Education in Places of Temporary Asylum: The Case of Afghan Refugees Living in Peshawar

Mariam Kakkar

A Thesis

in

The Department

of

Education

Presented in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts at Concordia University Montreal, Quebec, Canada

March 2000

© Mariam Kakkar, 2000
The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-47752-5
ABSTRACT

Education in Places of Temporary Asylum: The Case of Afghan Refugees Living in Peshawar

This is an exploratory case study that documents Afghan refugees' educational experiences in Peshawar, Pakistan. The central question of this thesis asks: how Afghans educational needs are met through the educational/training institutions available to them? In the absence of theoretical studies on refugee education, this study used a comparative approach in reviewing the literature for general trends and patterns of various refugee experiences. It appears that the educational needs of Afghans refugees are not being met. This is in large part due to the lack of organisation by many governmental, non-governmental and UN organisations working on behalf of these refugees, lack of employment opportunities in Peshawar and lack of trust and collaboration amongst the refugees. Refugee groups are viewed as unique. Yet there exists some common recurrent patterns in all refugee experiences in places of temporary asylum. Unfortunately, the lessons learned from past refugee situations have not been applied here. Fieldworkers and administrators working with refugees in places of temporary asylum need time to reflect and study past refugee experiences before attempting to implement educational programs. It is only through an examination of past refugee movements that we can prepare proper strategies to serve the needs of the next wave of refugees.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis could not have been written without special acknowledgements to some very special people.
First, I would like to thank Dr. A. Cleghorn. Her professional and personal support, guidance and enthusiasm has allowed me to grow both as a person and as an academic. Her commitment to my research is deeply appreciated. I am indebted to her generous assistance and advice. I am so fortunate to have had her as my thesis supervisor.
I would also like to thank Dr. A. Abdi whose help and encouragement in my research has been enormous.
Professor Hamalian and Dr. Bouchard thank-you for being supportive in my academic work.
My friends at Concordia, Colleen Bernard and Laura McEwen, your friendship and belief in my abilities is deeply cherished. Annie Potter, thank-you for being so kind all the time.
My friends in Montreal, Khatima El-Kandoussi, Irene Katsarkas, Dalia Minassian and Laure-Elise Singer, thank-you for listening to my little research 'stories'.
My friends in Toronto, Shirley Mayer and Joanne Mouyal, you both have been my pillars of strength in finishing this project.
To my brother and sister, thank-you for making little concessions for me this year.
To my parents, without you I would never ever have finished this thesis. Thank-you for supporting me in school for the past twenty-one years.

My heartfelt thanks to all of you.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## I. INTRODUCTION

## II. CHAPTER 1: AN OVERVIEW OF THE CURRENT LITERATURE

1.1 Introduction 7

1.2 Historical Perspective on Education in Afghanistan 8

1.2.1 Pre-War Era 8
1.2.2 The Educational System During the Soviet Occupation 10
1.2.3 Education After the Soviet Invasion 13

1.3 How is Educational Policy formed for Afghan refugees in Peshawar? 13

1.3.1 Brief Overview of the Afghan Refugees in Pakistan 13
1.3.2 Educational Policy for Afghan Refugees: whose role is it? 15
1.3.3 Educational Organisations: A Collaborative Policy 16

1.4 Curriculum Development: How is curriculum developed for Afghan Refugees? 20

1.4.1 Geography 21
1.4.2 History 22
1.4.3 Socio Economic Factors 24
1.4.4 Political Factors 24
1.4.5 Cultural Factors 25

1.5 Factors Which Influence Participation in Educational Programs 26

1.5.1 Cultural Factors 26
1.5.2 Economic Factors 27
1.5.3 Psychological Distress 28

1.6 Post-War Development in Afghanistan: The end result of education? 29

1.6.1 Repatriation 29
1.6.2 Post-War Development 31

1.7 A Framework for Understanding Refugee Behaviour 35

1.7.1 Refugee Theory 35
1.7.2 Refugee State 36
1.7.3 Social Identification Categories 38
1.7.4 Refugee Settlement 39
### III. CHAPTER 2: METHODS SECTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction to Qualitative Research</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Relevant Qualitative Methods of this Study: The Case Study Method</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Interviews</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Observations</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Documentation</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Validity and Reliability of Ethnographic Research</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Reliability</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Validity</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Pre-Field Work</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Ethics</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Entering the Field</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 Participants</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Procedure</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 Role of the Researcher</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 The Interviews</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3 Observations</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.4 Document Collection</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.5 Triangulation</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Data Analysis</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.1 Analysing Data During Data Collection</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.2 Ending Data Collection</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.3 Analysing Case Study Data</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.4 Limitations of the Data Analysis</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Limitations of this Study</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### IV. CHAPTER 3: RESULTS OF THE STUDY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Current Needs of Afghan Refugees</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1 Employment</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2 Mental Health Services</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3 Long Term Policy Planning</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.4 Trust/Collaboration</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.5 Aid From Expatriates</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Socio-Economic Levels of Refugees</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Educational Background of Refugees</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1 Education Prior to the Soviet Invasion</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2 Education After the Soviet Invasion</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Policy Planning and Curriculum Development</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Afghan Schools</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Pakistani Schools</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3 Vocational Training Centers</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4 Madrassas</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Perceptions of the Advantages and Disadvantages of Different Educational Systems</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1 Afghan Schools</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2 Pakistani Schools</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3 Vocational Training Centers</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4 Madrassas</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Participation in Education</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1 Refugees Who Plan on Going Abroad</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2 Refugees Who Plan in Staying in Pakistan</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3 Refugees Who Plan on Going Back to Afghanistan</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Personal Perceptions of Education</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.1 Administrators</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.2 Teachers</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.3 Students</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
V. CHAPTER 4: DISCUSSION

4.1 Need and Education 101

4.1.1 Employment and Education 101
4.1.2 Mental Health Services and Education 105
4.1.3 Trust and Collaboration and Education 106
4.1.4 Long Term Policy Planning 108
4.1.5 Aid from Expatriates 109

4.2 Critical Experiences 110
4.3 Pedagogical and Social Objectives of Education 111
4.4 Factors which influence participation 114

4.5 Afghans and Repatriation 115

4.6 Lessons Learned 116

VI. REFERENCES 118

VII. Appendices

Appendix A: Consent Form 128
Appendix B: Debriefing Form 129
Appendix C: Participant Names and Occupation 130
Appendix D: Interview Questions 131
INTRODUCTION

This study is an exploration of Afghan refugees educational experiences in Peshawar, Pakistan. The study is grounded in research on refugee theory and on refugee education in places of temporary asylum.

This chapter outlines a brief background of the situation, the research questions and the rationale for undertaking this research project.

Background

For the past nineteen years, the Afghan refugee problem has constituted the world's largest refugee crisis. In 1978, a Soviet backed communist coup overthrew the government of Afghanistan and set in motion events that would foreshadow twenty years of war. The war in Afghanistan was one of the bloodiest and most destructive of the Cold War era. Millions of dollars was spent on arms for both sides such that eight years later, over a million people were dead, hundreds of thousands disabled and over six million people forced into exile.

Since the Soviet invasion, Afghans have been fleeing their homeland and seeking refuge in neighbouring Pakistan and Iran. Some Afghans gained refugee status in the United States of America, Canada, Germany and Australia. Other refugees repatriated from Pakistan and Iran when after the Geneva accords of 1988, the Soviets withdrew from Afghanistan. However their eagerness to repatriate was short lived. In addition to the economic hardships faced by returnees, a civil war broke out immediately after the Russian withdrawal. Many who had returned home were forced out of the country once again.
The civil war officially ended in 1996 with the establishment of the Taliban government. The Taliban come from religious schools in Pakistan where young Afghan men were trained and educated by Pakistani Islamic fundamentalists. The only education they received was religious and their only training in weaponry. Since 1997, there has been an influx of Afghan refugees back to their homeland in areas that are not controlled by the Taliban. The United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR, 1995) indicates that presently there are still 1.4 million Afghan refugees in Iran and 1.5 million refugees in Pakistan. Of these, there is a desire for many to go home. There are numerous non-governmental organisations (NGO's), private organisations and United Nations (UN) departments offering services to Afghan refugees living in Peshawar.

The refugees in Pakistan were classified into four main groups upon their arrival from Afghanistan in 1979. The first group consisted of refugees that were from wealthy families, with businesses and assets outside of Afghanistan (Rogers, 1992). This group faced no difficulties living in Pakistan since most of them eventually went to Europe or North Americana as soon as their refugee status was approved. The next group brought assets with them from Afghanistan, and as such were able to participate in Pakistani commerce (Rogers). The third group was classified as the professional group consisting of teachers, lawyers, engineers and doctors. It is this group that has contributed most to the Afghan refugee society, many of whom live in refugee camps in Peshawar, near the Pakistan-Afghan border (Sinclair, 1990). It is this group that has offered essential services (health care, education, job placements) to the inhabitants of the camps
with aid from various organisations. The last group consists of Afghans who left Afghanistan with nothing, and are solely dependent on assistance from Pakistan and NGO's for food, shelter and water (Rubinstein, 1986). After the signing of the Geneva Accords, the mandate of the UN and other organisations has been to help those Afghan refugees who want to repatriate back home to be able to do so (Sinclair, 1990). As a result, there has been some major modifications in the assistant programs offered to the refugees.

After twenty years of war, Afghanistan remains a country completely devastated on all political, economical and social fronts. However as new conflicts continue to arise all over the world, Afghanistan is slowly being forgotten by the rest of the world. The time has finally come to begin the difficult task of rebuilding the country. There are over a million Afghan refugees living in Pakistan and Iran, many of whom are eager and willing to return home.

Against this backdrop I decided to take a close look at the educational opportunities for Afghans in Peshawar, since education may be assumed to constitute to refugees readiness to return home or alternatively, to continue as refugees in one part of the world or another.

Statement of the Problem

The topic of my thesis is comprehensive in nature. In an attempt to study education in places of temporary asylum, I have focused on economic, political and social issues. I believe that each topic yields valuable information on the education issue. I am not making a proposal for educational reform. Rather, I am
attempting to offer insight to the problems associated with the current dynamics of the education system available for Afghan refugees.

**Research Questions**

The main research question which fuelled my investigation is how are Afghans' needs met through the various education/training programs offered in Peshawar? The thesis was then guided by the following questions: A) What have been the critical experiences which have led to the current educational situation of Afghans in Peshawar? B) What are the current pedagogical and social objectives of the education offered to Afghans? C) How have Afghans participated in education /training programs? and D) What role will Afghans in Peshawar play in post-war development in Afghanistan?

**Significance of the Study**

This study documents Afghans educational experiences in Peshawar. It is unique in that it examines children, men and women participating in a variety of educational settings. A comprehensive study of this topic has never been completed prior to this research. In the execution of this study, it is my wish to provide information for educational policy makers who work on behalf of Afghan refugees. Also it is hoped that some of these findings may be useful for educators who work with other refugee populations.
Overview of the Thesis

Chapter One presents a brief historical overview of the educational system in Afghanistan. The current educational system in Peshawar can only be understood through an examination of the cultural and sociological aspects of the education system in Afghanistan. As well, this chapter discusses refugee theory in relation to refugee education. Lastly, this chapter reviews the situation of other refugees populations in places of temporary asylum.

Chapter Two describes the methodology employed in this thesis. The methodology used a case study approach with data gathered through the use of interviews, observations and document analysis. The limitations of the study are included in this chapter.

Chapter Three presents the results of this study. Key issues include: current needs of refugees, how Afghans participate in education and refugee kinetic-state in relation to refugee education.

Chapter Four summarises the research findings in relation to the questions this thesis attempted to answer. This chapter also proposes possible research projects to answer the questions that this thesis raised and did not cover.

Prior Research

In anticipation of carrying out this study, three Afghan individuals living in Montreal were contacted and interviewed. This project was carried out as part of
the requirement for a research methods course. The two women and one man had attended school in Peshawar in the late eighties and had lived in Montreal since the early nineties as immigrants.

The interviews focused on Afghans educational experiences in Peshawar during the late eighties. This study explored individuals' experiences in various language classes they attended in Peshawar. The results of this study gave valuable insights as to what I might expect when I conducted my fieldwork in Peshawar. For instance, I was informed that there is no organised system of education offered to Afghan refugees in Pakistan. As well, vocational centres for refugees are scarce. I will refer to some of the findings from this research project in this thesis.
CHAPTER ONE: AN OVERVIEW OF THE CURRENT LITERATURE

This chapter serves two purposes. The first part of the chapter explores important issues in understanding the current dynamics of the education system offered to Afghan refugees in Peshawar. The second part of the chapter reviews the literature on refugee education and defines the conceptual and theoretical framework for the thesis.

1.1 Introduction

The literature review was conducted using library databases (ERIC, PAIS, PsyLit) and online searches of United Nations search indexes (UNIONS and RefWorld). The overall purpose was to gather a combination of preliminary and secondary sources. Aside from looking for journal articles, reports and books on Afghan refugees and their education in Peshawar, I also searched for sources on refugee education and refugee theory. All too often the material I found was in the form of reports and opinions papers. I found that there was a lack of scholarly research in the field of Afghan refugees and education and refugee education in places of temporary asylum.

In synthesising the research findings of the literature review, I used a five-step method that Ogawa and Malen (1991) refer to as a multivocal literature review. The first step involves reviewing and assessing the literature for purpose and quality. Second, the data in the literature was categorised under specific
themes. The third step requires the researcher to "map the manner in which components of the data set inform the question of the study" (p. 279). Next, I developed coding schemes to construct the data for the questions of this study. Lastly, I examined the limitations of the data in the literature. This meant for example, verifying for any biases in UN reports towards the Taliban government. The review includes for the most part qualitative research described in an exploratory manner.

1.2 Historical Perspective on Education in Afghanistan

1.2.1 Pre-war Era

Formal education has had an important role in the history of Afghanistan (Boesen, 1989). Prior to the nineteen fifties, the Islamic religion, prevalent in the region, had the strongest influence on the education system. Mullas (religious leaders) taught about Quranic Law and various religious doctrines in madrassas (religious schools) (Conner, 1989; Jawad, 1989). Also found in Afghanistan at the same time, though rare, were schools run under various international institutions such as the French system and the British system. These schools offered courses in Islam as well as in other subjects. Viewed from the perspective of Afghans enrolled in these institutions, this education offered them many opportunities both within their own country and abroad. That is, many young Afghans received scholarships and bursaries to study abroad.

The advent of modern education, otherwise known as Western education occurred in the late nineteen fifties. It was at this time that the Afghan constitution
mandated that all Afghan children attend schooling up until the high school level. (Carter, 1988). In order to enhance the level of higher education, King Habibullah established a new system of education from high school to university in the majority of cities in Afghanistan (Boensen, 1989). This education system was formed, primarily with the aid of many foreign countries such as West Germany, France and the United States. Kabul University was affiliated with many prominent universities in the United States, France, Italy and Japan (Jawad, 1989; Majrooh and Elmi, 1986). This new education system broke away from the traditional system of education to one more rooted in modern ideas (Anderson and Dupree, 1990). Boensen (1989) argues that:

> the modern Afghan educational system was exceptionally cosmopolitan, a fact which reflected the Afghan development policy of seeking partners of co-operation from different countries and political blocs., balancing each countries influence out, in order to remain neutral and non-aligned (p. 4).

In this way, then, Afghan educators were attempting to protect the education system against Western influence.

The general attitude of the Afghan people towards this new type of education was very positive especially in the rural provinces (Jawad, 1989). Many young adults from rural villages found an alternative to traditional careers such as farming. Jawad found that in the nineteen sixties the majority of the students enrolled at Kabul University were from rural villages. As a consequence of this new educational system, a new force, an 'intelligentsia' developed in Afghan culture (Anderson and Dupree, 1990). This group of intellects were dedicated to
the development and modernisation of Afghan society. It was unexpected, but not surprising that the Soviets became very interested in this group of intellectuals. In fact, they translated and published many of their works in Russian (Noorzoy, 1989). It is within this context that the Soviets became very familiar with Afghan ideology and culture.

In the late nineteen seventies, prior to the Russian coup, Russian educators took a special interest in the education system of small rural villages located near the Soviet-Afghan border. The Soviets, with the aid of Afghan communists, attempted to re-direct the education system towards a more communist system (Globe, 1986). Their strategy was simple. Known as likbez (liquidate illiteracy), the target group for these literacy programs was illiterate villagers. This type of education, or crash course, consisted of a few hours of lessons. The prime purpose of this was that "they allowed the authorities to conduct propaganda for linguistic division...under the guide of education" (Globe, p. 2). As a result of their conniving tactics, the Soviets created support for the Soviet regime in some of these small villages. Until then, the Afghan government had not had the opportunity to provide educational opportunities for these people.

1.2.2 The Educational System During the Soviet Occupation

Immediately after the invasion, the Russians took control of important sectors of the country. This included, for example, transportation and communication, monetary and education systems. Their immediate goal was to transform the current educational system to one that mirrored the Soviet system
(Globe, 1986). The aim of this educational system was implemented in order to serve the long-term purposes of Soviet interests. The Soviets wanted Afghanistan to become integrated into the Soviet Union, and thus they were interested in a complete reorientation of Afghan society (Globe). Their ultimate goal was to establish a group of 'elite' Afghans who would run the country for them.

Russian educators were sent to Afghanistan to overhaul the entire education system. The immediate target group was children between the ages of six to twelve. Many orphaned children in Afghanistan were taken to the Soviet Union to special orphanages (Globe, 1986; Jawad, 1992). There they were subjected to the same ideological pressures as the children back in Afghanistan. Globe notes..."in this way, they could be forced like flowers in a hothouse to grow through several historical stages in only a few months" (p.3). The manifest purpose of this tactic was that these young Afghans, after several years of a Soviet education, were to take the role of communist leaders when they returned to Afghanistan.

The Russian advisors took over key positions as education planners (Globe, 1986). Within this context Russian scholars and educators faced a serious problem of inferiority compared to their Afghan counterparts (Majrooh and Elmi, 1986). Although the actual level of scholarship was considered much lower in the Soviet Union than in Afghanistan, the Soviets nonetheless managed to exert their power on the Afghan education system. They found that attempting to 'transform' youth living in rural areas was difficult because they held strong ties
to their culture and religion (Boensen, 1988). Therefore, they concentrated their efforts on the urban youth.

In addition to changing the language of instruction in schools from Farsi (Afghan language) to Russian, the Soviets used the classroom for their propaganda. They rewrote all the Afghan textbooks to fit Soviet ideology. For example, at the University of Kabul the following policies were implemented: Islamic and Western subjects were substituted for Soviet and Communist-oriented curriculum; they enforced learning a second language, Russian or Spanish (as homage to the communist Cuban regime); compulsory courses such as "the New History of Afghanistan", "The History of World Literature: Marx, Lenin and Castro" were implemented into the curriculum. (Boesen, 1989; Globe, 1986; Majrooh and Elmi, 1986; Noorzay, 1989). According to the new interpretation of Afghan history, Afghans received their independence from the British with the help from the Soviet Union. Thus to Afghan educators, the 'sovietization of Afghan education' completely changed the ideology of an entire generation (Boensen).

The immediate impact of the new policies resulted in thousands of intellectuals being jailed and executed for non-conformity to Soviet rules and regulations (Boensen, 1988). As a consequence, there was an immediate exodus of Afghan teachers, educators and intellectuals. Vacant teaching positions were seized by Soviet teachers (Elmi, 1989). Fazel (1985) argues that this was the 'brain drain' of Afghan intellects and educators from Afghanistan.
1.2.3 Education After the Soviet Invasion

The Soviets left the educational system of Afghanistan in a state of collapse (Allen, 1994). Figures indicate that over 2000 schools were destroyed, 2000 teachers killed and another 15 000 left the profession. After ten years of civil war, many of the school buildings that were not destroyed during the Soviet occupation, were ruined during the civil war (Carter, 1988). At present, a proper infrastructure in education is non-existent (Allen, 1994; Breen, 1995; Damato, 1995). With Afghanistan just recently out of a civil war, there is a lack of economic resources to develop an education system.

1.3 How is educational policy formed for Afghan refugees living in Peshawar?

1.3.1 Brief Overview of the Afghan refugees in Pakistan

A refugee, by definition is a person who has fled his country for fear of being persecuted on the basis of religion, colour, race, nationality, gender or political opinion (Christensen, 1987). According to Kunz (1981), refugees can be categorised under two groups: reactive fate groups and purpose groups. Purpose groups are refugees who perceive persecution based on their social and political beliefs. Reactive fate groups are victims of wars and social movements. Afghan refugees living in Peshawar fall under this category.

When the Afghans first arrived in Pakistan, the government was quick to meet their basic needs (Rogers, 1992). Accounts from various refugees indicate that many Pakistanis were hospitable and generous towards them (Jawad,
1992). Dupree (1988) maintains that this occurred for two reasons: the close geographical location and the common religion of the two countries. To date, there has been no major outbreak of violence or disease as a result of the Afghan refugees living in Pakistan (Dupree).

The United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR) is the main relief organisation that provides aid for refugees. It has a mandate to offer protection and relief assistance to refugees (Simmance, 1987; Stein, 1981). UNHCR follows a model of determinants when designing policies for refugees (Pitterman, 1987). Four factors affect the 'need' of the refugees: refugee population size and character, severity of refugee situation, host-country economic well-being and disruptions (climate, conflict). Based on an analysis of needs, UNHCR devises policy options centred on host country demand articulation, donor state priority and refugee salience.

A coherent strategy for refugee aid has been non-existent in the Afghan situation. This is due largely because the state of Afghan refugees has never remained static. As a result of constant political changes in both Afghanistan and Pakistan, the policies formed in aiding Afghan refugees has altered considerably from the onset of the crisis (UNCHR, 1998). Whereas, in the beginning many Afghans were to go abroad, now, policy options are aimed at their repatriation (Sinclair, 1990).

It may be impossible to have an exact number of Afghan refugees living in Pakistan. To date, there appears to be over one million Afghan refugees in Pakistan. (Miller, 1985; Dupree, 1988; Javad, 1992 Stein, 1981). The fact that
many refugees do not register with the Pakistani government may explain why there is not an exact figure of the number of refugees. Refugees who do register are entitled to free relief assistance provided that they live in refugee camps (Dupree, 1988). Experience has demonstrated in past refugee situations that many refugees who do not register with host governments do so because they find family members living outside of the camps to provide for them (Hansen, 1981). This has been the case for many of the Afghan refugees living in Peshawar.

1.3.2 Educational Policy for Afghan refugees: Whose role is it?

UN agencies, NGO’s and private organisations are responsible for the education available to Afghan refugees (Boensen, 1988). Preston (1991a) indicates that in general a great deal of money is allocated towards the education of refugees. Designing and implementing courses in education/vocational institutions for example, have been done so by members of the organisations mentioned above. At the same time, however, the host country is ultimately responsible for the allocation of resources to the refugees (Preston, 1990).

Literature on policy planning of education in places of temporary asylum is lacking (Preston, 1992). The reasons to explain why there is a lack of literature on refugee education in places of temporary asylum will be discussed later in this chapter. Hadad (1995) suggests that policy options for educational systems fall under four categories: the systemic mode, the incremental mode, the ad hoc mode and the importation mode. These modes apply to circumstances where
educational policy is formed over an extended period of time. Within the Afghan context, it is extremely difficult to find a policy mode that will fit exactly within the boundaries of a specific mode. This being the case, I believe that the policy mode which best applies to the Afghan situation is the ad hoc mode. Hadad (1995) defines this policy mode as one where policy options are formed when major political or social events affect the educational system.

1.3.3 Educational Organisations: A Collaborative Policy?

Various organisations have been commissioned to work on behalf of Afghan refugees. The end result is that there are four types of educational organisations Afghans have access to. They are: 1) Pakistani Schools, 2) Afghani Schools, 3) madrassas (religious schools) and 4) Vocational/Training Centres (Boesen, 1989; Carter, 1988; Fazel, 1985; Sinclair, 1990; Rogers, 1992).

Pakistani schools in Peshawar are open to Afghan students, provided they can pay the high tuition costs (Boesen, 1988). The language of instruction is Urdu (Pakistani language). Only a minority of Afghans attend Pakistani schools this owing to the high tuition costs of these schools. Children who attend these schools become familiar with Pakistani language, culture and history. A degree from a Pakistani school is recognised anywhere in Pakistan and abroad. The policies formed for Pakistani schools are formed by the Ministry of Education in Pakistan.

The majority of Afghans send their children to Afghani schools
These schools receive funding from two main sources: NGO’s and UN organisations. The majority of schools in refugee camps are run by UN organisations such as UNHCR and the United Nations Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO). The teachers and educators who run these schools are Afghan. The schools must follow certain guidelines set by UN organisations and NGO’s. This may include, for example, providing equal opportunity for male and female education. The policies in these educational institutions change on a yearly basis. This occurs for various reasons: lack of money, change in administration and most importantly the political situation in Afghanistan.

As well there are numerous Afghan schools in Peshawar run by Afghans (Rashid, 1990). The policy of these schools is to offer an education that mirrors that found in Afghanistan just prior to the Soviet invasion. The language of instruction is Farsi. There are courses on Islam as well as courses in all subject areas such as math, science and humanities. The goals of the Afghan schools is to offer children an education that not only allows them to become familiar with Islam and its values, but as well to become knowledgeable about their national and cultural identity and to become informed of the human and natural resources of Afghanistan (Fazel, 1985). An important point to make here is that although there are numerous Afghan schools in Peshawar, there is no collaboration between the schools in regards to the type of curricula offered in each school. In fact there is no single policy towards curricula amongst any of these schools.

Vocational or training centres are operated under the supervision of UN organisations and NGO’s (Allen, 1994; Boensen, 1988; Jawad, 1992; Sinclair,
These centres offer training in a variety of areas such as sewing; carpet weaving, machinery repair and shoe making (Sinclair). The aim of these programs is to wean people away from assistance to self-employment. It should be kept in mind, however, that the number of spaces in these schools is limited. All too often refugees become frustrated at the lack of vocational opportunities available to them. Each organisation has a different policy. One organisation, for example, the Norwegian Project Organisation, travels to Afghanistan to conduct a needs assessment. Then, based on skills they have found are needed in Afghanistan, they train Afghan refugees living in Peshawar who are planning on repatriating (NPO, 1998).

As noted previously, there is a constant restructuring of policies towards refugees due in large part to changes in the political situation in Afghanistan (Sinclair, 1990). Recently, due to the signing of the Geneva Accords, many of the policies formed for Afghan refugees who participate in organisations run by NGO's and UN organisations, have been geared towards aiding in their repatriation. For example, recently, land mine awareness programs have been initiated in some vocational/training centres in order to reduce accidents or causalities when Afghans return home (Sinclair, 1990).

Lastly, there are many madrassas in Peshawar. These schools are operated by both Afghans and private governments. As one would expect these schools offer a very religious education. This includes the teaching of religion and Quranic Law (Boensen, 1988). Schools run by the Kuwaiti government for example, even offer courses in Arabic. The target audience for these schools
include Afghans who want a religious education. These types of schools are found in many Muslim countries. In Sudan for example, refugees who attend these type of religious institutions are not interested in finding employment nor do they attend vocational institutions (Karadawi, 1987).

To conclude, there is no one set policy for educating Afghan refugees in Pakistan. Up to date there has not been a uniform mandate within the different organisations in developing a uniform curricula. The sections to follow will discuss various issues affecting curriculum development for Afghan refugees.

1.4 Curriculum Development: How is curriculum developed for Afghan refugees?

The definition of curriculum can include everything from subjects to be studied or credits to be granted to learning outcomes or program of study (De Luca, 1994). For the purpose of this study curriculum is defined as the subjects to be studied. For several years now, the Afghan refugees living in Pakistan have received education/training in various subjects, such as English as a second language, mine clearance, skills training in carpet weaving and basic health care. Trying to understand curriculum development for Afghan refugees is not possible without examining the circumstances, which influence its evolution.

Five factors influence curriculum development (De Luca, 1994). They include: geography, history, socio-economic factors, political factors and cultural factors. Despite the obvious challenges faced in explaining curriculum
development for Afghan refugees, I feel it is important because it helps explain key elements of the current education system in Peshawar. It should be kept in mind, however, that this section only reviews some of the basic issues. It is outside the scope of this study to discuss all the issues of curriculum development in Peshawar or elsewhere.

1.4.1 Geography

Pakistan and Afghanistan are both landlocked countries, with high mountains, lowland and desert. There is little rainfall and high evaporation in the lowland areas (Moghadam, 1994). Because Afghanistan is situated in the heart of Asia, it is the meeting place of four cultures: Middle Eastern, Central Asian, Indian and Far Eastern (Jawad, 1992; UNESCO, 1995). From a cultural viewpoint, Afghanistan has one of the most ethnically and linguistically diverse populations. Peshawar, located in Pakistan is one of the closest cities to Afghanistan. It is here where most of the Afghan refugees have settled (Dupree, 1988)

Geography can influence the scope and type of curriculum offered to individuals. For example, in Zimbabwe the lack of infrastructure in roads and communication in rural areas can make education inaccessible to many people (DeLuca, 1994). In many respects, this situation is also similar in Peshawar. In many areas in Peshawar, the long distances and lack of adequate transportation between major cities makes movement between different sectors of the city both costly and time consuming. In the findings from my previous research project, the
participants indicated that travelling to certain refugee camps would take over two hours. The participants disclosed that it was very difficult to recruit teachers to work in refugee camps because they were located very far from Peshawar.

1.4.2 History

Afghanistan is a country rich in different ethnic groups, religions and languages (Allen, 1994). The population consists of twenty-one main ethnic groups (Jawad, 1992; UNESCO, 1995). There is no national ethnic culture. During and after the war, millions of Afghans have been denied any opportunity for an education. The Afghan refugees in Pakistan are a very heterogeneous group in terms of their ethnic background as well as their educational levels. As well, they are very different ethnically and culturally from Pakistanis. This can make the organisation of an education system difficult. For instance, Macharia (1990) claims that an organised system for the education of Ethiopian adult refugees in Somalia was possible for two reasons. First, seventy five percent of the refugee group was ethically and linguistically Somali. Second, the refugees themselves were a homogenous group in regards to their backgrounds and socio-economic levels.

1.4.3 Socio-economic

Socio-economic factors such as high population growth rates can create a great burden on the education system because of the lack of funds available.
Pakistan is considered to be one of the poorest nations in Asia (Rogers, 1992). It is experiencing one of the greatest population growths in the world. The annual population growth rate is between 2.9% and 3.2%, one of the highest between the ten most populated nations of the world. The population today is considered to be over one hundred and ten million. Rogers claims that one reason for this high population growth occurred because of the decrease of epidemic diseases as a result of recent medical innovations used in Pakistan.

In many respects economic problems have placed a great strain on the amount of resources available for the education system of Pakistan for its own people. Although there has been an increase in the literacy rate from 17% in 1971 to 26% in 1981, the illiteracy rate is still one of the highest in the world. Rogers (1992) stresses that:

Owing to Pakistan’s growth rate, the literacy and education objectives of the country will become increasingly difficult to achieve. With an increasing school-age population, the number of children unable to attend school will increase if enrolment fails to keep pace with fertility (p.747).

The Afghan refugees have been both a blessing and a curse to Pakistan. Afghans provide cheap labour for Pakistanis. They will work for wages far below what the average Pakistani is willing to accept (Jawad, 1989). Also, many Pakistanis will hire Afghan workers because they perceive them to be more hardworking and disciplined than Pakistanis (Miller, 1985). This has resulted in local Pakistanis being unemployed. Many government officials have stated that the Afghan refugees have placed a great strain on Pakistani schools, hospitals, lands, water, employment, the economy and other dimensions of refugee asylum.
(Dupree, 1988; Rogers, 1992). For instance, the rate of de-forestation in Pakistan has increased as a result of the Afghan refugees living in camps (Miller). Every refugee, on average, uses four tonnes of firewood. Some business leaders in Peshawar are very angry with the government for allowing Afghans to own their own business. Afghans, because they are not citizens of Pakistan, do not have to pay taxes nor do they require a permit to operate a business (Miller).

Although most of the funding for education/training offered to refugees is from UN organisations and NGOs, Pakistan still has to deal with some of the costs involved with the refugees. The situation has many paradoxes. When many of the working Afghans return to Afghanistan it will in all likelihood cause an economic strain to an already fragile economic situation (Jawad, 1992). Consequently, resistance towards Afghans leaving Pakistan by some Pakistanis is understandable. In this context, Pakistanis will in all likelihood not support any educational/training offered to Afghans if it means that Afghans will return home.

Although the need for assistance is great, funds to educate the refugees are depleting slowly. Reviewing the reports from UNHCR’s literature on its projects in Afghanistan and Pakistan, it is both astounding and appalling to see that many of the projects that were planned for Afghanistan have been discontinued (UNHCR, 1995). Subsidised transportation for aid workers travelling from Peshawar to refugee camps is threatened with suspension due to lack of funds. No new quick impact projects (QIPs) to rehabilitate drinking water systems are under consideration due to lack of funds, while QIPs in sanitation have been
suspended and new health/nutrition projects have not been approved due to funding shortage.

1.4.4 Political Factors

Political changes no matter how small or big influence curriculum. Political factors both in Pakistan and Afghanistan have influenced the education of Afghan refugees. Peshawar, for example, is populated with more Afghans than with Pakistanis. One consequence of this is that residents of this city have had the greatest influence from members of the Taliban government of Afghanistan living in Peshawar. Women, be they Afghan of Pakistani, now cover their heads with a hijab (head scarf), something that was not common in Peshawar until the Taliban took power in Afghanistan. Also, there are many Afghan supporters of the Taliban that are causing a great headache to many aid workers who are offering education/training services to refugees. Because the Taliban have virtually denied education to women in Afghanistan, they have tried to do the same for Afghan women living in Peshawar (Rashid, 1990). This has severely hampered the educational initiatives of many organisations. They have threatened not only women who are attending school, but as well those who try to offer them services.

The role of Pakistani politics has received comparatively little attention in this situation in relation to the Afghan political situation. By many accounts, the Afghan situation may becoming a refugee crisis. According to Rogers (1992), "a refugee crisis is a situation where there is a refugee nation attempting to
establish its authority within a country which is attempting to achieve political legitimacy and development" (p. 758). Countries such as Syria, Jordan and Lebanon have faced similar issues because of the Palestinian refugee population (DeLuca, 1994). A country that is politically unstable is unsafe in the Middle East and Asian region. A conflict can spill over to other nations and cause a great catastrophe in an area that is so politically sensitive to begin with. It is in the best interest of many countries near Pakistan, such as China, India and Iran to have Afghans return home as soon possible. It does not come as a surprise that China recently sent a delegation to Kabul for talks with the Taliban to help find solutions to Afghanistan's political conflicts (CNN, 1999).

1.4.5 Cultural

Even though the cultural differences between Afghans and Pakistanis are great, there have been very few conflicts between the two groups (Dupree, 1988). Pakistan, because it is an Islamic country, has many Islamic traditions embedded in the school system. For example, in most primary, secondary and some institutes of higher education, men and women are taught in separate classrooms. At the same time, many Afghan schools in Pakistan follow the same traditions.

A 1983 Danish refugee Council survey by Boesen (1988) found that amongst Afghans of different backgrounds, there was solidarity and unity. She found for example, more marriages than previous years from families of different
ethnic groups. This growing sense of unity can continue to provide a common goal for many which is to return to their homeland when the time is right.

1.5 Factors which influence participation in Educational Programs

Viewed from the perspective of Afghan refugees, there appears to be three main reasons that influence participation to participate in education/training programs. Particularly significant are cultural, economic and psychological factors.

1.5.1 Cultural Factors

Within the Afghan context, there are various cultural groups, each with different attitudes towards education (Jawad, 1992). Participants from my research project last year believe that Afghans who were educated in Afghanistan want their children to have the same educational opportunities. There are, for example, many Afghans who see the education of their youth as their only hope for survival. It is not uncommon to find parents working at menial jobs in order for their children to attend school. However, there are differing opinions as to the type of education children should participate in. Some parents believe that their children should attend Pakistani schools because they will in all likelihood remain in Pakistan. Others want their children to attend Afghan schools in the hopes that they will return back to Afghanistan someday.

The perceptions and behaviours of some minority groups of Afghans in Peshawar differ considerably from the majority group. Perhaps the most
significant difference between the minority groups is their view towards women and education (Colville, 1995). The principal reason underlying this view is that a women's role as mother and caregiver is considered far more important than that of student or an employee. Traditionally, some families in Afghanistan would not allow women to attend any form of schooling. As one would expect, many of the same families now living as refugees in Peshawar have maintained the same traditions towards the education of their women (Centlivres and Centlivres-Dumont, 1992).

1.5.2 Economic Factors

A 1982 United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) report on Afghan refugees in Pakistan indicates that Afghans in general are self-reliant (Christensen, 1987). Despite the obvious challenges of living in Pakistan, not all Afghans depend on foreign aid for their overall well-being. One conclusion from this report found that in almost all Afghan households one member has found employment in Pakistan. This has been for the primary purpose of supplementing their food income. The corollary here is that many believe that education is important however not at the expense of a household income.

In many instances, Afghans have not had the opportunity to reap the opportunities of education. Many cannot even afford the smallest tuition fees. Others have their children work in order to help support the family. Given the apparent lack of lucrative employment opportunities, Afghans have entered
various fields of occupation, anything that will provide them with some money (Dupree, 1988). Many young adults, for example, who had the opportunity to learn either English or French in Afghanistan work in various UN organisations. These young adults cannot attend any type of schooling, because the ultimate responsibility of providing for their families is on them.

Selman, Coole, Selman and Dampier (1998) contend that adult education can fall into three main clusters: academic, credential and vocational; personal interest and development; social action and social change. The first cluster involves those individuals who are interested in pursuing education for economic reasons. This view accepts that the main purpose of adult education is that it supports the economy. Education/training offered to refugees is an investment made to "fulfil manpower forecasts" (Spencer, 1998, p.43). Participants from my previous research project indicated that it is not uncommon to find one member of a family attending school while the rest of the family supports him/her. It is hoped that when this individual graduates and finds decent employment, then the family will in all likelihood have a higher standard of living. Thus participation in adult education in the case of Afghan refugees is for economical purposes.

1.5.3 Psychological Distress

It is very difficult to get figures on the exact number of Afghan refugees who have psychological problems. Evidence suggests that refugees face many psychological problems including depression and post-traumatic disorder (Chung
and Kagawa-Singer, 1993; Rogge, 1987). A great deal of the stress that refugees encounter in a host country occurs because of acculturation and change (Bernier, 1992). Many Afghan refugees have suffered severe social, economic and physical losses (Dupree, 1988). Unfortunately, refugee aid programs are directed towards meeting immediate needs. Offering mental health services are usually too expensive to be made available for refugees (Kelley, 1992; Muecke, 1992).

The literature on refugee symptomatology indicates that many refugees have paranoid schizophrenia, psychotic reactions and grief reactions (Cohon, 1981). Women in particular suffer from depression (Christensen, 1983). This owing to the lack of freedom many have in their new country. There are many young Afghans who have witnessed the horrors of war. Although to date there is no literature available on Afghan refugees' psychological profiles, it is my belief that whatever psychological problems they have will affect their educational experiences. It is outside the scope of this study to take into consideration how exactly psychological problems affect participation in education programs.

1.6 Post war Development in Afghanistan: The end result of education?

1.6.1 Repatriation

Refugees in places of temporary asylum face three scenarios: voluntary repatriation, local settlement and third country settlement (Stein, 1981). Despite
the obvious challenges of repatriation, a coherent strategy is in place to repatriate Afghan refugees (Sinclair, 1990; UN, 1996).

Repatriation occurs when refugees return back to their country of origin (De Carlo and Hamilton, 1994). The right to return to one's own country is clearly stated in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and is codified in the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. It states that "no one shall be arbitrarily deprived of the right to enter his own country" (UNHCR, 1995). In the last two years over ten million refugees worldwide have returned home (UNHCR, 1998). After the signing of the Dayton peace accord, over 250,000 Bosnians returned home. In the second half of 1996, approximately 720,000 Rwandese refugees were repatriated from eastern Zaire. These examples were selected in order to emphasise that in many refugee situations there has been a shift away from resettlement towards repatriation. In many regions in Afghanistan some form of peace and stability has been established. Although there is conflict and violence in other areas, those who wish to repatriate to the peaceful areas are able to do so (UNHCR, 1995).

Nearly four million Afghan refugees have returned home (UNHCR, 1998) even though most of the country is not politically stable. The irony here is that within the Afghan context, many refugees in Pakistan want to return home but they do not want to return to a country that is in complete ruins (Breen, 1998). Viewed from the perspective of Afghans who oppose the current government in Afghanistan, it is understandable why they do not want to return.
It is in some cases more beneficial for the refugee to leave than to remain in another country (Stein, 1981). Many Nicaraguan refugees repatriated from Honduras before the contra war was over because they felt their needs were not being met in the refugee camps (UNHCR, 1998). Another case in point: the repatriation of Salvadoran refugees from Honduras. They went home because they believed that the moment had come when, as organised communities in El Salvador, they could contribute to the political struggle against the government and military in their home country (UNHCR).

1.6.2 Post-war development

I believe an understanding of the consequences of education and post-war development is necessary in order to understand the goals of some educational organisations for Afghan refugees. It my belief that education in the post-war context is an important factor in political, social and economical development.

Post-war development in Afghanistan can only occur with the proper manipulation of human, capital and natural resources combined (Moghdam, 1994). Broadly stated, the term development has been widely used to describe the process through which individuals, societies and entire civilisations change the way they use natural, capital and human resources. I understand development as changes in the economic, political and social systems of a country for the sake of rendering these more productive. More
significant here, I believe, is the view of human development. Griffen and Khan (1992) believe that:

The ultimate purpose of development is to expand the capabilities of people, to increase their ability to lead long and healthy lives and to enable them an opportunity to live in dignity and with self respect (p.1).

Afghans, for the most part, have had access to schooling, health care, electricity, jobs and security in Pakistan. It is my belief that they should have the same opportunities when they return home.

The most important factors shaping the role of education in Afghan society are its political structures; the type of government, the ideology of the ruling elite, and their access to resources. The Taliban have control of over eighty percent of Afghanistan. They have strict authority over the type of educational programs offered to the Afghan people. Although the media would like us to believe that the situation in Afghanistan is bleak, the transition from war to peace is slowly changing the political situation. Until recently, the Taliban denied women access to higher education. The passage of time has slightly changed this. The Taliban have now allowed women to have formal training in the fields of medicine and health care (Norwegian Project Organization, 1998). While many have viewed this as minimal involvement of women in society, the change has been remarkable in Afghan society.

There needs to be a proper allocation of monetary resources towards developing an education system, one that is non existent now. Afghanistan's’
leaders must focus on three factors in order to develop the education system: the accessibility and strength of basic education, the enhancing of the learning environment and the strengthening of communication between partners (Hallak and Fagerlind, 1991). Basic education involves "the essential learning needs by all members of society in order to make human development possible" (Allen, 1994, p.1). Basic education must not only include essential learning tools, such as basic literacy in reading, writing and math, but also basic learning content in the knowledge and skills necessary for individuals to develop to their fullest potential. Enhancing the learning environment must allow for both men and women, orphans, the handicapped, ethnic minorities and urban and rural dwellers the chance to benefit from educational opportunities be it technical/vocal, primary, secondary and higher education. Increasing communication between partners allows for increased interaction between different partners, such as the Ministry of Health, Education, Agriculture and local NGO's and other organisation involved in the development of the country. In sum the Taliban politics is the strongest factor that will influence the scope, content and type of education offered to the Afghan people.

Economic development in Afghanistan, as it stands now, is very improvised. Most economic activity currently taking place in Afghanistan is trade within individuals with items such as food, carpets and other goods. There is also a growing trend in Afghanistan of growing poppy seeds for opium and then selling the products to countries in Europe. Economic development in Afghanistan must exploit the agricultural land for fruits, vegetables and grains.
There is a need for a strategic framework to rebuild the economic infrastructure. Ideally returnees should settle in areas where there is the most devastation and where there is a great need for human resources to help rebuild. In order for this to occur citizens must be educated in skills and techniques that will enable them to rebuild. These types of vocational skills will benefit the refugees when they return home by providing them with income generating activities. Khan (1995) stresses the importance of refugees having the means, support and opportunity to become self-reliant through income generating skills. In fact, it might be argued that the development of the economy is very important in order to ensure that the refugees that do repatriate will be able to lead productive lives, thus possibly ensuring their stay.

There is undoubtedly a relationship between social/cultural development and education, the most important link being the role of education in promoting the growth of civil society that enables more people to play an active role in society. Most Afghans who have lived through the war have had limited if no educational opportunities (Damato, 1991). The illiteracy rate in Afghanistan is one of the highest in the world. Literacy skills will allow for better communication amongst people, which in turn will lead to their development as individuals. Peace-building strategies and conflict resolution must be incorporated into the curriculum in order to promote mutual respect and understanding between different ethnic groups in the country (Sensenig, 1997). Different ethnic groups need to work with one another if they want their country to transform. Despite the difficulties of such a task, if development is to occur, attitudes of all parties must
change. In all likelihood development activities will be hindered unless ethnic and religious differences are not addressed.

The more educated Afghans will become, the more likely they are to take interest in affairs that affect their lives, to organise and promote these interests and to think critically so as to make informed decisions. This in turn, may lead to development in education. In short, the civil society, political scientists so often talk about as crucial to the growth of democracy and everything good, is much dependent upon education, and education, conversely, may be its beneficiary.

Many educators believe that one of the biggest dilemmas facing the education system of Afghanistan is the fact that when Afghan refugees return home, they will have all been exposed to a multiple of educational institutions (Gouttierre, 1989). What type of standards will be employed to compare the different standards of education refugees have been exposed to? Will there be equivalency programs? Who will be responsible for rebuilding the educational infrastructure? Afghan returnees? Or Afghans living in Afghanistan?

1.7 A framework for understanding refugee behaviour

This section reviews literature on refugee theory in relation to education. The basic premise by which I wish to approach this chapter is that refugee experience produces refugee behaviour (Kunz, 1973). The theoretical framework I wish to approach this thesis is best stated by Stein (1986):
Refugee problems should be analysed from a general, historical, and comparative perspective that view them as recurring phenomena with identifiable and often identical patterns of behaviour and set of causalities. Specific refugee situations should not be treated as unique, atypical, individual historical events but rather as part of a general subject; refugee behaviour, problems, and situations that recur in many contexts, times and regions (p. 378).

1.7.1 Refugee Theory

The challenge to this study is to deliver research on refugee education while respecting the components of refugee theory. The problem is that refugee research does not fit into a theoretical structure (Stein, 1986). Nor does a systematic body of data exist on refugee theory. Kunz (1973) maintains that it is only through a systematic analysis of recurrent patterns of refugee behaviour that we can understand the 'refugee phenomena'. On the other side, in many instances, researchers attempting to study refugee phenomena fail to review existing studies on refugees (Stein, 1986). While this may be true, David (1969) points out that many researchers and specialists do not take the needed time to reflect their experiences in order for others to benefit from them. In the absence of theoretical studies on refugee education, I will use a comparative approach in reviewing general trends and patterns of various refugee experiences. I will attempt to generalise these findings to refugee education. The five areas I will focus on in establishing a theoretical framework are: refugee state, refugee social identification category, refugee settlement and refugee education.
1.7.2 Refugee State

Kunz (1973) developed a kinetic model of refugees in flight. His theory of refugee movement places refugees into three distinct groups: anticipatory, acute and intermediate refugee. Acute refugee movements occur when there are political changes or movements of armies. Refugees in this case have not planned for their departure (Stein, 1986). Afghans are considered to be part of acute refugee movements. Within acute refugee movements, refugees can be either in the push-pressure-plunge state, push-pressure-stay state or push-pressure-return state. In a push-pressure-plunge state a refugee has lost all hope of ever returning home or living in a temporary location. A refugee in this state wants to leave and go abroad. In the push-pressure-stay state the refugee has given up the dream of ever returning home and wishes to remain in the country they are in. Lastly, in the push-pressure-return state the refugee wants to return home. The kinetic factor of 'push' comes as a result of refugees' perceptions of being forced to move out of their current settlement choice. The kinetic factor of pressure, Stein argues, occurs because..." the country of asylum and the international aid agencies try to force the refugee to make a choice" (p. 9). Kunz argues that these kinetic states can serve as predictive possibilities on refugee behaviour that affects all aspects of life from family to work to education. In fact Stein (1979) in studying Vietnamese refugees has used Kunz's kinetic model and has found it to be accurate to explain refugee behaviour.

I will discuss one of the findings of a study by Woolridge, Stewart, Pathak and Matusse (1990) to explain the predictive possibilities of the kinetic states
proposed by Kunz (1973). Woolridge et al. in a study exploring Swaziland refugee educational experiences in Mozambique, found that vocational classes for adults were poorly attended. The Swaziland government was not in a position to allow refugees to become integrated into their country. The refugees never had a chance of becoming a permanent resident in Mozambique nor would they have the opportunity to go abroad. Thus their only hope was to return home.

Woolridge et al. found that refugees were more concerned with finding immediate employment than in participating in educational programs that in the long run may help them find employment opportunities. Many of the classes offered to refugees would allow them to learn skills for income generating projects. However it is important to point out, attending classes was a time consuming process. These refugees, it appears, were in the push-pressure-return state. Because of this, they were not interested in making long term commitments. Rather, finding quick employment opportunities made more sense to meet their immediate needs.

In the preliminary study of Afghan refugees living in Montreal referred to earlier, I found that in the late eighties Afghans living in Peshawar had no hopes of either staying in Pakistan or going back to Afghanistan. At this time many countries such as Canada, Germany and the United States were allowing refugees into their countries for permanent settlement. The majority of refugees were on waiting lists to be sent abroad. Thus, it appears, that many of the refugees were in the push-pull-plunge state. Of the three Afghans interviewed in the preliminary study of this thesis, two had a college degree and one had a high
school degree. The study found that many refugees gave up on formal schooling in order to attend language classes in either English, French or German depending on their choice of country for permanent settlement. The refugees need for language classes was greater than the need for formal or vocational education.

1.7.3 Social Identification Categories

Regardless of the factors that result in a refugee leaving his home, a refugee falls into three social identification categories (Kunz, 1973). The majority-identified group of refugees identifies with their homeland but not with its local government. The second group, the events-alienated group, want to be recognised by their nation, yet because of either religious or ethnic background they are rejected. Lastly, the self-alienated persons have no desire to identify with their homeland. Thus it is only natural that refugees who are part of the first two groups will most likely want to repatriate. In fact, the Afghans who I interviewed last year, felt that individuals who were part of Afghanistan's ethnic minority groups were interested in going home so long as the new government would not try to force them out. Also participants indicated that Afghans who belonged to the last group would never attempt to go back because they no longer held any ties with their country.

In an examination of past refugee movements, Kunz (1973) has made some predictive hypotheses on the behaviours of the refugees that fall into these categories. First, refugees who are part of the events-alienated group will adjust
to life more quickly in a host country. Second, majority-identified groups will form politically oriented associations making them dissociated with the host society.

1.7.4 Refugee Settlement

Not all refugees will settle in camps (Conner, 1989; Dupree, 1998). The experiences and behaviours of refugees who settle in camps versus those who settle in urban areas is very different. Conner (1989) stresses that the main difference between these two groups is that the latter becomes part of the host community while the former remains part of their own community. Further, refugees that have become part of the host community have by and large usually found some type of employment. Therefore many are less likely to repatriate if they feel certain that they will not gain the same employment opportunities at home. Unfortunately there is little documentation available on self-settled refugees because host countries do not have the means to document their settlement experience.

Where a refugee chooses to settle is related to his or her ethnicity, educational level, geographic origin, political involvement and type of employment (Conner, 1989). The premise here is that these characteristics will affect the choice of settlement area. Stepick and Portes (1986), for example, found that members of the same ethnic group will most likely stay within the same geographic area. In numerous instances people from the same village will stay in close geographical proximity in a host country. Refugees who for example find well paying jobs will move away from their group to more affluent and prestigious
areas. It is usually members who belong to this group who plan on remaining in the host country.

Conner (1989) studied residential choices of Afghan refugees in Peshawar. He found that refugees settled together based in part on geographic origin, ethnographic ties and extent of political involvement. In Peshawar especially, "the political orientation of refugees is an important factor in their behaviour" (p. 927). The influence of education and employment on residential choice was not found. This being said, the residential choices of Afghan refugees will provide some insight into their behaviour patterns. Afghans living in affluent areas like Hyatabad will most likely not have plans of returning home (Conner). On the other hand, those living in poorer parts of Peshawar such as Bord probably may have no intention on staying in Pakistan. Therefore the nature and demand for education will depend on refugees' long-term settlement expectations (Preston, 1991a).

1.7.5 Refugee Psychology

Considerable research has been conducted on refugee mental health (Bernier, 1992; Ching and Singer, 1993; Cohon, 1981). Not only do refugees face tremendous stress during their escape from their homeland, but also Stein (1986) claims that the greatest amount of stress on refugees is the hardships they face during resettlement. These difficulties range from loss of status to language difficulties to identity confusion. For example, a great deal of stress is
faced by my many camp residents adapting to camp staff in refugee camps (Bernier).

During the initial stages of adjustment, many refugees have come to grips with what has been lost (Stein, 1981). Many realise their loss of social status at this stage. Also at this time, there will be many family problems, namely that the husband cannot provide for his family. Even now, at this difficult stage, the refugees entertain hopes of returning home.

The next stage occurs one to two years after the initial flight. During this stage, many refugees take control of rebuilding their lives, in essence trying to establish what they have lost (Stein, 1981). This usually occurs as a result of the refugee becoming more accustomed to living in a new environment. Although the refugee still endures a tremendous amount of stress, it is much less than what was apparent in the initial stages.

After four or five years, the refugees live in a 'routine' (Stein, 1981). During this stage, very few changes occur. Refugees in this stage accept their living circumstances (Stein, 1986). Relatively few studies have addressed the question of refugees mental health during this period. Stein found that problems associated with trauma that did not manifest themselves during the first two stages many appear now.

In the last stage, after ten years or so, refugees will experience a certain level of stability (Stein, 1981). The stress has become less. In the end, the greatest problems refugees face is the possibility of another loss of status.
(Bernier, 1992). Many will not likely want to disrupt their sense of stability for the fear of the unknown.

Afghan refugees, depending on when they left, are in various stages of adjustment. There is a constant flow of refugee in and out of Afghanistan. To date, there is not data available on the exact numbers of refugees that could be grouped in the different stages mentioned above.

1.8 Research in Refugee Education

Stein (1986) claims that there is a general lack of interest from researchers to pursue issues in refugee education. Stein suggests that this occurs because: "refugee research does not fit neatly into disciplinary categories" (p. 6). For the most part, the research that is available on refugee education focuses on humanitarian sympathy to refugees and questions their right to an education (Preston, 1991a).

A literature review of this topic suggests that refugee education falls into two categories. Refugee education in places of permanent settlement and refugee education in places of temporary settlement (Preston, 1991a). There are numerous studies (Baizerman and Handricks, 1987; Bui, Caplan and Whitmore, 1985; Habte-Mariam, 1989; McDonald, 1992) that offer insight to the former. This type of research examines what factors contribute to a refugees' successful integration into their new country. Missing from the literature are studies of refugee education in places of temporary settlement (Preston).
The aims of refugee education in places of temporary asylum can include teaching refugees skills to rebuild their home when they return, aid them integrate into their new home, or prepare them for settlement in a third country. Host governments and NGO's fear that the outcomes of research projects in this area may affect their funding and may cause adverse publicity (Preston, 1991a; Stein, 1986).

It should be kept in mind that education offered to refugees who settle in Western countries is aimed at integrating them into the host community (Inquai, 1990; McDonald, 1990). Western countries take the responsibility, when they accept these refugees in their country, to provide for and support these refugees. Unfortunately, when refugees settle in countries of the third world, host countries do not have the proper resources to assist these refugees (Inquai). Countries of the third world are too poor to offer educational opportunities for them. Therefore, integrating refugees into their country is not a feasible option. Inquai argues that: "the pattern of settlement and the prevailing wish of refugees to maintain their own national identity means organising separate education provision" (p. 38).

One problem in researching education in places of temporary asylum is the lack of infrastructure in many educational institutions. Dodds (1988), for example, attempted to research the South-West Africa's People's Organization (SWAPO). This organisation aimed to provide education for Namibian refugees. The education program was created with the help of NGO's. Its aim was to teach Namibians the skills needed to rebuild their country upon their return. The methodology used was to give intensive crash courses to selected Namibian
refugees or to send certain refugees abroad for intensive training. After training they would be responsible for teaching the skills to the rest of the refugees. However, the major problems encountered in this study, due to lack of organisation of settlement supervisors, was that there were no sustained progress reports to evaluate the study.

To conclude, the ability to evaluate refugee education program in places of temporary asylum is largely determined by the infrastructure of the whole institution, which unfortunately is totally out of the researchers' hands. This study highlights the fact that a proper organizational infrastructure may be necessary if one is to allow researchers to properly evaluate or explore educational programs.

1.8.1 Review of Research

Macharia (1990) studied the education of adult refugees in Somalia. These refugees are mostly of Ethiopian background. Because there is no hope for repatriation, education offered by UNHCR was aimed at helping these refugees settle into rural settlements. Thus education needed to be directed towards teaching the refugees basic skills in areas of health, agriculture and management of small scale businesses. A needs assessment was conducted in order to match a refugee with the specific type of educational program that they desired. Surprisingly, the results indicated that over ninety percent of the individuals were illiterate. New programs needed to be implemented that would incorporate literacy as well as training skills necessary to rebuild in rural settlements. The lessons learned here is that before devising programs for
refugees, it is important that a needs assessment be conducted in order to ensure that the program will meet refugee needs.

The ultimate aim of refugee education in places of temporary asylum in general, is aimed at providing refugees with skills that will ameliorate their lives and empower them to make decisions. Wooldrige et al. (1990) studied adult education of Mozambican refugees in Swaziland. Similar to the Afghans, the Mozambicans cannot integrate into Swaziland due to the country's own economic woes. However, unlike the Afghans the Mozambican political situation will in all likelihood cause the refugees to become a permanent fixture in Swaziland. The solution was to provide education that would aid refugees in working in their refugee settlement. Mozambicans' short-term goal was to find employment, even if they had to go far away from the camps. Although there was a general interest to attend schooling that is provided in the camps, few attended because they felt that the educational programs did not meet their immediate needs. The lessons learned from this refugee study is that any type of education program offered, although in good intention must be congruent with the needs of the population it wishes to serve.

Abu-Habib (1996) writes that Palestinian refugees living in Jordan, Syria, and Lebanon have received aid from the United Nations Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA). Prior to 1985, UNRWA provided Palestinian children with primary education. What is interesting in the case of the Palestinian refugees is that in Jordan and Syria they have basically some of the same rights compared to citizens of that country. This means that they have been allowed the
opportunity to attend schools and universities. In Lebanon, they have been granted temporary refugee status. Palestinian refugees in Lebanon have no sense of security that they will remain in Lebanon (UNHCR, 1995). Only a few refugees can afford to attend Lebanese schools. Yet, even those who are lucky enough to graduate face a grim future. In recent years, many Palestinian doctors were no longer allowed to work because of employment regulations imposed by the Lebanese government (Abu-Habib). In fact, over forty percent of refugees are unemployed (Hansen, 1998). UNRWA has attempted to offer some educational or vocational training to these refugees (Abu-Habib). Yet the demand has been so high, the needs of only a few refugees are met. There is growing concern as to what will become of these refugees considering the peace negotiations have, as of yet, not established enough initiative for them to return home. In places of temporary asylum the political situation of the refugees' home will influence their 'stay' in their host country as is demonstrated in this case.

Sinclair (1990) found that some Afghan refugees living in Pakistan did not support education that was not religious in nature. In fact some institutes of higher education found in difficult to attract any Afghan students to their centres. Realising all this, many organisers opted to have adult vocational training centres. It was believed that income-earning skills for adults did not go against the religious beliefs.

Respecting religious and cultural beliefs is extremely important when educators and administrators devise programs. Recently, the Norwegian Project Organisation (NPO), found that many Afghan women in rural parts of Afghanistan
were dying in child birth (NPO, 1988). They decided to bring some Afghan women from Afghanistan to Peshawar for training in midwifery. Because many of these women are not allowed to travel alone, the NPO paid their husbands salaries in order for them to take time off from their employment in order to come and stay with their wives in Peshawar for the duration of the training.
CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

2.1 Introduction to Qualitative Research

This thesis has thus far discussed the relevant issues of Afghan refugees' education by examining the historical perspectives of the education system in Afghanistan. The theoretical framework for which to base the research has been formulated by synthesising the pertinent literature on refugee theory and refugee education. Refugee theory offers some useful insights to understanding refugee education in places of temporary asylum. The theoretical analysis can provide predictive possibilities of the Afghan refugees' educational experience in Peshawar.

The purpose of this research project is not to explain and predict phenomena, but rather to describe it. Research in exploring the educational experiences of individuals is not possible with a manipulation of variables or statistical analysis. Quantitative research involves ...

performed hypothesis to be tested, isolation of relevant variables, control for extraneous variables, collection of standardised data, and analysis of data in such a way that the original hypothesis can be supported or not, and then state conclusions related to generalizability (Leedy, 1997, p. 5)

When pursuing research in refugee education, it is extremely rare that a researcher knows the exact variables under study before hand (Carter, 1988). Also, quantitative research focuses on testing theories. An accepted theory of refugee education in places of temporary asylum is non-existent.

There are for example, some cultural groups who distrust data collectors who search for numbers by using surveys or questionnaires. In fact, Dupree
(1988) notes that in a 1984 study by the Centres for Disease Control Survey, many Afghans were very untrusting of these types of data collection methods.

I am not arguing here that quantitative research can never be employed in studying refugees. In fact, there have been some very interesting studies using quantitative methods in refugee research. For example, Espino (1991) in studying refugee school children's exposure to violence in stress, used quantitative research methodology. In sum, I believe quantitative research can be used to study refugee experiences when the aim of the research is to explain and predict, to confirm and validate and to test theory (Leedy, 1991).

This research focuses on Afghan refugees' educational experiences in places of temporary asylum. Gall, Borg and Gall (1996) assert that qualitative research focuses on specific instances of phenomena. Leedy (1991) argues that qualitative research should be employed when the researcher perceives that these are multiple constructed realities, the research question is exploratory in nature and the available literature is limited or missing. The experiences of Afghan refugees in Pakistan fit the specifications of qualitative research.

2.2 Relevant Qualitative Methods of this Study: The Case Study Method

Many qualitative researchers use the case study method as the main approach for their research (Gall et al. 1996; McMillan and Schumacher, 1997). Eisner (1991) states that the case study method should be used when the research is unique, when the boundaries of the phenomena are not known and when the research is exploratory in nature. The purpose of a case study, Eisner
contends, is to provide explanations for the phenomena. This study does this by attempting to examine refugee theory and refugee education by exploring the experiences of Afghan refugees in Pakistan.

It is important to point out that this study was conducted in a developing country. Research in developing countries is affected by many variables, all of which cannot be discussed in this study. What I wish to focus on is that a great deal of research has not been conducted in developing countries because of the lack of interest on the part of researchers (Crossley and Vulliamy, 1997). Preston (1991b) writes that "the development of high level research and related capacities to increase the independence of low income countries is not yet in the interest of those who control world finance" (p.59). More importantly, local researchers in developing countries are not always considered to be on the same level as researchers in developed countries. This may explain why most of the research conducted in developing counties is done by people in developed countries (Kai-ming, 1991).

Research examining Afghan refugees has for the most part focused on very discrete variables such as employment, family income, health awareness and settlement patterns (Conner, 1989; Dupree, 1988). The general methodological approach towards studying Afghan refugees' experiences as well as many other refugee experiences in places of temporary asylum has been the case study method.

Hansen (1982) in a study to examine Angolan refugees in Zambia, used case study methods to explore refugee dynamics. Conner (1989) while studying
refugee settlement patterns of Afghans in Peshawar also employed the case-study method. As well, Carter (1988) in studying the educational dynamics of Afghan refugees in Peshawar also used the case study method. These examples are sources that I have used in order to form a framework for the methodology of this thesis. This research study was conducted using a case study methodology.

Data sources that can be used in case studies include: 1) interviews, 2) documents and 3) observations. In this study all three were employed. In this research project the type of case study was exploratory. Lynn (1991) believes this type of case study should be used when "considerable uncertainty exists about program operations, goals and results" (p.1). A brief review of the methodology and why they were chosen in this study will be discussed in the following paragraphs.

2.2.1 Interviews

Vockell and Asher (1983) argue that "the general approach of the qualitative interview is nondirective and Rogerian in style" (p.199). They further argue that the purpose of this type of interview is to gather data information that the researcher cannot predict an answer for. Interviews are especially useful when used with a combination of other data collection techniques such as observation and document analysis (Bogdan and Bilken, 1998).
2.2.2 Observations

Observation in qualitative research involves "the systematic noting and recording of events, behaviours and artefacts (objects) in the social setting chosen for the study" (Marshsall and Rossman, 1999, p.107). When the researcher does not know the exact behaviours he or she wishes to observe, then, Vockell and Asher (1983) propose the open-ended observation. When researchers conduct this kind of observation they are exploring the social interactions in the classroom without discussing the interactions with the participants afterwards. Patton (1990) believes observation can allow the researcher to view events that the participant is not fully aware of or may be unwilling to discuss.

2.2.3 Documentation

Using documents such as newspapers for example in this type of research allows the researcher to become familiar with the cultural and political situation of the area before the conducting the fieldwork (Harber, 1991). Lincoln and Guba (1985) contend that newspapers are official records.

2.3 Validity and Reliability of Ethnographic Research

2.3.1 Reliability

External reliability refers to the extent to which researchers working in the "same or similar context would obtain consistent results" (Wiersma, 1995, p.273). The political and economic situation in Peshawar is constantly changing.
The observations made by earlier research may not necessarily be true today. The challenges imposed on researchers to accurately reconstruct a situation is virtually impossible in the context of this research project. Ethnographic researchers can enhance external reliability by paying close attention to research status position, informant choices, social situation and conditions, premises and the methods used to collect data (Goetz and LeCompte, 1984).

Internal reliability in ethnographic research is .." the extent to which researchers concerned with the same data and constructs would be consistent in matching them" (Wiersma, 1995, p. 273). One way in which to increase internal reliability is through a process called triangulation (Bodgan and Bilken, 1998). Triangulation refers to the to use of more than one data source for data collection.

2.3.2 Validity

In ethnographic research validity refers to the extent to which the results can be generalised to other situations (Wiersma, 1995). Goetz and LeCompte (1984) contend that validity .." subsumes the problem of whether conceptual categories understood to have mutual meanings between the participants and the observer are actually shared" (p. 222). Internal validity in ethnographic research is enhanced when the research is conducted in a natural setting. External validity in this type of research refers to what extent the results can be generalised to other populations (Wiersma, 1995). External validity can be of a general type. General type, as defined by Polkinghorne (1991) are
generalisations that something is true for every member of the population under study. This is based on assertoric argumentation which Wiersma states is .."accepting a full range of rationality", (p. 275). Thus setting, history and construct effects will influence external validity (Goetz and LeCompte, 1984).

2.4 Pre-Field Work

2.4.1 Ethics

In any research project the researcher must be sensitive to ethical principles before, during and after the research project (McMillan and Schumacher, 1997). In this research project ethical guidelines from the American Psychological Association were for the most part followed. However, due the fact that this research was conducted with refugees in the developing world some minor adjustments were made. Many individuals who live in politically unstable areas are weary and untrustworthy of researchers. Conner (1989) in researching Afghan refugees found this to be the case. Therefore, in this study participants were asked to either sign a consent form or verbally consent to the research (See Appendix, A). Reiss (1979) argues that consent may serve to reduce participation. In this case, I believe that had participants been required to sign a consent form they would not have participated in this research project.

Before the actual fieldwork for this research, the Ethics Committee at the Department of Education at Concordia University reviewed and accepted the research methodology. After the field work, participants were given a debriefing form (see Appendix, B) in order that they could contact me if they had any
questions after the interview. In order to respect the ethical guidelines of the project, participants' names have been altered to respect confidentiality and anonymity.

2.4.2 Entering the Field

I initially contacted Mrs. Nancy Dupree, head of the Agency Coordination Body for Afghanistan (ACBAR). I found Mrs. Dupree's email address though a family friend living in Peshawar. It was through Ms. Nancy Dupree that I found Ms. Dara, head of the Afghan Woman's Network. I sent her a letter explaining my research proposal. I felt that the intended purpose of the research needed to be explained. Bogdan (1972) states that a good rule to follow when gaining permission to enter an organisation is to be truthful. After reading through my proposal letter explaining my intended research project, Ms. Dara suggested that I could come to Peshawar to interview women who belonged to the Afghan Womens' Association about their educational experiences in Peshawar. As well she informed me that if I would be interested, once I arrived in Peshawar, I could interview teachers and administrators of education/vocational institutions.

One week prior to my departure to Peshawar, Ms. Dara informed me that she had a list of men, women and children who could also participate in this study. All of these individuals, she stated, were directly involved in various areas of the education field. She stated that she had contacted all of these individuals and that they were very eager to participate in this study. As well, she gave me
the contact names of various schools and vocational training centres that I could contact once I arrived there.

The original letter that I had sent to Ms. Dara explicitly stated that the research project was intended for partial fulfilment of a masters thesis. Participants were informed that they could receive a copy of the thesis once it was finished. I strongly believe that this is one reason why participants were inclined in taking part in this project. In fact, Goetz and LeCompte (1984) state that "contact is facilitated when participants and respondents view the researcher's purposes as valuable or, at least, as harmless" (p. 89). As well, Punch (1989) notes that the nature of the research project can determine the access the researcher will have in the field. The fact that the results obtained in this thesis would never be reported to any organisation, other than an educational institution, is the main reason why I believe that individuals were interested in participating in this project.

Goetz and LeCompte (1984) state that social situations and conditions must be described in order for another researcher to understand the dynamics of the situation. Prior to leaving for Pakistan, the government of Nawaz Shariff was overthrown. The political situation in October was extremely sensitive. There was no guarantee on what to expect in terms of interviewing participants once I arrived in Peshawar this partially owing to the political instability. Many Afghans at this time were unsure of the intentions of the new government towards them. At the same time though, my belief is that the general attitude towards the new government was positive. This is understandable because many felt that the
former prime-minister was corrupt. Another researcher attempting to conduct a similar study may or may not encounter a similar research environment. Therefore there is a threat here to external reliability because another researcher working in a different time frame may or may not encounter the same findings.

2.4.3 Participants

This desired target population for this research project was Afghans either enrolled in educational/training programs and/or Afghan teachers, students or administrators working in educational/training programs. The accessible sample for this research was Afghan men, women and children participating in madrassas, Afghan/Pakistani schools and NGO education/vocation centres. Of these, one woman between the age of 18-45 was enrolled in a madrassa; one female between the age of 18-22 was enrolled in an Afghani school; one hundred and twenty female children were enrolled in an Afghani elementary school at a refugee camp; two female Afghani school teachers participated in this project; six females administrators and three male administrators working in educational and training centres also participated and finally one female principal of a madrassa also participated.

Participants provided maximum variation sampling because they represented a heterogeneous group in terms of age, religion, marital status, education and work experience. While this may be considered a weakness, the scope of this research project was not to look at these variables and somehow relate this to education. Patton (1990) contends that:
The maximum variation sampling strategy turns that apparent weakness into a strength by applying the following logic: Any common patterns that emerge from great variation are of particular interest and value in capturing the core experiences and central, shared aspects of impacts of a program (p. 172).

In examining the threat of external validity, Goetz and Lecompte (1984) note that ..."it depends on the identification and description of those characteristics of phenomena salient for comparison " (p.229). The main selection effects this project was concerned with rests with that of individuals and their experiences with different educational environments.

All the participants in this research project were either directly or indirectly involved in the education system. Goetz and LeCompte (1984) note that..."key informants are individuals who possess special knowledge, status, or communicative skills and who are willing to share that knowledge or that skill with the researcher" (p. 119). The participants in this study were chosen because they all could provide insight to the educational experiences of Afghan refugees.

It is not necessary, I believe, to describe each participant’s individual characteristics. The personal dimensions that I felt necessary to describe is their role in the educational system (see Appendix, C). The threat to reliability in not explaining in detail all informants characteristics is , I believe, low.

Lastly, because of the limited time frame of this research design, sample size is small. Because this was not an experimental study the sample size did not have to be large in order to place more confidence on the results. Lincoln and Guba (1985) state the following about sample size:
In purposeful sampling size of the sample is determined by informational considerations. If the purpose is to maximise information, the sampling is terminated when no new information is forthcoming from new sampled units; thus redundancy is the primary criterion (p.202).

As well, Myers (1998) believes that small samples sizes are more useful when examining a phenomenon from various perspectives as is the case for this study.

2.5 Procedure

Once in Peshawar, initial contact with participants was made by phone. I introduced myself and the purpose of my research project in English. During the first few conversations, participants informed me that they were not interested in participating in this project. I was very confused. When I decided to speak in Farsi, however, participants changed their original response. They would gladly participate in the interview. This happened many times before I finally decided to speak in Farsi at the beginning of all phone conversations with participants.

Conner (1989) and Dupree (1988) discovered that Afghans, particularly in Peshawar, are somewhat distrustful of researchers. This may explain the initial reactions that I received when I spoke in English.

The interview protocol was formed prior to the actual interview. Questions were reviewed by Dr. Flouran Wali and Rameen Moshref, researchers familiar with the Afghan refugees in Peshawar and with the scope of this project.

McMillan and Schumacher (1997) argue that prior to the interview a pre-test should be conducted to test the accuracy of the interview. This was not feasible with the limited time frame of this study in Peshawar. Therefore I felt that by allowing Dr. Floran and Mr. Moshref to review the interview questions, I would identify any problems in the interview protocol. As a result of their participation,
some weaknesses were identified and those questions that were deemed inappropriate were either altered or removed from the interview. For instance, the question asking participants their exact age and marital status were removed because it may have offended some of the participants.

As well, prior to interviewing the participants, a bogus interview was conducted with an Afghan living in Montreal. Tuckman (1994) believes that an interviewer must have the opportunity to conduct practice interviews before conducting the 'real' interviews. This bogus interview allowed me to have some interview experience prior to leaving for Peshawar.

In order to decide on an interview format (structured, semi-structured or unstructured), I felt it was necessary to refer to past research methodologies exploring refugee experience. Bodgan and Bilken (1998) argue that in qualitative studies repeatedly asking the same question to interviewees serves no real purpose. Further because this study relied on experiences of refugees, the standardised interview may have limited the candidates and naturalness of responses. Conner (1989) and Carter (1988) found that the most effective method to interview Afghans was to have in informal manner using an interview guide. I thus felt that the interview approach whereby topics would be outlined in advance would be the most appropriate. The topics covered were based the on the categories described by Patton (1980) for interviews. This included: experience and behaviour questions, opinion and value questions, feeling questions, knowledge questions and demographic questions (see Appendix, D).
After the initial phone contact, interview times were set up. I could not control the areas where the interviews were conducted. The conditions in terms of time of day and settings could not be controlled and thus differed for all participants. This may have caused some threats to internal reliability.

2.5.1 Role of the Researcher

The role of the researcher in this project was that of a visitor. Flick (1998) defines the visitor's role as one who visits the field only once for a single interview. Because of the limited time frame more than one interview could not be set up. Strauss and Corbin (1990) argue that a researcher must be theoretically sensitive to the research. This means having an insight and understanding of the phenomena under study. They believe that theoretical sensitivity can come from a number of sources such as professional and personal experience. My Afghan-Canadian background and my experiences as an educational research assistant has given me a solid foundation by which to define my role as a researcher in this project. Davies (1997) contends that building trust is essential in order to obtain good interview results. In this research, I took this to mean that the researcher should be sensitive to the cultural, religious and language characteristics of the interviewees.

All Afghan women cover their head with a head scarf and dress with a long coat and loose pants. Ms. Dara informed me that if I wore clothes that were considered too 'Western' I might attract unwarranted attention from the interviewees. Further she felt that if I wore Western type clothing, some
interviewees, especially those in refugee camps may react in a hostile manner towards me or ask for money. Prior to the interviewing stage, I acquired clothes in Peshawar that were similar to what most women wore.

Even though I look Afghan, speak Farsi, and am aware of the cultural traditions of Afghans, I have never lived in Afghanistan. I was considered by Afghans in Peshawar as a 'visiting Afghan'. They considered me to be 'one of them'. However they were well aware that I grew up in Canada and therefore had different attitudes and perceptions than they held. Davies (1997) argues that:

the role of ignorant outsider is of great benefit in an interview process, for it enables very basic question to be asked and explanations to be sought that would not be seen as a necessary for a local teacher or a researcher (p. 143).

In this sense then, many of the answers that respondents shared with me were reflective in their perception of my lack of awareness of many things that happened in Afghanistan during the war and to Afghan experiences living in Peshawar. The interview relationship is also influenced by gender issues (Davies). As a female researcher in this environment, both males and females throughout the different interviews treated me with the utmost respect.

2.5.2 The Interviews

Informants were given the choice to sign the consent form (See Appendix, A) or to entrust their consent verbally. All chose the latter. This is understandable because of the attitudes many Afghan hold towards researchers (Conner, 1989). Although I was considered to be 'one of them', the participants were still hesitant and unsure about signing anything. Participants were informed
that the interviewer would not only be taking notes but also taping the interview in order to ensure the accuracy of the results. Bodgan and Bilken (1998) argue that recording interviews helps prevent interviewer bias that may occur when analysing the data. They further state that taking notes during the interview may ensure the accuracy of the data because if there is any discrepancy on the voice on the tape the interviewer can refer to his or her notes. On the other hand, Lincoln and Guba (1985) state that recording participants may be intrusive. While this may be true, I felt that if participants were either uneasy or uncomfortable they would inform me. In fact three participants were not taped because they were not at ease about being taped. Responses of participants who were not recorded were written in a log book. Interviews took approximately one hour.

The following are some potential sources of bias that I had anticipated prior to the interview: response effect, predisposition of the interviewer towards the interviewee and inconsistencies across the interviews. Response effect is defined by Weiss (1975) as the predisposition of a respondent to react in a certain way during the interview. Wiersma (1995) maintains that this could involve a wide range of possibilities such as lack of motivation to respond, responses that try to put the interviewee in the best possible light, or responses that are given in order to appear more socially correct than one that they experience. I felt that I had no problems with participants motivation to respond. In fact, many were eager to converse for as long as possible. In many instances I
asked a question twice (worded differently) so as to ensure the accuracy of the participants’ responses.

As well because this was a study intended to offer insight to participants’ educational experiences, there was no right or wrong answer and thus I am convinced that participants were aware that there was no socially correct answer. Inconsistencies in the interview occurred when respondents would answer one question contradictory to another. For example, one interviewee claimed that there was a lack of policy planning in her schools. Later in the interview she stated that her long-term project for her school was a five-year plan. I remarked that this did not make sense since she had mentioned earlier in the interview that there was a lack of policy planning in her school. She clarified her response by stating that she had developed a five year plan for her school in the hopes of the funding being extended from year to year.

The interaction mode between the interviewer and respondent influences the interview (Goetz and LeCompte, 1984). This interview used a conversation mode. This mode, as described by Lofland (1976), emphasises an integration of understanding and empathy. In order to gain the trust and respect of interviewees this mode is appropriate if the aim to gather elaborate and conclusive data (Goetz and Lecompte). In many instances, I felt at ease to ask for clarification and detail of answers. Bodgan and Bilken (1998) assert that this is reflective of a good interview. Predisposition of the interviewer towards the interviewee in this instance meant that I may have talked down to the interviewees or failed to establish rapport. There was no control of this side effect
on my part except that I tried to make a conscious decision to behave in manner that was nonthreatening and friendly.

2.5.3 Observations

Entrance in the classroom was permitted by the school administrators that I had the opportunity to interview. Gall et al. (1996) state that "in a qualitative research project an observer can prepare by serving as an apprentice to an expert" (p. 345). Unfortunately due to time constraints this was not possible. However, due to my experiences in conducting classroom observations in Quebec high schools, I felt that I was familiar with the dynamics of classroom observations. Of course, the dynamics of a classroom in a refugee camp are very different from that of a high school in a developed country, I nevertheless felt my observation skills in classrooms were adequate for this research project.

This research design employed open ended observations in classrooms. This allowed the me to view behaviours in a naturalistic environment. The researcher made observations on continuous behaviours. The categories under study where based on the categories of classroom observations cited in Goetz and Lecompte (1984). These include: 1) What resources are used in classroom activities and how are they allocated? 2) How do the people in the group behave to one another? 3) What is the content of conversation between teacher and student and student and student? 4) What languages do they use for communication and 5) What beliefs do the content of their conversation demonstrate?
Six classrooms with twenty-five to thirty students were observed for forty minute each. Bodgan and Bilken (1998) observe that the lower the number of subjects under observation the more likely that the researcher will influence a change in behaviour. On the one hand, I believe that my presence in the classroom inside the refugee camps influenced the children only slightly. From the information I gathered from the educational administrators of the camp, I think that many of these children are accustomed to having researchers from UNHCR observe their classrooms, that it has become almost a normal occurrence.

Thus by definition, my role in the classroom was that of a complete observer (Gall et al. 1996). The reliability of the observations can be questionable because only I was involved in recording the observations. No videotaping was allowed. Tellis (1997) believes that one way to overcome this problem is having multiple observers. I unfortunately did not do this. Because I did not have permission to tape the class lectures, I took comprehensive notes during and after the class.

2.5.4 Document Collection

Prior to leaving for Pakistan, I read as often as possible various Pakistani and British newspapers online. Specifically, I was reading anything I could find regarding Afghan refugees, Afghan refugees and education and Afghan repatriation. The purpose of this was to become familiar with the social, economical and political context that I would be conducting my research. As a researcher, I needed to take into account that what I was reading in these
newspaper articles may or may not always be the truth. Tuckman (1994) argues that "in no instance, however, can the researcher be confident in assuming that the account is accurate" (p.377).

2.5.5 Triangulation

One method to validate case study findings is through a process known as triangulation. Gall et al. (1996) define triangulation as "a process of using multiple-data-collection methods, data sources, analysts, or theories to check the validity of case study findings" (p. 574). In this study three forms of data collections methods were employed. One great advantage of this method is that it can aid the researcher in comparing and contrasting the findings of one data collection method over another (Goetz and Lecompte, 1984).

2.6 Data Analysis

2.6.1 Analysing Data During Data Collection

During my stay in Pakistan, although time was limited, I compiled a contact summary sheet after each interview or classroom observation. Gall et al. (1996) contend that these sheets may help the researcher find missing information and therefore aid the researcher in the next step of the research process. For example, after carefully reviewing the contact sheets of the first two interviews, I felt that I needed to probe a bit further with the interviewees perceptions on their future as refugees in Peshawar. I felt that I had enough information on the past of these refugees but not enough on what their feelings
were towards the future. Also, when observing students in the classroom I felt that my data was missing information on the number of student in each classroom. I had become to preoccupied with classroom dynamics instead of documenting the number of students in each class. Therefore when I visited subsequent classrooms, I made sure to write down the number of students in each class.

2.6.2 Ending Data Collection

This research was conducted in a very unstable region on the world. I would have liked to stay much longer, however due to some bomb attacks in the capital, Islamabad, I decided to leave earlier. I felt, however, that any more information gathered would not have been relevant to this study. In other words I believe that I had exhausted all my sources. This means, I had no more people to interview. As well, while reviewing the data in Pakistan, I felt that some common themes and patterns were emerging within the different data sources. Gall et al. (1996) observe that "at some point, the researcher encounters sufficient consistencies in the data she develops" (p. 562). At this point, then, I felt it was appropriate to end the fieldwork.

2.6.3 Analysing Case Study Data

Unlike quantitative analysis, organisation of data into categories and identifying relationships occurred after the data collection (McMillian and Schumacher, 1997). In other words, data analysis in qualitative research is an inductive process. Patton (1990) contends that themes emerge out of the data.
transcribed the tapes non-verbatim. Certain phrases such as: "Mmmm, let me see, well.." were omitted due to the limited time frame of transcribing the tapes. It should be kept in mind that the data transcripts provide an accurate reflection of respondents answers even though certain words were omitted.

In analysing the data of case studies I used interpretational analysis. Gall et al. (1996) define interpretational analysis as "the process of examining case study data closely in order to find constructs, themes and patterns that can be used to describe and explain the phenomena being studied" (p. 562). The first step involves segmenting the database. This means that I placed all the information in computer files under the following headings: interview transcripts, observations and documents. The text was then broken down into meaningful segments. This is defined by Gall et al. as "a section of the text that contains one item of information and that is comprehensible even if read outside the context in which it is embedded" (p. 563). An example of a segment is, Pakistani schools have a higher tuition than Afghan schools.

The next step involved developing categories (Gall et al. 1996) define a category as "as a construct that refers to a certain type of phenomena mentioned in the database" (p. 564). I developed my own categories. This type of category development is based on the principles of grounded theory. This implies that the categories were developed from the data not from the theories.

The third step developed coding segments. In this step I reviewed the categories that I developed in order to identify the segments that would fit into the categories that I developed.
Next, I grouped the category segments. This is an identification of conceptual categories. I was attempting to build a conceptual model of the data. However, in order to ensure that the categories reflected the data, I compared the different categories. In this way, then, certain patterns emerged between the different categories. This process ends when theoretical saturation occurs. Gall et al. (1996) state that this:

occurs when no new or relevant data are emerging relevant to an established coding category, no additional categories appear to be necessary account for the phenomena of interest, and the relationships among categories appear to be well established (p. 567).

The last step in this process is drawing conclusions. This is formed through an examination of the different segments of the categories and how they answered the main and sub-questions of the thesis.

I analysed the data from the classroom observations by using a method of inquiry based on what Gall et al. (1996) refer to as interpretational analysis. The notes taken during the observation were first segmented into a computer database. Then, categories were developed based on common themes and patterns between the different classes observed.

Documents, in this case newspapers were analysed in an interpretative manner. I followed Hodders (1995) five suggestions for interpreting documents for research purposes. This means that I reviewed the documents based on: 1) internal coherence, that there were no contradictions in information of the document, 2) external coherence, that the interpretation of the phenomena fit the accepted notions of the theories both in and outside of the discipline, 3)
correspondence between theory and data, 4) the fruitfulness of the theoretical supposition means what new perspective and views are offered in this document and 5) the trustworthiness of the sources.

2.6.4 Limitations of the Data Analysis

When the researcher is responsible for drawing conclusion from the data, there is always a chance that the data interpretation is represented in a biased manner (Miles and Huberman, 1984). However, I checked for rival explanations in the data interpretation by employing the strategies advocated by Miles and Huberman. This meant, I looked at several explanations of the study, and after careful examination for the 'support' for each one, decided on which was the best one to explain the phenomena I was studying.

Miles and Huberman (1984) contend that researchers should corroborate with their informants the findings of the study. The informants could examine and evaluate the findings of the study. I did not have the opportunity to do this because of the limited time frame of this study. Therefore this may be considered a limitation of the study.

2.7 Limitations of this Study

This study was an exploratory case study. Lynn (1991) argues that the greatest limitation of this type of case study is the prematurity of findings. These findings, instead of providing information for further investigation in the area, are seen as conclusions. Therefore, researchers must be careful about making pre-
mature conclusions without taking into consideration what further research may or may not find.

Generalizability is the degree to which the findings of one study can be generalized to the entire population (Polit and Hungler, 1991). The Afghan refugee population under study in this research project is unique. Lincoln and Guba (1985) argue that local conditions differ across different groups and therefore it may always be impossible to generalise the results of one study to another. Therefore one can argue that a major limitation of this study is the lack of generalizability of findings to other refugee situations. On the other hand, Gall et al. (1996) contend that findings can be generalised when the case under study is a typical one. Refugee experiences in places of temporary asylum is in itself not a unique phenomenon. The Afghan refugee population can in many ways be considered a typical case of refugees in places of temporary asylum. Stake (1980) claims that the findings of case studies should be .."be directed towards gathering information that has practical and functional uses rather than the cultivation of persistent law "(Stake, 1980, p.70).

Another argument for the generalizability of case study findings is supported by Wilson (1979). Wilson argues that it is not the responsibility of the researcher but rather of the reader to determine the generalizability of the findings. Myers (1998) argues that the researcher must provide enough information that enhances the reader's understanding of the phenomena. It is therefore up to the reader to determine if the findings can be used to his or her situation (Lincoln and Guba, 1985).
One method in which to increase the value of qualitative research is through member checking. This process occurs when the participants view the research report for accuracy. Due to the time constraints imposed on this study, participants will be given a copy of the thesis only after it has been completed.

This study was conducted in a three and a half week time frame. The political situation as mentioned above was unstable. The reliability of these findings could have been increased had there been more long-term involvement in this project. Yet at the same time, factors related to political instability occur in all refugee situations.
CHAPTER 3: RESULTS OF THE STUDY

Interpretational analysis is the process of examining case study data closely in order to find constructs, themes and patterns that can be used to describe and explain the phenomena being studied (Gall et al. 1996). In this case study four major themes were identified: current needs of Afghan refugees, policy planning and curriculum development, refugee groups and participation in educational programs. In each one of these themes subcategories were also formulated.

Names of participants have been changed. For reference purposes, a list of names with occupation is found in Appendix D.

3.1 Current Needs of Afghan Refugees

3.1.1 Employment

More than three quarters of the participants stated that there was a lack of employment opportunities available for Afghan refugees. The extent of this was apparently true across all economic levels, especially for the refugees in the lowest socio-economic level. The MS Presswire of November 18, 1999 reported that Afghan refugees were leaving camps in large numbers to look for any form of employment in Peshawar. Participants in this study felt that the only type of employment opportunities that was available was in carpet weaving, machine repair and construction. Employment opportunities for those who had computer skills and spoke English were available, in very limited numbers, in NGO's and UN organisations.
Participants, both male and female, indicated that there was an uneven
distribution of male and female workers in NGO's and UN organisations. They felt
that this was due to certain policies regarding hiring procedures. Mr. Ahmed, an
educational administrator in one NGO remarked that:

The general trend has been to hire more women in many of these NGO's. It is very rare that the men will get key positions in NGO's and many UN
organisations. Many job vacancies specifically ask for female applicants. They are many qualified men who do not have employment because the jobs are given to females.

As well, Ms. Laila, an educational administrator at another NGO reiterated
Mr. Ahmed's views. She claimed that:

There has been a recent surge of employment for females in many key
positions in various UN organisations. This is due to their policies towards
hiring more women. There is a lot of politics involved here and men lose
out this time.

While some women may be finding jobs in various organisations, there
was a concern expressed by many at the high rate of female prostitution of
Afghan women. Many of these women are widows. Employment opportunities for
women with no education and limited skills is rare. The 'clientele' are Pakistanis.
The views of Ms. Sarah, a female educational administrator summarised the view
of many of the participants regarding the subject of female prostitution:

Women who are widows find life very difficult. They have no skills and
thus cannot find jobs. Many have large families and have no means of
supporting them. Others have skills but can't find anything. I don't want
you to think that these are all women from lower classes. Many women
who come from very distinguished families have resorted to this. In our
culture this is a great sin. We cannot judge. Maybe we can be hungry for a
day may two or three..but how long can someone go hungry? But who can
help them? No one is right now
3.1.2 Mental Health Services

All but two of the respondents indicated that many Afghans in Peshawar suffered from mental health problems. This ranged from severe depression to serious post-traumatic stress disorder. There was a general consensus amongst participants that there was lack of support services to help these people. To date, there are no mental health centres available for Afghans.

It appears that the lack of employment opportunities has also played a role in refugees mental health. Mr. Elias, a male educational administrator, emphasised that:

Many stay home and have nothing to do. Smart people. Doctors, lawyers, engineers, professors.. they all stay home. What do they do? Well, we have this thing called satellite television. You will find one house with the satellite. But the rest of the street gets it..illegally! So they stay home and watch television all day. That is it. They even like the commercials. They are so sad all the time because they have nothing to do. There is no such thing as movies, museums, parks or theatres here. Some just wake up and sit in front of the television with the same clothes they went to bed with. Since they watch Indian movies all day we call it the Indian Movie Syndrome.

Many Afghan males have had to readjust their role in the family. Males, once the bread winner of their families, have now adjusted to allowing their wives to work because they cannot find employment. Participants felt that because Afghanistan is a patriarchal society, many males have had a hard time adjusting to this. Ms. Laila, an educational administrator had the following view on this topic:

You have to remember where we come from. Women, have opportunities. But at the end of the day it is men who are the real supporters of their families. Many males are not used to women taking their roles. But here their option is either having their women work, or having no money. This
has been a very difficult adjustment for many. This is why many who stay home and do nothing all day feel sad and depressed.

There are individuals who suffer severe psychological problems. Many have had first hand experience with the atrocities of war. This includes for example being tortured or having a loved one killed in front on them. There are no support systems available to these people. The views of Ms. Iman, a teacher at a refugee camp offers some insight to the situation in the camps:

We have a lot of men and women here who just laugh all the time. Its not normal. They just sit there all day and we try to help them eat and clean. We cannot understand what they are saying is gibberish. But we've told the camp administrators and they just tell us there is nothing we can do!

3.1.3 Long Term Planning

Half of the participants indicated that the lack of long term planning in policy formation impeded the growth of many of their schools projects. Many blamed the lack of political stability in the region as a reason for this. Others believed, that NGO's and UN organisations lack of long term policy planning in schools and even in vocational centres, made them feel weary of planning projects for fear of funding cuts. The comments given by Ms. Sabrina, a female educational administrator sums up the view faced by many administrators working with Afghan refugees:

Nothing can be planned forever. We have great ideas, but can't implement them because the funding agencies won't allow us to do it long term. They are really afraid that we are becoming a never ending problem for them. Some will not allow us to plan for anything for more than a year. So what we plan is very small in comparison to what we could be doing. We need more time to work on the project, but they don't allow it.
The sentiments of many of the participants were also corroborated from an article in L'Agence France Presse of November 16, 1999. The article quoted Ravi Nair of the South Asia Human Rights Documentation Centre as saying:

"There seems to be a potential agenda here. The UNHCR has money for Kosovo and Rwanda and anything else that makes it on the CNN news bulletin but nothing for Afghan, Myanmar or Bhutanese refugees."

It appears that the lack of long term policy planning has left many Afghans in a state of flight.

3.1.4 Trust/Collaboration

Some respondents indicated that the lack of trust between different groups of Afghans has severely hampered their community in Peshawar. Many individuals, for example who have lived in Pakistan for a long time, are very untrustworthy of Afghans who have just recently left Afghanistan. Many believe that the newly arrived refugees remained in Afghanistan during the communist regime because of their ties with the Soviet government. Others mistrust the Afghans who have come from rural areas in Afghanistan. They view them as being spies for the Taliban. Ms.Yasmeen, for example, argued that:

"We as a group don't trust one another. We have fought so long and hard for many years that we don't know who is on what side. The intellectuals want us to believe that the rural ones are with the Taliban. The rural ones believe that the intellectuals were with the communist. You have this tension here all the time. This is why many of these different groups don't mix with one another."
Ms. Noor, an educational administrator stated that:

You have to be very careful about what you and say and to whom. You never know who supports what. Unless its your close family, people have to be very careful. People have been killed because they have spoken to the wrong person about the wrong thing.

Ms. Yasmeen reported that many Afghans who oppose the Taliban have been attacked in Peshawar. In November for example, she stated that a prominent Afghan journalist who advocated a representative parliament in Afghanistan was killed outside his home.

Many participants admit that Afghans need to collaborate with one another if they want their situation in Peshawar to improve. Yet, there have been limited endeavours by any one ethnic group to accomplish this. Individuals who wish to return to Afghanistan are perturbed by the lack of trust amongst Afghans living in and out of Afghanistan. This situation may worsen. L'Agence France Presse of November 14, 1999, reported that due to new UN sanctions against Afghanistan many refugees in Pakistan will lose communication with their relatives in Afghanistan.

In regards to the field of education, participants indicated that amongst Afghani schools, schools are run under different political organisations. Some school systems support the Taliban government. Participants indicated that some classes taught students in History class positive aspects of the Taliban government in Afghanistan. Others who for example are adamantly opposed to the new regime, may teach students the problems with the current regime of Afghanistan. On the whole, many of the madrassas are not seen as individual institutions but rather as a community of institutions. Many participants indicated
that one teacher may teach at different madrassas. As well, some students attend one madrassa in the morning and another one in the afternoon.

There is also a general feeling of mistrust by Afghans towards 'outsiders'. Afghans believe that the help some foreign aid workers provide is masked by ulterior motives. Many view some of the aid workers, particularly those from the United States and Great Britain as spies who are monitoring political movements in the area. There is a general anti-Western feeling amongst all Afghans.

Not surprisingly, many Afghans do not trust researchers as well. Repeatedly, I heard Afghans telling me that they had never 'talked' to another researcher so openly and candidly. They stated that because I was an Afghan from abroad I could be trusted. Ms. Dalia, a female student, expressed the following in regards to the issue of researching Afghan refugees:

We always get people coming here to 'ask' us questions. They have their translators with them and they go about asking us questions. We have no clue what they want. Most of the time they just want to create propaganda when they go home. You know, how Afghan are backwards, they treat women badly, they are barbaric stuff like that. Last year a group of researchers came here for three months. Going around and around. You know what they wrote in a report? That we were backwards, unsophisticated and a threat to the region!

3.1.5 Aid from Expatriates

The majority of respondents felt that there was a general lack of support from expatriates. Numerous individuals indicated that aid from expatriates was necessary for both the improvement of the current situation of Afghan refugees in Peshawar as well as to the post-war development of Afghanistan. Afghans living in Peshawar have a sense of abandonment by those who were once refugees
but now live abroad. A few Afghans, who have come back to help in Peshawar are viewed as heroes. In recent years, some Afghan-Americans have returned for short periods of time to help in areas such as medicine, education and construction. Some have even taught in the schools. The area in which most refugees want aid from expatriates is in the field of education. Mr. Elias makes an interesting point:

We need them to help us. We need their expertise and their guidance. They know more than we do yet they don’t offer us anything. We trust them and would accept them with open arms but they have to come here to see for themselves. They have forgotten about being like us.

3.2 Socio-Economical Level

The responses from refugees indicate that the socio-economical level of refugees fall under five main categories. All agree that those refugees living in the camps are the poorest group. In fact, I witnessed the poor shape of the refugee camps while visiting the refugee schools. Resources (water, sanitation areas, food) were lacking. The Times (London) of August 4, 1999 reports that the lack of adequate humanitarian assistance will make the situation even worse. These refugees left Afghanistan with nothing and are completely dependent on assistance. Some adults and children spend their day begging on the streets and markets.

Informants believed that the next group consists of those refugees who have one member of the household holding a job. These individuals still, however live in extreme poverty. The work available to these refugees is very limited. Mr. Elias pointed out that:
They work sometimes 18 hours a day mostly for Pakistanis. They have no choice, most have to support large families. They will never complain because that know that there is someone else waiting for a job. So they work like dogs and there is nothing anyone can do to help them.

The third socio-economic level consists of refugees who hold jobs in private organisations, NGO's or UN organisations. Afghan refugees have found employment in these areas. Luckily, the salary of one individual can support a very large family. Many have been working in these areas for many years.

There is a group of refugees who under Peshawar standards, live extremely well. These refugees have large homes, maids, cooks, housekeepers and drivers. They are supported by family members who live abroad. These individuals, for the most part, have no form of employment. They are completely self-reliant on family members living abroad. Ms. Leila claims that the reasons for this lies in the fact that:

For about 400 dollars Americana month, you and a large family can live very well. Look at it this way 50 rupees is 1 American dollar. Okay, now renting a large mansion, complete with 3-4 bathrooms and 6 bedrooms will cost you about 5000 rupees. Hiring a cook for a month will cost you about 1000 rupees. So you see how people can live like this?

Lastly, there is a group of refugees that live better than the group mentioned previously. They live in large mansions in the posher areas of Peshawar. There was no consensus as to where and how these refugees manage to support themselves. Ms. Sarah, an educational administrator, claims that these refugees deal drugs that come from Afghanistan. Other participants believed that they belonged to the communist regime of Afghanistan, and are living off the money they robbed from Afghanistan.
3.2 The Educational Background of the refugees

3.2.1 Education Prior to the Soviet Invasion

The majority of Afghans living in Peshawar were educated in Afghanistan. Participants claimed that there were no figures to indicate how many there were, but their overall impression was that most received their education in Afghanistan.

There are many Afghans, for example, who before the coup, had the opportunity to study abroad. It is not surprising to find Afghans who hold degrees from distinguished universities from all over the world. Numerous participants indicated that these individuals are well respected because of their 'foreign education'. Mr. Elias said that:

These people have the best education because they learned away from Afghanistan and then they came back and used what they learned here. They have seen a lot more than many of us have.

Participants indicated that these Afghans, for the most part, have not found any type of employment in their respective field.

3.2.1 Education in Afghanistan after the Soviet Invasion

Soviet Education

Very few participants knew of Afghans who received a Soviet education. Though most agreed that there were many that were enrolled in schools during and after the coup, in this study no one personally knew of anyone in Peshawar who have gone through the Soviet education system. Ms. Laila, enrolled in high school, at the time of the coup, dropped out as soon as the 'new education
system’ was implemented. In fact, she stated that many of her friends dropped out of school with her.

Participants have differing views of the impact of the Soviet education on Afghans living in Peshawar. Mr. Youssef claimed that:

The Soviet educational system changed the ideology of an entire generation. Many who live here still try to push this ideology here. It happens in very subtle ways but I see it. This is why there is still that ‘soviet mentality’ held by many.

Ms. Selma had a somewhat differing view on the issue:

I believe, that these individuals either are in Russia or went abroad. I don’t think you will find many of them here. The ones that are here, I believe, have been influenced by the thinking of the majority and therefore cannot really exert any type of power here.

Throughout the civil war, many different political organisations took over the education system of Afghanistan. By the participant’s accounts, the first group tried to implement a Western education back into Afghanistan. They found textbooks and journals from abroad and translated the material to Farsi. By the time this system was in its initial stages, another political group took control of the Afghan government.

The majority of the participants believed that most individuals who were studying under the next education system became strong supporters of the Afghan freedom fighters. The education they received, is considered by many to have influenced their decision to fight with the freedom fighters. Mr. Youssef, who was in Afghanistan at the time, stated that:

What they were teaching was unbelievable. I saw someone’s math book and I was shocked. I remember seeing someone’s math textbook. One
math problem was 1 dead communist plus 4 dead communists is how many dead communists?

All participants agreed that most Afghans did not attend schooling during the conflict. Many, would attend for six months, then stop. Ms. Noor, was in her last year of high school, after the Soviets took over, and throughout the conflict never had a chance to go back.

3.3 Policy Planning and Curriculum Development

3.3.1 Afghan Schools

Afghan schools in Peshawar model the schools in Afghanistan prior to the coup. In fact, many schools in Peshawar have the same names as those once found in Afghanistan. Subjects taught in these schools include, English, Math, Science, Geography (Afghan and International), History (Afghan and International) and Islam. Parents pay a fee each month to cover the costs of books, rent and teacher salaries. Each school has its own mandate and policies, usually formed by the educational administrators. If schools receive partial funding from a non-governmental source, then policy planning and curriculum is formed by the educational administrators as well as by members of the funding source. Although exact figures were not stated, most respondents believed that the majority of Afghan children attend Afghan schools. Mr. Omar believes that:

Afghan schools offer a very Afghan education. You could, in essence, find the same schools in Afghanistan. We have used the same, I guess you could call it template for these schools in Peshawar. The only thing we have done is add some more current stuff to the material
3.3.2 Pakistani schools

Afghans are allowed to enter Pakistani schools so as long as they can pay the tuition fees. There are a few very known and prestigious schools in Peshawar. A high school degree from a Pakistani school is recognised in many countries. The curriculum is formed by the Ministry of Education, all schools must follow their mandate. Very few Afghans attend Pakistani schools.

Ms. Dina, an educational administrator stated that:

It is not surprising to find one family member going to one of these schools while the rest of the family works to send this one child to go to school. They figure that once this kids gets out then they will all live the good life.

3.3.3 Vocational/Training Centres

Vocational and training centres are run by private organisations, NGO’s and UN organisations. There are centres that offer training in carpet weaving, soap making and sewing. Each centre has specific criteria for admission into training courses offered by their organisation. There are for example, some training centres that only allow women to attend. The aim in all of these centres is to teach people skills to become self-reliant. Many respondents indicated that the skills are taught so that individuals can use these skills when or if they ever return back to Afghanistan. It is not surprising to find one organisation running many different centres. Ms. Sabrina, who run one centre, stated the following:

We are told by our funders that there is a demand for embroidery on clothes. So we go to camps and see how many women can do such embroideries. If they show us that they can, then we teach them certain embroideries that we need. We don’t, for example, train people who have no clue how to embroider. We give them the materials, and show them a sample of what they want done. They do this all on their own time. We pay them for what they produce.
3.3.4 Madrassas

There are numerous madrassas in Peshawar. Most are run by Afghans. There are a few run by the Saudi and Kuwaiti government. The curriculum is simple, teaching people the Quran. The Afghan madrassas charge a small fee for books, rent and teachers salaries. Most of the non-Afghan madrassas usually test interested candidates and upon passing an examination, offer free tuition. Madrassas run by foreign Islamic governments are held in high regard. Because in addition to teaching students the Quran, they also teach students Arabic.

Students who attend madrassas usually do not attend any other type of schooling. Many come from rural areas in Afghanistan. Their parents have been accustomed to this type of education. The age range for these schools is wide, usually between six years till about sixty years of age.

3.4 Perception of the advantages and disadvantages of the different educational systems

3.4.1 Afghan schools

Participants indicated that the advantages of Afghan schools were as follows: they taught Afghans in their own language, the curriculum centred on Afghan history and geography and the fees were low. When I visited one of the schools, I observed a teacher teaching the students about Afghanistan and its surrounding countries. Ms. Sadaf, a teacher in the school told me that:

We teach kids about Afghan geography as well as international geography. We are trying to teach them as much as we can about themselves in relation to the whole world.
The main disadvantages of the Afghan schools were its lack of adequate resources such as tables, chairs, books, pencils, and chalk. In fact, in one of the schools I visited, I saw that over forty children sitting on the floor of a very tiny classroom. There was a chalk board, one meter by one meter, in front of the class. Ms. Dina claimed that:

We are all going by a minimal budget. We cannot ask for higher tuition fees. Last time we asked for higher tuition fees, we lost half our students because the parents could no longer afford to send their kids.

Many felt that the funding that some Afghan schools received was 'drying up'.

Mr. Ahmed views summarise those of the participants:

You see were never suppose to be here this long. People are tired of sending us money. There are other refugee crisis that are more serious or more important. Look at the Kosovars...the money that used to go to us is going to them.

Half the participants felt that most of the books used in these schools were outdated. I had first hand experience with this. In one of the classes, I had the opportunity to examine some of the history books the kids were reading. They were dated from 1963.

3.4.2 Pakistani schools

The main advantage of attending Pakistani schools, it seems, is the employment opportunities that are accessible to those who graduate. As well the schools, for the most part, are up to date with the latest books, journals and tools such as computers and science laboratories. Ms. Sabrina indicated that because
she had received her MBA from a Pakistani university, she was able to find an excellent job at a NGO. As well, Ms. Noor claimed that her university degree from a Pakistan university was the reason why she had received her job at a UN organisation. Mr. Elias pointed out that he felt that the situation was also the same in Iran. That is, Afghans who attend Iranian colleges and schools will find better employments opportunities then those who attend Afghan schools in Iran. Unfortunately, as Ms. Dina pointed out, the fees to attend these schools are very expensive. Very few families can afford the tuition fees of one thousand rupees (20 US dollars) per month. There are also no scholarships or bursaries available for Afghans.

3.4.3 Vocational/ Training Centres

The majority of the participants indicated that they believed that vocational and training centres have allowed many Afghans to be become self-reliant. Mr. Youssef, for example, indicated that some vulnerable groups, such as widows and the disabled have found employment because of training they received at various centres. Ms. Noor, pointed out, that in some centres women are offered free day care while attending classes. Mr. Ahmed said:

Some Afghans who worked here for while eventually went back to Afghanistan. We try to make sure that they can still continue with what they did here over there. Like, this one husband and wife team, they were excellent in carpet weaving. So we would send them the raw material from here and they would send us back the carpets here. We would then send them money for each carpet they sewed. We have a huge demand for Persian carpets. They wanted to go back home and still make some money to live on.
Unfortunately, there are not enough training centres for all who would like to attend. Over the years, once thriving centres have shut down due to funding cuts. Participants believe that all this is of course related to funding agencies finding other refugee groups that need the aid more than Afghans. Mr. Youssef noted that more and more centres will eventually close down as other refugee situations become more serious and funding is directed towards them. Mr. Ahmed and Mr. Elias pointed out that the NGO's they work for are hoping to transfer their centres to Kabul once the political situation is stable.

3.4.4 Madrassas

Individuals from different age groups attend madrassas. Ms. Selma, a principal at one madrassa, indicated that madrassas have allowed Afghans, who would otherwise stay home all day, a chance to leave their homes and socialise with other Afghans. When I observed some classes in a madrassa, I found that the whole atmosphere was very much like an informal social gathering. In one class for example, I noticed children as young as five sitting with elderly adults. They were sitting discussing a section of the Quran.

Ms. Karima, a student at one Afghan madrassa claimed that she felt that many Afghan families who do not allow their kids to attend any formal schooling would allow them to attend Madrassas. Ms. Karima stated that:

Even Afghans who have depression problems can come here and just talk to other people. You know, I am not saying that madrassas help solve everyone's psychological problems, but it helps some people just to know that others have similar problems as they do. Many husband who don't let their wives go anywhere, will allow them to come here.
Madrassas receive no funding from external agencies. Students are required to donate a small fee each month. Mr. Ahmed indicated that many funding agencies are weary against giving funding to an organisation they perceive as religious. Ms. Selma claimed that:

With this whole thing against Bin Laden, they think we are training people to be radical terrorists. We have tried to get funding but it is impossible. The Arab Madrassas that are here, it is rumoured, they receive funding directly from Bin Laden’s people.

3.5 Participation in Education

3.5.1 Refugees who plan on going abroad

Participants indicated that refugees who are planning on going abroad have one or more of the following characteristics: they hold a degree from a foreign university, in other words they studied abroad prior to the coup, they are highly educated, they are not nationalistic towards their country, are against the current government and have family members living abroad who can support them. This being said, many have strong intentions of going abroad. The Dawn of September 21, 1999 reported that UNHCR made a recent appeal for Afghans to stop coming to their office for aid in third country settlement. In fact, a spokesperson from UNHCR claimed that there has been no demand from any country for Afghan migration from Peshawar. Many participants stated that Afghans now try to leave Pakistan illegally. Ms.Laila, stated that many are desperate to find foreign passports so that they can leave the country as soon as possible. Others have hired smugglers to help them achieve their goal of leaving Peshawar. Ms. Selma heard that smugglers charge around 50 000 American to
get a family out. The most desired location is England because they allow Afghans to stay in the country.

From this group, those that have money will send their kids to Pakistani schools. It is generally assumed by many of these families that once they leave Pakistan, their kids will have no problems integrating into schools abroad. Mr. Ahmed pointed out that families who cannot afford to send their children to Pakistani schools would send them to Afghan schools. Nevertheless, Ms. Noor stated that parents will try to buy books from Pakistani schools to teach their kids additional material at home.

3.5.2 Afghans who plan on staying in Pakistan

In general, participants stated that Afghans who belong to this group have one or more of the following characteristics: have employment, can support their families, are employed in organisations that will pay for university education after a minimum of five years, do not support the political party in Afghanistan and have nothing left in Afghanistan. There are many Afghans who contrary to what Pakistanis may believe, are content with their lifestyle in Pakistan. Ms. Laila told me that:

Many Afghans here feel like they are like the Palestinians who are living in Jordan. Some of us have been here for twenty years, we are part of this country now. Eventually we may get our own state here.

Many who have good jobs have long term planning in their mind. Ms. Dina, told me that her employers would pay for her to get her MBA, provided that she stay for a minimum of five years. She maintains:
I have nothing there. Our home was bombed. I like my job, I like the house we rent. We have money, clothes, food, and a good job. My kids will have a good life here.

The Dawn of September 6 1999, reported that the Taliban announced that all Afghans should return home by mid March otherwise their immovable assets would seized by the government. The Dawn of September 17, 1999, writes that:

Many well to do Afghans will still not go back. In fact they are attempting to gain Pakistani citizenship. Many of their kids have been born in Pakistan and studying in Pakistani institutions.

Participants did acknowledge the fact that Afghan who have decided on staying in Pakistan always face the threat that Pakistan might forcefully send them home.

Ms.Noor points out that:

If we left this area, we would kill the Pakistani economy. If you had seen this place 20 years ago, you would have thought it was a ghost town. Now look! The Pakistanis became rich because of us. All the land where the refugee camps are..can you imagine how rich the Pakistani landlord who owns these lands are?

This is corroborated by a report by Hasan in the Dawn of September 6, 1999. According to the report, approximately half of the shops in Peshawar are occupied by Afghans. As well, over sixty percent of the public transportation is run by Afghan refugees.

There is a constant sense of apprehension and anxiety by some Afghans, particularly those who are very vocal against the current government in Afghanistan. Some fear for their safety in Pakistan. Gannon has written in The Associated Press of February 17, 1999 that many such Afghans are attacked or
killed by the Taliban. Many of them cannot get political asylum anywhere in the world.

Not surprisingly then, many Afghans who are part of this group want their children to receive a Pakistani education because they will never return. Ms. Iman pointed out:

As soon as the parents are able to they will scrape some money together, they get their kids out of our school and send them straight into a Pakistani school.

Some families, who have no desire to go back and yet still cannot send all their kids to Pakistani schools, will try get the older kids to work so that one child can go to a Pakistani school. These families see no real value in sending their kids to Afghani school if their kids won’t find employment when they leave.

3.5.3 Refugees who plan on going back to Afghanistan

In general participants perceived that Afghans who plan on going back to Afghanistan hold one or more of the following characteristics: they are poor, jobless, come from the rural areas of Afghanistan, are very nationalist towards their homeland and are very religious. The participants felt that the Pakistani government was hampering their repatriation efforts. Youssef has reported in The Dawn of September 2, 1999 that there is a general lack of interest by Pakistani rulers to aid Afghans with repatriation.

Ms. Iman pointed out that many Afghans are waiting for the political situation to improve before they return. Kamal Hosssain, the Special Rapporteur of the Commission of Human Rights in Afghanistan argues in the MS. Presswire
of November 8, 1999 that refugees will only return home when the government becomes broad based enough to represent the three to four million Afghan living abroad. L'Agence Presse of September 20, 1999 reported that the Taliban are trying to create conditions conducive to repatriation. However the repatriation is hampered by landmines and lack of communication facilities.

Mr. Ahmed claimed that he himself would return to Afghanistan as soon as all schools become open for girls and boys. He may have his wish. In the Nation, dated September 15, 1999, Wakil Ahmed Mutwakkel, Afghanistan’s Foreign Minister stated that: "There is no education for boys and girls. We intend to have an education programme for both genders under one curriculum".

Many families, then, be they poor or rich, if they are planning on returning to Afghanistan are sending their kids to Afghan schools. Ms. Iman said:

Many of my students have parents who may afford to send one child to a Pakistani school but they don't because they want their kids to learn Afghan history and culture.

Ms. Noor stated that some families are so poor, that they may have the desire to send the kids to schools, but they need the kids to work or beg to get money for the family. As well, parents who live in camps, are very supportive of their kids attending camp schools. Ms. Iman stated that:

Some of these parents are illiterate. but they want their kids to have the things they never had a chance to have. All the hopes and dreams of rebuilding Afghanistan lies in these kids success in school.

Families who come from rural areas or are very religious want their kids to attend madrassas if anything. Some of the families will allows their males to attend Afghan schools, but this is a minority.
Lastly, many adults who plan on returning to Afghanistan try to enrol in classes at vocational and or training centres. They believe that the skills they learn in these centres will help them find employment in Pakistan. In the long run they foresee the possibility to take these skill back with them to Afghanistan. Mr. Youssef pointed out that in his organisation:

We teach people life long skills. Skills that they can take back with them to Afghanistan. It helps them here and there. Like for example, something like carpet weaving. So as long as there is a demand from Europe and North America for Persian rugs, we will continue training people to make them.

3.6 Perceptions of Education

3.6.1 Administrators

The majority felt the main problems associated with the current educational system is the lack of funding available for long term planning. Administrators are frustrated at the lack of long term projects that they can implement. They feel, in general, that only through long term projects can they successfully implement educational programs.

Also, many felt that any type of curriculum for Afghan refugees needed to include peace management and conflict resolution programs. Mr. Youssef summed up the view many administrators have concerning this issue:

We are a very diverse group. If we want the country to rebuild one day we need to work with one another. Otherwise we will always be in this so called post-conflict phase.
As well, the lack of adequate money available for proper books, teachers’ salaries, classrooms and resources hampered their ability to teach students effectively. Mr. Elias, believed that:

We have such a poor system of education. We don’t know how to succeed. We can’t give these kids the right things they need. Sometimes I can’t believe we have come this far with what little we have.

Mr. Youssef, recently visited a clinic run by Afghans. He was treated by a recent graduate of the Islamic University of Afghanistan in Peshawar. His story emphasises the problems students face with lack of adequate resources:

The young graduate needed to take my blood pressure. The poor girl had no idea where on my arm she need to do it. I showed her. She explained that this was the first time she had attempted to do this. She had only been shown a manual demonstration once in her class.

There was also growing concern in even convincing the young to attend school. Many have seen their parents or friends go to school, only to stay at home not being able to find any type of employment.

3.6.2 Teachers

The two teachers in this study felt that their monthly salaries were low. This is corroborated by both students and administrative staff as well. Both teachers felt that they would rather be teaching than staying at home and doing nothing. They voiced there frustration at the lack of resources and material they had to teach with. Also, both found it very difficult to plan curriculum for the following year due to the lack of long term planning in their respective schools. Both stated that if they could find employment that would offer them a higher salary.
3.6.3 Students

The two students felt that they were in school really only to please their parents. The two students also felt that many of their friends had basically given up on schooling because they felt that there was nothing for them when they finished. Ms. Dalia claimed that she felt her education was a waste of time:

There are 2000 people enrolled in our medical school, 700 girls and 1200 boys. No one expects to get a job when the graduate. We have nothing in our medical school, no labs, no updated books, and no cadavers to practice on.

Ms. Karima stated that her teachers, who were teaching for free, was what motivated her to go to class everyday. She said:

When we lost our funding from Norway, we lost the engineering, law and literature departments. What is left is the medical school. We pay fees, but it only covers our books and the rent for the building. We don't know when the Pakistani government will close us. Our teachers do this for free, to help the kids.
CHAPTER 4: DISCUSSION

I will first begin by reviewing the questions that I proposed in the Introduction section of this thesis. The main question that guided this thesis is how are Afghans needs met through the various education/training programs offered in Peshawar? The sub-questions of this thesis are the following: A) What have been the critical experiences which have led to the current educational situation of Afghans in Peshawar? B) What are the current pedagogical and social objectives of the education offered to Afghans? C) How have Afghans participated in educational/training programs? And D) What role will Afghans in Peshawar play in post-war development in Afghanistan?

This section will discuss the lessons learned by the researcher, explore the answers to the research questions and discuss future research in this area.

4.1 Needs and Education

This study identified five main needs, as perceived by Afghan refugees living in Peshawar. They are: employment, mental health services, trust and collaboration between Afghans, long-term policy programs and aid from expatriates. How has education met these needs? First, I must reiterate what the educational opportunities are for Afghan refugees: Afghan schools, Pakistani schools, training/vocational centres and madrassas.
4.1.1 Employment and Education

Employment opportunities, it appears, are inadequate to meet the needs of all refugees in Peshawar. Christensen (1988) reported that in every Afghan household, at least one member has found employment. While this may have been true about ten years ago, this does not seem the case today. This may be due to the fact the many Afghans are leaving from Afghanistan for Peshawar (UNHCR, 1995). As a consequence, there are many more individuals looking for employment.

This study found that Afghans who are graduates of Afghani schools are not finding employment in Pakistan. Their degree is not recognised anywhere in Pakistan. It is certainly the case that those refugees who have been lucky enough to attend Pakistani schools, seem to find employment opportunities. Usually the lucrative employment opportunities are in UN organisations and NGO's. This study found that the number of Afghan students attending Pakistani schools is low. Boensen (1988) also found this to be the case. I believe that regardless of the year in question, the proportion of Afghans who are part of the higher socio-economic level will always be small. Therefore the enrolment rate of Afghans in Pakistani schools will also be low.

First, without a doubt, Afghans need resources to improve their current education system. Second, although this may be difficult, certain Afghan institutions should be allowed to have some type of recognition for schools that meet the criteria of Pakistani schools. For example, Afghans who have graduated from Afghan high schools who speak English and Urdu should have the
opportunity to attend Pakistani universities and colleges. This means, then, that
the Pakistani government would have to acknowledge the credits students
receive from Afghan institutions. This may be unlikely to happen. First, Pakistani
educators may have to become involved in the Afghan educational system. The
Pakistani government does not have the resources to do this. As well, Afghans
may not allow Pakistanis to interfere in their education system. If the Pakistani
government were to encourage any type of permanent settlement of refugees in
their country, then they may face adverse reactions from Pakistanis who oppose
Afghan settlement in their country.

The fact that Afghans who graduate from Afghan schools cannot find
employment is discouraging. This situation appears to mirror the situation faced
by Palestinians in Lebanon as reported by Abu-Habib (1996). Similar to Afghans,
many Palestinian refugees find that their participation in education programs
serves them no purpose in finding employment opportunities in Lebanon. What is
the purpose of participating in education programs if individuals cannot find
employment?

Interestingly, Macharia (1990) reported that the Somali government in
collaboration with UNHCR established a National Institute for Adult Education for
Ethiopian refugees. The main reason the Somali government allowed this to
occur is because the refugees were ethnically Somali and because the refugees
were forced out into Somalia. The refugees were not seen as foreigners but as
members of that country. Although Pakistanis and Afghans are culturally
different, Iranians have similar linguistic and cultural backgrounds as Afghans.
This study did not examine the situation in Iran, but participants in this study believed that the situation of education for Afghans in Iran has been for the most part the same as in Pakistan. This owing to the fact that Iran, like Pakistan, does not want the refugees to remain in their country. These cases suggest that the host country plays the strongest role in the availability of employment opportunities for refugees. Therefore educators must take into consideration what the ultimate goals of education programs for refugees are if there are no employment opportunities available for them.

The work available to Afghan refugees is mostly in skilled labour. Those Afghans who have been lucky enough to attend vocational/training centres have reaped the benefits of having a stable income to live on (Sinclair, 1990). Although Sinclair’s research was conducted nine years ago, the demand for skilled labour has not gone down. I believe the reason for this to be the market demand for goods produced by these skilled labourers. For instance, the demand for Persian rugs is always high on the market. In my view, funding needs to be directed towards opening more vocational centres. This study found that those fortunate enough to attend vocational centres are finding employment in Peshawar. Why then are NGO’s and UN organisations not creating more centres? The mandate of many of these organisations is to help refugees repatriate (Sinclair). If Afghans find employment, then they may decide to remain in Pakistan. The Pakistan government, NGO’s and UN organisations want Afghans to return home. The only solution that may work in this case is if some of the vocational centres operate in Afghanistan instead of Peshawar. If for instance, refugees want to
return to Khandhar and learn carpet weaving, a NGO could transfer their centre from Peshawar to Afghanistan. This study found that NGO's would be interested in doing this. This in itself may be difficult for logistical reasons. Afghanistan is still in the pre-war phase. The infrastructure in transportation is non-existent.

Some informants mentioned that many of the Pakistani schools and vocational centres were located in posher areas of Peshawar. The Afghans who live in these areas, are for the most part employed and belong to one of the higher socio-economic levels. What benefit does vocational centres offer them? Vocational centres need to be located in areas where refugees who belong to the lower socio-economical levels will benefit from them. Educators and administrators need to take this into consideration when deciding the location of schools and centres.

It appears that students who attend madrassas are not inclined to attend vocational training centres or finding employment. This is corroborated by Karadawi (1987) who found that Sudanese refugees attending religious institutions were not interested in pursuing formal or vocational education. This study found that madrassas were used for the sole purpose of learning about the Quran. However, this study also found that madrassas were also used for a social gathering place. Women, who would otherwise stay at home and do nothing are attending madrassas. Therefore, in the case of Afghan refugees madrassas are used for both social and educational purposes.
4.1.2 Mental Health Services and Education

Mental health services are not offered in any of the educational institutions. In fact, in many other refugee situations the lack of mental health services available for refugees is evident. Offering mental health services is usually too expensive (Kelley, 1992; Muecke, 1992). There are numerous studies concerned with examining the psychological stress of refugees in asylum (Cohon, 1981; Muecke). These studies offer causes and effects of mental health problems of refugees, yet they fail to offer viable solutions that aid agencies can follow. This study emphasised the necessity for research to focus on ways in which mental health issues should be addressed in aid for refugees. All too often, once the basic needs of refugees are met there is not enough money for mental health services. What kind of mental health services are needed to serve the refugees? What role could the education system play? Hiring mental health workers from foreign countries that speak Farsi will not work. This study found that Afghans do not trust foreigners, particularly those from Western countries. This is also corroborated by Conner (1989) and Dupree (1988). One simple solution that may work, is that UN organisations and NGO's train Afghan refugees in Peshawar who have degrees from Afghanistan or Pakistan in clinical psychology or social work to help the refugees.
4.1.3 Trust and Collaboration and Education

The lack of trust and collaboration amongst Afghans is high. Boensen (1989) found that there was a solidarity and unit amongst Afghan ethnic groups. This may have been the case in 1989 because the Soviet war was just over. My belief is that her study was done immediately after the Soviet withdrawal. Therefore the refugees living in Peshawar most likely felt a sense of unity because their country was free from the Soviets. Similar to the results of this study, Sensening (1997) has found that years of war has caused many Afghans to distrust each other. Afghans are homogeneous group when one considers that they are all refugees. Unfortunately, in areas of political affiliation and ethnicity they are a very heterogeneous group. Researchers working with Afghan refugees must acknowledge the fact the Afghan refugees constitute a very diverse group.

The biggest mistake that many working on behalf of refugees make is to group refugees into a homogenous group (Stein, 1986). Refugees who live in Peshawar have all left Afghanistan at different times. It would be interesting to examine if there is a sense of trust and collaboration amongst refugees based on Steins’ (1981) model of refugee psychology. Is there evidence to suggest that refugees who belong in the 'initial ' stages of settlement can collaborate and trust one another? If this is true, then educators can devise educational programs that would specifically meet the needs of these groups of people.

Stepick and Portes (1986) for example in studying refugee settlement patterns found that members of the same ethnic group will stay together. Their
study did not examine the relationships between settlement patterns of refugees and choice of education. Participants in this study indicated that refugee settlement patterns in Peshawar were based on socio-economic levels. For instance, refugees who were from the lower socio-economic levels, lived in the poorer parts of Peshawar such as Bord. These findings in regards to settlement patterns seems to mirror those found by Burney (1982) and Conner (1989) who found that employment will directly influence where a refugee will settle.

Fazel (1985) has suggested that an education centre be developed in order to devise the curriculum for all the Afghani schools in Peshawar. While I believe that this is an excellent idea, I do not think that this is possible at this time due to the problems Afghans face trusting and working with each other. I also believe that the introduction of peace management and conflict resolution courses into the school curricula of Afghani schools is extremely important. All principals and educational administrators need to collaborate to discuss some common goals they may have. Although, by no means am I convinced that this would meet all Afghans' needs. Despite the obvious challenges of bringing different groups of Afghans together, doing so may open the lines of communication between different groups.
4.1.5 Long Term Policy Planning and Education

This study found that Afghans felt a sense of instability because there is no long term planning in any of the educational programs. This is due in large part to lack of funding. UNCHR (1995) has documented the fact that many funding agencies are slowly allocated their financial resources elsewhere. Similarly, Sinclair (1990) found that there was constant restructuring of policies for Afghan refugees. It appears that funding agencies have grown weary of the Afghan refugee situation. From a political, social and economical viewpoint this can be attributed for two reasons. If projects are on a long term basis this means that Afghans will stay in Pakistan longer. The Pakistani government does not want this. Second, the situation in Afghanistan is always changing. What would happen if for some reason Afghans were to leave Peshawar and return home? What would happen to the projects? Funding agencies want to protect themselves from this.

4.1.6 Aid from Expatriates and Education

Afghans feel that they need help and support from expatriates. Unfortunately, many who have left Afghanistan and Pakistan have opted not to return. This can be easily understood. Many have settled in Western countries and do not want to return to a life in Peshawar. This study found that some Afghans from Western countries have returned to Peshawar for a limited time to teach. From responses in this study, individuals indicated that they wished more Afghans from abroad would work with them in Peshawar. Little detail is available.
on the number of UN representatives from Afghanistan. One solution I recommend is that UN agencies and other NGO’s hire qualified Afghans from abroad to work in the education sector. For instance, there are many qualified retired Afghan professionals living abroad that could teach and work in Peshawar. However, the fact that UN agencies do not hire Afghans from abroad to work in their organisations in Peshawar is an area that needs further investigation in itself.

In sum, the overall needs of Afghan refugees have not been met through educational services. In can be generalised from this study that refugees in places of temporary asylum need employment opportunities, mental health services and long term policy plans. The issue of trust and collaboration and aid from expatriates is an issue, I believe, unique to the Afghan refugee population. Many refugee populations in places of temporary asylum do not have members who have gone abroad and therefore they will in all likelihood not see the return of expatriates as a real need. It would be interesting too see if Afghan refugees living in Iran perceive aid from expatriates as a need.

Research in the area of refugees in places of temporary asylum has not examined the issue of trust and collaboration amongst refugee populations. In fact, it is rare that educators and those working with refugees group them as a heterogeneous group. Macharia (1990) claimed that the delivery of an organised system of education was possible in Somalia for Ethiopian refugees because the refugee group was ethically and linguistically the same. In Afghanistan, individuals are defined by what ethic group they belong to. The literature will
attest to the fact that Afghans are a very diverse population (Dupree, 1988; Jawad, 1989). However, in Peshawar there are viewed simply as a group of Afghan refugees. Policy workers working on behalf of refugees need to focus on the different ethnic groups of refugees (Stein, 1986). They cannot assume that because a group of individuals have left their country they have similar needs and goals.

4.2 Critical Experiences

The critical experiences, which have led to the current educational situation of Afghans in Peshawar, can be explained in terms of the refugee group. First, the twenty year conflict in Afghanistan has resulted in a very diverse group of individuals in regards to educational background. Second, the refugee group varies greatly on socio-economic level. Conner (1989) found this to be the case for Afghan refugees. Therefore, it can be assumed that the education levels and socio-economic levels of refugees may explain why there are a variety of educational services in Peshawar. For instance, those refugee who are part of the lowest economic level, if they are able to, will attend schools that are free or have low tuition costs. Afghans who are part of the higher socio-economic level can attend institutions such as Pakistani schools that are costly. Further research in this area should examine the level of socio-economic level and the choice of educational institution. For example, what type of educational needs do refugees living in camps perceive they need versus those that live in urban areas? Interestingly, after a survey was conducted to find refugees’ educational needs,
Macharia (1990) found that refugees living in camps in Somalia claimed they needed education and training in health care. These types of needs assessment need to be employed by educators working on behalf of refugees in order to determine what type of educational services to offer these refugees.

**4.3 Pedagogical and Social Objectives of the Education**

The current pedagogical and social objectives of the education offered to Afghans depends on what educational institution they attend. Kunz's (1973) kinetic model of refugee state offers some interesting insights to why refugees make particular choices. Afghans' choice of participation in a particular education program can be understood based on Kunz's kinetic model. This study, like Steins' (1979) study on Vietnamese experiences in the United States, found support for Kunz's kinetic model. Because Kunz's theory offers predictive possibilities, it may be useful to explain the behaviours of Afghan refugees in regards to education using Kunz's model.

This study found that Afghans who are in the push-pressure-plunge state will never return to Afghanistan. Individuals in this state can belong to the events-alienated group. Based on Kunz's predictive hypothesis, these refugees will adjust more quickly in a host country because they do not identify with the homeland. This study did not examine the relationship between social identification categories and choice of education. In this study I found that if refugees are not planning on returning to Afghanistan, then they have no desire to attend Afghani schools. Their aim is either to stay in Pakistan or go abroad. As
this study found, those planning to go abroad will try to prepare beforehand. For example, if they can afford to, they will send their kids to Pakistani schools. This is also corroborated by participants who I interviewed last year. I found that Afghan refugees in Peshawar planning on going to North America, for example, would take English classes in order to integrate themselves in their new home.

Afghan refugees in the push-pressure-stay mode are planning on remaining in Pakistan. This study found that refugees who have employment, money and do not support the current government are planning on remaining in Pakistan. Those who can afford to send their kids to Pakistani schools have done so. They have tried therefore to integrate themselves into Pakistani society. This for example also occurred with urban refugees from Ethiopia and Uganda in Sudan who wanted to integrate into Sudanese society would send their kids to Sudanese run schools (Karadawi, 1987). Also, Afghans who want to find employment will try to attend training classes in vocational centres. Similarly, Karadawi found this to be the case for the Sudanese refugees attending vocational training centres.

Refugees who see themselves as part of the push-pressure return have the desire to return home. They view their life in Peshawar 'in-transit'. In this study, then, following Kunz predictors hypothesis on social identification category, these refugees may belong to major identified or events alienated groups. In this study, I found that refugees who attend Afghani schools and madrassas have a desire to return. It should be noted however that this found
that refugees who want to leave go abroad also attend Afghani schools if they
cannot afford the high fees of Pakistani schools.

This study has found support for Kunz’s (1973) predictive hypothesis
based on refugee choice of education. Further research in this area should
examine other refugee populations to see the extent to which Kunz’s predictive
hypothesis applies to them. It appears to be the case that refugees decisions will
be based on what state they belong to in Kunz’s kinetic model. Therefore,
researchers exploring other refugee population in places of temporary asylum
should keep this in mind. As well, educators who work on behalf of refugees,
should have a thorough understanding of this model before forming curricula and
policies for educational institutions.

4.4 Factors which influence participation

The factors which the literature indicates will influence participation in
educational programs are: cultural, economic and psychological factors
(Dupree, 1988). This is also corroborated to some extent by the research findings
of this study. This study did to examine the extent to which psychological
problems affected participation in educational programs. Afghans who need to
find immediate employment are not interested in participating in educational
programs. Woolridge et al. (1990), for example, found that refugees would not
participate in educational programs because their economic needs were not
being met. Cultural factors, will also influence participation in educational
programs. For instance, in this study it was found that individuals who are from
very religious backgrounds attend madrassas. Comparatively, Karadawi (1987) found this to be the case for Sudanese refugees who attend religious institutions.

Ironically, this study found that women were more encouraged to attend schooling because their prospects of getting employment afterwards as compared to men, was a lot higher. Ten years ago this would probably not be the case. Dupree (1988) found that many Afghan women were regarded as the caregivers of their families and thus it is only natural that they remain at home. Today, UN organisations and NGO's are forming policies towards hiring more women in their organisation and therefore it is understandable why they are encouraged to attend schools. I believe the main reason these policies were formed is because of the treatment the Taliban government has imposed on women in Afghanistan. UN organisations and NGO's want to allow women to have the freedom and rights that are not totally guaranteed to them in Afghanistan. This study did not address how women in Peshawar see their role in Afghanistan. An investigation of how their freedom in Peshawar influences their decision to remain in or leave Peshawar would offer valuable information. For example, if the Taliban cannot not offer them the same employment and educational opportunities in Afghanistan, what will become of these women in Peshawar? As well, research is this area should examine how the perceptions of men towards women's education in Peshawar has changed. In fact, it would be interesting to see what the next generation of Afghan women will be like in Peshawar. Will we, for example, find a large gender gap favouring women in enrolment rates at schools?
4.5 Afghans and Repatriation

In regards to Afghans and repatriation, this study found that Afghans who were part of Kunz’s (1973) push-pressure-return state have a desire to repatriate back to Afghanistan. In sum, the children of these refugees attend Afghani schools or madrassas. However, this study found that there is no collaboration between any of the Afghani schools. Therefore, what will happen to these children when they return back to Afghanistan? If the Taliban government is interested in securing the future of the education for these children, then it must play an active role in the development of their curriculum in Peshawar.

In this study, I found that many Afghans were not ready to return home to a country that was in complete ruins. This is also supported by Breen (1998) who also found this to be the case with Afghan refugees. Some vocational centres offer refugees the chance to learn skills such as machine repair and carpet weaving, that they may use in Peshawar and when or if they return to Afghanistan. This is interesting because if refugees no longer can use these skills in Pakistan, they may be forced to go back to Afghanistan. Research should examine how refugees who have attended vocational centres apply these skills in post-war development. The findings of such a study would be beneficial for individuals who plan the curricula for vocational centres in places of temporary asylum. However, as Dodds (1988) found in researching refugees in an educational institutions this may be difficult if the institution does not have proper organisation structure by which to allow researchers to study refugees for an extended period of time.
4.6 Lessons Learned

This research project began last year when I was worked on my research project for my research methods class. I found that researching this topic was not an easy one. Finding research on Afghan refugees is extremely difficult. Stein (1986) has written that scholarly research on refugee issues fails to explore and learn from past experiences. In discussing the findings of this study, I have attempted to compare and contrast the experiences of other refugee experiences with that of Afghan refugees. I believe that all researchers working on refugees need to view other refugee experiences. Although each refugee group is unique in terms of ethnicity, culture and history, there are many similarities between different groups. Refugees face similar problems in employment opportunities, mental health problems and perceptions of life 'in-transit'.

Prior to leaving for Peshawar, I had finished my literature review. From the various articles that I had read, I was under the impression that most if not all Afghans in Peshawar were aiming to go back home. However, once I began the fieldwork for the research, I found this not to be the case. I was surprised to learn that not all Afghan refugees were willing to go home. Once I came back to Montreal, I had to change the focus of the entire literature review. The impression that I had formed prior to leaving for Peshawar was in large part based on various NGO reports that I had read. Many if not all of these NGO's wants these Afghans to return home. Therefore, the articles written by members of the NGO's are extremely biased and not representative of the situation.
I truly believe that the findings from this research project will not be duplicated by another researcher if they are not Afghan. I say this because I felt that participants were very open and candid with me. Part of the reason I got the answers I did is because I was perceived to be 'as one of them'. An Afghan student from Concordia University is currently working with Afghan refugees experiences in Peshawar. It would be interesting to see how our findings are similar and different.

Overall I feel that this research project accurately captured the situation of Afghan refugees' educational experiences in Peshawar. There is no clear solution to the educational problems of Afghan refugees in Peshawar. I believe that the ultimate responsibility of a researcher who works with refugees should be to offer some viable solutions for refugees. It should be kept in mind, however, that once a paper is published or a thesis accepted, that the researcher not end his or her work. The scholarly research on refugees must offer something to refugees. It is my belief that the researchers, particularly those working with refugees, be held accountable for the contribution they make in helping refugees. In order to ensure that this thesis was not done in vain, I will be sending copies of my thesis to educators working with Afghan refugees in Peshawar. It is my hope that some of these findings will benefit them.
REFERENCES


Afghan Refugees in Pakistan fear sanctions will cut off links with home. (1999, November 14). L'Agence France Presse, p.3.


Taliban Forcing Refugees to Return. (1999, September 17). *The Dawn*, p.4


APPENDIX A

CONSENT FORM

Consent Form

Mariam Kakkar
M.A Candidate
Concordia University

I ______________________ (print name) agree to allow Mariam Kakkar to interview me for research to fulfil her requirements for her Master's thesis for the Department of Education at Concordia University on this date.

In signing this form I accept the following:

1. I am voluntarily participating in this interview.
2. The interview will be tape-recorded.
3. I can choose to terminate my participation in this interview at any time; there are no consequences to this.
4. My answers to this interview will remain confidential; my responses will not be shared with or sold to anyone.
5. No physical harm will come to me by participating in this interview.
6. I can request a copy of the thesis once it has been completed.

Signature of participant:

Signature of researcher:
APPENDIX B
DEBRIEFING FORM

Thank you for participating in this interview.

I wanted to learn about your educational experiences in this program. Based on these findings, I hope to provide information for educators and policy makers who work on behalf of Afghan refugees. I hope that some of these findings will be useful for developing further educational programs for Afghan refugees.

Also, I hope that some of these findings can be generalized to other refugee populations in similar situations.

If you wish, I can send you a copy of my thesis once it is finished.

Please let me know if you would be interested in receiving a copy.
My email address is:
mkakkar@education.concordia.ca
My mailing address is:
Concordia University
CSLP, Education LB-581
1400 de Maisonneuve .BLD .W
Montreal, Quebec H3G 1M8
APPENDIX C

PARTICIPANTS NAMES AND OCCUPATION

Educational Administrators

1. MR YOUSSEF, male, educational administrator for a NGO
2. MR.AHMED, male, educational administrator for a NGO
3. MR.ELIAS, male, educational administrator for a UN organisation
4. MS.YASMEEN, female, educational administrator for a NGO
5. MS.SABRINA, female, educational administrator for an NGO
6. MS.DINA, female, educational administrator for an NGO
7. MS.SARAH females, educational administrator for an NGO
8. MS.LAILA, female, educational administrator for a NGO
9. MS.NOOR, female, educational administrator for a UN organisation

Students

10. MS.DALIA, female students, in Afghani medical school
11. MS.KARIMA, female student in a Madrassa

Teachers

12. MS.SADAF, female teacher, in a refugee camp
13. MS.IMAN, female teacher, in a refugee camp

Principle

14. PF1: MS.SELMA
APPENDIX E

INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

1. What is your occupation?
2. Where do you work?
3. How long have you been in Peshawar?
4. As an Afghan living in Peshawar, what do you believe are some needs of refugees?
5. What types of educational/vocational institutions are available to Afghans?
6. What are some advantages and disadvantages of each institution?
7. Who attends the different institutions? Why do they pick one institution over another?
8. How do you believe Afghans needs are met through the educational/training institutions offered in Peshawar?
9. Are there some problems you believe that educational administrators face? If so, what are they.
10. Are there some problems you believe that teachers face? If so, what are they?
11. Are there some problems that students face? If so, what are they?
12. Who is responsible for the current state of the education system for Afghan refugees in Peshawar?
13. Has the education system changed a lot in the past five years?
14. Who benefits most from the educational system? Who benefits the least?
15. Do you believe that there should be any improvements in the education system? If so, what are they?
16. Where will Afghans be five years from now?