for Victorian fathers.<sup>46</sup> Some fathers may have merely chosen, for their own personal reasons, to invest a great deal of time, and energy on their

---

<sup>45</sup>- Bernard Harrington was a tenured chemistry professor at McGill. Besides his long summers and significant free time, the Harringtons also lived very close to campus, allowing Bernard the freedom to remain at home if he was needed.

William Lighthall spent a great deal of time on pet projects, which included promoting Canadian literature, and directing municipal affairs. Furthermore, the Lighthall's moved to their house in Westmount very soon after the birth of their second child, thereby making it impossible for William to mix his home and business life quite as freely as others.

<sup>46</sup>- On the few occasions that Bernard Harrington had to leave Montreal on University business, he bemoans the fact that business takes him away from home.

...Dear little fellow, I feel that I am missing so much of his pretty little ways. I wonder whether he will know me when I go down. These separations are more & more wretched and it seems as if this one were going to be almost endless. Still I suppose it is all for the best and so I must not be discontented....

Bernard Harrington to Anna Harrington, July 14th 1878. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.). Contrary to his own claim, Bernard Harrington did not go away very often. According to the Collection, he only left home on University affairs four times in ten years. See also Dr. Drummond to his wife, Sept. 15th 1901. Drummond Collection. (O.L.) .

children, while other fathers may have preferred to concentrate their efforts on their 'public' personae. There was a possibility of choice between the two, however, and while Bernard Harrington chose to make his family a priority, William Lighthall chose to invest more in his career, and his political ambitions.<sup>47</sup>

Individual considerations in explaining patterns in fatherhood must also take into account social standards. According to the historians of motherhood, the cult of true womanhood had, by the later decades of the nineteenth century, appropriated child-rearing as an exclusively female occupation. The acceptance of this ideal, by the 1900's is so ingrained as to justify Quebec judges giving the child to the mother, rather than the father, in custody decisions. If fathers had incorporated and understood the gender ideals promoted by late nineteenth century society, then they might have naturally assumed that they were excluded from active participation in their young children's lives. Cybel Wilkes, a well brought up young women, might have exercised her

---

<sup>47</sup>- All of which does not mean to imply that William Lighthall did not pay attention to his young children or love them. William Lighthall was the only father to have conserved amongst his papers some of his children's drawings, and the only father to have written a 'baby-talk' letter to his one year old daughter. "Dear Baby boo- Take care of Mam-mam be goo-goo. Pay wis annie. Seep all night. Don't get nasty cobbles wobbles. Go see moo-cow. Eat plenty bickie, say Ah-a-ah, keep little heady down. Tell Mam-mam all about Da-dy. Take plenty kissy. Gammam sends nice little smacky to baby-boo. By by Da-dy." William Lighthall to Baby Lighthall, 1892. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

right to monopolize the nursery, leaving her husband with little responsibility for the young children.

Finally, it might be useful to know how the late Victorian man, surrounded by social Darwinism, the rising faith in medical science, felt about his own personal inabilities to cope with something so fragile as an infant. Not enough work has been done on manhood and manliness to be more than tentative in this conclusion, but it seems that before we label these men cold, and unfeeling, we should understand a little more about the censure men might have incurred had they expressed a more tender, 'feminine' approach to very young children. Herbert Wilkes for example, writes to his sister, saying that she might think him "a silly goose" for being so entranced with his young daughter.

Overall these middle class Montreal fathers demonstrated an active interest in, and attention for their very young children. Infants were not tucked away in some corner of the house, nor was the nursery obviously monopolized by the mother. Fathers played with the babies, carried them about, and paid attention to their 'little ways'. The apparent distance of some fathers like William Lighthall can be understood as both a reflection of individual choice as well as perhaps the ready acceptance of society's more rigid dictates. That individual choice played a role in how much men could invest emotionally in their

young children's lives suggests the power of the patriarchal society. That so many individual fathers chose to invest that time suggests the importance the men themselves felt about their fatherhood.

### III

Once the child has passed through the most physically hazardous period, the father took an increasing, active and direct role in child-rearing. This period of childhood extended until he or she reached the age of 16. During this period fathers became concerned about discipline and achievements, scholastic and social. Discipline became a particularly important subject. There was more direct association between the father and the child as fathers began to include children in their own activities outside the home.

Ever since Aries introduced the history of childhood twenty seven years ago, discipline has been one of the more important historical touchstones of the parent-child relationship. Most family historians have argued that the concept of childhood did not exist prior to the 17th century, and that even into the twentieth century, children

were either systematically ignored or physically abused.<sup>48</sup> In Pollock's words: "the historians appear to be writing about a history of child-abuse, rather than the concepts of childhood."<sup>49</sup> The Victorian father has been alternately perceived as completely absent from his children's life, or as a firm, and authoritarian disciplinarian. The evidence analyzed for this study suggests, however, that fathers were very lenient in matters of discipline, men who were constantly aware and appreciative of their children's activities, scholarly or extra-curricular.

The strict, authoritarian father exercising his power with physical discipline found no reflection in Montreal's middle class. In this they resembled the fictional fathers of girls' literature. With only a few exceptions, all the families attempted other methods of discipline than corporal punishment. Furthermore, there is no evidence to support the conclusion that the Montreal fathers of the 1870's were harsher or more libertarian than their sons raising children in the 1900's. Men like J. William Dawson, quick tempered though he may have been, refrained from physical discipline.

...Papa had a very quick temper, though there were very few occasions when he let it appear, but he had no sympathy for practical jokes, & several times when something of that nature transpired, he would speak

---

<sup>48</sup>- L. de Mause, ed., The History of Childhood (London, 1976); N. Sutherland, Children in English Canadian Society: Framing the Consensus (Toronto, 1976).

<sup>49</sup>- Pollock, op.cit., p. 12-22.

hotly to us, which made so much more impression because he was usually so quiet & courteous to us....<sup>50</sup>

'Speaking hotly' was one way of expressing displeasure, and most fathers relied on reasoning with the child or appealing to its better nature. E. B. Greenshield had five year old Moray brought to his bedroom one morning when he had been misbehaving "... to have a talk with him."<sup>51</sup>

Robert Rhodes speaks of 'warming up' his son:

"Sometimes I think I am growing too fond of the little fellow, still I warmed him up a little the other night, but you came near warming me up..."<sup>52</sup> Warming up could be an

---

<sup>50</sup>- Anna Harrington's notes for a posthumous biography of Sir William Dawson. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.). These five pages were intended for an introduction of the life of Sir William Dawson.

<sup>51</sup>- Edward Greenshield's diary, June 6 1896. Greenshield Family Collection. (Mc.M.).

<sup>52</sup>- Robert Rhodes to his wife Edith, May 29 1891. Rhodes and Tudor Hart Family. (R.B.D.). This letter also suggests that Robert Rhodes was concerned about loving his son too much. 'Warming him up', or severely punishing him, proved to the father that he loved his son in moderation. Historians of the ideals of manliness have noted a tendency appearing around 1890, of some fathers and some organizations, towards strengthening the sons, by establishing a rather formal father-child relationship and insisting on physical prowess. One manifestation of this fear could have been the father's refusal to indulge his children, and to discipline their transgressions severely. J. Dubbert, A Man's Place: Masculinity in Transition (New Jersey, 1980), pp. 122-125, and pp. 163-168.

The fear of one's son becoming a 'sissy' went beyond methods of discipline. The following letter written to Armitage Rhodes by his brother, is a description of one man's method of inculcating manliness in his son.

...His boy is quite a bright vigorous good looking little fellow of 12 and of whom they are very proud though his mother is the only one who shows the pride.

euphemism for a beating, or else for strong words; whichever it was, the mother apparently intervened, suggesting that she felt that the punishment was too severe. The support the Victorian mother gave to the father's authority may not have extended to all aspects of child-rearing or in all its extremes. It is possible to hypothesize, that the father's authority was in the first instance tempered by the mother.

In disciplining their children, fathers and mothers displayed significantly different standards of behavior and expectations. Like Bernard Harrington, some fathers were amused by acts of defiance:

...Yesterday, she (Constance) declined point blank to come off the wet grass and I had to carry her to the path where she cried for some time. Afterwards she told Millie that "fathers did not know how to manage little girls". She still remembers with indignation your mother's attempts to coerce her to goodness last winter....<sup>53</sup>

---

Alvey, outwardly is quite indifferent but inwardly it is different, he even plays cricket with the boy now and then and has a huge L11.00 gramophone that the boy manipulates with the keenest delight and about which A. rather glories in saying "I don't know how to manage it."

This father refused to show his son the pride he feels in his mastery of skills, the parental demonstration of the feeling of pride being the mother's role. Such an severe attitude towards fathering finds an echo in some of the more adventurous adventure stories, for example Jack London, Call of the Wild <1903>, where the emphasis on being a strong man excluded the possibility of being tender. To be tender in that Man's World was the first step towards annihilation.

<sup>53</sup>- Bernard Harrington to Anna Harrington, June 15 1895. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

Bernard found the story entertaining, and though the child's defiance resulted in physical intervention, there is no censure in the tone of the letter. Perhaps he even admired her character, and agreed with her judgement on his paternal ability.<sup>54</sup> In general, however, fathers were apparently very tolerant. In the single case found where a child may have been severely punished by his father the mother stepped between them.

Mothers, on the other hand, had much firmer ideas about childish behavior. Instead of 'having a talk' with the child, mothers almost unanimously controlled their children through guilt. Mrs. Morgan wrote on several occasions about the sacrifice the father was making to be able to afford the expensive English school: "...Once more darling son, let me beg you to think of how much we are all sacrificing- how dreadfully Papa works to keep you at school & denied himself holidays & rest that he ought to have, & also how the heart of your mother rests upon you...."<sup>55</sup> Anna Morgan's references to her husband's role as provider, used in this

---

<sup>54</sup>- It may also have been that since Constance was a girl, such defiance was laudable, while a similar act from a son may have drawn more censure. See examination of Samuel Butler's The Way of All Flesh <1903> in Chapter 5, infra.

<sup>55</sup>- Anna Morgan to Cleveland Morgan, April 24 1898. Anna Morgan to Cleveland March 27 (N.D., 1895-1905) Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.) See also Anna Harrington to Conrad Harrington, Aug. 24 1894. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.) Felicity Stephens to Sheldon Stephens, Nov. 7th. 1892. Stephens Family Collection. (Mc.M.).

context to urge good conduct to her son, is one of the few references of that paternal role.<sup>56</sup>

The differences between fathers' and mothers' approach to discipline went beyond method. There is no evidence suggesting that mothers found misbehavior as amusing as some of the fathers. Perhaps this distinction was a function of the division of labor within the home. When both parents were present, the mother appears to have been more responsible for the children, and their behavior than the father. William Lighthall's letter to his sister Katherine suggests that Cybel was the parent responsible for the children's behavior: "...Cybel sent off Mr. Topping [the nurse?] Saturday & had a hard fight all next day with Wm. Jr. but may now get a little rest as he was good last night...."<sup>57</sup> Why William Lighthall did not step in between mother and child, especially as he seemed aware of his wife's exhaustion is difficult to understand, except if it

---

<sup>56</sup>- One of the rare references of the providing role from fathers can be found in the Morgan Collection. "Gladly would I come to Dover did I not consider it my duty to take care of the place here and earn sufficient to cover the expenses of your schooling. It has been and is an enormous expense as you know but we expect to get it back again with interest in the good times coming." James Morgan to Cleveland Morgan, July 3 1898. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

<sup>57</sup>- William Lighthall to Katherine Lighthall, Aug. 6 1895. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

were conventional in that household for the wife to control the children's behavior.<sup>58</sup>

In the Harrington household, even though Bernard was present, and had been the children's only parent for four months,<sup>59</sup> Conrad wrote to his mother appealing a decision of his eldest sister Claire, who has refused the boy permission to go to the rink.<sup>60</sup> This suggests that even though the mother was not present, the father did not automatically replace her authority within the family. Claire, at 18 years of age, was not only the person responsible for the maids and the younger children's socks, but also for their discipline.<sup>61</sup>

It may have been that the fathers had no need to intervene directly in matters of discipline, since their wives, and older daughters assumed the role of routine umpire within the household. The impression given from fathers such as Edward Greenshield and William Dawson, is that the father's authority rested more on potential than

---

<sup>58</sup>- A similar division of parental labor was present in the Greenshield household, where the father apparently intervened only as a last recourse. E.B. Greenshield's Diary, June 6th 1896. Greenshield Family Collection. (Mc.M.).

<sup>59</sup>- Anna has been taking care of Eric in the Adirondacks.

<sup>60</sup>- Conrad Harrington to Anna Harrington. Nov. 19 1894. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>61</sup>- See Claire Dawson's letters to her mother summer and fall 1894. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

actual threat. Because the wives and daughters were the routine disciplinarians, when the father disciplined, the punishment had more impact.<sup>62</sup> In a sense, while there existed in Victorian society an ideal of the father as absolute authority, in Montreal this authority was rarely exercised to its potential. Practices, of course, varied from man to man, and from family to family.<sup>63</sup> Overall the image which emerges from these letters, is one of paternal leniency. The fathers in Montreal, were apparently forceful without resorting to force.

Discipline and the exercise of authority was not the only function of the father within the home. As their children grew and developed, fathers increasingly interested themselves in their children's activities, scholarly as well as extra curricular. Furthermore, these Montreal fathers

---

<sup>62</sup>- See note no.50. Anna Harrington's note for her father's biography suggest that because her father rarely raised his voice, on those occasions when he did, it had much more effect.

<sup>63</sup>- The nature of the punishment was also unique to the particular case. The Stephens family is the singular exception to the above description. Here we have the more familiar image of the autocratic parents, who insist that their word was law. It may not be appropriate however, to make generalizations from this family, because of the eldest son Sheldon, was exceptionally ill for several years until his death at 16, and in a great deal of pain for most of the time. His parents concern and attempts to control him may have been a result of the strain imposed upon them by knowing the child may not survive.

Since this is the only example of such severe discipline, and since the tone of the relationship changes considerably towards their younger son, after Sheldon dies, it may be that this severe discipline was a product of the parents concern for their child's health.

enjoyed their children's company, taking advantage of the rich resources of the city.

For the Victorian middle class, education was one of the distinguishing characteristics of their position in society.<sup>64</sup> The emphasis on, and increasing interest in, science and technology has long been established as one of the important elements of Victorian society.<sup>65</sup> The ever increasing efforts of benevolent societies and governments to encourage education, even amongst the working classes, was a measure of the general importance placed on education by the middle class.

The father's role in the child's education was to encourage. In this aspect of child rearing, mothers fully

---

<sup>64</sup>- Fred Wilkes, Cybel Lighthall's brother, saw education for his son as a means of overcoming his own difficult youth. "...Well, I only hope I can give my boy the chance I did not have. He is very much like me in many respects...." Fred Wilkes to Cybel Lighthall, April 27 1913. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.). This attitude may be symptomatic of a certain strata of the middle class which saw education as a means of social mobility.

<sup>65</sup>- R. Cook, The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada (Toronto, 1985); F. Thompson, The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain, 1830-1900 (London, 1988); W. Houghton, The Victorian Frame of Mind, 1830-1870 (New Haven, 1957).

supported the father's authority.<sup>66</sup> A letter from William Dawson to his father underlines the extent of the father's involvement in the child's studies, even though William was only 7 years old. This letter also demonstrates the mother's support of the father's authority over a child's education.

...I have not had time to write this week, as we have hard lessons for today. How does Mama expect me to take so much out door exercise when our lessons are so long? Of course it doesn't take Taylor so long, & Greenshields have a tutor & none of the other boys learn theirs or if they do they have keys....If I get any prizes, is there any books you would recommend me to get, or would you leave it to my discretion...<sup>67</sup>

---

<sup>66</sup>- While discipline appeared as a shared responsibility, and mothers appeared to give full support to their husbands in matters of education, fathers appeared to encourage their children, particularly their sons, to honor their mothers. In a letter to Cleveland, James Morgan wrote "A long letter from the dear Mater this morning telling of you and what you are doing. Be careful you do not spoil her. By all accounts you and she are inseparable. May you always be so. A boy or man can hardly do wrong when he loves his mother." Dec. 19 1899. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.). This sentiment is clearly reminiscent of the message found in the reform literature, when the Home and Mother functioned as moral touchstones for the young men.

<sup>67</sup>- William Dawson to his father, William Dawson, June 2 1870. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

It could be argued that William Dawson had perhaps an exceptional interest in his children's education,<sup>68</sup> but other fathers were equally interested and supervisory of their children's formal education. For example, William Lighthall took the time to thank his son's tutor for the help the teacher gave to the boy.<sup>69</sup> Cleveland Morgan encouraged his son to learn because of the benefits to the child: "...Write to me again & tell me how you like your new school- I want you to learn to read & write well. There are so many interesting things in books..."<sup>70</sup> Despite the tutors and the outdoor exercise, these fathers appear aware of the child's limitations and there are no letters which suggest that young children's cognitive abilities are not recognized by their fathers, or that the children were taxed beyond their strength.

The emphasis the fathers placed on good scholarship was often tempered, at least while the children are still under

---

<sup>68</sup>- ...Whether in public or household affairs he was always ready to assume any duty or respond to any emergency not otherwise provided for. When engaged in writing, or surrounded with specimens, he regretted, but did not resent our interruptions. Very often I fear we came to him in the evenings for assistance with latin exercises or historical questions, and we did not fear to do so, no matter how busily he might be employed....Notes for an biography of Sir William Dawson, written by his eldest son George, after his death. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.).

<sup>69</sup>- William Lighthall to Mr. Cadman, June 16 1909. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

<sup>70</sup>- Cleveland Morgan to Ian Morgan, Dec. 26 1916. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.). Ian was living in Bermuda with his grandparents.

the age of fifteen, by their understanding that there were other equally important things for the child to be doing. James Morgan often writes to his sons encouraging their extra-curricular activities.

...It is a pleasure to me to know that you take so much pleasure in the workshop. It will be a source of amusement and pastime and though not considered as great an accomplishment as playing piano, or fiddle or one calculated to give as much pleasure to friends, still, when as the head of the household you will find it will save you many pennies and be a comfort to your wife....<sup>71</sup>

Although absent fathers seem to encourage their sons in their extracurricular pursuits more than fathers who live with their children, there are perhaps two reasons for this emphasis. Perhaps the encouragement of resident children was verbal, and hence left no record. It may be also, that the nature of letter writing imposed on these 'absent' fathers a more encouraging role, and that they chose to leave the censure to when they were face to face.

J. William Dawson brought Anna on his rounds of Saturday morning errands, and all his children on his archeological expeditions on St. Helene's island.<sup>72</sup> While

---

<sup>71</sup>- James Morgan to Harold Morgan, May 26 1898. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.) This is a fairly unique letter within the sample, as it is the only one to refer to a future role as husband or father to the children. It is particularly important when one considers the few role models and encouragements men had concerning their role in his private family life.

<sup>72</sup>- Notes for a biography of Sir William Dawson by his daughter Anna. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.).

E. B. Greenshield mentioned his daughter Muriel only incidently in his day book, he noted with amusement the antics of his son Moray, and he even learnt how to ride a bicycle so that they could share the activity.<sup>73</sup> Edward Clouston took his daughter Osla to the theatre, and bought her books to read.<sup>74</sup> James Morgan cared for his sons' animals while the children were at school, keeping the boys informed of their pets' behavior.<sup>75</sup> William Lighthall played hide and seek after dinner with his children.<sup>76</sup> Lawrence and his father fished together in the school holidays.<sup>77</sup>

While there is no evidence to suggest that the Victorian father discriminated between his son or daughter, subtle gender distinctions are evident. This distinction

---

<sup>73</sup>- E. B. Greenshield's diary, Sept. 23 1900. Greenshield Family Collection. (Mc.M.). On occasion, Edward Greenshield took not only his son, but also his son's friends to some Montreal event suitable for the boy's ages: on February 15 1896, he noted in his diary: "I went with Moray and Herby Shore to the matinee of Pinafore by the Montreal Amateurs society."

<sup>74</sup>- Osla Clouston's Diary, Sept 21 1896, April 18th 1894. Clouston Family. (Mc.M.).

<sup>75</sup>- James Morgan to Cleveland Morgan, March 1st. 1896. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

<sup>76</sup>- "... All are well. The two take their evening walk with me which they greatly enjoy apparently. Last evening we played tag on Montrose Ave., or rather, they hunted & pulled me & I escaped and dodged..." William Lighthall to Cybel Lighthall, Aug. 15 1901. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.C.).

<sup>77</sup>- Lawrence Stephens to Felicity Stephens, August 14 1895, August 2, 1896. Stephens Family Collection. (Mc.M.).

appears to reinforce conservative gender lines, in that activities with daughters were more quiet and restrained than activities with the sons.<sup>78</sup> Anna Dawson ran errands with her father, but George and Sir William Dawson went on outings together. Moray and Edward Greenshield bicycled to the Club, while Muriel and Mother drove there. Sons went fishing with their fathers, while daughters and fathers went on a leisurely paddle across the lake. Bernard Harrington took all of his children out for a drive with the pony carts, but only the older boys got to drive the carts. While fathers were concerned that their sons develop proper

---

<sup>78</sup>- ...On Saturday morning he often went to town about little business matters, & I not infrequently was his companion. I used to feel great pride in having him introduce me as "his only daughter", which I was for a number of years- and was delighted to see the interior of printing offices, banks, the post office and other wonderful places, all of which he would explain as we went along. ..(On Saturday walks to places of geological or historical interest) Whatever he was himself searching for or thinking over, he was never too occupied to answer our questions or look at our discoveries & indeed I think we felt ourselves distinctly members of the expedition....Notes for a biography of Sir William Dawson by his daughter Anna. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.).

Eva Dawson was born in 1862, so Anna was only 12 years old when these walks took place. The obvious importance to Anna of this distinction of being the 'only daughter', and the importance she took about being her father's companion is echoed in a letter by Cybel Wilkes: "...I can never be too grateful for having had such a father. Words he said to me as a child have helped and guided me ever since. I might have been a much better woman than I am now if he had lived, but there must have been some wise, kind, reason for his being taken, though it seemed strange and hard to understand. ...." Cybel Wilkes to William Lighthall, July 28 1889. Lighthall Collection. (R.B.D.). The pride and guidance reappear in many of the daughters' reminiscences of their fathers, which suggests that fathers had an enormous moral authority over their daughters.

masculine traits,<sup>79</sup> they also encouraged the development of their daughters' feminization. These letters suggest that fathers were as active in the feminization of their daughters, as they were in the masculinization of their sons.

Children of the Victorian era in Montreal were obviously not just presented to their fathers, clean and crisp in their Sunday best for a kiss before dinner. Fathers played their games, such as hide and go seek, and brought them along on own activities, such as running the Saturday morning errands. They consciously followed their children's academic progress, and some found the time to be helpful in

---

<sup>79</sup>- The emphasis these fathers placed on physical activities as well as scholarship conforms to the ideal of Muscular Christianity, where a strong body was as important as a pure and disciplined mind. According to E. Rotundo, "Learning about Manhood: Gender Ideals and the Middle Class Family in Nineteenth Century America", in J. Mangan and J. Walvin, eds., Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America, 1800-1940 (Manchester, 1987), American mothers of the nineteenth century emphasized the ideal of the Christian Gentleman, (pious moral values) and the fathers stressed the ideals of the Masculine Achiever, (drive for success and accomplishments). The Montreal fathers, on the other hand appeared to have encouraged both elements of manliness, equally.

the evenings.<sup>80</sup> Even the particularly rich child, like Moray Greenshield, played with his father, and his father found the time to play with him.

The numerous references to the play activities between fathers and children are particularly remarkable when one compares them to the references found of play between mothers and children. While children probably spent more time with their mothers during the day, (all the fathers in this sample work in another location than the home), there are very few references of children playing with their mothers. Mothers darned the socks, supervised the maids, and disciplined the children, but there is no mention of playing. Even in infancy, fathers appear to play more with

---

<sup>80</sup>- A letter by Cybel Lighthall, 'Not to be opened during C.W.L.'s lifetime' is interesting in this regard."...And Will dear, talk often to the children about the deeper things in life and encourage them to tell you their thoughts and feelings, be a companion to them in their every day lives and don't let them grow to look upon you as too old and wise for them to come to you with all their interests...." Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.). There are two possible explanations for the encouragement Cybel gives to William to be accessible to their children if she has died. The first possible reason, is that Cybel knows that William will be grief struck, and probably will not want to spend much time with the children, perhaps preferring to stay in his library. The second reason is that it is Cybel herself who is the children's companion at present, and that she worried about what would happen to this parental role when she died, unless William was encouraged to pick it up, and assume it for himself.

their children than mothers.<sup>81</sup> It may be that both parents and children took playing with mothers for granted, and it therefore aroused no comment. On the other hand, it may be as these letters suggest, that fathers did indeed spend more time playing with their children.

Those families with very strong religious backgrounds, like the Dawsons, indicate that there was a spiritual aspect to fatherhood, which began while the child was very young. While George was in Edinburgh with his mother, his father wrote to his wife: "...that papa hopes he will be a good boy and obedient to his mamma; and that he will pray to God to make him good and take away all bad things from his heart. I hope that he will learn to ---illeg.) and not forget that the good begins at the Peep of Day...."<sup>82</sup> Even when George was only a few months old, his father emphasized the spiritual aspect of parenthood, "...I hope with God's helping that we shall be able to develop the good and

---

<sup>81</sup>- This division between the parents concerning play was seen in the children's literature as well. In many of these books fathers, and men in general, were more often associated with playing games with children, than their mothers. As some episodes in children's literature suggested, the fathers were the parent who encouraged the development of creative skills, (Matthew Cuthbert encourages Anne to tell stories), while the mothers were more concerned that the child's learn useful skills, like baking. Bruno Bettelheim has suggested that playing serves the social function of developing the child's creative skills. B. Bettelheim, "The Importance of Play", Atlantic Magazine, 249, (1987), pp. 35-46.

<sup>82</sup>- William Dawson to Margaret Dawson, Dec. 7th 1852. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

weaken the evil that is in him..."<sup>83</sup> This is the only example of such early emphasis on the spiritual aspect of fatherhood. Most of the other fathers in this study waited until the child was a little older, about 10 or 12.<sup>84</sup> Only William Dawson appears to have perceived the spiritual aspect of his fathering role so early in his child's life. There are no examples of a completely secular approach to child-rearing, although contrary to expectations, the religious aspect of life was rather noticeably absent in these correspondences.

While many middle class Victorian men were deeply committed to activities outside the home, when they did return home, the center of their attention was the children. Although mothers continued to maintain the function of the dominant parent in the home, the father's sphere in the domestic sanctum was relatively richer than the analysis of social standards would have led us to believe. From his position as head of household, the father appeared to have played the role of benevolent authority figure, leaving the actual workings of discipline to his wife. Harsh or even corporal discipline was not a feature of raising these

---

<sup>83</sup>- William Dawson to Margaret Dawson, Oct. 2 1850. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>84</sup>- On the occasion of his confirmation, Lawrence received this letter from his father: "In this sacred and important event in your life, in all other circumstances, I have a very deep interest...." 'Sheldon Stephens to Lawrence Sheldon, Feb. 17 1893. Stephens Family Collection. (Mc.M.).

children. Fathers continued to play with their children, as they had in the child's infancy, and as the children grew, games and activities became the significant focus of the father-child relationship. In these letters and diaries, fathers appear as active participants in their children's lives, actors whose function within the family dynamics was rich and complex.

#### IV

While their children were growing up, middle class fathers in Montreal were never particularly remote. They were aware of, and active in their children's lives. Until the children reached the age of about 16, the mother appeared to be the most important parent, supervising and directing the household and the children's daily activities. From the time the sons left high school until they established themselves in their own independent households, however, their relationship with their parents changed. During this period of their lives, the sons' most important parent became the father.<sup>85</sup> This period in the father-son relationship was one characterized by concerns caused by

---

<sup>85</sup>- There was no father daughter relationship which spanned the moment in their lives of the daughters moving out of their fathers home. Therefore, this section must focus exclusively on fathers and sons.

generational turnover. On one hand the fathers attempted to help their sons, motivated by concern and dynastic continuation. On the other hand, the sons tried to establish themselves in their own right. The Victorian novel suggested that this stage in the father-son relationship was often fraught with conflicts and tensions, rising from the son's desire for autonomy and the father's desire for continued control. Like the fictional fathers examined in the previous chapter, these Montreal fathers attempted to control their sons who were trying to become autonomous. Unlike the fictional families, however, in real life the conflict did not explode, as the sons deferred and the fathers' efforts never became tyrannical. In reality, there is little evidence of direct conflict. Fathers and sons appeared to arrive at some kind of compromise. Should conflict between father and son erupt, however, other family members intervened and attempted to mediate.

Both George and William Dawson, the older sons of Sir William, appear to have maintained a good relationship with their father during their years at university in Europe. They were both very deferential to their father, and continually asked his advice on their summer jobs, or future plans.

...I wish to begin to discuss what will be best for me to do during next summer, as I now have about all the information I am likely to be able to obtain in regard

to ways of employing the time if I stay over  
here....<sup>86</sup>

William's strategy in dealing with his father was to avoid any appearance of confrontation. He began very early to plan his summer projects, allowing enough time to convince his father that the plans were good. He also made certain, however, that he controlled the flow of facts and presented them so that his father would acquiesce to what William wanted. Neither William nor George wanted to fight with their father. Both desired his approval. They were deferential, and considerate, respecting their father's desire to counsel them, (they shared his professional interests), but not to the extent of doing what they did not want to do.

Another example of a generational conflict diverted by filial deference can be found in the Rhodes family. This was the only family which contained correspondence between siblings of an older generation: William Rhodes who settled in Canada, and Godfrey and Francis who remained in England corresponded frequently. The subject of the correspondences between these brothers was predominantly business, but certain letters contained information about William's four sons and their prospects.

...Frank's education will extend over a period of four years when he will have learnt enough to be a fortune in itself, he will make the acquaintance of the best

---

<sup>86</sup>- William Dawson to his father, William Dawson, Dec. 24 1875. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

class of the young American Gentlemen and he will be of considerable use to his Brothers, who are learning what is desirable in other departments of the great industry in metals....<sup>87</sup>

All four sons went to American universities and graduated with engineering degrees. This deliberate dynastic strategy devised by the older generation extended beyond the occupations of the children.<sup>88</sup> William has planned that the eldest son Armitage inherit the family home at Bramhope.<sup>89</sup> Unfortunately the collection does not contain much about the sons' reactions to these attempts to control their lives, except for a note by Godfrey, (William's son) found at the end of a letter his father wrote to a doctor in Baltimore,

---

<sup>87</sup>- William Rhodes to Godfrey Rhodes, Feb 17 1870. Rhodes and Tudor-Hart Family. (R.B.D.).

<sup>88</sup>- A deliberate strategy, but one that did not employ the daughters. In his letters to his brothers, William often included a line or two about 'his girls', yet they did not carry the same weight in the creation of the dynasty that the boys do. "My young girls are growing up quickly. Gerty is never "I want" now, she remembers everything, the other day on seeing a balloon in the S. London News she said "I saw a balloon at Bramhope."..." William Rhodes to brother Godfrey, Feb 17 1870. Rhodes and Tudor-Hart Family. (R.B.D.). Gerty is certainly credited with associating the balloon with the one at Bramhope, the family estate, but when it was time for her to choose a suitable spouse, her father participation is significant by its absence.

<sup>89</sup>- William Rhodes to Godfrey Rhodes, Sept. 23 1870. (Unfortunately things don't go as planned, and in 1898, Army writes to his uncle Godfrey : " ...It is not likely that any of us will ever reside in England, where we have no friends or acquaintances, nor any prospects of ever having the means of being able to do so as you must know it costs so much more to live in England than it does in Canada..." April 7th 1898. Rhodes and Tudor-Hart Family. (R.B.D.).

asking this doctor to introduce Godfrey to some eligible young women.

My dear Doctor,

I have heard several times in my travels of your saying a good word in favour of my sons who went to Columbia which is an encouragement to them and a great satisfaction to me to hear these young men so well spoken of- Godfrey the eldest has been appointed superintendent of Motion Power for the (A & F blg?) Baltimore and I should be much obliged to you to give him a Letter of Introduction to some of the Gentlemen's Families there.

William the other young man at the Altonia is engaged to be married to a very nice person a Miss (Hibdin?) and we should like Godfrey to have the opportunity to making that kind of connection, if he is as (disposed?) in a proper quarter- his uncle Colonel Godfrey Rhodes of Westhaugh, near Pontifract Yorkshire, leaves him a splendid House and a nice estate and as William has rather taken us by surprise with his Lady, we wish to be better prepared for what Godfrey may do.

Baltimore as you know has a great reputation for its Belles and as Godfrey is really a nice young man and a great addition to any society, I should like him to have the opportunity of being intimate with some of the best people.

I hope you will excuse my writing to you, but I really do not know any other person in Baltimore or in fact anywhere else, who would so willingly render a deserving young man such a service.

Believe me yours faithfully (signed) William Rhodes.

Note in another hand on the same paper  
The Colonel gave this to me sealed. Not succeeding in finding the Doctor, some months later when Mother & Gerty were visiting me at the former's suggestion I opened it and was pretty horrified !! at the contents- would not knowingly have presented it for a mint. (signed) G.W. Rhodes <sup>90</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup>- 7/2/76. Rhodes and Tudor-Hart Family. (R.B.D.).

For such an intrusion into his personal life, the son's response was surprisingly casual. He expressed little anger, or frustration at his father's attempts at control.

On the occasion of his eldest son's sixteenth birthday, James Morgan composed the following letter.

...It is about time you should be considering what profession you intend to follow once schooling is over but of this we can discuss to better advantage when you return in August. I need hardly say however that there is a pair of old boots under my desk that will fit your feet and that the best thing you could do is to slide your feet in whenever you are ready. It will be a comfort to me to know that the structure your father & grandfather have laboured so long and hard to build was not to crumble to the ground for want of a guiding spirit.<sup>91</sup>

James Morgan's letter suggests a personal approach to the question of dynastic ambitions, compared to the engineering empire William Rhodes was trying to create with his sons. The conversation in August went unrecorded and Douglas eventually studied medicine. The second son, Cleveland, inherited the family business. The correspondence does not indicate whether James Morgan had any strong feelings about either primogeniture, or even personality: had James Morgan's dynastic desire impelled him to create a distinct and quantifiably different relationship with his eldest son? Was there any "special" comfort in passing on the family

---

<sup>91</sup>- James Morgan to Douglas Morgan, June 19 1896. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

business to the eldest son? Or was it enough simply to know that the "pair of old boots" would be filled?

In the case of the Rhodes and Morgan family, the reason for the exercise of such paternal control was the desire to found or maintain a dynasty. Both William Rhodes and James Morgan had invested a great deal of their own lifetime in their business ventures, and the continuation of such ventures in the next generation was a paternal priority. Perhaps like Philip Dombey, William Rhodes and James Morgan desired some kind of immortality, at least in this sense, although neither man expressed it in such terms. That none of the second generation openly rebelled against such paternal desires may indicate that the sons had been inculcated at a very early age to accept such self-sacrifice, if indeed it were a sacrifice.

The Dawson family is the only family within this sample to have left any record of open conflict between the father and a son. The younger son, Rankine did not have as easy a relationship with his father as his older brothers did. For approximately ten years, there was a great deal of animosity and conflict between father and son. Unlike his brothers, Rankine was less respectful of his father's judgement. Nor was he deferential in his tone:

...I wish I could convince you of this, (making investments in land in Manitoba) but I can hardly expect you to do so as you have not seen and studied

our western country as I have and therefore cannot appreciate the fact fully. It was for this reason that I asked you not so much to convince yourself of the soundness and practicability of the scheme, as to trust to my investigation, and I most earnestly hope that you have done so....If I cannot get righted with Selwyn or get some other foot hold in the country, I shall simply look forward to go from Canada as far as I can get, after next spring and try to forget all about my treatment there. This is not in any way as a threat, but merely a determination.<sup>92</sup>

His plea, or threat was not well received. In his family, Rankine had the reputation for wild schemes and exalted expectations.<sup>93</sup> In addition to these demands for capital, Sir William was concerned for Rankine's lack of spirituality.<sup>94</sup> For a man so deeply religious, to have a son who

---

<sup>92</sup>- Rankine Dawson to William Dawson, Aug. 15th 1881. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

<sup>93</sup>- "...If he (Rankine) would only say what he intends to do, it would be much easier. I cannot see why he expects to be started with capital. He has got his profession and --(illeg.) very well make his own way with it as W. (William) and I have done & others have to. ..." George Dawson to his father William Dawson, June 17 1882. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.).

<sup>94</sup>- "...I observe in your letters lately not a word as to anything higher than this world. I do not infer from this that your thoughts are altogether earthly; but I do hope you take time to refresh your soul with God's word, and to keep higher aims in sight...." William Dawson to Rankine Dawson, Sept. 16 1881. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.). Rankine may have reminded Sir William of his own father, an alcoholic who never had been able to provide for his family. If this were the case, Sir William's fears and concerns about Rankine can also be understood as his own failure as a father, since he has created a monster in his own paternal image.

was apparently so secular must have been an enormous disappointment.<sup>95</sup>

In her letters to her brother Anna Harrington attempted to mediate between her father and her brother, and in one letter to Rankine, suggested that the real issue of contention was Rankine's disrespectful attitude towards his mother, and his continued "admiration of money".<sup>96</sup> The resolution to this conflict began to appear in the correspondence sometime in 1884, (although it continued to flair up occasionally) when Sir William finally admitted that he really could not help Rankine the way he had helped George or William.<sup>97</sup>

Rankine had different expectations and attitudes from the rest of the family. His "admiration of money", his constant demands for capital and his refusal to placate his father in deferring to his judgement all helped to alienate

---

<sup>95</sup>- George and his father never exchanged views on the question of religion, although they often exchanged opinions on the work of other geologists. This complete silence suggests that George never openly challenged his father's opinions concerning evolution and geological evidence.

<sup>96</sup>- Anna Harrington to Rankine Dawson, March 6 1886. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.). This letter, as most of Anna's and her mothers demonstrate one of the roles of other (female) members who witnessed this kind of conflict. See note #88, where Mrs. Rhodes and Gerty encouraged Godfrey to open a letter written by his father, thereby challenging the father's complete authority. Anna Harrington and Margaret Dawson consistently try to influence Rankine and William by explaining and placating.

<sup>97</sup>- William Dawson to Rankine Dawson, June 21 1884. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

him from his father. Although this is the only example of overt and direct generational conflict, it suggests that in some cases, the father's expectations and the son's ambitions produced tensions. It also signals the importance of intervention of other family members in smoothing over these conflicts.

Most families, however, avoided conflict. Like George and William Dawson, the four Rhodes boys never confronted their father or uncles in anger. There was an apparent consensus in accepting their father's personality and interventions. The sons were capable of finding strategies of dealing with the authority of their fathers, short of direct confrontation as William Dawson did in controlling the flow of facts, or as Godfrey Rhodes did in merely suppressing the doctor's letter.

The smooth relationship between James Morgan and his sons Douglas and Cleveland, suggests another element for consideration in explaining this surprising lack of conflict during this period. James Morgan had effectively been separated from his children from the time they were ten. Perhaps it was this distance that makes for such smooth relationships within the Morgan family. A father like William Dawson, who spent time with children, even after they began university, probably knew them more intimately

and supervised their lives more closely than others.<sup>98</sup> In the final analysis, James Morgan had been too long apart from his children to be able to dictate their future lives.

Finally, the correspondences between the young men and their fathers suggest that gratitude for the opportunities afforded them played no small part in maintaining good relations. The following letter from Lawrence Stephens is typical of many other letters: "...Dear Father I am so grateful to you for all the money you spend on me and also for the all the love. The only thing I pray is that I may grow up worthy of being your son and may be able to repay you and help you. Not only you but mother also..."<sup>99</sup>

This grateful attitude for the father's efforts to provide the opportunities was, in the first part, instilled

---

<sup>98</sup>- ...In later years, when it came to our turn to sustain a literary & musical club of which we were members, he would come from his desk to the drawing room before the close of the evening & take an evident & real delight in conversing with our friends, young or old... Notes for a biography written after Sir William's death. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.).

<sup>99</sup>- Lawrence Stephens to Father. 26.1.95. Stephens Family Collection. (Mc.M.) Exactly what is meant by repayment is not clearly spelt out, but once Lawrence returns to Montreal and begins to study at McGill, his father writes a letter congratulating Lawrence on taking the initiative, and inquiring at the bank about the family's financial affairs. It appears from these later letters that Lawrence intended to enter his father's business. See also Murray Brooks, Notes for a autobiography, Murray Brooks Collection. (R.B.D.). Robert O'Brian to his father, March 3 1872. O'Brian Collection. (R.B.D.), "...I'm afraid I am awfully expensive, but I hope I will be able in some way to get worth for the money." George Dawson to William Dawson, March 20 1870. George Mercer Dawson Papers. (R.B.D.)

by the mothers in their efforts to urge good conduct upon their children. Throughout their lives, children were only rarely told directly by their fathers about this paternal role. Within the collections, however, almost all contain at least one letter from the sons thanking their father for their educational opportunities.<sup>100</sup> That such gratitude was instilled in the children without the father directly drawing it to their attention suggests the power of the maternal and societal influences in defining children's attitudes towards their fathers. It may also be an important factor in explaining the reason for such a surprising lack of conflict between the sons and their fathers.

The ideal of family, as a dynastic or emotional unit did not remain exclusively within the father's sphere of influence. Other men of the family attempted to exert control over their nephews or younger siblings in the name of the family. Godfrey Rhodes wrote a very terse letter to the son of Armitage Rhodes, after he had seen an announcement of the boy's intended marriage, complaining that the announcement did not explicitly state that the boy

---

<sup>100</sup>- "I finished my exams last Saturday and the results come out tomorrow. I wonder what they will be success or failure. I do hope it will be the former especially for your sake and Dad's- as a small return for all you both have done and gone thro' for me." Douglas Morgan to Anna Morgan, June 12 1902. Morgan Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

was adopted.<sup>101</sup> As we have seen Anna Harrington wrote often to Rankine, attempting to make a bridge between him and his father. After the death of their father, George Dawson was very concerned that the children work together to present a decent biography of Sir William. Their father had been an important man, and it was imperative to protect his image.<sup>102</sup>

The period in the child's life, from 16 to 25 was one of tremendous change, not only for the son, who became initiated into the man's world of family and responsibilities, but also for the parents. Fathers, almost without exception, attempt to control their sons. The basis from which they attempt this control is the authority vested in them as head of the family. This authority was supported by society, by the churches, entrenched in the Quebec Civil Code, and supported by the children's deference, and the wife's exclusion from the process. The father's power stems

---

<sup>101</sup>- ">>>My attention has been called to an announcement of your engagement to Mrs. Hagland in the Morning Post of the 19th. Have you made it clear to the young lady and her mother that you are not the son of Armitage Rhodes, but his adopted son? It is too bad that the word adopted was omitted from your announcement..." Godfrey Rhodes to Charles Rhodes 3.12.14. Rhodes and Tudor-Hart Family. (R.B.D.). According to the Canadian census of 1891, Armitage and his wife and this child were living in Montreal. This son was the wife's from a first marriage. Perhaps the family had felt strongly about Armitage throwing himself away on the wife, or perhaps Godfrey really felt that to be adopted was some sort of stigmata, and that Charles should make it clear that he really was not a part of the Family.

<sup>102</sup>- George Dawson to Anna Harrington, Feb 13 1901. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

initially from his ability to control the family assets,<sup>103</sup> and is subsequently affirmed by the son's own acquiesce to the older man's experience. The analysis of the conflicts and tensions suggests that the son's acceptance of this power did not immediately signify the loss of the son's autonomy, nor did it announce a father's autocracy. It appears that although there was a certain potential for tension, and conflict, that children and to a certain extent the fathers, developed strategies which avoided direct confrontation.

## v

This period of potential confrontation, and increased emotional intimacy, usually ended a few years after the sons had settled in their occupations. The next period of the father child relationship could be characterized as a reversion, to a certain extent, to the relationship during childhood. The father remained interested in his children's and grandchildren's activities, but lacked the intensity evident while the sons were learning to be men.

Fathers continued to be concerned for their sons, even when they had a family of their own. William Lighthall's father wrote on several occasions, offering the family a

---

<sup>103</sup>- In all cases, the fathers financially supported their sons through university.

vacation, as his son appeared tired.<sup>104</sup> In characterizing this last period of the father-child relationship as one lacking emotional intimacy, is not to suggest that there was no longer any relationship at all. Fathers were proud of their adult sons' accomplishments, as they were when the boy was learning how to use the gramophone. Kylie Lighthall wrote to her father the joy her grandfather felt when they received the news that William had become King's Counsel.

...You know I know you know that you are appointed to the King's Counsel and I am very glad. Grandpa as soon as he saw it began yelling and shouting so loud that we thought you were mixed up in the train accident and he had seen it but it was not that and he is so overjoyed that he will be quite cheerful for awhile now, he told me to write to you and tell you, but I am sure you know...<sup>105</sup>

The pride the old man felt in his son's occupational achievements was so great, that now "he will be quite cheerful for awhile", which perhaps says as much about a

---

<sup>104</sup>- ...The state of your health has been anything but satisfactory for a considerable time past, and from what I have seen lately you require rest, and an immediate change of air, scene, etc. and if you will at once drop all business cares, etc. and go to the sea shore, or what is still better, take a sea trip for at least three weeks, say to the West Indies, I will see if I can bear the Expenses; make an estimate at once and let me hear from you when details can be talked over....William Lighthall to his son William Lighthall, Jan 17 1906. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.) See also William Lighthall to his mother Margaret Lighthall, July 25, 1899. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.)

<sup>105</sup>- Kylie Lighthall to William Lighthall, July 2 1906. Lighthall Family Collection. (R.B.D.).

father's pride, as it says about a grandfather's irritability.

The Morgan Collection, one of the most apparently complete collections consulted, indicates that after a certain point in time, the emotional intimacy ceased to exist between Cleveland and James Morgan. Letters become a means of imparting information, and expressions of feelings no longer appeared between the father and his sons. Cleveland, who took over the business, wrote only sporadically to his father, and those letters concerned business. His letters to his mother contain far more emotional content than those to his father, even though Ian, his son, lived in Bermuda with the grandparents. One might have expected that Ian would have served as an emotional link between the son and the father, even if it were as another pair of feet to fit into the business "boots".

The subject of the aging parent is one which cannot be fully examined here, as only one family of the sample fell into that category. It is a critical issue, however, in the evolution of the parent child relationship.<sup>106</sup> As the head of the family weakened and died, the sons had to compensate for their father, performing certain family obligations. George Dawson, for example, became Anna Harrington's banker

---

<sup>106</sup>- See D. Troyansky, The Old Age in the Old Regime. Image and Experience in Eighteenth-Century France (Ithaca, 1989).

and counsellor, offering her advice and extra money for her children's piano lessons.<sup>107</sup> The women of the family were also affected by the serious illnesses of their aging parents, particularly if they lived in the same city. George's letter to Anna Harrington suggests that Anna was exhausted by the demands her children and parents were making on her. Her father in particular was getting more and more difficult to manage, and as easy as it was for George to say get more help, it obviously fell on Anna and Bernard to help Margaret Dawson cope with the house, and with the almost paralyzed Sir William. As Sir William was the only example of an aging and weakening father, it is difficult to conclude from this one example. The historical analysis of the relationship between grown children and their aging parents is, however, an important one. The emotional transfer of authority and leadership from one head of the family to another is as critical to a society and to the family members as the economic transfer of land and capital.

\*\*\*\*\*

Since there was no strong consensus concerning the private elements of the father's role similar to that which existed for the Victorian mother, fatherhood may have

---

<sup>107</sup>- George Dawson to Anna Harrington, Oct. 19 1897. Dawson-Harrington Family Collection. (U.A.).

depended a great deal on the individual's commitment to, or interest in, the role rather than in any conformity to an image based on consensus. Throughout the late Victorian, early Edwardian period, the middle class fathers of Montreal were important actors in their children's lives, extending their participation beyond the social standards of providing and protecting. This study found that fathering increases as the children mature: from a deafening silence in the period of expectation, through a period of escalating awareness, which would culminate in the case of the sons to a period of intense intimacy, and finally, once filial independence was achieved a reversion to awareness, but without the same intensity. This pattern was surprisingly stable through time, fathers of the 1870's being remarkably similar to the fathers of 1910.

Only in their children's infancy were some fathers 'distant' from the nursery. William Lighthall is unique in this sample for being apparently 'put out' by his infant daughter's troubled teething. This distance is, however, difficult to determine with any accuracy, since it is "read" through his wife's letters. William himself apparently kept some of his children's drawings, the only father to do so. And yet, this perceived distance is significant, as it suggests that not only were some fathers initially slightly disconcerted by the fragility of their children, but also that to isolate this disconcertion, and label William

Lighthall distant would be to ignore the other evidence, which suggests on the contrary, a rather participatory father. Considering the limited social directives given the late nineteenth century father concerning his role, that some fathers may have had mixed feelings, and displayed ambiguous behavior should not be surprising.

As the children grew up, these Montreal fathers played with them, supervised their scholastic achievements, and when their sons reached a certain age of maturity, helped them to establish economic independence. Their position of authority was clearly superior to that of their wives, but they were not often called upon to exercise it in disciplinary action. Fathers who sent their children away to school maintained a positive, encouraging relationship. Fathers who kept their children at home were far more than disciplinarians. They were aware of, and partook in, the interests and activities of their children. They did not conform to stereotypes of indifference or authoritarianism.

As the children, especially the sons, reached the age of maturity, the father's role in their lives increased to such an extent, that he took the place of the mother as the child's primary parent. Although this period in this son's life has been portrayed in several contemporary novels as one fraught with tension and conflict with an authority figure, in reality, these fathers and sons developed strategies to avoid overt tensions. Like the fictional

fathers, these Montreal fathers made concerted efforts to create a dynasty. The difference between the real and fictional fathers, was that the former's attempts stopped short of tyrannical methods. Should such overt tensions be present, however, the entire family (and particularly the women) took part in attempting to smooth over the conflict.

In extending our perspective on the family and the patterns of parenthood to include and recognize stages of a child's development, a double rhythm becomes apparent. The first rhythm is between mothers and fathers, as the balance of parenting oscillates depending on the function: for example, the absolute nature of paternal discipline is balanced by the mother's routine role as family umpire. The second rhythm is between father and child: the father (as pivot figure between public and private worlds) becomes an increasingly critical actor and influence, as the child emerges from the nursery and moves toward independence. Each static moment, or stage, of the father-child relationship had some counterpart in the social texts. As this chapter has demonstrated, it only becomes apparent how important fathers were to their families and how important fatherhood was to the men, when the static moments are strung together and examined as a whole. For these late Victorian Montreal men, fatherhood was more than the sum of its parts, it was a life-time affair and extended far beyond the standards society had set for them.

## Conclusion

This dissertation has examined the late Victorian, early Edwardian English speaking Protestant middle class Montreal father's social roles and reality through a variety of prisms. Caught between the traditional image of the authoritarian pater-familias and the emerging ideal of domestic bliss, the rock and the hard place referred to at the beginning of this study, the turn of the century father-figure seemed squeezed out of the family's emotional network. Yet the reality, perceived through the prism of private papers suggests rich and complex father-child relationships, which belied these alternatives proposed in either discourse.

Reform literature, animated by a search for social stability, focussed its attention on the new generation. This new generation required protection and nurture. The

Home became a refuge, and invested with great moral power. At its epicenter were the child and mother. These fragile and vulnerable persons were to be protected from the degenerative aspects of the urban environment. This defensive spirit animated the social construction of the new middle class streetcar suburbs. The father's contribution to this refuge was limited to providing and protecting. These roles were not to be taken lightly as any failure on the part of the man to fulfill these obligations would reduce his family's circumstances, plunging the innocents into a chaotic and dangerous underworld.

The father's protecting role was further reinforced by the Quebec courts. The Bench valued the biological family at all costs, whatever the will of the child, or objective material considerations. The concept of paternal authority was the cornerstone of these decisions. Within the family itself, however, the courts became increasingly inclined to award custody to the child's mother, rather than to his or her father, on the basis that mothers were more naturally capable parents. In their view, the father's occupational demands were such as to make it impossible for him to care personally for the children. Like the authors of reform literature, the judges emphasized the role of provider, although in this case, they also recognized its limitations.

The fictional literary landscape gave fathers a more impressive role, but one characterized by great

contradictions and inconsistencies. In girls' stories, the father was a crucial actor in the heroines' lives. The heroines sought out their fathers or found suitable substitutes. The men who cared for children found themselves involved in emotionally rewarding relationships. Those who refused to care for a child, on the other hand, were demonstrably miserable, emotionally scarred individuals. Redemption and social reintegration could only pass through a child's love. In the boys' adventure stories, fathers were almost non-existent. The adventure, in and of itself, taught the hero to become a man. If marriage and children were mentioned, wife and child are relegated to one brief concluding paragraph, the crowning laurels of a well completed adventure.

In adult literature, the father figure assumes a powerful symbolic function in the plots, standing as a representative of the old order. Fathers must be confronted by the protagonists, and the traditional values either assimilated or rejected in order for the new generation to move on. The balance between the values of the past and the promise of the future dominated the late Victorian fictional literary landscape, and father and son played important, recognizable roles. Like the reformers or the judges, the authors of adult literature injected the father-figure with exceptional authority, but did little to inspire that figure with emotional resonance.

Variations over time in the father's roles were barely perceptible, and were specific to particular genres. The rulings of the courts demonstrated the most obvious change, a phenomenon made possible by the elaboration and interpretation of the "child's best interests." Judgments in custody cases between two parents were, until the 1890's, apparently based on the relatively objective standard of the injured spouse. Throughout the last decade of the nineteenth century, however, the courts became increasingly favorable to awarding custody to the mother, based on both her innate parenting abilities and the demands placed on her husband by his occupation. The reform literature did not reveal such a shift in perspective, the only change over time being the increased stridency in the tone as the Home as refuge theme gained strength and power. The literary texts also demonstrated a marked stasis. The period was not one of innovation in gender identification, but one of consolidation.

Notwithstanding these rather emotionally restrictive social parameters, however, many fathers created nurturing relationships with their children. These fathers were not in fact restricted to merely providing or protecting their family. Their diaries and letters suggest that the father child relationship was emotionally entangled and multifaceted. The fathers themselves seemed to resent some of the demands placed upon them by their providing role,

complaining that the public demands impinged on their private lives. A father's participation within the home appears in reality to have been guided by his own personality, and determined by the child's age rather than by social dictates. Again, a remarkable consistency was found among the generations of men examined.

\*\*\*\*

By lifting the veil on the father-figure at the turn of century, this study has uncovered important contradictions within the socially promoted ideals of fatherhood as well as between these ideals and reality. Within the genres, two distinct kinds of discourse were apparent, each presenting a different image of the father-figure. In the public or political discourse, fatherhood was heavily invested with authority and power. Issuing from economic force and the desire to have clearly designated lines of authority from State to individual, the ideal of paternal authority was a strong and powerful ideal in the late nineteenth century. In a time of social flux, no one was willing to abandon completely such a familiar vessel of authority. Considering the emphasis on the rule of law in late Victorian society, it is hardly surprising that some of this traditional bulwark of social-familial authority was maintained.

That authority was not echoed, however, in the private or domestic discourse. The sentimental family ideal, which centered around the nursery and child, suggested another and alternative image of fatherhood. The late nineteenth century child was perceived to require nurturing and sensitivity, quantities thought to be innately female. At the center of the Home was the mother and child. By placing mother and child so firmly at the emotional epicenter, creating thereby a complete and exclusive nexus between mother and child, the father-child relationship was side-lined. With the child's best interests in mind, it was perhaps less important that the father was an incapable parent, but merely that his wife was so much more capable. In this private or domestic discourse the father is most notable for his absence.

The expected stereotype of the absent or authoritarian father-figure implied in much family history is to a certain extent confirmed in this examination of the social models proposed to the late nineteenth century Montreal father. In the political discourse the father was a figure of imposing power; in the domestic discourse, however, the father was noticeably absent. These inconsistencies and contradictions within these parameters suggest, however, that to limit the analysis to one or another is to avoid seeing an apparent tension, one which may have had important ramifications for the late Victorian family.

This study has also implicitly addressed the question of the power of the patriarch in the patriarchal system. From the female perspective, both the public and private discourse were designed to keep her out of the public world. The public discourse created systemic barriers, while the private discourse functioned to enhance her contribution through the domestic world. As a negative or restrictive ideal, paternal authority appeared impregnable and absolute. As a barrier to women's entry into the public world, paternal authority (as a representative element of the patriarchal system) was a prohibitive obstacle. These models and the ideal behind them, were uni-dimensional in their restrictive capacity. Simply to transfer that restrictive dimension onto the male experience, to graft as it were, from what society said to women in an exclusionary discourse and see it as a positive discourse for the male, is to hide a rich, if contradictory relationship of ideals and models.

But this study explicitly confronted and questioned the appearance of the parameters from the father's perspective; and from his perspective, as guidelines for behavior, the parameters were confusing and surprisingly inconsistent. The public strength and power demanded in one model was, in the other model an inhibitor to proper child-nurture. Neither discourse suggested positive, emotionally rich images of father-child relationships. Positive father-child models were scarce, indeed the only genre to promote a positive

father-child relationship were the girls' books. While Louisa Alcott was popular, one doubts that many middle class men entertained themselves by reading Little Women. That Matthew Cuthbert and many other fathers, real and imagined, 'put their oar in', regardless of the images and models proposed to them, suggests that the female monopolized nursery may only have existed in the minds of a few, and not in the reality of the many. If such is the case, then the convergence of private values and public policies demands renewed attention.

What this study does not contend is that patriarchy was on the wane within the late nineteenth century Montreal middle class community. The continued emphasis on absolute paternal authority within many of the texts reflects the male dominance in society. In the continued restriction, albeit through enhancement of the women in the domestic sphere, systemic patriarchy was preserved and even intensified. In the public world, men had achieved total monopoly. The hidden cost of such public power, however, was the relinquishment of private power, and perhaps even emotion. Behind the imposing edifice of discourse on paternal power, the individual patriarch had little real power and received little support from the legal institution to which he was appealing. Mother's love was more important than father's care.

While the community maintained the traditional ideal of the father on the political and perhaps philosophical level, on the individual level, the father was increasingly losing his authority over his children. By the creation of the domestic ideal, which emphasized emotional commitment and intimacy and by placing the wife firmly at the emotional epicenter, the father's function was limited by his wife's natural aptitude in matters of sentiment. For the men living in this community, whatever their personal feelings or sensitivities, their society would not publicly recognize the paternal participation in the nursery. Nor did it recognize the rich and flexible relationship between father and growing child. As men, great promise and power awaited them in patriarchal public world. As fathers, the social parameters were limited to the twin roles of providing and protecting. Their children's other needs were best attended to by their wives.

There was, however, nothing within the manly ideal promoted in Canada which explicitly excluded men from participating in the family or contributing to child rearing. The public visage of manliness did little to promote qualities of emotional entanglement, or intimate sensitivity. But silence cannot be equated with prohibition. The ideal of manliness focussed on the public life, where upstanding behavior protected the family's reputation and enabled the father to provide the material goods necessary

for their welfare. Proponents of this ideal were encouraging public virtue; they were not creating emotionally sterile monsters. The addition of the dimensioned father-figure as a historical actor and an understanding of the contradictory images he had to integrate, suggests that the simple private-public cleavage in gender analysis may hide more than it reveals. This is particularly true when examining the private lives of men, where the identification between gender and space may not be explicitly defined or confining. Like the feminists who attempted to enter the public world, the father who participated in the private realm did so with few contemporary social models. Unlike the feminist, however, who risked losing her femininity by entering the public realm, the father who entered the nursery did so without any overt challenge to his masculinity. That so many did so suggests the important chasm between social parameters and reality of sentiment.

Twenty years ago, historians of women were arguing for a search beam to be turned onto the erstwhile silent shadows of women, mothers and daughters. The rewards of such studies are rich and varied. Bernard Harrington's experience of fatherhood is surely as legitimate and as worthy of our attention. Moreover, the study of the private lives of men, fathers and sons, can shed illumination on an important series of contradictions in the interplay of the rhetoric and behavior as it was experienced by those whose self-

identification had to account for the daily intersection between the private world and the public realm. If this case study is not a geographic anomaly, this analysis of social models and images of fatherhood suggests that the father figure was important, and that he cannot be dismissed as simply the figure who represents the public world order in the domestic sphere. Whatever some of the social pundits said, he was certainly not dismissed by his children. This consideration alone should justify further study.

Appendix A  
Advice Literature for young women

While the brothers were learning about good reputations and strong bodies, their sisters were receiving important advice concerning their future role as mothers. The significant difference between the literature written for young men and that written for young women was the assumption that women by definition were not as 'indifferent' as their brothers to the Christian message. Rather than convince the reader to be religious, these

authors were attempting to refine the Spirit that was assumed to be inherent.<sup>1</sup>

The logic behind this assumption of women's innate piety was clearly spelled out by Gray, a Canadian author of a health/moral book for young women. The narrator of this book, a mother, was explaining to her daughter why she should maintain her high standards in reference to boys. A woman's power stemmed from her sanctified pedestal.

Now we ought to remember that woman was not created to merely please man. God thought very differently from that about it. He said "I will make a her to be a help-mate for him" and when she gives up her power to help him in order to please him, she is falling short of the purpose for which she was created, and is doing the world a great wrong. Girls are naturally more refined than boys, and hence it is more easy for them to resist temptation. But she must not buy a boy's friendship by stepping down one inch from the high and holy platform on which God has placed her.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>- Should any young women have any doubts about Christianity, these authors suggest she reflect upon the fact that Christianity was the only ideology which ennobled women. The legal status of women in Ancient Rome was compared to Jesus Christ's friendship with Martha and Mary, to demonstrate the 'civilizing' nature of Christianity. "The home is the conservation of the civilization, and the condition of its women the indication of its progress. Where women are honored the home is noble, and the civilization safe and strong." Mrs. F. E. Willing, The Potential Women. A Book for Young Ladies (Boston, 1886), p. 66. See also Rev. F. E. Clarke, Looking Out On Life. A Book for Girls (Boston, 1892), Chapter 2.

<sup>2</sup>- R. Gray, Queer Questions Quaintly Answered, or creative mysteries made plain to children (Toronto, 1899), p. 116.

Women were 'naturally more refined', and in all the books written for women, this God given power was what the authors were seeking to elevate to its noblest purpose: motherhood.

Motherhood was considered the ultimate goal for these young readers. This role fulfilled two social objectives. The first was the creation of an oasis of rest: " The true Christian home is the one remnant of Eden in this out-of joint world."<sup>3</sup> And the purpose of this oasis was a haven for the bread winners, fathers and sons. Rev. Clarke described it thusly:

Men are the natural bread winners in this world; women are the natural makers of the home. Fathers and sons and brothers would labor with far more zeal and success if the mothers and daughters would spend their energies making home attractive. The men do not mind hard knocks much if they can go home at the close of a day's service to a haven of rest and comfort, such as only a women's love and tact can make.<sup>4</sup>

The noble purpose of motherhood, the 'natural' ability of women to comfort, is reinforced by the social responsibility that attended such a creation. Men would get along better in the business world knowing the haven was there.<sup>5</sup> Rather than entering the man's world, (the public sphere) women

---

<sup>3</sup>- Willing, op.cit., p. 180.

<sup>4</sup>- Clarke, op.cit., p. 159.

<sup>5</sup>- Clarke was the only author to explicitly address the question of women's suffrage, (he dismisses it as being a negligible right, and that women have to spend more time on the fighting for the right to good health, and individuality). Ibid., pp. 21-25.

should develop their 'natural' characteristics and create their little 'Eden'. In this way, they will contribute, not only to the moral fabric of their family, but also to its financial success.

The second objective of motherhood was the creation of the 'New Society'. Having placed woman squarely at the center of the home, and elevated her to both moral, and secular heights, these authors then placed the home at the center of the rejuvenated society. As the narrator of Queer Questions puts it: "I have realized too, the nobility of a woman's life. I have felt so often that no one holds so firmly the destiny of the world as a mother does."<sup>6</sup> The reason for this power was her place in the home. "If the furniture is old, we take thought to renew it; if the father is away, he is enquired after; but if the mother is gone, the home is gone. It is like a train of cars without an engine."<sup>7</sup> Rev. Clarke, in talking about the 'coming man' writes: "...that before this 'coming man' will make his appearance, his mother will precede him, and that he will be very largely what his mother makes him."<sup>8</sup> Young women should not think of being great themselves, their goal should be to raise great men.<sup>9</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup>- Gray, op.cit., p. 149.

<sup>7</sup>- Ibid., p. 167.

<sup>8</sup>- Clarke, op.cit., p. 35-36.

<sup>9</sup>- For example, see Chapter 1 in Willing, op.cit..

While these young girls were being instructed to be mothers, there was very little to suggest that their children will have a father. There was no suggestion that fathers would play an important role in their children's lives. Only Mrs. Willing proposed that a father should make time for his children, and that in order to make this time, his wife should help him in his business endeavors. In this way, the children would not suffer, "if she shares her husband's work, he can find time to teach the children, and to be taught by them the sweet lessons he needs to learn."<sup>10</sup> Mrs. Willing was the only author who argued that fathers were important for their children, and that children were important for their fathers: so important in fact, that the mother should temporarily, leave the home, and enter the business world, in order to permit her husband some time with the children.

The goal of these books were to inspire the readers towards a form of social Christianity, one which placed the Home at the nucleus of change, the mother as the catalyst, the children as the agents, and finally, the father as some sort of background figure, to be cared for, certainly, but perhaps a little obsolete for this new world. In this type of literature, written for young people, fathers were very vague figures. They were rarely commented upon, and on their rare appearances, it was either, as in the case of the boys'

---

<sup>10</sup>- Ibid., p. 103.

literature, as a figure in need of aid, or in the girls' books, as a figure in need of comfort.

## Appendix B

### Biblical Fathers

At the Cluny Museum in Paris, in the Ivory Gallery on the ground floor, is a unique fourteenth century ivory medallion showing Joseph leaning over the manger, and touching the baby Jesus. What makes this piece so unique is that there are so few religious pictorial representations of Joseph the Carpenter touching his foster son Jesus. Compared to the number and availability of representations of the Virgin and child, Joseph's isolation is even more striking.

The absence of these pictorial representations should come as no surprise after a short perusal of the Gospels. Joseph disappears from the story soon after the scene at the Temple, when Jesus is only about 11 years old. For such an important person, Joseph is singularly shadowy.

The Victorian reader may not have read the Bible for realistic models of fathers, however, Biblical figures of

both testaments were common currency in Victorian ideology. These stories were as familiar, if not more so, than Mother Goose, Dickens, or fairy tales. Indeed, no book was more familiar to the late Victorian than the Bible; it was the focus of sermons, art, music, and fiction. Throughout this period, a new popular iconography and a new literary genre were developing, which domesticated the holy family, and other Biblical characters, thereby making them even more accessible. In the 1890's the Christmas tradition of the creche became common in Canada, giving yet another pictorial representation of Joseph in relation to his foster son.<sup>1</sup> The popularity of the creche gave a new look given to a Biblical moment in which Joseph, as a father, played a large, if silent role.

The proliferation of editions of Bible Stories for young children was one of the consequences of the conjunction between the rise of children's literacy, and the theological reevaluation of childhood during this period. The emphasis on the Bible in personal salvation was not significantly challenged by the Protestant reformers, and children were seen to need special editions of the Bible to familiarize themselves with the stories.

---

<sup>1</sup>- It was also in 1871 that Pope Pius IX. declared St. Joseph the Patron of the whole Church. J. Hastings, ed., Dictionary of the Bible, dealing with its language, literature, and contents including the Biblical theology <1899> (New York, 1909), p. 777. St. Joseph was an important saint for Quebec long before 1871.

One of the most successful editions of this kind of book was Charlotte Yonge's The Child's Bible Reader (Canadian edition, Toronto, 1898).<sup>2</sup> Since Charlotte Yonge was one of the most popular writers of the nineteenth century, (she outsold Charles Dickens in total sales), and this book was published by a Canadian publishing house for distribution in Canada, it is appropriate to use Miss Yonge's Reader in the selection of particular stories. These familiar images, while perhaps never overtly referred to, can be considered as a silent subtext in the Victorian mind.

The fathers present in the Bible, and particularly in the Old Testament, such as Abraham, David, or Job, have several common characteristics: benevolence, providing, protection, and a sense of balance between private sentiment and public duty. The story of King David and his son Absalom is a example of paternal benevolence. Absalom's treachery is against David as father, and as King. Not only has he challenged the political structure, but also the more fundamental familial one. Despite this act of revolt, which leads to civil war, David's last words to his officers before the battle were to spare his son. His grief was enormous when his soldiers kill the rebel Prince. (II Sam.

---

<sup>2</sup>- Miss Yonge presented the Bible stories in an original manner. Rather than merely presenting the stories in simple language, the book tells the story of a maiden aunt's visit to her niece and nephew. A deeply religious women, the aunt tells a Bible story to the children every Sunday. After each story, the children and the aunt discuss the story. Miss Yonge included in the text these questions and answers.

18-19)<sup>3</sup> Such benevolence stands in contrast to God the Father's anger and retribution throughout the Old Testament. For Moses's lack of faith, he is deprived of ever setting foot in the Holy Land.

Another characteristic shared by the fathers of the Bible is their ability, and their duty to provide for their children, and their servants. When figures are introduced, their livestock, and progeny are often also listed. Job, for example is introduced as having seven sons, three daughters, and 11,000 head of livestock. (Job 1, 1-5)<sup>4</sup>. The man's worth is measured in this case by his fruitfulness, both biological and agricultural, particularly as it suggests God's grace. After eating the forbidden fruit, Eve must bear children in pain, and Adam is condemned to toil the soil. (Gen. 3) The difficulty of providing for a family is one of the consequences of the Fall, and one of the measures both of the individual's ability, and God's favor. Providing for one's family was certainly one of the most important of paternal characteristics emphasized by the reformers.

---

<sup>3</sup>- Charlotte Yonge's interpretation of this story is to suggest that children should not "trouble" their parents, for they are sure to cause grief to their parents, and bring destruction upon themselves (p. 174). The emphasis is placed less on the father's grief, than on the consequences of bad behaviour.

<sup>4</sup>- It is interesting to note that in returning to God's favor, Job is given everything twice over, except the number of children, who are furthermore, the last thing to be returned to him.

The story of Joseph the carpenter raises the last two characteristics examined in this section. The first of these is the protection the men give their children. Based on the Gospels, Joseph can be said to have protected Jesus twice. The first time was in marrying Mary, thereby giving the child a socially acceptable family, protecting Jesus from the consequences of illegitimacy. The second time was, heeding the angel in his dream and fleeing to Egypt, to avoid Herod's wrath.<sup>5</sup> Joseph's death was never recorded in the Gospels, but he was no longer present after the scene at the Temple. By this time, Jesus was about 11 years old, and could conceivably protect himself.<sup>6</sup>

The final paternal characteristic, particularly illustrated in the story of Joseph, is the acceptance of public duty over private considerations. According to Matthew (Matthew 1, 18) after hearing that Mary was

---

<sup>5</sup>- In the book of James, (Apocrypha) Joseph protected Jesus from an irate neighbor, who was angry at him for killing a playmate who had crossed him. Joseph did not understand why Jesus behaves this way, but he did protect him. (Reasons for the inclusion or exclusion of these gospels, and the development of early Christian doctrine can be found in The Cambridge History of The Bible, Vol.1 (Cambridge, 1963).) J. Montague, ed. and trans., The Apocryphal New Testament being the Apocryphal Gospels, Acts, Epistles and Apocalypses (New York, 1909).

<sup>6</sup>- In the Book of James (Apocrypha) Joseph does have one last moment, that of his death. It is perhaps significant that Joseph is the first person to whom Jesus preached the message of eternal life. Joseph was deeply afraid of dying, particularly because he had doubted Mary's account of her pregnancy. Jesus calmed his fears, and chased the devils away. Joseph's soul is placed in a silk napkin and watched over by the Archangels Michael and Gabriel, before being given to God.

pregnant, Joseph resolved to quietly break off the engagement, and was deterred from this course of action by a dream. The angel told him not to fear the consequences of marrying Mary.<sup>7</sup> Joseph never questioned these dreams. Like Abraham leading Isaac to the Mountain,<sup>8</sup> there was perfect faith in God, a faith which looked beyond the immediate role of father to the larger role of God's child.

The importance of these figures as fathers in the Victorian mind can only be surmised. Their characteristics, however, present an interesting picture, even in this cursory survey. The most important fact about these father figures is their shared characteristics. Combined, they present a powerful image of a benevolent, forgiving, providing, and protecting paternal figure. This image is particularly striking when compared with the rather arbitrary and authoritarian God the Father figure.

One of the most interesting aspects of the advice literature was the use made of the Bible, and certain Bible stories by the authors of the advice literature. Rather than use any one of the examples examined above, which we expected, since they conform so nicely with the basic tenets

---

<sup>7</sup>- According to the Book of James (Apocrypha) Joseph was afraid of looking like a fool, marrying a pregnant girl half his age. He already had a family from an earlier marriage.

<sup>8</sup>- Charlotte Yonge sees the story of Abraham and Isaac as an example of the need for complete obedience in God's word. "Much as he (Abraham) loved his son, he loved God more, and we must all be willing to give up anything God wants us to." Yonge, op.cit., p. 47.

of providing, and authority, the authors chose to emphasize those stories dealing with famous Biblical mothers: Miriam, Timothy's mother, and Mary for example. The emphasis on the women as moral leaders obviously detracts from the patriarchal model, and places women squarely at the center of moral education of children. This evidence alone does not confirm the working hypothesis of this study, that the Victorian father was to a certain extent losing private power to his more morally pure wife, but it does suggest that there was a conscious effort to reevaluate the role of women, and that despite the presence of alternate (patriarchal) models, the feminine model was chosen, and developed.

## Appendix C

### Cases Used for Chapter 3

L.C.J.- Lower Canadian Jurist  
C.S.- Cour Supérieure  
R.J.Q.- Rapport juridique de Québec  
L.N.- Legal News  
P.R.- Practice Rapports/ Rapports de pratique  
S.C.R.- Supreme Court Reports  
R.L.- Revue légale  
R. de J.- Revue de jurisprudence

#### Cases:

1863- Cooper es-qual vs. Tanner 8 L.C.J., 113  
1864- Brisson vs. Lafontaine dit Surprenant 18 L.C.J., 173  
1869- Barlow vs. Kennedy 13 L.C.J., 57  
1871- Barlow vs. Kennedy 17 L.C.J., 253  
1875- Rivard vs. Goulet 1 R.J.Q., 174  
1878- Stoppelben vs. Hull 2 R.J.Q., 255  
1878- Regina vs. Hull 3 R.J.Q., 136  
1882- ex parte Meiklejohn 5 L.N., 386  
1883- ex-parte Grace Ham vs. Phelan 27 L.C.J., 127  
1884- Pillet vs. Delisle 7 L.N., 78  
1884- Côté vs. Denault 10 Q.L.R., 115  
1888- Riley vs. Grenier 33 L.C.J., 1  
1889- La Mission de la Grande Ligne vs. Morissette 33  
L.C.J., 227 (in appeal)  
1889- Valade vs. Corbeil 33 L.C.J., 207  
1892- Beaudry vs. Starnes 2 R.J.Q., 396  
1893- Lynch vs. Carbray 4 C.S., 453

1893- Moore vs. Gillard 4 R.J.Q., 29  
 1894- Delisle vs. Pillet 17 C.S., 75  
 1894- Odell vs. Gregory 5 R.J.Q., 348  
 1897- Morency Vs. Fortier 12 R.J.Q., 68  
 1897- Thibault vs. Poitras 13 R.J.Q., 481  
 1897- Crépeau vs. Julien 12 R.J.Q., 308  
 1897- Sansfacon vs. Poulin 13 R.J.Q., 53  
 1898- Truaux vs. Ingalls 4 R. de J., 442  
 1898- Piché vs. Morse 15 R.J.Q., 306  
 1899- Pelletier vs. Jutras 17 C.S., 79  
 1899- Moreau vs. Bacquet et al. 17 C.S., 77  
 1899- Gallagher vs. McEnroe 17 C.S., 204  
 1900- Simard vs. Ballard 18 R.J.Q., 287  
 1900- Doyen vs. Riopel 17 R.J.Q., 488  
 1900- Vautrin vs. Dupuis 3 P.R., 232  
 1900- Daoust vs. Schiller 2 P.R., 529  
 1900- Daoust vs. Schiller 55 R.L., 333  
 1901- Courteau vs. Skelly 20 C.S., 215  
 1902- Bleau vs. Petit 21 C.S., 353  
 1904- Sigouin vs. Denis 11 R. de J., 99  
 1905- Lorenz vs. Lorenz 28 R.J.Q., 330  
 1905- MacDonald vs. MacDonald 14 R.J.Q., p.320  
 1905- Garcin vs. Croteau 27 C.S., 198  
 1908- Proulx vs. Proulx 33 C.S., 131  
 1909- Poitras vs. Lafrance 36 C.S., 362  
 1910- Gregory vs. Odell 39 R.J.Q., 291  
 1910- Beaulieu vs. Larivee 37 C.S., 163  
 1911- Nault vs. Nault 13 R.P., 221  
 1911- Daoust vs. Schiller 13 R.P., 115  
 1912- Wollven vs. Aird et al. 14 R.P., 165  
 1912- Moquin vs. Turgeon et al. 42 R.J.Q., 232  
 1916- Arsenault vs. Piuse 50 C.S., 373  
 1917- Malloch vs. Graham 27 R.J.Q., 447  
 1917- Blais vs. Héroux 21 R.P., 194  
 1919- Bytheway vs. Lile and Palmer 56 R.J.Q., 196  
 1919- Stevenson vs. Baldwin 21 R.P., 401  
 1920- Julien vs. Lortie 54 C.S., 167  
 1920- Brin vs. Meyer 23 R.P.Q., 270  
 1923- Michaud vs. D'Astous 33 R.L., 181  
 1923- Stevenson vs. Florant 38 R.J.Q., 315  
 1925- Stevenson vs. Florant S.C.R., 532  
 1926- Robinson vs. Fortier 64 R.J.Q., 327  
 1926- Marshall vs. Fournelle 64 R.J.Q., 391  
 1927- Stevenson vs. Florant A.C., 211  
 1928- Kivenko vs. Yagod 44 C.S., 330

Appendix D  
Selection of Fiction

To select a sample of the hundreds of thousands of fictional titles published between 1870 and 1914, in the English language, was a difficult task. The goal of the process was to attempt to recreate, at least in part, the reading experience of the middle class Anglophone community

in Montreal.<sup>1</sup> This selection was made all the more difficult without studies on reading patterns of the Canadian middle class.<sup>2</sup> Under these conditions, popularity

---

<sup>1</sup>- In their analysis of the borrowing patterns from L'Institut canadien in Montreal from 1865 to 1875, L.-G. Harvey and M. Olson found that the borrowers preferred the novel over all other forms of literature available in the library. And this, despite the intentions of the library's manager, or the condemnation of the clergy. Although novels only accounted for 32% of the library holdings, they accounted for over 75% of the total volume of circulation. "La circulation de la bibliothèque de l'Institut canadien de Montréal, 1865-1875", Histoire sociale/Social History, XIX, 37 (mai/May 1986), pp. 139-160.

Although there are no comparable studies for English libraries, some incidental information suggests that while the novel was still relatively acceptable by the late nineteenth century, some individuals and groups still saw the novel as a waste of time. Gordon Roper mentions that in 1882, when the Toronto Public Library was opened, there was a concerted effort to keep fiction off the shelves. G. Roper, "New Forces and New Fictions, 1880-1920", in C. Klink, et al., eds., Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English (Toronto, 1965), p. 286. See also the introduction to M. Church, Mapleton, or More Work for the Maine Law, 3rd ed. (Montreal, 1853), and A. Schultz, How to Provide Good Reading for Children (Toronto, 1895).

<sup>2</sup>- L.-G. Harvey and M. Olson's work on L'Institut does however, suggest some important considerations. The overwhelming preference for fiction, over and above any other form of literature has already been mentioned. They have also suggested that individual readers would choose to read in series, that is, that having found either an author or a genre that pleased them, the reader would continue in that vein for several novels.

and importance is difficult to measure. A conservative, and inclusive approach was therefore adopted.<sup>3</sup>

Library lists were the first primary source to be consulted. Westmount library has a printed holdings list of some of the books in their collection in 1902. The Fraser-Hickson library has several listings, manuscript and printed, dating between 1891 and 1902. The Mechanic's Institute and McGill University Library do not have such a guide to early holdings. With the exception of a list made by Osla Clouston of the books on her own and her sister's bookshelves, I have found no other listings of privately held Montreal collections in this period. William Lighthall donated much of his personal collection to McGill, however, there is only a limited record of the titles, either in his own papers or in the library. Another serial list consulted were the records of literary societies in Montreal throughout the period. These societies include, The Dickens

---

<sup>3</sup>- Claude Bissell in his article, "Literary Taste in Central Canada During the Late Nineteenth Century", Canadian Historical Review, 31, 3 (September, 1950), pp. 237-251, argues from an analysis of The Week, that Canadian literary taste favored the American rather than the British, and that the Canadian literary critics favored novels in the romantic style (Dickens) over those of the realists (James). See also Roper, op.cit.. The obvious gap, however, is between the critics and the people. Neither Roper, nor Bissell make any attempt to relate the critics approval or disapprobation to actual reading patterns. Kent Power's list of reading habits of contemporary Dalhousie students suggests that, assuming the students were honest in their responses, their reading was relatively classically oriented. K. Power, "The Reading of Canadian Students" University Magazine, VIII, 1 (1909), pp. 127-134.

Society of Montreal, and The Montreal Ladies Society. While working with the private papers, any mention of titles was also noted, along with the age of the reader, as well as any comments they might have had. Finally, a series of perhaps eclectic sources were examined: school records, from the Protestant School Board, articles on authors or books noted in the religious periodicals, and an article by W. Kent Powers on the reading habits of first year students at Dalhousie in 1909 was also useful.<sup>4</sup>

Literary criticisms were also consulted. For the children's section, Gillian Avery's Childhood's Heroes and for the adult section, Carl Klink's Literary History of Canada, James Hart's The Popular Books (which has a list of bestsellers).<sup>5</sup> Several important feminist literary criticisms were also consulted.<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup>- Power, "The Reading of Canadian Students".

<sup>5</sup>- G. Avery, Childhood's Patterns A Study of Heroes and Heroines in Children's Fiction (London, 1975); J. Hart, The Popular Book A History of America's Literary Taste (Berkeley, 1963); J. Townsend, Written for Children: An Outline of English Language Children's Literature (Harmondsworth, 1974); C. Klink, et al eds., Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English (Toronto, 1965).

<sup>6</sup>- N. Auerbach, Women and The Demon, The Life of A Victorian Myth (Cambridge Mass., 1982); S. Gilbert and S. Gubar, The Madwomen in The Attic The Women Writer and The Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination (New Haven, 1979); J. Adams, Women Writing About Men (New York, 1986); A. Douglas, The Feminization of American Culture (New York, 1988); and L. Boose and B. Flowers, eds., Daughters and Fathers (Baltimore and London, 1989).

These titles were collated, and those authors and titles mentioned in any more than one were chosen for the first cut. Books published before 1870 were excluded, with only a few exceptions, (Dickens and Scott were included because of their continued popularity) and books which went through more than five printings in ten years were assumed to be popular, and therefore included. The completed list includes over 50 titles in the children's section, and over 100 in the adult section.

The distinction between children's and adult's fiction in the Victorian era is a difficult one to measure accurately. Adults probably read books intended for children, and children were certainly familiar with adult books, such as Dickens or Scott. Ralph Connor, for instance, was read and enjoyed by both children and adults, (the copies held in the McGill rare book room belonged to William Lighthall). Other authors, such as Kipling, or Twain were part of both groups standard reading and re-reading. There are a surprising number of children's books on Hart's list of American bestsellers, suggesting that these books were not for children only. Some authors prefaced their works with a short introduction, giving some indication for whom the book was intended. The preface to Twain's Tom Sawyer for

example is dedicated to boys and girls.<sup>7</sup> Most authors, however, were not so explicit and other means of measurement were used to make the distinction so it must be considered suggestive, but not conclusive.

After the compilation of lists, based on lists of library holdings, references to titles in private papers, and on literary studies, such as those by Avery and Townsend, on children's literature, and Auerbach and Miller on adult literature, an initial selection of children's books was made on the basis of the complications of the plot structure. Books written for children in this period were, according to Avery and Townsend, fairly straightforward in plot development, and rarely introduced more than a dozen or so characters. This method of selection was used to place Dickens in the adult literature chapter.

Finally, books analyzed for the chapter on children's fiction were selected for their simplicity. For the most part, the books written for girls were 'domestic dramas, and for the boys, adventure stories. The major authors writing for children during this period, for example Louisa Alcott, Lucy Montgomery, and Rudyard Kipling, were predominantly interested in children becoming adults, and simple social commentary creeps into their plots.

---

<sup>7</sup>- Which does not mean that an adult did not read, and enjoy the book. It was on the Hart list for 1876.

The standards used for this selection process are in no way absolute, and the subjectivity reflects the absence of historical and literary studies concerning the reading habits of the middle class Victorian, adult and child. However, because this study has included analysis of both children's and adult's literature, it is hoped that any arbitrariness in selection will be countered by the inclusion of both kinds of literature.

Appendix E.  
List of Children's Books

Code for source: 1-Private papers  
2-School text  
3-Library lists  
4-Secondary sources  
5-Referred to in other children's books  
6-Hart's bestseller list  
7-Power's list

<u>Author</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>First edition</u>	<u>Source</u>
<u>Girls' Books</u>			
Cummings, Mrs.	<u>The Lamplighter</u>	1854	3, 4, 6
Dodge, Mary	<u>Hans Brinker and The Silver Skates</u>	1865	3, 4
Carroll, Lewis	<u>Alice in Wonderland</u>	1865	3
Finlay, Mary	<u>Elsie Dinsmore</u>	1867	4
Alcott, Louisa	<u>Little Women</u>	1868	1, 2, 3, 4, 6
Yonge, Charlotte	<u>The Daisy Chain</u>	1868	1, 3, 4
Alcott, Louisa	<u>Little Men</u>	1871	1, 2, 3
Coolidge, Susan	<u>What Katy Did</u>	1872	1,
Coolidge, Susan	<u>What Katy Did At School</u>	1874	1, 5
Ewing, Juliana	<u>Six to Sixteen</u>	1876	3, 4
Sewell, Anna	<u>Black Beauty</u>	1877	3
Sidney, Margaret	<u>Five Little Peppers And How They Grew</u>	1880	3, 4
Alcott, Louisa	<u>Joe's Boys</u>	1886	1, 3
Burnett, Frances	<u>Little Lord Fauntelroy</u>	1886	1, 3, 6
Burnett, Frances	<u>A Little Princess</u>	1888	1, 3
Wiggin, Kate	<u>Timothy's Quest</u>	1890	3, 5
Machar, Agnes	<u>Marjorie's Canadian Winter</u>	1892	4
Saunders, Margaret	<u>Beautiful Joe</u>	1894	3
Johnston, Annie	<u>The Little Colonel</u>	1896	4
Wiggin, Kate	<u>Rebecca of</u>		

Montgomery, Lucy	<u>Sunnybrook Farm</u>	1903	4
	<u>Anne of Green Gables</u>	1908	4, 6
Nesbitt, Edith	<u>The Railway Children</u>	1911	3, 4
Burnett, Francis	<u>The Secret Garden</u>	1911	4
Barrie, James	<u>Peter Pan</u>	1911	4
Webster, Jean	<u>Daddy-Long-Legs</u>	1912	4, 6
Gates, Eleanor	<u>The Poor Little Rich Girl</u>	1912	4
Porter, Eleanor	<u>Pollyanna</u>	1912	4, 6
Brazil, Angela	<u>Third Class at Miss Kaye's</u>	1912	4

Boys' Books

<u>Author</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>First edition</u>	<u>Source</u>
Dafoe, Daniel	<u>Robinson Crusoe</u>	1716	3, 4, 7
Marryat, Cpt.	<u>Masterman Ready</u>	1841	3, 4
Dana, Richard	<u>Two Years Before the Mast</u>	1841	1, 2, 3
Hughes, Thomas	<u>Tom Brown's Schooldays</u>	1857	4
Farrar, Frederick	<u>Eric or Little by Little</u>	1858	3, 4, 5
Ballytine, Robert	<u>The Coral Island</u>	1858	1, 4, 7
Alger, Horatio	<u>Ragged Dick</u>	1868	4, 5, 6
Macdonald, George	<u>At the Back of the North Wind</u>	1871	4
Twain, Mark	<u>The Adventures of Tom Sawyer</u>	1876	3, 5, 6
Twain, Mark	<u>The Prince and the Pauper</u>	1881	1, 6
Stevenson, Robert	<u>Louis Treasure Island</u>	1883	3, 4, 6
Henty, George	<u>With Clive in India</u>	1883	2, 7
Henty, George	<u>Jack Archer</u>	1883	2, 7
Twain, Mark	<u>Adventures of Huckleberry Finn</u>	1884	3, 5, 6
Haggard, Rider	<u>King Solomon's Mines</u>	1885	1, 6
Stevenson, Robert	<u>Louis Kidnapped</u>	1886	4
Henty, George	<u>Through The Fray</u>	1885	2, 7
Conan Doyle, Sir Arthur	<u>The White Company</u>	1891	1, 7
Kipling, Rudyard	<u>The Jungle Book</u>	1894	1, 3, 7
Falkner, John	<u>Moonfleet</u>	1894	4
Conan Doyle, Sir Arthur	<u>The Exploits of Brigadier Gerard</u>	1896	1, 3, 7
Henty, George	<u>With Wolfe in Canada</u>	1886	2, 7
Kipling, Rudyard	<u>Captain Courageous</u>	1897	3, 6, 7
Ollivant, Alfred	<u>Bob Son of Battle</u>	1898	4, 6
Connor, Ralph	<u>Black Rock</u>	1898	6, 7
Connor, Ralph	<u>The Sky Pilot</u>	1899	3, 6, 7

Kipling, Rudyard	<u>Stalky and Co.</u>	1899	3,7
Kipling, Rudyard	<u>Kim</u>	1901	3,7
Wister, Owen	<u>The Virginian</u>	1902	3,6,7
London, Jack	<u>Call of the Wild</u>	1903	6
Connor, Ralph	<u>The Prospector</u>	1904	7
Connor, Ralph	<u>The Foreigner</u>	1909	7
London, Jack	<u>White Fang</u>	1910	
Tarkington, Booth	<u>Penrod</u>	1914	3,6

Appendix F  
List of Adult Books

Code for source:    1- Private papers  
                      2- Library lists  
                      3- Secondary sources  
                      4- Visitor to city  
                      5- Hart's bestseller list  
                      6- Power's list

CANADIAN

<u>Author</u>	<u>Title</u> <u>edition</u>	<u>First</u>	<u>Source</u>
Leprohon, Roseanna	<u>Antoinette: Secret Marrying and Secret Sorrowing</u> 1864	2	
Kirby, William	<u>The Golden Dog</u> 1877-1896	2,3	
Lighthall, William	<u>The Young Seigneur</u> 1888	2	
Allen, Grant	<u>The Woman Who Did</u> 1895	3	
Parker, George	<u>The Seats of the Mighty</u> 1896	5,6	
Lighthall, William	<u>The False Chevalier</u> 1898	2	
Parker, George	<u>Mrs. Falchion</u> 1898		
Parker, George	<u>The Right of Way</u> 1901	6	
Duncan, Sarah	<u>The Pool in the Desert</u> 1903	3	
Duncan, Sarah	<u>Assorted Stories</u> 1904		
Parker, George	<u>The Imperialist</u> 1907	6	
Curwood, James	<u>The Danger Trail</u> 1910		
Leacock, Stephen	<u>Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town</u> 1912	4	
Parker, George	<u>The Judgement House</u> 1913	6	
Leacock, Stephen	<u>Arcadian Adventures of The Idle Rich</u> 1914	4	

BRITISH

Austen, Jane.	<u>Pride and Prejudice</u> 1813	1,2,6
Austen, Jane	<u>Emma</u> 1814	1,2,6
Scott, Sir Walter	<u>Waverley</u> 1814	1,2,3,5,6
Scott, Sir Walter	<u>Ivanhoe</u> 1819	1,2,3,5,6
Dickens, Charles	<u>Pickwick Papers</u> 1837	1-6
Dickens, Charles	<u>Oliver Twist</u> 1838	1-6
Dickens, Charles	<u>Nicholas Nickelby</u> 1839	1-6
Dickens, Charles	<u>Barnaby Rudge</u> 1841	1-6

Dickens, Charles	<u>The Old Curiosity Shop</u>	1841	1-6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>A Christmas Carol</u>	1843	1-6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Martin Chuzzlewit</u>	1844	1-6	
Bronte, Charlotte	<u>Jane Eyre</u>	1847	2, 6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Dombey and Son</u>	1848	1-6	
Bronte, Emily	<u>Wuthering Heights</u>	1848	2	
Dickens, Charles	<u>David Copperfield</u>	1850	1-6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Bleak House</u>	1853	1-6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Hard Times</u>	1854	1-6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Little Dorrit</u>	1857	1-6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>A Tale of Two Cities</u>	1859	1-6	
Collins, Wilkie	<u>The Women in White</u>	1860	2, 5	
Eliot, George	<u>The Mill on the Floss</u>	1860	2, 6	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Great Expectations</u>	1861	1-6	
Yonge, Charlotte	<u>The Clever Women of the Family</u>	1865	2	
Dickens, Charles	<u>Our Mutual Friend</u>	1865	1-6	
Collins, Wilkie	<u>The Moonstone</u>	1868	2, 5	
Blackmore, Richard	<u>Lorna Doone</u>	1869	2	
Meredith, George	<u>The Ordeal of Richard Feverel</u>	1869	2	
Dickens, Charles	<u>The Mystery of Edwin Drood</u>	1870	1-6	
Butler, Samuel	<u>Erehwon</u>	1872	2	
Conan Doyle, Sir Arthur	<u>The Complete Stories and Novels of Sherlock Holmes</u>	1888-1915	2, 5, 6	
Hardy, Thomas	<u>Tess of the D'Urbervilles</u>	1891	2, 5	
Ward, Mrs. Humphrey	<u>Marcella</u>	1894	3	
Wilde, Oscar	<u>The Importance of Being Ernest</u>	1895	4	
Hardy, Thomas	<u>Jude the Obscure</u>	1895	2	
Butler, Samuel	<u>The Way of All Flesh</u>	1903	4	
Gosse, Edmund	<u>Father and Son</u>	1907	3	
Ward, Mrs. Humphrey	<u>Canadian Born</u>	1910	3	

AMERICAN

James, Henry	<u>Washington Square</u>	1870	2
Chopin, Kate	<u>The Awakening</u>	1899	3
Wharton, Edith	<u>The House of Mirth</u>	1905	5

EUROPEAN

Hugo, Victor	<u>Les Misérables</u>	1862	2
Turgenev, Ivan	<u>Fathers and Sons</u>	1862	2
Ibsen, Henrik	<u>A Doll's House</u>	1879, 1889	3
Zola, Emile	<u>La Terre</u>	1887	2

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Primary Sources

#### 1. Manuscript Sources

Catalogue of English Books, Fraser Insitute. Montreal.  
October, 1890. Manuscript.

Catalogue of Books. Fraser Institute. 1900-1902. Manuscript.

Clouston Familv, 1890-1942 McCord Museum, McGill University.  
Unaccessioned.

Dawson-Harrington Family, 1800-1917. University Archives,  
McGill University, Montreal. M.G. 1022

Drummond, William Henry, 1854-1907, (1874-1935). Osler  
Library, McGill University, Montreal. Acc. 439.

Friedman, Norman Hiram, 1898-ca 1950 Rare Books Department,  
McLennan Library, McGill University. M.G. 3060.

George Mercer Dawson Papers, 1849-1901 Rare Book Department,  
McLennan Library, McGill University. Large MSS.

Greenshields Family 1822-1952 McCord Museum, McGill  
University. Unaccessioned.

Lichthall Family, ca.1820-1984 Rare Book Department,  
McLennan Library, McGill University. Large MSS.

McCord Family, 1890-1942 McCord, McGill University. M.21411.

McLennan Family, 1849-1940 Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. CH98. S116, CM30. Bd238.

Morgan Family Collection Rare Book Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. Unaccessioned.

Mowatt, E. Rae, Mrs George Christie, 1884- Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. M.G. 2099.

O'Brian, Robert Stuart Brock, fl. 1852-1873. Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. M.G. 3005.

Patton Shaw Family, 1816-1884. Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. Large MSS.

Rhodes and Tudor Hart Family, 1774-1975. Rare Books Department, McLennan Library, McGill University. Large MSS.

Stephens Family Collection, 1828-1953. McCord Museum, McGill University. Unaccessioned.

Wisdom Family Papers, fl. 1897-1991. University Archives, McGill University. M.G. 2015.

## 2. Printed Sources

First edition of material is indicate in < >.

### 2.1 Newspapers, journals and magazines.

Addresses Delivered Before the Canadian Club of Montreal. Montreal. Volumes, 1911-1914.

Canadian Methodist Magazine Toronto. volumes 1880-1904

Canadian Methodist Magazine and Review Toronto, Montreal, Halifax. Volumes 1883-1906.

The Canada Presbyterian. Toronto. Volumes, 1873-1887

Montreal Witness, Montreal, (1870-1878)

The Presbyterian Record. Montreal. Volumes, 1875-1914.

University Magazine. Montreal. Volumes, 1902-1914.

## 2.2 Annual Reports and Catalogues

Abstract of a Course of Ten Lectures on Municipal Administration in Montreal. Delivered in connection with the Educational Work of the Young Men's Christian Association of Montreal, s.l., 1895-6.

American Library Association twenty second Annual conference, McGill University, Montreal. June sixth to twelfth, nineteen hundred. Programme and guide issued by the local committee Montreal: Herald Press, 1900.

Author List of Works in the Westmount Public Library To which are appended s fiction list and a list of books for young readers. Montreal: Witness Printing House, 1899. Supplement, 1904.

Boy's Home. Annual Report. 1900-1910. Montreal: s.l., 1910.

Church of St. Paul's, Montreal. Annual Report. 1879-1895. Montreal: s.l., 1895.

Club Programme Montreal Women's Club 1899-1900. Montreal: s.l..

Discerning Tastes: Montreal Collectors, 1880-1920. Commentary by Janet Brooke. Catalogue from the exhibition "Discerning Taste" (presented from December 8, 1989 to February 15, 1990. Montreal: Montreal Museum of Fine Arts, 1989.

The Girl's Club, Griffintown. Fourth Annual Report. Montreal: s.l., 1912-1913.

Harper, J. R. and S. Riggs, eds. Portrait of A Period: A Collection of Notman Photographs, 1856-1915. Introduction by E. Collard. Montreal: McGill Queen's Press, 1967.

Montreal Protestant Orphan Asylum. Annual Report. (90th Annual Report). Montreal: s.l., 1912.

Montreal Directory of Women. Second Annual Report. Montreal: s.l., 1915.

Nazareth Street Club 1st Annual Report. Montreal: s.l., 1910.

Old Brewery Mission. Annual Report. (13th Annual Report,) Montreal: s.l., 1904.

Our City and Our Sports. Official Programme of the 12th Annual Meet, Montreal, July 1894. Canadian Wheelmen's Association Montreal Bicycle Club. Montreal: Herald Print, 1894.

Pearson, Rev. A. The Year of the Jubilee church of St. James the Apostle. Montreal: s.l., 1915.

The Readers Club Programme of Sessions. McGill University. s.l. Seasons 1911, 1912.

Report of a Committee of the Montreal Council of Social Agencies Being the Findings of a Social and Financial Survey of Protestant and non-Sectarian Social Agencies of an Undenominational character in the City of Montreal Province of Quebec, Canada. Montreal: s.l., 1919.

Society of Canadian Literature Programme. season 1889

## 2.3 Non-Fiction

A.B.C. La Tempérance contre l'ivrognerie. s.n.: s.l., 188?

Abbott, S.A. L'Alcohol, Voila L'ennemi plaidoyer en faveur de la prohibition du trafic des boissons enivrantes. Montréal: s.l., 1883.

Adams, H. The Cause of the Degradation of Man. St. John: E.J. Armstrong, 1895.

Adams, H. A True Picture of the Effects of Intemperance. Yarmouth, N.S.: C. Carey, 1888.

Ames, H. The City below the Hill. <1887>. Introduction by P. Rutherford. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1972.

- Anonymous, Catéchisme de l'Temperance a l'usage des familles et des écoles de la province de Québec. La Biere, l'alcohol, le tabac. Publie par la société Chretienne de Tempérance des Dames (W.C.T.U.) de la Province de Québec. Montréal: Imp. Commercial, 189?.
- Anonymous, Guide du jeune homme: recueil de prières suivi du petit office de la Sainte Vierge de l'office des morts, du petit office de l'ange gardien du cérémonial de la réception des Congréganistes, des conseils du P. Olivant, De cantiques, etc. etc. Montréal: Cadieux et Derome, 1882.
- Anonymous, Book of the Families, consecrated to the Holy Family of Jesus, Mary and Joseph Practice: Night Prayers in Common. Montréal, Cadieux et Derome, 1893.
- Anonymous, An appeal to men of wealth and influence, against the use of intoxicating drinks. s.n.: s.l., 18?.
- Anonymous, L'Alcoholism- ses effets, sa guerisson. Montreal: Dixon Cure Co. of Canada, 1898.
- Anonymous Père Trappiste Vie de Sainte Emilie Mère de St. Basile le Grand et modele des mères Chretiennes. Introduction par L'Evêque de Montréal. Montréal: s.l., 1876.
- Bayard, W. An Address upon the use and abuse of Alcoholic Drinks. St. John ?: s.l., 1882.
- Bengough, John Wilson The Gin Mill Primer: A book of Easy Reading Lessons for Children of all ages, Especially for Boys Who Have Votes. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, Montreal: C.W. Coates: Halifax: S.F. Huestis, 1898.
- Bland, S. The New Christianity or the Religion of the New Age. <1920>. Introduction by R. Allen. Toronto: Univerisity of Toronto Press, 1973.
- Bland, S. The Life of James Henderson D.D. Introduction by S.D. Chown. McClelland and Stewart: Toronto, 1926.
- General Booth The Training of Children. London: International Headquarters of the Salvation Army, 1884.
- Boutet, P. Des Restrictions successives apportées à la notion de puissance paternelle. Paris: V. Giard & E. Briere eds., 1905.
- Bruneau A.A. Du Marriage. Montréal: G. Ducharme ed., 1921.

- Brunet, L. A. La Famille et ses traditions. Montréal: Senecal, 1880.
- Byrne, Rev. James T. A Lecture Delivered to the Young Men's Literary Society at L'Orignal and subsequently at Respectible Audiences at Montreal, St. Andrews, and Quebec. Montreal: Campbell and Beckett, 1841.
- Cameron, Rev. D. B. Thoughts on Prohibition and the Total Abstinence Pledge. Toronto: James Bain and Son, 1881.
- Chavasse, P.H. Advice to a Mother on the Management of her Children and on the treatment on the moment of their more pressing illnesses and accidents. <1879>. Toronto: Willing and Williamson, 1880.
- Chiniquy, Father C. N. Oblat of Mary Immaculate- Manuel of the Temperance Society Dedicated to the youth of Canada. Translated by P. Demaray. Montreal: Lovell and Gibson, 1847.
- Chiniquy, Father C. Manual of the Temperance Society Dedicated to the Youth of Canada. First English edition, translated by P. Demaray. Montreal: Lovell, 1847.
- Clarke, Rev. F.E. Our Business Boys (What 83 Business Men Say). Boston: D. Lothrop, 1884.
- Clarke, Rev. F.E. Looking Out On Life. A Book for Girls on Practical Subjects, based on many letters from wise mothers. Boston: D. Lothrop, 1892.
- Cobbett, W. Advice to Young Men and (Incidentally) to Young Women in the middle and higher ranks of life in a series of letters addressed to a youth, a bachelor, a lover, a husband, a citizen or a subject. New York: J. Doyle, 1833.
- Côté, E-A. La Puissance paternelle. Rimouski: S. Vachon ed., 1927.
- Dawson, J. W. The Testimony of the Holy Scriptures Respecting Wine and Strong Drink Being the Substance of a course of lectures delivered before the Pictou Temperance Association <1848> Pictou: s.l., 1858.
- Emra, J. N. (Lieutenant M. P. Royal Marines) The Question of the Day: A Temperance Lecture Delivered at Montreal, 1873. Montreal: John Lovell, 1873.

- F.P.B. Assistance due aux Parents. Montréal: Cadieux et Derome, 1883.
- Farrar, F. Social and Present Day Questions. Boston: Bradley and Woodruff, 1891.
- Finch, J. B. The People versus the Liquor Traffic The Great Speeches of Honourable John B. Finch. 23rd edition, 2nd Canadian edition. Toronto: Citizen Publishing Co., 1885.
- Forsyth, W. Forsyth on the Custody of Enfants: A treatise on the Law relating to the Custody of Infants. London: William Benning & Co., 1850.
- Gelke, C. Entering on Life: A Book for Young Men. 10th ed. London: Hodder and Stroughton, 1882.
- Gough, J. B. Platform Echoes: or Living Truths for Head and Heart. Introduction by Hon. Sir S. Leornard Tilley, minister of finance Canada. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, 1886.
- Grand Trunk Publications, Montreal. s.n.: s.l., 1909.
- Gray, R. Queer Questions Quaintly Answered, or Creative Mysteries Made Plain to Children. Toronto: J. L. Nichols, 1899.
- Hall, E.A. The Truth About Alcohol. Victoria: Tree Lance Publishing Co., 191?.
- Henault, L. Notes et Conseils de Louis Henault à ses enfants. Montréal: Senecal, 1880.
- Hingston, Dr. W. H. The Climate of Canada and Its Relations to Life and Health. Montreal: Dawson, 1884.
- History of Child Saving in the United States The National Conference of Charities and Corrections Chicago, <June 1893> Montclair, New Jersey: Reprint Patterson Smith, 1971.
- Horner, Rev. R.C., To, Before, and On the Alter. Toronto: Wm Briggs, Montreal: C. Coates, Halifax: S.F. Huestis, 1891.
- Howe, J. Lecture delivered before the St. John Early Closing Association at the Hall of the Mechanic's Institute. St. John: Morning News, 1859.

- Howe, J. Address Delivered by the Hon. Joseph Howe, secretary of State for the provinces before the Young Men's Christian Association Ottawa February 27, 1872. Ottawa: I.B. Taylor, 1872.
- Jackson, G. Rev. First Things First: Addresses to Young Men. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1894.
- Johnson, W. "Legal Education in Quebec", Canadian Law Review. 10, 4, (1905), 451-499.
- Lancelly, J. E. The Domestic Sanctuary or the Importance of Family Religion. Hamilton: Spectator Print. and Pub. Co., 1878.
- Lareau, E. Le Code civil du Bas-Canada. Montréal: A. Periard, Libraire-Editeur, 1885.
- Lighthall, W. D. Sights and Shrines of Montreal: A Topographical, Romantic and historical description of the city and environs. Montreal: Grafton and Sons, 1892.
- Lighthall, W.D. Montreal After 250 Years. Montreal: F. E. Grafton, 1892.
- Lorimer, Chas et Vilbon, Chs. La bibliothèque du Code Civil de la Province de Québec. Montréal: Cadieux et Derome, 1885.
- Lower Canada Code Civile du Bas Canada Rapports des codificateurs. Québec: G.E. Desbarats , 1865.
- Mackensie, R. T. "The University and Physical Efficiency", University Magazine. VI, 2 (April 1907), 168-178.
- Mackensie, R. T. "Canada's Opportunity in Physical Education", Addresses Delivered Before the Canadian Club of Montreal. 1911-1912 Season, Montreal: s.l., (1912).
- Mason Mrs. E. M. Faces that Follow. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, Montreal: C. W. Coates, Halifax: S. F. Huestis, 1898.
- McCallen, Rev. J. A. Temperance Lectures delivered in St. Patrick's and St. Ann's Churches. A grateful tribute to Father Mathew's memory and work. Montreal: L.D.A. Marechal, V.G. Imprimeur, 1890.
- Mignault, P. B. Le Droit civil canadien. Volumes 1-9. Montreal: Whiteford and Theoret, 1895-1919.

- Murray, C. The Industrial Kingdom of God. <1887>. Introduction and edited by L. Armour and E. Trott. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1981.
- Ontario Temperance and Prohibition League The Advisor A Book for Young People. Toronto: s.l., 1873.
- Palmer, A. B. The Temperance Teachings of Science Adapted to the use of teachers and pupils in the Public schools. (Prescribed by the Board of Education New Brunswick) St. John: J. and A. McMillan, 1889.
- Paquin, Rev. L. P. Lecture on the Hurtful Qualities of Spirituous Liquors Delivered in Quebec. Quebec: C. Darveau, 1880.
- Paquin, E. Le Livre des mères, ou instructions pratiques sur les principes fondamentaux de la propagation de la race humaine. Montreal: s.l.. 1880.
- Peabody, F. G. Jesus Christ and the Social Question. An Examination of the teaching of Jesus in its relation to some of the problems of modern life. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1907.
- Phelps, H. Montreal for Tourists. New York: s.l., circa 1904.
- Platt, G. D. The Temperance Primer: An Elementary lesson book on the nature and effects of alcohol for use in Canadian schools. Toronto, Winnipeg: W. J. Gage and Co., 1883.
- Power, W. K. "The Reading of Canadian Students" University Magazine VIII, 1 (1909), 127-134.
- Questions of the Day. Montreal: W. Drysdale, 1885.
- Rauschenbusch, W. Christianity and the Social Crisis. <1907>. New York: s.l., 1919.
- Rogers, Rev. D. Shot and Shell for The Temperance Conflict. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, Montreal: C.W. Coates, Halifax: S. F. Huestis, 1884.
- Rogers, Rev. The Gatling With Ammunition for the Temperance Warfare. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, Montreal: C.W. Coates, Halifax: S. F. Huestis, 1894.
- Ross, E. Rev. The Manliness of Piety. Halifax: Wesleyan Conference Steam Press, 1860.

Ross, D. Rev. Hindrances to Temperance Work Being an Essay Read at the 5th Annual Meeting of the Quebec Temperance and Prohibitory League, 1875. Montreal: s.l., 1875.

Sainte-Foi, Charles Les Heures sérieuses d'un jeune homme Montréal: C. O. Beauchemin et Valois, 1876.

Sallmon, William Henry, ed. The Culture of Christian Manhood: Sunday Mornings in Battell Chapel Yale University. Toronto: F.H. Revell, 1897.

Schoenfield, J. "Recreational Survey of Montreal", Addresses Before the Canadian Club of Montreal. Season, 1912-1913, Montreal: s.l., 1913.

Schultz, Agnes How to Provide Good Reading For Children. Read at the National Council of Women of Canada, Toronto, 1895 (To be sold in aid of the Talent fund for debt on Holy Trinity Church, Winnipeg.) Toronto: Bryant Press, 1895.

Sherlock, L. M. Present Aspect of the Temperance Movement: Lecture Delivered in the Sons of Temperance Hall, Bleury Street, Montreal, November 6, 1872. Montreal: John Lovell, 1872.

Stoakes, C. W. Here and There in Montreal. Toronto: The Musson Book Co. Ltd., 1924

Templeton-Armstrong, I. The Old Vice and The New Chivalry. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, Montreal: C. W. Coates, Halifax: S. F. Huestis, 1884.

Thompson, Rev. J. Lambs in the Fold; or the Relation of Children to the Church and their Proper Christian Nurture. Montreal: W. Drysdale and Co., 1893.

Walton, F.P. The Scope and Interpretation of the Civil Code of Lower Canada. <1907>. Introduction by Maurice Tancelin, Toronto: Butterworth, 1980.

Whitacre, George Soberness of Mind Sermon Preached in the Chapel of Trinity College, Toronto, on Sunday June 25, 1865. Toronto: Published by the Students of the College, 1865.

Willing, J. F. Mrs. The Potential Women: A Book for Young Ladies. Boston: McDonald and Gill, 1886.

Yonge, C. The Child's Bible Reader. <1898>. Toronto: John C. Winston Co. Ltd., (n.d.).

## 2.4 Fiction

- Alcott, L. Joe's Boys. <1886>. Boston: Little, Brown and Co., 1953.
- Alcott, L. Little Men. <1871>. Boston: Little, Brown and Co., 1913.
- Alcott, L. Little Women. <1868>. Boston: Little, Brown and Co., 1968
- Alger, H. Ragged Dick Or Street Life in New York. <1868>. New York: Crown Publishers, 1945.
- Allen, G. The Women Who Did. <1895>. Boston: Roberts Bros., 1895.
- Anonymous, Homes Made and Marred, a book for working men and their wives. London: The Religious Tract Society of London, circa 1870.
- Arthur, T. S. Ten Nights in a Barroom, and What I Saw There. <1854>. Introduction by D. A. Koch. Cambridge, Mass: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1964.
- Austen, J. Emma. <1814>. Introduction and notes by T. Tanner (1972). Harmondsworth: Penguin books, 1977.
- Austen, J. Pride and Prejudice. <1813>. New York: airmont Publishing Co., 1969.
- Ballytine, R. M. The Coral Island. <1858>. London: Andrew Melrose, (n.d.).
- Barrie, J. Peter Pan. <1911>. New York, Scribner, 1980.
- Blackmore, R. D. Lorna Doone. <1869>. Introduction by M. Threapleton. New York: Airmont, 1967.
- Brazil, A. Third Class at Miss Kaye's. <1908>. London: Blackie and Son Limited, (n.d.).
- Bronte, C. Jane Eyre. <1847>. New York, Toronto: Bantam books, 1981.

- Bronte, E. Wuthering Heights. <1848>. New York: Dell Publishing, 1965.
- Burnett, F. Little Lord Fauntelroy. <1886>. Introduction by A. Thwaite. New York: Garland Publishers, 1976.
- Burnett, F. A Little Princess. <1888>. New York: Dell Yearling, 1979.
- Burnett, F. The Secret Garden. <1911>. London: <s.l.>, 1911.
- Butler, S. Erehwon or After the Range. <1872>. Afterward by K. Amis. New York: Signet classic, 1960
- Butler, S. The Way of All Flesh. <1903>. Edited by J. Cochrane, introduction by R. Hoggart, (1966). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1984.
- Chopin, K. The Awakening. <1899>. New York: Avon Books, 1972.
- Church, M. Mapleton, or More Work for the Maine Law. Montreal: J.C. Becket, 1853.
- Collins, W. The Moonstone. <1868>. New York: Books Inc, 1945.
- Collins, W. The Women in White. <1860>. Edited, introduction and notes by J. Symons, (1985). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1985.
- Conan Doyle, A. The Complete Stories and Novels of Sherlock Holmes. <1888-1915>. (2 volumes). Introduction by L. Estelman. New York: Bantam Books, 1986.
- Conan Doyle, A. The White Company. <1891>. London: John Murray Publishers Ltd., 1963.
- Connor, R. The Black Rock A Tale of the Selkirks. <1898>. Toronto: The Westminster Co., (n.d.).
- Connor, R. Corporal Cameron of The North West Mounted Police. A Tale of the MacLeod Trail. <1912>. Toronto: The Westminster Co., 1912.
- Connor, R. The Doctor A Tale of the Rockies. <1906>. Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1906.
- Connor, R. The Foreigner A Tale of Saskatchewan <1909>. Toronto: The Westminster Co., 1905.

- Connor, R. The Patrol of the Sun Dance Trail. <1914>. Toronto: The Westminster Co., 1914.
- Connor, R. The Prospector A Tale of the Crow's Nest Pass. <1904>. Toronto: The Westminster Co., 1904
- Connor, R. The Sky Pilot. <1899>. Toronto: The Westminster Co., n.d.
- Conrad, J. Lord Jim A Tale. <1900>. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1972.
- Coolidge, S. What Katy Did. <1872>. Harmondsworth: Puffin Classic, 1984.
- Coolidge, S. What Katy Did At School. <1874>. Puffin Classic: Harmondsworth, 1985.
- Cummings, M. The Lamplighter, or an orphan girl's struggles and triumphs. <1854>. London: Ward Lock and Co. Ltd., (n.d.).
- Curwood, J. The Danger Trail. <1910>. New York: Grosset and Dunlap, (n.d.).
- Dafoe, D. Robinson Crusoe. <1716>. New York: Dodd, Mead and Co, 1946.
- Dana, R.H. Two Years Before The Mast. <1841>. London: Blackie and Son Ltd., (n.d.).
- Dickens, C. Barnaby Rudge. <1841>. Introduction, edited and notes by G. Spence, (1973). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1987.
- Dickens, C. Bleak House. <1853>. Introduction by J. Miller, edited by N. Page, (1971). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1985.
- Dickens, C. "A Christmas Carol", <1843>. In Christmas Books. Introduction and edited by R. Clancy. London: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Dickens, C. David Copperfield. <1850>. Afterword by E. Johnson. New York: Signet Classic, 1962.
- Dickens, C. Dombey and Son. <1848>. Introduction by R. Williams and notes by P. Fairclough, (1970). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1986.

- Dickens, C. Great Expectations. <1861>. Introduced, edited and notes by A. Calder, (1965). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1986.
- Dickens, C. Hard Times. <1854>. Introduction by R.D. Spector. New York: Bantam Classic, 1964.
- Dickens, C. Little Dorrit. <1857>. Edited and introduction by J. Holloway, (1967). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1987.
- Dickens, C. Martin Chuzzlewit. <1844>. Introduction and edited by P. Furbank, (1968). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1987.
- Dickens, C. The Mystery of Edwin Drood. <1870>. Introduction A. Wilson, edited by A. Easson, (1972). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1974.
- Dickens, C. Nicholas Nickleby. <1839>. Edited and Introduction by M. Slater, (1978). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1987.
- Dickens, C. Pickwick Papers. <1837>. Introduction and edited by R. Patten, (1972). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1981.
- Dickens, C. The Old Curiosity Shop. <1841>. Introduction by M. Andrews, edited by A. Easson, (1972). Harmondsworth: Penguin books, 1987.
- Dickens, C. Oliver Twist. <1838>. Afterword by E. Le Comte. New York: Signet Classic, 1961.
- Dickens, C. Our Mutual Friend. <1865>. Introduction and edited by S. Gill, (1971). Harmondsworth: Penguin books, 1987.
- Dickens, C. A Tale of Two Cities. <1859>. Introduction and edited by G. Woodcock, (1970). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1986.
- Dodge, M. Hans Brinker and The Silver Skates. <1865>. New York: Grosset and Dunlap, 1945.
- Carroll, L. Alice in Wonderland. <1865>.
- Finlay, M. Elsie Dinsmore. <1867>. Introduction by B. Parry. New York: Garland Publications, 1977.

- Duncan, S.J. The Imperialist. <1904>. Introduction by C. Bissell, (1971). Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1984.
- Duncan, S.J. The Pool in the Desert, Assorted Stories. <1903>. Introduction by R. Sullivan. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1984.
- Eliot, G. The Mill on the Floss. <1860>. Edited, introduction and notes by G. S. Haight. Boston: Houghton and Mifflin, Co., 1961.
- Ewing, J. Six to Sixteen. <1876>. Introduction by G. Avery. New York: Garland Publications, 1976.
- Falkner, J. Moonfleet. <1894>. London: Edward Arnold (Publishers) Ltd, n.d.
- Farrar, F. Eric or Little by Little. A Tale of Roslyn School. <1858>. London: Adam and Charles Black, 1909.
- Gates, E. The Poor Little Rich Girl. <1912>. Introduction by M. Booth. New York: Garland Publications, 1976.
- Gosse, E. Father and Son. <1907>. Edited by P. Abbs. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1983.
- Haggard, R. King Solomon's Mines. <1885>. London, Toronto: Cassell and Co. Ltd., (n.d.).
- Hardy, T. Jude the Obscure. <1895>. Introduction by W. Buckler, (1959). New York: Dell Publishing, 1968
- Hardy, T. Tess of the D'Urbervilles. A Pure Women. <1891>. London: McMillan and Co. Ltd., 1965.
- Henty, G.A. Jack Archer. <1883>. New York: The F.M. Lupton Publishing Co., n.d..
- Henty, G.A. Through The Fray. <1885> New York: The F.M. Lupton Publishing Co., n.d..
- Henty, G.A. With Clive in India. <1883> London: Blackie and Son Ltd., n.d.. (Published in Canada by Copp Clark Co. Ltd, and Wm. Briggs: Toronto).
- Henty, G.A. With Wolfe in Canada. <1886> London: Blackie and Son Ltd., n.d. (Published in Canada by Copp Clark Co. Ltd, and Wm. Briggs: Toronto)
- Hughes, T. Tom Brown's Schooldays. <1857>. London: Sidgwick, 1923.

- Hugo, V. Les Miserables. <1862>. Préface de Vercors, commentaires de N. Say, et notes et G. Rosa. 3 Tomes. Paris: Le Livre de Poches, 1985.
- Ibsen, I. A Doll's House. <First European production, 1879. First New York Production, 1889>. In Four Great Plays. Introduction by J. Gassner (1959) New York: Bantam Books, 1984.
- James, H. Washington Square. <1870>. New York: Bantam Classic, 1959.
- Johnston, A. The Little Colonel. <1896>. Introduction by S. Elbert. New York: Garland Publications, 1976.
- Kipling, R. Captains Courageous A Story of The Grand Banks. <1897>. London: Macmillan, 1937.
- Kipling, R. Just So Stories. <1902>. London: Macmillan and Co. Ltd., 1966.
- Kipling, R. Kim. <1901>. New York: Doubleday, 1966.
- Kipling, R. Stalky and Co.. <1899>. London: Macmillan, 1939
- Kirby, W. The Golden Dog A Romance of Old Quebec. <1877-1896>. Toronto: Musson Book co, (n.d.)
- Leacock, S. Arcadian Adventures of The Idle Rich. <1914>. Introduction by R. Curry. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1969.
- Leacock, S. Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town. <1912>. Montreal: Reprint Society of Canada Ltd., 1947.
- Leprehon, R. Antoinette: Secret Marrying and Secret Sorrowing. <1864>. Introduction by C. Klink. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1973.
- Lighthall, W. The False Chevalier or The Lifeguard of Marie Antoinette. <1898>. Montreal: Grafton, 1898.
- Lighthall, W. The Young Seigneur or Nation-Making. <1888>. Montreal: Wm. Drysdale and Co., 1888.
- London, J. Call of the Wild. <1903>. Introduction by A. Rothberg, 1963. New York: Bantam Classic, 1984.
- London, J. White Fang <1910>. Introduction by A. Rothberg, 1963. New York: Bantam Classic, 1984.

- Lucas, D. V. (D.D.) Bill and Polly. Toronto: Wm. Briggs,  
Montreal: C. W. Coates, Halifax: S. F. Huestis, 1893.
- Macdonald, G. At the Back of The North Wind. <1871>.  
Philadelphia: Lipincott, 1909.
- Machar, A. Marjorie's Canadian Winter. <1892>. Toronto: Wm  
Briggs, 1896.
- Marryat, Cpt. Masterman Ready. <1841>. Introduction by J.  
Seelye. New York: Garland Publications, 1976.
- McClung, N. Sowing Seeds in Danny. <1908>. Toronto: Wm.  
Briggs: 1908.
- Meredith, G. The Ordeal of Richard Feverel. <1869>.  
Afterword by B. Raffel. New York: Meridian, 1985.
- Montgomery, L. M. Anne of Green Gables. <1908>. Toronto:  
McClelland and Stewart, 1968.
- Morse, F. L. Social Heroism: A Canadian Prize Temperance  
Story. Toronto: T. Moore Book and Job Printers, 1878.
- Nesbitt, E. The Railway Children. <1911>. London: Benn.,  
1957.
- Ollivant, A. Bob Son of Battle. <1898>. New York: Grosset,  
(n.d.).
- Parker, G. The Judgement House. <1913>. London, New York:  
Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1913
- Parker, G. Mrs. Falchion. <1898> Toronto: Copp Clark, 1898.
- Parker, G. The Right of Way. <1900>. New York: Grosset and  
Dunlap Publishers, 1901.
- Parker, G. The Seats of the Mighty. <1896>. New York:  
Appelton, (n.d.)
- Parker, G. The Weavers A Tale of England and Egypt of Fifty  
Years Ago. <1907>. New York: A.L. Burt Co. Publishers,  
1907.
- Pedley, H. Looking Forward. A Novel for The Times. <1913>  
Toronto: Wm. Briggs, 1913.
- Porter, E. Pollyanna. <1912>. New York: Grosset and Dunlap,  
1946.

- R.T.K. A Visit to the Spring on the Hillside, or The Temperance Question. Halifax: Herald Steam Press, 1887.
- Saunders, M. Beautiful Joe. <1894>. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, c. 1927.
- Scott, Sir W. Ivanhoe. <1819>. Introduction and edited by A. Wilson, 1984. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1986.
- Scott, Sir W. Waverley <1814> introduced A. Hook, (1972). London: Penguin Group, 1985.
- Sewell, A. Black Beauty. <1877>. New York: Books Inc., (n.d.).
- Shelley, M. Frankenstein. <1831>. New York: Dell Publishing Co. Inc., 1974.
- Sidney, M. Five Little Peppers And How They Grew. <1880>. Boston: Lothrop, Lee and Shepard Co., 1976.
- Sims, F.L.H. Drink and Drudgery Two Social Sins. Toronto: By the Author, 1900.
- Sinclair, M. Brother G. M. Rose A Temperance Story. Toronto: Hunter Rose and Co. Printers, 1879.
- Stevenson, R. Kidnapped. <1886>. Introduction and edited by E. Letley. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986.
- Stevenson, R. Treasure Island. <1883>. New York: Scribner, 1937.
- Straton-Porter, G. Freckles. <1904>. New York: Grosset and Dunlap Publishers, 1916.
- Tarkington, B. Penrod. <1914>. New York: Grosset and Dunlap, 1969.
- Turgenev, I. Fathers and Sons. <1862>. Translated by G. Reavey, foreword by A. Hodge. New York: Signet Classic, (n.d.)
- Twain, M. Adventures of Huckleberry Finn. <1884>. Edited by H.N. Smith. Riverside Edition, Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1958.
- Twain, M. The Adventures of Tom Sawyer. <1876>. Afterword by P. Glassman. New York: William Morrow and Co., 1988.

- Twain, M. The Prince and The Pauper A Tale for Young People of All Ages. <1881>. New York: Harper, 1909.
- Walker, M.S. The Family Doctor: or Mrs Barry and her Bourbon. Henry Hoyt: Boston, John Dougall and Son: Montreal, 1870.
- Ward, H. Canadian Born. <1910>. London: Smith, Elder and Co., 1910.
- Ward, H. Marcella. <1894>. Introduction by T. Watters. London: Virago Modern Classics, 1984.
- Webster, J. Daddy-Long-Legs. <1912>. New York: Grosset, 1940.
- Wharton, E. The House of Mirth. <1905>. Introduction by R. Lewis, 1984. New York: Bantam Classic, 1986.
- Wiggin, K. Rebecca of Sunnybrook Farm. <1903>. New York: Grosset, 1909.
- Wiggin, K. Timothy's Quest A Story for anybody, young or old, who cares to read it. <1890>. Boston: Houghton and Mifflin, 1891.
- Wilde, O. "The Importance of Being Ernest" <First London Production, 1895>. In Five Major Plays. Introduction by N. Teitel. New York: Airmont, 1970.
- Wister, O. The Virginian. <1902>. New York: Lancer Books, 1970.
- Yonge, C. The Clever Women of the Family. <1865>. Afterword by G. Battiscombe. London: Virgo Modern Classics, 1985.
- Yonge, C. The Daisy Chain. <1868>. Introduction by S. Kenney. New York: Garland Publications, 1977.
- Zola, E. La Terre. <1887>. Paris: Biblio-Carpentier, 1930.

## SECONDARY SOURCES

### 1. "Frame of Mind"

- Allen, R. The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-1928. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971.
- Baudoin, L. "Puissance paternelle". 14 Revue du Barreau, (1954), 478-486.
- Baudoin, L. Le Droit civil de la Province de Québec: Modèle vivant de Droit comparé. Montréal: Wilson et Lafleur, 1953.
- Berger, C. The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1870-1914. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1970.
- Berger, C. Science, God and Nature in Victorian Canada. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983.
- Bernard, J.P. ed. Les Ideologies québécoises. Montréal: Boreal Express, 1973.
- Bernier, J. La Médecine au Québec, Naissance d'une profession. Québec: Presses de l'Université de Laval, 1989.
- Bettleheim, B. "The Importance of Play". Atlantic, 249 (March 1987), 35-46.
- Bliss, M. A Living Profit: Studies in the Social History of Canadian Business, 1883-1911. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1974.
- Bliss, M. A Canadian Millionaire: The Life and Times of Sir Joseph Flavelle, Bart., 1858-1939. Toronto: Mcmillan of Canada, 1978.
- Brierley, J.E.C. "Quebec's Civil Law Codification: Viewed and Reviewed". 14 McGill Law Journal 4, (1968), 522-589.

- Brown, R. C. and R. Cook, Canada 1896-1921 A Nation Transformed. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1974.
- Bullen, J. Child Labour in Early Industrial Canada: Working Conditions and Family Responsibilities. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Ottawa University/Universite d'Ottawa, 1990.
- Bullen, J. "Hidden Workers: Child Labour and the Family Economy in Late Nineteenth-Century Urban Ontario". Labour/Le Travail, 18 (Fall 1986), 163-187.
- Christie, E.A. The Presbyterian Church in Canada and Its Official Attitude Towards Public Affairs and Social Problems, 1875-1925. Unpublished Master's Thesis, University of Toronto, 1955.
- Clark, N. Deliver Us from Evil, An Interpretation of American Prohibition. New York: Norton, 1976.
- Cook, R. The Regenerators: Social Criticism in Late Victorian English Canada Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985.
- Crépeau, P.-A. "La Renaissance du droit civil canadien". In A. Morel, et Boucher, J. directeurs. Livre du centenaire du Code Civil vol.1 Montréal: Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1970, xiii-xxx.
- Filas, F.L. The Man Nearest to Christ: Nature and Historic Development of the Devotion to St. Joseph. Milwaukee: The Bruce Publishing Co., 1944.
- Forbes, E. R. "Prohibition and the Social Gospel in Nova Scotia", Acadiensis, 1, 1 (Autumn/Automne, 1971), 12-36.
- Fussell, P. The Great War and Modern Memory. New York: Oxford University Press, 1975.
- Gwynn, S. The Private Capital: Ambition and Love in the age of Macdonald and Laurier. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1984.
- Houghton, W. The Victorian Frame of Mind, 1830-1870. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1957.
- Howes, D. "The Transformation of Quebec Law: From Polyjurality to Monojurality". McGill Law Journal, 32, (1987), 524-558.

- Johnson, W. S. "The Codification of the Common Law". Revue du Barreau, 17, 4 (1957), 165-186.
- Kaplan, F. Dickens. A Biography. New York: William Morrow and Co. Inc., 1988.
- Lukacs, J. "The Bourgeois Interior," American Scholar 39 (1970), 616-630.
- Magney, W. H. "The Methodist Church and the National Gospel, 1884-1914" The Bulletin (1969), 3- 95.
- Masters, D. C. Protestant Church Colleges in Canada: A History. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1966.
- Millard, J. R. The Master Spirit of the Age: Canadian Engineers and the Politics of Professionalism. Toronto: University of Toronto, 1988.
- Mitchison, W. and J. McGinnis, eds. Essays in the History of Canadian Medicine Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1988
- Morel, A. Les Limites de la liberté testamentaire dans le droit civil de la Province de Québec. Préface de R. La Balle. Paris: Librairie Générale de Droit et de Jurisprudence, 1960
- Morel, A. et J. Boucher, directeurs, Livre du centenaire du Code Civil. Vol.1. Montréal: Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1970.
- Morel, A. "La Codification devant l'opinion publique de l'époque". In Livre du Centenaire de la Code Civile au Québec. A. Morel et J. Boucher, directeurs. Montréal: Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1970, 27-45.
- Morton, W. L. ed. The Shield of Achilles: Aspects of Canada in the Victorian Age: Le Bouclier d'Achille Regards sur le Canada de l'ère Victorienne Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1968.
- Nantel, M. "L'Etude du droit et le barreau". La Revue du Barreau, 10, 3, (1950), 97-120.
- O'Brien, K. Oscar Wilde in Canada: An Apostle for the Arts. Toronto: Personal Library, 1982.
- Owram, D. The Promise of Eden The Canadian Expansionist Movement and the Idea of the West 1856-1900. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980.

- Perkin, H.J. The Rise of the Professional Society in England since 1888. London, New York: Routledge, 1989.
- Rowell, N.. "Our Heritage in the Civil and the Common Law" Canadian Bar Review XII, 7 (1934), 393-405.
- Russell, P. ed. Nationalism in Canada. Toronto: McGraw Hill, 1966.
- The Cambridge History of The Bible. 3 vols. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963-1970.
- Thompson, J. H. The Harvests of War: The Prairie West, 1914-1918. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1978.
- Thompson, F. M. L. The Rise of Respectable Society: A Social History of Victorian Britain, 1830-1900. London: Fontana, 1988.
- Trudel, G. Traité de droit civil du Québec. Tome II. Montréal: Wilson et Lafleur, 1942.
- Wade, W. C. The Titanic: End of a Dream. <1979> Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1981
- Waite, P. The Man From Halifax. Sir John Thompson, Prime Minister. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985.
- Wiebe, R. The Search for Order, 1877-1920. New York: Hill and Wang, 1967.
- Young, G.M. Portrait of An Age: Victorian England. <1936> London: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Young, B. George Etienne Cartier: Montreal Bourgeois. Montreal: McGill Queen's Press, 1981.
- Young, B. and J. Dickenson, A Short History of Quebec: A Socio-Economic Perspective. Toronto: Copp, Clark, Pitman, 1988.
- Zeller, S. Inventing Canada Early Victorian Science and The Idea of a Transcontinental Nation. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1987.

## 2. Space

- Burnett, J. A Social History of Housing, 1815-1970. Newton Abbott, North Pomfret: David and Charles, 1978.
- Collin, J.-P. "La Cité sur mesure: Spécialisation sociale de l'espace et autonomie municipale dans la banlieue montréalaise, 1875-1920". Urban History Review/ Revue Histoire Urbaine, XIII, 1, (June/juin 1984), 19-34.
- Collard, E. The Saint James Club: The Story of the Beginnings of the Saint James Club Montreal: Gazette Printing Co, 1957.
- Collard, E. Call Back Yesterdays Don Mills: Longmans Canada, 1965.
- Collard, E. Montreal Yesterdays (2nd. ed. rev.) Don Mills: Longmans Canada, 1963.
- Cooper, J. Montreal, the Story of Three Hundred Years Montreal: Impr. de Lamirande, 1942.
- Copp, T. Anatomy of Poverty Conditions of the Working Class in Montreal, 1897-1929 Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1974.
- Douglas, M. A History of the Service of the Protection of Women and Children in Montreal. Masters thesis, School of Social Work, McGill University, Montreal, 1967.
- Dufresne, S. "Le Carnaval d'hiver de Montréal, 1803-1889". Urban History Review/Revue d'histoire urbaine, XI, 3 (February/février, 1983), 25-46.
- Fournier, D. "Consanguinité et sociabilité dans la zone de Montréal au début du siècle", Recherches sociographiques, XXIV, 3 (septembre, decembre 1983), 307-323.
- Frost, D. ed. Montreal Geographical Papers. Occasional Papers in Geography, No.1. Montreal: Concordia University, 1981.
- Girouard, M. Cities and People A Social and Architectural History. New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 1985.

- Goheen, P. G. "Communications and Urban Systems in Mid-Nineteenth Century Canada". Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, XIV, 3 (February/fevrier 1986), 235-245.
- Gubbay, A. and S. Hoof, Montreal's Little Mountain A Portrait of Westmount/La Petite Montagne Un Portrait de Westmount. Montreal: Trillium Books, 1979.
- Handlin, D. The American Home: Architecture and Society 1815-1915. Boston: Little Brown, 1979.
- Hanna, D. "Creation of an Early Victorian Suburb in Montreal". Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, IX, 2 (October/octobre, 1980), 38-64.
- Hanna, D. and S. Olson, "'Métiers, loyers et bouts de rue: l'armature de la société montréalaise, 1881 à 1901". Cahiers de géographie du Québec, 27, 71 (1983), 225-276.
- Hanna, D. The New Town of Montreal: Creation of an Upper Middle Class Suburb on the Slope of Mount Royal. M.A. Thesis, University of Toronto, Toronto, 1977.
- Historical Atlas of Canada: Addressing the Twentieth Century. Vol. III. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990.
- Jenkins, K. Montreal, Island City of the St. Lawrence. New York: Doubleday, 1966.
- Linteau, P.-A. et Robert, J.-C. "Montréal au 19e siècle: bilan d'une recherche". Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, XIII, 3 (February/fevrier 1985), 207-223.
- Linteau, P.-A. "Quelques réflexions autour de la bourgeoisie québécoise, 1850-1914". Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française, 30, 1 (Juin 1976), 55-66.
- Linteau, P.-A. Maisonnette, ou comment les promoteurs fabriquent une ville. Montréal: Boreal, 1981.
- Linteau, P.-A. "Montréal, 1850-1914". Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1, 75 (June/juin 1975), 31-35.
- Linteau, P.-A., R. Durocher and J.-C. Robert, Quebec A History, 1867-1929. Translated by R. Chodos. Toronto: J. Lorimer, 1983.

- MacKay, D. The Square Mile: Merchant Princes of Montreal. Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1987.
- Marsan, J.-C. Montreal in Evolution, Montreal: McGill Queen's Press, 1981.
- Metcalfe, A. "The Evolution of Organized Physical Recreation in Montreal, 1840-1895". Histoire sociale/Social History, XI, 21, (mai/May 1978), 144-166.
- Morrow, D. A Sporting Evolution: The Montreal Amateur Athletic Association, 1881-1981 Montreal: M.A.A.A. and Don Morrow, 1985.
- Olson, S. "Occupations and Residential Spaces in Nineteenth Century Montreal". Historical Methods, 22, 3 (1989), 81-96.
- Olson, S. "Occupations as Clues to Social Structure in Nineteenth Century Montreal/ Les Proffessions indices de la structure sociale de Montréal, 1861-1891". Shared Spaces No.4, (1986), 1-52.
- Robert, J.-C. "Urbanization et population: Le Cas de Montréal en 1861". Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique Française, 35, 4 (mars 1982), 523-535.
- Robert, J.-C. "The City of Wealth and Death: Urban Mortality in Montreal, 1821-1871". In Essays in the History of Canadian Medicine. Edited by W. Mitchison, and J. McGinnis. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1988, 18-38.
- Rumilly, R. Histoire de Montréal. Vol. 4. Montréal: Fides, 1972.
- Rybczynski, W. Home A Short History of an Idea. New York: Penguin Books, 1986.
- Tunbridge, J. E. "Separation of Residence from Workplace: A Kingston Example". Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, 78, 3 (February/fevrier 1979), 23-33
- van Nus, W. "The Role of Suburban Government in the City-Building Process: The case of Notre Dames de Graces, Quebec, 1876-1910". Urban History Review/ Revue d'histoire urbaine, XVIII, 2 (October/ octobre 1984), 91-103.

- Warner, S. B. Streetcar Suburbs The Process of Growth in Boston, 1870-1900. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1962.
- Weisz, G. "The Geographical Origins and Destinations of Medical Graduates in Quebec, 1834-1939". Histoire sociale/Social History, XIX, 37 (mai-May 1986), 93-119.
- Westley, M. Remembrances of Grandeur: Montreal's Anglo Protestant Elite, 1900-1950. Montreal: Libre Expression, 1990.
- Wolfe, J. and G. Strachan, "Practical Idealism: Women in Urban Reform, Julia Drummond and the Montreal Parks and Playgrounds Association". In Life Spaces: Gender, Household, Employment. Edited by C. Andrew and B. M. Milroy. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1988, 65-80.
- Wright, G. Moralism and the Model Home: Domestic Architecture and Cultural Conflict in Chicago, 1873-1913. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980.

### 3. Literary Criticism

- Adams, J. Women Writing About Men. New York: Pantheon Books, 1986.
- Auerbach, N. Women and The Demon, The Life of A Victorian Myth. Harvard University Press: Cambridge, Mass., 1982.
- Avery, G. Childhood's Patterns A Study of Heroes and Heroines in Children's Fiction. London: Hodder and Stroughton, 1975.
- Baker, G. B., K. E. Fisher, V. Masciotra, and B. Young, Sources in the Law Library of McGill University for a Reconstruction of the Legal Culture in Quebec, 1760-1890. Montreal: Faculty of Law, and Montreal Business History Project, 1987.
- Berger, C. "The True North Strong and Free". In Nationalism in Canada. Edited by Peter Russell. Toronto: McGraw Hill, 1966, 3-26

- Bissell, C. "Literary Taste in Central Canada During the Late Nineteenth Century" Canadian Historical Review 31, 3 (September 1950), 237-51.
- Brown, R. D. "Modernization: A Victorian Climax". In Victorian America. Edited by D. W. Howe. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1976. 29-46.
- Cadogan, M. and P. Craig, You're a Brick Angela: A New Look at Girl's Fiction from 1839 to 1975. London: Gollanz, 1976.
- Carr, G. B. Images and Symbols of Children and Youth in Selected English-Canadian Novels, 1890-1914. Unpublished M.A., Queen's University, Kingston, 1979.
- Denning, M. "Cheap Stories: Notes on Popular Fiction and Working-Class Culture in Nineteenth Century America". History Workshop, 22 (autumn 1986), 1-18
- Douglas, A. The Feminization of American Culture. <1977>. 2nd. edition. New York: Avon, 1988.
- Dreher, D. E. Damnation and Defiance: Fathers and Daughters in Shakespeare. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1986.
- Dunae, P. "Boy's Literature and The Idea of Empire, 1870-1914". Victorian Studies, 24, 1 (1980), 105-121.
- Flemming, J. "Historians and the Evidence of Literature", Journal of Interdisciplinary History, IV, I (Summer, 1973), 95-105.
- Forster, E. M. Aspects of the Novel. <1927> Introduction by O. Stallybrass. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1985.
- Frye, N. The Great Code The Bible and Literature. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Jovanovich, 1983.
- Garrison, D. "Immoral Fiction in the Late Victorian Library". In Victorian America. Edited by D. W. Howe. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1976. 141-159.
- Gilbert, S. and S. Gubar, The Madwomen in The Attic The Women Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979.

- Greene, T. America's Heroes: The Changing Models of Success in American Magazines. New York: Oxford University Press, 1970.
- Harris, C. "The Myth of the Land in Canadian Nationalism". In Nationalism in Canada. Edited by P. Russell. Toronto: McGraw Hill, 1966. 27-43.
- Hart, J. The Popular Book A History of America's Literary Taste. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1963.
- Harvey, L.-G. and M. Olson, "La circulation de la bibliothèque de l'Institut canadien de Montréal, 1865-1875", Histoire sociale/Social History, XIX, 37 (mai-May 1986), 139-160.
- Hynes, S. A War Imagined The First World War and English Culture. London: The Bodley Head, 1990.
- Johnson, W. S. Sons and Fathers: The Generation Link in Literature, 1780-1980. P. Lang: New York, 1985.
- Klink, C. et al eds. Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1965.
- Lamonde, Y. Les Bibliothèques de collectivités à Montréal (17e-19e siècles). Montréal: Ministère des Affaires culturelles Bibliothèque Nationale du Québec, 1979.
- Laurie, A. Don't Tell the Grown-Ups. Subversive Children's Literature. Boston: Little, Brown and Co., 1990.
- Lemieux, D. Une Culture de nostalgie. L'enfant dans le roman québécois de ses origines à nos jours. Montréal: Boréal Express, 1984.
- Manning, S. "Families in Dickens". In Changing Images of The Family. Edited by V. Tuffe and B. G. Myerhoff. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979. 141-153.
- McKillop, A. B. Disciplined Intelligence: Critical Inquiry and Canadian Thought in the Victorian Era. Montreal: McGill Queen's Press, 1979.
- Miller, J. Women Writing About Men. New York: Pantheon Books, 1986.
- Motley, W. The American Abraham: James Fenimore Cooper and The Frontier Patriarch. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1987.

- Moyles, R.G., ed., English Canadian Literature to 1900. A Guide to Information Sources. Detroit: Gales Research Co., 1976.
- Moyles, R.G. and D. O'ram, Imperial Dreams and Colonial Realities: British Views of Canada, 1880-1914. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1988.
- Palamari, D. "The Shark Who Swallowed His Epoch: Family, Nature and Society in the Novels of Emile Zola". In Changing Images of The Family. Edited by V. Tuffe and B. G. Myerhoff. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979, 155-172.
- Roper, G. "New Forces and New Fictions, 1880-1920". In Literary History of Canada: Canadian Literature in English. Edited by Carl Klink, et al. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1965, 274-297.
- Sadoff, D. F. Monsters of Affection: Dickens, Eliot and Bronte on Fatherhood. Baltimore: John's Hopkins University Press, 1982.
- Smart, P. Ecrire dans la maison du père: L'émergence du féminin dans la tradition littéraire du Québec. Montréal: Québec/Amérique, 1988.
- Townsend, J. R. Written for Children: An Outline of English Language Children's Literature. Harmondsworth: Kestrel Books, 1974.
- Vinson, J. ed. Great Writers of the English Language: Novelists and Prose Writers. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1979.
- Walden, K. "The Great March of the Mounted Police in Popular Literature, 1873-1973", Historical Papers, 1980, 33-57.
- Watt, F. "Nationalism in Canadian Literature". In Nationalism in Canada. Edited by P. Russell. Toronto: McGraw Hill, 1966, 235-251.
- White, J. When Words Lose Their Meaning: Constitutions and Reconstitutions of Language, Character, and Community. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984.
- Wise, S. F. "Sermon Literature and Canadian Intellectual History" The Bulletin, (1966), 3-18

Zipes, J. Fairy Tales and The Art of Subversion: The Classical Genre for Children and the Process of Civilization. New York: Wildeman, 1983.

#### 4. Family and Gender Studies

##### 4.1 Family

Adams, A. "Architecture in the Family Way 1870-1914" delivered at the McGill Center for the Study of Women, Fall 1990.

Andrew, C. and B. M. Milroy, eds. Life Spaces: Gender, Household, Employment. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1988.

Ariès, P. L'Enfant et la vie familiale sous l'Ancien Régime. <1959> Nouvelle édition. Paris: Seuil, 1973.

Ariès, P. et G. Duby, (directeurs) Histoire de la vie privée. Vols. 1-4. Paris: Seuil, 1985-1989.

Backhouse, C. "Shifting Patterns in Nineteenth-Century Canadian Custody Law". In Essays in the History of Canadian Law. Vol. 1. Edited by D. Flaherty. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1981, 212-248

Bailey, B. From Front Porch to Back Seat: Courtship in Twentieth Century America. Baltimore: John's Hopkins University Press, 1988.

Bliss, M. "Pure Books on Avoided Subjects: Pre Freudian Sexual Ideas in Canada". Historical Papers, (1970), 89-108.

Bonnekamp, D. "The Best Interest Principle and the Adjudication of Custody". In Unravelling Fatherhood. Edited by T. Knijn and A.-C. Mulder. Dordrecht-Holland/Providence-USA: Foris Publications, 1987, 62-74.

Bouchard, G. "L'étude des structures familiale pré-industrielles: pour un renversement des perspectives". Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine, 28, (1981), 545-571.

- Bradbury, B. "Pigs, Cows and Boarders: Non Wage Forms of Survival among Montreal Families, 1861-91". Labour/Le Travail, 14 (Fall 1984), 9-46
- Bradbury, B. "The Family Economy and Work in an Industrializing City: Montreal in the 1870's". Historical Papers, (1979), 71-96.
- Cohen, E. S. "Fond Fathers, Devoted Daughters? Family Sentiment in Seventeenth Century France". Histoire sociale/Social History, XIX, 38 (novembre-November 1986), 343-363.
- Cominos, P. T. "Late-Victorian Sexual Respectability and The Social System" International Review of Social History 8 (1963), 18-48 and 216-50.
- Davidoff, L. and Hall, C. Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle Class, 1780-1850 London: Hutchison, 1984.
- de Mause, L. ed. The History of Childhood New York: Harper and Row, 1976.
- Demos, J. A Little Commonwealth: Family Life in Plymouth Colony New York: Oxford University Press, 1970.
- Demos, J. "Images of the American Family, Then and Now". In Changing Images of The Family. Edited by V. Tuffe and B. G. Myerhoff. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979, 43-60.
- Dinnerstein, D. The Mermaid and The Minotaur: Sexual Arrangements and Human Malaise. New York and London: Harper and Row Publishers, 1976.
- Erickson, E. Childhood and Society. New York: Norton, 1963.
- Filene, P. Him/Her/Self: Sex Roles in Modern America. <1975>. 2nd. ed. Baltimore: John's Hopkins University Press, 1986.
- Flandrin, J.-L. "Histoire de la famille et histoire des mentalités", Historical Papers, (1983), 136-146.
- Flandrin, J.-L. Familles, parenté, maison, sexualité dans l'ancienne société. Paris: Hachette, 1976.
- Gérin, L. Le type économique et social des Canadiens. Montréal: Fides, 1948.

- Greven, P. The Protestant Temperament: Patterns of Child-Rearing, Religious Experience, and The Self in Early America. New York: Knopf, 1977.
- Griswold, R. L. Family and Divorce in California, 1850-1980. Illusions and Everyday Realities. Albany: SUNY Press, 1982.
- Grossberg, M. Governing the Hearth: Law and the Family in Nineteenth-Century America. Chapel Hill, N. C.: University of North Carolina Press, 1985.
- Haraven, T. "Family Time and Industrial Time: Family and Work in a Planned Corporation Town, 1900-1924". In Family and Kin in Urban Communities, 1770-1930. Edited by T.K. Haraven. New York: New Viewpoints, 1977. 187-202.
- Hardyment, C. Dream Babies. Three Centuries of Good Advice on Child Care. New York, Harper and Row Publishers, 1981.
- Henretta, J. A. "Families and Farms: Mentalite in Pre-Industrial America". The William and Mary Quarterly, 35, 1 (1978), 3-32.
- Jones, A. and L. Rutman, In the Children's Aid: J.J. Kelso and Child Welfare in Ontario. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980.
- Kagan, J. The Nature of the Child. New York: Basic Books: 1984.
- Kett, J. F. Rites of Passage: Adolescence in America 1790 to the Present. New York: Basic Books, 1977.
- Lacelle, C. "Les Domestiques dans les villes canadiennes au XIXe siècle: effectifs et conditions de vie". Histoire sociale-Social History, XV, 29 (mai/May 1982), 181-208.
- Lacelle C. Urban Domestic Servants in 19th Century Canada. Ottawa: Environment Canada Parks, 1987.
- Lamonde, Y. "La sociabilité et l'histoire soci-culturelle: le cas de Montréal, 1760-1880". Historical Papers, (1987), 86-111.
- Lasch, C. Haven in a Heartless World, the Family Beseiged. New York: Basic Books, 1977.
- Lasch, C. The Culture of Narcissism American Life in an age

- of Diminishing Expectations. New York: Norton, 1978.
- Laslett, P. The World We Have Lost. 2nd. edition, New York: Scribner, 1973.
- McLaren, A. and A. McLaren, The Bedroom and The State: The Changing Practices and Politics of Contraception and Abortion in Canada 1880-1980. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1986.
- Minnow, M. "'Forming Underneath Everything That Grows": Towards a History of Family Law". Wisconsin Law Review, 759 (1985), 819-898.
- Mintz, S. A Prison of Expectations. The Family in Victorian Culture. New York, London: New York University Press, 1983.
- Mintz S. and S. Kellogg, Domestic Revolutions: A Social History of American Family Life. New York, London: The Free Press, 1988.
- Moore, E. G. and B. S. Osbourne, "Marital Fertility in Kingston, 1861-1881: A Study of Socio-Economic Differentials". Histoire sociale/Social History, XX, 39 (mai/May 1987), 9-27.
- Morgan, E. The Puritan Family: Religion and Domestic Relations in Seventeenth-Century New England rev. ed. New York: Harper and Row, 1966.
- O'Neill, W. L. Divorce in the Progressive Era. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967.
- Ozment, S. When Father Ruled: Family Life in Reformation Europe. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983.
- Pagels, E. Adam, Eve and The Serpent. New York: Random House, 1988.
- Parr, J. ed. Childhood and Family in Canadian History. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1982.
- Parr, J. Labouring Children: British Immigrant Apprentices to Canada, 1869-1924. Montreal, London: McGill Queen's Press, Croom Helm, 1980.
- Pollock, L. ed. A Lasting Relationship: Parents and Children over Three Centuries. Hanover, N.H.: University Press of New England, 1987.

- Pollock, L. Forgotten Children: Parent-child Relations, 1500-1900. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Rooke, P. and R. Schnell, "Childhood and Charity in Nineteenth-Century British North America". Histoire sociale/Social History, XV, 29 (mai-May 1982), 157-179.
- Rosenberg, C. "Sexuality, Class and Role in 19th-Century America", <1973 in American Quarterly>. In The American Man. Edited by E. Pleck and J. Pleck. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall, 1980, 219-154.
- Ryan, M. Cradle of the Middle Class: The Family in Oneida County, New York, 1790-1865. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1981.
- Savage, G. "The Divorce Court and the Queen's/King's Proctor: Legal Patriarchy and the Sanctity of Marriage in England, 1861-1937". Historical Papers, (1989), 210-227.
- Segalen, M. Mari et Femme dans la société paysanne. Paris: Flammarion, 1980.
- Semple, N. "The Nurture and Admonition of the Lord": Nineteenth Century Canadian Methodism's Response to Childhood". Histoire sociale/Social History, XIV, 27 (mai-May, 1981), 460-475.
- Shorter, E. The Making of The Modern Family. Basic Books: New York, 1975
- Smith-Rosenberg, C. Disorderly Conduct: Visions of Gender in Victorian America. New York: A.A. Knopf, 1985.
- Snell, J. "'The White Life for Two': The Defense of Marriage and Sexual Morality in Canada, 1890-1914". Histoire sociale/Social History, XVI, 31 (Mai/May, 1983), 111-28.
- Stone, L. The Family, Sex and Marriage in England, 1500-1800. New York: Harper and Row, 1977.
- Sutherland, N. Children in English Canadian Society: Framing the Twentieth Century Consensus. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1976.

- Sutherland, N. "'To Create a Strong and Healthy Race ": School Children in the Public Health Movement, 1880-1914" History of Education Quarterly, 12, 3 (1972), 304-333.
- Teitelbaum, L. E. "Family History and Family Law". Wisconsin Law Review, 759 (1985), 1135-1181.
- Thomas, M.P. "Child Abuse and Neglect Part 1: Historical overview, Legal Matrix, and Social Perspectives". North Carolina Law Review, 50 (1972), 294-328.
- Thompson, E. P. "The Grid of Inheritance". In Family and Inheritance: Rural Society in Western Europe, 1200-1800. Edited by J. Goody, E.P. Thompson and J. Thirsk. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1976, 328-360.
- Troyansky, D.G. Old Age in the Old Regime Image and Experience in Eighteenth Century France. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989.
- Trudgill, E. Madonnas and Magdalenes: The Origins and Development of Victorian Sexual Attitudes. New York: Holmes and Meier, 1976.
- Walvin, J. A Child's World: A Social History of English Childhood, 1800-1914. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1982.
- Ward, P. Courtship, Love and Marriage in Nineteenth Century English Canada. Montreal: McGill Queen's Press, 1990.
- Wishy, B. The Child and The Republic: The Dawn of American Child Nurture. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1968.
- Wohl, A. ed. The Victorian Family: Structure and Stresses. London: Croom Helm, 1977.
- Wolff, L. Postcards From The End of The World: Child Abuse in Freud's Vienna. New York: Atheneum, 1988.
- Zainaldin, J.S. "The Emergence of a Modern American Family Law Child Custody, Adoption, and the Courts, 1795-1851". Northwestern University Law Review, 73, 6 (1979) 1038-1089
- Zeliner, V.A.R. Pricing the Priceless Child: The Changing Social Value of Children. New York: Basic Books, 1985.

## 4.2 Women

- Abelson, E. S. "The Invention of Kleptomania". Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society (Signs), 15, 1 (1989), 123-143.
- Bacchi, C. "Race Regeneration and Social Purity. A Study of the Social Attitudes of Canada's English-Speaking Suffragists". Histoire sociale/Social History, XI, 22 (novembre/November 1978), 460-474.
- Bacci, C. Liberation Deferred: The Ideas of the English-Canadian Suffragists. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983.
- Backhouse, C. "Nineteenth-Century Canadian Prostitution Law: Reflections of a Discriminating Society". Histoire sociale/Social History, XVIII, 36 (novembre/November 1985), 387-424.
- Bloch, R.H. "American Feminine Ideals in Transition: the Rise of the Moral Mother, 1785-1815". Feminist Studies, 4, 2 (1978), 100-126.
- Boose, L. E. and B. S. Flowers, eds. Daughters and Fathers. Baltimore, London, The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989.
- Branca, P. The Silent Sisterhood: Middle Class Woman in the Victorian Home. Pittsburg: Carnegie Mellon University Press, 1975.
- Cross, S. "The Neglected Majority: The Changing Role of Women in 19th Century Montreal". Histoire sociale/Social History, VI, 12 (novembre/November, 1973), 202-223
- Dally, A. Inventing Motherhood: The Consequences of an Ideal. London: Burnett Books, 1982.
- Danylewycz, M. Taking the Veil: An Alternative to Marriage, Motherhood and Sinisterhood in Quebec, 1840-1920. Edited and with an introduction by P.-A. Linteau, A. Prentice, and W. Westfall. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1987.
- Gordon, L. "Single Mothers and Child Neglect, 1880-1920".

American Quarterly, 37, 2 (summer, 1985), 173-192.

Holcombe, L. Wives and Property: Reform of the Married Woman's Property Law in 19th Century England. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1983.

Kealey, L. ed. A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880's-1920's. Toronto: Canadian Women's Educational Press, 1979.

Kniebiehler, Y. et Fouquet, C. Histoire des mères, du Moyen Age à nos jours. Paris: Hachette <Pluriel>, 1982.

Le Collectif Clio, L'Histoire des femmes au Québec depuis quatre siècles. Montréal: Quinze, 1982.

Lemieux, D. et L. Mercier, Les Femmes au tournant du siècle, 1880-1914. Ages de la vie, maternité et quotidien. Québec: Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture, 1989.

Levesque, A. "Le Bordel: Milieu de travail contrôlé". Labour/ Le Travail, 20 (Fall 1987), 13-32.

Mitchison, W. "The WCTU: 'For God, Home and Native Land': A Study in Nineteenth-Century Feminism". In A Not Unreasonable Claim: Women and Reform in Canada, 1880's-1920's. Edited by L. Kealey. Toronto: Canadian Women's Educational Press, 1979, 151-167.

Mitchison, W. "The YWCA and Reform in the Nineteenth Century". Histoire sociale/Social History, XII, 24 (novembre/November 1979), 368-384.

Van Kirk, S. Tender Ties: Women in Fur-Trade Society in Western Canada, 1670-1870. Winnipeg: Watson and Dwyer Publishers, 1980.

Ward, P. "Unwed Motherhood in Nineteenth-Century English Canada", Historical Papers, (1981), 34-56.

Warner, M. Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and The Cult of The Virgin Mary. London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1976.

Welter, B. "The Cult of True Womanhood 1820-1860". American Quarterly, XVIII, 2 (Summer 1966), 151-174.

## 4.3 Men

- Benson, L. Fatherhood. New York: Random House, 1968.
- Bly, R. Iron John A Book About Men. Reading, Mass, New York, Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc., 1990.
- Chandos, J. Boys Together, English Public Schools, 1800-1864. Hutchison: London, 1984.
- Christ, C. "Victorian Masculinity and The Angel in The House". In A Widening Sphere: Changing Roles of Victorian Women. Edited by M. Vicinus. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977, 146-162.
- Darmon, P. Trial by Impotence. Virility and Marriage in Pre-Revolutionary France. <1979> Translated by Paul Keegan. London: Chatto and Windus, 1985.
- Delaisi de Parseval, G. La part du père. Paris: Seuil, 1981.
- Deleury, E., Rivet, M. et Nault, J.-M. "De la Puissance paternelle à l'autorité parentale: Une institution en voie de trouver sa vraie finalité", Cahier de Droit, 15, 1974, 779-870.
- Dubbert, J. A Man's Place: Masculinity in Transition. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall, 1979.
- Demos, J. "The Changing Faces of Fatherhood". In Past, Present and Personal: The Family and the Life Course in American History. Edited by J. Demos. New York: Oxford University Press, 1986, 41-67.
- Dolan, C. "Géniteur ou gestionnaire? L'image du père à Aix-en-Provence au XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle". Histoire sociale/Social History, XVIII, 35 (mai-May 1985), 29-43.
- Filene, P. "Between a Rock and a Soft Place". South Atlantic Quarterly, 84, 4 (Autumn, 1988), 336-355.
- Kniebihler, Y. Les Pères aussi ont une histoire. Paris: Hachette, 1987.

Lowe, N.V. "The Legal Status of Fathers: Past and Present". In The Father Figure. Edited by L. McKee and M. O'Brien. London, New York: Tavistock Publications, 1982, 26-42.

MacLeod, D. "A Live Vaccine: the Y.M.C.A. and Male Adolescence in the United States and Canada, 1870-1920". Histoire sociale/Social History, XI, 21, (mai/May 1978), 5-25.

Mangan, J. and J. Walvin, eds. Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1987.

Maynard, S. "Rough Work and Rugged Men: The Social Construction of Masculinity in Working-Class History". Labour/ Le Travail 23 (Spring 1989), 159-169.

McKee, L. and M. O'Brien, eds. The Father Figure. London, New York: Tavistock Publications, 1982.

Mott, M. "One Solution to the Urban crisis: Manly Sports and Winnipeggers, 1900-1914". Urban History Review/ Revue Histoire Urbaine, XII, 2 (October/octobre 1983), 57-76.

Mrozek, D. "The Habit of Victory: The American Military and the Cult of Manliness". In Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America, 1800-1940. Edited by J. Mangan and J. Walvin. Manchester: University of Manchester Press, 1987, 220-241.

Murphy, P. F. "Towards a Feminist Masculinity". Feminist Studies, 15, 2 (summer 1989), 351-361.

Osherson, S. Finding Our Fathers: The Unfinished Business of Manhood. New York, London: Free Press, Collier Macmillan, 1986.

Owen, U. ed. Fathers: Reflections by Daughters. London: Virago Press, 1983

Pleck E. and J. Pleck, eds. The American Man Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall, 1980.

Roberts, D. "The Paterfamilias of the Victorian Governing Classes". In The Victorian Family: Structure and Stresses. Edited by A. Wohl. London: Croom Helm, 1977, 35-51.

Roche, D. "L'amour paternel à Paris au XVIIIe siècle" Annales de démographie historique (1963), 73-80.

Rotundo, E. "Learning about Manhood: Gender Ideals and The Middle Class Family in Nineteenth Century America". In Manliness and Morality: Middle Class Masculinity in Britain and America, 1800-1940. Edited by J. Mangan and J. Walvin. Manchester: University of Manchester Press, 1987, 35-51.

Rotundo, E. Manhood in America: The Northern Middle Class, 1770-1920. Unpublished PhD. Brandeis, 1982.

Stearns, P. Be a Man! Males in Modern Society New York: Holmes and Meier Publishers, Inc., 1979.

Suitor, J. J. "Husband's Participation in Childbirth: A Nineteenth Century Phenomenon". Journal of Family History, 6, 3 (Fall 1981), 278-293.

Towle, A. ed. Fathers. A Collection of Tributes, Insults, Observations and Asides From the Famous, the Infamous and the Rest of Us. Montreal: Eden Press, 1986.

Turgeon, J. "Le Contrôle judiciaire de l'autorité parentale". In Livre du Centenaire du Code Civil au Québec. A. Morel et J. Boucher, directeurs. Montréal: Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 1967. pp. 75-79.

Vance, N. Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought. Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1985.

Wyatt-Brown, B. Southern Honour: Ethics and Behaviour in the Old South. New York: Oxford University Press, 1982.