Creating Sustainable Economic Development
Within Two B.C. First Nations Communities:
A Rights-Based Approach

Titilope I. Kunkel
B.Sc., Computer Science, University of Lagos, Nigeria, 1989
MBA, Thames Valley University, London, England, 1994

Thesis Submitted In Partial Fulfillment Of
The Requirements For The Degree Of
Master Of Natural Resources And Environmental Studies

The University of Northern British Columbia
April 2008
© Titilope I. Kunkel
NOTICE:
The author has granted a non-exclusive license allowing Library and Archives Canada to reproduce, publish, archive, preserve, conserve, communicate to the public by telecommunication or on the Internet, loan, distribute and sell theses worldwide, for commercial or non-commercial purposes, in microform, paper, electronic and/or any other formats.

The author retains copyright ownership and moral rights in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

In compliance with the Canadian Privacy Act some supporting forms may have been removed from this thesis.

While these forms may be included in the document page count, their removal does not represent any loss of content from the thesis.

AVIS:
L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque et Archives Canada de reproduire, publier, archiver, sauvegarder, conserver, transmettre au public par télécommunication ou par l'Internet, prêter, distribuer et vendre des thèses partout dans le monde, à des fins commerciales ou autres, sur support microforme, papier, électronique et/ou autres formats.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur et des droits moraux qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

Conformément à la loi canadienne sur la protection de la vie privée, quelques formulaires secondaires ont été enlevés de cette thèse.

Bien que ces formulaires aient inclus dans la pagination, il n'y aura aucun contenu manquant.
ABSTRACT

Rural First Nation peoples traditionally sustained their economy through hunting, gathering and fishing. These traditional ways are now threatened by the national and global economies of Westernized societies. For the continued independence and development of First Nations communities, there is a need for them to participate in the wider economy. These communities now face daunting obstacles to development. Some of these obstacles include low human capital and the means to develop it, long term effects of marginalization, lack of control over available natural resources, and distance from Service Centres.

A rights-based approach offers unique ways of addressing some of the development challenges that are prevalent in some rural First Nations communities in British Columbia by transforming needs into rights. The approach offers solutions which are participatory. Individuals and communities are empowered beyond the charity and welfare models. A rights-based approach to development transforms needs into rights and places a responsibility on the government in question to provide sustainable solutions. The inquiry identified the economic situation and development challenges faced by two rural First Nation communities in British Columbia, the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations, and suggested a framework for development.
5.5.3  First Nations Economic Development Recommendations 132
5.5.4  Recommendations for the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations 134
5.5.4.1 Community Vision, Values, and Principles 136
5.5.4.2 Community Goals 136
5.5.4.3 Separating Business From Politics 137
5.5.4.4 Empowering People, Promoting Social Enterprises and Entrepreneurship 138
5.5.4.5 Development Priorities for the Nazko and Esket Communities 140
5.6  Areas of Further Research on Creating Sustainable Economic Development 141
5.6.1 First Nations Development Indicators 142
5.6.2 The Role of First Nations Women in Economic Development 144
5.7  Summary and Conclusion 145

Bibliography 147

Literature Cited 147

Film and Videotapes 158
LIST OF TABLES

1.1 Similarities and Differences Between the Esketemc and Nazko Communities 6

2.1 Differences Between Aboriginal Title Land and Other Forms of Land Title 18

2.2 Differences Between the Economic World View and the Indigenous World View 28

2.3 2001 Community Profiles: Williams Lake and Quesnel 45

2.4 2001 Labour Force and Economic Sectors: Williams Lake and Quesnel 46

2.5 Leading Employers in the Quesnel Area, 2004 47

2.6 Leading Employers in the Williams Lake Area, 2007 47

2.7 Degrees of Resource Reliance 48

2.8a Obstacles or Barriers to Development 52

2.8b Obstacles or Barriers to Development 53

2.9 Different Organizational Focus 54

4.1 2001 Community Profiles: Esket and Nazko 87

4.2 2001 Community Workforce: Esket and Nazko 90

4.3 2001 Community Health and Well-being: Esket and Nazko 91

4.4 2001 Education: Esket and Nazko 93

4.5 2001 Income and Earnings: Esket and Nazko 95

4.6a Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions 103

4.6b Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions 105

4.6c Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions 106

4.6d Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions 107

4.6e Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions 108

4.7 Critical Success Factors and Sustainability of Development 110

5.1 Emerging Themes for Creating Sustainable Economic Development Within First Nations Communities 119

5.2a Applicable Human Rights and Governmental Responsibilities 129

5.2b Applicable Human Rights and Governmental Responsibilities 130
5.2c  Applicable Human Rights and Governmental Responsibilities 131
5.3  Recommended Development Priorities for the Nazko and Esket Communities 141
5.4  Suggested First Nations Development Indexes 142
5.5  Composite Indicators for Suggested Traditional Ecological Knowledge Index 143
5.6  Composite Indicators for Suggested Traditional Activities Index 143
LIST OF FIGURES

1.1 First Nations Territories and Protected Areas in B.C. ............................................. 5
1.2 First Nations Peoples of British Columbia ................................................................. 7
1.3 Magnitude of the Mountain Pine Beetle Epidemic ....................................................... 10
3.1 Sources of Data ........................................................................................................... 68
3.2 The Coding Process ................................................................................................... 81
5.1 Development Framework for the Nazko and Esket Communities ................................. 135
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>Aboriginal Business Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACOA</td>
<td>Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.C.</td>
<td>British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCFNFC</td>
<td>BC First Nations Forestry Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCFNCEDF</td>
<td>B.C. First Nations Community Economic Development Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCTC</td>
<td>B.C. Treaty Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFDC</td>
<td>Community Futures Development Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIDA</td>
<td>Canadian International Development Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSSP</td>
<td>Clayoquot Sound Scientific Panel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSTC</td>
<td>Carrier Sekani Tribal Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CURA</td>
<td>Community University Research Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIAND</td>
<td>Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNEDF</td>
<td>First Nations Economic Development Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNMPBI</td>
<td>First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FNTC</td>
<td>First Nations Technology Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRA</td>
<td>Forest and Range Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRO</td>
<td>Forest and Range Opportunity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDC</td>
<td>Inuvialuit Development Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INAC</td>
<td>Indian and Northern Affairs Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LHF</td>
<td>Legacy of Hope Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOFR</td>
<td>Ministry of Forest and Range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non Government Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRCan</td>
<td>Natural Resources Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OIBDCC</td>
<td>Osoyoos Indian Band Development Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QCEDC</td>
<td>Quesnel Community Economic Development Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBA</td>
<td>Rights Based Approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCAP</td>
<td>Royal Commission on Aboriginal People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSBC</td>
<td>Royal Services British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCBC</td>
<td>Supreme Court of British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEK</td>
<td>Traditional Ecological Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNBC</td>
<td>University of Northern British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WLEDO</td>
<td>Williams Lake Economic Development Office</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am deeply indebted to the Chief and Council, and Administrative members of the Nazko Band. I appreciate the opportunity they gave to me to work with them and the community, and to learn first hand about First Nations people in Canada. I would like to acknowledge the works of Chief Delores Alec, Lee Melnyk, Laurell Crocker, Bernice Cremo, Doreen Patrick, and Geneva Irwin which provided the foundation for my work, both with the Nazko Band and my research studies. My appreciation goes to the Chief and Council of the Esketemc First Nation for giving me their time and support to accomplish this research. I am grateful for the support of the previous Chief, Fred Robbins, and the Band Administrative members, especially Lucy Dick, Irene Johnson, and Pat Johnson. The lives of Ivy, Phyllis, and Andy Chelsea, provided me with inspiration.

I feel truly blessed to have a supportive Supervisory Committee. I am deeply indebted to Dr Bob Ellis, my supervisor, Dr Tonia Mills and Dr Jane Young, my committee members. Their constant support, advice, and patience was truly appreciated. Their insightful comments helped shape this research. My appreciation also goes to Dr. Blanca Schorcht. Without her encouraging words, I may not have started the program. I felt privileged to have Darlene Wooldridge, Carol Zoernack, Cinnamon Neumeyer, and Julie Andow navigate me through UNBC's administration. My study buddies were great. They made sure I didn't give up on the coursework. Caroline von Schilling's words of encouragement at the beginning of the program stayed with me until the end.

My family, Tom, Theodora, and Taddea Kunkel, were truly awesome. Their love and support, and planning their timetable around my time, was a big motivator. I could not have accomplished this research study without them. Thank you all. I feel truly honored to have such a amazing number of people support my studies. I'm glad I made it!
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Rationale

As a child, I was always fascinated by the world around me. I was born in London, England and spent some of my childhood years in Lagos, Nigeria, my place of ancestral origin. I have always been concerned with and interested in the plight of developing countries that are rich in natural resources, yet have many people living in impoverished conditions with inadequate infrastructure and an inability to harness the richness of their environment. As a young adult, I lived in and traveled through Western Europe and was fortunate to experience the culture and the people of these countries. Most countries in Western Europe have very sophisticated logistical infrastructures, as well as strong social and economic systems. My journeys also took me to parts of the Middle East, where some countries are blessed with natural resources and are as sophisticated and developed as Western Europe.

As a continent, North America is rich in natural resources and contains two of the wealthiest countries in the world. Canada, in particular, is extremely rich in natural resources and is one of the most economically and socially developed countries. When my journeys brought me to Canada, I was surprised to discover that some Indigenous people lived in social and economic conditions similar to those of impoverished parts of Africa. I became interested in discovering more about the First Nations people and the causes of these
conditions. In my quest to understand the reasons for the disparity in socio-economic conditions, I learned about the rich history and culture of the First Nations peoples in Canada. I realized, from the fur trade history, that First Nations peoples were shrewd business people who engaged in commercial activities with each other (Furniss 1993b; Tobey 1981). The First Nations people in Canada, prior to colonization, were economically and socially connected to each other and to the natural environment in which they lived. I became interested in finding out the reasons why modern First Nations people were not as actively involved in commerce as were their predecessors.

An opportunity arose to investigate and further my understanding of the disjunction between the past and the present economic circumstances of First Nations peoples. In January of 2005, I met two members of the Esketemc First Nation (also referred to as Esket) through the UNBC Weekend University at Williams Lake. I was fascinated by the work of one of the members, Phyllis Chelsea, in moving the community forward from 100% alcoholism to 95% sobriety within a 14 year period. The Esket people continued in their sobriety, and have become internationally recognized as one of the founding communities of the sobriety movement. The Esketemc First Nation is a Band of about 750 members (DIAND 1997 - 2004). The Band has a main reserve located approximately 50 km southwest of the City of Williams Lake, British Columbia (DIAND 1997 - 2004). Governed by an elected chief and council, their traditional territory covers a vast area of the Cariboo region, spanning the banks of the Fraser River southwest of Williams Lake (Carruthers 1997). In May 2006, I had the opportunity to meet with the Chief and Council through one of my colleagues and offered to work with them in the development of their Non-Timber
Forestry Products.

In December 2006, I was referred to Nazko First Nation as another potential source for my research information. At this time, the Band had just received funding for an economic development position to start in April 2007. I met with the Chief, Band Manager, and the Treaty Manager for an interview. At this interview, we agreed that I would work with the Band as an Internship student to build understanding and relationships. In January 2007, I started a graduate Internship with Nazko First Nation as part of my credit courses. The Internship period was from January to the end of March 2007. At the conclusion of this period, I gained employment at the Band in the capacity of Economic Development Manager. Without prior experience in working with First Nations communities, the Internship provided me with the opportunity to acquire useful insights and experiential knowledge of the economic environment I was going to be studying. The Internship was instrumental in furthering my understanding of some of the distinct differences between Aboriginal and Western cultures. My employment with the Nazko First Nation gave me the opportunity to learn more about First Nations peoples in British Columbia, their cultures, and their development challenges.

The Nazko First Nation (also referred to as Nazko) has a membership of about 325 people, just over a hundred of whom live on the main reserve in the Nazko valley (DIAND 1997 - 2004). The main reserve is about 98 km west of the City of Quesnel, British Columbia (ibid). The Band is governed by an elected Chief and Council (DIAND 1997 - 2004). Their traditional territory extends from the outskirts of Williams Lake, covers the whole of Quesnel, as far east as Bowron Lake, to the fringe of Vanderhoof in the Northern
The Nazko and Esketemc communities have their traditional territories within the Cariboo Regional District (Carruthers 1997). Figure 1.1 shows the location of First Nations in central British Columbia. The Esketemc First Nation is situated in the area labeled 'Esket' in Figure 1.1, while the Nazko First Nation is situated in the area labeled 'Nazko'. Both communities were ideal for the study because neither of the communities have the exclusive rights to use and to manage resources within their traditional territories, hence they are working towards self government through the British Columbia Treaty process to negotiate a percentage of these territories. At the time of the study, the Nazko and Esket communities are at stage 4 of the 6-stage treaty process and neither of them have signed their Agreement in Principle.

Although the Nazko and Esketemc communities are both within the Cariboo region, the two communities belong to different language groups. Nazko is part of the Athapaskan language group whereas Esketemc is part of the Interior Salish. Table 1.1 below shows some similarities and differences between the two nations.

---

Figure 1.1: First Nations’ Territories and Protected Areas in central BC (Carruthers 1997)²

² For clarity, overlaps with other First Nations within the Nazko territory are not shown on this map.
Table 1.1: Similarities and Differences between the Esketemc and Nazko communities. (DIAND 1997 – 2004, Esketemc 2006)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nationality</td>
<td>Shuswap Nation</td>
<td>Southern Carrier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language group</td>
<td>Interior Salish: Secwepemc</td>
<td>Athapaskan: Dakelh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population (2001)</td>
<td>748</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>50 km southwest of Williams Lake</td>
<td>98 km west of Quesnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Activities</td>
<td>Hunting, Gathering, Fishing, Trapping, Trading</td>
<td>Hunting, Gathering, Fishing, Trapping, Trading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treaty Negotiations</td>
<td>Stage 4</td>
<td>Stage 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tribal Council Affiliations</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons age 15yr + with income (2001)</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>Not available(^3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average income (2001)</td>
<td>$15,622</td>
<td>Not available(^4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total # of dwelling</td>
<td>130 (40 needing major repairs; 75 needing minor repairs)</td>
<td>30 (15 needing major repairs; 15 needing minor repairs)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1.2 shows the different language groups of the First Nation peoples of BC.

The Nazko First Nation is part of the Great Southern Carrier Nations, traditionally known as Dakelh. Nazko First Nation along with the Kluskus, Ulkatcho, and Red Bluff First Nations form the Southern Carrier Nations, while the Esketemc are part of the Secwepemc Nations, also known as Shuswap. Both Nations engage in similar traditional activities such as hunting, gathering, fishing, trapping, and trading.

\(^3\) Data not released by Statistics Canada due to confidentiality issues.
\(^4\) Data not released by Statistics Canada due to confidentiality issues.
Figure 1.2: First Nations Peoples of British Columbia (BC n.d.).
With the infestation of the Mountain Pine Beetle, British Columbia's forestry industry is expected to face a downturn (Simpson 2007a, 2007b). The Esketemc and Nazko communities are strongly dependent on their forestry operations, hence diversifying their economic activities is their foremost goal. Part of this study was to work with the communities and to seek new economic development opportunities that would fit with the values and vision of the communities. During this inquiry, I came to understand and appreciate the cultures and values of these two communities.

I believed that I could contribute meaningfully to the economic development activities of First Nations communities within British Columbia because of my educational background, my travels, and my industry experience. To achieve this contribution, I decided on a participatory action research approach. I wanted to work with both communities and provide formal or informal information that could help them in their economic development. Based on the history of the First Nations peoples, I believe that resources available on the traditional lands of these communities offer the potential for the creation of social enterprises which could lead to sustainable economic development for their communities. My inquiry was to try and determine how resources available to the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations, within their traditional territories, might be used to create sustainable economic development in line with their culture and values.
1.2 Thesis Statement

First Nation peoples have traditionally sustained their economy through hunting, gathering, fishing, trapping, and trading. These traditional ways are now threatened by the national and global economies of Western societies. For the continued independence and development of First Nations communities, and their engagement with the broader community, there is a need for them to participate more fully in the wider economy. My research focused on the resources and social enterprise opportunities that are available to the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations peoples in order to create sustainable economies that can be maintained from their traditional territories which reflect and support their cultures and values.

1.3 The Challenge and the Opportunity

Nazko First Nation is 100% reliant on forestry as its economic base. The Esketemc community, while heavily reliant on logging, also has some tourism and retail. The magnitude of the Mountain Pine Beetle infestation has gone from very severe to over-run between the years 2001 and 2006 (MOFR 2001-2006).

Figure 1.3 shows the impact of the Mountain Pine Beetle infestation within the central interior of British Columbia. The area of the map which encompasses Prince George and Williams Lake have been completely over run by the epidemic since 2006. This area also encompasses the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations' traditional territories.
The Mountain Pine Beetle infestation has a three-fold implication for the Esketemc and Nazko communities. The first implication is that the communities would be affected by the expected downturn in the forestry industry. Secondly, as part of the Treaty process, the
communities have to go through the land selection process to identify and select lands viable for community expansion, and current or prospective economic activities. The epidemic has created an uncertainty about the future of the forestry industry. Thirdly, traditional activities such as the hunting, trapping, and gathering activities are also impacted by the epidemic.

The Ministry of Forests and Range in British Columbia has increased the allowable cut of timber within the Quesnel and Williams Lake areas as a way of harvesting the marketable timber before it loses its economic value due to the Mountain Pine Beetle infestation. With the harvest rate and the infestation within the territory of the Nazko and Esket communities, it is uncertain if there will be marketable timber available by the time the Treaties are signed. The central aim of this study is to work with both First Nation communities, the Esketemc and Nazko, to identify how resources within the two communities can be used to enable the First Nations communities to participate meaningfully in the wider economy. During this inquiry, I attended three conferences and forum events between October and December of 2007 in order to gather regional data and to gain understanding of the regional context within which both communities operate. The events were: (1) the First Nations Technology Conference held in Prince George, (2) First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative at Williams Lake, and (3) the First Nations Economic Development Forum (FNEDF) also held in Prince George. I solicited questions the communities wanted answered. Questions were posed in focus group meetings and semi structured interviews with Band members.
1.4 Research Goals

My personal and professional interest is in economic development with the hope of alleviating poverty within these communities. This research provided me with opportunities to gain more knowledge and insight in the area of development study. The initial purpose of my research included the following: (1) to identify the non-forestry renewable resources available to the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations communities, (2) to complement or add to the body of knowledge in the area of First Nations enterprises and development, (3) to produce information that could be used by individual communities in their economic development and planning, and (4) to investigate ways of creating sustainable economic development within First Nations communities in general and the Nazko and Esketemc communities in particular.

As my research was participatory, working with both communities, the purpose of the research became driven by the needs of the communities. The goals were revised as follows: (1) to identify economic development opportunities beneficial for both the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations, (2) to complement or add to the body of knowledge in the area of economic development for these two communities, and (3) to provide the communities with information which could be used in their economic development planning.

My overarching goal was to explore how First Nations communities can create social enterprises in line with their culture and values, with the benefit of delivering financial, economic, and environmental returns, using resources available to them. My research sought an exploration of these goals through attending focus group meetings with the Esketemc
First Nation members, my employment with the Nazko First Nation, conducting semi-structured interviews with selected members of the Nazko First Nation, attending regional First Nations forums and conferences, and using secondary data. The research also gave me a foundation for my anticipated future study on the emerging theories and frameworks for First Nations' meaningful participation in the wider economy.
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Introduction

Indigenous or aboriginal peoples are so-called because they were living on their
lands before settlers came from elsewhere; they are the descendants ... of those who
inhabited a country or a geographical region at the time when people of different
cultures or ethnic origins arrived, the new arrivals later becoming dominant through
conquest, occupation, settlement or other means (General Assembly of The United

There are various definitions for Indigenous or Aboriginal people (Anderson et al.
2005). The above definition is one used by the General Assembly of the the United Nations
as follows:

Peoples in independent countries who are regarded as indigenous on account of their
descent from the populations which inhabited the country, or a geographical region to
which the country belongs, at the time of conquest or colonization or the
establishment of present State boundaries and who, irrespective of their legal status,
retain some or all of their own social, economic, cultural and political institutions.
The Indian Act was first enacted by the Federal Government of Canada in 1876 and has subsequently been amended several times (Isaac 2004, 189; Laliberte et al. 2000, 567). The Act defined an Indian in relation to the Federal Government's obligations, and sets out a series of regulations including various rights and restrictions applying to Indians living on reserves (Isaac 2004, 190; Laliberte et al. 2000, 567). In this inquiry, “First Nations peoples” refer to Canada's Indigenous peoples who are registered under the Indian Act (Laliberte et al. 2000, 568). These people are politically autonomous groups (ibid). Group members are usually related by kin ties (Laliberte et al. 2000, 568). The First Nations are nations of Canada's First Peoples (ibid). Prior to European contact, North America was home to hundreds of distinct First Nations who differed in language, culture, political organization, economic and social systems, and environments (Laliberte et al. 2000, 237; Helin 2006). British Columbia alone sustained approximately 30 different Aboriginal groups, each with its own unique linguistic and cultural identity, as distinct as the various European nations at the time (Helin 2006, 69). The advent of colonization saw the isolation of indigenous communities and the evolution of government as the sole source of income within these communities (Helin 2006, 115, 128). This led to learned helplessness amongst First Nations people in British Columbia, and the dependency on Federal transfer payments (ibid).

Prior to European contact, Aboriginal peoples in Canada had their own forms of government, social organization, and economies (Furniss 1993b; Isaac 2004; King 2004; Sherry and Myers, 2002). Case laws confirmed the existence of Aboriginal rights and title because prior to Europeans arriving in Canada, Aboriginal people were already living in communities on the land and participating in distinctive cultures as they had done for
centuries (Isaac 2004, 2). Aboriginal rights refers to rights deemed to be held by the Indigenous peoples of Canada by virtue of their ancestors' original and long-standing nationhood and their use and occupancy of land (Laliberte et al. 2000, 565). Isaac (2004, 3) stated that Aboriginal title is a special legal interest that Aboriginal people possess in lands based on their historic occupation and relationship to those lands. Aboriginal title is a right to the land itself (Isaac 2004, 3). The Province of British Columbia has settled treaties with some First Nations communities, but in much of British Columbia no treaty settlement has been reached and is therefore open to claims based on Aboriginal title and rights (Isaac 2004, 11).

Local First Nations communities are starting to challenge the Provincial Ministries on their land use decisions, for example, the case of Tsilhqot’in people in the Nemiah Valley against the Province of British Columbia (SCBC 2007). Land use planning and forestry activities unjustifiably infringed on the Tsilhqot’in people's Aboriginal rights and title (SCBC 2007). In the Tsilhqot’in case, the Supreme Court stated that Aboriginal title land was not “Crown land” as defined by Provincial forestry legislation, hence the Provincial Forest Act does not apply to Aboriginal title land (SCBC 2007, 4). The Forestry Act defined “Crown Land” to mean land whether or not it is covered by water, or an interest in land vested in the Government Act and “Crown timber” as timber on Crown land or timber reserved for the Crown (SCBC 2007, 313; RSBC 1996). The plaintiff in the Tsilhqot'in case argued that timber situated on Tsilhqot’ in Aboriginal title lands was not “Crown timber” for the following reasons: (1) Aboriginal title is a right to the land itself and the title encompasses the right to the exclusive possession, occupation, use and enjoyment of the
land and its resources; and (2) the Province does not own the title to or the resources on
Aboriginal title lands, hence should not benefit from such and is not entitled to demand any
revenue or royalties with respect to resources (SCBC 2007, 313). The Provincial
government has the administration of all Crown land except land specifically under the
administration of another minister, branch or agency of Government (RSBC 1996).
According to the Supreme Court, the current Forest Act authorizes Provincial forestry
officials to enter into agreements granting rights to harvest “Crown timber”; that is, timber
situated on “land ... or an interest in land, vested in the government” but not timber on third
party land (SCBC 2007). The Supreme Court further stated that the jurisdiction to legislate
with respect to Aboriginal title land lies with the Federal Government hence the Provincial
Government has no jurisdiction to extinguish Aboriginal title, and such title was not
extinguished by a conveyance of fee simple title (SCBC 2007, 4). The Judge offered the
opinion that Tsilhqot’in Aboriginal title does exist within 200,000 hectares of land, inside
and outside the Claim Area of 440,000 hectares (SCBC 2007). The Supreme Court's
decision in the Delgamuukw case and the Judge's opinion in the Tsilhqot'in case both
confirmed the difference between Aboriginal title and and other forms of land title (Isaac
2004, 10; SCBC 2007, 3,4). These differences are summarized in Table 2.1 below. The
court cases support Mills' (2005, 14) argument that treaty settlement of less than 10% of the
Aboriginal interests area, such as the Nisga'a treaty, are not fair because communities stand
to lose a significant portion of their traditional territory through the current process.
Table 2.1: Differences Between Aboriginal Title Land and Other Forms of Land Title (B.C. 2002, 9,10; Isaac 2004, 10; SCBC 2007, 3, 4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aboriginal Title Land</th>
<th>Other Land Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Roots in pre-sovereignty occupation of Aboriginal people.</td>
<td>Post sovereignty Crown grants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inalienable except to the Crown, title can only be transferred back to the Crown.</td>
<td>Alienable, for example, fee simple land can be sold.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crown has a fiduciary duty.</td>
<td>No Crown fiduciary duty.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title encompasses the right to the exclusive possession, occupation, use, and enjoyment of the land and its resources.</td>
<td>Land tenure is not necessarily exclusive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title is vested in group and communally held.</td>
<td>Title can be individually or communally held.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutionally protected as existing Aboriginal right, therefore, part of the supreme law of Canada.</td>
<td>Not constitutionally protected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Falls under Federal jurisdiction.</td>
<td>Can be Provincial or Federal jurisdiction.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The review of literature covered eleven main topics: the development history of First Nation Peoples; Indigenous world view versus economic world view; development indicators in Aboriginal communities; resource management and Traditional Ecological Knowledge (TEK); economic development and sustainability; First Nations and resource sharing in British Columbia; regional characteristics of the Quesnel and Williams Lake areas; economic base and resource reliance of the Quesnel and Williams Lake areas; barriers to economic development and critical success factors; the United Nations’ Millennium Development Goals (MDGs); and Rights Based Approach (RBA) to development and gender equity.
2.2 Development History of First Nations Peoples

Economic and social development of First Nations peoples was intertwined with their culture prior to European contact (Helin 2006). The pre-colonial culture of First Nations peoples was centered on the natural environment (Helin 2006; Furniss 1993b). Furniss (1993a, 77) stated that in order for First Nations peoples to survive, they needed detailed understanding of the natural world around them. The early Southern Carrier⁵ people developed an extensive body of knowledge about animals, plants, climate, terrain, and geology (Furniss 1993a, 77). This knowledge was required for their spiritual, economic, social, and cultural survival (ibid). The First Nations peoples occupied their territories for millennia based on the extensive traditional local ecological knowledge which they had developed from the detailed understanding of their environment (Armstrong 2002; Berkes 1999; Furniss 1993a; McGregor 2000). This knowledge was passed down from generation to generation and is commonly known today by scholars and scientists as Traditional Ecological Knowledge or TEK (Armstrong 2002; Berkes 1999; Furniss 1993a; McGregor 2000; Turner et al. 2000).

Throughout human history, whenever dominant neighbouring peoples have expanded their territories or settlers from far away have acquired new lands by force, the cultures and livelihoods - even the existence - of indigenous peoples have been endangered. The threats to indigenous peoples' cultures and lands, to their status and other legal rights as distinct groups and as citizens, do not always take the same

⁵ The early Southern Carriers refers to the people whooccupied the Southern Carrier territory before colonization.
forms as in previous times. Although some groups have been relatively successful, in most parts of the world indigenous peoples are actively seeking recognition of their identities and ways of life (General Assembly of The United Nations, 1995 - 2004).

Prior to the arrival of Europeans in Canada, First Nations communities were completely self-reliant (Helin 2006, 82). They had a subsistence economy, with established social and trade network links (Furniss 1993b; Helin 2006; Hilbert et al. 2006; Ignace 1998). The Shuswap people traded with their immediate neighbors and had links with their more distant neighbors on the Northwest coast, on the Columbia Plateau, and across the Rockies (Ignace 1998) while the Southern Carrier people traded with communities on trails leading to the West Coast of British Columbia (Furniss 1993b). The Nazko Nation, along with other First Nations, used the Grease trail to trade fresh and dried food, hides, furs, and black volcanic rocks (obsidian) used to make arrows and spearheads from their region for oolichan oil (hence the name 'Grease' trail), dried salmon, and precious dentalia shells from the west coast (Furniss 1993b, 14; Hilbert et al. 2006; Palmer 2005). Many of these trails existed throughout the Southern Carrier country, spreading into territories of the neighboring nations, and served as major trade and social routes for the Nuxalk, Chilcotin and Carrier communities (Furniss 1993b; Hilbert et al. 2006). The busiest trade route in what is now known as British Columbia, the Grease trail, was used by Alexander MacKenzie, hence renamed 'Alexander MacKenzie Trail' or 'The MacKenzie Grease Trail' (ibid).

Most First Nations people maintained a nomadic lifestyle, traveling hundreds of miles within their traditional territory in pursuit of seasonal food such as moose, berries, and
fish (Furniss 1993a). The people had deep respect for the land and acted as caretakers of the resources available within their territories (Ignace 1998; Helin 2006, 80). Their mobile lifestyle was part of the cultural adaptation due to the seasonality of harvest at the different food sources (Furniss 1993a). The Shuswap people, like other First Nations people, traveled to their seasonal food gathering places (Haig-Brown 1993). The food gathering activities were based on the autumn, winter, spring, and summer cycles (ibid). For example, in the autumn season, people traveled to their hunting grounds (Haig-Brown 1993). While the men and some women hunted, other women and children gathered berries (Haig-Brown 1993). The food harvesting activities depended on the weather and what food was available during the season (ibid).

The Fort Thompson trading post was established in 1812, close to a winter village of the Shuswap people, by the North West Company (Haig-Brown 1993, 27). In 1821, the North West Company established another trading post in southern Carrier country, called Fort Alexandria (Furniss 1993b). From these two posts, the Europeans began to solicit trade directly from the Southern Carrier, Chilcotin and Shuswap peoples (Furniss 1993b; Haig-Brown 1993). The Native people traded a variety of furs including beaver, otter, fox, bear, lynx, muskrat, wolverine, and wolf (ibid). They also traded dried salmon, berry cakes, and fresh meat for goods such as blankets, kettles, guns, ammunition, clothes, and tobacco (ibid). Some Native people worked at the forts as hired interpreters, laborers, hunters, and also carried messages between various forts in the company's network (Furniss 1993b). During this period, the missionaries began to intensify their presence in British Columbia (Haig-Brown 1993). The missionaries' involvement with the North West Company provided
the opportunity for Europeans to be immersed in the lifestyle of the Native people (Haig-Brown 1993, 28). The influences of the government and the missionaries on the lives of First Nations people had a very large impact on the economic and social culture of the people (Haig-Brown 1993; Milloy 1999). Haig-Brown (1993, 28) stated that the Oblates\(^6\) viewed the migratory lifestyle of the native people to be inherently wrong, and the acquisition of farming skills and an agrarian lifestyle were seen as a positive step in order to 'Christianize and civilize' the people. As part of colonization, the government was keen to assimilate the First Nations peoples into the European culture and viewed the work of the Oblates as being strategic in the process (Haig-Brown 1993; Milloy 1999).

The Europeans depended on the Natives during the fur trading period (Furniss 1993b). Southern Carrier people had good trading relationships with the Europeans (ibid). The wealth of First Nation communities increased with the intensified fur trade (Tobey 1981). The discovery of gold in the Horsefly River in 1859 led to the Cariboo gold rush which brought about changes in trading relationships with non-Natives (Furniss 1993b). Gold prospectors began to compete directly with Native miners which led to conflicts over land and resources (ibid). Following the advent of the fur trade, the epidemic of the gold rush, the missionaries, and the imposition of colonial government in the early 1800s, First Nations' cultures have undergone significant changes (Furniss 1993b).

In the early 1900s, diseases such as measles, whooping cough, influenza, smallpox, and tuberculosis decimated the Native people (Furniss 1993b, 100). Groups of Native people were moved to reserve settlements which occupied only a small part of their

---

\(^6\) An association of priests or religious women who have offered themselves to the service of the church (Oblate n.d.)
traditional territory (Palmer 2005, 41; Furniss 1993b, 78). European miners and settlers, dwindling game, and reduced numbers of Native people weakened the ability of First Nation peoples to defend the territory they had previously controlled (Furniss 1993b).

Traditionally, Native children received their education by watching and participating in cultural activities within their communities, but the Federal Government saw compulsory attendance at missionary schools as an essential part of the assimilation process (Haig-Brown 1993; Palmer 2005; Furniss 1993b). Whereas life skills were taught by every member of the community, the Elders played an important role in passing down traditional knowledge (ibid). The introduction of mission schools meant that children were isolated from the cultural influences of the community and their education became that of learning to read, write, and to speak English (Haig-Brown 1993; Milloy 1999). The residential school system was started by Reverend Wilson in 1873 at Shingwauk Hall, Ontario (Milloy 1999). In 1879, the Canadian Government adopted the policy of residential schools because Reverend Wilson reported that 'Indian adults' were irredeemable, and were also a hindrance to civilization (Milloy 1999, 26). The first children from Alkali Lake were enrolled in school in 1891 (Palmer 2005, 48). In 1894, amendments of the Indian Act made it illegal to keep children out of school (Palmer 2005, 49). By the 1930s and 1940s, Southern Carrier children were starting to attend school in increasing numbers (Furniss 1993b, 81). Children were fluent in their traditional language and not exposed to English language before attending residential schools (Milloy 1999). With the Indian Act amendment, children were forced away from their homes to attend residential schools where they were forbidden to speak their own traditional language or practice their culture (Furniss 1993b, 85). The

---

7 Assimilation is the imposition of European customs and values on indigenous peoples (Helin 2006, 88)
children had their hair cut, were subject to sexual abuse and harsh physical punishments, and were poorly fed (Furniss 1994; Milloy 1999). Many children died in the residential schools as a result of suicide, poor nutrition, and lack of medical care (ibid). The objectives of the residential school included ‘civilizing the savages’, which meant to ‘kill the Indian in the child’ and in the end ‘all the Indian there is in the race should be dead’ (Milloy 1999, 43; RCAP 1996). The Aboriginal children did not enter these schools uneducated, but were re-educated to fit a European model (LHF 2003, 17). The residential school system was used as a tool by the government to assimilate the Native children, ‘civilize’, and ‘Christianize’ them by removing them from the daily influence of their culture (Haig-Brown 1993; Milloy 1999; RCAP 1996). This separation led to the breakdown in the traditional social and economic structures of First Nations communities (Haig-Brown 1993; Milloy 1999). The First Nations people who attended residential schools became alienated from their traditional cultures and consequently were unable to teach the younger generations (RCAP 1996). Today, these people are commonly referred to as ‘survivors’, not ‘alumni’ (LHF 2003; RCAP 1996). Although the Canadian government abolished the residential school system in 1969, some of the schools continued operating into the 1970s and 1980s (LHF 2003, 55). The last residential school in British Columbia was closed in 1984 (Milloy 1999). The residential school system created the loss of indigenous languages through forced English speaking, the loss of traditional ways of being on the land, the loss of parenting skills through the absence of four or five generations of children from Native communities, the loss of pride and self esteem amongst Native people, and the learned behavior of despising Native identity, all of which continues to impact First Nation communities to the
present day (RCAP 1996). Most of the ‘survivors’ and their communities still face economic and social marginalization (St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 44), social exclusion, discrimination, and even racism within the Western communities (RCAP 1996).

Helin (2006, 85) stated that the period of colonization brought about the shift in Aboriginal peoples' from self-reliance to dependency on the government in Canada. Most Aboriginal people in British Columbia now live on Reserves in impoverished conditions, enduring inadequate education, polluted water supplies, social issues, ill health, substandard housing, and family violence (RCAP 1996). These conditions are typically associated with developing countries (ibid). The Royal Commission on the Aboriginal People was faced with the challenge of investigating social and cultural issues, and had to propose solutions to deal with the quality of life of Aboriginal people (RCAP 1996). First Nations peoples are also exploring alternative ways of keeping their communities together and their people employed (Anderson et al. 2006). Sustainable logging proposals, tourism projects and economic development ventures with non-Native businesses and industries, as well as land claims settlements, are all routes that First Nations are exploring to once again become self sufficient and to participate in the wider economies (Furniss 1993a). According to Anderson et al. (2006), First Nations people are inseparable from their traditional lands. The creation of social enterprises on these traditional lands is being explored by some Aboriginal communities because social enterprises have the benefit of delivering a quadruple bottom line, namely financial, social, cultural, and environmental performance targets which are required for sustainability and the social development of a community (Anderson et al. 2006; Peredo and Chrisman, 2006; Wallace 1999). Wallace (1999) defined social enterprises
as commercial enterprises where funding comes from the public or private sector and the profits generated are returned to the community in the form of social services. Social enterprises are committed to community benefits and are classified as community businesses, cooperatives, development trusts, credit unions, and development corporations (Wallace 1999). Lands and resources within traditional territories are the foundation upon which indigenous people intend to rebuild the economies of their nations as demonstrated in social enterprises owned by communities such as the Osoyoos Indian Band and the Inuvialuit people of western Canada's Arctic region (Anderson et al. 2006; St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 46).

2.3 Indigenous World View Versus Economic World View

There are many world views but for the purposes of this discussion, I’ll name three: the scientific, the Indigenous, and the economic. The economic world view dominates the other two. Some of you may disagree with this statement but I believe that the current management of our forests and rivers and oceans is driven not by science, but by economics. (Gayton 2002)

In explaining the construct of 'world view', Graveline's (1998, 19) study showed that the term is defined to include a distinctive vision of reality which transcends the experience of a single lifetime (ibid). Graveline (1998, 19) stated that the construct, 'Traditional', links geographical space and world view. Graveline (1998, 19) quoted Ortiz, a Tewa historian, as stating that:
Worldview provides people with a distinctive set of values, an identity, a feeling of rootedness, of belonging to a time and a place, a felt sense of continuity with a tradition which transcends the experience of a single lifetime, a tradition which may be said to transcend even time.

Since the First Nations peoples have inhabited their environment for millennia, they have come to perceive and relate to this local environment in a “Traditional” way (Graveline 1998). Despite the Western education system, the minds of traditional American Indians are steeped in native cultures, hence the survival of ideas, perspectives, and Indian thinking remains (Fixico 2003). This traditional thinking and perspective was part of the everyday lives of First Nations people (McGregor 2000, 442).

The scientific world view and the Traditional Ecological Knowledge (TEK) of the Indigenous peoples are closely aligned (McGregor 2000, 436, 439). Lertzman (2002) stated that TEK systems and scientific knowledge systems are both empirical and dynamic in time, and each have their own mechanisms for establishing the validity of ideas and beliefs. Lertzman (2002, 30) also stated that science looks for difference and is careful to draw boundaries between the “natural” and “supernatural”, while TEK sees connections between the “natural” and “supernatural”.

The economic world view, which forms the basis of the present economic thinking, was established by colonization and the industrial revolution (Hawken et al. 1999, 6). The increased use of technology resulted in improved productivity, reduced labor, increased standard of living and real wages, and increasing demand for transportation, housing,
education and clothing, thus creating the foundation of modern commerce (Hawken et al. 1999, 6, 7). The economic world view is based on free market systems of production (Hawken et al. 1999), while the Indigenous world view is based on subsistence economy (Berkes 1999; Nuttall 2005). Table 2.2 below shows some differences between the economic world view and the Indigenous world view.

Table 2.2: Difference Between the Economic World View and the Indigenous World View (Berkes 1999; Hawken et al. 1999; McGregor 2000).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic World View</th>
<th>Indigenous World View</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic progress can best occur in free-market systems of production and distribution where reinvested profits make labor and capital increasingly productive.</td>
<td>Humans are not superior beings but part of a community of all nature. The hunting and gathering activities are carried out for sustenance not for profit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive advantage is gained when bigger, more efficient plants manufacture more products for sale to expanding markets.</td>
<td>TEK is a communal, social and spiritual relationship to the land on which a community survives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Growth in total output (GDP) maximizes human well-being.</td>
<td>TEK is expressed in how people live and how they relate to Creation. The knowledge and the people are inseparable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any resource shortages that do occur will elicit the development of substitutes.</td>
<td>Resource shortage are related to ethical transgressions of humans.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerns for a healthy environment are important but must be balanced against the requirements of economic growth, if a high standard of living is to be maintained.</td>
<td>TEK is an integral part of the local culture, and management prescriptions are adapted to the local area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free enterprise and market forces will allocate people and resources to the highest and best uses.</td>
<td>In hunting as an example, access right limits the number of hunters who can operate within family territories and in communal territories thus achieving high levels of productivity with limited hunting pressure.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Helin (2006, 74) noted that it had been suggested that the difference between world
views and the approach of Western and traditional indigenous societies can be attributed to
two cultures at differing stages of development. Fixico (2003, 17) stated that although many
Native Americans have been educated in mainstream public schools, American Indians who
are close to their traditions still perceive things from an indigenous perspective.

2.4 Development Indicators in Aboriginal Communities

The idea of development is linked to concepts of modernity. 'Modernity' in its
broadest sense means the condition of being modern, new or up-to-date, so the idea
of 'modernity' situates people in time. However, more specifically, 'modernity' has
been used as a term to describe particular forms of economy and society based on
the experiences of Western Europe. Modernization encompasses industrialization,
urbanization, and the increased use of technology in all sectors (Willis 2005, 2).

Willis (2005) argued that the concept of modernization involved the loss of
indigenous cultures and practices, and the increased use of technology. Anderson et al.
(2005) stated that one of the underlying assumptions of modernization is that traditional
cultures and social structures are barriers to progress. The term 'Development' is Western
with values taken from industrialized societies, where labor and participation are necessary
stated that in the western European and non-Aboriginal Canadian perspective, societies
which were industrialized, literate, and urbanized with well developed market economies
were believed to be superior to those that were not. As part of the colonization process, the
Government of Canada saw the assimilation of First Nations peoples into the European or Western culture as a means to development (Milloy 1999, 19). This view was also shared by the Government of the United States (Jorgensen and Taylor, 2000). Jorgensen and Taylor (2000) stated that the Federal Government in the United States espoused the argument that "Indians" would develop as soon as they shed their "Indian-ness". The Canadian Government called it the "Indian problem" (LHF 2003, 54), but research by the Harvard Project showed that “Indian” culture is a resource which provides important cultural norms that support or complement appropriate institutions of government (Cornell 1987). A study by the Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency (ACOA) showed that some Aboriginal communities are participating meaningfully in mainstream economy while keeping close ties with their cultures and traditions (ACOA 2003). The study also showed that success in economic development is evident in projects that have incorporated culture and are striving to find alternative ways of keeping traditions alive (ibid).

When economists speak about development success, they usually think in terms of per capita incomes, employment, and financially successful development enterprises (Cornell 1987; St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 2). Cornell (1987) found that tribal development success for Aboriginal peoples in the United States typically has political, economic, ecological, and cultural dimensions. Development indicators such as labor participation, unemployment figures, employment income, and educational attainment are used to measure performance within First Nation communities (Damus and Liljefors, 2004; Mendelson 2004). These indicators were created based on market economies, which are prevalent in Western societies (The World Bank 2007). Indicators such as labor participation
and education levels are based on industrialization and are used as universal measures for
development by organizations such as the United Nations and the World Bank (The World
Bank 2007; UNDP nd).

First Nations people had a subsistence economy where terms such as per capita
incomes, employment, and financially successful development enterprises were foreign
(Nuttall 2005; Cornell 1987). Communities are now being measured using universal
development indicators which do not take into consideration the subsistence economy and
the Indigenous world view (Statistics Canada 2004; DIAND 1997 - 2004). Most
contemporary First Nations communities have a mixed economy which consists of a
Nuttall (2005, 656) stated that traditional activities such as hunting, fishing, and gathering
are mainly aimed at satisfying important social, cultural, and nutritional needs, as well as the
economic needs of families, households, and communities. The Southern Carrier people
organized themselves into family groups and would split or come together for social and
cultural activities such as hunting and fishing (Furniss 1993b). Subsistence economies
usually do not provide economic indicator data (Nuttall 2005; St. Germain and Sibbeston,
2007). Income or goods traded are typically not accounted for, hence indicators for the First
Nations people would be better represented with the inclusion of elements of subsistence
economy (ibid).

Success indicators in Aboriginal communities in the United States include
development sustainable for generations (Cornell 1987). These communities will readily
sacrifice an economic good for a political and cultural one (ibid). Cornell (1987) stated that
the Warm Springs Indians in Oregon rejected a proposal from non-Indian developers to build a ski resort on the Mount Jefferson boundary of their reserve despite the promise of millions of dollars in annual profit. One of the goals of the British Columbia Treaty process is to settle Treaties with First Nation communities in order to avoid conflicts and pave the way for further economic developments by non-Aboriginal people within Aboriginal territories (BCTC 2005, 9). Not all First Nation communities are in support of the Treaty (ibid).

2.5 Resource Management and Traditional Ecological Knowledge

Rural First Nations communities in Canada are usually many kilometers from the nearest town and are often isolated (Parfitt 2007; St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 63). Due to the geographic remoteness and size of many of these nations' communities, the people depend on traditional activities such as hunting, gathering, fishing, and trapping for subsistence (Nuttall 2005; St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 63). There is also a heavy demand for resources found on Crown lands which the First Nations' communities depend (Parfitt 2007). The extraction of these resources has impacted the traditional activities of the people (Furniss 1993b; St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 63). Furniss (1993b, 103; 1994) stated that these changes and the effects of the residential school experience has led to social problems such as alcohol abuse and family violence. Furniss (1993b, 102) further stated that the expansion of the logging industry in the Southern Carrier territory in the period after 1940, led to clear cutting of forests and road building. This took its toll on the subsistence economy of the people (ibid).
First Nations people have conservation ethics which were founded on millennia of producing food, shelter, medicine, and clothing from forest ecosystems while sustaining the resources from which these materials are derived (BCFNFC 2006; Karjala et al. 2003; King 2004). This conservation ethic is in direct contrast to the economic world view which guides modern resource management systems (Berkes 1999). Modern resource management, conducted by professional administrators and scientists, is founded on culturally specific ideas about competition, individuality, property, and control (Berkes 1999; Sherry and Myers, 2002). The ethnographic study carried out by Whiteman and Cooper (2000) revealed that the Cree tallymen in James Bay, Northern Quebec, had been gathering ecosystem information for millennia. King (2004, 161) discovered that First Nations in the Pacific Northwest have evolved management systems for fish and forest resources over hundreds of years. Karjala et al. (2003, 92) stated that this information has not been recorded which makes it difficult for others to access.

As noted by a number of authors, First Nations' traditional knowledge is context specific and passed down through the generations orally (Farnsworth and Hagen, 2001; Prince 2002; Sherry and Myers, 2002; Whiteman and Cooper, 2000). Each First Nation community manages its territory in a unique way (ibid). An example of this was expressed by Prince (2002), who stated that the Tl'azt'en First Nation believed that they are the caretakers and stewards of their traditional land. This view is still upheld in the Nation today and governs how they manage their forestry licenses (ibid). Sherry and Myers (2002) stated that in many Aboriginal communities, traditional knowledge provides the guiding principles

---

8 A Cree Tallyman is a senior designated hunter who is recognized as the head of a family hunting ground (Whiteman and Cooper, 2000).
for which resources are used and managed. Whiteman and Cooper (2000) observed that the
local TEK is unique to a given culture or society. This was confirmed by Karjala et al.'s
(2004, 96) observation that TEK is local or regional in scale, and it is based on a detailed
understanding of the environment, customary authority, and communal management
principles.

The Clayoquot Sound Scientific Panel (1995) completed a review of forestry
practices standards in effect in Clayoquot Sound. The Panel's report showed that Nuu-Chah-
Nulth people have lived in Clayoquot Sound area for thousands of years and have great
knowledge and personal experience of Clayoquot Sound ecosystems. The Nuu-Chah-Nulth
people have a history, a culture, and spirituality which are all firmly bound to the area’s
forests and waters (CSSP 1995, vii). The report (CSSP 1995, 14, 15) summarized the
indigenous perspective of TEK as follows:

1. The Creator made all things one;
2. All things are related and interconnected;
3. All things are sacred and must be respected; and
4. Balance and harmony are essential between all life forms.

TEK is a qualitative research method because the data gathered through TEK is
focused and bounded within its context (CSSP 1995; Miles and Huberman, 1994, 10). As a
research method, TEK has the advantage of providing “rich and thick” descriptions which
are required in qualitative research as stated by Miles and Huberman (1994, 10). Collier et
al. (2002) and Whiteman and Cooper (2000) associated traditional ecosystems' management
as the lived experience of First Nations people. Collier et al. (2002, 66) described TEK as living knowledge because it is a person or community’s experiential knowledge of the land, the wildlife, and the seasons. TEK stewardship approach is passed down from the Elders’ sayings which have been gathered over time (ibid). TEK gathers data to understand the environment, not to change nature or alter the environment, but for the First Nations people to live in harmony with nature (Collier et al. 2002, 66). It is passed down through riddles which grandfathers tell to young men, and sometimes in stories and snippets of information that the whole community shares (Collier et al. 2002; Turner et al. 2000). For example, an Elder may say “It’s too early to hunt moose today. Wait another week” (Collier et al. 2002). TEK requires keen eyes and a good memory and it is often shared a little at a time to enrich the family and community’s understanding of the land (Collier et al. 2002, 66; Turner et al. 2000).

Collier et al. (2002) stated that TEK management techniques are sensitive to seasonality and changes in the environmental. For example, TEK is knowing that the salmon are up the river to spawn because a certain kind of berry has suddenly changed color (Collier et al. 2002, 66). This kind of knowledge is learned when humans live close to the natural world and when they share the same space for long periods of time (Collier et al. 2002; Turner et al. 2000). For example, First Nations people have an understanding that fire, drought, heavy snowpack winters, heavy rains, and flooding all have a part to play in nature (Armstrong 2002). While Collier et al. (2002, 66) referred to the lived experience as TEK, Whiteman and Cooper (2002) referred to this experience as ‘ecological embeddedness’. To be ecologically embedded means to identify with the land; to adhere to beliefs of ecological
respect, reciprocity, and care taking; to actively gather ecological information; and to be physically located in the ecosystem (Whiteman and Cooper, 2002). TEK, as a stewardship approach and a form of social science, is deeply rooted in spiritual beliefs (ibid). Scientists are now incorporating TEK data into ecosystem management strategies (Turner et al. 2000).

The pre-colonial First Nations people had social, economic, and political activities which were governed by their spiritual beliefs (Isaac 2004; King 2004; Sherry and Myers, 2002). They had knowledge systems which guided their management regimes and governed access rights and responsibilities, harvesting, allocation of benefits and costs, technology, education and training (King 2004; Sherry and Myers, 2002). This knowledge system was intricately linked to the governance, spirituality, and social relationships of the nation (King 2004, 162). First Nations economies were based on the ecological knowledge and activities specific to their traditional territories (Furniss 1993b). The imposition of Euro-centric knowledge systems first by missionaries, settlers and colonizers, later by Provincial and National governments, and then corporations holding tenure rights assigned by those governments, have caused conflicts with First Nations communities for decades (King 2004, 162). First Nations economies are now subject to regulations, and laws imposed by the Canadian authorities (RCAP 1996). One of the greatest challenges of First Nations people is to build institutions for resource and common property management that reflect their traditional values rather than succumb to the pressures of aligning their institutions with the national and international regimes based upon knowledge systems of the dominant culture (King 2004, 162; Helin 2006). The land claims process is viewed as a mechanism for First Nations to develop land tenure and environmental regimes that would lead to the healing of
both their ecosystems and their communities, and empowering them to create sustainable communities (King 2004, 164; Helin 2006). As part of their development, First Nations people now have to create financially successful enterprises with employment opportunities for their Band members (Anderson et al. 2005).

2.6 Economic Development and Sustainability

Sustainable development recognizes that development is essential to satisfy human needs and improve the quality of human life. It is based on the efficient and environmentally responsible use of all society's scarce resources - our natural, human and economic resources. Activities must be considered in light of their impacts on the "seven generations" to come. (Gitxsan Wet'suwet'en Quoted in INAC, 2006a).

There are various definitions of 'sustainable development', but the Gitxsan Wet'suwet'en's quote defined sustainable development from a First Nation perspective. The term 'sustainable development' is defined as development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of the future generation to meet its own needs (Willis 2005; UN 2000 - 2006b). First Nations people place great emphasis on the environmentally responsible use of land and resources with which they have very close links (Anderson et al. 2006). Lackey (1998) stated that the term “sustainability”, if used in ecosystem management, should be defined stating the time frame of concern, the benefits and costs of concern, and the relative priority of these benefits and costs. Ecosystem sustainability, in the context of First Nations people, typically refers to systems that have survived for millennia
(Whiteman and Cooper, 2000). Lackey (1998) also pointed out that ecosystem sustainability should yield economic growth that will benefit present and future generations without detrimentally affecting the resources or biological systems of the planet. Whiteman and Cooper (2000) linked sustainability to the human stress on the environment. Their study found that the Cree managers had hunting, trapping, and gathering territories the size of cities which meant less stress on resources available (ibid). Whiteman and Cooper (2000) argued that the Cree tallymen's ability to sustain themselves was linked to their high degree of ecological embeddedness which had led to their sustainable practices.

Armstrong (2002) emphasized that management of resources for market economics is a very different positioning from First Nations' interaction with resources within their traditional territories. In the past, market pressures have led to over-harvesting and hence scarcity of resources as witnessed during the fur trade (Whiteman and Cooper, 2000; Cummins 2004). Armstrong (2002) stressed that traditional resource management is synonymous to the English word 'perma-culturing', which is care-taking of the land over many years as if it were a garden and having an understanding that the garden grows without the use of pesticides, without irrigation, and without interfering with natural systems. Traditional harvesting was practiced as part of First Nations sustainable management (Armstrong 2002, 12, 13). Farnsworth and Hagen (2001) argued that the use of TEK is becoming a realistic approach in determining the sustainable levels in which natural systems should be managed or exploited at local and sometimes regional levels.
2.7 First Nations and Resource Sharing in British Columbia

Indigenous peoples have the right to determine and develop priorities and strategies for the development or use of their lands, territories and other resources, including the right to require that States obtain their free and informed consent prior to the approval of any project affecting their lands, territories and other resources, particularly in connection with the development, utilization or exploitation of mineral, water or other resources. Pursuant to agreement with the indigenous peoples concerned, just and fair compensation shall be provided for any such activities and measures taken to mitigate adverse environmental, economic, social, cultural or spiritual impact (UN 1993, Article 30).

Vast stretches of forest in British Columbia have been infested by the Mountain Pine Beetle (Parfitt 2005). In response to this infestation, the Provincial government increased the allowable cut of timber by an additional 11 million cubic meters per annum in 2005 (ibid) and has since increased the cut further (Simpson 2007a). The scale and severity of the Mountain Pine Beetle epidemic poses health and economic challenges to rural First Nations communities both in the central and northern interior of British Columbia (Parfitt 2007 and Simpson 2007a). As a form of accommodating the infringements on Aboriginal title, the British Columbia Government initiated 126 resource and revenue sharing agreements with First Nations (Parfitt 2007). Ninety-one of these agreements are known as Forest and Range Agreements (FRAs) or Forest and Range Opportunities (FROs). Under these agreements, First Nations are offered a limited amount of cash and timber per Band member over a
period of five years (Parfitt 2007). The total volume of timber available for First Nations to harvest and generate revenue and employment under the 126 agreements is 21.95 million cubic meters for the five-year period (ibid). While these agreements provide First Nations communities with tremendous opportunities to influence the resource management activities in their territories, there have been both positive and negative results from the resource sharing (Parfitt 2007). Many First Nations communities in British Columbia are isolated and lack major technology and infrastructures such as roads, power, good water supply, and sewer services (Parfitt 2007; St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 65). The isolation and lack of infrastructure reduces the competitive advantage for these communities as the volume of timber offered by the Government is not enough to make investments economically viable (Parfitt 2007). With this disincentive, such First Nations communities are unable to participate actively in resource management for economic benefits (St. Germain and Sibbeston, 2007, 65). Some regions experienced significant forest fires over the past few years (Parfitt 2007). While trees in burned-over areas still retain high economic value, provided that they are logged within a few years of the fire, a significant investment is required to re-fit sawmills in order to deal with the blackened outsides of the logs (ibid). With the abundance of fiber from the mountain pine beetle outbreak, such communities would be at a cost disadvantage, hence it is unlikely that they would make the extra investment to re-fit sawmills and harvest burnt trees (ibid). Some Nations, such as the Moricetown Band, were already participating in forestry ventures prior to the FRAs and FROs (Parfitt 2007). These Nations had already built internal human capacity and were able to benefit from FRAs (Parfitt 2007). Having significant forestry tenure uniquely positions a
First Nation community to manage resources within its territories (ibid). Community Forest Licenses in conjunction with FRAs and FROs give First Nations communities more access to economically viable forestry resources as demonstrated by the Westbank First Nation (ibid). The Nation signed its Community Forest License with the Provincial Government, acquiring an area of Crown forestland 46,000 hectares in size and an associated annual logging volume of 55,000 cubic meters per year (Parfitt 2007). The license, combined with woodlot tenure and the FRA, provided Westbank First Nation with economically viable logging and sawmilling interests in the region (ibid). Parfitt (2007) stated that communities need a significant investment in technology combined with high logging volumes to generate profit from forestry resources.

Communities are able to manage ecosystems within their territory on their own terms if they are in possession of economically viable forestry resources as demonstrated by the Tl’atz’en and Ktunaxa communities (King 2004, 164; Parfitt 2007; Prince 2002). The Tl’atz’en Nation has a tree farm license and a logging venture from which they have built resource-based enterprises to restore their communities (ibid). The Tl’atz’en Nation’s Elders insist on sustainable practices such as stream buffers, no use of herbicides and pesticides, and limited sustainable cutting regimes (King 2004, 164; Prince 2002). The Ktunaxa Nation has a critical mass of fiber from its Community Forest License and FRA agreement (Parfitt 2007). Partfitt (2007) stated that Ktunaxa’s territories were once savanna-like settings consisting of grasses and widely dispersed trees. Many such places have become overrun with trees because of more contemporary fire-suppression efforts (ibid). Under its community stewardship plan, Ktunaxa planned to include logging and prescribed burning
program in degraded ecosystem areas to bring back such lands to their earlier character, making the landscape more ecologically diverse (Parfitt 2007).

The infestation of the Mountain Pine Beetle has created uncertainties in the future of the Forestry Industry (Simpson 2007b). A number of First Nations communities are solely dependent on the Forestry industry as their economic base (NRCan 2006c; Simpson 2007b). Without access to economically viable volumes of forestry resources, First Nations communities would be unable to compete with the established industry players (Parfitt 2007). The infestation of the Mountain Pine Beetle has led to a significant increase in the volume of fiber being harvested in British Columbia (ibid). With the increased amount of logging activities, the severity of the Mountain Pine Beetle attack, and the forecasted downturn in the Forestry industry, economic diversification has become a top priority for many communities in British Columbia (Simpson 2007a, 2007b).

2.8 Regional Characteristics: Quesnel and Williams Lake

The Nazko First Nation and Esketemc First Nation have their traditional territories spanning a significant proportion of the Cariboo Regional District (Carruthers 1997). The Nazko traditional territory encompasses the entirety of the Quesnel District's timber supply area, while the Esketemc traditional territory spans the banks of the Fraser River within the Cariboo region (Carruthers 1997).

Members of First Nations communities access Provincial and Federal Government services through Service Centre communities (DIAND 1994-2004). These services include health care services, community and social services, environment services, Canada Post, and
employment centres (ibid). The town of Quesnel is the nearest Service Centre for the Nazko people while Williams Lake is the nearest Service Centre for the Esketemc people (DIAND 1994 – 2004; Statistics Canada 2004). Table 2.3 summarizes the characteristics of the Quesnel and Williams Lake area, and the Province of British Columbia according to the census data of the year 2001.

The First Nations peoples occupied the modern Quesnel area for thousands of years before Europeans explorers arrived (QCEDC 2005, 10). The gold rush and the arrival of the railway increased the population and development in the Quesnel area and subsequently, the community became a municipality in 1928 (QECDC 2005, 10). Quesnel is located at the confluence of the Quesnel and Fraser Rivers. It is the commercial centre of the North Cariboo with a population of 24,426 people (QCEDC 2005, 5; Statistics Canada 2002). The area has established road and rail networks, an airport, communications technology, and a high employment participation rate of 67.9% as shown in Table 2.4. BC Rail serves the Quesnel area with freight trains running north and south, and the Rocky Mountain Vacation train which stops in Quesnel during the summer months. Quesnel is connected by road to the North and South of the Province via Highway 97. The airport is located at the north end of the City and has an elevation of 544m with a runway of about 45m wide and 1,672m long (QCEDC 2005). Central Mountain Air provides daily scheduled flights to Vancouver from Quesnel airport (ibid). There are also several helicopter charter services available at Quesnel airport (ibid).

The Williams Lake area was home to the Chilcotin, Carrier, and Shuswap First Nations people prior to European contact (WLEDO 2007). The area was named after one of
the First Nations Chiefs, Chief Williams (WLEDO 2007, 5). The City of Williams Lake was incorporated as a village in 1929 and assumed a town status in 1965 (WLEDO 2007). As a result of the Gibraltar mine, the population increased and Williams Lake became a City in 1981 (WLEDO 2007, 5). With a population of 25,112, the Williams Lake area is established as a major commercial centre (WLEDO 2007). The area benefits from economic infrastructures such as good rail and road networks, air transportation, communications technology, and a high employment participation rate of 72.5%. BC Rail serves the Williams Lake area with freight trains running north and south (WLEDO 2007, 16). The Williams Lake airport is located about 14 km north of the city with a 2100m runway (ibid). The airport is served by Central Mountain Air and Pacific Coastal Airline, providing three flights to Vancouver daily (WLEDO 2007, 16). The Williams Lake area is connected to the North and South of British Columbia via Highway 97 and to Bella Coola on the Coast via Highway 20.

Table 2.3 shows that the average employment income in 2001 in Quesnel was $28,652. Employment earnings accounted for 79.5% of all income in the year. Table 2.3 also shows that the average employment income for 2001 in Williams Lake was $29,087 with employment earnings accounting for 81.4% of all income for the year. Table 2.4 shows that for the year 2001, the employment rate (E / LF) in Quesnel was 58.6% while the unemployment rate was 13.8% for the same period. In the year 2001, the employment rate (E / LF) in Williams Lake of 62.2% was higher than the overall employment rate in British Columbia, which was 59.6% for the same period. The Williams Lake area had a 14.3% unemployment rate.
Table 2.3: 2001 Community Profiles: Williams Lake and Quesnel (Statistics Canada 2002).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Quesnel Agglomeration</th>
<th>Williams Lake Agglomeration</th>
<th>British Columbia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>24,426</td>
<td>25,122</td>
<td>3,907,738</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median age of population</td>
<td>37.4</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>38.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of population ages 15 and over</td>
<td>79.1</td>
<td>79.1</td>
<td>81.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Earnings in 2000:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Quesnel Agglomeration</th>
<th>Williams Lake Agglomeration</th>
<th>British Columbia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All persons with earnings</td>
<td>13,145</td>
<td>14,595</td>
<td>2,128,545</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average earnings of all persons with earnings ($)</td>
<td>28,652</td>
<td>29,087</td>
<td>31,544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total earnings ($)</strong></td>
<td><strong>376,630,540</strong></td>
<td><strong>424,524,765</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Income in 2000:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Quesnel Agglomeration</th>
<th>Williams Lake Agglomeration</th>
<th>British Columbia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Persons 15 years of age and over with income</td>
<td>17,770</td>
<td>18,615</td>
<td>2,990,520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median total income of persons 15 years of age and over with income</td>
<td>19,306</td>
<td>21,849</td>
<td>22,095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition of income</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earnings - % of income</td>
<td>79.5</td>
<td>81.4</td>
<td>75.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government transfers - % of income</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>11.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other money - % of income</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2.4: 2001 Labour Force and Economic Activities: Williams Lake and Quesnel (Statistics Canada 2002).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labour Force:</th>
<th>Quesnel Agglomeration</th>
<th>Williams Lake Agglomeration</th>
<th>British Columbia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed labour force 15 years and over</td>
<td>11,155</td>
<td>12,215</td>
<td>1,883,975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation rate</td>
<td>67.9</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>65.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment rate</td>
<td>58.6</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>59.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Activities:</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Main Industry Sectors</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>Forestry, mining, agriculture, tourism</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliance on Forestry (%)</td>
<td>&gt; 80</td>
<td>&gt; 80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.5 below shows that the major industry employers in Quesnel for the year 2004 were in the forestry sectors with Wal-Mart being the only major employer in the retail sector. Table 2.6 below shows the Forestry and Mining sectors as leading industry employers in the Williams Lake area for the year 2007, with Overwaitea Save on Foods being the only major retail employer.
Table 2.5: Leading Employers in the Quesnel Area, 2004 (QCEDC 2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>West Fraser Timber Company</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>1478(^{10})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School District 28</td>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GR Baker Memorial Hospital</td>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Logging Contractors</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canfor</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tolko Industries</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dunkley Lumber</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Quesnel</td>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wal-Mart</td>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C&amp;C Wood Products</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.6: Leading Employers in the Williams Lake Area, 2007 (WLEDO 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tolko Industries Ltd</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Fraser Mills</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>577</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interior Health Authority</td>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School District #27</td>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mount Polley</td>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gibraltar Mine</td>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jackpine Forest Products Ltd</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overwaitea Save on Foods</td>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caribou Road Services</td>
<td>Services</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Williams Lake</td>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pioneer Log Home</td>
<td>Forestry re-manufacturing</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^9\) West Fraser purchased Weldwood of Canada, Quesnel River Pulp, and Cariboo Pulp and Paper
\(^{10}\) Combined West Fraser, Weldwood, Quesnel River Pulp, and Cariboo Pulp & Paper employment for the year 2004
2.9 Economic Base and Resource Reliance: Quesnel and Williams Lake

According to Natural Resources Canada (NRCan 2006c), the economic base for a community is defined as the total employment income within the local economy that is generated by demand from outside the community. Economic base is calculated as the employment generated by goods exported by the community (ibid). Natural Resources Canada (2006c) believed that this calculation is essential for the economic well-being and viability of most communities. The employment income of the economic base subsequently supports other industries, including local services, that generate income solely from the local area (NRCan 2006c). Natural Resources Canada classified the economic impact of resources extracted in communities in terms of the employment income directly generated by their exploitation, processing, and in some cases distribution to determine a community's dependency of these resources (NRCan 2006c). Table 2.7 below shows the degree of reliance on resource according to the dependency classification.

Table 2.7: Degrees of Resource Reliance (NRCan 2006c)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range of Values</th>
<th>Name of Class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30.0 to 49.9%</td>
<td>Moderately reliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50.0 to 64.9%</td>
<td>Strongly reliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65.0 to 79.9%</td>
<td>Highly reliant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80.0 to 100.0%</td>
<td>Solely reliant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Resource reliance is a measure of the relative importance of a resource sector to a
particular community (NRCan 2006c). Natural Resources Canada created the reliance classes and their names solely for qualitative comparison of the degree of reliance of communities (NRCan 2006c). British Columbia has a larger amount of available forest fibre on an annual basis than any other province because of its mild and moist climate, hence there are a number of communities in the Province which depend on the forestry sector for their economic base (NRCan 2006c).

According to the Natural Resource Canada classification, the City of Quesnel and its surrounding communities are solely reliant on the forestry industry (NRCan 2006b). The forest industry is the primary driving force for the Quesnel economy with approximately 2200 families directly depending on it for their livelihood (QCEDC 2005, 20). Local mills provide a variety of commodity and value-added products for the USA and overseas markets, generating over $500m in revenue (ibid). There are 155 farms in Quesnel with about 6,121 hectares of land in crops (QCEDC 2005). Quesnel has an established Farmers' Market for the local growers which opens every weekend from May to October (ibid). There are a number of tourism assets in Quesnel, including Dragon Lake which is a world class fly fishing lake; Hallis Lake Cross Country Ski and Troll Ski resort; two Golf courses; a Casino; a Museum; various parks and riverfront trails; and a number of historical buildings. Quesnel also provides the only road access to the historical towns of Wells and Barkerville, and Cottonwood House (QCEDC 2005).

The economic base of the City of Williams Lake includes cattle ranching, forestry, wood manufacturing, mining, tourism, service industry, and Government Agencies (WLEDO 2007). According to Natural Resources Canada's classification, the City of
Williams Lake and its surrounding communities are solely reliant on the forestry industry (NRCan 2006b). The forestry sector is recognized as the main economic driver in the Williams Lake area with lumber mill companies currently employing 4,800 people and contributing about $190m in earnings to the area (WLEDO 2007, 17). Local companies hold approximately 7.5million cubic meters of allowable annual cut through multiple tenures which represents 10% of the Province's allowable annual cut and approximately $180m in stumpage fees to the Province (WLEDO 2007, 17).

The Williams Lake area has two major mines, the Gibraltar mine operated by Taseko Mines Ltd, and Mount Polley operated by Imperial Metals Corporation (WLEDO 2007). The mines produce copper, molybdenum, and gold, and employs over 580 people when fully operational (WLEDO 2007, 18). It is anticipated that Taseko Mines will add a copper refinery to its operation which is located about 80 km north of Williams Lake (ibid). This refinery would add another 100 construction jobs and 50 operating jobs to the area (WLEDO 2007, 18).

The beef production sector forms the backbone of agriculture in the Williams Lake area (WLEDO 2007). The Cariboo Chilcotin area has 646 beef cattle ranches which account for 20% of the Province's beef cattle population (WLEDO 2007, 20). Most cattle in the region are sold through the Williams Lake stockyard with total receipts of approximately $33m. According to the Williams Lake Economic Development Office, the annual sales from farming in the region are about $55m which accounts for 3% of the Province's agricultural production (WLEDO 2007, 19).

Tourism is one of the fastest growing sectors in British Columbia's economy
(WLEDO 2007, 21). Accommodation in the Cariboo Chilcotin Coast region generated a revenue of $23.6m in the year 2005 (ibid). The City of Williams Lake is creating its tourism infrastructure in order to increase its share of the tourism market within the area (WLEDO 2007).

2.10 Native Americans' Barriers to Economic Development and Critical Success Factors

While it is possible that business development may negatively impact indigenous culture, the same question might be asked as to whether Chinese, Japanese, or Jewish people are less Chinese, Japanese, or Jewish because they engage in business?... These groups still continue to be culturally Chinese, Japanese, and Jewish and actually use the wealth they create to bolster their culture. (Helin 2006)

Helin (2006) argued that economic integration, such as found within the Chinese, Japanese, and Jewish cultures, does not necessarily imply a loss of indigenous culture. As part of the Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, Cornell and Kalt (1992) reported on the list shown in tables 2.8a and 2.8b as obstacles or barriers to economic development on Indian reservations in the United States. Some of these obstacles or barriers are internal barriers for the tribes, or experienced externally by potential developers as shown in tables 2.8a and 2.8b (ibid). Helin (2006, 171, 172) also stated that there is no cultural dignity in the welfare trap or an unemployment line, hence there is a need for Indigenous cultures to make progress in development like the rest of the world.
Table 2.8a: Obstacles or Barriers to Development (Cornell and Kalt, 1992)

| Obstacles or Barriers                                                                 | Internal or External Experience |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------
| Tribe or individual lack access to financial capital.                               | Internal                        |
| Lack of education, skills, and technical expertise, and the means to develop it.     | Internal                        |
| Tribes cannot persuade investors to locate on reservations because of intense competition from non-Indian communities. | Internal                        |
| Non-Indian outsiders control or confound tribal decision-making.                    | Internal                        |
| Tribes have unworkable and/or externally imposed systems of government.             | Internal                        |
| Alcoholism and other social problems are destroying tribes' human capital.          | Internal                        |
| The long-term effects of racism have undermined tribal self-confidence.             | Internal                        |
| Tribal cultures get in the way.                                                    | Internal                        |

Helin (2006, 191) broke down barriers to Indigenous development in Canada into two categories: (a) systemic and (b) inherent barriers. Systemic barriers reported by Helin (2006, 197), included lack of accountability at all levels of Indigenous government, lack of transparency and accountability in handling of monies and budgets, poor management and allocation of existing transfer payments, and in some cases, corruption or ineptitude that has resulted in monies and resources being wasted. He further stated that generations of Indigenous people living on welfare payments have created a welfare trap and a dependency mindset (Helin 2006, 191). This dependency mindset is termed as 'Inherent barriers' (ibid).
Table 2.8b: Obstacles and Barriers to Development (Cornell and Kalt, 1992)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Obstacles or Barriers</th>
<th>Internal or External Experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The instability of tribal government keeps outsiders from investing.</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-reservation factionalism destroys stability in tribal decisions.</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tribal politicians and bureaucrats are inept or corrupt.</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurial skills and experience are scarce.</td>
<td>Internal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reservations lack effective planning or are subject to too much planning and not enough action.</td>
<td>Internal and external</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Indian management techniques will not work on the Reservation or Non-Indian management techniques will work, but are absent.</td>
<td>Internal and external</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federal and state policies are counterproductive and/or discriminatory.</td>
<td>Internal and External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reservations are disadvantaged by their distance from markets and the high costs of transportation.</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reservations are poor in natural resources or have natural resources, but lack sufficient control over them.</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Bureau of Indian Affairs is inept, corrupt, and/or uninterested in reservation development.</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reservation savings rates are low.</td>
<td>External</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

St. Germain and Sibbeston (2007) reported on some key barriers to economic development to the Standing Senate Committee on Aboriginal Peoples in Canada. The reported barriers included access to capital, legislative and regulatory barriers, limited access to lands and resources, building human capital, infrastructure deficits, lack of governance capacity, and fragmented Federal approach to economic development and limited funding.

Helin (2006, 193) stated that the failure to separate government and corporate
functions results in confusion of goals because the organizational focus of businesses are different from that of tribal governments. Table 2.9 below shows some of Helin's (2006, 193) summary of the differences in business and tribal organizations' focus.

**Table 2.9: Different Organizational Focus (Helin 2006)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business Focus</th>
<th>Tribal Government Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Profit driven</td>
<td>Social welfare driven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business planning</td>
<td>Big picture planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost control</td>
<td>Budget based planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on needs</td>
<td>Focus on rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>Dependent on government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite barriers that exist, the study by Atlantic Canada Opportunities Agency showed that some Nations are achieving success in their economic development ventures (ACOA 2003). These Nations include Eel River Bar, Mi'kmaq, Lennox Island, and Labrador Inuits (ibid). Success factors listed in the report (ACOA 2003) included good governance planning, holistic approach to development, successful projects were in tune with the communities' desires and needs, having qualified people in place, capacity building within the communities, building trusting relationships, engaging youth, gaining accessibility and control of resources, incorporating culture in projects, sharing best practices, ability to work co-operatively with neighboring communities and others, bottom-up initiatives, making government programs work for the communities, and smart business plans and market opportunities.

St. Germain and Sibbeston (2007) noted factors contributing to economic
development success included good leadership and vision, understanding the complementary roles of politics and business, legitimacy of economic development activities, identifying a community's best features, having a qualified labor force, and partnerships with industry. St. Germain and Sibbeston (2007) concluded their report to the Standing Senate Committee on Aboriginal Peoples by stating that Canada's Aboriginal people view economic development as fundamental to reshaping their social outcomes and are asking that this area be afforded a greater priority.

2.11 The United Nations' Millennium Development Goals

We will spare no effort to free our fellow men, women and children from the abject and dehumanizing conditions of extreme poverty, to which more than a billion of them are currently subjected. We are committed to making the right to development a reality for everyone and to freeing the entire human race from want. (UN 2000, 4).

The above is a quote by the world leaders at the United Nations Millennium Summit of September 2000. The world leaders, including Canada, made a number of resolutions (UN 2000). The resolutions included the following:

1. By the year 2015, to halve the proportion of the world’s people whose income is less than one dollar a day and the proportion of people who suffer from hunger and, by the same date, to halve the proportion of people who are unable to reach or to afford safe drinking water;

2. By the year 2015, to ensure that children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be
able to complete a full course of primary schooling, and that girls and boys will have equal access to all levels of education;

3. By the year 2015, to have reduced maternal mortality by three quarters, and under-five child mortality by two thirds, of their current rates;

4. By 2015, to have halted, and begun to reverse, the spread of HIV/AIDS, the scourge of malaria and other major diseases that afflict humanity;

5. To provide special assistance to children orphaned by HIV/AIDS;

6. By the year 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers as proposed in the “Cities Without Slums”11 initiative;

7. To promote gender equality and the empowerment of women as effective ways to combat poverty, hunger, and disease, and to stimulate development that is truly sustainable;

8. To develop and implement strategies that give young people everywhere a real chance to find decent and productive work;

9. To develop strong partnerships with the private sector and with civil society organizations in pursuit of development and poverty eradication;

10. To ensure that the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communication technologies,12 are available to all;

11. To respect fully and uphold the Universal Declaration of Human Rights13;

12. To strive for all the full protection and promotion in our countries of civil, political, economic, social, and cultural rights for all;

---

11 Action plans with concrete targets to improve the living conditions of the world’s most vulnerable and marginalized urban residents.
12 Forms part of the UN ECOSOC 2000 Ministerial Declaration.
13 Forms part of the UN Resolution 217A.
13. To strengthen the capacity of all our countries to implement the principles and practices of democracy and respect for human rights, including minority rights;

14. To combat all forms of violence against women and to implement the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women;¹⁴

15. To take measures to ensure respect for and protection of the human rights of migrants, migrant workers and their families, to eliminate the increasing acts of racism and xenophobia in many societies and to promote greater harmony and tolerance in all societies;

16. To work collectively for more inclusive political processes, allowing genuine participation by all citizens in all our countries;

17. To ensure the freedom of the media to perform their essential role and the right of the public to have access to information.

As a result of these resolutions, world leaders agreed to a set of measurable goals and targets (UN 2000). These goals, called the Millennium Development Goals, set targets for eight areas identified for improvement by the year 2015 (UN 2002 – 2006a; UN 2000). The identified areas were poverty and hunger, primary education, women’s equality, child mortality, maternal health, disease, environment, and a global partnership for development. The Millennium Development Goals provided a time bound framework for social and economic development programmes delivered in many poor and developing countries (UN 2004b). Since its inception, the goals have transformed global development cooperation with unprecedented coordinated action (UN 2004b; UN 2008). The United Nations warned

¹⁴ Forms part of the UN Resolution 34/180.
that progress had been hardest to come by in the poorest nations and in many cases
development had been reversed, but developing countries are reducing extreme poverty,
extending access to primary education, and alleviating disease and hunger in many regions
of the world (UN 2004b).

2.12 The Rights Based Approach to Development and Gender Equality

Indigenous peoples have the right of self-determination. By virtue of that right they
freely determine their political status and freely pursue their economic, social and
cultural development. Indigenous peoples have the right to maintain and strengthen
their distinct political, economic, social and cultural characteristics, as well as their
legal systems, while retaining their rights to participate fully, if they so choose, in the
political, economic, social and cultural life of the State (UN 1993, Article 3 and 4).

Article 7 of the International Labour Organisation (1991) supports the rights of
Indigenous peoples to develop. The article also stated that Indigenous peoples have the right
to exercise control over their own economic, social, and cultural development (International
Labour Organisation 1991). The people also have the right to the improvement of the
conditions of life and work and levels of health and education, with their participation and
co-operation (ibid).

The United Nations declaration on the rights of Indigenous peoples supports the
Rights Based Approach to development (UN 1993). First Nations people have the right to
share in and participate in the economic prosperity of British Columbia (Parfitt 2007). The
Report on Aboriginal People showed that most First Nations people live in poverty (RCAP 1996). The definition of poverty used by the United Nations referred to people living under one dollar a day (UN 2000), but CARE International (2005) paraphrased the definition as hunger, lack of shelter, being sick and not being able to see a doctor, not being able to go to school and not knowing how to read, not having a job, fear of the future, living one day at a time, losing a child to illness brought on by unclean water, powerlessness, and the lack of representation and freedom. The Royal Commission's report expressed poverty amongst Canada's Aboriginal people, as living in deplorable social and economic conditions (RCAP 1996).

In its analysis of poverty, CARE's initial hypothesis was that poverty was related to food availability decline and the lack of basic necessities such as water and healthcare (CARE 2005). Further analysis by the organization showed that poverty was also related to the lack of entitlement such as assets, opportunities, skills, and knowledge (CARE 2005). The organization now believes that the lack of assets such as land, access to markets to sell and buy, and the lack of basic education and vocational training all contribute to poverty (ibid). This view was also expressed by Sen (1983), who stated that poverty is related to the lack of entitlement. The hypothesis now used by CARE (2005) is that poverty, in most cases, is rooted in human-made systems that exclude, marginalize, and discriminate against certain groups of people. This view was also supported by Akinsanmi (2005) and Tisdell (2002). CARE (2005) believed that the lack of entitlement and absence of necessary goods and services were symptoms of exclusion and social injustice.

Development agencies believed that about 70% of the 1.3 billion people who lived in
extreme poverty were women and girls (Oxfam 2006; CARE 2005). The United Nations believed that women are agents of development, hence, the main aim of the Millennium Development Goal number three was to empower women and promote gender equality (UN 2000; UNDP 2003). In its 2006 report, the United Nation stated that women are still at a disadvantage in securing paid jobs and face inequality in income, occupational segregation, higher unemployment rates, and a disproportionate representation in the informal and subsistence sectors (UNDP 2006, 8). The major causes of these included sociocultural attitudes, employment policies, and the lack of options for balancing work and family responsibilities or for controlling the timing and spacing of births (UNDP 2006, 8). Gender discrimination, or the denial of women’s basic human rights, is a major cause of poverty because men and women experience many aspects of poverty differently (Oxfam 2006).

Isaac (2004) stated that Aboriginal women in Canada face dual discrimination as members of the visible minority group and as a result of their gender. They are the victims of racism, of sexism, and excessive levels of domestic violence (ibid). They have been segregated from the wider society and from their traditional role as equal and strong members of their community due to the effects of past discriminations (ibid). This has placed them in a disadvantaged position in mainstream society (ibid). Isaac (2004, 504) further expressed that Native females are at multiple jeopardy on a number of socio-economic indicators, hence face additional barriers to economic and social health. Their socio-economic development is very poor as a result of the demeaning image that has developed over the years (Isaac 2004, 506). A report of an Aboriginal justice inquiry showed that Aboriginal women and their children have suffered as victims of contemporary
Canadian society (Isaac 2004, 506).

Tisdell (2002) stated that when poverty strikes a family, it is often the women who suffer most. When mothers suffer poverty in rural communities, so do their children because for every one woman living in poverty, there are at least four hungry children (Akinsanmi 2005; Tisdell 2002). A high incidence of child poverty goes hand in hand with a high incidence of poverty among women in rural communities (Tisdell 2002). In 2002, Afshar and Alikhan carried out a study to try and understand what empowerment is in terms of the experiences of a group of elderly women dwelling in the slums of Hyderabad, India. They identified empowerment as an important tool for enabling marginalized individuals to gain access to resources and to value the individual's own experiences (Afshar and Alikhan, 2002).

In 2002, CARE adopted a 'rights-based' approach to poverty reduction (CARE 2005). The organization had a shift in paradigm, from viewing livelihoods as human needs to seeing them as human rights, and CARE now focuses on people achieving the minimum conditions for living with dignity (ibid). The 'rights-based' approach helped the organization to expose the roots of vulnerability and marginalization, and to address issues of gender, governance, and power (CARE 2005). According to CARE (2005), a rights-based approach insists that: poverty is neither natural nor inevitable, but has roots in political and economic decisions; helps identify the structural and societal causes of poverty and marginalization; aims to address relations between those who wield power and those who do not; provides a means of strengthening people’s capacities to claim and exercise their rights; and clarifies authorities’ duties to those they supposedly serve. Drinkwater (2005) stated that the
increased number of developmental organizations using the 'rights-based' approach to poverty reduction has brought a different perspective to human rights.

2.13 Literature Review Conclusion

The specific goals of this study are: (1) to identify economic development opportunities beneficial for both the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations, (2) to complement or add to the body of knowledge in the area of economic development for the two communities, and (3) to provide the communities with information which could be used in their economic development planning. The study explores ways of creating social enterprises using resources available to the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations, in line with their culture and values.

- 62 -
CHAPTER 3

METHODS

3.1 Introduction

I am fortunate to have an African heritage and to be visibly different which uniquely differentiated my research from that of other Western researchers. From a position of trust, I gathered information, and soon recognized that the knowledge gained from this research needed to be presented back to the First Nation communities. During my Internship study period, from January to March of 2007, I worked in an economic development capacity for the Nazko First Nation Band. At the end of the period, I became employed as the Economic Development Manager for the Band. My Masters degree in Business Administration and my industry experiences placed me in a unique position to work with the Nazko people, and to help them with some of their developmental aspirations. Prior to this research, I worked with Community Futures Development Corporation of the North Cariboo as a Project Coordinator for two years, where I gained insight into the economic development challenges faced by the region. Of particular value to this study was my employment with Nazko First Nation which spanned the duration of this research. My employment with the Band began on the 1st of April 2007 with a one year contract. Through my employment, I worked with the Band's Administrative staff, Chief and Council, community members, various provincial ministries, local municipal government, and industry representatives. Most of the data in this inquiry was collected between May 2007 and November 2007.
3.2 Participatory Action Research

I chose a participatory action research methodology for this study because I wanted to involve the communities that I was studying in the entire research process. I believe that their involvement in the process would provide insights which may not necessarily be captured through "outsider" research. Kemmis and McTaggart (2005) proposed that participatory action research aims to help people recover, and release themselves from the constraints of irrational, unproductive, unjust, and dissatisfying social structures that limit their self development and self determination. They further asserted that it is a process whereby people explored ways in which their practices are shaped and constrained by wider social, cultural, economic, and, political structures (ibid). This research method gives people the opportunity to consider whether they can intervene to release themselves from these constraints (Kemmis and McTaggart, 2005, 567). The participatory action research method was ideally suited for this study because the work and lives of Band members contribute to the structuring of a shared social life (Kemmis and McTaggart, 2005).

Smith (1999, 170) stated that research is about satisfying a need to know, and a need to extend boundaries of existing knowledge through a process of systematic inquiry. Some Indigenous people have a deep distrust and suspicion of research because it is seen as an important part of colonization where Indigenous people served as the object of research (Smith 1999, 173). Despite researchers believing that they would improve the conditions of the research participants, many Indigenous people still live in extreme levels of poverty, in chronic ill health, have poor education opportunities, use polluted water supplies, and live in substandard housing and impoverished social conditions (Smith 1999; RCAP 1996). The
central aim of this research was to work with the communities, and to gather information meaningful to their development.

This participatory action research is based on the human rights approach to poverty. According to the United Nations (2004a, 18), this approach requires the active and informed participation of the poor in the formulation, implementation, and monitoring of poverty reduction strategies. The right to participate meaningfully is deeply dependent on the realization of other human rights including the right to speak freely without intimidation and have access to information in order to know the relevant facts (UN 2004a, 19). The data gathering for this research was performed with consideration for the human rights of Band members in the research communities. A comprehensive view of possibilities, as well as difficulties, of economic development emerged through making assumptions founded on the understanding that every individual has a right to development. This understanding is based on the United Nations Human Rights Declaration of 1948 (UNDP 1998).

3.3 Indigenous Research

The Esketemc and Nazko First Nations have not achieved a state of “independence” as experienced by some Nations who have signed their Treaties with the Canadian Government. The two communities are at stage 4 of the 6-stage treaty process and are still subject to regulations from Indian and Northern Affairs Canada (INAC). Both Nations face ongoing struggles for the recognition of their Aboriginal rights and title within their traditional territories.

The Esketemc First Nation has been the object of numerous studies following the
Band achieving 95% sobriety in 1985 from 100% alcoholism in 1971 (Alkali Lake 1987). A documentary was made, entitled 'The Honour of All', showing how the community achieved this goal (ibid). As a result of the documentary, the community became known as a leader in the sobriety movement (Alkali Lake 1987). A member of Esketemc First Nation was concerned that this research study would leave the community no better off than other research they had participated in. The following is an extract from an email communication with this Band member:

Past experience has been that individuals use the community for completion of a thesis such as this and in the end the community is no further ahead in terms of our goals and dreams such as a treatment program for our children, in the meantime you will have received your degree (Esketemc 2007).

Smith (1999) explained that when the word “research” is mentioned in many Indigenous contexts, it stirs up silence and conjures up bad memories because of colonization and assimilation experiences. Crocker (2005) stated that the function of research is not only gathering and making sense of information, but also acting responsibly with that information. Champagne (1998, 183) noted that the unhappiness expressed by Indian communities against scholars was partly due to the different way in which data was collected and published, and that method resulted in little benefit to the host Indian community. Champagne (1998, 183) suggested benefits can be returned to communities by way of written reports or presentations to tribal government, or by lending academic skills to tribal projects. For these reasons, I chose participatory action research and hoped that the findings from this inquiry will make a difference to the Nations and individuals, and serve to
move the communities ahead in their development. As part of my research, I presented new information to the Esketeme and Nazko communities and shared my findings which was in line with the daily interests of the Band governments.

3.4 Ethical Considerations and Respect for the Communities

This research was carried out following University of Northern British Columbia's ethical guidelines. The research involved human subjects and Aboriginal communities which meant that the approval of the University's Ethics Board and the consent of the First Nations communities was required before data collection started. As a result of my employment with the Nazko Band, I became immersed in the community's culture for the period of this inquiry. This posed an ethical problem for me because I had access to the community and some members were not aware that I was conducting research while working as an employee. While I had the 'informed consent' of the Nazko Band's Chief and Council, I also had access to information which was not public and may not have been supplied to a researcher. As a result, I decided to use more secondary data, participate in public forums and bring information back to the communities. The focus of my research became that of gathering external information and presenting it back to the communities in ways which were meaningful to them, and to elicit their comments and suggestions in the ongoing dialog that is at the heart of this participatory research.

As part of my academic career, I have presented some of my research findings at conferences. I informed the communities about the nature of my presentation and was careful to present only public information.
3.5 Data Collection

The use of multiple sources of evidence in data collection increases the validity of a qualitative inquiry (Yin 1994, 78). Using multiple sources for data collection provides the opportunity for triangulation (Yin 1994, 91). In this inquiry, data was collected by direct observation, participant observation, participation at First Nations regional forums, public documentation, and some semi-structured interviews.

Figure 3.1 shows the sources of data used in this inquiry. Data was collected through attending Provincial First Nations conferences and Forums, in-depth interviews

Figure 3.1: Sources of data.

with two of Nazko First Nation Elders, while working as an Economic Development
Manager for the Nazko Band, through community meetings at Alkali Lake, and from secondary sources.

3.5.1 Participant Observation, Direct Observation, and Micro-ethnography

Bryman and Teevan (2005, 165) defined ethnography as a research method in which the researcher is immersed in a social setting for an extended period of time, making regular observations of the behaviour of members of that setting, listening and engaging in conversations, interviewing informants on issues not directly amenable to observation or that the ethnographer is unclear about, collecting data about the group, developing an understanding of the culture of the group and people's behaviour within the context of that culture, and writing up a detailed account of that setting. Bryman and Teevan (2005, 165) further stated that it was possible to carry out a form of micro-ethnography involving a focus on one specific aspect or topic over a shorter period of time, from a couple of weeks to a few months, in the organization either on a full-time or part-time basis.

In my position of Economic Development Manager, I had the opportunity to become a micro-ethnographer. Thorne (2000) stated that when a researcher claims to have used ethnographic methods, it is assumed that he or she has come to know a culture or group through immersion and engagement in fieldwork or participant observation and has also undertaken to portray that culture through text. Thorne (2000) further stated that ethnographic analysis uses an iterative process in which cultural ideas, that arise during active involvement “in the field”, are transformed, translated, or represented in a written document. It involves sifting and sorting through pieces of data to detect and interpret
thematic categorizations, search for inconsistencies and contradictions, and to generate conclusions about what is happening and why (ibid). Working as the Economic Development Manager for Nazko First Nation, I had the opportunity to become immersed in the lives of the Nazko people. I traveled to some of the Nazko's Reserves, and spent time attending different activities with community members. My employment with the Band continued beyond this inquiry.

Smith (1999, 137) raised the issue of an 'Insider/Outsider' researcher. She stated that most methodologies assume that the researcher is an outsider able to observe without being implicated in the scene, but feminist research has made the 'Insider' researcher much more acceptable in qualitative research. The 'Insider' researcher is similar to what Bryman and Teevan (2005) described as 'going native'. According to Bryman and Teevan (2005, 172), 'going native' is a condition when ethnographers lose their sense of being researchers and become wrapped up in the world view of the people they are studying. Working in the paid position of Economic Development Manager for Nazko, I became an 'Insider' researcher and had to become 'native' in my world view in order to fulfill my commitments to the Band. This had the advantage of providing valuable insights into the development challenges of the community, which would not have been gained from an 'outsider' position. This also presented the ethical dilemma of access to private information.

My employment with the Nazko Band gave me valuable insights into the realities of First Nation communities, their struggles, and their daily challenges. I became an insider/outside researcher for both Esketemc and Nazko communities. This made me part of their solution. I became immersed in the social setting of the Nazko community, listening...
and engaging in conversations, observing, developing an understanding of the people's culture, and taking notes of information directly relevant to the economic development of the community. From an insider position, I was mindful that I had access to privileged information, not necessarily for the advancement of my research, but in my role to facilitate economic development for the communities. With this in mind, my research objectives were modified to make it more meaningful to the people. I positioned my work as a resource for the communities, gathering external data relevant to the objectives and needs they identified, and presenting it in meaningful ways to the communities in line with their development aspirations.

Part of my responsibilities as the Economic Development Manager for the Nazko First Nation included researching viable and feasible development projects, and creating a five year economic development plan for the Band. The information required to create this plan was in line with the information required for my research. For the feasibility study, data was gathered through participating in discussions, focus groups, semi-structured interviews with Band Administrative members, and attending formal and informal community meetings.

3.5.2 Public Documents

The Esketemc community became a pioneer and leader of the sobriety movement and has since gained world recognition for this success (Alkali Lake 1987). A documentary was made showing how the community achieved their sobriety. The community had a continued succession of researchers and organizations studying and working within the
people to learn more about sobriety within Indigenous communities. The Betty Ford Center, a healing centre for people with drugs and alcohol abuse, has been working in partnership with the Esketemc people since 1988 to help other individuals from around the world (BFC 2005).

The census data available from Statistics Canada includes information on population, health, education, employment, income and earnings of communities. The year 2001 was used as the base year for the census data in this study, because the data for the labour force participation, income, and earnings were not available for the year 2006. Statistics Canada also suppresses data for communities with fewer than 250 people in order to protect their identity. There are over 250 people living at Esket (Alkali Lake). As a result of this, there is more public data available about the Esketemc community. The main Nazko reserve has fewer than 250 people, hence there is limited census data available about that community.

More detailed information about all First Nations in Canada is available through the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development (DIAND). The department's website has information containing the profiles of all First Nations in Canada. This information has been extracted from a number of databases. The information includes the number of reserves and their locations, registered populations, on reserve populations, labour force indicators, Community Well-Being index, and education. Some data on this website is suppressed in line with the census data suppression policy to protect anonymity.

Secondary data was used in conjunction with data gathered through discussions and attending focus group meetings organized by the community. Throughout this inquiry, I kept community members informed of new information through meetings and email
communications in line with the United Nations' Declaration of Human Rights to information (UNDP 1998).

3.5.3 Alkali Lake Community Meetings

At the beginning of this inquiry, I attended a Chief and Council meeting at Alkali Lake to explain the purpose of this research. At the meeting, I received consent to proceed and was given guidelines to follow. In May 2007, I attended a second meeting with the Chief and Council along with most of my University of Northern British Columbia's supervisory committee. At this meeting, the Chief stated the community's goals and we were given a tour of some of the resources and community assets which were available for economic development. Subsequent to this, I attended two meetings with the Esketeme Band Administration Managers to brainstorm ideas and develop action plans for some ongoing community economic development projects. At these meetings, I took notes on information relevant to the research. The information included community guidelines, Band protocols, and community aspirations. I had various telephone conversations and email communications with two of the managers to clarify new information and to triangulate data.

During my numerous visits to Alkali Lake, I spent time within the community, observing current economic activities on the main Reserve. I met with Band members and provided them with marketing information on some of the existing business ventures. While this research was not at the request of the Band government, the practical and daily interests of the community provided direction for this inquiry.
3.5.4 Semi-Structured In-depth Interviewing

It was important to show respect for both individual participants and the communities in my research. Through my work as an employee of the Nazko First Nation, I gained more insight into the everyday lives of people within the community, and became aware that a significant number of people were still suffering from the effects of residential schools. As my relationship with the community developed, the Chief at Alkali Lake pointed out that conducting interviews with some Elders may trigger unresolved traumas as a result of their residential school experience. My lack of training or experience in dealing with traumas, such as those caused by the residential school experience, made it inappropriate for me to probe deeply into the lives of some members of the Nazko and Esket communities. I had to rethink my data gathering methods and continue my inquiry in ways which were less intrusive.

I conducted semi-structured in-depth interviews with Doreen Patrick and Geneva Irwin, both Elders from the Nazko First Nation. The interviews provided the opportunity to clarify historical information and issues that were not directly amenable to observation. These Elders are over 55 years of age and are recognized as community and spiritual leaders. They were chosen because they had worked on various projects for the Band, including the Traditional Land Use study, and I had developed working relationships with these Elders as part of my employment with the Band. I also felt comfortable talking to them about social issues within the Nazko community. These Elders also had a good command of the English language and required no translation or interpretation. They had the capacity to
answer questions in their own words and the ability to clarify their responses without intimidation, thereby exercising their freedom of expression (UN 2004a). One of the semi-structured interviews was video-recorded using a digital camera. Notes were taken during both interviews. Transcription occurred as soon as the interviews were completed. Copies of the transcripts were given to the Elders to verify while information was still clear in my mind and the minds of the interviewees.

3.5.5 Participation at First Nations Regional Forums and Conferences

Champagne (1998, 182) stated that Indian nations are human groups, who are part of a broad history of all humanity. As such, they can be compared with other groups in technology, cultural world views, history, and adaptation to global markets and expanding state systems. As part of my inquiry and my work for Nazko First Nation, I participated in three First Nations regional forums and conferences. The purpose of these events was to identify socio-economic gaps in First Nations communities, and to develop strategies and action plans to bridge these gaps. While these events were organized by First Nations organizations, there were representations from various provincial ministries and industries. Through participation, I gained insight into the regional development of First Nations communities, the development opportunities within the region, and the challenges faced by these communities.

The events I attended were the First Nations Technology Conference held in Prince George; First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative at Williams Lake; and the First Nations Economic Development Forum also held in Prince George. During each of these
events, there were focus group sessions where interested participants discussed specific issues. Information from groups were presented back to all participants. The event organizers collated all the information and emailed all participants for verification. Each event had a final report write-up which was used to develop regional action plans and strategies.

3.5.5.1 First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative: A Strategy for Developing a Sustainable Economy

I attended the First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative regional forum workshop at Williams Lake on October 30, 2007. This group is an independent organization funded by the Federal government to create a strategy for a First Nations sustainable economy. This strategy is to serve as a framework for identification of major objectives in three theme areas. These were identified at an initial planning session in North Saanich on September 24 and 25, 2007. The three themes were accelerated harvest, energy and mining opportunities, and economic diversification. Participants at the regional forum included representatives from First Nations communities, both the provincial and federal government agencies, municipal governments, and industries.

Participants were provided with background information before the forum meeting. The information included the report from the North Saanich meeting, information on the Balanced Scorecard Strategy development tool, and background information about the Mountain Pine Beetle infestation. At the regional forum, the Balanced Scorecard approach was used to identify strategic themes which were then compared with themes that emerged
from the North Saanich meeting. A similar exercise was conducted in the Prince George and Kamloops regions. There was a total number of 159 participants at all the forums including 52 First Nations communities representatives. The emergent themes from all the regions were compiled by the forum organizers, and a final report was produced. Attending this forum was useful for this inquiry, because it provided me with more information and a regional context for the Nazko and Esketeme First Nations. I took notes during this session which I later compared with the regional reports from the forums.

3.5.5.2 B.C. First Nations Community Economic Development Forum: Restoring a Working Culture

In January 2007, all elected leaders of British Columbia's First Nations and tribal associations were invited to attended the B.C. First Nation Community Economic Development Forum, in order to discover ways in which community economic development can be included within their community vision. There were representatives from 135 British Columbia's First Nations and 13 Tribal councils at the forum. The forum was held in Richmond, British Columbia, and was hosted by the First Nations Leadership Council (FNLC) and the Economic Development Regional Program Management Advisory Committee (RPMAC). This Committee is the advisory committee to the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Developments. The goals of the forum were: raising awareness of economic development, increasing the understanding of every Chief and Council of British Columbia's First Nations communities of the impact and benefits of economic development, increasing the number of First Nations focusing on economic development.
thus making wealth generation a priority, and inspiring First Nations Chief and Council to promote economic development as a priority across British Columbia and Canada.

As a follow-up from this forum, five regional events were organized to discuss and review a draft framework for a British Columbia First Nations Economic Development Strategy. These regional events were planned to take place at Chilliwack, Chase, Prince George, Terrace, and Campbell River. Chiefs, Councils and economic development officers were encouraged to attend these regional forums. The main objective of the forums was to solicit input into the development of a Province-wide economic development strategy. The participants of the regional sessions were the Chiefs, Councils, and Economic Development Officers of the First Nations communities in those regions. The forum organizers solicited advice on the recommendations from the January 2007 session. At the end of November 2007, only three regional forum events had been completed out of the five. These three forum events were at Chilliwack, Chase, and Prince George. The Terrace and Campbell River events had not taken place yet. I attended the two-day regional forum at Prince George in November 2007. I took notes at this event, but was unable to compare my notes with the forum report as it had not yet become publicly available at the time of writing this document.

3.5.5.3 First Nations Technology Council: First Nations' Land Referral Forum

The Crown has a fiducial obligation to consult meaningfully with First Nations communities before making any land use decision that would potentially infringe on their Aboriginal Titles and Rights. All land use decisions, including licenses and tenures on
Crown Land, generate Referral Applications which are presented to First Nations Administrations by the various ministries and industries. This Referral process provides First Nations communities with information about resource developments and economic opportunities within their territories. As a result of the process, Nazko First Nation, along with other First Nations communities in British Columbia, are faced with an overwhelming number of Referrals on a weekly basis. The Nazko and Esketemc Band Offices receive a significant number of these Referral applications on a daily basis and they are expected to respond with any potential infringement upon their Aboriginal title and rights within a limited time. Processing each Referral is time consuming, and could involve traditional use knowledge from the community members or even a field trip to the site. The First Nations Technology Council (FNTC), a committee of the First Nations Summit, was mandated from the British Columbia's Chiefs to develop an integrated approach to information management which would help with finding solutions for First Nations communities in dealing with Referral processing.

I attended the two-day technology forum in September 2007 at Prince George. The forum was organized by the First Nations Technology Council and the Carrier Sekani Tribal Council. At this forum, seven First Nations organizations and Tribal Councils presented information on how they manage Referrals. These organizations represented 20 First Nations in British Columbia. There were also presentations from FrontCounterBC, representing the Province of British Columbia's Integrated Land and Management Bureau; GeoConnections, representing National Research Canada (NRCAN); and the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development (DIAND). Representatives from over 70 First
Nations communities participated at the Forum. The second day at the forum included facilitated group sessions to discuss main issues and challenges facing First Nations communities with regards to resource development and capacity building. During the two days, I took notes which I later compared with the final report\(^{16}\) from the First Nations Technology Council.

### 3.6 Data Analysis

Fereday and Muir-Cochrane (2006) described thematic analysis as a process of data analysis that searches for emerging themes in raw data. This same approach, where codes emerged from data, was described by Miles and Huberman (1994, 58) as the “grounded” approach. This search for themes is important to the description of the phenomenon. The process involves identification of themes through “careful reading and re-reading of the data” which is a form of pattern recognition within the data, where emerging themes become the categories for analysis (Fereday and Muir-Cochrane, 2006). The process involves encoding the information by organizing the data to identify and develop themes from them (ibid). Fereday and Muir-Cochrane (2006) described the coding process as important in the analysis of the data prior to interpretation. They further stated that a good code is one that captures the qualitative richness of the phenomenon (ibid).

The process of data analysis was started after all key data had been gathered. Collected data was coded by categorizing, using established qualitative data analysis methods (Miles and Huberman, 1994, 9). Using thematic analysis, the data collected from

\(^{16}\) Final report is available at [http://www.cstc.bc.ca/cstc/84/fn+referrals+forum last, accessed December 31, 2007 (FNTC and CSTC, 2007)](http://www.cstc.bc.ca/cstc/84/fn+referrals+forum)
forums and from participant observation were analyzed for emerging development themes. The thematic analysis process involved moving from the initial reading and analysis of the transcriptions through later steps of describing, classifying, and interpreting the data. Context sensitive codes were generated from the data. Written reports, notes, and transcripts were revised and manually coded over consecutive days to ensure consistency. Emergent themes were highlighted and reviewed in an iterative manner. This inductive approach to data analysis allowed research findings to emerge from the raw data without preconceptions (Thomas 2003). Clear links were established between the research objectives and the summary findings derived from the raw data. The approach ensured that the links between the research objectives and the summary findings from the raw data were transparent and justifiable (Thomas 2003). Figure 3.2 shows the steps taken to analyze the data collected.

![Figure 3.2: The coding process (Adapted from Thomas, 2003).](image-url)
Anfara et al. (2002) suggested a four-criteria data evaluation process to ensure the quality of the data. The criteria were theory and data triangulation, peer review, clarifying researcher bias, and rich descriptions (ibid). Attending three events provided opportunities to triangulate data collected. At the events, questions were asked to clarify information. After each event, I had informal discussions at the Nazko Band office with the Treaty Manager and the Band Manager to clarify new information, and to understand the relevance of the event to the Band's identified goals. This provided opportunities to involve Band Administration in interpreting the data and clarifying the findings. Archival information and records of past economic development activities were discussed with the Esket Band members. This also provided another opportunity for data triangulation and the clarification of information. The involvement of Band members and Administrators at both communities made the study participatory.

3.7 Confidentiality and Conclusions

The Esketemc First Nation's population is about 750 persons with approximately 396 of these living on the reserve at Alkali Lake, whereas Nazko First Nation has a population of about 333 persons with approximately 144 living on the reserve. While this research was not meant to be invasive, it may not be possible for information gathered to remain completely anonymous. Confidential information was not solicited during this research, but some of the findings were confidential and hence not published. Participants provided information during interviews which was transcribed and copies were approved by participants before inclusion in the study. Quotes from respondents provided rich descriptions. The interview
participants, Doreen Patrick and Geneva Irwin, consented to their names being used alongside their quotes in this study.

The Nazko and Esket communities are both at stage 4 of the 6-stage treaty process. During this stage, the First Nation and the Federal and Provincial governments have to identify, define, and negotiate a range of rights and obligations, including existing and future interests in land and resources (BCTC 2007). Due to the confidentiality of these ongoing treaty negotiations, information that could jeopardize the Nazko and Esket communities has not been included in this thesis.

A significant amount of data was gathered through attending the First Nations Forums. The themes identified in this study were derived primarily from data gathered at the forums. This information is available to the public and does not identify specific issues relating to either the Esketemc or Nazko First Nations. The information gathered situated both communities within a wider regional context. This was necessary to ensure that community confidential information was not made publicly available through this research.

By virtue of being visibly different because of my African ancestral origin, the communities trusted me and provided information which may not have been made available to other researchers. My employment with Nazko First Nations also meant that I had access to the community and to confidential information. The approach to this research was adapted to respect both the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations and keep their confidential information away from public domain. Hence, data was gathered from public forums which was not invasive to any of the communities and their members.
CHAPTER 4

RESULTS

4.1 Overview

The research posed questions to gather information required to: (1) to identify economic development opportunities beneficial for both the Esketemc and Nazko First Nations, (2) to complement or add to the body of knowledge in the area of economic development for these two communities, and (3) to provide the communities with information which could be used in their economic development planning. The results from data gathered is presented in the sections below.

4.2 Identifying Economic Development Opportunities for the Nazko and Esket Communities

The people say “INAC will take care of us”. INAC give the Band money, so people expect the Band to give them everything they need, but they don't understand that the funding is limited (Geneva Irwin 2007).

The Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development (DIAND), also commonly referred to as INAC, oversees the Federal Government's responsibilities towards First Nations Communities. A large percentage of income in most British Columbia's rural First Nations communities comes from transfer payments from the Federal Government.
This transfer income, coupled with the lack of economic infrastructure, isolation, and distance from Service Centres, has created a 'dependency economy' amongst these communities.

Following a few landmark cases, First Nations communities are now asserting their Aboriginal rights and title over lands which the Government of British Columbia depends on for natural resource extraction. First Nations communities are also working on resolving the on-going land disputes with the Federal and Provincial Governments through the treaty process. Once the treaty process has been completed, these Nations would be required to generate revenue for the on-going support and development of their communities. The Nazko First Nation and the Esketemc First Nation are both at stage 4 of the 6-stage treaty process. The communities rely on forestry resources within their territories, but the infestation of the Mountain Pine Beetle is taking an economic toll on the timber supply in British Columbia. As a result of the Mountain Pine Beetle infestation and the treaty negotiations, economic development has now become top priority for both communities. As part of this inquiry, I worked with both communities to research resources and assets available for economic diversification. Due to the confidentiality of the ongoing negotiations, information about these resources and assets have not been included in this publication.

4.2.1 The Nazko and Esketemc Community Profiles

I was born in Nazko. I remember how the community worked together. It is quite difficult for me to watch the younger generation now how they don't pull together. I
remember when we make hay, all the family members helped us too. They didn't have to be asked, they didn't get paid either. They used our horses sometimes in the winter to go hunting when they run out of meat. I suppose that is why they did it. Family get together and make wood (firewood). They see the wood going down, being used up, they just get together and make more. They got wood for other people without being asked, for example – somebody may see that somebody else has no wood and get her some, when people see that kind of gesture around the community there's always somebody who comes forward and cooked for those getting wood without being asked. And they all help each other with things like that (Geneva Irwin 2007).

The Nazko people had a work culture and a culture of reciprocity. In addition to their traditional activities of hunting, gathering, trapping, and fishing, people gained employment on ranches and farms close to their Reserves (Doreen Patrick 2007). The introduction of technology and heavy farming equipment meant fewer people were required for farming activities. This subsequently led to high unemployment on Nazko's main Reserve. Traditional activities continue to be a significant part of adults' lives in Alkali Lake. According to Statistics Canada (2004), 46% of the adult population hunted for food, 61% fished, and 61% gathered wild plants such as berries and sweet grass. Labour activity data supplied by Statistics Canada showed that the majority of the traditional activities carried out by adults at Alkali Lake were for subsistence rather than for market economy (Statistics Canada 2004). The two communities in this study have high levels of unemployment. Table
4.1 below summarizes the profile of the Esketemc and Nazko communities.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census year 2001</th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Characteristics:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Between 50 and 350 km from the nearest Service Centre</td>
<td>Between 50 and 350 km from the nearest Service Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population (Registered)</td>
<td>750</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Reservations</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Reserve and distance from nearest Service Centre</td>
<td>Alkali Lake (55 km from Williams Lake)</td>
<td>Nazko (98 km from Quesnel)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>Year-round road access</td>
<td>Year-round road access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Reserve population</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Centres</td>
<td>Prince George, Williams Lake</td>
<td>Prince George, Quesnel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Demographics**

| 1996 to 2001 population change (%) | 11.1 | 27.3 |
| Age 0-19 | 185 | 75 |
| Age 20-64 | 245 | 65 |
| Age 65 and over | 30 | 10 |
| Median Age | 26.2 | 18.3 |

17 Figures are based on Reserve population
18 2001 Statistics Canada Census data
19 2001 Statistics Canada Census data
20 2001 Statistics Canada Census data
21 2001 Statistics Canada Census data
4.2.2 Community Characteristics

The Elders started drinking because the children were taken away to residential schools. They didn't know what to do with themselves. The reserves had no employment because of the location. People always worked before alcohol and drugs. They used to pull out stumps by hand to make hay fields (Doreen Patrick 2007).

The Nazko and Esketemc communities are rural First Nations communities which are situated at considerable distances from their nearest Service Centres (DIAND 1994 - 2004). The communities lack major logistical and economic infrastructure required by industries such as a three phase power supply, good rail and road networks, and highly skilled labour force. Major industrial areas close to the Nazko and Esketemc communities are approximately 98 km and 55 km respectively from the main Reserves. The two communities have year-round road access to their nearest Service Centres. These Service Centres have financial institutions such as banks and credit unions, a pool of skilled and semi-skilled labour, and suppliers of materials and equipment for construction (DIAND 1994 - 2004).

4.2.3 Community Well-Being and Workforce

My Dad is still doing fencing for the ranch. They now have new machineries on the ranch which means less employment. The First Nations invented the hay stacking. We called it a 'sleen'. The sleen has two poles on it tied to the
horses. The horses lead and pull the sleen to stack the hay (Doreen Patrick 2007).

The Nazko and Esketeme communities have high labour force participation. This means that a significant percentage of the population are available for work. The labour force in a community is the total number of individuals employed (E) and unemployed (U) within the community (Statistics Canada 2003). Statistics Canada defined labour force participation for a particular group as the numbers of individuals employed and unemployed in that group expressed as a percentage of the total population (Pop) for that group, rate of employment as a percentage of labour force, and unemployment rate also as a percentage of the labour force (Statistics Canada 2003).

\[
\begin{align*}
E &= \text{number employed} \\
U &= \text{number of unemployed (people looking for jobs)} \\
\text{Pop} &= \text{total population} \\
\text{LF} &= \text{labour force} = U + E \\
p &= \text{participation rate} = \frac{\text{LF}}{\text{Pop}} \\
e &= \text{rate of employment} = \frac{E}{\text{LF}} \\
u &= \text{rate of unemployment} = \frac{U}{\text{LF}}.
\end{align*}
\]

Table 4.2 shows that more than half (55.6%) of the people living on Nazko's main Reserve are available for work, but have no jobs. From the interviews carried out with some
Nazko First Nations Elders, one of the reasons stated why people are unemployed within the community is a lack of motivation. The distance of the Reserves from the nearest Service Centres is also a contributing factor to the high unemployment rates experienced both at Nazko and Esketemc's main Reserves.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census year 2001</th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Workforce:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour Force Participation (%)</td>
<td>60.9</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Rate (%)</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>26.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment Rate (%)</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main industry</td>
<td>Agriculture, Resource Based</td>
<td>Resource Based</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Selected Reasons for not working (%):</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Going to school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No full-time jobs available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family responsibilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not qualified for jobs available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Community Well-Being Index is a social composite indicator which consists of education, labour force activity, income, and housing (INAC 2006b). The index is used by the Department of Indian and Northern Affairs to measure the social and economic well-being.

---

22 Figures are based on Reserve population
23 Figures are based on Reserve population
being in First Nations communities (ibid). Table 4.3 shows the Well-Being Index for the Nazko and Esket communities. The index for Nazko is 51 and Esket is 68. These figures are significantly below the average British Columbia non-First Nation community which is 85. British Columbia's First Nations communities have an average score of 70 and a lowest score of 49 on the Community Well-Being Index (DIAND 1994 – 2004).


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census year 2001</th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Health:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Well-Being Index</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(BC Non-First Nations communities: 85)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of adults who say their health is excellent or very good</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of adults who say their health is good</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of adults who say their health is fair or poor</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Esket community achieved 95% sobriety in 1985 (Alkali Lake 1987). Table 4.3 also shows that over half the adult population within the Esket community are in good health. Some of the reasons why unemployment rates within the Esketemc community are high are either because there are no jobs available or people do not have the skills required for the jobs that are available. A high percentage of the people aged 15 and over within the Esketemc community are also in school.

24 Figures are based on Reserve population
4.2.4 Education

In the past, people were not educated. They had no training for jobs. They worked on ranches making hay and caring for cattle. People made money by trapping, preparing pelts the way it was supposed to. That is how people lived. The people grew their own vegetable even before contact. They used to teach the non-natives how to grow vegetables (Doreen Patrick 2007).

Through my employment with the Nazko Band, I realized that the residential school system provided education only to grade 6, hence a significant number of Nazko adults do not have a high school certificate. These Band members are now parents of children in high school. Table 4.4 shows that the Alkali Lake Reserve has a significant number of highly educated people. Seventy people have post secondary school education, and 30 have high school graduation certificate. Table 4.4 also shows that 37% of adults who live at Alkali Lake and attended school went to residential school, and 100% of adults within the Esket community had family members who attended residential or industrial school. The destructive effects of the residential school system on First Nations communities are still ongoing. There are Band members at Nazko in their thirties who attended and survived the residential school system. The residential school history is very recent. Communities are still undergoing healing for the emotional, physical and sexual abuse, and the traumas that they suffered under this system. The last residential school in the Williams Lake area was closed in 1986.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census year 2001</th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education:</strong>&lt;sup&gt;25&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population 15 years and over</td>
<td>320 (100%)</td>
<td>75 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons with less than high school graduation certificate</td>
<td>155 (48%)</td>
<td>65 (87%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons with a high school graduation certificate</td>
<td>30 (9%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons with post secondary school education</td>
<td>70 (22%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons with trades, college or university certificate or diploma (below bachelor's degree)</td>
<td>60 (19%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons with a university degree at BA level or higher</td>
<td>10 (3%)</td>
<td>0 (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Residential and Industrial Schools:</strong>&lt;sup&gt;26&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of adults&lt;sup&gt;27&lt;/sup&gt; who were students at a federal residential or industrial school</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of adults&lt;sup&gt;28&lt;/sup&gt; with family member(s) who attended residential or industrial school</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Getting an education remains a challenge for the Nazko First Nation members. The School District in Quesnel has an elementary school close to Nazko's main Reserve. This school serves the Nazko Valley community. Children living on Nazko's Reserve complete their elementary school in Nazko Valley but have to travel to Quesnel for their high school education.

<sup>25</sup> Figures are based on Reserve population
<sup>26</sup> Figures are based on Reserve population
<sup>27</sup> As a percentage of adults who attended school
<sup>28</sup> As a percentage of adults who attended school
education. The distance of the Reserve from the nearest high school in Quesnel requires students to travel two hours in the morning and another two hours at the end of their school. This journey makes the day very long for the students. The journey also makes it difficult for students to participate in extra curricular activities within Quesnel which further isolates the Nazko First Nation children from the rest of the Quesnel community.

The Nazko Band Administration identified gaps between the grade 8 students coming from Nazko and those students who had their elementary school education within Quesnel. The Band Administration worked with the School District in Quesnel in 2007 to provide grade 8 and 9 education at the Nazko Valley, and to bridge some of the identified gaps. This new program for grade 8 and 9 students became operational from September 2007 and is now being delivered at the Nazko Valley school.

4.2.5 Income and Earnings

Table 4.5 shows that employment income (earnings) made up the largest component of total income for individuals within the Esketemc community in the year 2001. Government transfer payments, such as old-age pensions and employment insurance benefits, contributed 30 cents of every dollar (on average) to income within the community. Government transfer payments for the Esketemc First Nation was above the regional average for Williams Lake (between 1.8 cent and 11.9 cents of every dollar) and Quesnel (between 12 cents and 15.9 cents of every dollar) for the same period (NRCan 2006a). Regardless of the transfer payments, First Nations communities contribute a significant amount of money to the economies of their nearest Service Centres.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census year 2001</th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Income:</strong>&lt;sup&gt;29&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons 15 years and over with income</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>Data not available&lt;sup&gt;30&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average total income (all income ($))</td>
<td>15,622</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total income</strong></td>
<td><strong>$4,374,160</strong></td>
<td><strong>Data not available</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All persons with earnings (total)</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average earnings (all persons with earnings ($))</td>
<td>16,782</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total earnings</strong></td>
<td><strong>$2,852,940</strong></td>
<td><strong>Data not available</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earnings - % of income</td>
<td>65.6</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government transfer - % of income</td>
<td>30.3</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other money - % of income</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Data not available</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.5 also shows that the Esketemc community at Alkali Lake, for example, had a total income of over $4m dollars in the year 2001. The community has a gas station, restaurant, and store, but the majority the total income is not retained within the community, because Band members typically purchase significant quantities of other commodity goods and services in neighbouring towns and Service Centres, thus contributing to other economies. As part of my employment with the Nazko Band, I observed that there are no stores, services or facilities available on any of Nazko's Reserves. Band members spend all their income outside of their community, also contributing to other economies.

---

<sup>29</sup> Figures are based on Reserve population

<sup>30</sup> Statistics Canada has data available for areas where the Aboriginal identity population count is 250 or more.
4.3 Complementing the Knowledge: British Columbia's First Nations Economic Development Emerging Themes

Four themes emerged during the inquiry. The themes are organized around episodes both from the events attended and in my capacity as an Economic Development Manager for the Nazko First Nation. The themes identified were “making economic development a priority”, “Aboriginal rights and title lands as assets for development”, “getting past the barriers”, and “criteria for resource development”. My employment as the Economic Development Manager for the Nazko Band provided valuable insights required to make sense of the data gathered during the forum events. Working with Nazko also helped me acquire a First Nations world view. This world view, combined with my economic world view, was required to fully understand and appreciate the inquiry.

4.3.1 Theme 1: Making Economic Development a Priority

We feel community economic development is being overlooked in our First Nation communities, it should be a priority since it provides the means and stimulation to address the social ills in our communities and offers the promise of improving the quality of life for our people (Chief Clarence Louie of the Osoyoos First Nation 2007)

The BC First Nations Community Economic Development Forum, which took place in January 2007, was hosted by Indian and Northern Affairs Canada's British Columbia Regional Program Management Advisory Committee, British Columbia Assembly of First

Nations, First Nations Summit, and the Union of British Columbia Indian Chiefs (BCFNCEDF 2007). The speakers at the forum included Chief Clarence Louie from the Osoyoos First Nation; Stephen Cornell from the Harvard Project on American Indians; The Honorable Gordon Campbell, the Premier of British Columbia; and Jimmy Pattison, a successful business man who is one of British Columbia's few billionaires (ibid). The purpose of that forum was to:

1. Stimulate discussions and gain insight into the issues related to economic development within First Nations communities;
2. Explore and identify how First Nations leaders can play a key role in economic development;
3. Inspire political support required to make economic development a priority; and
4. Create networking opportunities that will benefit participants in the future.

The forum set the tone for other regional forums throughout the year by acting as a catalyst for communities to make economic development a priority. Making economic development a priority was seen as an important aspect for communities to bridge the socio-economic gap between First Nation communities and the wider Canadian communities (BCFNCEDF 2007). This theme was echoed in all the events attended as part of the inquiry.

Most First Nations communities in British Columbia are dependent on Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development for their core funding. Several Bands reported, at the Economic Development forum, that the Community Economic Development Program funding from the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development was not enough to support a full time position for an Economic Development Officer. The Department
allocated $7m for 200 First Nations communities for the fiscal year 2007/2008. The funding was for Community Economic Development Programs (CEDP), hence the Department allocated a minimum of $10,000 plus a per capita for each First Nation person in the Province for economic development. This meant that Bands with fewer members were unable to support a full time economic development officer position and had to find other sources of funds if economic development was to remain a priority. This lack of human capacity with economic development priorities was also echoed at the other two events, particularly at the Technology forum where communities stated that there are a significant number of resource development opportunities missed during the referral and consultation process because communities do not have the human capacity to address these issues.

The regional events created the opportunities for communities to discuss challenges and barriers and to create frameworks and strategies at regional levels. All the regional events attended as part of the inquiry had very good attendance and participation. Community representatives at the events were mainly Band Chiefs and Councilors, and some Band and Tribal council members involved in economic development activities. Participating in these events provided opportunities for data triangulation, validation, and clarification.

It was obvious that the Nations represented at these events considered economic development a priority. The participants were aware of development opportunities, and the barriers First Nations communities faced. The majority of the participants attended forums to participate in framework and strategy development which would help them overcome barriers to economic development. It was highlighted in all three events that there was a
need for the Federal and Provincial Governments to change some policies and put more resources into helping First Nations communities continue in their development.

4.3.2 Theme 2: Aboriginal Rights and Title Lands as Assets for Development

There is a lot of things we would have done. As a child, like in town now where you see the general public, we didn't have any of that in those days. When I think back, I had no fear of starving because there would always be somebody who will give. There was a lot of giving. You give someone a hind leg of moose and in turn that person give you a couple of cans of preserve. They dried fruit, sometime they give us a bag of that. Dried fish, dried moose, they were so plenty, now its not the same (Geneva Irwin 2007).

Over 40 years ago, the Nazko community functioned as a social organization. People had no fear of starving because there was a significant amount of sharing which took place. People traded moose meat for cans of preserves, dried fruit for dried fish, and there was a lot of sharing and giving that took place. Today, everyone have their own freezer and keep their surpluses with little or no bartering or sharing. Resource development has also had a significant impact on the culture of First Nations people in British Columbia. Communities which sustained themselves by living off the land are now having to assert their Aboriginal rights and title to these lands. The Province of British Columbia depends on these lands for resource extraction and development. As a result of the Supreme Court rulings on some land mark cases, Provincial agencies are required to consult with First Nations communities.
before making land use decisions that could potentially infringe on First Nations Aboriginal rights and title. The Ministries are legally obligated to accommodate any justifiable infringement. According to the Provincial Policy for Consultation with First Nations (B.C. 2002, 9, 10), the following are the principles underlying Aboriginal title:

1. it is a right to exclusive use and occupation of land;
2. it is a proprietary interest, but it is held communally;
3. it cannot be alienated other than to the Federal Government;
4. it is a particular kind of Aboriginal right, being a right to the exclusive use and occupation of the land itself;
5. it includes the right to choose to what use land can be put by the holders of that title (not restricted to traditional uses), and includes exploitation of mineral rights;
6. it is subject to the ultimate limit that those uses cannot destroy the ability of the land to sustain the kinds of activity which made it Aboriginal title land in the first place;
7. lands held pursuant to Aboriginal title have an inescapable economic component; and
8. Aboriginal title is not absolute, but is a right to exclusively use and/or occupy Crown land.

The effect of the Supreme Court rulings on Aboriginal title means that First Nations communities can assert their rights to resources on lands within their traditional territories and the communities also have the right to determine how Crown land can be used. Aboriginal rights are linked to the cultural practices of communities, hence the greatest
assets owned by any these communities is their Aboriginal title lands. In all three events attended, First Nations communities voiced their strong ties to the land and their commitment to the long term sustainability of their culture. These commitments were shown in their willingness to participate in ecosystem stewardship management that reflects the traditional knowledge and values of their communities, and the willingness to integrate western science and traditional ecological knowledge to inform decision making on resource developments.

At the Technology Forum, First Nations communities expressed that they receive significant volumes of referral daily from the different Ministries and industries concerning land use decisions. This showed that there are still significant amounts of resources being extracted from First Nations traditional territories. These resources are being extracted from Crown land and are subject to the accommodation of First Nations interests. Aboriginal title and rights can be asserted on these Crown lands. The Ministries have an obligation to accommodate cultural, economic, jurisdictional, or environmental interests that the First Nations communities may have on the land from which resources are being extracted.

As part of my employment with the Nazko Band, I worked with the Referral Committee. The Referral Committee meet to review all projects received from the various Ministries and companies proposing land use decisions which could potentially infringe on Nazko First Nation’s Aboriginal rights and title. During these meetings, cultural, economic, jurisdiction, social, and environmental interests are identified for each project. Some of the community's cultural interests includes: identifying and protecting archaeological, sacred and ceremonial sites; historic trails and travel corridors; and maintaining viable and
sustainable hunting, trapping, fishing and gathering areas. Economic interests of the Nation include: providing employment for the Band members, developing and retaining Band human resources capacity, accessing business opportunities for the Band as a whole, accessing business opportunities for Band members, and developing joint ventures and other mutually-beneficial business partnerships. As part of its jurisdictional interest, Nazko First Nation seeks to maintain positive government-to-government relationships; take a greater role in resource decision-making involving Crown land; create opportunities for revenue sharing arrangements; and also take a greater role in higher level land use planning activity on Crown land. The environmental interest of the Nation includes: maintaining healthy and sustainable wildlife habitats by monitoring wildlife tree patches, stopping the use of herbicides and pesticides; maintaining fisheries habitats through monitoring stream buffers; minimizing impact of resource development on the forest; maintaining access routes for traditional use areas; and being directly involved in environmental monitoring. Some of these cultural, environmental, economic, and jurisdictional interests were also expressed by other Nations at the regional events.

4.3.3 Theme 3: Getting Past the Barriers

Building upon our rich vibrant history, we diversify our economy through collaborative, mutually beneficial partnerships to increase community wellness, sustainability, and resiliency (FNMPBI 2007).

The above statement was the vision statement created by participants at the First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative at Williams Lake in October of 2007. The
participants of the three events in the inquiry identified a number of economic development challenges and also identified potential solutions. A number of these challenges are also applicable to the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations. Tables 4.6a - e, below, show some of these identified challenges and the potential solutions.

From the events attended, it was obvious that the First Nations communities represented had a good understanding of what economic development meant to their communities.

Table 4.6a: Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions (FNMPBI 2007; FNTC and CSTC, 2007; FNEDF 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Challenges</th>
<th>Potential Solutions</th>
<th>Responsibility or Obligations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Making First Nations economic development a Federal Government priority;</td>
<td>Establish an Economic Development Council to lobby both the Provincial and Federal Government and to deliver programs</td>
<td>First Nations Political Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Core funding increased for Economic Development Officer wage support</td>
<td>Federal Government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A number of local First Nations have ongoing successful business ventures and are moving forward with resource development. The communities know the challenges they face, have the ability to change things at Band level, but do not necessarily have the resources required to make changes at the Federal or Provincial government level. None of the Nations represented at the events were satisfied with the social economic gap between
their community and the neighboring non-First Nation communities. All First Nations communities who participated at the regional forums had economic development and diversification as a priority. The communities were eager for the Federal Government to make First Nations economic development a priority by providing resources such as core funding to support full time employment positions for Economic Development Officers for the Bands as stated in Table 4.6a.

Most First Nations communities in the region still perceive their surroundings through their Indigenous world view. Many of the Bands do not have members with Business degrees or training. This lack of business skills or language is a challenge. As shown in Table 4.6b below, the communities require more support to enable them to acquire the business skills and language required for economic development.

The two-year election period for Chief and Council presents a challenge for the stability of Band governance as shown in Table 4.6c. Resource development and most economic activities require more than two years to complete. The lack of development capital coupled with unstable governance makes First Nation communities unattractive for development partners. Industry partners and investors typically need the guarantee of much longer term stability.
Table 4.6b: Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions (FNMPBI 2007; FNTC and CSTC, 2007; FNEDF 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Challenges</th>
<th>Potential Solutions</th>
<th>Responsibility or Obligations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Capacity of Bands to engage in a meaningful way at regional planning groups;</td>
<td>Focus on capacity development to engage in revising land use planning and changes to legislation at political levels not Band level.</td>
<td>First Nations Political level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of business skills and language at Band level.</td>
<td>Invest in healing within communities.</td>
<td>Band, Federal &amp; Provincial Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invest in more focused First Nation education such as Aboriginal Skills and Employment Partnership (ASEP).</td>
<td>Federal Government, Colleges and Universities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Invest in more economic development training through Council for the Advancement of Native Development Officers (CANDO).</td>
<td>Federal Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop an online First Nations Resource Centre through existing agencies such as Community Futures and SFU listserve.</td>
<td>Band, Federal Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Promote First Nations information sharing, visits, and best practices.</td>
<td>Band, Federal Government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4.6c: Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions (FNMPBI 2007; FNTC and CSTC, 2007; FNEDF 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Challenges</th>
<th>Potential Solutions</th>
<th>Responsibility or Obligations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Develop community strategies for economic development; Band governance and economic development.</td>
<td>Establish economic development corporation to keep politics away from business.</td>
<td>Band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use bylaws to separate business from politics</td>
<td>Band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Involve youth and Elders in economic development.</td>
<td>Band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Have different election period for Chief and for Council to maintain continuity.</td>
<td>Band, Federal Government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 4.6d, there is a need for the Provincial government to share resource revenue with communities. This would have the advantage of providing communities with development capital. First Nations are not satisfied with the status-quo socio-economic gap between their communities and the non-First Nations communities as shown in table 4.6d. Table 4.6d also shows that the lack of social and economic development infrastructure within communities is a concern.
Table 4.6d: Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions (FNMPBI 2007; FNTC and CSTC, 2007; FNEDF 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Challenges</th>
<th>Potential Solutions</th>
<th>Responsibility or Obligations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access to development capital; Application of technology to enhance land use decision making.</td>
<td>Royalty sharing agreements, Fee for Service Agreements.</td>
<td>Band, Provincial Government, Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First Nations pool funds and resources.</td>
<td>Band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Collaboration with industry.</td>
<td>Band, Industry, and Provincial Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More coordinated efforts across ministries, review of Province's consultation policy.</td>
<td>Provincial Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-economic gap between First Nation communities and the wider Canadian communities.</td>
<td>Build collaboration and partnerships to reduce unemployment; increase community wellness; and decrease poverty and racism.</td>
<td>Band, Provincial Government, Industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop companion social strategies alongside economic development strategies.</td>
<td>Band</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 4.6e, most communities would like to participate meaningfully in the regional economy while preserving their traditional knowledge and culture.
Table 4.6e: Economic Development Challenges and Potential Solutions (FNMPBI 2007; FNTC and CSTC, 2007; FNEDF 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Challenges</th>
<th>Potential Solutions</th>
<th>Responsibility or Obligations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preservation of traditional ecological knowledge and values;</td>
<td>Effective archival systems for the documentation of Elders knowledge and oral history in a manner that provides appropriate protection for intellectual property.</td>
<td>Band, Institutions such as Museums and Universities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different world views: economic development vs ecological sustainability.</td>
<td>First Nations specific programs at colleges and universities to provide mechanisms for recognition of traditional knowledge.</td>
<td>Bands, Educational institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Holistic planning to link economic development and ecological values.</td>
<td>Band</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3.4 Theme 4: Criteria for Resource Development

As strategic partners and decision-makers, First Nations are fully engaged in developing and managing other resource opportunities to promote community/territory sustainability (FNMPBI 2007).

A number of First Nations communities are already engaging in resource development within their territories. Supreme Court rulings in favour of First Nations continues to strengthen their claims on resources within their traditional territories. At the
Mountain Pine Beetle forum, First Nation representatives were in favour of working with industries within their territories to develop resources which promotes the sustainability of their cultures and communities. First Nations communities showed an interest in meaningful resource development based on a number of identified objectives. These objectives added social, financial, and environmental benefits to the communities and the members. The development objectives identified include: building diverse and resilient First Nations economies; long term perspective and sustainability of resources, and First Nations cultures and communities; development benefits to present and future generations; opportunities to close socio-economic gaps between First Nations and non First Nations communities; development opportunities that return both financial and non-financial values to communities; return on investment that is fully realized in local communities and the First Nations territories; provision of royalty or revenue sharing agreements with First Nations; and net benefit to First Nations community on the cost base analysis of resource development. Communities also expressed interests in increased collaboration and partnerships with government, industry and institutions. Participants identified successful collaboration for resource development as including the characteristics shown in Table 4.7 below.
Table 4.7: Critical Success Factors and Sustainability of Development (FNMPBI 2007; FNTC and CSTC, 2007; FNEDF 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Critical Success Factor</th>
<th>Development Impact on First Nations Communities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Diversity</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Wellness</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Resiliency</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
<td>Decrease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependence on Forestry</td>
<td>Decrease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racism and discrimination</td>
<td>Decrease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnerships, Joint venture</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pride, Self Esteem</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Sustainability</td>
<td>Increase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First Nations representatives at the forums identified the factors that are critical to the success of resource development within their territories. These factors are also critical to the sustainability of their communities. The success factors include developments that would reduce their reliance on Forestry and create new employment. The need to diversify from the Forestry industry was seen as essential due to the infestation of the Mountain Pine Beetle. The success factors identified, as shown in Table 4.7, were mainly socio-economic factors. Communities want economic development that would reduce racism and discrimination, poverty, and increase community wellness, resiliency, sustainability, pride, and self esteem.
But the younger generation don't want to go as far back to traditional ways. There has to be deep healing for things to happen, they need things that make them happy and to get paid. When someone transfer from SA cheque of $250 per month to a pay cheque of $1000, they have a big party and drink with the money. When Bands sign away land to industries, with the promise of big cheques and jobs – only one person stays on at the job out of 10 employed. Economic development has to be fun, which is why it fails. How do we address this failure? (Geneva Irwin 2007).

Geneva Irwin's comments (2007), and the critical success factors listed in Table 4.7 above, show that without social development, economic development efforts have been failing. The inquiry revealed that it is essential for economic development and social development needs to happen simultaneously.
CHAPTER 5

DISCUSSION

5.1 Overview

The goals of the research were to work with the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations to identify economic development opportunities beneficial to the communities, to complement or add to the body of knowledge in the area of economic development for the two communities, and to provide the communities with information which could be used in their economic development planning. This chapter discusses the main findings of the research, provides recommendations and development priorities for the Nazko and Esketemc First Nation, and discusses areas of further research.

5.2 Key Findings

The Nazko and Esketemc First Nations were traditionally sustained by the lands which they occupied for millennia. The advent of colonization and resource development on these lands has had a significant impact on the communities and lifestyle of the people. For the continued sustainability of the communities and their cultures, there is a need for the Nations to become more involved in resource development on these lands in order to benefit culturally, economically, and environmentally from the activities. The main findings of the research are summarized below in four categories: (1) economic development opportunities for the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations, (2) complementing the knowledge of British
Columbia's First Nations economic development, (3) community information on economic
development planning, and (4) areas for further research on creating sustainable economic
development.

5.3 Economic Opportunities for the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations

The findings of the inquiry showed that rural First Nations communities within the
Quesnel and Williams Lake area are economically positioned to supply natural resources to
Service Centres for processing and distribution. Towns such as Quesnel and Williams Lake
offer economic infrastructure required by companies. This infrastructure includes access to
transportation corridors, three phase power supply, diversified skilled and unskilled labour,
banking and financial services, modern communications services such as high speed Internet
facilities, postal facilities, hospitals and health care services, and recreational facilities. As
Service Centre communities, Quesnel and Williams Lake rely heavily on natural resources
from the First Nations' traditional territories for their economic bases. These First Nations
communities are slowly becoming key players in the region and have compelling visions for
their traditional territories.

5.3.1 Land Claims and Treaty Settlement Opportunities

The Nazko and Esketemc First Nations are currently at stage 4 of the 6-stage treaty
process. As part of the treaty negotiations, the communities have to select lands for cultural,
economic, and social development. Communities can take advantage of this process to
select lands which can become Band owned Service Centres. It is evident from the study
that Service Centres are so called because of the infrastructure services they provide.
Selecting lands close to highways and railway infrastructure has the added advantage of
providing links with existing transportation corridors, providing access to fibre optic data
trunk cables, and the opportunities for laying copper cables. Copper cables along railway
lines are mainly used by rural communities for three phase power supply. Sections of
highway 97 to Prince George, from the South, and highway 16 East from Prince George,
have fibre optic data trunk cables. These data trunk cables are capable of providing much
needed modern communications services such as high speed Internet access required by
institutions, and many industries.

First Nations Communities showed strong interest in collaborating with the
Provincial Government, industries, and other neighboring communities to jointly develop
resources within their territories. The development of resources are subject to the
accommodation of Aboriginal interests such as cultural, economic, jurisdiction, and
environmental interests. Prior to treaty settlement, communities can develop resources on
Crown land by adhering to Provincial regulations regarding permits and licenses on Crown
land. Working with industries wanting to develop these resources in line with the identified
development objectives can secure some resource benefits for the First Nations
communities. Pending Treaty settlement, communities can also identify lands with resources
for potential development and have these lands protected. It is important for the
communities to ensure that the Provincial Government does not dispose of all Crown lands
with resource development potentials prior to communities settling their treaties.
5.3.2 Demographic Changes

A young population is required to sustain the vigor of a regional economy. First Nations communities are experiencing an increase in population. The On-Reserve population at Nazko went up by 27.3% between the 1996 and 2001 census dates while the on Reserve population at Alkali Lake also increased by 11.1%. This is very positive for both communities, because it shows that the communities are experiencing rapid growth either through more births or members returning home. The Nazko and Esketemc communities both have very young demographics. A significant percentage of Band members on the Nazko and Esketemc main Reserves are children and youths between the ages of 0 and 19 years.

In a five year period, between the years 1996 and 2001, there was a 22.2% increase in the number of people with Aboriginal identity in Canada (Mendelson 2004). The aboriginal population rose from 2.8% of all Canadians in 1996, to 3.3% in 2001 (ibid). This significant increase in Aboriginal population was seen as a positive growth for Canada (Statistics Canada 2007). Mendelson (2004) stated that Aboriginal entrants into the labor market are vital in filling labor demand requirements over the next decade, especially in Western Canada. The need for more investment in Aboriginal children's education would be required to support this. With the communities' ties to the land, there is a need to ensure that the youth have equal opportunities for educational and meaningful employment. Communities working with new industries and resource development partners can provide some of these opportunities.

The Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Developments allocates some of its
funding to communities based on population. The Ministry of Forest and Range in British Columbia also provided some forestry resources and revenue sharing to communities based on population. While communities do not believe this per capita resource allocation or funding is adequate, an increase in population is certainly beneficial for the Bands.

5.3.3 Workforce

Labour force participation at the Nazko and Esketemc main Reserves, 60% and 60.9% respectively, are low by comparison to the average of 65.2% in British Columbia. The distance from Service Centres is a major disadvantage for people living on rural Reserves and seeking employment. Urban Reserves have the advantage of being close to sources of non-Band employment for members. Due to the remoteness of Nazko and Esketemc main Reserves, Band members living on these Reserves are typically excluded from social networks that exists in towns or Service Centres. These members are left out of social circles and may not fit into the town culture. Such members are marginalized and sometimes made to feel different. Hence, traveling many kilometres into towns for low paid employment with the prospects of social exclusion, marginalization, and even racism, is not motivating for rural First Nations people.

Work opportunities closer to Reserves would increase employment and labour force participation for rural First Nations peoples. Communities engaging in resource development within their territories have the opportunity to generate their own revenue and to provide local employment for their Band members. Employment opportunities can be provided in sectors such as tourism which would enable Band members to utilize existing
local and traditional knowledge and skills. Cultural tourism is the fastest growing of the worldwide tourism sector (B.C. 2008). Developing tourism assets and infrastructures in rural First Nations communities would encourage both Elders and youths to participate in employment. This could potentially increase the labour force participation in such communities significantly. Members would be able to work in areas of their strength such as arts and crafts, and would also be able to continue traditional activities such as hunting, trapping, fishing, gathering, and trading.

Regional First Nations communities expressed their interest in the archiving of Elders' knowledge, documenting traditional resource management techniques, electronically storing traditional land use studies, creating interpretive centres, and even creating a curriculum based on local traditional ecological knowledge. These projects could potentially be beneficial for First Nations communities, educational institutions, and the larger public. By forming Community University Research Alliances (CURA) for some of these projects, there would be mutual benefits for both the First Nations and non First Nations communities. Such projects would increase labour force participation, employment rates for all communities involved, and provide major contributions to the existing body of knowledge. First Nations Elders would gain recognition for their knowledge and could potentially earn honorary credits for their contributions to educational activities or research by these institutions. This would benefit communities because First Nations youths would see the value of the contributions made by their communities to the body of knowledge and the commitment of their Elders to education. Honorary degrees also have the potential to create local role models for the youth and other members of the communities.
5.3.4 Income

Esketemc Band members at the Alkali Lake Reserve own the local petrol filling station, restaurant, and grocery store. These enterprises are important as they retain some of the community's income and employ community members. The majority of income within most rural First Nations communities is spent at the nearest Service Centres. It is essential for rural First Nations to retain larger percentages of their income within their own communities. This retention can be achieved through encouraging entrepreneurship and community enterprises. Rural First Nations communities can do a cost benefit analysis of goods and services mostly accessed by members during their trips to Service Centres with the possibility of providing such services on Reserve if there is a net benefit to the community.

5.4 Complementing the Knowledge of British Columbia's First Nations Economic Development

Table 5.1 below summarizes the themes that emerged in the research. As outlined in the Results section, four key themes emerged as pertinent to creating sustainable economic development within First Nations communities. These themes emerged from regional First Nations forums and events, and represent the development aspirations of the regional First Nations communities including the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations.
Table 5.1: Emerging Themes for Creating Sustainable Economic Development Within First Nations Communities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Illustrative Quotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Making economic development a priority</td>
<td>We feel community economic development is being overlooked in our First Nation communities, it should be a priority since it provides the means and stimulation to address the social ills in our communities and offers the promise of improving the quality of life for our people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aboriginal rights and title lands as assets for development</td>
<td>When I think back, I had no fear of starving because there would always be somebody who will give. There was a lot of giving. You give someone a hind leg of moose and in turn that person give you a couple of cans of preserve. They dried fruit, sometime they give us a bag of that. Dried fish, dried moose, they were so plenty, now its not the same.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting past the barriers</td>
<td>Building upon our rich vibrant history, we diversify our economy through collaborative, mutually beneficial partnerships to increase community wellness, sustainability, and resiliency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria for resource development</td>
<td>As strategic partners and decision-makers, First Nations are fully engaged in developing and managing other resource opportunities to promote community/territory sustainability.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.4.1 Making Economic Development a Priority

There are several compelling reasons to make economic development of First Nations communities a priority for the Federal and Provincial Governments, and for Band Administrators. Some of these reasons include changing demographics, closing the socio-economic gaps, and most importantly fulfilling the Canada's human rights obligation.

At the United Nations Millennium Summit, world leaders including Canada made a number of resolutions to combat world poverty (UN 2000). Some of these resolutions can be applied to rural First Nations communities within Canada. The resolutions include ensuring
that all children have equal access to all levels of education; by 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of slum dwellers as proposed in the “Cities Without Slums” initiative; promoting gender equality and the empowerment of women as effective ways to combat poverty, hunger and disease and stimulating development that is truly sustainable; developing and implementing strategies that give young people everywhere a real chance to find decent and productive work; developing strong partnerships with the private sector and with civil society organizations in pursuit of development and poverty eradication; ensuring that the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communication technologies\textsuperscript{32} are available to all; respecting fully and upholding the Universal Declaration of Human Rights\textsuperscript{33}; striving for the full protection and promotion of civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights for all; strengthening the capacity of all our countries to implement the principles and practices of democracy and respect for human rights, including minority rights; combating all forms of violence against women and implementing the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women\textsuperscript{34}; and eliminating the increasing acts of racism and xenophobia in many societies and promoting greater harmony and tolerance in all societies. The Government of Canada has already adopted these resolutions. Applying some of the resolutions locally to First Nations communities would ensure that economic and social development become priorities at the Federal and Provincial levels.

With the increasing First Nations population, it is essential for the wider community to take First Nations economic development more seriously. The study showed that most

\textsuperscript{32} Forms part of the UN ECOSOC 2000 Ministerial Declaration (UN 2000).
\textsuperscript{33} Forms part of the UN Resolution 217A (UN 2000).
\textsuperscript{34} Forms part of the UN Resolution 34/180 (UN 2000).
rural First Nations communities depend on Government transfer payments. As the population of rural First Nations communities increases, so would the transfer payments. Helin (2006) stated that with the impending retirement of 10 million people in Canada, the baby boom generation, there would be a substantial reduction in the country's labour force participation. This, coupled with the increasing population of First Nations people, could potentially have a large impact on the Federal Government's finances. Creating sustainable economic developments for rural First Nations communities would reduce the dependency on Government funding and empower individuals and communities.

Prominent leaders, such as Chief Clarence Louie of the Osoyoos Band and the Honorable Gordon Campbell, agreed that community economic development has been overlooked in First Nations communities. Chief Louie believes that economic development should become a priority, because this would provide the means and stimulation to address the social ills within communities, and offers the promise of improving the quality of life for all First Nations peoples. The Harvard Project showed that “Indian” culture is a resource which provides important cultural norms that support or complement appropriate institutions of Government (Cornell 1987). In the Province of British Columbia, there are 165 First Nations communities with distinct cultures and identities. With Aboriginal tourism the fastest growing sector, making economic development a priority and promoting this sector would provide cultural, social, and economic benefits to all First Nations people within the Province. First Nations cultures would gain recognition as assets and provide benefits to communities in line with the critical success factors listed in Table 4.7.
5.4.2 Aboriginal Rights and Title Lands as Assets for Development

CARE International (2005) stated that the lack of entitlement to productive assets is one of the causes of poverty. Aboriginal communities in British Columbia who have not settled their treaties are currently at a disadvantage because they do not have full control over productive assets such as lands. The treaty process provides the opportunity for First Nations to negotiate full control over parts of their traditional territories. Pending the settlement of treaties, First Nations communities still have some control over Aboriginal title lands. These lands have proprietary First Nations interests. As Aboriginal rights and title are communally held, a First Nation can create social enterprises which would return financial, social, and environmental benefits to that particular nation using these lands. Aboriginal rights are linked to cultural practices of communities on the lands, hence the Aboriginal title lands are the greatest assets owned by Aboriginal communities.

As a result of the Supreme Court rulings on some landmark cases, rural First Nations communities are being empowered to challenge land use decisions made by the Province. The Provincial Government has a legal obligation to consult meaningfully with First Nations communities before making land use decisions that could potentially infringe on Aboriginal title lands. The Ministries also have a legal obligation to accommodate the First Nations for any justifiable infringement on their Aboriginal rights and title (B.C. 2002). The Aboriginal interests on these lands could be cultural, social, environmental, jurisdictional, or economic. Economic accommodation could be in the form of revenue sharing, royalties, job creation, enterprise development or however the First Nation feels adequately compensates for the infringement. The Province of British Columbia relies on
resources extracted from Crown Lands which are subject to Aboriginal titles. The effect of the Supreme Court rulings on Aboriginal title means that First Nations communities can assert their rights to resources on these lands within their traditional territories. First Nations communities also have the rights to determine how Crown land on their territory can be used, and participate in resource development on these lands.

The Tsilhqot'in people argued that the resources on Aboriginal title lands belong to the Aboriginal people not the Crown and the Judge offered the opinion that the Tsilhqot'in people can continue to secure a moderate livelihood on Aboriginal title lands (SCBC 2007). From the Judge's opinion, it was clear that the Provincial Government may have no jurisdiction over the forest that many communities rely on for their economic base and that Aboriginal title lands are assets for the First Nation communities. The full implications of the opinion of Supreme Court is yet to be realized by either the Province or the First Nations.

5.4.3 Getting Past the Barriers

Most First Nations communities in the Williams Lake and Quesnel area are developing Nations. While some of the Nations are going through the BC Treaty process, a significant number of communities are not in the process because modern treaty settlements in British Columbia have resulted in First Nation communities losing control on over 90% of their traditional territory. Regional First Nations people see the disparities and socio-economic gaps between their communities and the wider communities. They are no longer content with the status quo but understand that their communities need to develop to close
the gaps and are preparing themselves for change. This preparation is evident in First Nations participation at all regional events attended as part of the study. The communities have identified probable solutions to overcome the challenges they face in moving forward with economic development. The challenges include low capacity in human development, lack of business skills and language, weak Band governance, lack of development capital, the need to preserve traditional knowledge, and different world views. Some of the identified solutions involve targeted programs by Band government, Provincial government, the Federal government, industries, and institutions.

There was a strong sense, from the participants at the events, that the Mountain Pine Beetle epidemic has awakened the First Nations' 'sleeping giants'. The lands to which communities have strong ties have been ravaged by the epidemic and the forests are being logged with unprecedented volumes of fibre resources being removed. This has had a significant impact on the traditional lifestyle of First Nations people. The territories on which the Nations have survived for millennia are now patches of clear cuts and mostly dead trees. While the Ministry of Forest and Range have an accelerated harvest policy to salvage the marketable timber, First Nations' economic interests are being accommodated financially through template Forest and Range Agreements which uses a per capita formula. The benefits returned to communities from these agreements do not reflect the volume of activities within the different territories or the economic value of the resources being removed. These accommodation agreements are not renewable and are only valid for a five year period. As a direct result of this epidemic and the Tsilhqot'in court case, communities have increased their knowledge and capacity of what Aboriginal title entails, and are more
likely to negotiate more favorable accommodation agreements with better control over their jurisdiction when existing agreements expire.

First Nations now understand better the effects of decisions made by Provincial authorities on their lands. Provincial land use decisions are now being challenged because the sustainability of these cultures and communities are threatened as a result of the Mountain Pine Beetle epidemic. First Nations still have strong ties to the land and strong commitments to the long term sustainability of their cultures and communities.

5.4.4 Criteria for Resource Development

Communities defined criteria for successful resource development within the region. Table 4.7 shows the critical success factors identified by First Nations communities in the Quesnel and Williams Lake area for any resource development. These criteria were based on the primary aim of closing socio-economic gaps and the ongoing sustainability of the Nations. The criteria also complements Aboriginal interests such as cultural, environmental, social, and economic interests. The use of the critical success factors and Aboriginal interests as identified by a community can become the guiding principles for resource development within the Nation's territory. Some aspects of cultural interest identified by Nazko First Nation includes protecting archaeological, sacred and ceremonial sites; protecting historic trails and travel corridors; and maintaining viable and sustainable hunting, trapping, fishing and gathering areas.

While the Nazko Band is seeking to develop some resources within its territory, its economic interest in any development within its territory includes providing employment for
the Band members, developing and retaining Band human resources capacity, accessing business opportunities for the Band as a whole, accessing business opportunities for Band members, and developing joint ventures and other mutually-beneficial business partnerships. Defining a community's interests would provide clear guiding principles for the various Ministries and resource developers within the territory.

5.5 Economic Development Planning Information

Development practitioners, such as CARE International (2005), believed that poverty is man-made and has roots in systematic marginalization, and in political and economic decision making. Through the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), Canada works with organizations worldwide to fund, develop, and implement development strategies aimed at alleviating poverty in poor and developing countries. The works of CIDA seems to suggest that Canada has resources available nationally, to work with First Nations communities should political and economic decisions be made. As part of this inquiry, information pertinent to economic development planning for First Nations communities were identified. This information is discussed the following sections.

5.5.1 First Nations Development Framework

At the time of the study, there was no evidence of a nationally accepted development framework for rural First Nations communities. The First Nations Technology Forum was developing a technology based solution for the land use management, the First Nations Mountain Pine Beetle Initiative was developing strategies for economic development and
diversification for First Nation communities affected by the epidemic, while the First Nations Economic Development Forum's objectives were to solicit information for a Province-wide First Nations economic development strategy. A nationally accepted development framework for First Nations with goals, targets, and indicators specific to each community would provide direction for development strategies.

The Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) welcomes the United Nations Millennium Project's new report, Investing in Development: A Practical Plan to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals. This timely report, produced under the direction of Dr. Jeffrey D. Sachs, provides us with a positive roadmap to help generate new momentum for achieving long-term goals by 2015. (The Hon. Aileen Carroll, Minister of International Development, Quoted by United Nations, 2002 - 2006c)

The United Nations development framework, which was internationally agreed upon at the Millennium Summit of September 2000, consisted of 8 goals and 18 targets. The goals are time bound and measured with 48 indicators. These indicators were adopted by the United Nations, the International Monetary Fund (IMF), Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) and the World Bank as global development indicators. The Millennium development framework has the support of other world leaders including the Canadian government as indicated by Honorable Aileen Carroll, the Minister of International Development (UN 2002 - 2006c). The framework provided a development
road map for poor and developing countries. With country specific goals, targets, and indicators, the framework is reported to have had positive impacts on developing Nations.

5.5.2 Rights Based Approach to Development

Tables 5.2a - c show some universal rights adopted by the General Assemblies of the United Nations. The responsibilities of protecting these rights lies mainly with the Band Administration and Federal Government. The Provincial Government needs to endorse these rights for the First Nations people as well. The Human Rights Based Approach is a new development based on the adoption and proclamation of Universal Human Rights by the General Assemblies of the United Nations in 1948. The declaration stated that human rights are universal and should be the common standard of achievement for all peoples and all nations (UNDP 1998).

Development practitioners and Non Governmental Organizations (NGOs) have since been promoting and applying this approach with measurable successes. A Rights Based Approach to development can offer unique ways of addressing poverty issues that are prevalent in the First Nations communities within British Columbia. The Rights Based approach would offer solutions which are participatory and not prescriptive. First Nations communities would be empowered beyond the charity and welfare models. The Rights Based Approach to development looks deeper into the causes of poverty, and addresses these underlying causes and not just the effects.
Table 5.2a: Applicable Human Rights and Governmental Responsibilities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UN Article Number</th>
<th>Human Rights Declaration by the United Nations, 1948</th>
<th>Government Responsible for Protection of Rights</th>
<th>Type of development Right</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Social and human</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Everyone has the right to own property alone as well as in association with others.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human and Economic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Everyone, as a member of society, has the right to social security and is entitled to realization, through national effort and international co-operation and in accordance with the organization and resources of each State, of the economic, social and cultural rights indispensable for his dignity and the free development of his personality.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Social, Human, Cultural, and Economic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>Everyone has the right to work, to free choice of employment, to just and favourable conditions of work and to protection against unemployment.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human and Economic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>Everyone, without any discrimination, has the right to equal pay for equal work.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human and Economic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By identifying societal causes of marginalization within a community, First Nations governments can develop macroeconomic policies to address internal social problems, while the Federal Government can develop microeconomic policies jointly with the Provincial Government to address external issues.
Table 5.2b: Applicable Human Rights and Governmental Responsibilities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UN Article Number</th>
<th>Human Rights Declaration by the United Nations, 1948</th>
<th>Government Responsible for Protection of Rights</th>
<th>Type of development Right</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23.3</td>
<td>Everyone who works has the right to just and favourable remuneration ensuring for himself and his family an existence worthy of human dignity, and supplemented, if necessary, by other means of social protection.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human and Economic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>Everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family, including food, clothing, housing and medical care and necessary social services, and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age or other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human and Social</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.1</td>
<td>Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary and fundamental stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made generally available and higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Development practitioners, such as Sen (1983), believed that the lack of entitlement is a major cause of poverty.

Table 5.2c: Applicable Human Rights and Governmental Responsibilities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UN Article Number</th>
<th>Human Rights Declaration by the United Nations, 1948</th>
<th>Government Responsible for Protection of Rights</th>
<th>Type of development Right</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Human and cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Cultural and Human</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.1</td>
<td>Everyone has duties to the community in which alone the free and full development of his personality is possible.</td>
<td>Band and Federal</td>
<td>Social, Human, and Economic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CARE International (2005) also believed that lack of productive assets leads to poverty. The guiding principles for a Rights Based Approach to development ensures that these rights are protected for individuals and communities, and that everyone has a right to development. Adopting these principles for First Nations would create a more positive environment in which these communities could develop, and would ensure the cooperation
of both the Provincial and Federal Governments.

5.5.3 First Nations Economic Development Recommendations

The recognition that every individual has a right to develop places responsibilities on the Band and Federal governments. Band governments have responsibilities for the development of individual members just as the Federal Government have responsibilities towards the development of communities. The following are recommendations based on the findings of the study:

1. There is a need for a nationally accepted economic development framework for First Nations communities. This framework should be time bound with goals, targets, and measurable indicators similar to the Millennium Development Goals. The First Nations Development Goals should be complementary to on-going national and regional economic development strategies. The framework should include social and economic development goals, and guide funding programs from the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development. This system would be more effective than the current per capita funding currently utilized by the Department to fund community economic development programs.

2. With a youthful population and the rich endowment of natural resources within First Nations territories, there is a need for targeted development strategies. First Nations have the potential to become Canada’s largest regional economic communities and major players in the global economy, but much of this potential has remained untapped. Each Nation needs a unique development strategy to enable the attainment
of nationally accepted First Nations Development Goals (see 1 above). The development strategy would include programs for poverty reduction, employment generation, wealth creation, and cultural value reorientation.

3. As part of the treaty lands selection, rural First Nations should endeavor to select some economic development lands close to highway or railway networks. Such lands could provide the opportunity for creating First Nations Service Centres. These centres have the advantage of generating tax revenues for communities by attracting industries which would also create employment for Band members.

4. First Nations are working with Industry partners to develop resources within their territories. Communities need to create guiding principles as Industry representatives may not necessarily understand what First Nations interests are and how these can be accommodated. Using the Critical Success Factors identified in the study and a breakdown of Aboriginal Interests as discussed under the Results chapter, communities can create guiding principles for sustainable resource development. These principles would help industry representatives to understand what the cultural, environmental, economic, and jurisdictional interests of the communities are. The principles would also help the resource developers understand the costs of doing business within First Nations communities.

5. Both the Federal Government and the First Nations leaders need to create policies which recognize that individuals have rights to development. First Nation Governments need to have a better understanding of their human rights obligations towards their Band members and to ensure that these rights are protected and not
violated. First Nations people need to be empowered to assert their human rights.

The Federal Government also needs to support Band Government by providing adequate resources to foster development within communities.

As reported by the United Nations, the Millennium Development Goals transformed global development cooperation with unprecedented coordinated action (UN 2008). Creating First Nations Development Goals would make economic and social development of First Nations people a national priority in Canada.

5.5.4 Recommendations for the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations

The Rights Based Approach to development recognizes that communities have the right to chose what resources are to be developed within their territories, and a right to their development. As part of the study, the communities identified the resources suitable for development within their territory. Due to the sensitivity of the data, the identified resources were not included in this publication.

The Esket and Nazko communities receive their core funding from the Department of Indian and Northern Affairs. Due to funding limitations, it is essential for each community to create a clear framework for development. Figure 5.1 below shows a recommended development framework model which can be used by the communities. The model incorporates key findings from the study and some of the recommendations.
Figure 5.1: Development Framework for the Nazko and Esket Communities
5.5.4.1 Community Vision, Values, and Principles

The Mountain Pine Beetle infestation provided the opportunity for First Nations communities to work together on diversifying the regional economy and to focus on economic development. The epidemic has also provided the opportunity for communities to understand the implications of resource development within their territories.

There is a need for Provincial Ministries and industry collaborators to understand the world view of the Nazko and Esket peoples. This is essential for future development within their territories. To guide future development and practices, it is recommended that both communities articulate their vision, values, and principles to Provincial Ministries and potential development partners. This can be in the form of written policy document or resource development guidelines. The document should guide all future resource development within the Nazko and Esket territories.

5.5.4.2 Community Goals

The Community Well-Being Index, which consists of education, labour force activity, income, and housing indicators, is an average of 85 for non First Nations communities. The Well-Being Index for Nazko is very low at 51 while the unemployment rate of 55.6% within the community is high. The Esket community have a significant number of educated members. With 95% sobriety in 1985, the Esket community still has a low Well-Being Index of 68 and a high unemployment rate. It is recommended, as part of the economic development goals for both communities, that increasing the Community Well-Being Index by creating more local jobs for members and improving living conditions
on Reserves be made priorities. This has the advantage of closing the socio-economic gap between the communities and the neighboring non First Nations communities. Creating more local employment would also reduce the unemployment figures and the reliance on government transfers. As part of the economic development goals for the communities, it is recommended that development objectives be time bound and quantified in line with this vision.

5.5.4.3 Separating Business From Politics

As the Nazko and Esket communities move forward towards self government, there is a need for established economic activities. The study showed that communities need to separate Band governance from economic development because elected officials only have a two-year term. Large economic development projects typically take more than two years to complete. Finance organizations and investors require a longer term guarantee for development projects. The Nazko and Esket communities would benefit from creating a separate economic development corporation as a social enterprise. The development corporation would be owned and operated by the Band as a separate legal entity. This model has been successfully implemented by other Bands such as the Osoyoos Indian Band in B.C. and the Inuvialuit in the Arctic. The Osoyoos Indian band has a winery, vineyard, golf course, construction company, and real estate properties which are all managed by the Osoyoos Development Corporation (Anderson et al. 2005; OIBDC n.d.).

The Inuit and Inuvialuit people created the Inuvialuit Development Corporation (IDC), which is also a social enterprise, following their lands claim settlement. IDC has
since created or acquired twenty companies operating in two sectors as its means of enabling the Inuvialuit equal and meaningful participation in the Western Arctic, circumpolar, and regional economies (Anderson et al. 2005; Inuvialuit 2007).

5.5.4.4 Empowering People, Promoting Social Enterprises and Entrepreneurship

The result of the study showed that First Nations peoples are very aware of their Aboriginal rights and title, and assert these over their territories. It is uncertain if communities have as much information about their human rights and the United Nations Declaration of Rights. As a foundation to sustainable economic development using a Rights Based approach, it is essential for the Nazko and Esket community members to understand their human rights. It is recommended that communities invest in educational resources on human rights and for the members to understand what their human rights are and how these can be protected. The protection of rights will reduce social ills within communities. It is also possible that the protection of human rights within the communities can help close some of the socio-economic gaps. It is recommended that the communities invest in ongoing healing programs to help members who are still suffering from the Residential School abuse and associated syndromes. The protection of rights and ongoing healing from the Residential School abuse would provide the security needed for creating sustainable developments.

The right to development is essential for empowering people and promoting social enterprises and entrepreneurship within the Nazko and Esket communities. Social enterprises are communally owned and the benefits are returned to the community.
Resources on Aboriginal title lands are ideal for the development of social enterprises. Communities can seek development partners to work with in developing resources on Crown lands prior to treaty settlement. The development partners have the added advantage of having collaterals to secure the necessary financial investments and the required expertise which the Band may be lacking.

First Nations people living on Reserves are typically skilled in various arts and crafts but do not own property or collaterals required by Financial institutions to provide business finance for the development of arts and crafts businesses. It is recommended that the Bands work with organizations such as the Aboriginal Business Canada, Community Futures Development Corporations, and All Nations Trust, to develop micro-finance products for members. As the Nazko and Esket Bands diversify their current economic activities, it is also recommended that Band members be encouraged to start their own businesses, and the entrepreneurship skills available within the communities be developed.

The Vancouver 2010 Olympic presents an opportunity for community members to showcase their various arts and crafts. The Olympic and Paralympic winter games will be held on the traditional and shared territories of the Lil'wat, Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh First Nations (Vancouver 2010 2008). These Nations are working jointly as Four Host First Nations to promote Aboriginal cultures, arts, and crafts for the Olympics (ibid). It is recommended that the Nazko and Esket Bands provide the marketing infrastructure required to assist the members with promoting their arts and crafts through the Four Host First Nations and through facilities available in Whistler, British Columbia.
5.5.4.5 Development Priorities for the Nazko and Esket Communities

The research questions focused on creating sustainable economic development. The results of the study showed that there is a need for ongoing social and economic development. Table 5.3 shows the suggested development priorities for the Nazko and Esket communities based on the results of the study. The recommended priorities are not time bound, but can be implemented along with social development plans for the communities. During the study, resources and community assets available for economic development were identified in both communities. Due to ongoing treaty and rights negotiations, the resources and assets identified as part of the study were not made public.
Table 5.3: Recommended Development Priorities for the Nazko and Esket Communities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Planning Session</th>
<th>Nazko First Nation</th>
<th>Esketemc First Nation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promoting Social Enterprises</td>
<td>Create a Nazko Development Corporation and establish an independent Board of Directors.</td>
<td>Create an Esketemc Development Corporation and establish an independent Board of Directors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowering People</td>
<td>Determine resource development priorities and seek development partners.</td>
<td>Determine resource development priorities and seek development partners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and employment</td>
<td>Invest in human rights workshops for community members.</td>
<td>Invest in human rights workshops for community members.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting Social Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Work with an educational institution to develop a community education needs assessment.</td>
<td>Establish a Community University Research Alliance project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micro finance for Band members</td>
<td>Invest in business development workshops.</td>
<td>Invest in business development workshops.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing infrastructure</td>
<td>Publish and distribute a catalog of arts and crafts by community members.</td>
<td>Work with marketing organization to promote tourism assets.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.6 Areas of Further Research on Creating Sustainable Economic Development

The study solicited information for the creation of sustainable economic development, using a Rights Based Approach, for the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations. The results showed that there are gaps in the knowledge of First Nations development...
indicators and the role of First Nations women in creating sustainable economic
development. Below are some preliminary considerations for future research in these areas.

5.6.1 First Nations Development Indicators

The study identified two important dimensions of First Nations development:
(1) traditional ecological knowledge, and (2) traditional activities. These development
dimensions can form the basis of First Nations Development Index as shown in Table 5.4
below.

Table 5.4: Suggested First Nations Development Indexes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index</th>
<th>Activity Classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Ecological Knowledge Index</td>
<td>subsistence, market, education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Activities Index</td>
<td>subsistence, market, education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is a need for more research to find suitable economic indicators for Aboriginal
communities and the Aboriginal peoples. Table 5.5 and 5.6 show the composite indicators
that can be measured for the suggested indexes.

While Aboriginal communities may score low on educational achievement
indicators, they have a wealth of knowledge about their local ecosystems. The Elders within
the various communities are keepers of local ecological knowledge. This knowledge is
passed down through the generations, but the learning that takes place or the teaching and
mentoring skills of the Elders are not captured by data used in educational achievement
indicators.
### Table 5.5: Composite Indicators for Suggested Traditional Ecological Knowledge Index.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional Ecological Knowledge Index</th>
<th>Industry Sector</th>
<th>Activity Classification</th>
<th>Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wildlife</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>subsistence, market, education</td>
<td>knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fish</td>
<td>Fisheries</td>
<td>subsistence, market, education</td>
<td>knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forest</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>subsistence, market, education</td>
<td>knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soil</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>subsistence, education</td>
<td>knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>Forestry</td>
<td>subsistence, education</td>
<td>knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams, Lakes, and Rivers</td>
<td>Forestry, Fisheries</td>
<td>subsistence, market, education</td>
<td>knowledge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 5.6: Composite Indicators for Suggested Traditional Activities Index.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional Activities Index</th>
<th>Industry Sector</th>
<th>Activity Classification</th>
<th>Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hunting</td>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>subsistence, market</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gathering Berries</td>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>subsistence, market</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gathering Medicinal Plants</td>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>subsistence, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishing</td>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>subsistence, market</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trapping</td>
<td>Resource</td>
<td>subsistence, market</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birch Bark Craft</td>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hide and Leather Workers</td>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horsemanship</td>
<td>Service</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bead Workers</td>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moccasin Makers</td>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artists</td>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood Carvers</td>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>economic, education</td>
<td>knowledge, practice</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The suggested indicators are based on the historical fact that subsistence activities were part of Aboriginal economy and constitute Aboriginal Rights, hence they are necessary developmental activities for communities. First Nations indicators which capture these activities would provide a fairer picture of Aboriginal development.

5.6.2 The role of First Nations Women in Economic Development

Before contact, women used to make all the decisions about the community, they organized things. Christianity put men above women. Men went to harvest meat or fish. They dried and prepared the fish, and the meat on Itcha mountain because it made it easier for them to pack it (Geneva Irwin 2007).

Traditionally, First Nations women had a different role in the sustainability of their community. The advent of Christianity changed the roles of men and women within First Nations communities. CARE International (2005) demonstrated that if women are empowered with the right skills, assets and knowledge, there would be more gender equality, women would have more opportunities to get out of poverty, fewer children would live in poverty, and women would own more than just 1% of the world's productive assets. There is a need for further research to determine the role of First Nations women in creating sustainable economic development within their communities.
5.7 Summary and Conclusion

Rural First Nations within British Columbia have sustained their communities and cultures through their strong ties to the land. These lands are now threatened by resource development and the infestation of the Mountain Pine Beetle. The Treaty process provides the opportunity for these communities to negotiate full control and jurisdiction over a very small part of their territory, and to negotiate royalty sharing and co-management of some resources within their territory. The Treaty process also offers the opportunity for First Nations communities to meet regularly with the Federal and Provincial government negotiators and continue dialog and communication.

The general proposition that emerged from this study is that First Nations people are loyal to their territories and will continue to be so. Developing First Nations have compelling visions for the future of their communities and see economic development as a priority in closing socio-economic gaps. Due to their ties to the land, First Nations people have resource management knowledge that spans generations. Their inclusion in making decisions about resource extraction and in creating development strategies is an integral part of the Rights Based Approach to development.

The objectives of the research were adapted to reflect the needs of the communities, thus making the study participatory and useful for both communities. The study situated the two research communities, Nazko and Esketemc First Nations, within the wider regional context. Information relevant to the development of First Nations communities within the Quesnel and Williams Lake area was gathered. Some aspects of the study results are also applicable to other developing rural First Nations communities in Canada. The findings of
the research were disseminated to the Nazko and Esketemc First Nations through seminar presentations and reports as economic development still remains a priority for both communities. My employment with the Nazko Band gave me the opportunity to acquire a First Nation's world view which was necessary to fully comprehend development issues of these First Nations communities.
Bibliography

Literature Cited


Drinkwater, M. 2005. 'We Are Also Human': Identity and Power in Gender Relations. CARE International. Paper submitted to the Conference: 'The Winners and Losers from Rights Based Approaches to Development' University of Manchester, Feb.


Esketemc First Nation Band member (Esketemc 2007). E-mail communication with author.


Patrick, Doreen. 2007. Interview.


RCAP. 1996. The report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal People. Ottawa: RCAP.


Simpson, B. 2007a. Forester's Report Shows Campbell Is Still Failing Communities Hit


(accessed October 9, 2007)


Film and Videotapes