



ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretariat
National Library of Canada
395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, CANADA
K1A 0N4

ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secrétariat
Bibliothèque nationale du Canada
395, rue Wellington
Ottawa, CANADA
K1A 0N4

Telephone - Téléphone
(819) 994-6939

E-mail: iso.tc46.sc9@nlc-bnc.ca

ISO/TC 46/SC 9 N 298

2001-01-03

To: P-Members of ISO/TC 46/SC 9

cc. Mme C. Deschamps, Chairperson ISO/TC 46/SC 9
Mr. Dominique Yon, Project Leader for ISO 15707
Members of ISO/TC 46/SC 9/Working Group 2

From: Jane Thacker, ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Secretary

**Subject: Report of Voting on ISO Draft International Standard 15707
(International Standard Musical Work Code)**

Dear Colleagues,

Attached is the final Report of Voting showing responses to the comments on ISO/DIS 15707 for the ISWC project.

Draft International Standard 15707 was approved by 94.44% of the P-members voting. Consequently, we are recommending that the DIS should progress to the Approval stage for a final two-month vote by the ISO member bodies.

ACTION REQUIRED:

- For information and in accordance with the ISO Directives, Part 1, clause 2.6.5.

With regards,

[original signed by]

Jane Thacker
Secretary, ISO/TC 46/SC 9



REPORT OF VOTING ON ISO/DIS 15707	
Closing date of voting 2000-06-27	ISO/TC 46 /SC 9
	Secretariat SCC

Information and documentation – International Standard Musical Work Code (ISWC)

1 Result of the voting

The above-mentioned document was circulated to member bodies on the date shown in annex A, with a request that the Central Secretariat be informed whether or not member bodies were in favour of registration of the DIS as a Final Draft International Standard.

The replies listed in annex A have been received.

2 Comments received

See annex B. (This annex is circulated only to the P-members of the committee but is available to any other member body on request.)

3 Observations of the secretariat

4 Decision of the Chairman



The DIS has been approved in accordance with the conditions of 2.6.3 of part 1 of the ISO/IEC Directives and will be submitted without change, other than editorial, for circulation as an FDIS to all member bodies.

In the light of technical comments received,



a new DIS will be submitted to the Central Secretariat for circulation to the member bodies.



a new committee draft will be distributed for comment.



the DIS and comments will be considered at the next meeting.

Remarks

Documents relating to the development of the ISWC standard are available on the ISO/TC 46/SC 9 Web site at: www.nlc-bnc.ca/iso/tc46sc9/15707.htm.

Signature of the secretary

Jane Thacker

Date: 2000-12-30

Signature of the chairman

[original signed by]

Christine Deschamps

Date: 2001-01-02

**Report of Voting on
ISO DRAFT INTERNATIONAL STANDARD 15707
“Information and documentation -
International Standard Musical Work Code (ISWC)”**

Voting period ended: 2000-06-27

Approvals: 17 P-members out of the 18 who voted = 94.44 %
(Australia; Austria; Canada; Czech Republic; Denmark; France;
Germany; Iran; Ireland; Italy; Japan; Kenya; Rep. of Korea; Netherlands;
Norway; Poland; Russia; South Africa; Spain; Switzerland; U.K.; U.S.A.)

Disapprovals: 1 member (Finland) out of 22 member bodies = 4.55 %

Abstentions: 1 (Portugal)

Comments submitted by: Canada; Finland; France; Germany; U.K., U.S.A.

GENERAL COMMENTS

FINLAND (SFS)

[Introduction to the excerpted comments on ISWC from the Finnish comments on both the ISAN and ISWC draft standards]

... ISWC (International Standard Musical Work Code, ISO/DIS 15707) specifies a means for identifying a musical work.

Both systems [i.e. ISAN and ISWC] will be of vital importance for e-commerce. The standard drafts also outline international co-operation which will result into international ISAN and ISWC databases, and national and regional centres which will provide data to this centralised database. The model is similar to the ISSN network, but its scope will be much larger. The number of items these identifiers will be used to is many times bigger than those of serials. Therefore also the number and value of bibliographic records that need to be generated in national and regional centres may become very high.

Although both identifier systems are technically acceptable – given that the basic premise of using dumb numbers, which makes global databases à la ISSN necessary, is approved – there are political and organisational weaknesses in the standard drafts that should be corrected. We will discuss these problems below....

Summary: Both ISAN and ISWC will have a vital role in identification of electronic resources. Maintenance of these systems will require a lot of (human) effort, and there are reasons to believe that the national libraries will in many countries have the responsibility of these systems.

In spite of the thorough preparatory process both ISAN and ISWC drafts are still quite incomplete and contain requirements that are potentially very harmful. For instance, we can see no way to maintain the global ISWC database meaningfully if the ISWC proposal is approved in its current form.

RESPONSE: There is no expectation that national libraries will be responsible for the ISWC system in their respective countries. ISO 15707 represents formal standardization of the existing "ISWC" system used by collecting societies for musical works.

The main purpose of the ISWC is to provide a tool for use in the administration of rights to musical works. Therefore the expectation is that the ISWC agencies will be collecting societies for authors and composers. It is entirely appropriate for the societies that represent composers and authors of musical works (which are the closest parties to the authoritative source of data about those works) to be the agents for assigning ISWC.

Responses to specific comments are given under the relevant clauses below.

UNITED STATES (ANSI)

It may prove useful to include the letter "M" in the acronym to distinguish the application of this standard to musical works.

RESPONSE: The acronym will remain "ISWC" (not "ISMWC" as suggested in the comment). A shorter acronym is preferable and in keeping with the acronyms for other identifier systems. "ISMIC" is not a possibility because it is too close to the already existing "ISMN" acronym for the identifier for printed music. Furthermore, the acronym "ISWC" is already well-known and used among CISAC's member societies.

Table of Contents

FRANCE (AFNOR)

Editorial comment:

Version française:

Sommaire

Ajouter : Avant-propos	p. iv
Introduction	p. v

English version:

Contents

Add : Foreword	p. iv
Introduction	p. v

RESPONSE: The changes have been made.

3 Construction of the ISWC

3.1 Prefix element

FINLAND (SFS)

We do not understand why the prefix should be "T"; "M" (for Music) would be more appropriate and easier to remember.

RESPONSE: The prefix element has no mnemonic significance. The letter "T" was chosen because it is the prefix that is already being used in the musical work codes of CISAC's member societies.

As stated in the second sentence of clause 3.1, the prefix element may be changed at some point in the future to another alphanumeric character (instead of "T") in order to expand the numbering capacity of the ISWC system and/or to indicate the beginning of a new phase in the assignment of ISWC to musical works. For this reason, it is highly desirable to avoid embedding any significance in the letter chosen for the prefix element.

GERMANY (DIN)

The first element of an ISWC terms the letter "T" but it does not explain the meaning of "T" (tune or text?). We suggest to define the letter "T".

RESPONSE: The prefix element has no mnemonic significance. See response to the above comment from Finland.

Annex A: Guidelines for the use of ISWC

A.1.1 Eligible repertoire

CANADA (SCC)

The DIS states that an example of a composite work is “a work containing samples of pre-existing works...”. What is the meaning of “samples” in this context? Is it technically different from “excerpts”? It is not clear what the meaning of “samples” is.

RESPONSE: The term "samples" in this context is familiar to and understood by the collecting societies who will be responsible for administering the ISWC data so no change will be made to the standard.

Explanation: A sample is an extract from a recording of a sound. The sound may or may not be an extract of a musical work. The use of the word "sample" implies that a computer device called a sampler has been used to manipulate the recording. Since the invention of samplers they have become common place in the production of records, but are also used as musical instruments in their own right. An excerpt on the other hand is a portion of a musical work e.g. a movement from a symphony. The special sense in which the word, "sample" is used means that it is necessary to make a distinction between sample and excerpt. It is important to note that although sampling as a technique has its origins in the production of recordings, it is now the most common method of collaborative composition of musical works.

UNITED KINGDOM (BSI)

The words "irrespective of its form of distribution (e.g. analogue or digital)" in A.1.1, line 2, seem out-of-place and potentially misleading in a standard which is dealing with a work as an abstraction, not with manifestations. A work cannot by definition have a "form of distribution" – only a manifestation of the work can.

Agreed. The phrase has been deleted.

A.2 Administration of the ISWC system

A.2.2 Regional and sectoral ISWC agencies

FINLAND (SFS)

ISWC network will be co-ordinated by the International ISWC Agency. It will nominate regional and/or sectoral agencies. The concept of sectoral agency is poorly defined in the standard; it is impossible to understand what it actually means.

Compared with ISAN, the relationship between international and regional agencies is very poorly outlined. There should also be more detailed description of the roles of these agencies.

The criteria for selecting regional agencies (ability of the candidate agency to manage a musical repertoire for its specified area of jurisdiction, authority of the candidate agency to solve issues relating to the unique identification of musical works in its specified area of jurisdiction and capacity of the candidate agency to exchange information with other agencies of the ISWC system for musical works) indicate strongly that the scope of regional agencies is national. Also, at least in

the cases when legal or voluntary deposit covers also music materials, the national library is an obvious ISWC agency candidate.

RESPONSE: ISWC is an identification system for abstract entities (i.e. works) and therefore the deposit of physical materials is not relevant. National libraries are not obvious candidates for ISWC agencies; it is expected that collecting societies will take on that role since the ISWC is a principally an identification tool for use in the administration of rights to musical works.

Clause A.2.1 and A.2.2 describe the basic functions of the International ISWC Agency and the ISWC agencies. CISAC (which will be the International ISWC Agency, as stated in the footnote at clause 4) is working with an ISWC management committee on matters relating to implementation of the ISWC standard and will be responsible for addressing further details of the points outlined in these clauses.

UNITED KINGDOM (BSI)

[Re: A.2.2 (ISWC agencies) and A.3 (Allocation of ISWC)]:

The arrangements under which the ISWC agencies are created and operated must guarantee that the scheme will be open to a much wider user community that section A.3 seems to imply.

RESPONSE: The user community - as described in this section - includes all creators of musical works whether or not they are affiliated to a rights society. The revised wording of A.3.1 (see response to U.S. comment below) provides for this scenario. The ISWC system is open to a wide user community, providing that the items being registered are within the scope of the ISWC standard.

A.3 Allocation of ISWC

UNITED STATES (ANSI)

Section A.3.1 (page 4): Delete the second sentence.

Add the following text: "If a creator is not a member of a copyright society that is affiliated to an agency, this creator can request an agency to allocate ISWCs to his works on his behalf."

RESPONSE: Agreed.

The 2nd sentence of A.3.1 has been changed to:

English wording: *"In cases where a creator is not represented by a copyright society that is affiliated with an ISWC agency, the creator may request an ISWC agency to allocate ISWC to works on his behalf."*

French wording: "Au cas où un créateur ne serait pas représenté par une société de gestion de droit d'auteur affiliée à une agence ISWC, ce créateur peut demander à une agence d'attribuer en son nom des numéros ISWC à ses œuvres."

Section A.3.6 (page 4):

Based on national experience in administering identification systems, the DIS's handling of cases in which duplicate ISWCs have been assigned is awkward. In the case of duplicate codes it is suggested that one of them be declared "obsolete".

RESPONSE: Due to the fact that a musical work can have multiple authors, it is inevitable that, on rare occasions, a duplicate ISWC might exist and might not be detected immediately. Because of the existing business practices among collecting societies, it is not possible to simply declare an ISWC as obsolete. In such cases, as soon as they are identified, the system will deal with duplicate registrations by linking such registration records in the ISWC database and its related products.

A.4 Descriptive metadata

FRANCE (AFNOR)

Version française:

A. 4 Métadonnées descriptives

Ajouter :

- a) au moins un titre **uniformisé** par œuvre...

Commentaire : pour identifier de manière univoque une œuvre musicale, il convient de déterminer une forme contrôlée selon des règles communes du titre de cette œuvre.

English version:

A. 4 Descriptive metadata

Add :

- a) at least one **formal** title for the work...

Comments : for an unique identification of a musical work, a controlled form of title according to common rules should be elaborated.

RESPONSE: An original title is preferred (instead of a formal title as suggested). The wording will be changed to: "... at least one **original** title for the work (as defined in Annex C.2)" and in French: "... au moins un titre **original** par œuvre (tel que défini en Annexe C.2)".

A.5 ISWC databases

FINLAND (SFS)

The standard draft requires that each agency should maintain a database of its ISWC allocations and the associated descriptive metadata. From the point of view of current cataloguing practices in national libraries this is a challenge, since cataloguing is not done on work level.

In chapter A.5 there are two statements that are problematic:

"Musical works that are used internationally or which potentially could be registered by two or more ISWC agencies shall also have their ISWC information entered into the database of the International ISWC Agency."

At the time of registration there is no way of knowing if a work will eventually be used internationally. It may be that at the time of registration the work is not yet even used nationally. The proposal equals an ISSN network in which the global ISSN database would contain data on those journals that are sold in one country only.

In practice, making a selection would require adding a code into the record, which could then be used as a basis for extracting data from the local ISWC database to the global one. It would be easier to extract every record instead of a few chosen ones. With modern technologies, there is no need to try to limit the size of the global ISWC database. On the contrary, it would be very beneficial for users to have a single resource which contains all assigned ISWCs with related metadata. Global database would also be a good tool for the ISWC community, since only a database that contains everything will reveal all problems with ISWC assignment.

Another difficult statement is this:

"The International ISWC Agency will specify the type and format of metadata associated with ISWC registrations and the policies and mechanisms by which this data may be accessed."

The International ISWC Agency does not have any valid reasons or right to decide how a domestic ISWC database is accessed and how its records are used. ISWC data may in the future form part of the national bibliography; it is ridiculous to claim that should anything to say about the access to these systems outside the ISWC community itself. The above statement must be corrected in such a way that it can not be interpreted too broadly.

The proposed de-centralised model would bring a lot of technical problems. As a dumb code ISWC does not contain any hint of the country in which it was assigned. If the record were not found from the global database, it would be necessary to search from a large number of national databases. This would be a great waste of time and network resources, even if efficient protocols such as Z39.50 were used. It is quite likely that large number of national MARC formats and maybe even some other formats such as Dublin Core will be used to create

ISWC records; this would make it even more complicated to provide efficient searching capabilities.

On the other hand, if there is a global ISWC database, the International Agency only needs to specify the form in [which] the bibliographic data is to be delivered from the regional agencies. There would be no need to enforce [the] same access practices and formats throughout the whole community.

Contrary to ISAN, ISWC does refer to a format (UNIMARC) when defining descriptive metadata for musical works, if only [the] level of specifying some of the data elements.

RESPONSE: Details concerning the database architecture of the ISWC system will not be included in the International Standard. Such matters are addressed at the implementation level and within the network of ISWC agencies. It is entirely appropriate that the International ISWC Agency is responsible for coordinating this work, including the nature and format of essential ISWC registration data. Also see the response to the Finnish comment at A.2.2, above.

Concerning the reference to the UNIMARC format, it was used in this standard to facilitate the understanding of the tables, and of the definitions that were given in the tables. It was intended mainly to make a link between the terminology of the rights societies community and of the library community. It was not intended to imply that ISWC data would be the responsibility of national bibliographic agencies.

Annex C: Descriptive metadata for registration of musical works

C.2 Title information

FRANCE (AFNOR)

Version française:

Tableau C.1

Titre de partie d'œuvre. Dans quels cas doit-on renseigner cette donnée ?

Soit l'extrait est traité comme une œuvre autonome et possède son ISWC, le titre de partie devient donc un titre à part entière avec un type de dérivation. Soit l'extrait n'est pas traité de manière autonome et le titre, comme l'ISWC, est celui de l'œuvre globale.

English version:

Table C.1

Part title : When do you need such information ? Or it is an excerpt indexed as an self sufficient work with its own ISWC and the title of excerpt is a title of work

with the appropriate information on the type of musical work. Or it is an excerpt not recognized for itself and the ISWC and the metadata associated are those of the global work.

RESPONSE: Agreed. This information is not needed. It has been deleted from the table.

UNITED KINGDOM (BSI)

Metadata Table C.1:

We don't understand the circumstances in which "Part title" is needed. The definition should be "A title of a section of ...".

RESPONSE: Agreed. "Part title" is not needed in the ISWC context. See response to AFNOR comment above.

There is a problem with the term "Restricted title" – ANY of the other titles defined in the table could be presented in "restricted" form. So where other entries are saying what sort of title you've got, this one is merely saying how it is presented.

RESPONSE: The definition of "Restricted title" has been revised to: "*An original title from which all initial articles and punctuation have been removed*".
And in French: "*Titre compacté: Un titre original dont tous les articles et la ponctuation d'origine ont été supprimés.*"

UNITED STATES (ANSI)

Annex C, Section C.2, footnote B (page 7):
Please verify the reference to "textual incipit".

RESPONSE: The reference to "Textual incipit" has been deleted because it is not yet included in the UNIMARC format.

C.3 Information on creator(s)

CANADA (SCC)

The definition of adapter states "the author ... of an adapted text of a musical work". However, what about the person who adapts music? This person is different from the "arranger". The definition should not be restricted to "an adapted text of a musical work." (Please also note spelling of adapter (not adaptor).)

RESPONSE: CISAC societies have standardised their terminology to describe the person who adapts music as an arranger, and the person who adapts the text of a musical work to be an adapter. These definitions are specified in the table.

"Sub-author": We question the use of this term.

RESPONSE: As above this is the terminology adopted uniformly by CISAC societies for this role and it is used among the authors rights societies in some specific cases.

UNITED KINGDOM (BSI)

Metadata Table C.2:

There is a difficulty in the handling of text, music, and "text and music". For text alone, the table has both creator and various kinds of modifiers. For music alone, the table has both creator and modifier. For "text and music", the table has only creator. Wouldn't it be more consistent and more flexible to handle text and music separately throughout, using two role codes if one person is associated with both?

RESPONSE: In the CISAC community, there is no role existing for both text and music modifier, although there is a role for a text and music creator. This table cannot be changed because it corresponds to the usage in the daily operations among the rights societies.

C.4 Work derivation information

CANADA (SCC)

"Composite of samples": See comment [on Annex A] above regarding the use of the term "samples".

In addition, the definitions of "composite of samples" and "potpourri" refer to works in the context of recording, publishing and printing. However, recording, publishing and printing relate to the "manifestation" rather than the "work". These concepts of work and manifestation have been confused.

RESPONSE: The creation of a musical work in this instance is a consequence of the composite of samples taken from pre-existing recorded works. Therefore the distinction between the abstraction and the manifestation is maintained. The sequence of their creation, however, is different.

Bibliographie

FRANCE (AFNOR)

[Version française] Bibliographie, Remplacer par :

Fédération internationale des associations de bibliothécaires et des bibliothèques. UNIMARC Manual. Bibliographic Format. 2nd edition. Munich : Saur, 1994- . (UBCIM Publications New Series). ISBN 3-598-11211-4.

RESPONSE: The change has been made.

Editorial comments from AFNOR (France) on the French text of DIS 15707

RESPONSE: All of the changes proposed by AFNOR below have been incorporated into the French text.

3 Structure de l'ISWC

Remplacer par :

1^{ère} phrase : Un ISWC se compose de trois éléments : un préfixe suivi de neuf chiffres puis d'un chiffre de contrôle, comme suit...

Dernière phrase : A seule fin de faciliter la lecture, des tirets et des points peuvent être utilisés comme séparateurs entre ces éléments et au sein de l'identifiant de l'œuvre.

5 Liaison d'un ISWC aux métadonnées descriptives

Remplacer par :

Titre : Association d'un ISWC à des métadonnées descriptives.

L'ISWC doit être associé aux données descriptives (voir Annexe C) de l'œuvre musicale qu'il identifie au moyen d'une base de données de dépôt administrée par la même agence ISWC que celle ayant enregistré l'œuvre concernée.

A.1.1 Répertoire éligible

Remplacer par :

2eme exemple de versions modifiées : nouveaux arrangements (par exemple un arrangement pour orchestre de chambre d'une invention pour piano de Bach)

2eme exemple d'extraits : œuvre reconnue en tant qu'extrait d'une œuvre plus vaste, mais dont le type d'extrait n'est pas identifié (par exemple

A.3 Affectation d'un ISWC

Remplacer par :

Titre : Attribution d'un ISWC

Dans tout le paragraphe remplacer affectation ou affecté par attribution ou attribué.

A.5 Bases de données ISWC

Remplacer par :

Chaque agence de l'ISWC doit administrer une base de données recensant les ISWC qu'elle a attribués et les métadonnées descriptives qui leur sont associées.

A.6 Manuel des agences

Remplacer par :

Tous les détails sur l'attribution et l'utilisation de l'ISWC sont expliqués dans un guide disponible auprès des agences du système ISWC.

Annexe B

Figure C.1 - Remplacer par :

L'algorithme du chiffre de contrôle est le suivant :

Annexe C

Tableau C.1 - Remplacer par :

Titre erroné	Un titre faux ou impropre parfois utilisé par erreur pour l'identification
Titre de partie d'œuvre	Titre de la partie d'une œuvre qui n'est pas reconnue comme un extrait et qui n'a donc pas son propre ISWC cf aussi remarques techniques

RESPONSE: "Part title" has been deleted. See response to AFNOR comment on C.2 above.
--

Tableau C.2 - Remplacer par :

Adaptateur	L'auteur ou l'un des auteurs de l'adaptation du texte d'une œuvre musicale.
Auteur d'un texte supplémentaire	L'auteur d'un texte qui remplace ou modifie le texte existant d'une œuvre musicale.
